Gábor Klaniczay

DREAMS AND VISIONS IN MEDIEVAL MIRACLE ACCOUNTS

Dreams frequently report a contact with the supernatural or the world of the dead, and many times this experience is apprehended and narrated as a vision. Miracles are events that mostly occurred as a result of such a contact, by the supernatural intervention of the saints, the "very special dead"[1]. It is no wonder that there is a logical interconnectedness between these two types of narratives; indeed, dreams and visions are frequently the operators which make miracles occur.

Dreams and visions have been the subject of extended theoretical reasoning in classical Antiquity, including the writings of Aristotle, Artemidorus, Macrobius, Calcidius[2]. A distinction has been made between *somnium* and *visio*, and classificatory schemes have established a hierarchy according to the truthfulness of the presumed supernatural content of these experiences. The taxonomy ranges from true *revelatio*, *oraculum, visio* to dreams (*somnium*), with much lower prestige, at worse downright false (*insomnium, visum*), or heavily influenced, according to the argumentation of late antique medicine, by psychosomatic causes.

Christianity inherited these classifications. For dreams, the Christian taxonomy had been enriched by biblical models (Joseph and Daniel), and the hierarchies had been reordered according to the

1. P. Brown, *The Cult of the Saints. Its Rise and Function in Latin Christianity*, Chicago 1981.

2. The editions and the state of research is described by S. F. Kruger, *Dreaming in the Middle Ages*, Cambridge 1992, 17-33; cf. J. S. Hanson, «Dreams and Visions in the Graeco-Roman World and Early Christianity», in *Aufstieg und Niedergang der Römischen Welt*, II: *Principat*, 23, 2, Ed. W. Haase, Berlin 1980, 1395-427; P. Cox Miller, *Dreams in Late Antiquity: Studies in the Imagination of a Culture*, Princeton 1994.

«Micrologus' Library» 48, SISMEL Edizioni del Galluzzo, 2012

dichotomy of divine or diabolic inspiration (Tertullian, Augustine, Gregory the Great)[3]. Within all this, as Steven Kruger observed in the writings of St. Augustine and John of Salisbury, dreams acquired an interesting "middleness", an ambivalent position: while their deceptive nature was continually emphasised, their propensity of carrying hidden divine or saintly messages was more appreciated than in Antiquity[4]. From the twelfth century on a new systematic reflection brought dream interpretations in contact with the "morality of the dreamer" (Hildegard of Bingen), and refined the classificatory divisions with a scholastic elaborateness (Albertus Magnus, Vincent of Beauvais and Ramon Lull)[5].

Though the problem of visions has constantly been an integral part of the broader scheme of Christian dream interpretation, special consideration must be given to them here[6]. While in the early centuries of Christianity "visionary access" to divine inspiration used to be an essential constituent of Christian communities, from the fourth century on the emerging ecclesiastical hierarchy, along with its dominant thinkers such as Saint Augustine, insisted on a restricted access to the supernatural, open only to a narrow circle of holy visionaries[7]. The steady and ample output of Christian visionary experience in the early and later Middle Ages shows, however, that this restriction had little effect in the different circles seeking intensive contact with God – hermits, monks, pilgrims, canons,

3. J. Le Goff, «Le christianisme et les rêves», in idem, *L'imaginaire médiéval. Essais*, Paris 1985, 265-316); idem, «Rêves», in J. Le Goff and J.-C. Schmitt, eds. *Dictionnaire raisonné de l'Occident médiéval*, Paris 1999, 951-68; M. Dulaey, *Le rêve dans la vie et la pensée de saint Augustin*, Paris 1973; L. M. Bitel, «'In Visu Noctis': Dreams in European Hagiography and Histories, 450-900», *History of Religions*, 31 (1991), 39-59; G. G. Stroumsa, «Dreams and Visions in Early Christian Discourse», in D. Shulman and G. G. Stroumsa, eds., *Dream Cultures. Explorations in the Comparative History of Dreaming*, New York-Oxford 1999), 189-212; P. E. Dutton, *The Politics of Dreaming in the Carolingian Empire*, Lincoln and London 1994.

4. Kruger, *Dreaming in the Middle Ages*, 35-53.

5. *Ibid.*, 76-122; J.-C. Schmitt, «Rêver au XII^e siècle», in *I sogni nel medioevo*, ed. T. Gregory, Rome 1985; idem, *Les Revenants: les vivants et les morts dans la société médiévale*, Paris 1994; idem, «The Liminality and Centrality of Dreams in the Medieval West», in Shulman and Stroumsa, eds., *Dream Cultures*, 274-87; M. Wittmer-Butsch, *Zur Bedeutung von Schlaf und Traum im Mittelalter*, Krems 1990.

6. On visions in general see E. Benz, *Die Vision: Erfahrungsformen und Bilderwelt*, Stuttgart 1969.

7. I. Moreira, *Dreams, Visions, and Spiritual Authority in Merovingian* Gaul, Ithaca and London 2000, 11-38.

bishops or later lay religious movements, mystics[8]. Besides this variety of visionary experience one should also mention two distinct visionary-prophetic traditions: on the one hand the unfolding of a Christian mythology of the "other world", the "birth of Purgatory", the visions of Hell and Paradise[9] and on the other eschatological and apocalyptic imagery, "testing David with Sibyl", that also largely relied on the genre of visions and revelations[10].

As for the religious practice of healing miracles, antique, pagan antecedents can be recognized as well. One of these happens to be very closely related to our topic: the incubation miracles related to the "divine doctor", Asclepius[11]. At the cult-sites of Asclepius, in Pergamon or Epidauros (in the North East Peloponnese), a cult unfolded around 300 BC; the ill supplicants were sleeping in the sanctuaries, waiting for the appearance of Asclepius in their dreams. If this occurred, according to the votive tablets (*iamata*) preserved in Epidauros, the divine doctor healed them by touching the ill organs, by performing a professional medical operation, or by giving advice and prescriptions for the cure[12]. The incubation cult of Asclepius had several parallels and was also attached to other deities (such as Isis and Serapis or minor ones such as Amphiaraos at Oropos)[13], and in the first century AD it counted as a significant rival to Christianity. According to Thomas Mathews, it contributed to a redefinition of the figure of Christ as a miracle-working healer[14].

The persistent concept of miraculous dream-healing was still dominant when, from the third century on, new agents of miracu-

8. P. Dinzelbacher, *Vision und Visionsliteratur im Mittelalter*, Stuttgart 1981.

9. J. Le Goff, *La Naissance du purgatoire*, Paris 1981; Jérôme Baschet, *Les Justices de l'au-delà: les représentations de l'enfer en France et en Italie, XII-XV^e siècle*, Rome 1993; C. Carozzi, *Le Voyage de l'âme dans l'au-delà: d'après la littérature latine, V^e-XIII^e siècle*, Rome 1994.

10. B. McGinn, *Visions of the End. Apocalyptic Traditions in the Middle Ages*, New York 1979; *The Apocalypse in the Middle Ages*, eds. R. K. Emmerson and B. McGinn, Ithaca, N.Y. 1992.

11. K. Kerényi, *Der göttliche Atzt. Studien über Asklepios und seine* Kultstätten, Stuttgart 1998.

12. E. J. Edelstein and L. Edelstein, *Asclepius. A Collection and Interpretation of the Testimonies*, Baltimore 1945, 1998[2].

