

*Ratified Minutes of*

THE ORDINARY MEETING OF THE DEBATE SELECTION COMMITTEE

7<sup>th</sup> Week Hilary Term 2019

Sunday 24<sup>th</sup> February

The Morris Room, 17:30

**Present:** **The Chair of the Debate Selection Committee** (Lee Chin Wee, *Trinity College*), **The DSC Deputy Secretary cum Librarian-elect** (Sara Singh Dube, *St. Hugh's College*), **Standing Committee Delegate** (Chaitanya Kediya, *Exeter College*), **The Director of Training** (Rachel O Nunain, *Trinity College*), **The President** (Daniel Wilkinson, *Oriel College*), **The DSC Secretary** (Rosa Thomas, *St. Anne's College*), **Access, Communications & Equity Officer** (Dominic Brind, *Magdalen College*)

**Attending:**

**Apologies:** **The DSC Treasurer** (Bryan Yan, *Keble College*)

**Absent:** **The Externals Officer** (Jason Xiao, *Wadham College*), **Internals Officer** (Brian Wong, *Wolfson College*)

**Late:**

*DSC opens at 17:36*

**Apologies**

**Request to pass Absences from Previous Meetings**

The CDSC moves to pass the Internals Officer's absence from the previous meeting on the grounds that they were attending a pressing and extraordinary engagement agreed to be unavoidable.

*Motion passes nem. com.*

**Matters arising from Previous Minutes**

**Ratification of Minutes**

The CDSC moves to ratify the minutes of week 6 of Hilary term.

*Motion passes nem. com.*

**Business of the CDSC**

**Update of OxWSC**

The CDSC asks whether there are any concerns that members would like to discuss about OxWSC.

The Director of Training says that they have heard that Capstone might not be sending many teams due to the cost, and also that Capstone is not keen to sponsor the competition. The Director of Training adds that it might be best to market OxWSC as a domestic competition, and that the training day might not generate sufficient interest since most teams sent by debating academies or representing their country want to compete rather than train.

The DSC Secretary points out that it is important to clarify the target market for OxWSC. At the current price, OxWSC is not attracting domestic teams. Additionally, the DSC Secretary mentions that the prices shared with Capstone were not the same as the prices shown to DSC earlier. It is a problem if Capstone is not planning to send multiple teams and domestic schools are unable to pay the price to participate. The DSC Secretary acknowledges that a working document was sent to Capstone, but believes that even the access price on that document was far too high, which generates ill will among domestic schools and makes the Union look out of touch with the financial realities of domestic schools. Finally, if OxWSC is going to turn into a domestic competition, its model needs to be changed based on the points raised in previous meetings, since most domestic schools are unlikely to pay £60 for 3 students this late in the academic year.

The CDSC notes these points and asks the Access, Communications & Equity Officer the access price for Oxford Schools.

The Access, Communications & Equity responds that the access registration price is £25, and in addition to this there are bursaries available for schools.

The CDSC says that a reasonable price would be £30, which would not be framed as an access price. Rather registration fees for non-selective state schools would be £30 and registration fees for other local teams would be £60.

The DSC Secretary contends that this would still make the competition too expensive for disadvantaged teams. The DSC Secretary suggests allowing teams to reach out on a case-by-case basis if they are not able to pay the registration fees, and agrees with not calling the lower registration fee an access price.

The CDSC also agrees on steering away from a training day format in favour of a one-day competition. However, the CDSC points out that currently nearly 80% of the estimated revenue of OxWSC was coming from the training day.

The DSC Secretary points out that a one-day competition would be easier to organise in terms of getting people to judge and help out. Additionally, most local teams would not be able to afford the additional price of training day.

The Access, Communications & Equity adds that it would be unhelpful to charge a high price for a training day, especially if it would be difficult to ensure its quality.

The CDSC suggests implementing a team cap of 60 teams, which would require 30 rooms. The registration fees would be between £0-40 for teams requiring access prices, £60 for local teams, which could reach out for bursaries if this was a prohibitively high, and £100 for international and WSDC teams.

The Director of Training points out that international teams should also be able to reach out for bursaries since the price could be prohibitively expensive for them as well.

