

This House Believes That the Catholic Church Can Never Pay For Its Sins

Secretary: Nicholas

Beatrice Barr (opening proposition)

- About the institution of the Catholic church not its individuals
- Stories about the abuses & exploitation
- Not arguing that other organisations are entirely clean
- Decades of silence and silencing the victims
- Concept of forgiveness
 - ↳ Catholic Church believes in such a concept
 - ↳ The speaker cites Saint Augustine's City of God
- Systematic suppression of women and the LGBT+ community
 - ↳ Institutional norms throughout the society's history

Lee Chin Wee (opening opposition)

- Many sins committed under the auspices of Catholic Church
- Cannot extend this to the level of never being able to repay
- Two parts to the speaker's speech:
 - ↳ Sins from individual members do not reflect full Catholic Church
 - ↳ Clear improvements in terms of accountability and reform
- Individuals can never pay, but the Catholic Church can.
- Reform efforts:
 - ↳ Catholic church needs to do more to restore confidence in laypeople
 - ↳ under Pope Francis more efforts have taken place than ever before
- Sin will have

Mitchell Garabedian (second proposition)

- sin cannot be repaid with money
 - ↳ Victims have their souls stolen
- Victims are committed to faith and carry pain
 - ↳ They blame themselves for their life's mistakes
- Secrecy has to end
- Pope Francis call in 15th October 2018
 - ↳ Recorded and commented about Chilean problem
- Catholic abusers belong in jail
- Catholic Summit as awareness Conference
 - ↳ This is not enough
- using the guise of religion
 - ↳ Take away religion and they just criminals

Results:

Ayes: 111

Noes: 44

Marcel Satria (second opposition)

- Debate does not deny that the Catholic Church has committed sins
 - ↳ It is about whether the church can do something
- Justice is what the victims needs
- what is justice?
 - ↳ retributive
 - ↳ corrective
 - ↳ restorative
 - ↳ transitional
- Needs to build trust and acknowledgement of sins
- Church can, must and should do more
- Motion implies that all actions are futile
- Church must learn from its own people or reconciliation
- Implications of the motion gives up on the Church
 - ↳ Voting in opposition is voting to give up on the church

Elizabeth Coggin (Third proposition)

- Magdalene laundries victim (offers emotional story)
- criticism of the Irish government for the funding of the laundries
 - ↳ Conscious of the word slavery
 - ↳ Same slavery continued when she fled and was captured
- Pursuing justice since 1997
 - ↳ Ireland fighting the speaker's case and trying to block info
- Audience stand to their feet

Marc Hamilton (Third opposition)

- Catholic Church just one of a number of churches that has committed sins
- The civil lawsuits and criminal prosecution is making them pay
 - ↳ That is justice
- The law is the doctrine of hope
- 'More than what is your story; here is your justice'

Floor Speeches

1st proposition (Alex J. O'Connor, St John's College, 094418)

- Central concept of the Church is salvation
- Church cannot apologise

1st opposition C

- Anya Vohay in support of the motion is saying change is never possible
- Comparison with inferior powers and slavery

2nd proposition (Joshua A. Nott, St Antony's, 091146)

- Moral debt - how much moral debt is the Church in?
- Contraception and its endorsement would be an important step

2nd opposition C

- Optimist - society and culture has changed
- Trend towards empathy, generosity and compassion

3rd proposition (Catharina S. Dicks, Wadham College, 808460)

- Repentance as a willing action
 - ↳ Seen as forced on them by the Catholic Church
- Justice in the inclusive sense not been promoted

3rd opposition (Petrina H. Gomez, Wycliffe Hall, 095290)

- Heart as debate rests on the notion of justice
 - ↳ Catholic Church must do more

Thomas Reilly (Final Proposition)

- Gives personal story about their childhood being raised a Catholic
- Truth is there is a dark side to the church
- Agrees with Mithun Garabedian after seeing secret files
 - ↳ Moving of bishops and failure to disclose information
- There has been progress, but think about the institution
 - ↳ Church thinks in terms of centuries of history
 - ↳ plan A - denial
 - ↳ plan B - pay victims
 - ↳ plan C - apologise
- Suggest that there is no way the Church can pay for its sins
 - ↳ In large parts of the world cannot use the freedom of press
- The concept of obedience with trying to control the victims
- Treatment of women is shameful
- Church oversight cannot come from civil society but from the laity
- Truth is that it is a corrupt institution
- Send powerful message to the Catholic church and voters in proposition

Dr Jay R. Feerman (Final opposition)

- Background of professional career in psychology
 - ↳ Biggest problem is the celibacy of priests
- Acknowledgement that the Catholic church has done good
 - ↳ Not weighing good against the bad, but about specific areas
- Civil issues
 - ↳ Something more can be done other than support of the motion relieve the church of its responsibility to do more
- More effective remedies:
 - ↳ Celibacy - attract sexual outliers. Church could make this optional for certain women.
 - ↳ Homosexuality - change church's opinion on the issue
- Vote rejecting motion is not a vote in support for Catholic church
- Send the Church a strong message that it can do more

After-Debate

No Speakers.

Closes Meeting at 22:39.

~~Brian Wong~~ ~~ATD~~ regrets the fall (Emergency) ~~of the~~
This house ~~supports~~ the Soviet Union ~~debate~~

Daniel A Villar 093835

- Economic rights
- Socialism was not perfect
- The third world was improved by the Russia
- We should aim for a fairer world

Travis Bason 091708

- The US was not perfect either
↳ civil rights issues
- We as humans are getting better.
- The S.U collapsed

Brian Wong 088339

- Communism will never work
 - 1) empowering the masses is ~~the~~ against the elite
 - 2) It has never worked
 - 3) Left wing economics is a fallacy
- We have romanticised the S.U.

David

Matthew Rob
• 200
4