

The Ratified Minutes of  
THE ORDINARY MEETING OF THE STANDING COMMITTEE  
6th Week Hilary Term 2018  
Monday 19th February  
President's Office, 16:00

**Present:** **The President** (Ms Laali Vadlamani, *Trinity College*), **The President-Elect** (Mr Gui Cavalcanti, *Pembroke College*), **The Librarian-Elect** (Ms Shivani Ananth, *St. Anne's College*), **The Treasurer** (Mr Stephen Horvath, *New College*), **The Treasurer-Elect** (Mr Daniel Wilkinson, *Oriel College*), **The Secretary** (Ms Molly Greenwood, *St. Hilda's College*), **The Elected Member**, (Mr Shanuk Mediawaka, *Lincoln College*), **The Elected Member** (Mr Adam Watson, *Hertford College*), **The Elected Member** (Mr Charles Wang, *Hertford College*), **The Elected Member** (Mr Chris Garner, *St. Peter's College*), **The Returning Officer** (Mr Harry Samuels, *New College*), **The Bursar** (Ms Lindsay Warne), **The Chair of the Debate Select Committee** (Mr Andrew Seow, *Lincoln College*)

**Attending:** Mr Michael Harkness (**Ex-Returning Officer**, *Magdalen College*)

**Apologies:**

**The Senior Treasurer**, Mr Stephen Dixon, *Downing College Cambridge*  
**The Senior Librarian**, Mr Sean Power, *Oriel College*  
**The Elected Member**, Ms Genevieve Athis, *Christ Church*  
**The Chair of the Consultative Committee**, Mr Julian Kirk, *Magdalen College*  
**The Elected Member**, Ms Izzy Risino, *St. Catherine's College*  
**The Librarian**, Ms Sabriyah Sayeed, *Somerville College*

**Absent:**

*The President opens this Ordinary Meeting of the Standing Committee at 16:06.*

**Requests to Pass Absences from Previous Meetings**

The President moves that Mr Wang's absence from the Ordinary Meeting of the Standing Committee in Fifth Week be deemed as with good reason, as he was on Society business of paramount importance, namely working the Ann Coulter event.

*nem. con.*

The President moves to pass Mr Wang's absence from the Ordinary Meeting of the Standing Committee in Fifth Week.

*nem. con.*

The President moves that Ms Athis' absence from the first ten minutes of the Ordinary Meeting of the Standing Committee in Fifth Week be deemed as with good reason, due to an immovable academic commitment.

*nem. con.*

The President moves to pass Ms Athis' absence from the first ten minutes of the Ordinary Meeting of the Standing Committee in Fifth Week.

*nem. con.*

### **Matters Arising from Previous Minutes**

There are no matters arising from previous minutes.

### **Ratification of Minutes**

The Secretary moves to ratify the Draft Minutes from HT18 3rd Week Ordinary Meeting of the Standing Committee.

Seconded by the President-Elect

*nem. con.*

The Secretary moves to ratify the Draft Minutes from HT18 4th Week Ordinary Meeting of the Standing Committee.

Seconded by the President-Elect

*nem. con.*

The Secretary moves to ratify the Draft Minutes from HT18 4th Week Emergency Meeting of the Standing Committee.

Seconded by the President-Elect

*nem. con.*

The Secretary moves to ratify the Draft Minutes from HT18 5th Week Ordinary Meeting of the Standing Committee.

Seconded by the President-Elect

*nem. con.*

### **The President**

#### **Business of the President**

**The President** proposes an addition to Standing Order C7 which refers to the appointed committee. She noticed that there was no clause for dismissal, and it makes sense that if a President can appoint someone, there should be the procedure to remove them as there are with elected positions. She suggests adding a clause in which it would state that the President may recommend to the Standing Committee that they ratify the dismissal of appointed officials which would be passes by a simple majority vote.

**Mr Watson** questions whether a simple majority is too low a threshold for this.

**The President** moves to grant the **Ex-Returning Officer**, Mr Michael Harkness, *Magdalen College*, speaking rights for the duration of the meeting.

