

The Ratified Minutes of
THE ORDINARY MEETING OF THE STANDING COMMITTEE
3rd Week Hilary Term 2018
Monday 29th January
President's Office, 16:00

Present: **The President** (Ms Laali Vadlamani, *Trinity College*), **The President-Elect** (Mr Gui Cavalcanti, *Pembroke College*), **The Librarian** (Ms Sabriyah Sayeed, *Somerville College*), **The Librarian-Elect** (Ms Shivani Ananth, *St. Anne's College*), **The Treasurer** (Mr Stephen Horvath, *New College*), **The Treasurer-Elect** (Mr Daniel Wilkinson, *Oriel College*), **The Secretary** (Ms Molly Greenwood, *St. Hilda's College*), **The Elected Member**, (Mr Shanuk Mediwaka, *Lincoln College*), **The Elected Member** (Ms Genevieve Athis, *Christ Church*), **The Elected Member** (Mr Adam Watson, *Hertford College*), **The Elected Member** (Mr Charles Wang, *Hertford College*), **The Elected Member** (Mr Charlie Cheesman, *St. Edmund Hall*), **The Elected Member** (Mr Chris Garner, *St. Peter's College*), **The Chair of the Consultative Committee** (Mr Julian Kirk, *Magdalen College*), **The Returning Officer** (Mr Harry Samuels, *New College*), **The Bursar** (Ms Lindsay Warne), **The Senior Treasurer** (Mr Stephen Dixon, *Downing College, Cambridge*), **The Chair of the Debate Select Committee** (Mr Andrew Seow, *Lincoln College*)

Attending:

Apologies:

Absent:

The President opens this Ordinary Meeting of the Standing Committee at 16:00.

Requests to Pass Absences from Previous Meetings

The President deems Ms Risino's absence from the Ordinary Meeting of the Standing Committee in 2nd Week of Hilary Term 2018 as to have been with good reason, due to an immovable academic commitment.

nem. con.

The President moves to pass Ms Risino's absence from the Ordinary Meeting of the Standing Committee in 2nd Week of Hilary Term 2018.

nem. con.

Mr Wang enters the room at 16:01.

The President deems Mr Garner's absence from the Ordinary Meeting of the Standing Committee in 2nd Week of Hilary Term 2018 as to have been with good reason, due to a pressing and extraordinary engagement, namely a job interview.

nem. con.

The President moves to pass Mr Garner's absence from the Ordinary Meeting of the Standing Committee in 2nd Week of Hilary Term 2018.

nem. con.

Matters Arising from Previous Minutes

There are no matters arising from previous minutes.

Ratification of Minutes

The President moves to ratify the Draft Minutes from the Ordinary Meeting of the Standing Committee in 2nd Week of Hilary Term 2018.

nem. con.

The President

Business of the President

The President has no business.

Questions to the President

There are no questions to the President.

The Librarian

Business of the Librarian

The Librarian moves to recommend that the Standing Committee ratify the junior membership of Jamie Jordan, Wadham College, to the Library Committee.

Seconded by the President.

nem. con.

Ms Athis enters the room at 16:02.

Questions to the Librarian

There are no questions to the Librarian.

The Treasurer

Business of the Treasurer

The Treasurer, following the recommendation of the Finance Committee and pending the approval of the Bursar, moves to pass DSC Expenses of £2190.03.

Seconded by the President.

nem. con.

Questions to the Treasurer

There are no questions to the Treasurer.

The Secretary

Business of the Secretary

The Secretary has no business.

Questions to the Secretary

There are no questions to the Secretary.

Mr Shanuk Mediwaka

Business of Mr Mediwaka

Mr Mediwaka has no business.

Questions to Mr Mediwaka

There are no questions to Mr Mediwaka.

Ms Genevieve Athis

Business of Ms Athis

Ms Athis has no business.

Questions to Ms Athis

There are no questions to Ms Athis.

Mr Adam Watson

Business of Mr Watson

Mr Watson has no business.

