Mutual Exclusion (P1)

$$B = (\{s_0, s_1, s_2, s_3, t_0, t_1, t_2, t_3, 0, 1\}, \{=\}), V = \{a, b, x, y, t\}$$

 $M = (T, \Theta)$ over (B, V) as follows, with the usual interpretation I .

Prove:
$$(T,\Theta) \models_I G(a = s_1 \land b \neq t_1 \land b \neq t_2 \rightarrow (a = s_2Rb \neq t_2))$$

Proof Rule

Proof Rule:

$$\begin{array}{c}
\zeta \Rightarrow \varphi' \\
\varphi' \wedge \neg \psi \to [T]\varphi' \\
\underline{\varphi' \Rightarrow \varphi} \\
\zeta \Rightarrow \psi R \varphi
\end{array}$$

We have:

$$\zeta \equiv (a = s_1 \land b \neq t_1 \land b \neq t_2)
\psi \equiv (a = s_2)
\varphi \equiv (b \neq t_2)
\varphi' \equiv ?$$

Proof Rule:

$$\begin{array}{l}
\zeta \Rightarrow \varphi' \\
\varphi' \wedge \neg \psi \to [T]\varphi' \\
\varphi' \Rightarrow \varphi \\
\hline
\zeta \Rightarrow \psi R \varphi
\end{array}$$

We have:

$$\zeta \equiv (a = s_1 \land b \neq t_1 \land b \neq t_2)$$

 $\psi \equiv (a = s_2)$
 $\varphi \equiv (b \neq t_2)$
 $\varphi' \equiv \varphi$

$$\varphi' \wedge \neg \psi \to [T]\varphi'$$

(1)

$$t_1: a = s_0 \longrightarrow (y, t, a) := (1, 1, s_1)$$

 $[t_1]\varphi' = (a = s0 \rightarrow \varphi'(1/y, 1/t, s_1/a)) = (a = s0 \rightarrow b \neq t_2)$
 $\varphi' \land \neg \psi \rightarrow [t_1]\varphi': (b \neq t_2) \land \neg (a = s_2) \rightarrow [t_1](b \neq t_2)$
OK.
...
(6)
 $t_6: b = t_1 \land (y = 0 \lor t = 1) \longrightarrow (b) := (t_2)$
 $[t_6]\varphi' = (b = t_1 \land (y = 0 \lor t = 1) \rightarrow t_2 \neq t_2)$
 $\varphi' \land \neg \psi \rightarrow [t_6]\varphi': (b \neq t_2) \land \neg (a = s_2) \rightarrow [t_1](b \neq t_2)$

NEED to strengthen φ' .

FAIL.

Proof Rule:

$$\begin{array}{l}
\zeta \Rightarrow \varphi' \\
\varphi' \land \neg \psi \to [T]\varphi' \\
\underline{\varphi' \Rightarrow \varphi} \\
\zeta \Rightarrow \psi R \varphi
\end{array}$$

We have:

$$egin{array}{lll} \zeta &\equiv & (a=s_1 \wedge b
eq t_1 \wedge b
eq t_2) \ \psi &\equiv & (a=s_2) \ arphi &\equiv & (b
eq t_2) \ arphi' &\equiv & (a=s_1 \wedge (b=t_0 \vee b=t_3 \vee (b=t_1 \wedge x=1 \wedge t=0))) \vee \ &= & (a=s_2 \wedge b
eq t_2) \end{array}$$

$$\varphi' \wedge \neg \psi \to [T]\varphi'$$

Try to prove $\varphi' \wedge \neg \psi \rightarrow [t_6] \varphi'$

$$\begin{aligned} & ((a = s_1 \land (b = t_0 \lor b = t_3 \lor (b = t_1 \land x = 1 \land t = 0))) \lor \\ & (a = s_2 \land b \neq t_2)) \land (a \neq s_2) \land (b = t_1 \land (y = 0 \lor t = 1)) \\ & \rightarrow (a = s_1 \land (t_2 = t_0 \lor t_2 = t_3 \lor (t_2 = t_1 \land x = 1 \land t = 0))) \lor \\ & (a = s_2 \land t_2 \neq t_2) \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned} & ((a = s_1 \land (b = t_0 \lor b = t_3 \lor (b = t_1 \land x = 1 \land t = 0))) \lor \\ & (a = s_2 \land b \neq t_2)) \land (a \neq s_2) \land (b = t_1 \land (y = 0 \lor t = 1)) \\ & \rightarrow (a = s_2) \end{aligned}$$

$$\end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned} & ((a = s_1 \land ((b = t_1 \land x = 1 \land t = 0))) \land (y = 0) \\ & \rightarrow (a = s_2) \end{aligned}$$

FAIL.

