

Alternative proof of the equivalence (on page 180) of

$$\mathcal{N} \models \exists x_1 \forall x_2 \dots \exists x_n \psi(a, \vec{c}, \vec{x})$$

and

$$\begin{aligned} \exists i_1 > i_0 \forall i_2 > i_1 \dots \exists i_n > i_{n-1} \\ \mathcal{N} \models \exists x_1 < b_{i_1} \forall x_2 < b_{i_2} \dots \exists x_n < b_{i_n} \psi(a, \vec{c}, \vec{x}). \end{aligned}$$

by Michael Weiss (diagonalargument.com)

First do the equivalence

$$\begin{aligned} \mathcal{N} &\models \forall x \exists y \psi(x, y, \vec{c}) \\ \Leftrightarrow \forall p \exists q \mathcal{N} &\models \psi(p, q, \vec{c}) \\ \Leftrightarrow \forall i_1 > i_0 \forall p < b_{i_1} \exists i_2 > i_1 \exists q < b_{i_2} \mathcal{N} &\models \psi(p, q, \vec{c}) \\ \Leftrightarrow \forall i_1 > i_0 \forall p < b_{i_1} \exists i_2 > i_1 \exists q < b_{i_2} \mathcal{M} &\models \psi(p, q, \vec{c}) \end{aligned}$$

Now that we are in \mathcal{M} , a model of PA, we can use the collection axioms. Define a function F by

$$F(x, \vec{u}) = \begin{cases} \mu y[\psi(x, y, \vec{u})] & \text{if } \exists y \psi(x, y, \vec{u}) \\ 0 & \text{otherwise} \end{cases}$$

The definition can be formalized in the language of PA (although it is not Σ_1). Using the collection axioms in \mathcal{M} , $\max_{0 \leq z \leq x} F(z, \vec{u})$ exists for all x and \vec{u} , and is attained at some z in the segment $[0, x]$. If x and \vec{u} belong to N , then so does the maximum, since it is attained at some $z \in N$ and $\mathcal{N} \models \forall \vec{u} \forall x \exists y \mathcal{N} \models \psi(x, y, \vec{u})$. Using the cofinality of the b 's in N , we conclude that F is bounded on the segment $[0, p]$ by some b_i , and we are entitled to switch the quantifiers.