

Ratified Minutes of

THE ORDINARY MEETING OF THE DEBATE SELECTION COMMITTEE

5th Week Hilary Term 2019

Monday 11th February

The TV Room, 09:30

Present: **The Chair of the Debate Selection Committee** (Lee Chin Wee, *Trinity College*), **The DSC Deputy Secretary cum Librarian-elect** (Sara Singh Dube, *St. Hugh's College*), **The DSC Treasurer** (Bryan Yan, *Keble College*), **The DSC Secretary** (Rosa Thomas, *St. Anne's College*), **Standing Committee Delegate** (Chaitanya Kediya, *Exeter College*), **The Internals Officer** (Brian Wong, *Wolfson College*), **Director of Training** (Rachel O Nunain, *Trinity College*)

Attending:

Apologies: **The Externals Officer** (Jason Xiao, *Wadham College*)

Absent:

Late: **The President** (Daniel Wilkinson, *Oriel College*)

DSC opens at 09:43

Apologies

Request to pass Absences from Previous Meetings

The Standing Committee Delegate moves to pass their absence from the previous meeting on the grounds that they were in pursuit of service to the Society agreed to be of paramount importance.

Motion passes nem. com.

Matters arising from Previous Minutes

Ratification of Minutes

The CDSC moves to ratify the minutes of week 4 of Hilary term.

Motion passes nem. com.

Business of the CDSC

Selection of Co-convenor of OxWSC

The CDSC asks the names of all applicants.

The Director of Training answers that Ms Geneva Roy, Mr Jack Solomon, and Ms Louisa Broeg have applied for the position.

The CDSC says that it might make sense to appoint Mr Jack Solomon if he is likely to end up becoming a member of DSC.

The DSC Secretary points out that it should not be bearing on selections that an applicant would potentially become a member of DSC.

The Internals Officer inquires about the number of selections that need to be made.

The DSC Secretary responds that there is currently one slot open to become Co-convenor.

The Internals Officer suggests selecting two individuals, one as co-convenor and one as deputy co-convenor.

The CDSC adds that this would help in mentoring those who are selected to convene future competitions, however they point out that it is necessary to ensure that selecting two people does not result in diffusing responsibility. The CDSC says that they would make it clear what is the role of each person who is selected.

The Director of Training says that Ms Geneva Roy has the most experience based on the CV submitted by each applicant. Ms Geneva Roy has convened multiple tournaments of varying size in New Zealand. This is far more experience than the other two applicants.

The CDSC agrees that it might be better to select Ms Geneva Roy as Co-convenor, adding that Mr Jack Solomon might be busy since they intend on running for elections and might have commitments over the vacation.

The DSC Secretary adds that the Oxford Schools Convenor, Mr Dominic Brind, had mentioned that the regional round convened by Ms Geneva Roy ran more smoothly than the regional round convened by Mr Jack Solomon. Even though this was through no fault of Mr Jack Solomon, it can be seen as a reason to select Ms Geneva Roy as the Co-convenor.

The Director of Training says that Ms Louisa Broeg should not be overlooked.

The DSC Secretary asks whether Ms Louisa Broeg convened a regional round.

The DSC Deputy Secretary answers that Ms Louisa Broeg did not convene a regional round.

The Director of Training points out that Ms Louisa Broeg does have extensive experience speaking at the World Schools Debating Championship.

The CDSC says that since Ms Geneva Roy has tentatively been selected as the Co-convenor, it would be better to select an individual from a different region, such as Central Europe, to attract as many teams as possible. The CDSC adds that Ms Louisa Broeg has taken a keen interest over the last two terms and demonstrated considerable commitment to DSC.

The CDSC moves to appoint Ms Geneva Roy as the Co-convenor of OxWSC alongside the Externals Officer.

Motion passes nem. com.

The CDSC moves to appoint Ms Louisa Broeg as the Deputy Co-convenor of OxWSC alongside the CDSC

Motion passes nem. com.

Incident relating to Mr Marcus Huang's participation at Bath Pro-Am

The CDSC informs DSC about an incident relating to Mr Marcus Huang's participation at the Bath Pro-Am. Mr Huang received a call in a round, which they thought was unjustified. In response, Mr Huang sent an extremely long letter to the convenors of the competition, as well as to the judge and all speakers in that particular round.

The President enters the room at 09:51

The CDSC points out that this is a concerning matter because Mr Huang makes incredibly broad claims and allegations, and brings up members of DSC on the grounds that their coaching has informed Mr Huang that the call was incorrectly made.

The CDSC states that the letter by Mr Marcus Huang was uncalled for, and is not endorsed by DSC.