13. M. Hamilton, *Incubation and the Cure of Diseases in Pagan Temples and Christian Churches*, London 1905; W. A. Jayne, *The Healing Gods of Ancient Civilizations*, New Haven 1925.

14. Th. F. Mathews, *The Clash of Gods. A Reinterpretation of Early Christian Art*, Princeton 1993, 69-72.

lous healing emerged, the saints. The first *libelli miraculorum* of their healing sites contained a significant percentage of incubation miracles, and some of these early saints, especially in the eastern, Byzantine domain, were foremost specialized in dream-healing, developing a Christian version of the Asclepian cult[15]. The best known of these incubation saints were the famous *anargiroi,* the doctor saints Cosmas and Damian, whose principal cult-site, the Cosmedion in Constantinople, preserved a detailed list of these incubation miracles[16], and similar collections remain from the sanctuaries of St. Thecla at Seleucia and Aegae[17], St. Artemios at Constantinople[18], St. John and Cyrus at Menoutis[19], and others. These incubation cults have been the subject lately of a series of insightful analyses which regarded the dream-healing as a particular feature of Oriental, Byzantine Christianity[20]. The object of my enquiry would be to see, how this form of miracle fared in the West, in Latin Christianity[21].

15. H. Delehaye, «Les Recueils antiques de Miracles de saints», *Analecta Bollandiana* 43 (1925), 1-85, 305-25; A.-J. Festugière, *Sainte Thècle, Saints Côme et Damien, Saints Cyr et Jean (extraits), Saint Georges*, Paris 1971.

16. L. Deubner, *De Incubatione capita quattuor*, Leipzig 1900; E. Rupprecht, ed., *Cosmae et Damiani sanctorum medicorum vita et miracula e codice Londoniensi*, Neue Deutsche Forschungen 20, Berlin 1935; cf. I. Csepregi, «The Miracles of St Cosmas and Damian. Characteristics of Dream Healing», *Annual of Medieval Studies at CEU* 7 (2002), 89-122.

17. G. Dagron, ed., *Vie et miracles de sainte Thècle: texte grec, traduction et commentaire*, Bruxelles 1978.

18. V. S. Crisafulli and J. W. Nesbitt, *The Miracles of St. Artemios. A Collection of Miracle Stories by an Anonymous Author of Seventh-Century Byzantium*, Leiden 1997.

19. N. Fernandez Marcos, *Los Thaumata de Sofronio. Contribucion al estudio de la incubatio cristiana*, Madrid 1975.

20. Cf. the Ph.D. Thesis by I. Csepregi, *The Compositional History of Greek Christian Incubation Miracle Collections: Saint Thecla, Saint Cosmas and Damian, Saint Cyrus and John and Saint Artemios,* defended in 2007 at the Central European University, Budapest.

21. Before giving my article to print, I got acquainted with two recent and important studies by Luigi Canetti on the very same issue of examining the incubation miracles in Latin Christianity, partly discussing the same materials as I have done: «L'incubazione cristiana tra Antichità e Medioevo», *Rivista di Storia del Cristianesimo*, 7 (2010), 149-80, and «Sogno e terapia nel Medioevo latino», in *Terapie e guarigioni in età normanno-sveva. Convegno internazionale di storia della medicina nel Medioevo (Ariano Irpino, 5-7 ottobre 2008),* eds. E. D'Angelo, A. Paravicini Bagliani, O. Zecchino, Tavarnuzze (Firenze) 2010, in print. While I could not take into consideration here his insights which complement well my own observations, I will refer to a few important sources he analyses.

Early Medieval Evolution

From the large body of early medieval hagiographic writing from Gregory the Great[22] to the Venerable Bede, containing many dispersed data on dream-healing miracles, I will select here two well-documented examples from late sixth-century Gaul: the broad hagiographic oeuvre of the saintly bishop Gregory of Tours[23] and the miracles of St. Radegund (520/25-587) an early medieval queen who became a nun[24], described by the poet and hagiographer Venantius Fortunatus[25].

Gregory of Tours compiled two important legend collections, one dedicated to *The Glory of the Martyrs*, the other to *The Glory of the Confessors*[26], and he recorded two large miracle collections himself: that of St. Julian of Brioude, a Roman martyr venerated in Auvergne, and the three books containing hundreds of miracles occurring at the grave of St. Martin of Tours[27].

Gregory knew about Saints Cosmas and Damian, "the twins" who were "skilled doctors", whom he listed among the martyrs he had been praising. "Many say that these saints appear to ill people in visions and tell them what to do; once people follow these instructions, they leave with their health"[28]. Speaking about another incu-

22. Analysed by Canetti, «L'incubazione cristiana», 176-77, cf. Gregorii Magni *Dial*. II, 8, 12, cf. Gregorio Magno, *Storie di santi e di diavoli*, eds. S. Pricoco and M. Simonetti, Roma-Milano 2005, 140.

23. R. van Dam, *Saints and Their Miracles in Late Antique Gaul*, Princeton 1993; M. Heinzelmann, *Gregory of Tours: History and Society in the Sixth Century*, Cambridge 2001.

24. S. Gäbe, «Radegundis: sancta, regina, ancilla. Zum Heiligkeitsideal der Radegundisviten von Fortunat und Baudonivia», *Francia* 16 (1989), 1-30; R. Folz, *Les saintes reines du Moyen Age en Occident (VI^e^-XIII^e^ siècles),* Bruxelles 1992, 13-24; G. Klaniczay, *Holy Rulers and Blessed Princesses. Dynastic Cults in Medieval Central Europe* Cambridge 2002, 70-77.

25. *Vita S. Radegundis* libri II, ed. B. Krusch, in *MGH SS RM* II, 358-95; English tr. in *Sainted Women of the Dark Ages*, ed. by J. A. McNamara, J. E. Halborg, E. G. Whatley, Durham, NC 1992, 61-105; the most recent edition: *La vie de Sainte Radegonde par Fortunat. Poitiers, Bibliothèque municipale, Manuscrit 250 (136)*, ed. Robert Favreau, préface de Jean Favier, Paris 1995; cf. M. Rouche, «Fortunat et Baudonivie: deux biographes pour une seule sainte», in *La vie de Sainte Radegonde*, 239-49.

26. Gregory of Tours, *Glory of the Martyrs*, ed. R. van Dam, Liverpool 1988; idem, *Glory of the Confessors*, ed. R. van Dam, Liverpool 1988.

27. Gregorius Turonensis, *De virtutibus sancti Martini episcopi*, ed. B. Krusch, *MGH SRM* 1.2. 134-211; idem, *De passione et virtutibus sancti Iuliani martyris*, ed. B. Krusch, *MGH SRM* 1.2. 404-22; English translation: Van Dam, *Saints*, 162-318.

28. Gregory of Tours, *Glory of the Martyrs*, 122.

bation saint, a martyr from the Syrian region, St. Domitius, Gregory narrates the healing (and the conversion) of an "unbelieving Jew". Suffering from hip pains, he "asked to be brought to the entrance of the courtyard and cried he was unworthy to cross the holy threshold". Then, "in front of the gate of the courtyard, the night came and he fell asleep. But the blessed martyr did not postpone his compassion for long. During that night he approached the ill man in a dream and ordered him to depart with his health", obtaining, incidentally, also his conversion[29].