*nem. con.*

**Mr Harkness** notes that with the required quorum of Standing Committee, not many people are required for a valid meeting, and this should be noted when considering the simple majority. A valid meeting can be of just four members.

**The President-Elect** says that since there is a simple majority required for appointments, it makes sense for this to be the case with dismissals.

**The President** explains that since it is the Presidents themselves who appoint their appointed committee, there would assumedly be good reason for removing someone.

**Mr Harkness** asks whether it would only be the President who could do this, or whether other members of Standing Committee could as well.

**The President** clarifies that the Standing Order refers specifically to the President, but notes that the Standing Committee could vote.

**The Treasurer** notes that a member of Standing Committee could put a request to the President in their business.

**The Returning Officer** notes the possibility of a JDC or an IDC for particularly poor behaviour.

**The President** notes the appropriate procedure for higher escalation, but comments that this refers just to day to day issues.

The President moves to put forward this addition to Standing Order C7, which would add clause (vi).

*nem. con.*

#### Questions to the President

There are no questions to the President.

#### **The Librarian**

##### Business of the Librarian

The Librarian has no business.

#### Questions to the Librarian

There are no questions to the Librarian.

#### **The Treasurer**

##### Business of the Treasurer

The Treasurer moves that, following the recommendation of the Finance Committee, the Standing Committee pass DSC expenses of £711.74.

Seconded by the President.

*nem. con.*

**The Treasurer** brings up a change to Standing Order C7, which refers to the Access Officer. He explains that the chairing and running of the Access Committee can be hampered if the Chair has not been on the Committee before. He also mentions that it is extremely difficult to get projects completed within the short time frame given. He suggests having Access Officers be appointed for two terms instead of one. A staggered appointment would mean that each President still only appoints one Officer, and that there was always one more experienced Officer. He asks if there are any questions.

**The Treasurer-Elect** notes the potential issue that people would apply for two terms and then resign.

**The Treasurer** notes that resignations come on an individual basis, and that there is procedure in place in the event of a resignation to appoint someone else.

**Mr Garner** asks if one Officer will be more senior than the other.

**The Treasurer** notes that this will not explicitly be the case but it would make sense for the more experienced Officer to take the lead.

**The Librarian-Elect** notes that from her time on Access Committee, there was a natural hierarchy because only one person can chair the meeting.

**The Returning Officer** asks the Treasurer if he believes that a length of two terms will put off applicants.

**The Treasurer** responds by saying that, given how many strong applicants have applied in the past, he does not believe that it would deter people.

**The President** believes that the term length is in line with many other appointments across Oxford.

**The Bursar** asks if the transition between Trinity and Michaelmas would be feasible at this point.

**The President** argues that applicants are usually post graduates or first or second years, and so there would be less of an issue with people going down at the end of Trinity.

**The Bursar** asks whether this change would apply to all Liberation Officers.

**The President** says it refers only to the Access Officers. She says that it would allow them to better get to know and work with the staff.

**The Bursar** notes that she would not expect this Standing Order to remove the control of the Membership Drive from the President-Elect.

**The Treasurer** explain that he did not intend that.

**Mr Mediwaka** explains that a two-term appointment would encourage the more careful planning of longer-term projects.

**The President** believes it would encourage higher quality applicants.

**The President-Elect** notes that there is no provision that would prohibit the Access Officers to run in an election after their first term. He believes it would not be a problem.

**The President** argues that there is an issue of an inappropriate platform to run on.

**The Returning Officer** believes that the decision of whether a candidate could serve as both an elected and appointed Official at the same time is for the membership when they vote in the elections. Further restrictions on who should run are against the democratic spirit.

**Mr Garner** raises the point that there must always be one person who is female or a minority gender, and one who is male or a minority gender.

**The President-Elect** notes that each term the President would have to open applications excluding some genders.

**The Treasurer** considers that this issue is a distinct point from what is at hand.

**The President** notes that the gender rules is as it is for a reason, to help access.

The Treasurer moves that the Standing Committee amend Standing Order C7 (1) as specified on the document given.

Seconded by Mr Watson.

