

The Ratified Minutes of
THE ORDINARY MEETING OF THE STANDING COMMITTEE
3rd Week Michaelmas Term 2017
Monday 23 October 2017
President's Office, 16:00

Present: **The President** (Mr Chris Zabilowicz, *Worcester College*), **The President-Elect** (Ms Laali Vadlamani, *Trinity College*), **The Librarian** (Ms Melissa Hinkley, *Keble College*), **The Librarian-Elect** (Ms Sabriyah Saeed, *Somerville College*), **The Treasurer** (Mr Gui Cavalcanti, *Pembroke College*), **The Treasurer-Elect** (Mr Stephen Horvath, *New College*), **The Secretary** (Mr Ed Evans, *St John's College*), **The Elected Member** (Mr Brian Wong, *Pembroke College*), **The Elected Member** (Ms Shivani Ananth, *St Anne's College*), **The Elected Member** (Mr Julian Kirk, *Magdalen College*), **The Elected Member** (Mr Jan Bialas, *Magdalen College*), **The Elected Member** (Mr Kaleem Hawa, *Lincoln College*), **The Elected Member** (Ms Grace Joel, *Balliol College*), **The Bursar** (Ms Lindsay Warne), **The Senior Librarian** (Mr Sean Power, *Oriel College*), **The Senior Treasurer** (Mr Stephen Dixon, *Downing College, Cambridge*), **The CDSC** (Mr Andrew Seow, *Lincoln College*), **The Returning Officer** (Mr Neb Jovanovic, *St Peter's College*).

Attending:

Mr Greg Ritchie (**Ordinary Member**, *Wadham College*), Mr Michael Harkness (**DRO**, *Magdalen College*).

Apologies:

The Elected Member (Mr James Lamming, *Exeter College*).

Absent:

The President opens the meeting at 16:08

The President asks members of the press to identify themselves – Mr Greg Ritchie and Ms Shivani Ananth do so.

Requests to Pass Absences from Previous Meeting

The President moves that the Librarian-Elect's absence from the Ordinary meeting of TSC in 2nd week be passed with good reason due to an infectious or disabling illness.

Nem. con.

Matters Arising from Previous Minutes

The President moves to ratify the minutes from the Ordinary meeting of TSC in 2nd week.

Nem. con.

The President

Meetings missed: 0, Missed without good reason: 0

Business of the President:

The President has no business.

Questions to the President:

There are no questions to the President.

The Librarian

Meetings missed: 0, Missed without good reason: 0

Business of the Librarian:

The Librarian has no business.

Questions to the Librarian:

There are no questions to the Librarian.

The Treasurer

Meetings missed: 0, Missed without good reason: 0

Business of the Treasurer:

The Treasurer moves that TSC approve DSC expenses of £2,080.96, as recommended by the Finance Committee.

The Treasurer notes that these figures have been approved by the Bursar.

Seconded by the President.

Nem. con.

Questions to the Treasurer:

There are no questions to the Treasurer.

The Secretary

Meetings missed: 0, Missed without good reason: 0

Business of the Secretary:

The Secretary has no business.

Questions to the Secretary:

There are no questions to the Secretary.

Mr Lamming

Meetings missed: 1, Missed without good reason: 0

Business of Mr Lamming:

Mr Lamming has no business.

Questions to Mr Lamming:

There are no questions to Mr Lamming.

Mr Wong

Meetings missed: 0, Missed without good reason: 0

Business of Wong

Mr Wong has no business.

Questions to Mr Wong:

There are no questions to Mr Wong.

Ms Ananth

Meetings missed: 0, Missed without good reason: 0

Ms Ananth has no business.

Questions to Ms Ananth:

There are no questions to Ms Ananth.

Mr Julian Kirk

Meetings missed: 0, Missed without good reason: 0

Business of Mr Kirk:

Mr Kirk has no business.

Questions to Mr Kirk:

There are no questions to Mr Kirk.

Mr Jan Bialas

Meetings missed: 0, Missed without good reason: 0

Business of Mr Bialas:

Mr Bialas has no business.

Questions to Mr Bialas:

There are no questions to Mr Bialas.