He also attributes this type of healing to contemporary saints, such as the saintly confessor, bishop Albinus of Angers:

> A paralyzed man ... was carried on a wagon and sat before the glass windows in the apse where the holy limbs were buried. He fell asleep and saw a man who came to him and said to him: "How long do you sleep? Do you not wish to be cured?". The paralyzed man said: "If only I might deserve to be cured!". The man said to him: "When you hear the bell sounding for prayers at the third hour, immediately rise and enter the church to which you have come. For at that hour ... the blessed Martin will enter the church with his companion Albinus ... If you are present at that moment, you will be cured"[30].

The nightly expeditions of Saint Martin are also described among his own miracles, gathered by Gregory of Tours. In the *Libri de virtutibus sancti Martini*, among the 232 miraculous healings described, there are 17 (7%) that were brought about through dreams[31]. Let us see some typical examples. Landulf the madman was tortured in his dream by and resisting successfully to demons. Then he was suddenly

> affected by a mental daze; he saw that the blessed church was shining in a fresh light. The saint came out of the church and said to him: "Your prayer has been heard, and behold! You will be healed of the illness from which you suffer". And so he made the sign of the blessed cross over his head and departed. Once Landulf returned to his senses, all his attacks had departed, and he felt that he had recovered his original health[32].

29. *Ibid.*, 123.
30. Gregory of Tours, *Glory of the Confessors*, 98.
31. Moreira, *Dreams, Visions*, 130–35.
32. Book 2, Miracle 18, Van Dam, *Saints*, 237.

A mute man from Angers was healed in a dream at St. Martin's shrine in Candes:One night before Sunday, while this man was lying in the house of his host [Martin], it happened that suddenly the place was filled with a bright light. And behold, this man was terrified with fear and knelt on the ground. Immediately there appeared to him a man who was clothed in a bishop's robe. This man touched him, made the sign of the Cross of Christ on his forehead, and said: "The Lord has made you healthy. Rise, hurry to the Church and thank God". The ill man then raised his voice in a speech of gratitude and filled the region with his shouts[33].

Beside the recurrent phenomena of bright light accompanying the appearance of the saint and the sign of the cross on the forehead, some dream-apparitions show the saint as even more active. A nun called Apra "suffered from a burning fever and lost the use of all her limbs; only her tongue was still at her service. Because her hands as well as her feet were crippled, she lay there and day and night requested the assistance of the blessed [Martin]. One night it seemed to her that an old man came to her and gently touched and stroked all her limbs". In the morning she awoke with her feet healed, and subsequently, "on another day she received instructions in her sleep" to go to the church and participate at the vigil before the feast of St. Martin, where her ailing hand was also cured[34]. Both the advice given in a kind of "remedial dream", and the physical action of "gently touching and stroking" all the limbs of the afflicted resemble very much the methods of the dream-healers of Eastern Christendom in late Antiquity and Byzantium.

A further comparative observation could be related to the spatial aspect of the miracle. The shrines and temples in Byzantium functioned as kinds of hospitals, the cure-seekers awaited the saints' nightly appearance residing inside the buildings, and the shrines were, so-to-say, "inhabited" by those healing saints. In most Frankish cases the afflicted rather slept outside, near the sanctuary, and the saints came out from their resting place to visit the afflicted, and heal them[35].

Let us also consider two miracles narrated by Venantius Fortunatus concerning St. Radegund:

33. Book 3, Miracle 23, Van Dam, *Saints*, 269.
34. Book 2, Miracle 31, Van Dam, *Saints*, 244.
35. E. Bozóky, «Le miracle et la maison du saint», *Hortus Artium Mediaevalium* 9 (2003), 247-52, repr. in eadem, *Le Moyen Âge miraculeux*, Paris 2010, 21-34.

Monacha Animia suffered so with dropsical swelling that she seemed to have reached her end. The appointed sisters awaited the moment when she would exhale her spirit. While she was sleeping, however, it seemed to her that the most venerable blessed Radegund ordered her to descend nude into a bath (*in balneo*) with no water in it. Then, with her own hand, the blessed one seemed to pour oil on the sick woman's head and cover her with a new garment. After this strange ritual, when she awakened from her sleep, all trace of the disease had disappeared.... Her head still smelled of oil in witness of the miracle but the pernicious disease was no longer in her belly[36].

The last miracle Fortunatus tells about Radegund concerns a tribune suffering from a severe constriction of his throat. Radegund visits him in a dream, she takes him by the hand and shows him a place in which there are relics of Saint Martin, and where she orders that a church should be built in his honour. Then she delivers several punches to the tribune's jaw and throat and says "I came so that God might confer a better health upon you". Finally she requests him to release, for her sake, those he held in his prison, which he carries out after his awakening. A messenger later confirmed that she died at the very hour of the dream of the tribune[37].

Let us stop here for a moment and consider the conditions of dream-healing in these miracle accounts from sixth century Gaul. We meet here some of the typical features of incubation as known in the Antiquity and preserved, as we have seen, in the Byzantine East. Those who seek the cure sleep beside the sanctuary; they are visited by the saint at night and the healing is obtained in consequence of the nightly visit. As to the techniques of healing, we could encounter the following: the mere meeting in dreams might suffice or the saints could recommend them to approach their shrines and relics. They can also bring about the healing by pronouncing words (such as ordering them to stand up and walk), by the conventional wonder-working sign of "the blessed cross", by touching, even "striking" the suffering body-part, just as living saints, faith-healers and popular soothsayers do. The employment of other sacred/magical healing techniques reported in the dream-healing of the nun Animia is also remarkable. Giselle de Nie interpreted this to be a symbolical sequence: sending the afflicted back

36. *Sainted Women*, 84.
37. *Ibid.*, 85.

to the womb for being reborn again, then, after a kind of new conception operated by her being anointed with consecrated oil, the saint covers her with a new robe, to wake up, after this mystery (*peracto mysterio*), entirely cured[38]. A further factor is the alliance of two saints for making the healing really effective; both St. Albinus and St. Radegund associate St. Martin, the most renowned saint of the region with their mediation. We can also observe a highly significant coincidence: the soul of Radegund visited the tribune in his dream just at the moment of her death, before departing from earth, obtaining in a Christ-like redemptory manner the liberation of a host of prisoners and the foundation of a church as a condition of the requested healing.

Furthermore, late antique Asclepian incubation and the cult formed around Saints Cosmas and Damian suggested that "God learned medicine"[39] and was healing like a human doctor, making prescriptions or performing surgery. Among the Frankish cases, so far, no such example had been found. This might be explained by the greater presence of professional medical expertise in late antique Byzantium or Rome than in sixth century Gaul. If we broaden our early medieval sample to include the turn of the first millennium, however, the medical-chirurgical examples do appear here as well. In the eleventh-century *Miracula Sancti Benedicti*, we hear of St. Benedict making an incision with a knife to open the closed eyelids of a blind child[40]; other saints who appear and heal in dreams readjust fractures, remove abscesses, close ulcers, and perform operations. There are, of course unrealistic medical performances as well: readjusting carved-out eyeballs, cut-out tongues, reintegrating amputated legs, etc[41]. In any case, the saint is basically considered to be a doctor in Latin Christianity as well: a tenth-century peasant exclaimed that the medicines and cures proposed by the doctors were miserable, he could only trust the medicine offered by the saint doctor, Fiacre[42].

38. G. de Nie, «Fatherly and motherly curing in sixth-century Gaul: Saint Radegund's *mysterium*», in A.-M. Korte, *Women and Miracle Stories. A multidisciplinary exploration*, Leiden 2001, 53-87, at 75-77.

