The Ratified Minutes of THE ORDINARY MEETING OF THE STANDING COMMITTEE 2nd Week Hilary Term 2019 21st January 2019 TV Room, 16:00

Present:

The President (Mr Daniel Wilkinson, Oriel College), The Librarian (Mr Brendan McGrath, Oriel College), The Treasurer (Ms Amy Gregg, Somerville College), The Secretary (Mr Nicholas Leah, Lincoln College), The Elected Member (Mr Chaitanya Kediyal, Exeter College), The Elected Member (Mr Shining Zhao, University College), The Elected Member (Ms Mahi Joshi, Trinity College), The Elected Member (Mr Jim Brennan, St Peter's College), The Elected Member (Mr Elliot Bromley, St Edmund Hall), The Elected Member (Mr Rai Saad Khan, Christ Church), The President-Elect (Ms Genevieve Athis, Christ Church), The Librarian-Elect (Ms Sara Dube, St Hugh's College), The Treasurer-Elect (Mr Charlie Coverman, Brasenose College) The Ex-Treasurer (Mr James Lamming, Exeter College)

Attending:

The Senior Treasurer (Mr Stephen Dixon, *Downing College, Cambridge*), The Senior Librarian (Mr Sean Power, *Oriel College*), The Bursar (Mrs Lindsay Warne), The Returning Officer (Ms Louise Kandler, *Lady Margaret Hall*), The Chair of the Debate Select Committee (Mr Chin Lee Wee, *Trinity College*), The Access Officer (Mx Brian Wong, *Wolfson College*), Ms Alexandra Galloway, *Magdalen College*, Mr Liam Frahm, *Jesus College*, Mx Charlie Willis, *Wadham College*, Ms Cassandra Sullivan, *Linacre College*

Absent:

The Chair of the Consultative Committee (Mr James Dix, Christ Church), The Access Officer (Ms Amelia Harvey, Kellogg College)

Apologies

None

Requests to Pass Absences from Previous Meetings

The President moves that the Standing Committee pass Ms Olivia Leigh's absence from the 1^{st} week ordinary meeting of the Standing Committee due to a disabling and infectious illness with good reason

The motion passes nem. con.

The President opens the meeting at 16:05

Matters Arising from Previous Minutes

None

Ratification of Minutes

The President moves that the Standing Committee ratify the minutes from the 1st week HT19 Ordinary Meeting of the Standing Committee

The motion passes nem. con.

The President moves that the Standing Committee ratify the minutes from the 1st week HT19 Emergency Meeting of the Standing Committee

The motion passes nem. con.

The President

Business of the President:

Press requests

The President states there have been a large number of press requests this week. They note they have received batch of requests from Cherwell, including a request about an interview they conducted with Bill Donohue. They add that they refused to comment on a number of things he said.

The President notes that they have received a letter from Oxford Councillor Tom Hayes.

The President notes that they have conducted an interview with OxMail about Bill Donohue to clear up the process of invitation.

The President notes that they received a request from the Oxford Development Office about an interview Brian Lara.

The President proceeds to re-ratify the appointed officials as discussed in the previous ordinary meeting of the Standing Committee.

The President moves that the Standing Committee re-ratify Ms Natasha Naidoo as the Sponsorship Officer for Hilary Term 2019

The motion passes nem. con.

The President moves that the Standing Committee re-ratify Mx Brian Wong as the Senior Access Officer for Hilary Term 2019

The motion passes nem. con.

The President moves that the Standing Committee re-ratify Mr Garang Dut as the Graduate Officer for Hilary Term 2019

The motion passes nem. con.

The President moves that the Standing Committee re-ratify Ms Olly Woodhouse as the Temporary Memberships Officer for Hilary Term 2019

The motion passes nem. con.

The President moves that the Standing Committee re-ratify Ms Priscilla Guo as the Women's Officer for Hilary Term 2019

The motion passes with objections from Mr Jim Brennan and Mr Elliot Bromley.

The President proceeds to re-ratify the vacation days completed as discussed in the previous ordinary meeting of the Standing Committee.

The President moves that the Standing Committee ratify that the Logistics Officer Mr Nils Lovegren completed a total of 9 vacation days over the Hilary Term vacation period

The motion passes nem. con.

