

Ratified Minutes of  
THE ORDINARY MEETING OF THE STANDING COMMITTEE  
4<sup>th</sup> Week Hilary Term 2015  
Monday 9<sup>th</sup> February 2015  
President's Office, 16:00

**Present:** **The President** (Miss Lisa Wehden, *Worcester College*), **The Librarian** (Mr Charlie Vaughan, *St. John's College*), **The Treasurer** (Miss NamPhuong Dinh, *Corpus Christi College*), **The Secretary** (Mr Robert Harris, *New College*), **The Elected Member** (Miss Verity Hubbard, *Lady Margaret Hall*), **The Elected Member** (Miss Cindy Yu, *Christ Church*), **The Elected Member** (Mr David Browne, *Merton College*), **The Elected Member** (Mr Alastair Holder Ross, *St. Hilda's College*), **The Librarian-Elect** (Mr Stuart Webber, *Somerville College*), **The Treasurer-Elect** (Miss Antonia Trent, *St. Hugh's College*), **The Bursar** (Mrs Lindsay Warne), **The Returning Officer** (Mr Michael Flagg, *St. Hugh's College*), **The Access Officer** (Mr Samuel Billington, *Somerville College*), **The Access Officer** (Mr Daniel Haynes, *New College*), **The Chair of the Debate Selection Committee** (Mr Jamie Jackson, *St. John's College*).

**Attending:** **The Ex-Secretary** (Mr Dom Merchant, *New College*), **The Ex-Elected Member** (Mr Joseph Miles, *Wadham College*), **The Chief of Staff** (Miss Olivia Merrett, *St. John's College*), **The Deputy Returning Officer** (Mr Robert Boissonneault, *Keble College*), Miss Ceri Smith (*St. Anne's College*), Mr Jamie Lagerberg (*Corpus Christi College*).

**Apologies:** **The Elected Member** (Mr Joe Fowles, *Pembroke College*), **The President-Elect** (Mr Roberto Weeden-Sanz, *St. Benet's Hall*), **The Senior Librarian** (Mr Sean Power, *Oriel College*), **The Senior Treasurer** (Mr Stephen Dixon, *Downing College, Cambridge*), **The Chairman of the Consultative Committee** (Miss Felicity Blackburn, *Somerville College*), **The Access Officer** (Miss Claire Butler, *Worcester College*).

**Absent:** None.

*The President opens the meeting at 16:06.*

**Requests to Pass Absences from Previous Meeting**

There is no discussion on absences from the previous meeting.

**Matters Arising from Previous Minutes**

**The President** asks that it be put on record that it is totally unacceptable for attendees at meetings to attempt to alter the minutes to their advantage. Those wishing to make amendments should listen to the recording first to make sure they are correct, and not wilfully attempt to deceive. Accusations of lying cannot be made when something happened in the meeting with which you disagree.

**Ratification of Minutes**

The President moves that TSC ratifies the Minutes from the Ordinary Meeting of TSC of HT15 3<sup>rd</sup> Week.

*Nem. con.*

**The President**

*Meetings missed: 0, Missed without good reason: 0*

**Business of the President:**

**The President** requests that, when liaising with speakers, members of committee do not speak on her behalf. A speaker, Katie Pavlich, has contacted the President accusing her of vetoing a visit to the Union. As the minutes from 3<sup>rd</sup> Week state, she did not veto a visit; she just said it would be difficult given that there were two other speaker events that day. There has been an incredible case of miscommunication here and she is shocked by the actions of a certain member of committee. There will have to be action taken to deal with the person who misled the speaker.

Questions to the President:

There are no questions to the President.

**The Librarian**

*Meetings missed: 0, Missed without good reason: 0*

Business of the Librarian:

The Librarian has no business.

Questions to the Librarian:

There are no questions to the Librarian.