39. The term was coined by Ludwig Edelstein, *Asclepius,* vol. 2, 139-80.

40. E. de Certain, ed., *Miracula S. Benedicti*, Paris 1858, VIII, §28, 324-25.

41. P.-A. Sigal, *L'Homme et le miracle dans la France médiévale (XI^e^-XII^e^ siècle)*, Paris 1985, 139-40; cf. also, especially for the carved out eyeballs, *The Book of Sainte Foy*, tr. intr. by P. Sheingorn, Philadelphia 1995, 47-48.

42. *Ibid.*, 139, referring to J. Dubois, *Un sanctuaire monastique au Moyen Âge: Saint-Fiacre-en-Brie*, Genève 1976, 115.

For an overview of the early medieval evolution of the type of dream-healing miracle, besides a number of insightful analyses[43], we dispose of an ambitious quantitative assessment by Pierre-André Sigal, who analysed a total of 2,050 posthumous healing miracles, collected from 76 saints' lives and 166 miracle lists, before the end of the twelfth century. Within this material he found 259 miracles (12%) obtained by dream-healing, which, though a rather small fraction within the entire pool of the miracles of the age, is still a significant number to be reckoned with[44]. Of these dream-miracles 102 (40%) are of the "classical" type where the miraculous healing is obtained during the dream, whereas in the case of the larger portion – 157 miracles (60%) – the dream-vision has only an annunciatory function: the saint tells the believers what they should do in order to be healed. This sample also shows that the number of visions occurring at (or within) the sanctuary is much smaller than in oriental Christianity: among the cases where healing was obtained during the dream, only 42 occurred at the shrine and the rest mostly at the domicile of the afflicted. For the annunciatory dreams this proportion is even much more extreme: 121 dream-visions occurred at the domicile, 7 on the way to the sanctuary, 8 at the pilgrim's sleeping place, 8 at a sanctuary other than that of the saint, 10 at an unknown location, and only 3 near the sanctuary. This proportion announces the subsequent, late medieval eclipse of shrine miracles by the growing number of distance miracles[45]. Dream-healing offers the possibility to become one of the specific ways whereby the required proximity to the saint and a physical contact with his relics could be transmuted to a spiritual experience at a distance from the shrine.

43. C. Rendtel, *Hochmittelalterliche Mirakelberichte als Quelle zur Sozial- und Mentalitätsgeschichte und zur Geschichte der Heiligenverehrung untersuchten Texten insbesondere aus Frankreich*, Diss. Phil. FU Berlin, Düsseldorf 1985, 40-44, 118-39; Van Dam, *Saints*; A. Rousselle, *Croire et guérir. La foi en Gaule dans l'Antiquité tardive*, Paris 1990; M. Heinzelmann, «Die Funktion des Wunders in der spätantiken und frühmittelalterlichen Historiographie», in K. Herbers, M. Heinzelmann, and D. R. Bauer, eds., *Mirakel im Mittelalter. Konzeptionen, Erscheinungsformen, Deutungen*, Stuttgart 2002, 23-62; J. Keskiaho, «The Handling and Interpretation of Dreams and Visions in Late Sixth- to Eighth-Century Gallic and Anglo-Latin Hagiography and Histories», *Early Medieval Europe*, 3 (2005), 227-48.

44. Sigal, *L'Homme et le miracle*, 134-46; G. de Nie, *Word, Image and Experience. Dynamics of Miracle and Self-Perception in Sixth-Century Gaul*, Aldershot 2003.

45. Ch. Krötzl, «Miracles au tombeau – miracles à distance. Approches typologiques», in D. Aigle, ed., *Miracle et karāma. Hagiograhies médiévales comparées*, Turnhout 2000, 557-76.

While we observe the unfolding of this new trend, we should not disregard that there remain some striking examples which still exemplify the archaic pattern, the close link between the appearing saint and his relics. In the ninth-century miracle collection of Saint Privat there is a story about a priest who was suffering from fever and saw in a dream a head coming out the reliquary, position itself upon his head, then return to the reliquary. Then from another reliquary an arm came out, and joined his arm, and subsequently returned to its location. The same way the other arm, the legs, and other body parts appeared and touched him and he was perfectly cured by the morning[46].

Taken together, the early medieval dream-healing miracles in Latin Christianity offer a noteworthy example of the continuation of the Late Antique and Byzantine tradition of incubation miracles[47].

The Age of Canonization Processes

The institutional control-mechanism which regulated, from the beginning of the thirteenth century, who could become a universally recognized saint in Latin Christianity, had a profound influence upon the genre of miracle accounts. In earlier cults the miracles recorded at the cult-site or narrated in the legends had been rather freely shaped by the narrator(s), adjusted to pre-existent patterns and rewritten to form a stylistically well constructed sequence in support of the cult. The canonization process, on the other hand, required a legally constructed series of proofs of sanctity, obtained from testimonies under oath by those concerned. These testimonies were meticulously recorded, examined and authenticated, first by the papal legates, then by the members of the Consistory at the Papal Curia[48]. This procedure also changed the conditions in which

46. Sigal, *L'Homme et le miracle*, 139.

47. This continuity is especially relevant to two miracle collections from the tenth-century Napolitan region, attributed to Pietro Suddiacono, and recently analysed by Luigi Canetti in his unpublished study «Sogno e terapia»; cf. D. Mallardo, «L'incubazione nella cristianità medievale napoletana», 57 (1949), 465-98; A. Vuolo, *Una testimonianza agiografica napoletana. Il 'Libellus miraculorum s. Agnelli' (sec. X)*, Napoli 1987, 149-201; Pietro Suddiacono napoletano, *L'opera agiografica*, ed. E. D'Angelo, Firenze 2002 (Edizione nazionale dei testi mediolatini, 7, ser. I, 4).

48. E. W. Kemp, *Canonization and Authority in the Western Church*, London

these miracles occurred. The investigations created an unusual conjuncture of pilgrims around the shrine, a *dynamique miraculeuse* much more intensive and concentrated than the one at traditional faith-healing shrines (where there was a continuous but modest flow of pilgrims with some routine-like increase on the saints' feasts)[49].

The question arises: did the specific type of incubation miracles, the dream-healing or the apparition of the saints in visions acquire a new form or an increased significance in these new conditions, or did it, on the contrary, decline?

Here again, we can rely upon some quantitative research. The vast material of the acts of medieval canonization processes – 71 officially initiated investigations leading to 36 canonizations in the Middle Ages, plus another 70 unofficial local inquiries, which, however, tried to emulate the official legal prescriptions in order to be fully recognized – in all contain close to ten thousand miracle accounts, which were first evaluated by André Vauchez[50] and Michael Goodich[51], who also provided the first analyses of dreams and visions related to medieval canonization cases or narrated in the testimonies on miracles[52]. The question was examined in a greater detail by Constanze Rendtel and Maria Wittmer Butsch, who studied a sample of 454 miracles and found 10% in this group related to dreams and visions[53]. Based on the multiplication of such case stud-

1948; T. Wetzstein, *Heilige vor Gericht. Das Kanonisationsverfahren im europäischen Spätmittelalter*, Köln-Weimar-Wien 2004.

49. Sigal, *L'Homme et le miracle*, 165-225.

50. A. Vauchez, *La Sainteté en Occident aux derniers siècles du moyen âge. D'après les procès de canonisation et les documents hagiographiques*, Rome 1981.

