

Ratified Minutes of

THE ORDINARY MEETING OF THE DEBATE SELECTION COMMITTEE

1st Week Trinity Term 2019

Monday 29th April

Morris Room, 09:30

Present: The Outgoing Chair of the Debate Selection Committee (Lee Chin Wee, *Trinity College*), The Standing Committee Delegate (Beatrice Barr, *St Peter's College*), The Access, Communications & Equity Officer cum Deputy Returning Officer (Dominic Brind, *Magdalen College*), The Externals Officer (Jason Xiao, *Wadham College*), The DSC Deputy Secretary cum Librarian (Sara Singh Dube, *St Hugh's College*), The Internals Officer (Brian Wong, *Wolfson College*), The DSC Treasurer (Bryan Yan, *Keble College*), The President (Genevieve Athis, *Christ Church*)

Attending:

Apologies: The Director of Training (Rachel O'Nunain, *Trinity College*)

Absent:

Late: The DSC Secretary (Rosa Thomas, *St Anne's College*)

DSC opens at 09:42

Apologies

Requests to pass Absences from Previous Meetings

Matters arising from Previous Minutes

Ratification of Minutes

Business of the Outgoing CDSC

Convenor selections for Schools, IV, and ICYD

The Outgoing CDSC proposes selecting convenors for Oxford Schools, the Oxford IV and ICYD in 4th Week.

The Outgoing CDSC asks the Deputy DSC Secretary whether it would be possible to organise a social in fourth week before the selections take place.

The Outgoing CDSC reminds DSC that the selector panel will be made up of himself, Christine Jiang, Andrew Seow and Dominic Brind, with The Externals Officer and DSC Treasurer acting as back-ups if required.

Pro Am of the Year

The Outgoing CDSC asks for an update on the organisation of Pro Am of the Year.

The Internals Officer responds positively, and mentions that Joseph Sisson (*St John's College*) has agreed to tab the competition.

The DSC Secretary (Rosa Thomas, St Anne's College) enters at 09:43

The Internals Officer requests a preliminary show of hands indicating which member of DSC would be willing to judge Pro Am of the Year. The Externals Officer and the Access, Communications and Equity Officer *cum* Deputy Returning Officer raise their hands.

The Internals Officer informs The Externals Officer that he has been put down to judge the majority of the competition, depending on the caliber of the debaters and the rooms.

The Internals Officer mentions that Marcus Huang (*Trinity College*) has offered to be a chair judge.

The DSC Secretary suggests that individuals' roles should not be revealed to them before the tournament, and that Mr. Huang may judge later in the day.

The Internals Officer explains that Hannah Taylor, The Externals Officer, and The Internals Officer will therefore judge the competition, and that teams will be organised within the next day.

The Outgoing CDSC says that he will announce the teams in this week's DA.

The DSC Secretary says that Louis Collier (*St Hugh's College*) is considering coming for a round. He is expecting to compete, but as the deadline has passed for entering he may be able to judge instead.

HT19 Corporate Objection

The Outgoing CDSC announces that he will read a letter from the member against whom a corporate objection was brought last term.

The meeting moves in camera at 09:43AM

The meeting moves out of camera at 09:46AM

The Outgoing CDSC raises two matters relating to the corporate objection: firstly, that he will change the corporate objection clause of the DSC Standing Orders and pass any changes through DSC before moving them at TSC. Secondly, the Outgoing CDSC mentions that in conversation with the member concerned, the member expressed understanding and reiterated that their objection to the corporate objection rests predominantly on the actions concerned having taken place two years ago.

The Outgoing CDSC suggests that he remains in principle willing to give the member concerned moderate positions of responsibility, such as the role of co-convenor of an internal, and reconsider them for DSC if they fulfill these duties properly.

The DSC Secretary adds that the corporate objection is not necessarily relevant to anything the member concerned may apply for, citing the example of CA of a school's competition. She encourages DSC not to levy the objection against the member at every possible opportunity

Oxford Schools Review

The Outgoing CDSC asks the Access, Communications and Equity Officer *cum* Deputy Returning Officer for a review of Oxford Schools.

The Access, Communications and Equity Officer cum Deputy Returning Officer circulates a document summarising Oxford Schools 2019 to all members of DSC.

The Access, Communications and Equity Officer *cum* Deputy Returning Officer says that Oxford Schools was very successful this year.

DSC applauds the Access, Communications and Equity Officer *cum* Deputy Returning Officer.

The Access, Communications and Equity Officer *cum* Deputy Returning Officer apologises for the absence of his Co-Convenor, Joseph Sisson (*St John's College*).

The Access, Communications and Equity Officer *cum* Deputy Returning Officer says that 822 teams took part in Oxford Schools this year, which is more schools than the previous year. Oxford Schools raised roughly £27,000, which is significantly more than last year.

The Outgoing CDSC asks where the new money was made from.