**The Treasurer**

*Meetings missed: 0, Missed without good reason: 0*

Business of the Treasurer:

**The Treasurer** says that she would like TSC to pass DSC expenses.

**The Bursar** notes that expenses cannot actually be passed without the presence of a Senior Officer.

Mr Browne moves that TSC agrees, in principle, to ratify DSC expenses subject to the approval of a Senior Officer.

*Seconded by the Librarian.*

*Nem. con.*

The Treasurer moves that TSC passes DSC expenses totalling £768.91, as recommended by the Finance Committee, subject to the approval of a Senior Officer.

*Seconded by Mr Browne.*

*Nem. con.*

**The Treasurer** explains that she has received an email from Nathan Lambert.

**The Librarian** responds that this is already being dealt with.

Questions to the Treasurer:

There are no questions to the Treasurer.

**The Secretary**

*Meetings missed: 1, Missed without good reason: 0*

Business of the Secretary:

The Secretary has no business.

Questions to the Secretary:

There are no questions to the Secretary.

**Mr Fowles**

*Meetings missed: 2, Missed without good reason: 2*

Business of Mr Fowles in his absence:

**Mr Fowles** emailed to praise the hard work and level-headedness shown by all the committee members during the visit of Marine Le Pen on Thursday evening, and to commend them on getting through what was an incredibly difficult situation.

**The President** expresses her thanks to Thames Valley Police and to the security team.

**Mr Browne** congratulates the President for holding the event despite such violent opposition. She is one of the greatest people he has had the privilege of serving under in a personal capacity. He presents the President with a gift.

**The Secretary** asks whether Mr Browne is attempting to buy the influence of the President.

**The President** expresses her heartfelt thanks to Mr Browne.

**The Bursar** suggests that we pass a special motion to thank Bridget and the security team.

The President moves a motion of thanks to Bridget and the security team for the way they handled the visit of Marine Le Pen.

*Nem. con.*

Questions to Mr Fowles in his absence:

There are no questions to Mr Fowles.

**Miss Hubbard**

*Meetings missed: 0, Missed without good reason: 0*

Business of Miss Hubbard:

Miss Hubbard has no business.

Questions to Miss Hubbard:

There are no questions to Miss Hubbard.

**Miss Yu**

*Meetings missed: 0, Missed without good reason: 0*

Business of Miss Yu:

Miss Yu has no business.

Questions to Miss Yu:

There are no questions to Miss Yu.

**Mr Browne**

*Meetings missed: 0, Missed without good reason: 0*

Business of Mr Browne:

Mr Browne has no business.

Questions to Mr Browne:

There are no questions to Mr Browne.

**Mr Holder Ross**

*Meetings missed: 0, Missed without good reason: 0*

Business of Mr Holder Ross:

Mr Holder Ross has no business.

Questions to Mr Holder Ross:

There are no questions to Mr Holder Ross.

**The President-Elect**

*Meetings missed: 3, Missed without good reason: 2*

Business of the President-Elect in his absence:

The President-Elect has no business.

Questions to the President-Elect in his absence:

There are no questions to the President-Elect.

**The Librarian-Elect**

*Meetings missed: 0, Missed without good reason: 0*

Business of the Librarian-Elect:

The Librarian-Elect has no business.

Questions to the Librarian-Elect:

There are no questions to the Librarian-Elect.

**The Treasurer-Elect**

*Meetings missed: 1, Missed without good reason: 1*

Business of the Treasurer-Elect:

The Treasurer-Elect has no business.

Questions to the Treasurer-Elect:

There are no questions to the Treasurer-Elect.

### **The Ex-Officio**

Business of the Ex-Officio:

The Ex-Officio have no business.

Questions to the Ex-Officio:

There are no questions to the Ex-Officio.

### **The Senior Librarian**

Business of the Senior Librarian in his absence:

The Senior Librarian has no business.

Questions to the Senior Librarian in his absence:

There are no questions to the Senior Librarian.

### **The Senior Treasurer**

Business of the Senior Treasurer in his absence:

The Senior Treasurer has no business.

Questions to the Senior Treasurer in his absence:

There are no questions to the Senior Treasurer.

