

No Questions to officers
the meeting closes at 23.28

Dominic Baird, Magdala, DRO, minutes

Don Dol

MT18 Wk 5 debate

Emergency debate motion: This House Would Tear Down Confederate Statues

Chair: Harry Webster

Secretary: Jack Blowers - Me!

Start time: 19.45

End time: 20.16

Brian Wong 0883399 Prop

- ↳ He made a bad joke 'tear-able'.
- ↳ Reinforcing that sense of superiority
- ↳ Reminding colonial past
- ↳ Psychologically toxic

James Brennan 087477 Opp

- ↳ Brian always makes good speeches
- ↳ These statues useful medium to bring history to account, removes historical ignorance

↳ Start discourse, thus

Syeda Abbas 094794 Prop

- ↳ Put up long after civil war,

Matthew Kayanja 095891 Opp

- ↳ What will we really get tearing these statues down?

- ↳ Not harming ^{more} upon taking them down, gives for right ~~legitimacy~~ legitimacy. will encourage ~~more~~ an increase in for right radicalism

Patrick Gwillui-Thomas 095478 Prop

- ↳ They glorify people, not educate ignorance.

Bethany Chamberlain 096144 Opp

- ↳ Lets throw eggs and rocks at them!

Brian Wong 088339 Prop

- ↳ Ergo backlash! Not casting evil!
- ↳ Adding legitimacy to reasons as well as people

Patrick Dancy 094486 Opp

- ↳ Strong points for education, However, denies young children a true ~~historical~~ ^{historical} education
- ↳ There will always be offensive things out there.

Marva Nuhomva-Frich 095155 Prop

- ↳ Statues set up and supported peak of civil rights movement
- ↳ This is political not historical

- L Saiged A Saig 095069 Opp
- ↳ Erasing history we don't like, uses Gladstone as an example,
 - ↳ Society progresses, opinions change, we should not remove these.
 - * Remember where society was and look how we've changed.

Mohammed Begi 094566 Prop

- ↳ Uses Salim H. statue in Iraq - brings great relief and joy to people.

George Palmer 095017 Opp

- ↳ Statues don't glorify people only ideas. Meaning can be completely different for statues, hence statues should stay, allow different people to see.
- ↳ Beliefs or interpretations are important, how potent a symbol Andamitz is.
- ↳ Lets have more statues!

Jessica Curry 096137 Prop

- ↳ They're not used in any way for education - this is a problem, not used for education, just left and kept to symbolise.

George Hargrave 094893 Opp

- ↳ A distraction, small things of history are as big as important as the current pressing issues - lets focus on them. Destroying statues does not solve these.
- ↳ We are building a better environment.

Sara Dube 092050 Prop

~~Keeping~~ keeping statues shows respect to the values we hold today

Matteo Baccaglini 094637 Prop

- ↳ ~~Statues~~ per plenty of historical figures ~~not~~ applicable to all statues
- ↳ fear moham.

Laura Lonsdale 095852 Prop

- ↳ Obvious answer - confederate statues have ~~an~~ immense power, not be too clear.

Gemma Timmons 091168 Opp

- ↳ "History is what the present chooses to remember of the past".
- ↳ We are not seeing the point ~~of~~ ^{or} purpose of statues, take their power and use it as a symbol of the things that are no longer.
- ↳ Serves as a reminder.

Nay was louder

Public Business Meeting MT18 Week 5

Chair: S. Horvath

Sec: L Kandler

- Ray invited to bring his motion on elections
- Stephen introduces one amendment, accepted as friendly
- prop: wants a more transparent union, discusses electoral malpractice and issues with Brendan taking up his position
- no opposition - passes

- Ray invited to propose his motion on GLOs.

- One amendment - accepted as friendly
- prop: clarifies the appointed committee process - can't make up a position for your friend

- opp: GLO, chch: objects to idea app. positions given to president's friends. Doesn't believe nepotism ~~matter~~ is a problem this term.

PO1: Ray - just because doesn't happen under this term, doesn't mean it should

response: no evidence in the past 3 terms

PO1: Brian - there have been issues with it.

PO1: Ray - no interviews

response: I don't think this is a way to fix it

Ray: moves the motion be put.

It passes.