Mr Kaleem Hawa

Meetings missed: 0, Missed without good reason: 0

Business of Mr Hawa:

Mr Hawa has no business.

Questions to Mr Hawa:

There are no questions to Mr Hawa.

Ms Grace Joel

Meetings missed: 1, Missed without good reason: 1

Business of Ms Joel:

Ms Joel has no business.

Questions to Ms Joel:

There are no questions to Ms Joel.

The President-Elect

Meetings missed: 0, Missed without good reason: 0

Business of the President-Elect:

The President-Elect talks TSC through elements of the membership drive. Some new things were done this year. The Union's branding was reworked with help from Mr Jan Bialas, with new banners, posters, graphics, and a Facebook cover photo. As well as the usual shot glasses and keyrings, bike seat covers were used to advertise the Union this year. The President-Elect notes that the posters were not distributed as well as they could have been – they could have been displayed in more places than they in fact were, and there are accordingly many left over. Two videos were filmed for the membership drive – one with aerial footage, and the other an infographic breaking down the cost of joining. The President-Elect asks for the responses of the members of TSC to the infographic.

The President says that he was told that people appreciated its transparency, and said that it was easy to follow. He congratulates the President-Elect on a successful membership drive.

The President-Elect suggests the video can be reused with suitably amended costs in future years. She notes additionally that welcome drinks events were quite well-attended, but there were many who acquired tickets and failed to arrive on the night, although this was offset to some extent by the fact that there were many who looked to gain entry on the door. She notes that this was the result of clashes with timetables produced by the Colleges for their freshers' weeks after the events had been scheduled.

The Bursar points out that this happens often – if people do not pay for tickets (though she does not suggest that people should, in fact, be charged), they have no incentive actually to attend the event. Even if tickets are charged at a small price people are more inclined to make use of their ticket.

The President-Elect suggests that the date of the events should be finalised later than at present, once College timetables are available so those that want to turn up can make plans in advance.

The President suggests that the issue could be resolved with more places available on the door, so that those that do not turn up can have their tickets reallocated.

The Bursar suggests that it should be specified that the ticket will be reallocated at a certain point, if the holder does not arrive by that time.

The President-Elect says this will be taken into account for next year. She adds that she is still waiting for the Union's Snapchat filter to be put into effect.

Mr Jan Bialas replies that Snapchat did not approve the filter, and thinks this is the result of the logo being used – he adds that he will amend the filter and the logo.

The Treasurer-Elect says that Snapchat approves logos for educational institutions.

Mr Jan Bialas replies that he submitted the filter under the category of 'educational', but it was not approved.

Mr Julian Kirk suggests this is because the Union is not an educational charity.

The Treasurer-Elect points out that the Union is an institution dedicated to the education of its members. He notes that US Universities, themselves not charities, can get these filters with logos.

The President agrees, and adds that the purpose of events is to ensure that speakers can be challenged by members, as well as the preservation of freedoms of expression.

The Treasurer-Elect suggests that the filter be resubmitted with a note that the Society's first substantive rule, rule 2A, describes the purpose of the Union as being for the advancement of the education of its members.

Mr Jan Bialas points out that in the guidelines for submission on educational grounds, Snapchat specifies that the institution in question must be a school or educational institution, and there is a fine line here.

The President-Elect says that it will be possible to get around this problem.

Mr Michael Harkness adds that often when companies check data of this sort, they simply go through the list of charities that categorise themselves as 'educational' when registering. Because the Society is not an institution like a school, this is perhaps the problem.

The President-Elect says that this should be investigated, but hopefully the filter will be up and running by the end of term. She congratulates the Committee for their help in the membership drive and for their first fortnight of work.

The President moves that the President-Elect be formally congratulated and thanked for her hard work over the membership drive.

Nem. con.

The Bursar says that she will keep the unused posters safe for next year.

Questions to the President-Elect:

There are no questions to the President-Elect.

The Librarian-Elect

Meetings missed: 1, Missed without good reason: 1

Business of the Librarian-Elect:

The Librarian-Elect has no business.

Questions to the Librarian-Elect:

There are no questions to the Librarian-Elect.