The President moves that the Standing Committee ratify that the Press Officer Ms Miriam Feldman completed a total of 8 vacation days over the Hilary Term vacation period

The motion passes nem. con.

The President moves that the Standing Committee ratify that the Socioeconomic Officer Ms Amelia Bircham completed a total of 6 vacation days over the Hilary Term vacation period

The motion passes nem. con.

The President states that the interim reports stipulated under A1 of the rules are now overdue and need to be completed by members of committee with immediate effect.

Questions to the President:

There are no questions to the President

The Librarian

Business of the Librarian:

The Librarian has no business

Questions to the Librarian:

There are no questions to the Librarian

The Treasurer

Business of the Treasurer:

The Treasurer asks the Bursar if they have the DSC cover sheet. **The Bursar** responds that they are happy to pass the DSC expenses subject to their comments.

The Senior Treasurer states that they had a glance at the DSC expenses from the week but did not understand about the section about visas.

The Chair of the Debate Selection Committee states that they have had discussion within DSC about whether to reimburse reasonable expenses for travel, particularly for reasons outside of the control of the debaters: for example, the need to apply for a visa. They add that

the DSC is currently running a surplus so it seems like a sensible idea to make reasonable reimbursements for a reason of access.

The Senior Treasurer thanks the Chair of the Debate Selection Committee. They add that this should not be something that can be done one year but not the year. **The Bursar** agrees that the question of visas is not something that is here today and gone tomorrow.

The Chair of the Debate Selection Committee proposes that a motion is moved a discussion be had about paying for visa costs who want otherwise be unable to take part in debates.

The President asks for clarity on whether the debaters who took the ferry to their recent debate saved the society money. The Chair of the Debate Selection Committee confirms that this did save the society money. The Treasurer adds that this discussion does not concern the ferry or the flight, but rather the visa. They further add that a visa is reasonable thing to spend money on, and believes that expenses for visas should operate on an ad hoc basis or have a cap.

The Chair of the Debate Selection Committee suggests that a cap of £100 seems more than reasonable. The Treasurer adds that this would make it possible for people to go down to London for any visa issues.

Mr James Lamming enters the room at 16:18

The Elected Member (Mr Chaitanya Kediyal, *Exeter College*) thinks that a hard cap would work best, and points out that it usually the highest costs for weakest passports.

The Treasurer agrees with the £100 cap, suggesting that the Debate Selection Committee approve this and then it can be brought to TSC.

The Chair of the Debate Selection Committee moves that the Standing Committee endorse the proposal that a £100 cap is set for debating visa requirements, as approved by the Debate Selection Committee

Seconded by the Treasurer.

The motion passes nem. con.

The Treasurer asks the Bursar to remind them of the full amount.

The Treasurer moves that the Standing Committee pass DSC expenses of £534.14, as recommended by the Finance Committee

Seconded by the President.

The motion passes nem. con.

Questions to the Treasurer:

There are no questions to the Treasurer

The Secretary

Business of the Secretary:

The Secretary notes that the ball budget will need to be passed during an emergency meeting of both the Finance Committee and the Standing Committee. They state that this is because they are still negotiating with a few suppliers and awaiting their final quotes.

Questions to the Secretary:

There are no questions to the Secretary

Mr Chaitanya Kediyal

Business of Mr Chaitanya Kediyal:

Mr Chaitanya Kediyal has no business

Questions to Mr Chaitanya Kediyal:

There are no questions to Mr Chaitanya Kediyal

Mr Shining Zhao

Business of Mr Shining Zhao:

Mr Shining Zhao has no business

Questions to Mr Shining Zhao:

There are no questions to Mr Shining Zhao

Ms Mahi Joshi

Business of Ms Mahi Joshi:

Ms Mahi Joshi has no business

Questions to Ms Mahi Joshi:

There are no questions to Ms Mahi Joshi

Mr Jim Brennan

Business of Mr Jim Brennan:

Mr Jim Brennan has no business

Questions to Mr Jim Brennan:

There are no questions to Mr Jim Brennan

Mr Elliot Bromley

Business of Mr Elliot Bromley:

Mr Elliott Bromley has no business

Questions to Mr Elliot Bromley:

There are no questions to Mr Elliot Bromley

Ms Olivia Leigh

Business of Ms Olivia Leigh:

Ms Olivia Leigh has no business in their absence

Questions to Ms Olivia Leigh:

There are no questions to Ms Olivia Leigh in their absence

Mr Rai Saad Khan

Business of Mr Rai Saad Khan:

Burns Night social

The President notes that that Burns Night social has sold 167 tickets. **The Treasurer** adds that it has already made a contribution not a loss.