Questions to Mr Watson

There are no questions to Mr Watson.

Mr Charles Wang

Business of Mr Wang

Mr Wang has no business.

Questions to Mr Wang

The Treasurer asks when tickets for the Puppy Party will be released.

Mr Wang explains that it will be in Fourth Week.

The President explains that she is now in correspondence with the relevant people and is dealing with the arrangement.

The President-Elect asks whether Ms Risino has presented her budget for the Martini Social to the Bursar.

The President notes that she has met with the House Manager.

The Secretary explains that Ms Risino has arranged to meet with her the forthcoming Wednesday.

The President-Elect notes that her budget will be due in the next Ordinary Meeting of the Standing Committee in Fourth Week.

The President agrees, and says this means tickets will go on sale the week after that.

Mr Charlie Cheesman

Business of Mr Cheesman

Mr Cheesman has no business.

Questions to Mr Cheesman

There are no questions to Mr Cheesman.

Ms Izzy Risino

Business of Ms Risino

Ms Risino has no business.

Questions to Ms Risino

There are no questions to Ms Risino.

Mr Chris Garner

Business of Mr Garner

Mr Garner has no business.

Questions to Mr Garner

There are no questions to Mr Garner.

The President-Elect

Business

The President-Elect has no business.

Questions

There are no questions to the President-Elect.

The Librarian-Elect

Business of the Librarian-Elect

The Librarian-Elect has no business.

Questions to the Librarian-Elect

There are no questions to the Librarian-Elect.

The Treasurer-Elect

Business of the Treasurer-Elect

The Treasurer-Elect has no business.

Questions to the Treasurer-Elect

There are no questions to the Treasurer-Elect.

The Ex-Officio

Business to the Ex-Officio

The Ex-Officio have no business.

Questions to the Ex-Officio

The President explains that she recently received an email in response to a previous email sent by **the Ex-President**, *Worcester College*. The e-mail is from a member of the Blavatnik School of government, first from 9th October 2017. She explains the contents of the email to the Standing Committee, which was asking for suggestions for benefits or discounts regarding the Union since the intensity of their course meant that they could attend few events, but that a partnership would be beneficial due to how BSG can help contribute to Union events. She notes that she did not know about this before. There was a follow-up e-mail sent on 12th October, to which **the Ex-President** replies and explains that discounts are not possible. **The President** argues that this is not actually the case. The e-mail offers two spots at drinks receptions for students from the Blavatnik School of Government, which **the President** reads as meaning that at every event, two students from BSG are entitled to a spot, and she assumes people had gone ahead with membership on this assumption. She explains that only a small number, 20, of BSG students signed up this year. (**The Treasurer** notes that the number was 70 last year.) She questions **the Ex-President** as to what happened with this situation, why he made the decision to make this offer, and why it was not brought to the Standing Committee, or discussed with any other Officer or the Bursar.

Mr Kirk asks if it is possible to make these kinds of offers without the permission of the Standing Committee.

The President explains that this is her question to the Standing Committee.

The Returning Officer explains that under Standing Order C4, spaces allocated at informal guest receptions are at the President's discretion. He clarifies that he does not wish to make any comment as to the desirability of this ability to allocate guest spaces in the way explained by the email.

The President argues that, according to her reading of the e-mail, it implicates future Presidents as she does not believe that it was supposed to be for one term only, and therefore it should have been brought to the attention of at least herself and **the President-Elect**.

Mr Watson requests that **the President** circulate the email chain to members of the Standing Committee.

The President agrees to do so, and does.

The Treasurer considers it deeply concerning in light of the way that BSG membership has gone in the past, it has always been difficult to negotiate. The students have often appointed themselves as representatives, and he recalls the Fresher's Fair at which the President was also present, where an individual from BSG tried to negotiate a deal themselves on behalf of their whole class. He states that it is a problem to deal with individuals, and stresses that we must make it clear that we can only discuss deals with people endorsed by the institution. We cannot set a precedent where we just negotiate with individuals, because it could mean that there is nothing to stop a JCR treasurer then coming and trying to arrange a deal for a college, which is a dangerous precedent to set.