The Treasurer-Elect

Meetings missed: 0, Missed without good reason: 0

Business of the Treasurer-Elect:

The Treasurer-Elect reminds TSC that he was mandated to look into the process of signing down by committee members for their vacation days. He is not looking to challenge the rules about quantifying vacation days.

The Treasurer-Elect talks TSC through his proposed changes. He refers to a 'portfolio' of work to show that it is not only invitations that are required to gain a vacation day, but that there are other elements of Society work that are important. His changes also take into account the quality of the work. He argues that this point is already employed informally, but for in the interests of thoroughness it is worth putting in the rules.

He looks to record what Officer each committee member is assisting, to make clear on what that member is working. He adds that this is beneficial for scrutiny from ordinary members. His changes also mean a vacation day would be logged each day, and not retrospectively – this gives committee members confidence that their work will be recorded accurately.

He suggests that any member of committee may request in writing the number of vacation days with which they have been credited – some members of committee have mentioned to him that they believe they have done a certain amount, but that this figure has often been discounted for various reasons. This discrepancy of information can lead to problems with fines and election manifestos. Knowing if one's work has been credited is concerned with fairness and allowing committee members to plan for their vacation days appropriately.

He proposes that the sign-down sheet be made available to the Returning Officer – he argues the RO should be able to see the figures before their ratification at 0th week TSC, so that they may check the figures have not been decided arbitrarily, or may identify other problems.

He adds that the text of the rules was made gender neutral several years ago, and accordingly he has amended a 'his' in the text which escaped detection.

He argues that absentee vacation days are not relevant, but that his system is about how vacation days are recorded.

The President suggests that 'as soon as possible' is vague wording.

The Treasurer-Elect points out that if the recording is digital, it can be seen immediately by the RO.

The President argues that this is already covered in the detail that allows the RO to see the sheet.

The Treasurer-Elect argues that it is made clear that there should be a public record viewable by the RO.

The President suggests the rules should go further, so that continual access is granted to the RO throughout the vacation.

The Treasurer-Elect thinks 'as soon as possible' is sufficiently strong wording. As soon as possible is meant to mean as soon as the list is created. But it additionally allows alternatives – if, for example, the sheet is recorded on paper, rather than digitally.

Mr Julian Kirk suggests that if the President is not in the office, it is reasonable that a deputy should be appointed by them to assess committee members' work.

The Treasurer-Elect thinks this is covered by the specification that a vacation day can be credited by the Officer supervising a committee member's work.

Mr Julian Kirk suggests this be made more explicit.

The Treasurer-Elect agrees that this is possible. He suggests his proposed change to B15.a.ii. be amended to 'assigned to them by the President, a Junior Officer, or a deputy appointed by the President'.

Mr Julian Kirk argues that in the interest of fairness, there is required a provision whereby a committee member can challenge a decision.

The Treasurer-Elect argues that if this amendment is made, and the President seems to be doing something misleading, it is possible to object at the point of ratification in 0th week TSC.

Mr Julian Kirk argues that it is difficult for committee members to notice these instances or for the RO necessarily to identify them, and thinks the record should be available to committee at all times.

The Treasurer-Elect argues that this is covered by the option for any committee member to request figures in writing.

Mr Julian Kirk agrees in principle, and notes that the process is difficult to formalise, so suggests that until there is a proposal to formalise it, he would be hesitant to pass the new rule.

Mr Michael Harkness argues that vacation days are relevant mostly in manifestos, so if it is evident that Officers are responsible for manipulating figures to impact elections, they are liable under Rule 33.

Mr Julian Kirk points out that it is conceivable the individual judging vacation days has another motivation, which would prevent it falling under rule 33.

The Treasurer argues that since totals are discussed in 0th week TSC, TSC can overrule the President by a majority vote, so the individual complaining can challenge their total in 0th week and present the work that they have done on a specific day.

Mr Julian Kirk says that, in that case, perhaps it should be insisted that in the record of vacation days there should be a sentence justifying their decision from the individual assessing the work on why this number has been chosen.

The Treasurer-Elect argues it is possible to provide arbitrary reasons.