The Access, Communications and Equity Officer *cum* Deputy Returning Officer responds that the team cap was increased from three to four, as costs had been down and the competition skewed towards London and the South East the previous year. He mentions that this change unfortunately resulted in some unusually large regional rounds, such as Guildford, but that it was otherwise beneficial. 70% of entries this year were standard entries - from private schools or grammar schools - with 26% coming from non-selective state schools and 4% on bursaries. A bursary was granted to every school which applied, but that he will pass onto the next Oxford Schools convenors that this should be better publicised.

The Access, Communications and Equity Officer *cum* Deputy Returning Officer admits that it was a mistake to appoint 4 CAs, as duties fell through the cracks and not all CAs contributed the same amount. He suggests that the number of CAs appointed should return to 3 next year, and that the responsibility to help find judges and the two round judging requirement should be clearly communicated to all CAs.

The Outgoing CDSC suggests that CAs may often be exempted from the two round judging requirement for good work.

The DSC Secretary responds that there is no good reason not to judge one regional round, including for CAs.

The Access, Communications and Equity Officer *cum* Deputy Returning Officer suggests raising the requirement for judging rounds for all debaters from two to three.

The Outgoing CDSC is sceptical about this suggestion.

The Access, Communications and Equity Officer *cum* Deputy Returning Officer accepts that this change seems significant, but that Oxford Schools is at the limit of its capacity and relies excessively on local judges for all rounds.

The Outgoing CDSC suggests potentially paying external judges £15 for judging at Oxford Schools rounds.

The Access, Communications and Equity Officer *cum* Deputy Returning Officer responds that this would cause an administrative nightmare, and that the proposed rate would not be enticing to debaters.

The DSC Secretary suggests increasing the round requirement to three if the member intends to trial for EUDC or WUDC in the following year.

The Outgoing CDSC agrees that the two-round requirement is unsustainable.

The DSC Treasurer suggests that the three-round requirement would lead to members leaving their regional rounds until the last minute and claiming to be unable to judge enough remaining rounds.

The DSC agrees that the regional round requirement should be increased to three for those intending to trial for EUDC or WUDC in the coming year.

The Access, Communications and Equity Officer *cum* Deputy Returning Officer says that Oxford Schools finals day went well, and that the first international round in Zimbabwe went very well.

The DSC Secretary asks whether we set motions for Zimbabwe.

The Internals Officer responds that some international rounds choose their own motions.

The Access, Communications and Equity Officer *cum* Deputy Returning Officer explains that Zimbabwe World Schools asked the Union for permission to set up a round in Zimbabwe.

The Outgoing CDSC asks how much Zimbabwe paid.

The Access, Communications and Equity Officer *cum* Deputy Returning Officer responds that they paid the finals day fee, as well as their own travel to finals day. He also informs DSC that the Netherlands no longer hate Oxford because they were sent good judges.

The Internals Officer suggests setting up a round in China.

The Access, Communications and Equity Officer *cum* Deputy Returning Officer suggests Singapore.

The Externals officer suggests Australia.

The Access, Communications and Equity Officer *cum* Deputy Returning Officer says that Australia is too far.

The Outgoing CDSC likes the idea of increasing the number of international rounds as very little administrative work is required. He suggests that the Internals Officer should look at China, while the Outgoing CDSC and DSC Treasurer will look at Singapore.

The DSC Treasurer asks what happens if an international regional round goes wrong.

The DSC Secretary questions the legitimacy of international regional rounds, given that the only enticement is allowing the winners to come to Oxford.

The Access, Communications and Equity Officer *cum* Deputy Returning Officer suggests that more could be done in Singapore, where there are many debaters known to the Union, while little more could be done in China as the Union does not have capacity to send a large number of debaters there.

The DSC Secretary reminds the DSC that DSC hardly has the capacity to send a large number of debaters to Durham.

The Internals Officer reminds DSC that there are already many judges available in China through Local Leaders.

The Access, Communications and Equity Officer *cum* Deputy Returning Officer reminds DSC not to do a dodgy Capstone deal.

The Outgoing CDSC reiterates the principle of not being like Cambridge.

The DSC Treasurer files a motion of thanks to the Access, Communications and Equity Officer *cum* Deputy Returning Officer.

The motion passes nem. con.

Business of the DSC Treasurer

Expenses

The DSC Treasurer says that there is £939.76 of expenses to be passed.

The Outgoing CDSC asks why Jessy Jindal (*Merton College*) had her expenses cancelled.

The DSC Treasurer responds that they were filed late.

The Outgoing CDSC and DSC Treasurer agree on the authorisation of a taxi to Bookers for Geneva Roy.

The Outgoing CDSC explains that the expenses are particularly high because of the Leiden Open.

DSC passes expenses.

Business of the Externals Officer

Opening Applications for External Tournaments

The Externals Officer says that competition selections do not need to be opened but that Paris should be discussed.

Paris IV Selection

DSC moves in camera to discuss selections at 10:06AM

DSC moves out of camera at 10:09AM

Selections are confirmed for the Paris Open as:

Banjo Yang (DL) & Lee Chin Wee

Gemma Timmons & William Prescott

Olivia Railton & Louisa Broeg

Judges: Caitlin French, Jess Curry

Oxford Schools Helper Points

The Outgoing CDSC asks if there are any updates on helper points for Oxford Schools.

