

Draft Minutes of

THE ORDINARY MEETING OF THE DEBATE SELECTION COMMITTEE

6th Week Hilary Term 2019

Sunday 17th February

The TV Room, 17:30

Present: **The Chair of the Debate Selection Committee** (Lee Chin Wee, *Trinity College*), **The DSC Deputy Secretary cum Librarian-elect** (Sara Singh Dube, *St. Hugh's College*), **The DSC Treasurer** (Bryan Yan, *Keble College*), **Standing Committee Delegate** (Chaitanya Kediya, *Exeter College*), **The Internals Officer** (Brian Wong, *Wolfson College*), **Director of Training** (Rachel O Nunain, *Trinity College*), **The President** (Daniel Wilkinson, *Oriel College*)

Attending: Ex-CDSC (Andrew Seow, *Lincoln College*)

Apologies:

Absent: **The Externals Officer** (Jason Xiao, *Wadham College*)

Late: **The DSC Secretary** (Rosa Thomas, *St. Anne's College*)

DSC opens at 17:36

The DSC Secretary enters the room at 17:37

Apologies

Request to pass Absences from Previous Meetings

The CDSC moves to pass the Internals Officer's absence from the previous meeting on the grounds that they had immovable academic commitment.

Motion passes nem. com.

Matters arising from Previous Minutes

Ratification of Minutes

The CDSC moves to ratify the minutes of week 5 of Hilary term.

Motion passes nem. com.

Business of the CDSC

Filling of DSC Vacancy

DSC moves in camera at 17:39 to select a member for DSC

DSC stops being in camera at 17:55

The CDSC announces that Mr Dominic Brind has been filled the vacancy on DSC.

Update of OxWSC

The Externals Officer announces that they have received applications from Mr Jack Solomon, Mr Jamie Johnson, Ms Tara Sallis, and Ms Kristine Wilson for the four positions on the Organisation Committee of OxWSDC.

The CDSC adds that the DSC Treasurer has withdrawn their application for Training Director. As a result Ms Louisa Broeg will serve as the Deputy Convenor, and that the CDSC will serve as the Training Director.

The Externals Officer points out that none of the applicants have applied to serve as the Food or Social Officer, and that Mr Jack Solomon has only applied to serve as Chief of Staff.

The CDSC suggests appointing Mr Jack Solomon as the Chief of Staff since it is equitable that multiple students in their first year have the opportunity to hold positions of reasonable importance to demonstrate their ability to handle such positions.

The Ex-CDSC says that Mr Jack Solomon did not organise their regional round well, and that this raises questions about their ability to serve as Chief of Staff.

The Director of Training responds that it is better to appoint Mr Jack Solomon as Chief of Staff if all applicants have to be appointed since the role of Chief of Staff does not require an independent task which is susceptible to being poorly managed.

The Externals Officer adds that Mr Jack Solomon has experience managing a team and hosting a competition in Australia.

The CDSC mentions that they have no issue appointing Mr Jack Solomon as Chief of Staff.

The Externals Officer says that people who have applied to serve as Social and Outrooms can be appointed to these roles, however this still leaves the position of Food Officer empty.

The Ex-CDSC suggests appointing Mr Jamie Johnson as the Food Officer.

The DSC Secretary agrees that Mr Jamie Johnson would serve as a competent Food Officer.

The Externals Officer states that this would mean Ms Tara Sallis can serve as the Out-rooms Officer and Ms Kristine Wilson can serve as the Social Officer.

The CDSC points out that a Social Officer is unnecessary, and suggests appointing Ms Kristine Wilson as the Food Officer since Mr Jamie Johnson has already had the opportunity to serve as the Chief of Staff of Oxford Schools Finals Day.

The CDSC moves to ratify the following appointments as the Organisation Committee of OxWSC. The DSC Treasurer seconds the motion.

Co-Convenors: Mr Jason Xiao and Ms Geneva Roy

Deputy Convenor: Ms Louisa Broeg

Training Director: Mr Lee Chin Wee

Chief of Staff: Mr Jack Solomon

Out-rooms Officer: Ms Tara Sallis

Food Officer: Ms Kristine Wilson

Motion passes nem. com.

The CDSC asks the Externals Officer whether the last CA of OxWSC had been selected between Ms Rory Flynn and Ms Ana Vilhelmina Verdnik, and requests the Externals Officer to list the CAs currently confirmed.