### **The Bursar**

Business of the Bursar:

The Bursar has no business.

Questions to the Bursar:

There are no questions to the Bursar.

### **The Returning Officer**

Business of the RO:

**The Returning Officer** explains that we need to pass the IDC shortlist for HT15.

*Mr Dom Merchant (Ex-Secretary) enters the room at 16:10.*

**The Librarian** asks whether the relevant criterion is correctness, rather than suitability.

**The Returning Officer** responds that it is. This should have been done in 0<sup>th</sup> week but the previous RO sends his apologies.

**The Bursar** asks whether Mr Crawford Jamieson or Mr Cai Wilshaw have been convicted of electoral malpractice.

**Mr Browne** replies that they have not.

**The Librarian-Elect** notes that Mr Wilshaw resigned from the office of Secretary before he was convicted of anything.

**Mr Browne** says that Mr Wilshaw had never actually acceded to the office of Secretary by the time he resigned.

*Mr Leo Garwood (Ex-Librarian) enters the room at 16:14.*

**The Returning Officer** explains that the order is different from that when Mr Wharton Chan was RO at the beginning of MT14. The order is now determined firstly by the term in which they joined the Union, not when they received the position.

**Mr Browne** asks what the 'X' symbol means.

**The Returning Officer** clarifies that it means a number that has not been verified. XX signifies that there are two digits comprising that number. Despite looking through as many past term-cards as possible, he could not find some of the exact dates.

**The Librarian** suggests that the exact dates in question should not substantively affect the shortlist.

**The Returning Officer** agrees.

The President moves that TSC ratifies the IDC shortlist for HT15.

*Nem. con.*

**The Returning Officer** explains that we need to appoint three new DROs.

**The President** asks to see the DRO shortlist.

**The Returning Officer** responds that the shortlist of possible DROs is exactly as passed by TSC in 2<sup>nd</sup> Week.

**The Librarian-Elect** asks whether this makes the title of 'Ex-Traitor' an official position.

**The Returning Officer** responds that this was a mistake on the part of a number of people. He tells Mr Miles to behave or he will give him a smacked bottom, though he subsequently apologises for this reference. The three people he intends to appoint as DROs are Mr William Barnes (*Hertford College*), Mr Jamie Lagerberg (*Corpus Christi College*) and Miss Ceri Smith (*St. Anne's College*).

**Miss Yu** asks how these names have been chosen.

**The Returning Officer** states that this was a point of contention. He looked at Rule 32(a)(iv) which points to the other relevant rules. Interpretation A34 refers to the only necessary order as being that prescribed by Standing Order D12, which is in an order based on the number of terms as ROA and the number of terms as DRO. The only relevant criterion is terms of service within the elections. But it is also arguable that the appointments are just by choice of the RO.

**Miss Yu** asks whether this provision is in the rules.

**The Returning Officer** responds that the rules are vague on this issue.

**The Librarian** says that there are two questions here. The first is whether the RO is obliged to take the top three names on the list, or whether he has the discretion to choose any three.

**The Returning Officer** states that he has taken the top three names on the list given a couple of points.

**The Librarian** continues that the second question pertains to which people are actually the top three on the list given the contention regarding Mr Miles' experience.

**The Returning Officer** agrees that the contentious point relates to the unclear experience of Mr Miles. Both ROs he has served under have expressed disfavour for how he conducted himself whilst an electoral official; in particular, Mr Atkinson told Mr Miles to leave and not come back (in less savoury terms), and notes that he attended the count as a representative rather than as an ROA. The second person who has been removed from the shortlist is Miss Brigitte Stenhouse (*Somerville College*) because she was given first refusal of the position of DRO and chose to turn it down.

**Mr Miles** objects that the list passed by TSC explicitly states that he was appointed as an ROA for two terms. Standing Order D12 says that the only relevant criterion is the number of terms served as an electoral official, not how good the person was at the job. He proceeds to read out some of the rules.