The Elected Member (Mr Rai Saad Khan, *Christ Church*) notes that the social will feature a whiskey tasting.

The Elected Member (Mr Rai Saad Khan, *Christ Church*) adds that they will ensure that the Ceilidh band arrive in smart attire, not military attire as they typically do.

Questions to Mr Rai Saad Khan:

There are no questions to Mr Rai Saad Khan

The President-Elect

Business of the President-Elect:

Graduate rules change

The President-Elect notes that their proposed change has been distributed.

The President-Elect states they will be discussing post-graduate life members. They note that there was a lot of consensus last term about giving postgraduates on a one-year course the opportunity to run straight for the Union's Standing Committee. They add that post-graduates have more experience and offer a great deal to the society.

The President-Elect states that they are happy to open up into a discussion.

The Bursar argues that the proposed change is discriminatory to one-year courses who are fast-tracked to the Standing Committee. **The President-Elect** responds that future Standing Committees can change this. They add that recognition of one-year courses is not discriminatory.

The Bursar states that students on a one-year course have been very competent in past but they have gone through the normal electoral process.

The President states that the structure of the Union is different and unique. They argue that postgraduates on one-year courses might have experience but they would not know what the Union is and how it works. They add that those who run for Secretary's Committee on one-year courses usually do a very small number of vacation days, thus it would be binding the hands of a future Hilary term President.

The President-Elect maintains that students should not be running if they cannot do their vacation day requirements.

The Treasurer says that they broadly agree with the proposed change. They suggest that an eligibility requirement is attached to the change.

The President suggests that postgraduates on one-year courses attend the committee meetings they would be sat on.

The Treasurer suggests four meetings so the postgraduate members know what they are doing and how to govern. They add that one-year course students often cannot do the vacation day requirement, and therefore it might be worthwhile introducing something similar to appointed officials. They note that this might be controversial, as the students would be voted in by the society's wider membership.

The Bursar asks if the change will make a differentiation between a one-year course and a student part-time on block release. **The President-Elect** responds that this change will only affect one-year courses.

The President-Elect notes that that one way to make sure everyone do their vacation days is to make it clearer on the form.

The Bursar states that they are more worried about the commitment of those students during the term. **The President-Elect** replies that the election workshops will outline commitment.

The Bursar states that every other term there are people who stand for Secretary's Committee and resign because they realise that they need to work. **The President-Elect** replies that a resignation could apply to anyone.

The Elected Member (Mr Elliot Bromley, *St Edmund Hall*) notes that they sympathise with the point about exposure and experience. They add that there is no guarantee that postgraduates on a one-year course would get further experience in Hilary than in Michaelmas. They suggest that vacation days are made more stringent.

The President asks how you make it more stringent. They add that vacation day requirements are made clear. **The Elected Member** (Mr Elliot Bromley, *St Edmund Hall*) replies that repercussions could be imposed and people removed from their positions.

The President states that are a number of issues with removing elected officials. **The Treasurer-Elect** responds that people are automatically removed from office if they miss three meetings. **The President** responds that this is about vacation work not term time commitments. **The Treasurer-Elect** maintains that a lack of vacation work sets a precedent for little attendance throughout the term.

The President notes that the main concern is postgraduate exams in January as it makes them the least likely students to complete vacation days.

The Elected Member (Mr Rai Saad Khan, *Christ Church*) states that they do not wish to make a generalisation about one-year students as it could be the same exam circumstances for other courses.

The Senior Librarian leaves the room at 16:39

The Librarian moves that the Standing Committee grant Ms Cassandra Sullivan speaking rights for the duration of the meeting

Seconded by the President-Elect.

The motion passes nem. con.

Ms Cassandra Sullivan states that they are observing in the capacity of the Said Business School Liaison Officer. They note that they have heard solid arguments for and against the proposed change. They state that there are currently more opportunities for students if they have a longer time at the university. They add that a big theme of the term is accessibility. They argue that are many people who would like to participate but there's an arcane procedure preventing them from doing so. They further argue that there has been an unfair generalisation about one or two people not completing their vacation day requirements. They conclude that they are struggling to understand a strong case against the proposed change.

