

[10.1111/caje.12478] [International students and labour market outcomes of US-born workers]

Validation and Replication results

Some useful links:

- [Official Data and Code Availability Policy](#)
- [Step by step guidance](#)
- [Template README](#)

SUMMARY

Action Items (manuscript)

Action Items (Demirci_CJE_2020)

- [REQUIRED] Please provide the raw data sets along with links to their original location according to the instructions above
- [REQUIRED] the SEVIS data source and the National Survey of Recent College Graduates source should be referenced according to the AEA data and code repository
- [REQUIRED] Please provide programs used to create the final and analysis data sets from raw data
- [REQUIRED] please provide a clear description for each variable in the data sets provided
- [SUGGESTED] It is worth mentioning that access to the data on the IPUMS site requires registration and submission of a request for approval, which may take some time
- [SUGGESTED] Data in the public domain should be easily accessible by all without complex protocols
- [SUGGESTED] Add code to "Demirci_CJE_2020.do" that creates a file named "outputs" that will store all the outputs that should be separated from the inputs

General

- ☒ Data Availability and Provenance Statements
 - ☐ Statement about Rights
 - ☐ License for Data
 - ☐ Details on each Data Source
- ☒ Dataset list
- ☒ Computational requirements
 - ☒ Software Requirements
 - ☐ Controlled Randomness
 - ☐ Memory and Runtime Requirements
- ☒ Description of programs/code
 - ☐ (Optional, but recommended) License for Code
- ☒ Instructions to Replicators

- ☐ Details
- ☒ List of tables and programs
- ☒ References

Data description

Data Sources

American Community Surveys

- The raw data is not provided but in the README there is a link to access it <https://usa.ipums.org/usa/>
- There is no description of the access requirements. There is no mention of creating an account or submitting a request for access
- whether in the article or in the README, the data are correctly cited

Ruggles, S. J., T. Alexander, K. Genadek, R. Goeken, M. B. Schroeder and M. Sobek (2010): Integrated Public Use Microdata Series: Version 5.0 [Machine-readable database], Minneapolis: University of Minnesota. <https://usa.ipums.org/usa/> (accessed March 4, 2015).

IPEDS Data

- The raw data is not provided but in the README there is a link to access it <https://nces.ed.gov/ipeds/use-the-data>
- whether in the article or in the README, the data are correctly cited

Integrated Postsecondary Education Data System Completion Surveys. 1977-2015. National Center for Education Statistics. <https://nces.ed.gov/ipeds/use-the-data> (accessed April 21, 2018).

SEVIS Data and National Survey of Recent College Graduates

- Raw data are not provided but in the README there are a links to access them (<https://www.ice.gov/foia/overview>, <https://sestat.nsf.gov/datadownload/>)
- For the latter two sources there are no references adequately provided according to the requirements of the data repository and AEA code

Analysis Data Files

- ☐ No analysis data file mentioned
- ☐ Analysis data files mentioned, not provided (explain reasons below)
- ☒ Analysis data files mentioned, provided. File names listed below.

- Demirci_CJE_2020.dta
- Demirci_CJE_2020_figure1.dta
- Demirci_CJE_2020_figure2.dta

Data deposit

Requirements

- ☒ README is in TXT, MD, PDF format
- ☒ Deposit has no ZIP files
- ☒ Title conforms to guidance (starts with "Data and Code for:" or "Code for:", is properly capitalized)
- ☒ Authors (with affiliations) are listed in the same order as on the paper

Data checks

- The data have been read by indicated software (using STATA).
- The variables labels are present while using STATA.

Code description

There is only one STATA do file that produces all figures and tables (result). However, the do file has subsection which states that a specific figure or a table to produce.

Stated Requirements

- ☐ No requirements specified
- ☒ Software Requirements specified as follows:
 - Software 1 STATA
 - Software 2
- ☐ Computational Requirements specified as follows:
 - Cluster size, etc.
- ☐ Time Requirements specified as follows:
 - Length of necessary computation (hours, weeks, etc.)
- ☐ Requirements are complete.

Missing Requirements

- ☒ Software Requirements
 - ☒ Stata
 - ☒ Version
 - Packages go here

[REQUIRED] Please README must contain complete requirements.

You can copy the section above, amended if necessary.

Computing Environment of the Replicator

- Stata/MP 16.1
- Intel Compiler i5

Replication steps

1. Downloaded code from URL provided in the README
2. Downloaded data from URL indicated in the README. A sign-up was required (but not indicated in README)
3. Ran code as per README
4. It produced all figure and tables.

Findings

Data Preparation Code

- Demirci_CJE_2020.do` ran without error, output expected data

Tables

- All tables look the same.

Figures

- All figures look the same

In-Text Numbers

- ☒ There are no in-text numbers, or all in-text numbers stem from tables and figures.
- ☐ There are in-text numbers, but they are not identified in the code

Classification

- ☒ full reproduction
- ☐ full reproduction with minor issues
- ☐ partial reproduction (see above)
- ☐ not able to reproduce most or all of the results (reasons see above)