51. M. Goodich, *Vita Perfecta: The Ideal of Sainthood in the Thirteenth Century*, Stuttgart 1982; idem, *Violence and Miracle in the Fourteenth Century. Private Grief and Public Salvation*, Chicago 1995.

52. M. Goodich, «Vision, Dream and Canonization Policy under Pope Innocent III», in J. C. Moore, ed., *Pope Innocent III and his World*, Aldershot 1999, 151-63; idem, «Reason or Revelation? The Criteria for the Proof and Credibility of Miracles in Canonization Processes», in *Procès de canonisation au Moyen Âge. Aspects juridiques et religieux – Medieval Canonization Processes. Legal and Religious Aspects*, Rome 2004, 180-97; idem, «*Vidi in somnium*: The Uses of Dream and Vision in the Miracle», in idem, *Miracles and Wonders. The Development of the Concept of Miracle, 1150-1350*, Aldershot 2007, 100-16; A. Vauchez, «Les Songes d'Innocent III», in L. Gatto and P. Supino Martini, eds., *Studi sulle società e le culture del Medioevo per Girolamo Arnaldi,* Roma 2002, 695-706; cf. also J. Gardner, «Päpstliche Träume und Palastmalereien. Ein Essay über mittelalterliche Traumikonographie», in A. Paravicini Bagliani and G. Stabile, eds., *Träume im Mittelalter. Ikonologische Studien*, Stuttgart 1989, 113-24.

53. M. Wittmer-Butsch and C. Rendtel, *Miracula. Wunderheilungen im Mittelalter*, Köln-Wien 2003, 217-40.

ies it would be worthwhile to aim at putting together a more or less complete collection of dream-healing miracles in the available documentation of these 141 medieval canonization investigations. Working in this direction, in what follows, I will present a selection of a few typical cases from the thirteenth century related to my own research on this subject.

Let me, however, begin here by taking an example from a canonization preceding the institution of the new type of process, that of Thomas Becket[54]. One should add that this process had been promoted by Pope Alexander III, who first pronounced the aspiration of the Papacy for having a monopoly on the canonizations of new saints in Latin Christendom[55], which might account for the unusually thorough documentation of the saint's miracles, attested by a mass of witnesses and documented by two scribes, William of Canterbury and Benedict of Peterborough[56]. Dream-miracles had a salient presence in this collection: from among the first 161 miracles recorded at the grave of the martyr bishop by William of Canterbury, 22 (14%) were related to a vision or a dream in which the saint appeared. A subsequent and very famous incubation miracle – the healing of Philip, son of King Louis VII of France on the basis of the advice to make a pilgrimage to Canterbury given to him by Thomas Becket in a dream[57] – is depicted also on the stained glass windows of the cathedral.

My first series of detailed examples comes from the canonization process of St. Elizabeth of Hungary, daughter of King Andrew II of Hungary, a saintly princess, who died as the pious widow of Ludwig IV, landgrave of Thuringia in 1231[58]. The investigation had been car-

54. R. Foreville, *Thomas Becket dans la tradition historique et hagiographique*, London 1981; B.Ward, *Miracles and the Medieval Mind. Theory, Record and Event 1000-1215*, Aldershot 1987.

55. S. Kuttner, «La réserve papale du droit de canonisation», *Revue historique de droit français et étranger*, 4e série 17 (1938), 172-228.

56. William of Canterbury, *Miracula S Thomae Cantuariensis*, in J. Craigie Robinson and J. B. Sheppard, eds., *Materials for the History of Thomas Becket, Archbishop of Canterbury*, 7 vols. London 1875-1885, vol. 1, 137-546; Benedict of Peterborough, *Miracula S Thomae Cantuariensis*, ibid, vol. 2, 21-181; R. C. Finucane, *Miracles and Pilgrims*, *Popular Beliefs in Medieval England*, London 1977.

57. Cf. Finucane, *Miracles and Pilgrims*, 124.

58. The documents of the canonization process are edited by A. Huyskens, *Quellenstudien zur Geschichte der hl. Elisabeth*, Marburg 1908; I have discussed her cult in my *Holy Rulers*, 210-50; it was examined in detail in D. Blume - M. Werner, eds., *Elisabeth von Thüringen: Eine europäische Heilige*, Berlin 2007; cf. also

ried out between 1232 and 1235, by two papal commissions, recording the testimonies of about 800 witnesses on altogether 129 (104+26 of which one overlapping) miraculous healings, presented to the papal consistory in two separate lists. Although in more than 40 cases we have an indication that the pilgrims spent several days (and nights) near the shrine in the expectation of healing, which would have been a favourable situation for such dream appearances, the overall proportion of dream healings is relatively low here: there were only 6 cases. Yet, these cases are quite revealing, so I will present them in some detail.

Let me first recall two more or less typical cases. In I/76 a half-blind woman asks Elizabeth's help and receives advice in a nightly apparition to go near the altar and have her afflicted eye "ventilated" by the altarcloth (*corporale*)[59]. In another one (II/23) the blessed Elizabeth, appearing in "great light" during the night, and asking the afflicted *conversus*, whose hand had been crushed by a mill-stone: "Do you want to be healed?" (*Vis sanari*?); subsequently she touches the wounded and horribly disfigured hand and instantly renders it healthy – to the great wonder of all those present, among whom the opinion had prevailed that "according to the natural course of events" this hand would never be healed[60].

A woman with an injured hand narrates (I/40) that "she spent the night in the hospital and in her dream she saw herself inserting her hand into the sarcophagus, caressing the saint's body, which appeared to her to be humid as she touched it. Then with her moist hand she started rubbing her knee". When she woke up, she repeated the therapy suggested to her by her dream, inserting her hand into the tomb, starting to sweat in consequence, then rubbing her lame members with her hand, and this rather archaic healing technique indeed healed her[61]. This is not incubation, the saint does not appear in live form, yet the dream provides advice and brings the dreamer to the shrine.

the most recent study by O. Gecser, *The Feast and the Pulpit: Preachers, Sermons and the Cult of St. Elizabeth of Hungary, 1235-ca. 1500* (forthcoming in 2012 – Assisi).

59. The numbers in parentheses refer to the numbering of miracles according to the two lists easily retrievable from the cited edition of Huyskens, *Quellenstudien*, so I will only refer to page numbers if I have a longer textual citation. The translations from the Latin here are my own.

60. Cf. also the miracle I/51.

61. Huyskens, *Quellenstudien*, 192.

Another example is provided in the healing story of Beatrix, a nine-year-old girl (I/3), who had a hump and goiter (*gibbosa et strumosa*) and was carried by her stepfather on his back to the sepulchre, where they stayed, together with the mother, for ten days, praying for the healing. Their request had not been heard, and the mother, upset, complained to Elizabeth, "I will warn everyone not to visit your tomb since you did not listen to me!" and left in a sulk. After the family travelled a mile and a half they stopped at a spring near a place called Rosseberch, the daughter crying from the pain in her body. There while she cried, she started to sweat and then fell asleep. When awoke she said she had seen in her dream a lady approaching her whose face was splendid and her hands graceful and white and with her hands the lady touched her body on the back and chest and said: "Stand up and walk!". The girl arose; sweating all over and trembling struck her chest with her hand and said to her mother: "O, mother, here I am free in all my body". And standing upright, she started to walk freed from her hump and goiter and became healthy[62].