The President adds this generates a great deal of work for the President, which is time that could be better used in other ways.

Mr Julian Kirk suggests this work be deputised, hence his earlier suggestion.

The Treasurer replies that it is easy to produce evidence retrospectively to TSC, for a discussion and a vote.

The Treasurer-Elect adds that the individual could show phone records and emails, and it is possible to see who is in the office from the security cameras and expenses submissions.

Mr Julian Kirk replies that if the individual is using the Union phone, there are no personalised records.

The Librarian proposes that committee members themselves suggest what amount of work they have completed, on a document shared with the Officers.

The President-Elect suggests this is already done through the database, Civi, since debate and individual speaker invitations are logged on this database. Partnership and sponsorship work is carried out in close collaboration with the Treasurer, so they are aware of how much has been done. Similarly, the Secretary works closely with committee members on socials.

The Treasurer-Elect points out that he has seen occasions where people have been untruthful about the amount of work they have completed, and so the discretion of the President is important.

The Librarian disagrees with the Treasurer-Elect about untruthful committee members. She argues that most people do good work on their vacation days. On the portfolios of work, if the individuals are inclined to dispute numbers, it is useful to have them record themselves along the way how many days they think they have completed.

The President thinks committee members should not be compelled to list their own vacation days, and that they should be able to trust the Officers.

The President-Elect points out that it is their choice if they want to log work on Civi or back this up with further records – they are able to do more if they so desire.

Mr Julian Kirk suggests committee members provide a rough summary of what they have done, and get the approval of the officers. This saves their supervisors time in checking through their work, and so might be useful to have Committee do it.

The Treasurer-Elect argues that this may be useful for certain things, such as organising a social, but mostly the information is available on Civi.

Mr Julian Kirk replies that it may be there, but it is not necessarily easy to digest. To work out if an invitation is a good one, for example, it is required to look at phone numbers and email addresses used.

The Librarian points out that in the past, there has been a spreadsheet based on information logged in Civi.

The President-Elect points out that Civi itself already provides this system.

The Librarian agrees, but adds that it is a process of formalisation being discussed.

The Treasurer-Elect notes that Civi is currently not being updated as well as it should be – for example, a committee member will log that they have sent an email but not the contact details used, despite the President emphasising the importance of logging all information.

Mr Julian Kirk suggests there is no harm in having this in the rules. Being reliant on good practice results in eventual decline, and it requires a great deal of effort from Officers to make sure that it is done if it is not formalised in the rules, which wastes time. If it is in the rules, committee are incentivised to do it themselves.

The President-Elect agrees, but says the issue is that a system is being proposed in which each committee member submits work that they claim to have done through emails. Currently, she herself uses Civi to see a committee member's name and the number of invitations sent. Cross-referencing of emails sent and invitations logged is done anyway, in case a committee member forgot to record an invitation, for example.

The President adds that it will always be necessary to check, in case of human error or intentional deception, such as logging three invitations for the same speaker.

The Treasurer-Elect suggests a compromise, that he should add that a committee member should provide a report on their work if or when it is requested. This would mean the availability of written records.

The President points out that this helps for Officers as well, since it is often difficult to keep track of Officers' vacation days since they are often doing work that is not invitations based.

The Treasurer-Elect proposes as a friendly amendment that there should be added ‘a committee member should submit a written report if and when requested’.

Mr Julian Kirk suggests it be made explicit that the totals can be challenged in 0th week TSC. He notes, however, that the committee member might not attend TSC meetings.

The President notes that anyone can seek a representative from TSC.

Mr Julian Kirk suggests that the amendment to Standing Order B15 should include, ‘where it may be challenged by any committee member’.

The Treasurer-Elect notes this would give speaking rights at TSC to members of the Secretary’s Committee.

The President suggests this could be granted on a case by case basis.

The Returning Officer agrees that this is possible.

Mr Jan Bialas leaves the room at 16:40.

The Treasurer-Elect argues that it is reasonable to give speaking rights at TSC to members of the Secretary’s Committee. He asks whether this would enable each committee member to challenge their own vacation day totals, or those of others as well.

The President argues it should only be their own.

The Librarian argues it should be their own or their own by proxy.