Solution

Proof Rule:

$$\begin{array}{c}
\zeta \Rightarrow \varphi' \\
\varphi' \wedge \neg \psi \to [T]\varphi' \\
\varphi' \Rightarrow \varphi \\
\hline
\zeta \Rightarrow \psi R \varphi
\end{array}$$

We have:

$$\zeta \equiv (a = s_1 \land b \neq t_1 \land b \neq t_2)
\psi \equiv (a = s_2)
\varphi \equiv (b \neq t_2)
\varphi' \equiv (a = s_1 \land (b = t_0 \lor b = t_3 \lor (b = t_1 \land x = 1 \land t = 0 \land y = 1)))
\lor (a = s_2 \land b \neq t_2)$$

$$\varphi' \wedge \neg \psi \to [T]\varphi'$$

Solution OK

Try to prove $\varphi' \wedge \neg \psi \rightarrow [t_6] \varphi'$

$$\begin{array}{l} ((a = s_1 \land (b = t_0 \lor b = t_3 \lor (b = t_1 \land x = 1 \land t = 0 \land y = 1))) \lor \\ (a = s_2 \land b \neq t_2)) \land (a \neq s_2) \land (b = t_1 \land (y = 0 \lor t = 1)) \\ \rightarrow (a = s_1 \land (t_2 = t_0 \lor t_2 = t_3 \lor (t_2 = t_1 \land x = 1 \land t = 0 \land y = 1))) \lor \\ (a = s_2 \land t_2 \neq t_2) \end{array}$$

$$((a = s_1 \land (b = t_0 \lor b = t_3 \lor (b = t_1 \land x = 1 \land t = 0 \land y = 1))) \lor (a = s_2 \land b \neq t_2)) \land (a \neq s_2) \land (b = t_1 \land (y = 0 \lor t = 1))$$

$$\rightarrow \textit{false}$$

$$((a = s_1 \land ((b = t_1 \land x = 1 \land t = 0 \land y = 1)))) \land (y = 0)$$

$$\rightarrow false$$

OK.



Further Thinking

$$a = s_1 \land b \neq t_1 \land b \neq t_2 \Rightarrow (a = s_2Rb \neq t_2)$$
 $a = s_1 \land (b = t_0 \lor b = t_3) \Rightarrow (a = s_2Rb \neq t_2)$
 $a = s_1 \land (b = t_0) \Rightarrow (a = s_2Rb \neq t_2)$ and $a = s_1 \land (b = t_3) \Rightarrow (a = s_2Rb \neq t_2)$

May be easier to prove the last two properties.

$$\frac{\zeta_0 \Rightarrow \psi R \varphi \qquad \zeta_1 \Rightarrow \psi R \varphi}{\zeta_0 \lor \zeta_1 \Rightarrow \psi R \varphi}$$

Integer Square Root (P1)

Given $M = (T, \Theta)$, and the usual interpretation I over integers.

Prove
$$(T,\Theta) \models_I x > 0 \rightarrow G(a = s_4 \rightarrow y_1 = \sqrt{x})$$

Preparation

Proof Rule:

$$\begin{array}{c}
\zeta \Rightarrow \varphi' \\
\varphi' \to [T]\varphi' \\
\varphi' \Rightarrow \varphi \\
\hline
\zeta \Rightarrow G\varphi
\end{array}$$

Suppose that we have

$$(T,\Theta)\models_I G(a=s_0 \land x>0 \rightarrow G(a=s_4 \rightarrow y_1=\sqrt{x}))$$

Then
$$(T,\Theta)\models_I (a=s_0 \land x>0 \rightarrow G(a=s_4 \rightarrow y_1=\sqrt{x}))$$

In addition, we have $(T, \Theta) \models_I a = s_0$.

