

Michaelmas Debate - Week 1

Motion: THS: A Second Referendum on the final Brexit deal

Emergency Debate

Chair: Becky Collins
Secretary: Olivia Railton
Start Time: 7:35pm
End Time: 8:15pm

Proposition

Brian Wong, 088339

- The original referendum happened at a time when ^{no one knew} what Brexit would look like
- Shifting nature of economics/politics
- more constructive solution/understanding amongst the masses of Brexit if we have a second
- The best democracy is one that takes every chance possible to hear the voices of the people

Sulamann Rahim, 091418

- Doesn't matter if the referenda are legally binding → people think they are so they care
 - ↳ if we want any clout with British population we need a referenda to show "leavers" that
- Cambridge Analytica - so many lies in Brexit campaign

Adam Ellison, 093836

- The goal of the West is, (and has been for a long time) peace
 - ↳ the E.U. is one of the few institutions that has tangibly made things more peaceful
- Think of the impacts on Ireland
 - ↳ most people that voted leave probably didn't think about the effect Brexit would have on Ireland
 - ↳ we don't want the Troubles again

Opposition

George Penny, 087453

- Brexit is Britain's greatest self-harm
- referenda are fundamentally not British
 - ↳ Re-election is what we need → referendum does very little

Brian Wong, 088339

- contracts are contracts
 - ↳ who cares if I change my mind? I should be bound to my initial vote
- "Not a real opp speech"
 - ↳ but just trying to illustrate the best case scenario for Opp

Jonah Kaplan, 091133

- The people voted leave
 - ↳ the ~~only~~ people that are arguing prop. are those that do not want Brexit
 - ↳ they don't believe in the importance of referendum (alternative intention)
 - ↳ they would insult the intelligence of those that voted leave

Cheng Kai Xie, 094584

- UK is in the midst of constitutional crisis
- Second referendum wouldn't change anything
 - ↳ would waste time and money

Tinashe Chandanka, 208282 (Best speaker)

- Brexit means Brexit
 - ↳ the vote was leave
- E.U. is not democratic
 - ↳ for our Britain, we can do this alone

in Lloyd, 086
ach politicians
iticians lied
e need to m
ney can vote

Alexander

- There w
↳ Brexit
↳ man
(C
motion i
↳ it's ab
↳ shou
what

Felix Bu

- You need
their vo
↳ a sec
really

Sulamann

- The first
modern
↳ The
illegal
• if we c
another

Dennis

- Referend
↳ in democ
↳ not a
care
• a lot ha
changed

Prop.

Wlogel, 086928

politicians lie, except the way in which pro-Brexit politicians lied was outrageous
 we need to make people aware of the truth so that they can vote again in an informed matter
 //

Alexander Walls, 093724

There wasn't really a binary choice
 ↳ Brexit is not just EU or nothing
 ↳ many people support alternate Brexit deals (Canada +, Norway-esque deal, etc.)
 motion is not about a second referendum
 it's about the final Brexit deal
 ↳ should give people the chance to voice what sort of deal they want
 //

Felix Bunting, 084870

You need people in a democracy to feel that their voices matter
 ↳ a second referendum just shows that we really care about everyone's voices being heard
 //

Sulman Rahim, 091418

The first referendum was fundamentally undemocratic
 ↳ The leave campaign cheated → unfair and illegal tactics to spread propaganda
 • if we care about democracy at all, we need another
 //

Dennis West, 086392

Referenda are great
 ↳ in democracy we must trust the people
 ↳ not all people are idiots, and we should care about what they think
 • a lot has changed, many people have changed their minds.

Hugh

By h
 sugges
 bound
 • Since
 treats
 makes
 should

Fergus

Refer
 ↳ sho
 one

Noes

Rina

Olivia

276 AYES

10		150	
20		160	
30		170	
40		180	
50		190	
60		200	
70		210	
80		220	
90		230	
100		240	
110		250	
120		260	
130		270	
140		280	

TH (via.com) John is her. 2018 Debate

1st Week A.T. 2018 (P.T.O.)