The Access, Communications & Equity adds that 60 teams might be far too ambitious a goal and that there might not be enough teams to meet the cap.

The Director of Training says that the Istock Cup used to market itself as a qualifier for Team England trials since it was a 3v3 competition. OxWSC could market itself as a practise competition for a 3v3

tournament, which would attract schools interested in sending their students for Team England trials. Furthermore, in future years OxWSC could work with ESU to make it a qualifying competition.

The DSC Secretary agrees that there schools would take a keen interest in sending teams to a tournament which is a practise for Team England trials, especially since there are no alternate 3v3 competitions.

The CDSC agrees in reducing the number of teams, but then suggests having only 3 speakers on each team. Additionally, the CDSC projects that OxWSC could make a profit between £2000 and £3000, and while this is smaller than initially anticipated it would be beneficial for future years and the growth of OxWSC.

The DSC Secretary adds that OxWSC would grow more profitable in coming years and that it is necessary to acknowledge that there is some risk to hosting such a competition given that a limited number of actual WSDC teams will attend it.

The Standing Committee Delegate suggests looking at the teams that participate in Heart of Europe to determine whether it would be possible to attract them to compete at OxWSC.

The CDSC suggests setting a team cap at 50 teams, requiring 25 rooms. The registration fees would be as discussed earlier, with both local and international teams having the opportunity to reach out if they cannot pay £60 and £100 respectively. The cost of hosting the competition would be roughly £200 for judge travel and £500 for food. This would mean a limited profit of £2000 which is alright, since there are three alternative sources of revenue. First, sponsorship that the Sponsorship Officer will help secure. Second, selling debating stash to members within the Union. Third, conducting a summer camp for debating.

The DSC Secretary and Director of Training agree that members would like and purchase stash.

The CDSC confirms that the CA team for OxWSC would be Mr Teck Wei Tan, Ms Lisa Schallenberg, Mr Luke Churchyard, Ms Ana Vilhelmina Verdnik and Mr Bryan Yan. The CDSC resigns as the Training Director of OxWSC, and adds that publicity for OxWSC would go live from next week.

### EUDC Selections

The CDSC says that it is important to compile a list of potential selectors for EUDC Trial to ensure that they can be secured. The CDSC asks the Director of Training to compile such a list, and suggests having a conversation to discuss potential selectors. Chin - Rachel – please compile list because 0th week of Trinity

The CDSC mentions that Mr Darion Hotan was a selector in the previous WUDC trial which means they should not be invited for this trial. The CDSC suggests Mr Harish Natarajan as a potential selector.

The Director of Training points out that Mr Harish Natarajan has already been a selector thrice in the last three years. The Director of Training suggests requesting Ms Lucia Acre if Mr Jure Hederih is not trialling. The Director of Training adds that a selection panel should have at least one woman and person who is ESL.

The CDSC asks whether Ms Gigi Gil would be able to serve as a selector.

The Director of Training raises the concern that Ms Gigi Gil has coached members of DSC, and suggests Ms Emma Lucas if Ms Lucia Acre is unable to come.

The CDSC adds that this is a helpful brainstorming exercise.

The DSC Secretary says that it would be better to invite an ESL speaker from within the UK as it would lead to lower costs.

The CDSC suggests creating a list to confirm selectors and get ahead of the curve.

### Standing Order Changes

The Access, Communications & Equity Officer says that the Standing Order change proposed by them adds an obligation into the Standing Order to help judge or run 2 rounds during the Oxford IV and Oxford Schools Finals Day.

The CDSC says that they have no concerns with this change and will introduce it as a part of their agenda in week 8.

The Director of Training adds that Standing Order changes about EUDC trial requirements should be made as soon as possible.

The CDSC responds that they support such changes, and they can also be brought in week 8 TSC.

### **Business of the DSC Treasurer**

#### Expenses

In the DSC Treasurer's absence, the CDSC says that £334.96 has to be passed as DSC expenses today.