The Librarian states that on the question of eligibility they are concerned about the potential clashes with postgraduate classes at 4pm. **Ms Cassandra Sullivan** replies that none of the classes at the Said Business School are compulsory so it should not be a problem.

The Bursar notes that there are a large number of appointed positions without this restriction but with large responsibility. **The President-Elect** replies that some people would rather be on the society's governing body than on the appointed committee.

The President states that this is not about stopping people getting involved, it is about eligibility for one specific position.

The President-Elect maintains that the standing committee requirement is arbitrary, including nominating speeches. They add that there needs to be a wider discussion about interest.

The Treasurer argues that the changes like the proposed one brought by the President-Elect are crucial to graduate involvement.

The Elected Member (Mr Chaitanya Kediyal, *Exeter College*) states that there only concern is about an eligibility restriction.

The Treasurer maintains that nominating speeches are arbitrary but not the observation of the society's governing body.

The Elected Member (Mr Jim Brennan, *St Peter's College*) states that it is not wider experience that is needed to serve on the committee, but an understanding of how the society works.

The President-Elect notes that it is hard to give people taste of vacation work.

The Elected Member (Mr Chaitanya Kediyal, *Exeter College*) notes that they see the sentiment behind the eligibility restriction but they are not sure what purpose it will serve.

The Ex-Treasurer recommends that the Standing Committee pass the proposed change without a restriction. They add that someone could discuss amendments before the House.

The Librarian notes that without the amendment people would not be able to speak in favour. **The President-Elect** replies that if the amendment is accepted as friendly then it can be debated.

The Librarian asks if the committee can vote without amendment. The President responds that there problems with testing a vote. They state that is not how the committee is supposed to work.

The Elected Member (Mr Chaitanya Kediyal, *Exeter College*) suggests that it might be better to debate both versions, one with and one without an eligibility restriction.

The Ex-Treasurer states that they would not accept anything that is friendly. They add that it would be useful if anyone who thinks the motion is a terrible idea speaks up.

The Elected Member (Mr Chaitanya Kediyal, *Exeter College*) agrees that if someone has a strong view then they should voice their concern at this stage.

The Librarian asks if there will be any final discussion on the motion.

The President-Elect moves that the Standing Committee recommend the following private business motion on one-year postgraduate students for the public business meeting on 7th February 2019

Seconded by the Treasurer.

The motion passes with 12 for (The Librarian, The Treasurer, The Secretary, The Ex-Treasurer, The President-Elect, The Librarian-Elect, The Treasurer-Elect, Ms Mahi Joshi, Mr Rai Saad Khan, Mr Shining Zhao, Mr Elliot Bromley, Ms Olivia Leigh) and 2 against (The President, Mr Jim Brennan)

The Librarian-Elect

Business of the Librarian-Elect:

The Librarian-Elect has no business

Questions to the Librarian-Elect:

There are no questions to the Librarian-Elect

The Treasurer-Elect

Business of the Treasurer-Elect:

The Librarian-Elect has no business

Questions to the Treasurer-Elect:

There are no questions to the Librarian-Elect

The Ex-Officers

Business of the Ex-Officers:

The Ex-Officers have no business in their absence

Questions to the Ex-Officers:

There are no questions to the Ex-Officers in their absence

The Senior Librarian

Business of the Senior Librarian:

The Senior Librarian has no business in their absence

Questions to the Senior Librarian:

There are no questions to the Senior Librarian in their absence

The Senior Treasurer

Business of the Senior Treasurer:

The Senior Treasurer thanks the President for sending them the term card.

The Senior Treasurer notes that someone notified OLDUT about the invitation to Madame Le Pen this term. They add that OLDUT express concern that a lot of ring-wing speakers had been invited this term and not a lot of left-wing speakers.

The President responds that the society does achieve balance, especially in invitations and acceptances. They add that left-wing speakers typically receive much less attention than right-wing speakers.

The Secretary asks the Senior Treasurer what OLDUT is for the benefits of the Standing Committee.