The context of this dream-healing is not a peaceful invocation of the saint but rather a menace addressed to her, the kind of saint-coercion examined by Patrick Geary and Aron Gurevich[63].

Miracle I/105 presents the saint as playing a trick on the afflicted: the appearing *pulcherrima domina* offers a woman with an eye disease an apple (a metaphor for the eye-ball), telling her "Surge, comede", but the woman responds that she is not allowed to eat because that day she vowed to fast on bread and water to honour St. Elizabeth. This prompt answer earned her a cure by the next day.

Finally there is a complex vision-sequence among the miracles of St. Elizabeth, the miracle of the "epileptic" Cistercian monk, Henricus, from the monastery Amelungesburnen in Saxony (II/1). He suffered so gravely and miserably that single nights and other days he lay on the floor or his bed his head, back and legs were shaking, he was uttering cries that bore witness to a great pain in the body, often keeping four monks at his side to help. ... one night, as he claims, there appeared to him a woman in white robes who asked

62. Huyskens, *Quellenstudien*, 159-60.

63. P. Geary, «La coercition des saints dans la pratique religieuse médiévale», in *La culture populaire au Moyen Age, IVe Colloque de l'Institut d'études médiévales de l'Université de Montréal*, Montréal, 1977, 149-77; idem, *Furta sacra. Thefts of relics in the Central Middle Age*, Princeton 1990; A. Ia. Gurevich, *Medieval Popular Culture: Problems of Belief and Perception*, trans. by J. M. Bak and P. A. Hollingsworth, Cambridge 1990, 39-77.

whether he would like to be cured, to which he responded: "With great pleasure". She said: "If you want to be cured make an oath to lady Elizabeth of Marburg and hence you will be cured". At first Henricus was reticent or afraid to take this oath, but after two renewed apparitions he did and indeed got better. However, "because the rule of St. Benedict prohibits the monks from taking oaths or doing other special things without the permission of their spiritual father ... the prior said it was possible that the monk was seduced to do this prohibited thing by the apparition and persuasion of a malignant spirit...". But the following night, the same person he saw earlier appeared again and this finally convinced the abbot to allow him to go on a pilgrimage and get healed[64].

This convoluted miracle account is interesting in several ways. The dream-healing is developed here in a set of serial apparitions, with an uncertainty as to whether the "woman in white robes" was saint Elizabeth herself or simply a divine envoy (often in early medieval incubation miracles saints came semi-incognito to patients). The uncertainty goes even further as the superiors in the monastery wonder if the *apparitio* could be a malignant spirit. Here we join the long medieval tradition of the discernment of spirits (*discretio spirituum*)[65]. "Satan himself goes disguised as an angel of light", as Saint Paul warned long before (2 Cor, 11,14). This type of doubt about the origin of the miraculous dreams and apparitions and trying to decide whether the miracles were really obtained by the mediation of the saint or rather by some kind of magic were key matters to be dealt with by the new-stile canonization investigations. Pope Innocent III underlines this dilemma in most of the canonization processes he initiated[66]. They had to provide a new kind of legally tested and canonically examined proof for miracles, which were being challenged by increasingly rationalistic-critical attitudes in the twelfth century.

64. Huyskens, *Quellenstudien*, 243-44.

65. F. Vanderbrouke, «Discernement des esprits», *Dictionnaire de spiritualité ascétique et mystique*, dir. M. Viller, Paris 1937-95, vol. 3, 1254-66; N. Caciola, *Discerning Spirits: Divine and Demonic Possession in the Middle Ages*, Ithaca, N.Y. 2003; G. Klaniczay, «The Process of Trance, Heavenly and Diabolic Apparitions in Johannes Nider's *Formicarius*», in *Procession, Performance, Liturgy, and Ritual*, ed. N. van Deusen, Ottawa 2007, 203-58.

66. A. Vauchez, «Les Origines et le développement du procès de canonization (XII^{e}-XIII^{e} siècles)», in F. J. Felten and N. Jaspert, eds., *Vita Religiosa im Mittelalter. Festschrift für Kaspar Elm zum 70. Geburtstag*, Berlin 1999, 845-56.

My next example is related to the canonization of an eleventh-century queen, Margaret of Scotland, whose miracles from a 1245 investigation at her relics in Dunfermline Abbey were recently edited by Robert Bartlett[67]. Here we find a strikingly high percentage of dreams and visions – 27 out of 46 miracles (59%). Catherine Keene, writing a biography of Margaret, proposed[68], referring also to recent studies by Lisa Bitel[69], that this preponderance of visions and dreams might be related here to a context of Celtic beliefs. Indeed, we find a similarly high percentage of dream miracles in the twelfth-century miracle collection of St. Aebbe (sister of the seventh-century King Oswiu of Northumbria), in which 24 out of 43 miracles (56%) involve a dream or a vision of the saint[70].

Be it as it may, this series of miracles is one of the most useful for quantitative evaluation. Keene has shown that, besides dream-healing, these apparitions have an important additional function in that they convert the seers, whether a woman who becomes a nun (ch. 13), a monk who relinquishes his desire to return to the secular world (ch. 24), or a healed person who becomes a monk (ch. 28)[71]. Here too the protagonists struggle to distinguish dream and vision: "close to sleep but not yet completely asleep" (ch. 1). We can also find a nice series of self-introductions by the saint, thereby excluding any doubt of her identity: "I am Margaret, Queen of the Scots" (ch. 7, 12, 25, 39), "I am Margaret, whose body rests in this little dwelling" (ch. 20).

My third thirteenth-century example is that of Saint Stanislaus, the martyr-bishop of Cracow, a Polish forerunner of Becket who was murdered in 1079[72], but whose cult did not develop until the thirteenth century[73]. After the elevation of his relics in 1243, a first commission examined his miracles in 1250, and a second one under

67. R. Bartlett, ed., *The Miracles of Saint Aebbe of Coldingham and Saint Margaret of Scotland,* Oxford 2003.

68. C. Keene, «Envisioning a Saint: Visions in the Miracles of St Margaret of Scotland», forthcoming in a collection of studies entitled *Reading Memory and Identity in the Texts of Medieval European Holy Women*.

69. Bitel, «'In Visu Noctis'».

70. Bartlett, *The Miracles*, 1-67.

71. Keene, «Envisioning a Saint»; Bartlett, *The Miracles*, 100-5, 118-19, 122-25.

72. G. Labuda, *Święty Stanisław. Biskup krakowski, patron polski. Śladami zabójstwa – męczeństwa – kanonizacji*, [Saint Stanislaus, Bishop of Cracow and Patron of Poland. Life, martyrdom, canonization], Poznań 2000.

73. A. Rożnowska-Sadraei, *Pater Patriae. The Cult of Saint Stanislaus and the Patronage of Polish Kings. 1200-1455*, Krakow 2008.

the direction of the papal legate Giacomo da Velletri made a more detailed *inquisitio* in 1252, gathering the testimonies on 52 miracles. We have the acts of this second investigation, which had been reformulated and even augmented in the *legenda maior* of Stanislaus, written by the Dominican friar Vincent of Kielcza shortly after the canonization occurring in 1253[74].