### **Business of the Externals Officer**

#### Selections of UCL IV

In the Externals Officer's absence, the CDSC announces that the following teams will represent the Union at the UCL IV. Ms Gigi Gil and Ms Geneva Roy, Mx Imogen Edwards-Lawrence and Ms Melanie Onovo, and Mr Jure Hederih and Mr Jamie Johnson. Mr Peter Wallich will be a judge. However, since Mr Asa Li had only judged one regional round there were no applicants to judge. The CDSC decides to advertise the position of judge in the next DA.

#### Selections for KCL Women's Open

The Director of Training mentions that there have only been 3 applicants for KCL Women's Open.

The CDSC decides to continue to keep applications open for 3 teams and 2 judges at the KCL Women's Open.

### **Business of DSC Secretary**

#### Exemptions from judging requirements

The DSC Secretary mentions that the following individuals need exemption from the requirement to judge Oxford Schools Finals Day and in certain cases the requirement to judge two regional rounds of Oxford Schools.

Ms Hannah Taylor has Law Moderations and as a result is not able to judge the Oxford Schools Finals Day. They are exempted from the requirement.

Mr Conor Sheehan is an international student, and as a result had booked their flights in advance, which prevents them from judging the Oxford Schools Finals Day. They are exempted from the requirement.

Mr Anagh Agarwal is an international student, and as a result had booked their flights in advance, which prevents them from judging the Oxford Schools Finals Day. They are exempted from the requirement.

Mr Jonas Frey is not in the country during Oxford Schools Finals Day. They are exempted from the requirement, pending an explanation about why they are not in the country.

Mr Pieter Van De Veer has collections in 9th week and needs to revise for them. The DSC Secretary decides to seek clarification about the seriousness of the exams to determine whether they are exempt from the requirement.

Mr Charles Xavier Redmond was not able to judge a second regional round due to a misunderstanding about the date of the last regional round. Since this was not in bad faith, they are exempted from the requirement but will be expected to do workshop instead in the coming terms.

Mr Arthur James has only judged one regional round. The Access, Communications & Equity Officer says that Mr Arthur James was aware of his obligation to judge to regional rounds. The Director of Training adds that they do not have a reasonable excuse, which merits some penalty. The DSC Secretary agrees and points out that since Mr Arthur James knew about their obligation a high penalty should be imposed for not fulfilling their duty. The CDSC suggests deducting 4 helper points, expecting Mr Arthur James to conduct a workshop in the coming terms, and to help in all rounds of Oxford Schools Finals Day.

The CDSC also suggests making the Access, Communications & Equity Officer in-charge of communicating when exemptions have been made, and when penalties or alternate requirements have been imposed.

### **Business of the DSC Deputy Secretary**

The DSC Deputy Secretary says that Mr Stephen Horvath has asked for helper points for serving as Sponsorship Officer for a year and for a convening a regional round. This would mean that a combined 6 helper points are awarded to Mr Stephen Horvath.

The Director of Training points out that they are meant to be awarded 2 helper points for agreeing to judge the Taunton regional round at the last minute.

Ms Hannah Taylor is awarded 4 helper points for assisting the Beginner's Squad coaches over the last two terms.

Mr Jamie Johnson is awarded 2 helper points for assisting the Beginner's Squad coaches in Michaelmas term.

The CDSC notes that the DSC Deputy Secretary should award helper points to members who judged the regional round of ICYD in Oxford.

The CDSC adds that Mr Jason Xiao and Mr Andrew Seow should be awarded 2 helper points for convening the ICYD regional round.

### **Business of Director of Training**

The CDSC points out that workshops are going to be conducted with EC and Cherwell to maintain friendly relations with both institutions, and recommends that Mr Arthur James conducts these workshops.

The Director of Training adds that it is important for a time frame of 1 or 2 terms to be adopted within which members who are expected to conduct a workshop fulfill this duty. This helps ensure that penalties are tracked properly and not forgotten.

### **Business of the Internals Officer**

#### **Changes to the composition of this Committee**

The Access, Communications & Equity Officer is now Mr Dominic Brind (*Magdalen College*).

### **Any Other Business**

*The CDSC closes the meeting of DSC at 18:48*

Signed,

Chaitanya Kediya

**Standing Committee**

*Exeter College*