The Treasurer asks **the President** if she has responded to the e-mail.

The President says that she hasn't, because she wanted to ask the Standing Committee's position first. She does not agree with giving out spots and drinks receptions in this way, and notes it is a different thing entirely to giving slots for a particular event on an ad hoc basis. believes it is concerning to enter into quasi-contracts, such that an e-mail chain is.

The Returning Officer explains that the Rules allow the President to revoke this offer, and points out that the email does not specify a year's duration..

The President says that she first needs to know about any other correspondence that there has been.

The Treasurer argues that the e-mail follow-up in January suggests the expectation that it was a year-long agreement.

The President suggests that **the Ex-President**, *Worcester College*, perhaps produce some kind of report explaining this situation, and expresses surprise that he didn't follow up on this if it was in fact a personal favour.

Mr Watson asks **the President** for her stance on the situation as a whole.

The President says that this deal should not continue.

The Treasurer backs this up, explaining that there is limited space at drinks receptions, with capacity being 25 and rules allocating 10 places for members, not including members of committee who want to come.

The President explains concern at creating a kind of hierarchy within the membership with such deals.

Mr Cheesman enters the room at 16:14.

The Treasurer suggests that we come up with an interim reply so as not to leave the email with no response. He makes the suggestion that we must consider whether the Ex-President has broken any of Rule 71 (a)(i)(v) bringing the Union into disrepute, Rule 12, dereliction of duty, or Rule 22, seriously damaging the interests of the Union, and we must consider how to maintain our relationship with BSG.

The President explains that she intends to respond by making it clear we wish to maintain a relationship.

The Treasurer argues that we should not explain the issue in too much detail to BSG, so as not to 'air our dirty laundry'.

The Bursar explains that there has been previous discussion with BSG regarding deals made in the past in 2016.

The President expresses her wish to maintain the relationship with BSG because it is valuable for the Union.

Mr Watson asks whether we should get in touch with **the Ex-President** informally about this.

The President expresses that she does not think this is wise, but that he should be notified that a question has been asked.

The Senior Treasurer asks if there would be virtue in offering a deal such as that with the Saïd Business School.

The President notes the small membership at BSG, being only 20.

The Treasurer explains that in the past, the institution itself has not been interested in a deal, which was attempted in 2016 by Ex-Presidents Noah Lachs and Michael Li.

The President explains the current deal with the Saïd Business School, and mentions how sometimes they will assist with flights or speakers which is very valuable to the Union.

Mr Kirk questions the provisions in the Rules for discounts.

The Bursar says that a group of 10 or more, when an institution pays, there can be £10 off.

The Treasurer explains that with the temporary memberships, a reduction is at the Standing Committee's discretion, but this rule wouldn't apply to BSG.

The Bursar explains the necessity of the payment coming via the institution, not individual members.

Ms Athis points out that the email does not specify a year, and suggests this makes it easier for us to go back on this deal.

The President explains that the email implies a year.

Ms Athis suggests consulting with the Ex-President about this.

Mr Mediwaka questions the exact phrasing of the question to **the Ex-President**, and asks whether we are asking why and asking for all details.

The Treasurer adds that questioning something else that BSG might want be added to this question.

The President explains that at the moment, she will say that the deal is not possible, but encourage students to ballot, and highlight that we will keep in touch.

The Senior Librarian

Business of the The Senior Librarian

The Senior Librarian has no business.

Questions to the The Senior Librarian

There are questions to the The Senior Librarian.

The Senior Treasurer

Business of the The Senior Treasurer

The Senior Treasurer has no business.

Questions to The Senior Treasurer

There are no questions to The Senior Treasurer.

The Bursar

Business of The Bursar

The Bursar has no business.

Questions to The Bursar

There are no questions to The Bursar.