Stephen adjourns the meeting

U + HD we have not remembered them

1. Amy Gregg, Magdalena

• remembrance \neq remembering

- Historical accounts shaped by politics and context of time

- Current remembrance is that WW1 was noble and just

- Romanticised notions of freedom fighting and justice

- WW1 not about moral absolutes like WW2

- simultaneously, must not disrespect soldiers but also must not mischaracterise with politics of war

- we continue to repeat mistakes of WW1

- Remembrance about more than acknowledging historical event

- we have learnt very little, and so gives no meaning to their deaths, and so failed to honour them

2. Mr. Andrew Morrison MP

- without remembrance, we forget and have no recollection

- modern remembrance is personal and parochial rather than on a large scale

- we need to remember WW1 at all times one day a year

3. Prof. Katrina Penwell

- Those engaging in remembrance do not represent our society

- Non-white people have not engaged in remembrance

- Centenary events have focused on British dead and western front

- "2014-2018" framing ignores other conflicts

- challenging histories have been lost out by traditional accounts

- without reflection on causes, results is various

- By ignoring target of placard not looking after service personnel we are not honouring memory of soldiers

Mr. Simon Jenkins

- Great war cultural appearance is very large

- Ridiculous to say we do not remember enough

- Grief for memory cannot be shared it is private and cannot be national

- Honour is more rational, but we do not honour people once they are dead

- Lessons not being learnt; politicians use to their advantage

- Nationalising remembrance and memory
- politician
- Pathetic European history caused by
- ~~choosing to cause memory~~ ^{memory} war gives us angry emotion
- "History told by governments is fake news"

Floor Speakers

1. Mr. Sulaiman Rahim, 091418
 - Conflict is romanticised
 - war caused by elites, sought by the people

- ~~to be~~ lives of non-white soldiers valued less
- Not learnt lessons, elites continue to command the people at large

2. Mr. William Atkinson, 093942

- If we ~~not~~ remember, we do remember in the right way
- Hoping to 'learn' and stop wars is hopeless

3. Mr. Saïed Sadiq, 095069

- Origin of WWI similar to 7525, Iraq, Afghanistan, 9/11
- Learning lessons only meaningful remembrance and we have not done that

4. Magdalena Lombardi 095410

- You can remember and not learn lessons
- Teaching about western front is more easy to relate to

Main Speaker 5. Dr. Jenny Medford

- In some ways, we have remembered their existence - is this enough?
- Some of us remember some of them without learning from it
- Soldiers of the empire not remembered
- Racism was written into military law
- Many first-gen immigrants of 1940s were veterans
- If we don't remember racist context and accept consequences e.g. widows, have we remembered non-white soldiers?

- Nov. 11 1919, Parliament adjourned early to go to League of Nations
- Preamble to treaty of ~~EEC~~ ^{EEC} was to establish broad community where there had been war
- Britain has never brought into EU as peace instrument
- ~~But~~ Britain forgets WWI to focus on itself

6. Major General Nicholas Caplin

- Remembrance is individual and personal
- Words of remembrance uttered every day at Menin Gate
- Every Commonwealth casualty recognised ~~and~~ by Commonwealth War Graves Commission
- Many people remembering on Sunday
- 10,000 councils doing their own remembrance events
- Remembrance not just on 11/11 but all the time
- New National memorial arboretum

- remembrance didn't start and end with WW1, ~~was~~ still current and very personal
- About families and friends, not just individuals
- we need to remember and learn lessons; injuries as well as deaths

Signed,

Nmm

NICK BROWN

MAGDALEN COLLEGE

SECRETARY

After debate

Week 5

After debate

THB

We have not remembered them.

Mohamed Iman.

Not everyone remembered.

Not people of colour

George Harper.

Possible to remember?

Have we remembered?

Hard to remember with negative.

Poppies don't do anything

Bethany Molyneux

If remembered properly
there wouldn't be more wars.
Wouldn't be divisions we see
today.

Joshua Levinson.

Studied WWI, poppies, minute
silence - None of this helps.
Distant event confined to
history lessons

Nicholas Heath.

Actually about how we have
remembered them.

3 male speakers in prog.

3 female speakers in op.

White men conduct the narrative.

Olivia Leigh.

Commercialised response.

Varuna Mitra

More people educated as to why
we remembered.

Charles Courmes.

Personal.

Marches & Jewish contribution.

Still remembering.

Roman Marshall.

Last person to die in WWI was
in 1918.

Nobody can remember anything
that they weren't alive for.

Daniel Villar.

Colombia too busy killing each
other to remember.

WWI, from foreign view, is
part of popular memory of Britain

Connie Bostock.

Premier League responds in centenary.
Remembered them through statues
and memorials.