Therefore
$$(T,\Theta)\models_I (x>0 \rightarrow G(a=s_4 \rightarrow y_1=\sqrt{x}))$$

Proof Rule

Proof Rule:

$$\begin{array}{c}
\zeta \Rightarrow \varphi' \\
\varphi' \to [T]\varphi' \\
\varphi' \Rightarrow \varphi \\
\hline
\zeta \Rightarrow G\varphi
\end{array}$$

We have:

$$\zeta \equiv (x > 0 \land a = s_0)
\varphi \equiv (a = s_4 \rightarrow y_1 = \sqrt{x})
\varphi' \equiv ?$$

Solution

Let

$$\zeta \equiv (x > 0 \land a = s_0)
\varphi \equiv (a = s_4 \rightarrow y_1 = \sqrt{x})
\varphi' \equiv (a = s_0 \land \varphi_0) \lor (a = s_1 \land \varphi_1) \lor (a = s_2 \land \varphi_2) \lor (a = s_3 \land \varphi_3) \lor
(a = s_4 \land \varphi_4)$$

where

$$\varphi_{0} \equiv (x > 0)
\varphi_{1} \equiv (y_{1}^{2} \le x \land y_{2} = 2 * y_{1} + 1 \land y_{3} = (y_{1} + 1)^{2})
\varphi_{2} \equiv ((y_{1} + 1)^{2} \le x \land y_{2} = 2 * y_{1} + 1 \land y_{3} = (y_{1} + 1)^{2})
\varphi_{3} \equiv (y_{1}^{2} \le x \land y_{2} = 2 * y_{1} + 1 \land y_{3} = y_{1}^{2})
\varphi_{4} \equiv (y_{1} = \sqrt{x})
\equiv (y_{1}^{2} \le x \land x \le (y_{1} + 1)^{2})$$

$$\varphi' \to [T]\varphi'$$



Mutual Exclusion (P2)

Given $M = (T, \Theta)$, and the usual interpretation I.

Prove: $(T,\Theta) \models_I G(a = s_1 \rightarrow F(a = s_2))$

Proof Rule

Proof Rule:

$$\varphi \Rightarrow (\psi \lor \zeta)$$

$$\zeta \Rightarrow (w_x^e \land (\psi \lor E(T)))$$

$$\zeta \land e = v \rightarrow [T](\psi \lor (\zeta \land e \sqsubseteq v))$$

$$\varphi \Rightarrow F\psi$$

We have:

$$\varphi \equiv (a = s_1)$$
 $\psi \equiv (a = s_2)$
 $\zeta \equiv ?$
 $w \equiv ?$
 $e \equiv ?$

We may assume $(T, \Theta) \models_{I} G(E(T))$

Define f such that:

$$I(f(t_0,0)) = 1$$
 $I(f(t_1,0)) = 0$ $I(f(t_2,0)) = 2$ $I(f(t_3,0)) = 1$
 $I(f(t_0,1)) = 1$ $I(f(t_1,1)) = 3$ $I(f(t_2,1)) = 2$ $I(f(t_3,1)) = 1$

Let

$$W = (\{0, 1, 2, 3\}, \leq)$$

 $w = (0 \leq x \leq 3)$
 $e = f(b, t)$
 $\zeta = (a = s_1)$

Need

$$\varphi \Rightarrow (\psi \lor \zeta)$$

$$\zeta \Rightarrow w_{x}^{e} \land (\psi \lor E(T))$$

$$\zeta \land e = v \rightarrow [T](\psi \lor (\zeta \land e < v))$$

$$\zeta \wedge e = v \rightarrow [T](\psi \vee (\zeta \wedge e < v))$$

$$t_{6}: b = t_{1} \land (y = 0 \lor t = 1) \longrightarrow (b) := (t_{2})$$

$$((a = s_{1} \land f(b, t) = v) \land b = t_{1} \land (y = 0 \lor t = 1))$$

$$\rightarrow (a = s_{2} \lor (a = s_{1} \land f(t_{2}, t) < v))$$

$$((a = s_{1} \land f(t_{1}, t) = v) \land b = t_{1} \land (y = 0 \lor t = 1))$$

$$\rightarrow (a = s_{2} \lor (a = s_{1} \land f(t_{2}, t) < v))$$

$$((a = s_{1}) \land b = t_{1} \land (y = 0 \lor t = 1))$$

$$\rightarrow (a = s_{2} \lor (a = s_{1} \land f(t_{2}, t) < f(t_{1}, t)))$$

FAIL.

Need to strengthen $\zeta = (a = s_1)$ with $\zeta = (a = s_1 \land y = 1)$. Then it is ok.

Solution

$$W = (\{0, 1, 2, 3\}, \le)$$

$$w = (0 \le x \le 3)$$

$$e = f(b, t)$$

$$\varphi = (a = s_1)$$

$$\psi = (a = s_2)$$

$$\zeta = (a = s_1 \land y = 1)$$

Ok.

