

4 MT18 - WK6 - Emergency debate

THW reintroduce corporal punishment

Chair: Mahi Joshi

Secretary: Raman Marshall

Start time: 19:48

End time: 20:15

Prop

Brian Wong 088339

- We fetishise authoritarianism
 - ↳ why not show children this from an early age.
 - ↳ Beating teaches children

Syeda S Abbas 094794

- It is effective & efficient, look to older generations

Samuel S Lin 071580

- Would redress inequalities
 - ↳ It has a universality that would set a good precedent

Daniel A Villar 093835

- Encourages obedience
- Beating witches is fun

Sultan F Al-kawari 094494

- Respect should NOT be given to kids who are deserving of corporal punishment
- It changes behaviour

Brian Wong 088339

- We already breach bodily autonomy
 - ↳ Taxes is a form of this
- Most effective way

Opp

Brian Wong 088339

- Bodily autonomy is paramount
 - ↳ Violated by corporal punishment
 - ↳ Recognises the individual as the basis of morality.
 - ↳ People don't have sex
 - ↳ Undermines your ability to be a citizen

Beatrice HF Barr 09455

- Not necessary for discipline
 - ↳ Treat people as individuals who have emotions instead
 - ↳ Suggests that teachers have absolute authority on kids

William F.M Atkinson 093942

- Corporal punishment puts people off education.

Benedict Bunting 094956

- It does not create respect which is what we wish to teach kids
- Being a child is about learning to be an adult so they should be treated differently.

John G Boyd 094700

- The teachers are already overworked
- Cost of buying all teachers belts too much.

Prop

Jane Beumont 095607

- Killing children is wise

Opp

Laura E Lonsdale 095852

- Violence is a breach of morality in and of itself, it's inexcusable

Brian Wang 088339

- Corporal Punishment makes the authority of teachers illegitimate.
- It discourages creativity which is what we want in kids.
- Encourages prejudice & loss of individuality

L. G. Greville Aches, Christ Church,
Librarian

- we should be ashamed of our schools
- state schools always inherently limited
- Prop must show that private schools hurt society at large
- Advantage of private school students is unfair
- Impact of education does not end at 18
- we accept 'old boys' culture as inherently superior
- students at Oxford often have foster syndrome
- Argument that we can improve access to private schools is conclusion to explain premises
- Private schools can only prosper at expense of state education

Nick Brown, Vardell,
Magdalen, Secretary

- Brogs discussion on to his own, excellent, state comprehensive
- 3 points:
 1. Clearly notion - "public disaster"
 2. Negative consequences of abolition
 3. Nuanced nature of debate not recognised by proposition
- Introductions: Aches, Harrop, Smyth, Brown
- Defines "public disaster", noting very high bar.
- Notes costs of abolition - £3.5 billion - and practical difficulties in doing so.
- Inequality in our system more than just public/private divide: state/grammar, many state types
- State schools students may have tutors, catchment area house prices may surpass private school fees

3. Andrew Harrop

- Private school students could have done well at state school
- 99% of difference between state and private explained by factors other than the state schools, according to study
- Private schools are public disaster because of impacts on others
- All children do better when there are bright children in the room
- Private
- Private schools entrench inequalities

1. Parvathy Canon

- All schools described as a disaster
- Private schools can support special needs students well
- British public schools are best in world; other countries praise them and want to copy model
- Private schools integrate success of south London
- 1/3 of nursery private school students go to Oxbridge
- Private schools started pioneering education for girls

6. Karin Smyth MP

- Bristol South has one of lowest private school intake in country
- Private schools do not foster values of community
- Individual private school places do not work; they cost in academic attainment - good being bought is a network
- Top judges, MPs, CEOs, journalists, Oscar winners, mostly from private schools
- Private schools lead to underachievement in state schools
- Private schools undermine social mobility
- 65% increase in state funding under Labour government, 8% fall under Tories
- Private schools offer glass doors to privilege and barriers to others

6. Alexandra Galloway, Sr. Asst. Mayor

- To private schools cannot be blamed for social mobility
- 5 generations needed in UK for poor family to reach national average; 2 in Scandinavia
- Prop have not shown that private schools further inequality
- Private schools now have many social mobility schemes
- Getting rid of private schools does not raise standards
- To value excellence and encourage students to study niche subjects (at private schools) is good
- Voting with prop. allows gov. to abdicate responsibility for social problems

7. Tim O'Brien

- Debates on education don't get enough airtime
- Our society is more plutocracy than meritocracy
- Argument that a private school place has saved gov. money and benefits society ignores education does not really exist
- Low cost private education is not a realistic goal
- 2-tiered education system undermining civil society
- Free private school networks antithetical to meritocracy
- Schools can be fantastic vehicles for social integration, but private school elitism defeats this goal
- Lack of state curriculum can lead to bad consequences