The President agrees.

Mr Julian Kirk agrees that there is nothing wrong with challenging by proxy.

The Treasurer-Elect moves that Standing Order B15 be changed as follows, with several further amendments.

B15: VACATION DAYS [amendments underlined and in red]

. (a) A vacation day shall count:

- . (i) When a committee member has completed a period [deleted: ‘as a period’] of at least eight hours work within a 24 hour period, or two periods of four hours.
- . (ii) Where the work of the committee member on the portfolio assigned to them by the President, a Junior Officer they are assisting, or a deputy appointed by the President, is of a satisfactory quality and quantity in the eyes of both the President and the committee member’s immediate supervisor.

. (b) During the vacation the President shall keep either a physical or a digital [deleted: ‘a’] sign down sheet to record committee member’s vacation days, which shall record the time the committee member first entered and ultimately left the buildings, and which Officer they were assisting. The overall vacation day log shall be updated each day, and may not be determined retrospectively [deleted: ‘in the general office’]. A committee member should submit a written report on their work if and when requested.

. (c) It shall be the responsibility of individual committee members to make sure that they sign in with the President [deleted: 'down on the sheet'] upon entering and leaving the building. Any member of committee may request in writing that the President inform them of how many vacation days they have been credited with, and the President must respond within 24 hours.

. (d) The number of vacation days signed down by each committee member shall be passed in 0th week standing committee. The President shall provide the Returning Officer with full viewing access to the sign down sheet as early as possible, and no later than 24 hours preceding the meeting of 0th week standing committee, where it may be challenged by any committee member, either in person or by pre-appointed proxy.

. (e) Should any officer or committee member fail to complete their vacation day requirement, they shall automatically be fined £10 for every day they have failed to complete without good reason as considered by the President.

. (f) The President shall present a list of committee vacation days in the Presidential Debate and on the notice board for the first two weeks of term, as well as include them in their [deleted: 'his'] OPBM Report, in the following format –

“Following the passing of vacation reports, I am required to inform you of vacation day totals of committee members. You may wish to use this as a guide to the work carried out by committee members on your behalf, but should also consider the term card and specific events committee members are responsible for in making this judgement.

Committee member A carried out X Vacation days, out of a required Y; etc.”

Seconded by the President.

Nem. con.

Questions to the Treasurer-Elect:

There are no questions to the Treasurer-Elect.

The Ex-Officio

Business of the Ex-Officio:

The Ex-Officio have no business.

Questions to the Ex-Officio:

There are no questions to the Ex-Officio.

The Senior Librarian

Business of the Senior Librarian:

The Senior Librarian has no business.

Questions to the Senior Librarian:

There are no questions to the Senior Librarian.

The Senior Treasurer

Business of the Senior Treasurer:

The Senior Treasurer has no business.

Questions to the Senior Treasurer:

There are no questions to the Senior Treasurer.

The Bursar

Business of the Bursar:

The Bursar has no business.

Questions to the Bursar:

There are no questions to the Bursar.

The Returning Officer

Business of the RO:

Mr Michael Harkness says that conclave was held on Sunday evening, and Mr Neb Jovanovic was unanimously elected as his successor as Returning Officer. Their handover has been completed, and any issues are to be sent to Mr Jovanovic from now on.

He thanks everyone, and says that he is buoyed to see that, as this meeting shows, Committee is very much concerned with the rules, and that it should be possible to have such a long discussion about a Standing Order change. He says the term is going well and events are running smoothly, and this is down to the work of Committee. He thanks the Committee for keeping the society running and for their kindness.

The Returning Officer thanks Mr Harkness for all his help.

The Returning Officer moves that Mr Michael Harkness receive official thanks for his work as the Society's Returning Officer, over the last term.

Seconded by the President.

Nem. con.