The Access, Communications and Equity Officer *cum* Deputy Returning Officer says that the helper points record has been updated following regional rounds and for those who helped more than once on finals day. The variable number of helper points following the Standing Order change remains to be done.

The Outgoing CDSC and Access, Communications and Equity Officer *cum* Deputy Returning Officer agree to sort out the variable helper points.

The Access, Communications and Equity Officer cum Deputy Returning Officer circulates the helper points record for Oxford Schools.

The Access, Communications and Equity Officer *cum* Deputy Returning Officer explains that every participating member receives between one and three points, apart from the Co-Convenors, and that he is happy to give all regional convenors three helper points, with the exception of Jess Curry who split her duties with Ethan Stewart.

He states that none of the solo convenors did little enough to merit receiving only one helper point.

The DSC Secretary asks whether the Access, Communications and Equity Officer *cum* Deputy Returning Officer had a favourite regional round.

The Standing Committee Delegate coughs loudly.

The Externals Officer suggests that the Access, Communications and Equity Officer *cum* Deputy Returning Officer privately message him his favourite round.

The Access, Communications and Equity Officer *cum* Deputy Returning Officer states that Geneva Roy (*Brasenose College*) held a very effectively run round especially given its difficult location. He also states that Ernest Leung's round was particularly well run.

The DSC Treasurer reminds DSC that DSC helper points should not be over inflated.

The Externals Officer disagrees, claiming that helper points are a way of rewarding good performance. He suggests that the recipients of extra points should be notified by text.

The Access, Communications and Equity Officer *cum* Deputy Returning Officer suggests that Imogen Edwards-Lawrence (*Trinity College*) be awarded three helper points for the success of the Dublin round.

He adds that he proposes all co-convenors be awarded one helper point, apart from Benedict Mee and Beatrice Barr, who will be awarded two due to the large size of the Guildford round.

The Outgoing CDSC suggests that Cameron Bovell (*St Edmund Hall*) and Kanika Mittal (*St Peter's College*) are each awarded one helper point for co-convening the Birmingham round.

The helper points were awarded as follows:

Regional Convenors	Helper Points Awarded
Luke Dunne	2
Gemma Timmons	2
David (Zixuan) Ni	1
Jack Solomon	1
Tara Sallis	2
Sara Dube	2
Cameron Bovell	1
Kanika Mittal	1
Jamie Johnson	2
Beth Molyneux	2
Jessica Curry	1
Beatrice Barr	2
Benedict Mee	2
Xavier Redmond	2
Ernest Leung	3
Geneva Roy	3
Imogen Edwards-Lawrence	3
Ethan Stewart	1

The motion passes nem. con.

The Outgoing CDSC notes that regional rounds were particularly well run this year, especially by comparison to Cambridge.

The Outgoing CDSC asks for a reminder of the point range for convenors.

The Access, Communications and Equity Officer *cum* Deputy Returning Officer notes that the verb used in the Standing Orders is ‘convening’ not being a convenor - this puts the Convenor in the relevant points bracket.

DSC agrees to award William Prescott (*University College*) 10 helper points for his role as Oxford Schools Deputy Convenor.

The Outgoing CDSC and Access, Communications and Equity Officer *cum* Deputy Returning Officer agree to award the Oxford Schools Co-Convenors, Dominic Brind and Joe Sisson, 13 helper points apiece.

The Outgoing CDSC asks if any OrgComm members did not pull their weight.

The Access, Communications and Equity Officer *cum* Deputy Returning Officer suggests that Peter Wallich (*St Hilda's College*) did not seem to do much for food, and that Geneva Roy (*Brasenose College*) did most of this duty.

The Outgoing CDSC suggests appointing Peter Wallich (*St Hilda's College*) one helper point.

The Access, Communications and Equity Officer *cum* Deputy Returning Officer suggests awarding Jamie Johnson (*Pembroke College*) three helper points for his role as Chief of Staff, and two points to the rest of the Org Com.

The Outgoing CDSC and Access, Communications and Equity Officer *cum* Deputy Returning Officer express mutual joy that Oxford Schools is over for the year.

The Outgoing CDSC and Access, Communications and Equity Officer *cum* Deputy Returning Officer awarded the following helper points:

OrgComm	Helper Points awarded
Dominic	13
Joe	13
Will	10
Xavier Redmond	2
Jamie Johnson	3
Sara Dube	2
Olivia Railton	2
Marua Mukanova-Finch	2
Peter Wallich	1
Yee Kwan Law	2
Geneva Roy	2

The motion passes nem. con.

Business of the DSC Secretary

Business of the DSC Deputy Secretary

Business of the Director of Training

Business of the Internals Officer

Any Other Business

Changes to the Composition of this Committee

Genevieve Athis (*Christ Church*) has been elected President for TT19.

Beatrice Barr (*St Peter's College*) has been appointed as Standing Committee Delegate for TT19.

The Outgoing CDSC closes the meeting of DSC at 10:20AM

Signed,

Beatrice Barr

Standing Committee

St Peter's College