8. Dan Harris - Quinley

- No one can claim to know what is ~~at~~ good for a child like the child and family
- state will never be able to make up ~~in~~ ^{with} some resources as private sector into every child
- Oxford needs to keep private school 60/40 to maintain standards
- poor group would be poorer without its public school intake
- If companies hire private school children this is fine, they are just maximising profit
- Idea of getting rid of private schools is utopian and not practical
- choice is not a disaster, it's part of a free society

Signed

Nmm

NICK BROWN
MAUDALEN COLLEGE
SECRETARY

Chair: James Lanning, Treasurer
Secretary: Chaitanya Kediyal

After Debate - W6

PROP

Sandeep Singh, 094207
Overrepresentation of Put
School Kids

x

Zoe Fujiwara, 095380
Lottery of birth, reduces
inequality to ban put
Schools

x

Connie Bostock, 095292

Maintain inequality, thus
need to ban them

x

SUSannah Raymond-Barker,
094987

State schools suffer
austerity, while private
schools flourish.

Gap between private
and state school
kids widens

x

x

Sanjna Banerjee, 096275

Meritocracy is good

x

x

Lucy Nurcombe, 094986

Choice isn't available to the
most vulnerable

OPP

Cameron Bovell, 094586
Need to prevent
gentrification

x

Shining Zhao, 091020

Govt should support
private schools,
need for partnership

x

Olivia Leigh, 093883

Term public disaster
is too harsh

x

Rory Gaskin, 094980

Taught at a school
during their gap year,
state schools are
poor because of
govt. mismanagement
Parents should be
able to make the
best decisions for
their children

x

x

Harry Garty, 095861

Principle of liberty is
greater than equality
and social justice
Should be allowed to
build the best schools

Chair: James Lanning, Treasurer
Secretary: Chaitanya Kediyal

After Debate - W6

PROP

Sundeep Singh, 094207
Overrepresentation of Put
School Kids

— x —

Zoe Fujiwara, 095380
Lottery of birth, reduces
inequality to ban put
Schools

— x —

Connie Bostock, 095292

Maintain inequality, thus
need to ban them

— x —

SUSannah Raymond-Barker,
094987

State schools suffer
austerity, while private
schools flourish.

Gap between private
and state school
kids widens

— x —

— x —

Sanjna Banerjee, 096275

Meritocracy is good

— x —

— x —

Lucy Nurcombe, 094986

Choice isn't available to the
most vulnerable

OPP

Cameron Bovell, 094586
Need to prevent
gentrification

— x —

Shining Zhao, 091020

Govt should support
private schools,
need for partnership

— x —

Olivia Leigh, 093883

Term public disaster
is too harsh

— x —

Rory Gaskin, 094980

Taught at a school
during their gap year,
state schools are
poor because of
govt. mismanagement
Parents should be
able to make the
best decisions for
their children

— x —

— x —

Harry Garty, 095861

Principle of liberty is
greater than equality
and social justice
Should be allowed to
build the best schools

Pi

Private Business

Chair: Lanning

Secretary: Adam Wabon

BM: Proposes motion

AW: Oppose motion

~~SE~~:

BM: House be closed

also

Accept put forward

close 2254

Privat

from time to time: "Ayes this way," or "Noes this way," as the case may be.

3. To assist voters, if necessary, by saying each 'ten' on the card.

"Neutral," or words to that effect, marking off own side of the Barrier, except such as say "Neutral," or words to that effect, marking off

2. To count all members passing their Chair of the Debate to send in their cards

Our school	20	150
- States	30	160
limited	40	170
- Program	50	180
School	60	190
Large	70	200
- Adv	80	210
Students	90	220
- Info	100	230
not end	110	240
- we a	120	250
as inter	130	260
- students	140	270
to info		280
- Argue		
improve schools		
explain		

Private Schools Debate

15/11 20.15 (P.T.O.)

Abhishek Teller

- Private schools can only prosper at...

- Private...

Nick Brown, Magdalen, Secretary

- Brings discussion excellent, state of

3 points:

1. Clarify motion
2. Negative consequences
3. Nuanced nature recognised by proposals

Introductions: At this, I

Defines "public disaster"

Notes costs of abolition

real difficulties in doing so

equality in our system now

divide: state/grammar

ate schools students may have

have prices may surpass p

draw Harrop

NOES

10	150	168
20	160	
30	170	
40	180	
50	190	
60	200	
70	210	
80	220	
90	230	
100	240	
110	250	198
120	260	
130	270	
140	280	

Privat Schools Debate

15 November 2018 (P.T.O.)

Olivia Railton Teller

Debate

P.T.O.)

Teller

Nick Breeze
Magdalen, Sec
- Brings disc
excellent, state

- 3 points.

1. Clarify m

2. Negative a

3. Nuanced no
recognised by

- Introductions: A

- Defines "public
bar.

- Notes costs of
practical difficulties in

- Inequality in our s
data divide: state /

- State schools students
area house prices may

3. Andrew Harrop

Sylvain prem

- Private Schools can only