Among these miracles we find six (11%) in which the martyred bishop or one of his envoys appears to sleeping, afflicted persons and gives them instructions on how they might be healed. Some of these, again, simply follow the stereotype. In miracle 23 there is a mother whose infant suddenly dies. She begs St. Stanislaus to help her, and "when on that same day after sunset she closes her eyes to have a rest, immediately after falling asleep, a *vir canus et reverendus* appears to her and tells her: 'Anxious and troubled woman, by the help of St. Stanislaus your son will be restored to you this night'"[75]. Miracle 42 follows the scheme with some interesting variations: a raging madman bound by chains is laid beside the sarcophagus of the saint for four days and nights. On the last night St. Stanislaus, dressed as a priest, appears to him and says: "Come with me and you will be set free". But when the madman gets up (probably free from his chains, but the account does not bother to tell us), he tells the guards in vain that he had been called by St. Stanislaus, they do not believe him and do not let him out. He finally falls asleep again and meets two men who again call him to join them and come to meet St. Stanislaus. He then sees the saintly bishop, who was in another Cracow church, the one dedicated to St. Andrew. He wears episcopal vestments, holds a book in his hand and tells him to watch and wait. Many persons come before the bishop, all raging with madness and tortured by other afflictions. St. Stanislaus tells the observer: "These are the people who gave false testimonies, brought improper judgments and did fraudulent business with others, this is why they suffer; you should abstain from such evil things, and go and tell them that they should do penance and will be healed like you have

74. The canonization documents of St. Stanislaus were published by W. Kętrzyński, *Miracula sancti Stanislai,* in *Monumenta Poloniae Historica*, Lviv 1884, vol. 4, 285-318, and J. Pleziowa and Z. Perzanowski, eds., «Cuda Świętego Stanisława», *Analecta Cracoviensia,* 11 (1979), 47-141; cf. A. Witkowska, «The Thirteenth-Century *Miracula* of St. Stanislaus, Bishop of Krakow», in G. Klaniczay, ed., *Procès de canonisation au Moyen Âge. Aspects juridiques et religieux – Canonization Processes in the Middle Ages. Legal and Religious Aspects*, Rome 2004, 149-63.

75. *Miracula sancti Stanislai*, 302-3.

been healed just now"[76]. The dream-healing acquires here a clear instrumental dimension, as the nightly vision is enlarged to include Purgatory and the visionary sees the suffering awaiting the sinful and provides advices about how to avoid the suffering with a virtuous life.

A characteristic feature of the Stanislaus miracles, present in different variations in the other four (27, 35, 41, 44) is that an envoy of the martyr bishop, a *matrona reverenda* or a venerable old man appears to the afflicted in a dream, and urges the person to visit the shrine of the martyr-bishop, and that in exchange for their cure they have to remind the bishop of Cracow to initiate the canonization investigation of Stanislaus – we find here a clear imprint of the *do ut des* negotiation of miraculous healing, a popular view broadly attested in the age. A last aspect to be noted: the space to be covered by the appearing saint here reaches a new dimension: one of the nightly visions of St. Stanislaus occurred at a really great distance in Prague (44)[77].

My fourth series of dream-healings come from the cult of Saint Margaret of Hungary, who was Saint Elizabeth's niece, and the daughter of King Béla IV. She spent her life as a Dominican nun and died in 1270 in the royal convent founded for her on an island in the Danube near Buda. The miracles at her grave started one year after her death. The pope soon delegated a first commission, which between 1272 and 1274 questioned at least 40 witnesses and recorded 10 miracles in life, 4 miraculous visions concerning Margaret's death and 29 *post mortem* miracles. A list of these was incorporated in the oldest legend of St. Margaret, probably written by her confessor Marcellus, Prior Provincial of the Hungarian Dominicans[78]. The investigation continued in 1276, with a new commission delegated by Pope Innocent V – consisting, this time, of Italian cler-

76. *Miracula sancti Stanislai*, 315-16.

77. *Miracula sancti Stanislai*, 318.

78. *Vita beate Margarite de Ungaria Ordinis Predicatorum*, in K. Bőle, *Árpádházi Boldog Margit szenttéavatási ügye és a legősibb latin Margit-legenda* [The Canonization Case of the Blessed Margaret of the Arpad Dynasty and the Oldest Margaret Legend], Budapest 1937, 17-43; F. A. Gombos, *Catalogus fontium historiae Hungariae*, Budapest 1937-1939, vol. III, 2009-29; it is also included now in the reprinted and augmented version of E. Szentpétery, ed., *Scriptores Rerum Hungaricarum tempore ducum regumque stirpis Arpadianae gestarum*, Budapest 1938, 2nd ed., Budapest 1999, 685-709 (I will refer to this last edition); cf. Klaniczay, *Holy Rulers*, 423-24.

ics – who recorded the testimonies of 110 witnesses. From the witnesses of the first investigation only those of 14 miracles were available at this time. On the other hand, the legates were able to find testimonies on 52 new miracles[79]. The two investigations provided thus a total of 95 miracle accounts.

Margaret's miracles too contain revealing examples of dream-healing. Two come from the space where her memory must have been the strongest, the convent itself from her fellow nuns, Stephania (Witness 12) and Lucia (Witness 20). Let me cite the account by the latter.

> One time I was ill; I couldn't speak or control myself, and at that time the sisters sent for a certain brother to hear my confession, but I was unable to speak because of my serious illness, and they had the body of Christ administered to me, and also the oil, and then had me carried to the infirmary, and when I was lying there unable to sleep, this saint Margaret appeared to me and said, 'Get up, sister, and eat just a little', and then I opened my eyes, as if I had been woken up, and sat up on my bed, and as I sat there I started to sweat, and after I had sweated I felt better, and that same day I was cured and got up[80].

It is worth noting that the description is typically unclear whether this apparition happened while the nun was still awake ("unable to sleep") or already in a dream, since she had to "open her eyes, as if she had been woken up" – this ambiguity is quite frequent in dream-visions.

Three more dream healings are attributed to her intercession. The best documented among them is the healing of the nobleman Petruccio "*de genere* Kata". His incubation dream is already featuring in the first list appended to St. Margaret's earliest legend:

> When the aforementioned sick man was reduced to this condition, behold, in response to his meritorious faith and devotion, the virgin Sister Margaret, with certain venerable persons accompanying her, appeared to him in a dream. Filled with piety as she was, she touched with her virgin

79. V. Fraknói, ed., *Inquisitio super vita, conversatione et miraculis beatae Margarethae virginis, Belae IV. Hungarorum regis filiae, sanctimonialis monasterii virginis gloriosae de insula Danubii, Ordinis Praedicatorum, Vesprimis diocesis*, in *Monumenta Romana episcopatus Vesprimiensis*, Budapest 1896, Tomus I, 237-38.

80. «Cum iacerem ibi, nec dormire possem, ista sancta Margaretha apparuit mihi et dixit: 'Soror, surge et comede aliquantulum'»: Fraknói, *Inquisitio*, 238 (Because these texts are hard to get hold of, I also provide the most relevant excerpts of the longer citations in Latin).

hands the part worst affected by the paralysis and said, 'In the name of Our Lord Jesus Christ, in accord with your faith, may you receive the health you hoped for'. Then she disappeared at once. He awoke and cast off his illness, feeling himself completely well[81].

A second account of this same miracle was told to the legates of the second investigation by Nicholas of Irich, Petruccio's cousin, referring to the public oral account of the story by Petruccio after his healing at the tomb of St. Margaret. Here we can observe the rhetorical development of the story, with different words being put in the mouth of St. Margaret:

> In his sleep saint Margaret appeared to him and patted him, saying "How are you, poor fellow?". And the second night she appeared to him again and said, "Get up", ordering him to come to this tomb to be healed here; and when this was said to him, he stood up at once and was healed, and when his children saw this, some laughed, others cried[82].