The Returning Officer

Business of The Returning Officer

The Returning Officer notes that according to Rule 32, he is required to fulfil the space for a Deputy Returning Officer that was created following his appointment as Returning Officer, and that this spot is to be filled by Thomas Laver, *Balliol College*.

The Returning Officer moves to ratify Mr Thomas Laver, Balliol College, as a Deputy Returning Officer pending a 48 hour objection period.

Seconded by the President-Elect.

nem. con.

The Returning Officer notes the rules change that had been sent round to the Standing Committee which he is bringing at the request of the Ex-Returning Officer, Alistair Graham. He explains that changes to Rule 34 are predominately clerical, but those to Rule 35 are more substantial, and so he wishes to pass Rule 34 this week and Rule 35 to next week.

The Returning Officer explains his rules changes: that Sections A is unchanged, Section B incorporates an interpretation by Ex-Returning Officer Cerys Smith, a list is enhanced to include more responsibilities for the Returning Officer and to list what is included in the nomination packs, required vacation days are clarified. He notes the change that specifies the time that the doors of the nomination room are closed, and a specific list of things that the Returning Officer must disqualify candidates for rather than using their discretion, since the RO can be required to undergo an investigation for Innocent Interference as discretion is personal to an individual.

The Treasurer suggests that some parts are oddly worded, for example, saying that the President-Elect must inform people of what happened in past meetings seems useful but would put an undue burden on the President-Elect.

The Returning Officer says that this part is from the Rules previously.

The Treasurer suggests the value in considering a change which we review the rest of the Rule, in order to harmonise the Rules with common practice.

Mr Watson asks whether there are provisions in the Rules for nominating speeches that, for any reason, do not appear in the minute book.

The Treasurer explains that in the case of imperfect records, the Returning Officer must give the benefit of the doubt to the candidate according to Roger Mortimer's Interpretation A1 from 1998.

The Returning Officer says that the interpretation would still stand.

The Treasurer-Elect highlights the issue of not being able to tell the nominated role for Treasurer, Secretary and Librarian because of the nomination fee.

The Returning Officer explains that it would only become a problem if the RO team could definitively not tell what position had been chosen.

The Treasurer highlights an issue that the ambiguity could allow electoral manipulation.

The Returning Officer states that a later clause makes such a thing illegal.

The President-Elect notes whether it is fair to disqualify people for not providing both a phone and an e-mail, and suggests that just one suffices.

The Returning Officer takes this point, but highlights the huge importance of being able to contact candidates, if for example they have not supplied their Nexus email addresses or have illegible handwriting, due to the potential severity of tribunal decisions.

The President jumps in to explain that there are speakers waiting downstairs, and that many people present must leave. She suggests that the meeting be adjourned so that there is more time to discuss this, and that people read the changes and note comments before next week.

The Returning Officer proposes a formal motion of thanks to Mr Nebojša Jovanović for his work the previous term.

Seconded by the President.

nem. con.

Questions to The Returning Officer

There are no questions to The Returning Officer.

The Chair of the Consultative Committee

Business of The Chair of the Consultative Committee

The Chair of the Consultative Committee has no business.

Questions to The Chair of the Consultative Committee

There are no questions to The Chair of the Consultative Committee.

The Access Officers

Business of The Access Officers

The Access Officers have no business.

Questions to The Access Officers

There are no questions to The Access Officers.

The Chair of the Debate Selection Committee

Business of The Chair of the Debate Selection Committee

The Chair of the Debate Selection Committee has no business.

Questions to The Chair of the Debate Selection Committee

There are no questions to The Chair of the Debate Selection Committee.

Changes to the Composition of this Committee

Mr Harry Samuels has replaced Mr Nebojša Jovanović as the Returning Officer.

Any Other Business

There is no other business.

Date of Next Meeting

- Monday 5th February 2018

The President closes this Ordinary Meeting of the Standing Committee at 16:38.

Signed,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'M Green', is written over a faint, light blue circular stamp.

Molly Greenwood
St. Hilda's College
Secretary