The Externals Officer announces that Mr Teck Wei Tan, Ms Lisa Schallenberg, Mr Luke Churchyard, and Mr Bryan Yan have been invited as CAs for OxWSC.

The DSC Secretary says that there are certainly benefits of selecting Ms Ana Vilhelmina Verdnik as the last CA, but raises the concern that Ms Ana Vilhelmina Verdnik will not be able to attract additional teams to participate.

The Director of Training adds that other potential candidates for this position hold more impressive debating achievements at the WSDC level, and should be preferred.

The CDSC agrees and suggests reaching out first to Ms Rory Flynn, then Ms Rosa Thomas. This is because the panel does not currently have an English CA and Ms Rosa Thomas has won WSDC. If neither of them are able to CA the tournament, then the Externals Officer should reach out to Ms Ana Vilhelmina Verdnik and finally to Ms Vikki Perijainen.

The Externals Officer mentions that Capstone is willing to sponsor OxWSC and pay £1000 in exchange for naming advertisement rights.

The DSC Treasurer says that it is important to make it clear what the conditions for sponsorship are, otherwise it could lead to problems at a later stage.

The CDSC adds that it is important to be careful about the optics of such a sponsorship since Capstone could potentially send teams, and that the bottom line is that the tournament cannot be named after Capstone.

The Internals Officer points out that in previous years Capstone has had a difficult relationship with Cambridge and that Capstone marketed a competition at Cambridge in ways which were not agreed upon. This means that a contract should be agreed upon with Capstone to ensure certainty and clarity.

The CDSC says that alternate sources of sponsorship should certainly be explored and while this is an interesting proposal it is better to decide first what conditions should be placed internally before reaching out to Capstone.

The Ex-CDSC suggests asking Capstone what their conditions are to provide sponsorship.

The Director of Training raises the concern that in such negotiations there is a first-mover advantage, and as a result the Externals Officer should provide the conditions initially to limit the extent of concessions which have to be made.

The Externals Officer states that it would be fair to allow Capstone to have a booth at the tournament, advertise their name on OxWSC's social media page, and have a conversation with judges after the

tournament. However, this last aspect cannot be publicised as it could create conflict of interests if Capstone teams are participating in the tournament.

The Director of Training suggests agreeing with Capstone that emails will be sent out to the judges after the tournament informing them about an opportunity to meet representatives of Capstone.

The CDSC agrees with these suggestions, and reminds the Externals Officer to be careful about the optics of the sponsorship.

Competency points changes

The CDSC announces the following changes to the competency points to integrate the recently created OxWSDC Organisation Committee roles and to provide competency points for the Sponsorship Officer.

Convening OxWSC should have the same number of points as convening Oxford Women's, which is 22 points.

The Training Director should have the same number of points as the Crash Officer of the Oxford IV.

The Ex-CDSC objects to this since the role of the Crash Officer is far greater than that of a Training Director.

The DSC Treasurer suggests awarding the Training Director the same number of competency points as other members of the OxWSC OrgComm.

The CDSC agrees to this change.

The OxWSC OrgComm should have the same number of competency points as the OrgComm of Women's Open, which is 8 points.

The DSC Sponsorship Officer for two or more terms should have the same number of competency points as the convenor of an ICYD regional round, which is 14 points.

DSC Treasurer's Standing Order changes

The Director of Training suggests changing the requirement to do 3 sessions of squads in a pro-am team to 4 sessions to encourage individuals to compete at a pro-am tournament or undertake a similar commitment since most tournaments have a minimum of 4 rounds.

The DSC Treasurer agrees to the change, and mentions that this Standing Order change affects the requirements to trial for EUDC/WUDC, removes unused clauses and introduces a variable helper point score for convening an Oxford Schools regional round.

The CDSC announces that the change will be brought in week 7 meeting of TSC.

Incident relating to Mr Marcus Huang's participation at Bath Pro-Am

The CDSC informs DSC that Mr Marcus Huang refused to apologise for their letter. As a result, the CDSC apologised on their behalf and promised Bath registration fees waivers for 3 team slots at the next Oxford IV. As a result, the members of Bath's debating society are happy to move on from the incident. The CDSC asks what the appropriate punishment for Mr Marcus Huang would be.