The circumstances of this miracle are further revealed by the testimony of Sister Margaret, an Augustinian nun living on Margaret Island, a relative of Petruccio (Witness 54), who put him up while he was waiting for his cure. She tells how Petruccio reported his healing to the Dominican friars and thanked them for it. We get a glimpse here of how the *fama* of this new saint is disseminated within families and kin groups: from the same Kata kindred another woman named Algent is healed at Margaret's grave (Witness 58). She too stays at the house of the Augustinian nun, and also claims to have been healed by an incubation dream. In her dreams, St. Margaret gives the afflicted woman feet and a hand of wax, which heal her from her paralysis (*venit in somnis ista sancta Margaretha, et porrexit mihi pedes in cera, et manus de cera, et statim fui sanata*)—a curious reversal of the habitual ex-voto gift-giving after a cure[83].

81. «Ecce in sompnis dicta virgo soror Margareta comitantibus se venerabilibus quibusdam personis apparuit et sancta manu sua virginea eam, ut erat pietate plena, maxime partem paralisi percussam tangens: 'Ecce', inquit, 'in nomine domini nostri Iesu Christi secundum fidem tuam optatam recipias sanitatem»: *Vita beate Margarite*, 704.

82. «In somnis apparuit sibi ista sancta Margaretha et palpabat eum et dicebat: 'Quid facis miser?' Et in secunda nocte apparuit sibi et dixit: "surge", et precepit sibi quod deberet venire ad istud sepulchrum, ut sanaretur hic; et tunc, quando hoc dictum fuit sibi, statim surrexerit et sanatus est»: Witness 75, Fraknói, *Inquisitio*, 334.

83. On ex-voto gifts see Vauchez, *La Sainteté*, 532-38.

The incubation dream reported by a cleric of the parish church of the village of Teez might also be worthy of mention, as it recalls the archaic format of the incubation miracle (the ill sleeping outside the church containing the shrine). With it is combined the healing recommendation by St. Margaret, who is accompanied by other mediators:

> My priest, Gregory, had me carried in his wagon to the tomb of saint Margaret, and the first night I was there I slept outside the church, where the infirm usually sleep, in a flat area near the door of the Cross, and two ladies appeared to me in a dream, and one said, "This father is still lying down", and I said, "Lady, I'm still lying down", and she said, "Get up and walk", and I said, "How can I get up, seeing that I use crutches?" and she said, "Margaret orders you to", and I got up at once and walked with the aid of a stick to the church, and then the church door opened, and I went to the tomb and adored saint Margaret and thanked her for curing me[84].

As we could see, Margaret's dream-healing miracles did not diverge from the original pattern of incubation as much as the ones of Saint Elizabeth. They all occurred near the relics of Saint Margaret: in the convent, in the house of the Augustinian recluse, or outside the church of the monastery. The healing methods of the saint – touching the ill organs of the afflicted or giving an advice, a recommendation how to obtain healing – are also among the habitual and traditional ones. This series reminds us that in the world of miracle collections, despite a number of changes and variations, archaic patterns remain present and survive till our day.

To conclude, after these Central European examples, let me come back to one more Western European case, the canonization process of Louis IX, King of France[85]. The miracles of Louis IX, collected during his two canonization investigations in 1282 at Saint-Denis (the first consisting of hearing 38 witnesses, and the second 330)[86],

84. «In prima nocte, postquam fuit ibi, dormiebam extra ecclesiam, ubi solent dormire infirmi, in platea apud portam crucis, et due domine apparuerunt mihi in somno et una dixit: 'Surge et ambula'; et ego: 'Quomodo possum surgere, quia vado cum scabellis?' et ipsa dixit: 'Margaretha precipit tibi'; et incontinenti surrexi et ambulavi cum uno baculo usque ad ecclesiam»: Witness 99, *Inquisitio*, 363.

85. J. Le Goff, *Saint Louis*, Paris 1996; M. C. Gaposchkin, *The Making of Saint Louis: Kingship, Sanctity and Crusade in the Later Middle Ages*, Ithaca-London 2008.

86. J. Le Goff, «Saint de l'Eglise et saint du peuple: les miracles officiels de saint Louis entre sa mort et sa canonisation (1270-1297)», in *Mélanges Robert*

provide also several noteworthy dream-healing cases. Among them we can find the healing of the court-doctor of Saint Louis, Master Dudo[87].

Dudo narrates this healing eleven years after it had happened. He suffered from an acute fever and a terrible headache. His Paris colleagues held in vain a *consilium*; they did not find a remedy and "were becoming desperate" about him, so he already called for a confessor and was prepared to die. Then he called for the help of Saint Louis, making a vow of a vigil at his relics. Then he saw himself in a dream at the church of Saint Denis at the grave of Saint Louis where he saw suddenly Saint Louis appear, in a white dress, with a crown on his head and a sceptre in his hand, asking him what he wanted and then telling him:

> You have a corrupted, poisonous and obscure liquid (*humor*) in your brain which prevents you from recognizing your Creator. This is the cause of your illness and now I will remove it.

He got hold of the head of Master Dudo, put it upon the curve of his left arm, and with his right thumb he made an incision on his forehead from the hairline to the nose, he inserted two fingers, the middle and the index finger, and pulled forth from his head an obscure, lead colored, smoking mass the size of a nut, and told Master Dudo: "This is what you had in your head and you could not be healthy"[88].

Then the king reminded Dudo that, besides his promised vow, he also had to fulfil an earlier, forgotten vow: a pilgrimage to the grave of Saint Nicholas in Bari, which he had promised to make. After all this, when he awoke, he was fully healed.

* * *

In the early Middle Ages we could see that the Frankish dream-healing examples contained much fewer "realistic" medical treat-

Mandrou, Paris 1983, 169-80; L. Carolus-Barré, *Le procès de canonisation de Saint Louis (1272-1297). Essai de reconstitution*, Rome 1994.

87. The Latin text is published in AA SS Aug. V (1741), col. 648-650.

88. «Incidit frontem pollice dexterae manus a capillis usque ad nasum, atque imposuit duos digitos, pollicem nimirum et indicem, traxitque ex ipsius capite humorem tunc quantitate unius nucis, obscurum, coloris plumbei, fumantamque…» AA SS Aug. V (1741), col. 649.

ment descriptions than the incubation miracles from Byzantium. The same feature could be observed in thirteenth-century Central European cases. The remarkable brain-surgery by Saint Louis upon his court-doctor, Dudo, provides a nice example that by the thirteenth century "God learned medicine" also in the medieval West, as he had done in the case of the incubation miracles of Asclepius[89], and subsequently in the Christian incubation cults of the early medieval East.

Abstract

This paper illustrates how incubation miracles fared in Western hagiography, pointing out important changes in the practice. First it focuses on sixth-century Gaul, on two particular traditions surrounding the cult of Saint Martin and Saint Radegund. Then, after a brief overview of early medieval evolution, it moves to the incubation miracles recorded in the canonisation processes of the thirteenth century, both from Western and Central European hagiographic material. It provides a model about how the rise of these processes in the thirteenth century affected the accounts of dream-healing, and how the stories and the miracles themselves were adjusted to the new conditions of recording.

Gábor Klaniczay
Qualifica
e-mail@e-mail

89. Cf. note 37.