

DEBATE - 2

MOTION: THBT the Government should give full funding to STEM Degrees.

Chair: Sara Singh Dube
Secretary: Chaitanya Kediya
Time:
Start Time: 7:45pm
End Time: 8:14pm

PROPOSITION

Brian Wong, 088339

Limited budget not an arg against spending money

- Public good to fund education
- STEM degree public good
 - ↳ better products + innovation
 - ↳ better leaders
 - ↳ start-ups

— x — x —

Brian Wong, 088339

Not about funding both STEM and non-STEM.

Market funding for STEM is low

- ↳ Unpredictability of the field

fetishisation of non-STEM

- ↳ STEM suffers from collective action problem

— x — x —

Matthew C Grant, 092449

Banking is too lucrative, even for STEM students

Nobody seeks STEM professions after non-STEM education.

OPPOSITION

Amber G Seward, 091538

Need for balance b/w STEM + non-STEM

- ↳ Can't explore your interests

↳ Knowledge of politics + economics is vital

Oxford is good at integrating STEM and non-STEM

— x — x —

Max Parr-Reid, 087482

Can't sell STEM, w/o E&M

— x — x —

Aastha Tyagi, 808625

Where does the money come from:

↳ opp cost of STEM funding

STEM students doesn't necessarily translate to Scientists.

— x — x —

(*) Sariyed A Sadiq, 095069

Non-STEM is equally imp for the human side of life and society.

Intangible advancement achieved through non-STEM + Arts degrees

Daniel A Villar, 093835
STEM students don't enjoy life

↳ Have too many contact hours

Kenneth Chung, 094704

Tuition fees are a barrier to entry for the most disadvantaged people.

↳ Opening doors to the most talented, rather than the most privilege.

David Saveliev, 808495

Purpose of govt. to protect people from death

↳ Climate Change is a problem that requires scientists

Charles Hewis, 087596

Removing tuition for STEM

↳ STEM students earn more
↳ Don't need an exemption from grad tax

Anagh S Agrawal, 094508

STEM majors can't convince the world → No persuasion power

Too much control over unis with govt.

↳ Defeats the ability to critique the govt.

STEM isn't the only beneficial subject

Patrick Gwillim-Thomas, 095478

Process of choice-making of degree

↳ Need to maximise what a person wanted to achieve.

Noes have it

Okediyal

(CHAITANYA KEDYAL)

Secretary's Committee
Exeter College

The science cannot answer
our biggest questions

1. coming 2nd, university college
so secondary like.

- what are the biggest questions?
• conception of the world
• Justice
• spiritual questions

4 - Who am I?

- A derivation of your own
philosophical thought, not
by science

- Philosophy is irreplaceable
in answering our biggest
questions

- Moral questions are not absolute
and vary across cultures, an
empirical evidence cannot
provide moral answers

- Personal moral logic may not
apply to everyone

- Science cannot provide moral
answers

- Science cannot tell us how
our society works or will
work

- Humanistic historical studies
cannot be replaced by science
in studies of culture

- Question of existence of a
deity is beyond the powers
of science

- Religion or atheism is a ~~proof~~
belief which cannot be
proved
~~somehow~~

2. ~~philosophy~~

- To answer questions we must use scientific
the scientific method

- scientific method is hypothesis testing

- Copernicus in 1542 from observation
the sun is at the centre of the planetary system

- conclusions must be drawn from facts, not
just a gut

- Morality, religion etc. are NOT our biggest
questions - the world is moved forward
through data

- "What is life?", "What is consciousness?"
that we haven't answered & yet doesn't
mean we never will

• Life is about growth, which is to do
with cell division etc.

• Life is physics

- Global warming, disease, inequality
more important than morality

- Modern wars are fuelled by fossil fuel
inequality

• Fracking has decreased wars

- Science is only way to answer the truly
biggest questions

3. Dr. Arthur
Alexander

- science used to refer to one body of knowledge
incl. philosophy

- science only became professionalised in
the 19th century

- ~~no other language~~

- Answer depends on what biggest questions
are

- "Who do you want life partner to be?"
• scientific analysis probably can't descend
to love

Science cannot
answer our
biggest questions

- "What is a
science
but not

4. Prof

- Theological
illumination

- Important
'Sake' and

- Theological
questions

- e.g. 'What
is there?

exists

- Idea of
tool of

- Holy book
rewrites

- The idea of
too many
this is different

- Question
from observation

- What are
there are

1. Origin

2. Existence

- Religion

- Science
is getting

- Only person
never be on

- Ethics can
by biology

- Religion
not answers

science (and give technical terms of moral questions, but not moral values)

"What is meaning of life?"

science is great at answering 'how', but not 'why'

48

4. Prof. Atkins

Theologians obfuscate, scientists illuminate

Important to distinguish between 'fake' and 'real' questions

Theologians think of many fake questions

What is purpose of universe?

e.g. There's no proof that a purpose exists

Idea of after life is a great tool of crowd control

Holy books are full of fake news

Theists claim human brain is too puny to understand God, and this is disgraceful

Questions of science spring from observation

What are the big questions?
There are only 2

1. Origin of universe etc

2. Existence of consciousness

Religion claims answers to these

Science has not answered, but is getting close

Only pessimists think they will never be answered

Ethics can be ~~not~~ understood by biology and psychology

Religion provides comfort but not answers

Floor speeches

1. Patrick Gwillim - Thomas, Queens
095478

- Concedes some of Prof's big questions may not be based in evidence, but they are still big questions