The Senior Treasurer notes that OLDUT (Oxford Library and Debating Union Trust) was founded about forty years ago. They state that it was founded when the Union was heading towards bankruptcy and serious financial problems. They add that most of the Union's property was put into OLDUT and it is a charity registered with the charities commission. They further add that OLDUT objects to speakers being given a platform but not being sufficiently challenged.

The Senior Treasurer further notes that the Union is given a loan of a million pounds from Mitsubishi bank. They add that OLDUT are in the process of a professional fundraiser trying to raise two million pounds.

The President notes that next Tuesday the Senior Treasurer will hold an Oxford Union Society accounting session at 2pm.

The Elected Member (Mr Rai Saad Khan, *Christ Church*) asks for clarification on what OLDUT owns. **The Bursar** responds that OLDUT owns the education part of the Union, thus only the rooms with books. They add that they have a nine hundred and ninety year lease. **The Senior Treasurer** states that it is effectively freehold ownership.

Questions to the Senior Treasurer:

There are no questions to the Senior Treasurer

The Bursar

Business of the Bursar:

The Bursar has no business

Questions to the Bursar:

There are no questions to the Bursar

The Returning Officer

Business of the Returning Officer:

The Returning Officer notes that they have two things to discuss.

The Rules

The Returning Officer states that they have circulated the rules and the rules changes have been added.

The President notes that they spoke last week about scanning in rules changes. They express concern about checking with the Returning Officer about what has been passed. **The Returning Officer** states that they have not had enough time to scan everything.

The Returning Officer adds that many of the changes are on the noticeboard.

The President asks how the Returning Officer compared the changes using software. **The Treasurer** notes that this would not have been possible with PDF files.

The Bursar states that it is very quick to scan documents.

The Returning Officer states that they can scan the documents. They ask if the committee would like them to issue the rules now.

The President maintains that they would like to see some rules now.

Mr Liam Frahm states that a new copy of the rules will be issued in a few weeks time.

Deputy Returning Officer List

The Returning Officer notes that the Deputy Returning Officer lists are distributed on the table.

The President asks if the committee can submit a corporate objection. The Returning Officer replies that the committee can.

The Librarian asks on what basis the lists are being ratified.

The Returning Officer notes that the relevant rule is Rule 33(a)(7) which discusses Standing Order D12 and how long particularly people have been a Deputy Returning Officer. They

note that it takes into account experience in the Union's elections, experience in other society elections, and the general governance of the society.

The Elected Member (Mr Jim Brennan, *St Peter's College*) asks if the experience is from the Deputy Returning Officer's first term as a Returning Officer Assistant. **The Returning Officer** confirms that is right.

The Returning Officer notes that Ms Isabelle cox and Mr Lewis Roberts have external experience.

The Elected Member (Mr Jim Brennan, *St Peter's College*) asks what that experience was. **The Returning Officer** that it was in their college's Junior Common Room elections and as Deputy Returning Officer for the Oxford University Conservative Association.

The Returning Officer moves that the Standing Committee pass the Deputy Returning Officer shortlist for Hilary Term 2019

Seconded by the President.

The motion passes nem. con.

The Returning Officer adds that Mr Lachlann Hinley has experience with the St John's Junior Common Room, their school's debating society, and as a local political party examiner for Scottish party elections.

The Elected Member (Mr Jim Brennan, *St Peter's College*) states that the Returning Officer should change the order of the Deputy Returning Officer list.

The Returning Officer moves that the Standing Committee pass the following change to the Deputy Returning Officer shortlist, placing Mr Lachlann Hinley as first reserve and Ms Isabelle Cox as number eight

Seconded by the President.

Abstention - Brendan, JD, RSK

The President asks for clarity on the Standing Committee submitting corporate objections. The Returning Officer replies that there are two types of objections: the first a corporate objection that goes to the Standing Committee, the second that is an anonymous submission to the President.

The Treasurer leaves the at 17:23

The Returning Officer states that any objections must concern a Deputy Returning Officer's suitability not their capability, which is determined by a scrutiny board.

The President asks if anyone would like to submit a corporate objection.

The Elected Member (Mr Jim Brennan, *St Peter's College*) expresses their concern about the overlap with the hack world and Returning Officer world, particularly regarding Mr Joe Sisson.