James Jones Teller

"The has no confidence in HM Government"

1. Aisha Faruk, The Queen's College

Opportunity to hold gov. to account
for its failures

- Not Labour vs Conservative
- we should have no confidence about gov. ability to lead us through Brexit
- May's leadership is weak, turning to OT, TR-M etc.
- May has ruined Darling Queen's introductions
- Cameron's referendum puts UK in biggest constitutional crisis in decades
- DUP now threatening to bring down Gov.
- Gov. not taking care of Ireland problem
- Gov. fails to heal divides from '16 referendum
- Gov. should be condemned for treatment of homeless, disabled, benefits slashed
- World mental health day today, gov. fails to address this
- Gov. should provide stable council housing
- Environment policy disastrous
- Those aiming for refugee status face horrible trials, locked in migrant detention centre
- Windrush scandal, gov. deports citizens; institutional racism in gov.

2. Daniel Lanning, Treasurer

- Motion is about Tory vs Labour
- Prop. must propose viable alternative
- Next 5 years crucial to future of UK
- Civil discourse in the UK has worsened
- Gov. has not shielded away from Tory Blair's tough decisions
- UK is a nation of freedom and opportunity
- Labour has Brexit indecision
- Unemployment lowest since 70s
- Extra £20 billion promised for NHS
- Can't do Welsh accent
- Labour is making impossible promises
- Nation should work for everyone who works hard
- Conservatives are broad church not like Labour
- Choice between sage and pragmatic or divided, unrealistic opposition

3. Nia Griffiths MP

- Confidence & trust
- Gov. approach to Brexit is disaster
- Gov. has chosen to harangue and threaten EU partners
- UK diplomats not good - Hunt Comfort EU to USSR
- No surprise that there is no Brexit plan - Tories cannot agree amongst themselves
- No deal Brexit would be catastrophic and poorest in society would pay highest price
- Tories introduce transport compliance app rather than fix transport
- Labour has serious plan for getting people on housing ladder
- Tories have cut defence budget
- Labour wants to scrap tuition fees
- Gov. has run out of steam
- Gov. sailing on ideas on injustice and Brexit

4. Sam

- + can must
- Labour
- Bernie stop w source
- PM is + integrat
- Jeremy our i
- You w Mr w
- of
- Labour racist
- Corbyn or
- the Conserv books rected
- are
- If you vote C

Floor

1. Adam 0938

- Boo at a
- Bri
- has snoopers wide abiliti

2. Koso

- Labour Brexit re
- 3. Fran B
- Not just be about
- Labour change

4. Sam Gyimah, MP, Ex-President of the
 - campaigned for Remain, but we must respect democracy
 - Labour has no Brexit policy
 - Farmer is not impartial - we should stop quoting him as authoritative source
 - PM is trying to preserve territorial integrity of UK
 - Jeremy Corbyn is an enemy of our institutions
 - You would never get a Conservative MP who needs police protection
 - of disagreement with leader
 - Labour described as institutionally racist by its own MPs
 - Corbyn endangers national security
 - Conservatives did not balance books on the back of the poor - richest pay 45% of UK income tax
 - If you want meritocracy, vote Conservative

Floor speeders

1. Adam Ellison, Magdalen 093836
 - Books haven't been balanced at all
 - Britain's democracy rating has recently decreased
 - snoopers charter gives gov wide-reaching security abilities
2. Koso Braithwaite, Christ Church
 - Labour is seeking to undermine Brexit negotiations
3. Fran Best, Wadham 091417
 - Not just about Brexit should be about NHS
 - Labour will bring a lot of change, some will be bad

4. Eric Sukumaran, ex-Standing Committee
 - There is common ground between sides
 - We should respect the will of the referendum
 - People's vote is for right sort of people
 - Conservatives will get a deal
5. Sulamman Rahim, Wadham 091410
 - No confidence is not confidence in Labour
 - Focusing on Brexit ignores Tory record
6. Benedict Bunting, Keble 094956
 - Leaving the EU is a new start for Britain
 - People's pathways point to facts on the economy