Need:

$$\varphi \Rightarrow (\psi \lor \zeta)$$
, i.e., $a = s_1 \Rightarrow (a = s_2 \lor (a = s_1 \land y = 1))$. It is ok, since we have the following (can be proved separately). $(\mathcal{T}, \Theta) \models \mathcal{G}(a = s_1 \rightarrow y = 1)$.

Integer Square Root (P2)

Given $M = (T, \Theta)$, and the usual interpretation I over natural numbers (!).

Prove
$$(T,\Theta) \models_I x > 0 \rightarrow F(a = s_4)$$

Preparation

Proof Rule:

$$\varphi \Rightarrow (\psi \lor \zeta)$$

$$\zeta \Rightarrow (w_{x}^{e} \land (\psi \lor E(T))$$

$$\zeta \land e = v \rightarrow [T](\psi \lor (\zeta \land e \sqsubseteq v))$$

$$\varphi \Rightarrow F\psi$$

Suppose that we have
$$(T,\Theta)\models_I G(a=s_0 \land x>0 \to F(a=s_4))$$

Then
$$(T,\Theta)\models_I (x>0 \rightarrow F(a=s_4))$$

Proof Rule

Proof Rule:

$$\varphi \Rightarrow (\psi \lor \zeta)$$

$$\zeta \Rightarrow (w_{x}^{e} \land (\psi \lor E(T)))$$

$$\zeta \land e = v \rightarrow [T](\psi \lor (\zeta \land e \sqsubseteq v))$$

$$\varphi \Rightarrow F\psi$$

We have:

$$\varphi \equiv (a = s_0 \land x > 0)$$

 $\psi \equiv (a = s_4)$
 $\zeta \equiv ?$
 $w \equiv ?$
 $e \equiv ?$

We may assume $(T, \Theta) \models_I G(\psi \vee E(T))$

Solution

Define f such that:

$$I(f(s_0, x, y_3)) = 3x + 1$$

 $I(f(s_i, x, y_3)) = 3(x + 1 - y_3) + 1 - i$ (i = 1, 2, 3)
 $I(f(s_4, x, y_3)) = 0$

Let

$$W = (NAT, \leq)$$
 $\varphi = (x > 0 \land a = s_0)$
 $w = true$ $\psi = (a = s_4)$
 $e = f(a, x, y_3)$ $\zeta = \varphi'$

Need

$$\varphi \Rightarrow (\psi \lor \zeta)$$

$$\zeta \Rightarrow w_{x}^{e} \land (\psi \lor E(T))$$

$$\zeta \land e = v \rightarrow [T](\psi \lor (\zeta \land e < v))$$

$$\zeta \wedge e = v \rightarrow [T](\psi \vee (\zeta \wedge e < v))$$



ok.

Solution, Ok with some Modification

$$(\zeta \wedge e = v) \equiv (\zeta \wedge f(a, x, y_3) = v)$$

$$t_1$$
: $a = s_0 \rightarrow f(s_1, x, 1) < v$,
i.e., $a = s_0 \rightarrow 3(x + 1 - 1) < 3x + 1$.

$$t_2$$
: $a = s_1 \land y_3 \le x \rightarrow f(s_2, x, y_3) < v$,
i.e., $a = s_1 \rightarrow 3(x + 1 - y_3) - 1 < 3(x + 1 - y_3)$. [need $y_3 < x$, ok]

$$t_3$$
: $a = s_1 \land \neg (y_3 \le x) \rightarrow (f(s_4, x, y_3) < v) \lor (s_4 = s_4)$,

$$t_4$$
: $a = s_2 \rightarrow f(s_3, x, y_3) < v$,
i.e., $a = s_2 \rightarrow 3(x + 1 - y_3) - 2 < 3(x + 1 - y_3) - 1$.
[need $y_3 < x$, also ok]

$$t_5$$
: $a = s_3 \rightarrow f(s_1, x, y_3 + y_2) < v$,

i.e.,
$$a = s_3 \rightarrow 3(x+1-(y_3+y_2)) < 3(x+1-y_3)-2$$
.
(need $y_2 \ge 1$ and $y_3 \le x$, we need to add $y_2 \ge 1$ to ζ , ok)



Integer Square Root (P2a)

Given $M = (T, \Theta)$, and the usual interpretation I over integers.