The Elected Member (Mr Jim Brennan, *St Peter's College*) asks if a secret ballot can be held. **The Librarian** and **the Ex-Treasurer** both object to this.

The Elected Member (Mr Jim Brennan, St Peter's College) moves that the Standing Committee hold a secret ballot for voting on the corporate objection of Mr Joe Sisson

Seconded by the President.

JB – for Against – EB, CC, JL, RSK, everyone else Amy – abstention

The Elected Member (Mr Jim Brennan, *St Peter's College*) expresses their concern of friendliness within the election. They add the Standing Committee should not encourage these practices. They further add that certain individuals worked with people to get them elected.

The Ex-Treasurer states the Elected Member needs proof to support these allegations. **The Returning Officer** replies that no proof is needed for a corporate objection.

Ms Cassandra Sullivan leaves the room at 17:31

The Elected Member (Mr Chaitanya Kediyal, *Exeter College*) notes that it is the scrutiny committee's remit for the objection. They ask the President to characterise the objection. **The President** replies that they will write to Mr Joe Sisson about this matter offering them a chance to respond chance to respond about the apparent overlap of the judiciary the governing body.

The Elected Member (Mr Jim Brennan, *St Peter's College*) states that a Returning Officer Assistant was sacked after stating their intention to run. **The President** replies that the aforementioned case is not relevant.

The Elected Member (Mr Jim Brennan, St Peter's College) moves that the Standing Committee approve the corporate objection of Mr Joe Sisson to be Deputy Returning Officer this term

Seconded by the President.

The motion fails with 4 for (The Librarian, Ms Mahi Joshi, Mr Rai Saad Khan, Mr Jim Brennan) and 6 against (The President-Elect, The Treasurer-Elect, The Ex-Treasurer, Mr Elliot Bromley, Mr Chaitanya Kediyal, Mr Shining Zhao), including 4 abstentions (The President, The Treasurer, The Secretary, Ms Olivia Leigh).

The Chair of the Consultative Committee

Business of the Chair of the Consultative Committee:

The Chair of the Consultative has no business in their absence

Questions to the Chair of the Consultative Committee:

There are no questions to the Chair of the Consultative Committee in their absence

The Access Officers

Business of the Access Officers:

Mx Brian Wong states that they have released the report on the access survey. They add that it has been sent to the President and it will be circulated to the Standing Committee.

The President notes that there is an election workshop planned for this term to take place in fourth week.

The President-Elect asks if it will be in the same format as last term. Mx Brian Wong confirms that it will be in the same format.

The Returning Officer adds that fourth week is the best week to hold this event.

The Librarian asks if there was any reason why third week was not chosen. **The Treasurer-Elect** responds that this is because a public business meeting at the Palestine debate was not properly called and an additional public business meeting is needed before close of nominations.

The Treasurer asks if there has to be an additional one. The Treasurer-Elect confirms that there does.

Questions to the Access Officers:

There are no questions to the Access Officers

The Chair of the Debate Selection Committee

Business of the Chair of the Debate Selection Committee:

The Chair of the Debate Selection Committee gives their weekly update on the society's debating teams. They note that of the two teams that were sent to the Inner Temple Debating Open, one team reached the semi-final, with the Chair of the Debate Selection Committee ranking third and their partner Mr Arthur James, ranking seventh. They add the Mx Brian Wong was part of a composite team that reached the final and Mx Brian Wong was ranked joint third.

The Chair of the Debate Selection Committee notes that they do not think the Standing Orders that the Returning Officer just handed out incorporates some of the changes that were passed last week. They state that they will liaise with the Returning Officer about this.

The Chair of the Debate Selection Committee notes their intention to table a Standing Order change. They acknowledge that they submitted it to the Secretary too late to be considered on the agenda and they will bring it to the next ordinary meeting of the Standing Committee.

Questions to the Chair of the Debate Selection Committee:

There are no questions to the Chair of the Debate Selection Committee

Changes to the Composition of this Committee

None

Any Other Business

The Treasurer states that the women's public speaking workshop was very successful. They thank the Chair of the Debate Selection Committee for their contribution.

Date of Next Meeting

The President states that they will call the next meeting for Monday 28th January at 16:00.

The President closes the meeting at 16:20

Mulab Coeg hed

Signed,

Nicholas Leah Lincoln College

Secretary