Sofia Vorkhaturova

Remembered through art and music.

Week 5

After debate

THB

We have not remembered them.

Mohamed Iman.

Not everyone remembered.

Not people of colour

George Harper.

Possible to remember?

Have we remembered?

Hard to remember with negative.

Poppies don't do anything

Bethany Molyneux

If remembered properly
there wouldn't be more wars.
Wouldn't be divisions we see
today.

Joshua Levinson.

Studied WWI, poppies, minute
silence - None of this helps.
Distant event confined to
history lessons

Nicholas Leah.

Actually about how we have
remembered them.

3 male speakers in prog.

3 female speakers in op.

White men conduct the narrative.

Olivia Leigh.

Commercialised response.

Varuna Mitra

More people educated as to why
we remembered.

Charles Courmes.

Personal.

Marches & Jewish contribution.

Still remembering.

Roman Marshall.

Last person to die in WWI was
in 1918.

Nobody can remember anything
that they weren't alive for.

Daniel Villar.

Colombia too busy killing each
other to remember.

WWI, from foreign view, is
part of popular memory of Britain

Connie Bostock.

Premier League responds in centenary.
Remembered them through statues
and memorials.

Sofia Vorkhaturova

Remembered through art and music.

Joseph Lucas.

Need to remember individuals.
Names of the people on
memorials.

James Dragg

best scale.

we remember those from our colleges

Geneva Timmons.

Ask any child what the ~~poppy~~ means
and they don't understand what it
actually entails.
We haven't remembered the politics.

Antony Leonard.

Cannot remember something
we weren't sure for.
But none willing to try.

Rebecca Collins.

Can't get into shoes of
imagine lives they lead.
Assign people individuals.

Postponed private business motion

Secretary: Liam Frahan Jesus DRO

Chair: James Lanning Elder Treasurer

open 10.48

Anisha Faruk moves the SDC list as recommended by
Standing Out
passed

Woo to Brendan McGrath Librarian Elect

- motion counted out from last week (Third Division)
- open a window for RO to prevent minor
mistakes from preventing you from running from
election

The question was put
The Librarian does not wish to postpone

Yes: 12

No: 1

House was
counted
21 in ^{before} vote
House

Ray Williams Standardisation

Lk move that the house now be put - pass

Ray Williams

GDP &
passed

Ray Williams

It officer recording / creation

- CCC to Secretary recording duties

1053 closed by JL

Lk says motion was
am admitted out

remembered

aggladen

remembering

shaped by
set of time

is that wwl w

ions of freedom

oral absolute

not
but also
terise it

repeat

A more
historical

from time to time "Aye" this way, or "Noes"
3. To assist voters, if necessary, by saying
each 'ten' on the card.
2. To count all members passing their
own side of the barrier, except such as say
"Neutral" or words to that effect, marking off
the result on the card.

	✓	150
20	✓	160
30	✓	170
40	✓	180
50	✓	190
60	✓	200
70	✓	210
80	✓	220
90	✓	230
100	✓	240
110	✓	250
120	a	260
130		270
140		280

113: We have not remembered Debate
them 20..... (P.T.O.)
Elliot Browley Teller

looking after service personnel

at all

if in remembering
our society
are not any

are focused on
western govt
ignores other

have been

causes, people

place and

- Nationalizing curriculum
- politicians
- But this is European
- Challenging the way we see the world
- "History told by the victors"

- Floor Speaker
1. Mr. Sharma
- conflict is not
 - war caused by the people
 - No one
 - Lives of non-combatants
 - Not learnt to continue to work at large

2. Mr. William
- If we not remember in the
 - Hoping to 'let it be' is hopeless

(119)

Nbes

10	10	1	150
20	20	1	160
30	30	1	170
40	40	1	180
50	50	1	190
60	60	1	200
70	70	1	210
80	80	1	220
90	90	1	230
100	100	104	240
110	110	108	250
120	120	106	260
130	130		270
140	140		280

THB We have not remembered them Debate

the 106 20.18... (P.T.O.)

James Dix Teller

- By ignoring target of placard

at all times

- Nationalising to politician
- But the in Euro
- Choosing ^{memory} to
- "History told sake news"

emphatic Society

not engaged

Source on

in front

or other

are been

to

used, present

are been

to

are been

floor speaker

1. Mr. Schar

- conflict
- war caused by the people

- Lives of non-

- Not learnt continue to at large

2. Mr. Wil

- If we not remember in to
- Hoping to is hopeless