*nem. con.*

The Treasurer proposes a friendly amendment to the entirety of Standing Order C7 so that the wording is consistent with this change, hereby replacing the phrase ‘the Access Officers’ with ‘a vacant Access Officer position’ in C7(3)(i) and C7(4)(ii) and replacing ‘either of the Access Officers’ with ‘an Access Officer’ in C7(4)(iv).

Seconded by Mr Watson.

*nem. con.*

The Treasurer proposes that the Standing Committee recommend to a Public Business Meeting that Rule 30(d)(ii)(i) be amended to strike the phrase ‘(appointed termly by the President as per the Standing Orders)’.

Seconded by the President.

*nem. con.*

Questions to the Treasurer

There are no questions to the Treasurer.

**The Secretary**

### Business of the Secretary

The Secretary moves that, following the recommendation of the Finance Committee, the Standing Committee pass the accounts for the ball in Hilary Term 2018, with a contribution of £5,797.24 excl. VAT.

Seconded by the President.

*nem. con.*

### Questions to the Secretary

There are no questions to the Secretary.

### **Mr Shanuk Mediwaka**

#### Business of Mr Mediwaka

Mr Mediwaka has no business.

#### Questions to Mr Mediwaka

There are no questions to Mr Mediwaka.

### **Ms Genevieve Athis**

#### Business of Ms Athis

Ms Athis has no business.

#### Questions to Ms Athis

There are no questions to Ms Athis.

### **Mr Adam Watson**

#### Business of Mr Watson

Mr Watson has no business.

#### Questions to Mr Watson

There are no questions to Mr Watson.

### **Mr Charles Wang**

#### Business of Mr Wang

Mr Wang has no business.

#### Questions to Mr Wang

There are no questions to Mr Wang.

**Mr Charlie Cheesman**

Business of Mr Cheesman

Mr Cheesman has no business.

Questions to Mr Cheesman

There are no questions to Mr Cheesman.

**Ms Izzy Risino**

Business of Ms Risino

Ms Risino has no business.

Questions to Ms Risino

There are no questions to Ms Risino.

**Mr Chris Garner**

Business of Mr Garner

Mr Garner has no business.

Questions to Mr Garner

There are no questions to Mr Garner.

**The President-Elect**

Business

The President-Elect has no business.

Questions

There are no questions to the President-Elect.

**The Librarian-Elect**

Business of the Librarian-Elect

The Librarian-Elect has no business.

Questions to the Librarian-Elect

There are no questions to the Librarian-Elect.

## **The Treasurer-Elect**

### **Business of the Treasurer-Elect**

The Treasurer-Elect has no business.

### **Questions to the Treasurer-Elect**

There are no questions to the Treasurer-Elect.

## **The Ex-Officio**

### **Business to the Ex-Officio**

The Ex-Officio have no business.

### **Questions to the Ex-Officio**

There are no questions to the Ex-Officio.

## **The Senior Librarian**

### **Business of the The Senior Librarian**

The Senior Librarian has no business.

### **Questions to the The Senior Librarian**

There are questions to the The Senior Librarian.

## **The Senior Treasurer**

### **Business of the The Senior Treasurer**

The Senior Treasurer has no business.

### **Questions to The Senior Treasurer**

There are no questions to The Senior Treasurer.

## **The Bursar**

### **Business of The Bursar**

The Bursar has no business.

### **Questions to The Bursar**

There are no questions to The Bursar.

## **The Returning Officer**



### Business of The Returning Officer

The Returning Officer has no business.

### Questions to The Returning Officer

There are no questions to The Returning Officer.

### **The Chair of the Consultative Committee**

#### Business of The Chair of the Consultative Committee

The Chair of the Consultative Committee has no business.

#### Questions to The Chair of the Consultative Committee

There are no questions to The Chair of the Consultative Committee.

### **The Access Officers**

#### Business of The Access Officers

The Access Officers have no business.

#### Questions to The Access Officers

There are no questions to The Access Officers.