5. Richard Burgon MP
 - PIP: Stopping made by my constituent cry, Tories should be ashamed
 - Asylum seeker who left left is linked to see me
 - Many who can't get a council house
 - Whole government enterprise is lie
 - Just as Nye Bevan said, goal of Conservatives is to persuade majority to vote in interests of minority
 - Tories say they're 'on our side' - actually on side of 1%
 - Tories boast of law and order - have attacked legal aid and created chaos in prisons
 - Tories commence 'Americanisation' of our justice system
 - PM pretends austerity is over
 - Income inequality is more like US than rest of Europe
 - Wages are growing at worst rates since Napoleonic times
 - Tories are stripping down of NHS
 - Gyimah PPT about NHS
 - Strange for Tories to celebrate NHS when they opposed its creation

6. Pardon Lewis MP

- no all taking country into new future
- Tories created 1000 jobs a day since 2010
- Labour took 3 different Brexit positions at conference
- we should be proud of NHS and should maintain great point of delivery healthcare
- Lowest level of house building inherited in 2010
- Labour overspent '97-'10
- our education policies mean people have well-funded choices for their own government

After Debate - Week 1, MT18

Chair:

Secretary: Olivia

Chair: The President

- Mr. Williams withdraws 1st motion
- President says new motion has status 2 terms until referendum

1. Mr. Williams

- I ignited debate, progressed region
- open campaigning has been a fantastic success
- candidates are used for their private vote
- Union should be transparent
- we believe in this Union
- some suggest
- members are tired of snakes and betrayal

2. Eric Subraman 090888

- New tradition in socialism to try and fail things until they work
- Doesn't get rid of parts, just makes harder

- People invaded privacy for this election
- POT - previous time had no open campaign
- Don't try and campaign against nature

3. Sol 9-P 091593

- Speaking only for this motion, not for or against states
- confident about my position about so willing to go to referendum
- Union has preserved backbone for long

- Vote in side

4. ENS

- Debating

- It is a

- I got

network

- I got

asked

- How many

had

• Mr. Williams

question

Ages: 5

Chairman: Kedi

no confidence

- vote in favour, whichever
side you're on - this is about
the trial

4. E.Ns. Nicky Gyimah, Ex-President

- Debating same argument (L.M.H.)
as '98

- It is a bad idea

- I got in despite 'old boys
network'

- I got involved because I just
asked

- How many small colleges have
had presidents without slates?

• Mr. Williams moves that the
question be put

Ages: 57 Nov: 15

Christina Kediya, 091298

no confidence bc NHTS lol

276 **AYES**

10	 	150	
20	 	160	
30	 	170	
40	 	180	
50	 	190	
60	 	200	
70	 	210	
80	 	220	
90	 	230	
100	 	240	
110	 	250	
120	 	260	
130	 	270	
140	 	280	

TH TH (100 to 200) online in her Majesty's 1st Debate

1st Week MT 20/8... (P.T.O.)

James James Teller

which pro-Brexit
truth so that
matter

choice
nothing
ate Brexit deals
(etc.)
referendum

chance to voice
want

to feel that

shows that we
ices being heard

fundamentally
→ unfair and
poganda
+ all, we need

Hugh

• By h
sugges
bund
• Since
treats
makes
should

Fergus

• Refer
↳ sh
ont

Noes

Olivia

4. At the conclusion of the debate the
Teller's procedure will be as follows:—
this way, as the case may be.
The motion is carried, if necessary, by saying
from time to time: "Aye this way," or "Noes
this way," or "Noes this way."

20	IF IF	160	IF IF
30	IF IF	170	IF IF
40	IF IF	180	IF IF
50	IF IF	190	IF
60	IF IF	200	
70	IF IF	210	
80	IF IF	220	
90	IF IF	230	
100	IF IF	240	
110	IF IF	250	
120	IF IF	260	
130	IF IF	270	
140	IF IF	280	

TH has no confidence in her majesty's govt. Debate
1st Week MT 2016 (P.T.O.)
Shuning Zhao Teller

of
ly as
if the
to the
ning side
y will bow
y. They will
stand facing
e figures have