The Returning Officer adds that there a couple of rules about which he would like to remind members of TSC. The first is rule 71.i.4, concerning disciplinary procedure. He reads the rule. He adds that the rules only allow him to state it, and emphasises that disciplinary procedure cannot be discussed in committees. He adds that any member of TSC has the right to address an SDC, for which the submission deadline is 8pm this Friday, and that this may be discussed with the RO in person, but not in committees. Additionally, he reminds TSC of rule 67.e.i. concerning disciplinary procedures. The RO distinguishes between rule 71 and rule 33, the latter of which concerns elections. He suggests TSC become familiar with rule 71 and rule 67. He emphasises the importance of Standing Order B1.b., and reads it, stressing that questions relating to disciplinary procedures should go to the RO directly, and not be addressed in committee.

Questions to the RO:

There are no questions to the RO.

The Chairman of the Consultative Committee

Business of the CCC:

The CCC has no business.

Questions to the CCC:

There are no questions to the CCC.

The Access Officers

Business of the Access Officers:

The Access Officers have no business.

Questions to the Access Officers:

There are no questions to the Access Officers.

The Chair of the Debate Selection Committee

Business of the CDSC:

The CDSC has no business.

Questions to the CDSC:

There are no questions to the CDSC.

Changes to the Composition of this Committee

There is one change to the composition of TSC – Mr Michael Harkness (**DRO**, *Magdalen College*) has been succeeded as Returning Officer by Mr Neb Jovanovic, *St Peter's College*.

Any Other Business

The Librarian notes that the Library is changing the way in which DVDs are rented, and this has been put through the Library Committee. It will require a simple change to the appendices of the rules, to reflect the reality of how DVDs are rented in the Library.

The Returning Officer adds that Library Committee has approved the changes [found below].

The Librarian adds that this change is to bring DVDs in line with books.

The Treasurer-Elect asks if anyone borrows DVDs.

The Librarian replies that this has been discussed for a long time, as they are very rarely rented. She adds that they are being brought in line with books in the hope that they will be rented more frequently. The Library will not buy DVDs unless they are for educational purposes, when in the past it would buy DVDs for entertainment, which are expensive and are often rented only once.

The President suggests this is an interim stage before DVDs are phased out.

The Librarian moves to pass the changes to the appendices of the rules as below, as recommended by Library Committee.

Original:

2) Borrowing

(b) Borrowing from the Library

2. Each book may be borrowed for 2 weeks. After that time it may be renewed, as long as no other member has reserved it. Up to 2 consecutive renewals may be done remotely; for a further renewal the book must be brought into the Library. Each audiovisual item may be borrowed for 3 days. It may not be renewed.

Proposed amendment:

2) Borrowing

(b) Borrowing from the Library

2. Each book and audiovisual item may be borrowed for 2 weeks. After that time it may be renewed, as long as no other member has reserved it. Up to 4 consecutive renewals may be done remotely; for a further renewal the book or audiovisual item must be brought into the Library.

Original:

2) Borrowing

(b) Borrowing from the Library

3.

(ii) In Vacation

A member may, from the last Monday of Full Term, borrow up to 10 books for the Vacation. These will be due for return on the first Tuesday of the following Full Term. The loan period for an audiovisual item is always 3 days, whether in term or vacation time.

Proposed amendment:

2) Borrowing

(b) Borrowing from the Library

3.

(ii) In Vacation

A member may, from the last Monday of Full Term, borrow up to 10 books and 5 audiovisual items for the Vacation. These will be due for return on the first Tuesday of the following Full Term.

Original:

2) Borrowing

c) Return of loaned items

(ii) Overdue items

A member returning or renewing an item after the Library closes on the date the item is due will be fined 20p per day overdue for a book or £1 per day for an audiovisual or reference item, up to a limit of £10 per item (subject to periodic review by the Library Committee).

Proposed amendment:

2) Borrowing

c) Return of loaned items

(ii) Overdue items

A member returning or renewing an item after the Library closes on the date the item is

due will be fined 20p per day overdue for a book or an audiovisual item or £1 per day for a reference item, up to a limit of £10 per item (subject to periodic review by the Library Committee).

Seconded by the President.

Nem. con.

Date of the Next Meeting

Monday 30th October 2017, at 16:00 in the President's Office.

The President closes the meeting at 16 48.

Signed,

A handwritten signature in dark ink, consisting of a stylized 'E' followed by a horizontal line.

Ed Evans
St John's College
Secretary