The DSC Treasurer suggests docking 6 helper points from Mr Marcus Huang for his actions.

The Ex-CDSC points out that Mr Marcus Huang would be relatively immune from such a measure.

The DSC Treasurer suggests a stricter measure such as preventing them from competing for Oxford and under the Oxford name for the rest of the academic year.

The CDSC agrees to dock 6 helper points from Mr Marcus Huang, and prevent them from competing for Oxford and under the Oxford name for the rest of the academic year.

Business of the DSC Treasurer

Expenses

The DSC Treasurer inquires about the regional round which was held on February 9, as Ms Kristine Wilson has asked to be reimbursed for travel without specifying the round.

The Ex-CDSC responds that it is likely to be an ICYD regional round, but suggests asking Ms Kristine Wilson before reimbursing the cost.

The DSC Treasurer points out that Mr Charles Xavier Redmond has spent £250 for Oxford Schools Finals Day wristbands. This is an extremely expensive purchase and has not been delivered to the Union, which means that VAT will not be reimbursed.

The CDSC recommends asking the Convenor of Oxford Schools Finals Day why such an expensive purchase was made for wristbands when there were alternatives.

The DSC Treasurer mentions that Mr Kit Mercer was sent by the Union to London for both LSE Open and the West London regional round but made only one travel. The DSC Treasurer says that Mr Kit Mercer can be reimbursed for two separate travels as has been done for other members who have made the same travels.

The DSC Treasurer says that £1070.12 has to be passed as DSC expenses today.

Business of DSC Secretary

Exemptions from 2 Oxford School regional rounds requirement

The DSC Secretary mentions that the following individuals need exemption from the requirement to judge Oxford Schools Finals Day and in certain cases the requirement to judge two regional rounds of Oxford Schools.

Ms Sarah Tay has rusticated for the year, and as a result is not in the country to judge the second regional round. They are exempted from the requirement.

Ms Emma Rowland has Law Moderations this term, and as a result is not in the country to judge the second regional round. They are exempted from the requirement.

Ms Gemma Timmons was meant to judge the last regional round in Guildford but have been recently informed that they have an interview at McKinsey & Company on the same day. The DSC Secretary mentions that Ms Gemma Timmons should be expected to conduct a workshop in the future, but are exempt from the requirement.

Mr Jack Solomon and Ms Louisa Broeg are competing at the Munich Open. They have booked flights and paid for accommodation. The DSC Secretary says that it would be unfair to make them bear such financial cost. The Director of Training says that it is important to ensure that such practises are deterred in the future and accordingly actions should be taken. The CDSC suggests docking 3 helper points each. The DSC Secretary confirms that they are exempted from the requirement but will lose 3 helper points each, and be expected to help by conducting workshops.

The Externals Officer has to coach a team on the same day, and has judged three regional rounds. They are exempted from the requirement but expected to help by conducting workshops.

The Director of Training has to submit their dissertation, and as a result cannot judge Oxford Schools Finals Day. They are exempted from the requirement.

Mx Imogen Edwards-Lawrence have to coach a team on the same day. They are exempted from the requirement but expected to help by conducting workshops.

Business of the DSC Deputy Secretary

The DSC Deputy Secretary says that Mr Peter Wallich offered to take crash, but did not receive crash, and has not been awarded helper points.

The DSC Secretary clarifies that there are no helper points given for offering to take crash or for taking crash. Helper points are only given in exceptional circumstances for hosting a particularly large number of people.

The CDSC says that they will clarify the requirements over the next DA and congratulates the DSC Secretary, DSC Deputy Secretary, and the Externals officer for nearly completing the process of backtracking helper points.

Business of Director of Training

The Director of Training mentions that Ms Lucia Arce will be conducting a workshop this Saturday, and that a session with Mr Teck Wei Tan will be rescheduled.

Business of the Internals Officer

Business of the Externals Officer

Selections of UCL IV

The Externals Officer says that there have been only four applications for the UCL IV.

The CDSC suggests keeping applications open for another week.

Opening applications for KCL Women's Open

The Externals Officer asks the CDSC to open applications for 3 teams and 2 judges at the KCL Women's Open.

Changes to the composition of this Committee

Any Other Business

The CDSC closes the meeting of DSC at 18:52

Signed,

Chaitanya Kediya

Standing Committee

Exeter College