### **The Chair of the Debate Selection Committee**

#### Business of The Chair of the Debate Selection Committee

**The CDSC** explains Standing Order B13(7)(c)(i), which stipulates restrictions on the competitors. He explains that one competitor was unaware of this rule until two weeks previously, and there are no further available tournaments this term. He explains given the high expense of the recent trip to Mexico, the DSC has had to limit the number of tournaments available. Therefore, this member would be unable to fulfil requirements to trial. She asks whether we could waive this requirements for her.

*The President delegates the chairing of the Standing Committee to the Returning Officer for the duration of the rest of the meeting at 16:29.*

*The President leaves the room at 16:30.*

**The CSDC** explains that **the President** said that following a recommendation of the DSC, this can be brought to the Standing Committee. He explains that requirements have been placed on the members that she must fulfil.

**The Returning Officer** asks if there are any questions to the CDSC.

**The Bursar** asks why, when the Rules are clear, there should be an exception made.

**The CDSC** explains that the members of the DSC were aware, but she was not. She is the World Champion, and given missing the speech was the result of an honest mistake she should be allowed to trial.

**The Treasurer** notes that a difference between electoral speech requirements is that there is often time to rectify a mistake, but here the member became aware of the rule but could not rectify it.

**The Returning Officer** considers it not this clear cut. He tells the CDSC that the Standing Order cannot be waived for just one person.

*Shanuk Mediwaka leaves the room at 16:33.*

**The CDSC** says that this is not the understanding that was got from the President. He believes that the wording of the motion could allow this particular incidence.

**Mr Harkness** believes the motion as worded would be able to be waived for this person.

**The Bursar** asks if this waive would disadvantage anyone else.

**The CDSC** explains that there is still a competitive trial so would not disadvantage other members.

**The Treasurer** notes that we should add her name to the motion.

**The Returning Officer** raises the point that this could set a precedent.

**The CDSC** explains that this is the first time he has ever heard of someone missing the rule. He notes he will more widely publish the Standing Order so that it does not happen again. He notes that the Standing Order applies to very few people only once per year, and the member in question went last year to judge rather than speak, where the Standing Order does not apply.

**The Bursar** says that there must be a reason for this Standing Order.

**The CDSC** explains that it has to do with funding. He says that imposing requirements on her would make this fair.

**Mr Watson** explains that he does not think someone should be given the benefit of the doubt for not knowing the Rules.

**The Treasurer** says that by not following this Rule, there is no harm to the Society, but by not giving this person a trial would potentially reduce the chance of winning the World Championships, which raises the prestige of the Union.

**The Returning Officer** suggests adding a clause that exempts reigning World Champions from this Standing Order.

**The CDSC** says that this would unfairly advantage those in the English as a Second Language Category, and adding this clause would apply to very few people.

**The Treasurer** agrees with the Returning Officer. He believes that it would be fair to do so.

**Mr Watson** would also be in favour of this.

*Brian Wong, Ex-Standing Committee, enters the room at 16:41.*

**The Secretary** thinks that is unreasonable not to waive the Standing Order for this person, given it is so easy for the Standing Committee to do, and causes far more harm by not doing it. She does not believe that it will set a precedent, especially if the DSC still explain that it is a requirement.

**The CDSC** explains that this motion would have to be brought up each time, and so the DSC would try to ensure that it does not arise. Due to extraordinary budget situations this year, there were fewer tournament opportunities and so he would be more comfortable with a sing waive at this time.

**The Returning Officer** suggests adding a point to the motion that mentions that it sets no precedent.

The CDSC moves that, following the recommendation of the DSC, the Standing Committee waive Standing Order B13(7)(c)(i) for Vikki Perijainen, Balliol College.

Seconded by the Treasurer.

*nem. con.*

#### Questions to The Chair of the Debate Selection Committee

There are no questions to The Chair of the Debate Selection Committee.

#### Changes to the Composition of this Committee

There are no changes to the composition of this Committee.

#### Any Other Business

There is no other business.

#### Date of Next Meeting

- TBC

*The Returning Officer closes this Ordinary Meeting of the Standing Committee at 16:44.*

Signed,



**Molly Greenwood**  
*St. Hilda's College*  
Secretary