**The Librarian** clarifies that the question is whether Mr Miles has one or two terms of experience as an ROA.

**Mr Boissonneault** says that Standing Order D12 is intended to determine the order of seniority among DROs (i.e. amongst those who are already DROs); it has no relevance for, and does not apply to, those who want to become a DRO. It is incorrectly referenced in Interpretation A34.

**The Librarian** suggests that the Returning Officer needs to consider whether the 'firing' of Mr Miles changes his experience as an ROA.

**Mr Miles** says that it does not as this is not laid out in the rules.

**The Librarian** asks whether he believes the RO had no power to fire him.

**The Returning Officer** suggests that it is ridiculous to assume that the RO cannot get rid of his own assistants without having to negotiate with candidates.

**Mr Miles** says that it might sound ridiculous, but it is not in the rules.

**The Returning Officer** responds that it is not in the rules that he cannot.

**Mr Browne** notes that there is no mechanism by which the RO can fire an ROA.

**The Returning Officer** agrees, but notes that there is also no mechanism by which an ROA to resign, which is clearly wrong.

**The Librarian** says that we just need to decide on whether to ratify the three names. We should not get involved in questions of the RO's interpretative power.

**The Returning Officer** maintains that the three names he is proposing are Mr Barnes, Mr Lagerberg and Miss Smith.

**The Librarian** infers that this means he is interpreting the lacuna in the rules such that being removed from the position of ROA negates its value as experience.

**The Returning Officer** states that this is, indeed, the case, in the same way in which being ‘knifed’ as an ROA removes the ability to label it as experience.

**Mr Browne** disagrees, noting that TSC passed the listed experience of Mr Miles as being two terms, in the same way in which the experience of Mr Zachary Spiro which was not listed was not passed.

**The Librarian** reiterates that TSC simply needs to decide on whether or not to ratify the names proposed by the RO. We should not reject names on the basis that we think the RO’s interpretation is wrong, as we do not have interpretative power over this. The question of the RO’s interpretation is something that can be addressed through other avenues.

*Thomas Reynolds enters the room at 16:28.*

**Miss Hubbard** asks who is Mr Barnes.

**The Returning Officer** responds that he was three times RO (in all but name) of Conservative Future. He is extremely good at what he does and very experienced.

**Mr Miles** argues that he and Mr Lagerberg have similar experience but that he has been around the Society for longer.

**The Librarian** reiterates again that it is not for TSC to decide on who would be better, but merely to decide on whether it has any problem with Mr Lagerberg. Mr Miles can challenge the RO’s interpretation through other mechanisms.

**Mr Miles** agrees that this is fair.

**The Returning Officer** notes that serving on TSC (as Mr Miles has done) does not count as relevant electoral experience in an application to become DRO.

**The President** expresses her belief that this is absurd.

The President moves that TSC ratifies the appointment of Mr William Barnes (*Hertford College*), Mr Jamie Lagerberg (*Corpus Christi College*) and Miss Ceri Smith (*St. Anne’s College*) as DROs for HT15.

*Nem. con.*

Questions to the RO:

There are no questions to the RO.

**The Chairman of the Consultative Committee**

Business of the CCC in her absence:

The CCC has no business.

Questions to the CCC in her absence:

There are no questions to the CCC.

**The Access Officers**

Business of the Access Officers:



The Access Officers have no business.

Questions to the Access Officers:

There are no questions to the Access Officers.

**The Chair of the Debate Selection Committee**

Business of the CDSC:

The CDSC has no business.

Questions to the CDSC:

There are no questions to the CDSC.

**Changes to the Composition of this Committee**

**The President** congratulates Mr Michael Flagg (*St. Hugh's College*) on his election as Returning Officer.

**Any Other Business**

There is no other business.

**Date of the Next Meeting**

Monday 5<sup>th</sup> Week Hilary Term 2015 (16<sup>th</sup> February 2015), 16:00, in the President's Office.

*The President closes the meeting at 16:31.*

Signed,

**Robert Harris**  
*New College*  
Secretary