The CDSC suggests that they will personally follow-up with Mr Huang. Asking Mr Huang to apologise for the tone and substance of the letter, as well as for bringing up members of DSC. If Mr Huang cannot be persuaded to apologise, the CDSC will personally apologise to all concerned from Bath and the judge. The CDSC mentions that it is important for DSC to come across as friendly, and suggests waiving Bath's registration fees for the next Oxford IV as a token of good will.

Selection of DSC Member

The CDSC says out that there is an issue about when points can be taken into consideration if the deadline has passed but DSC has not made a decision. The CDSC suggests that Mr Jack Solomon's points for reaching the quarterfinals of the LSE Open should be taken into consideration.

The DSC Secretary says that the rules are not as clear in the Standing Order, but emphasises the importance of the deadline and states that it would be unfair if points were added after the deadline has passed, since it was not feasible for Mr Jack Solomon to actually re-submit their CV to reflect the increase in points.

The Internals Officer mentions that Mr Dominic Brind's points for convening Oxford Schools cannot be taken into consideration since the Standing Orders are clear about the time at which such points are to be allocated.

The Director of Training points out that the CV is not required to tick a score, but rather to get to know about an applicant's achievements which are often times unknown.

The DSC Deputy Secretary states that this issue is irrelevant since Mr Jack Solomon participated in an Open team, which means that they will be accredited with 5 points less than the points mentioned in the Standing Order.

DSC moves in camera at 10:02 to select DSC Member

DSC stops being in camera at 10:17

The CDSC notes that a corporate objection has been registered against Mx Imogen Edwards-Lawrence selection as a member of DSC.

The CDSC says that they will submit a written explanation to the President and move this before TSC within two weeks, as outlined by the Standing Orders.

Helper Points Record

The CDSC asks the DSC Deputy Secretary about the process of updating the helper points record.

The DSC Deputy Secretary says that they have created a new spreadsheet, and wanted to clarify certain confusions before DSC. They ask whether conducting a workshop is 1 point.

The DSC Secretary confirms that conducting a workshop is 1 helper point.

The DSC Deputy Secretary asks whether Ms Olivia Railton is meant to be allocated zero helper points as convenor of Oxford Wom*n's.

The DSC Secretary says that Ms Olivia Railton has been allocated the appropriate helper points under the column of the previous Oxford Wom*ns Open, but adds that they did not know whether Ms Olivia Railton would get a point for judging the earlier competition.

The Director of Training mentions that they have a list of all judges at the earlier competition, which can be used to allocate helper points.

The DSC Deputy Secretary asks whether Mr Dhruva Bhat would receive helper points for serving as ACA at the Oxford IV and for participating at the Queen Mary IV 2018 with the Externals Officer.

The CDSX says that Mr Dhruva Bhat would not receive helper points for either.

The DSC Deputy Secretary asks whether helper points have been allocated to those who took additional crash during the Oxford IV.

The DSC Secretary responds that helper points have not been allocated for crash yet.

The DSC Deputy Secretary inquires whether Equity Officers at the Oxford IV receive helper points.

The DSC Secretary says that Equity Officers should have been allocated helper points. The DSC Secretary adds that it should be made clearer what constitutes helper points and what is expected as requirements to be selected for competitions.

The CDSC suggests that the DSC Deputy Secretary send the CDSC a list by 2:00pm mentioning all the cases which have been reviewed.

The DSC Deputy Secretary asks whether Mr Dominic Brind would receive helper points for tabbing the ICYD round in Sheffield.

The DSC Secretary suggests allocating the same points as if Mr Dominic Brind was judging the round.

Standing Order changes

The CDSC states that the discussion about Standing Order changes will be moved to the next meeting.

Business of the DSC Treasurer

Expenses

The DSC Treasurer mentions that Ms Geneva Roy would not be reimbursed for an advanced hotel deposit incurred while judging at the Rotterdam regional round of Oxford Schools.

The DSC Treasurer says that £984.60 has to be passed as DSC expenses today.

Business of the DSC Deputy Secretary**Business of Director of Training**

The Director of Training mentions that workshops by alumni would be conducted in the coming and following Saturday.

DSC Secretary

The DSC Secretary says that Crewdate 2.0 will be held on Wednesday and asks members to attend the social event if they are free. As a result, squads would need to be cancelled accordingly.

Business of the Internals Officer**Business of the Externals Officer**Opening Applications of UCL IV

On behalf of the Externals Officer, the CDSC notes that applications will be opened to send 3 teams and 2 judges to the UCL IV.

Changes to the composition of this Committee**Any Other Business**

The CDSC closes the meeting of DSC at 10:32

Signed,

Chaitanya Kediya

Standing Committee

Exeter College