Prove
$$(T, \Theta) \models_I x > 0 \rightarrow F(a = s_4)$$

Preparation

Proof Rule:

$$\varphi \Rightarrow (\psi \lor \zeta)$$

$$\zeta \Rightarrow (w_x^e \land (\psi \lor E(T))$$

$$\zeta \land e = v \rightarrow [T](\psi \lor (\zeta \land e \sqsubseteq v))$$

$$\varphi \Rightarrow F\psi$$

Suppose that we have
$$(T,\Theta)\models_I G(a=s_0 \land x>0 \to F(a=s_4))$$

Then
$$(T,\Theta)\models_I (x>0 \rightarrow F(a=s_4))$$

Proof Rule

Proof Rule:

$$\varphi \Rightarrow (\psi \lor \zeta)$$

$$\zeta \Rightarrow (w_{x}^{e} \land (\psi \lor E(T)))$$

$$\zeta \land e = v \rightarrow [T](\psi \lor (\zeta \land e \sqsubseteq v))$$

$$\varphi \Rightarrow F\psi$$

We have:

$$\varphi \equiv (a = s_0 \land x > 0)$$

 $\psi \equiv (a = s_4)$
 $\zeta \equiv ?$
 $w \equiv ?$
 $e \equiv ?$

We may assume $(T, \Theta) \models_I G(\psi \vee E(T))$

Define f such that:

$$I(f(s_0, x, y_3)) = 3x + 1$$

 $I(f(s_i, x, y_3)) = 3(x + 1 - y_3) + 1 - i$ (i = 1, 2, 3)
 $I(f(s_4, x, y_3)) = 0$

Let

$$W = (NAT, \leq)$$
 $\varphi = (x > 0 \land a = s_0)$
 $w = x \geq 0$ $\psi = (a = s_4)$
 $e = f(a, x, y_3)$ $\zeta = \varphi'$

Need

$$\varphi \Rightarrow (\psi \lor \zeta)$$

$$\zeta \Rightarrow w_{x}^{e} \land (\psi \lor E(T)) \qquad ???$$

$$\zeta \land e = v \rightarrow [T](\psi \lor (\zeta \land e < v))$$

Solution

Define f such that:

$$I(f(s_0, x, y_3)) = 3x + 1$$

$$I(f(s_i, x, y_3)) = 3(x + 1 - y_3) + 1 - i \quad (i = 1, 2, 3) \quad y_3 \le x$$

$$= 0 \qquad \qquad \neg (y_3 \le x)$$

$$I(f(s_4, x, y_3)) = 0$$

Let

$$W = (NAT, \leq)$$
 $\varphi = (x > 0 \land a = s_0)$
 $w = x \geq 0$ $\psi = (a = s_4)$
 $e = f(a, x, y_3)$ $\zeta = \varphi'$

Need

$$\varphi \Rightarrow (\psi \lor \zeta)$$

$$\zeta \Rightarrow w_{x}^{e} \land (\psi \lor E(T))$$

$$\zeta \land e = v \rightarrow [T](\psi \lor (\zeta \land e < v))$$

$$\zeta \wedge e = v \rightarrow [T](\psi \vee (\zeta \wedge e < v))$$



Solution, Ok with some Modification

$$(\zeta \wedge e = v) \equiv (\zeta \wedge f(a, x, y_3) = v)$$

$$t_1$$
: $a = s_0 \rightarrow f(s_1, x, 1) < v$, i.e., $a = s_0 \rightarrow 3(x + 1 - 1) < 3x + 1$, or $a = s_0 \rightarrow 0 < 3x + 1$.

$$t_2$$
: $a = s_1 \land y_3 \le x \rightarrow f(s_2, x, y_3) < v$, i.e., $a = s_1 \rightarrow 3(x + 1 - y_3) - 1 < 3(x + 1 - y_3)$.

$$t_3$$
: $a = s_1 \land \neg (y_3 \le x) \rightarrow (f(s_4, x, y_3) < v) \lor (s_4 = s_4)$. [ok]

$$t_4$$
: $a=s_2 o f(s_3,x,y_3) < v$, i.e., $a=s_2 o 3(x+1-y_3)-2 < 3(x+1-y_3)-1$, or $-2 < -1$.

$$t_5$$
: $a = s_3 \rightarrow f(s_1, x, y_3 + y_2) < v$, i.e., $a = s_3 \rightarrow f(s_1, x, y_3 + y_2) < 3(x + 1 - y_3) - 2$. [$y_3 \le x$] Either $f(s_1, x, y_3 + y_2) = 0$,

or $f(s_1, x, y_3 + y_2) = 3(x + 1 - (y_3 + y_2))$ and we add $y_2 \ge 1$ to ζ .