2. Charles Harris, New, 087596

- A lot of big questions are not real questions

"What makes me unique?" nothing

"There is no answer" is a valid answer

3. Saïyed Saïyid, LCH, 095069

- OAH has tried to sweep big questions under rug

- Asks for show of hands on animal testing

- Big questions that cannot be answered by science are important

4. Cassandra Sullivan, Linacre, SBS

- To discuss moral questions requires scientific backbone

5. Lois Heslop, LMH, 094880

- Not only wrong but dangerous to think science has all the answers

~~image of~~ ~~serious possibility~~

- Rationality differentiates us from A2

- If we trust only science, we start to think like machines

6. ~~Alan~~ Brian Wong, Pembroke, 088339

- All doctrs are variations of science

- we may not follow observational science for morals, but we use scientific method to question our intuitions

5. Prof. Swinburne

- Great theories are greatest intellectual achievements of man
- Questions of disease, inequality etc. are moral questions
- Moral questions cannot be answered by science
- Different moral principles lead to different answers
- Moral principles can be chosen based on other consequences of them
- Culture has progressed in its morality
- Scientists are looking for a theory of everything
- A law of nature needs to apply to every object in the universe
- Causal explanations need to not be scientific e.g. personal questions and explanations
- Scientists cannot provide explanations of why laws of nature are uniform
- Science cannot answer questions of personal identity

6. Prof. Frank Tipler

- Science can and has answered biggest questions?
- Does god exist?
God is supernatural being that created universe
- This definition means God is the cosmological singularity

Do we have free will?

- Only way we can be certain of our ability to choose is that we do make those choices
- The only way we know is this, this is the parallel world's exist, and evidence shows this is true
- Is there life after death?
- In future, computers will emulate us so yes
- Why is there something rather than nothing?
Because singularity created us
- What is purpose of universe?
To get to its final purpose as described in my book
- Purpose of individuals? To give rise to successors
- Purpose of human race? To get to species beyond humans
- AI will succeed us
- A question of morals?
- Science can give us ethics; science has its own rules that imply not lying, nonviolence etc.

Nick Brown, Magdalen Secretary

MMW

After Debate - Week 2, MT 2018

Chair: James Lamming, Treasurer

Secretary: Chaitanya Kediyal

Start time: 10:19 pm

End time:

Proposition

Genevieve Athis, ~~092030~~ 087631
Watched a film

— x — x —

Nick Leah, 092030

Science Doesn't tell you how to use
scientific knowledge

— x — x —

Dani Villar, 093835

Metaphysical assumptions of
different scientific field are
not consistent.

— x — x —

Mahi Joshi, 091834

Brain is irrational

— x — x —

Caleb Short, 808704

Pursuit of Science doesn't
make us human

↳ what do we do
with answers of
the biggest questions

— x — x —
Rebecca Collins, 091794

Other fields (phil + theo) matter

— x — x —
Ebenezer Azamati, (2368048)
↳ BOD CARD

Position of Arrogance

Opposition

Hugh Bellamy, 091973, LMH

Loves God

— x — x —
Conrad YC Chan, 095850

Sociological science is
a science

Marx is the real Scientist.

— x — x —
Devang Sengal, 095814

Science can change
questions posed to
Society

— x — x —

Tamara Lloyd, 095416

Previous speaker is
wrong

Chaitanya
Chaitanya Kediyal
Exeter College
Secretary's Committee

AYES

1	10	150
2	20	160
3	30	170
4	40	180
5	50	190
6	60	200
7	70	210
8	80	220
9	90	230
10	100	240
11	110	250
12	120	260
13	130	270
14	140	280

x

use facts

thesis testing

observation, suggest
the planetary

from facts, or not

are NOT our biggest
moved forward

consciousness?
red Qs yet doesn't
U
th, which is to do
etc.

T.H.B. Science Along Can We Answer Debate
Our Biggest Questions

2nd MT 20.18 (P.T.O.)

Olivia Raiton Teller

rose, inequality
morality

- Modern wars are fuelled by fossil fuel
inequality

not answer

ions

iversity colleges

ee.

ggest questions
the world

stions

your own
thought, not

irreplaceable

ur biggest

are not abso

ss cultures, a

idence conro

answers

logic may not

at provide moral

stions

University College
Oke.

biggest question
of the world

questions

on of your own
cal thought,

is in place
g our bigger

tions are not ab
cross cultures
evidence con
oral answers

ral logic may not
everyone

not provide moral

10	✓	150	✓
20	✓	160	✓
30	✓	170	✓
40	✓	180	✓
50	✓	190	18
60	✓	200	146
70	✓	210	
80	✓	220	
90	✓	230	
100	✓	240	
110	✓	250	
120	✓	260	
130	✓	270	
140	✓	280	

IHB Science Alone Can Never Answer Debate
our biggest questions
2nd MT 20.18 (P.T.O.)

Teller

e must use facts

pothesis testing

n observation, suggest
of the planetary system

rown from facts, or not

tc. are NOT our biggest
is moved forward

at is consciousness?
rvered Qs yet doesn't
r will

rowth, which is to do
ion etc.

disease, inequality
than morality

- modern wars are fuelled by fossil fuel
inequality