

Thurs 7th Feb - 7:34pm

HT19 Week 4

Emergency debate - THBT Grammar Schools promote Social Mobility

Chair: Jim Brennan

Minutes: Beth Molyneux

Sundeep G Singh 094207

- alternative is no schools

Spencer Cohen 094833

- too young to determine
- too much shaped by background

Noorie Abbas 094794 (Syeda S. Abbas)

- good examples of successful grammar school alumni

Amelia M Harvey 094504

- not a tool for social mobility

Josh Attwell 096394

- not just system but place
- equalities / inequalities based on wealth of area
- access to go higher even when underfunded

Alexander Hamblin 807377

- focus on academic
- 'creative' students not encouraged to go

Mathilda KGK Walters 096280

- ↑ grammar schools ↑ Cambridge entry
- provide way of access

David Graham 096363

- What is social mobility? - moving up/down
- Who does it affect?

- rich
- middle-class
- poor

- What do grammar schools do?
 - academic → university
 - less academic → polytechnic
- gives poor students a shot at top unis
- didn't affect rich

- movement dependent on academic success

Henry Deacon 095572

- set people on path to good job prospects (path to university)
(avoid poverty trap)
- high quality focused education
- talented people otherwise fall through net

Benedict

- relieve
- only c
- but n
- strea
- gran
- so m
- brigh

Cheng

- prob
- state

Shinin

- highly
- rich +

William

- nation
- Strati public
- No gr

Benedict

- no m
- when
- gram

Chase

- didn't
- cultur
- improv

Sam

- origin
- regiona
- Yuanha

Katerin

- who i
- region

Sultan

- regiona
- in them
- In prn

alexand

- provide
- No distri

Benedict Mee 808606

- o relies on assumption that the education is different
- o only difference is the other people in the class
- o but not necessarily true that lower ability students don't pull down
- o streaming systems can allow for benefits of same abilities
- o grammars reverse social mobility
- o so many other factors in exam
- o brighter students help less able students to get through / do well

Chengkai Xie 096678

- o problem isn't the school, it's the wealth of people who go to them
- o state funded system which allows us to help the most able

Shining Zhao 091020

- o highly selective - need to perform very well
- o rich + middle class can afford to give kids advantage

William Atkinson 093942

- o tuition argument putting cart before horse
- o stratification between those who can afford either public or house prices near good state schools
- o no grammar schools robs children of a chance

Benedict Mee 808606

- o no mechanism for people being robbed of a chance when not with people of same ability
- o grammar schools remove role models

Chase Koch 095133

- o didn't know what grammar schools were
- o allow access to good institutions of education
- o improves chances of social mobility

Sam Christmas 095045

- o originally universal - spectrum of opportunity
- o regional inequality promotes injustice

Yuanhao Li 094535

- o fairness allowed to flourish - means or no means

Katerina A Alban 095293

- o who it promotes mobility for
- o regional inequalities See people doing better than you

Sultan Kawari 094494

- o regional concentration - problem with number not with schools in themselves
- o in principle the * grammars bridge a gap between state private
- o equality - can lift out of poverty

Alexandria Galloway 087930

- o provide high quality education for those who can't afford to pay
- o no distractions or comprehensive

Benedict Mee 808606

- What does high quality education mean?
- Grammar schools funnel away best teachers
 - Comprehensive schools get worse
- Actively harms social mobility

Rachel C Muir 094765

- Ability to mix with wide range of people at comprehensive
- Grammars create divide
- Hard to overcome narrative of inferiority which is hard to overcome (in later life), rivalry enforced

Grace Beresford-Boan 096061

- Not just economic capital
- Middle class culture feeds into grammar schools
- Teacher expectation plays a huge role

Sulamaan Rahim 091418

- 2 strands
- What do we want education to do?
 - Further stratify or allow access
 - Grammar school narrative of working class who pull up should want to elevate everyone to same level
- Middle class white kids benefit most from grammars

Closed 20.17

Floor prize - Sultan Kawan

Public Business

Questions to the Librarian:

Mr Tim Brennan, St Peter's College asks:

1. Did the Librarian know about the invalid nature of the rules before raising the returning officer team?

The Librarian replies that they have known for some time, and in the context of an upcoming election felt it was important they were left in accordance with the rules.

2. When did the Librarian plan to tell the Returning Officer team about this?

The Librarian states that they had concerns about the invalidity of the rules with the upcoming election.

Mr Samuel Burns, St John's College asks:

3. Has the Librarian entered into an electoral pact in their election?

The Librarian replies that they have simply tried to honour the rules of the society with an election coming up.

Mr Stephen Horrell New College asks:

4. Does the Librarian not wish to respect something that was carried out and [by] the previous president?

The Librarian replies that they do not have the political respecting

This house believes Thatcher was a hero to the working class

1 Adithi Shenva (opening proposition)

- What are heroes ought to be?
 - ↳ Individual fighting for a cause with conviction
- Thatcher's legacy echoes into Blair and his followers

2 Mahi Joshi (opening opposition)

- Asks us to think about who are heroes were when we were growing up
- Main beneficiaries of right to buy were ~~lower~~ lower middle classes
 - ↳ 1 million homes ~~built~~ created a highly priced housing, not affordable
- Thatcher inherited an economy that was described as the 'Sickman of Europe'
- Collapse of national mining industry
 - ↳ National coal board galvanized under the miners strikes
- Before conclusion, points out that Thatcher was an ordinary person, and thus this might have been used as a defence of the proposition

3 Lord Michael Howard (proposition)

- Margaret Thatcher was herself a hero as she was exceptional
- Recall the state of the United Kingdom before Thatcher
 - ↳ the winter of discontent
- Thatcher had to make hard choices
 - ↳ most people benefited from her changes
 - ↳ over 1 million gained the dignity of home ownership
- Gives examples of the Unions and their stranglehold on workers
 - ↳ took Thatcher to lift the yoke of the unions
 - ↳ Coal mines and factories were grossly inefficient and losing money
- Peter Tatchell (opposition)

- Satire is not dead by reading this proposition
- Thatcher proceeded over greatest assault on workers
- Restricted people with their right to withdraw their labour
 - ↳ this is the basic human right we should all celebrate

5. Edwina Currie (proposition)

- opens by congratulating the two female speakers
- Thatcher was not perfect
- Our longest standing post-war prime minister, and this would not have been possible without the support of the working class
- Mr Scargill never took a vote
 - ↳ picket turned back
 - ↳ picketing was about intimidation
- patriotism that is proud of being British

6. Wayne David (opposition)

- Thatcher was the dominant personality of politics at the time
- miners strike about protecting job and protecting communities
 - ↳ Thatcher punitively closed the mines without any alternative
- Thatcher clawed back power from the state
 - ↳ resulted in huge problems without the pension system
- Huge inequality under Margaret Thatcher
 - ↳ Only 10% got richer under her policies
- Poll tax was a financial disaster
 - ↳ Created a more unequal society
- 'no such thing as society, only individuals and families'
 - ↳ yes there is

Other speeches:

P1. William Atkinson, Christ Church, 093942

- Thatcher and Labour party differ
 - ↳ are offered hope and opportunity

O1. Jojo Hester-Jones, Hertford, 094680

- Picketing example

P2. Sultan F. Al-Kawari, St Hilda's, 094496

- Joseph Schumpeter and 'creative destruction'
- Resources were redefined and now to make UK a world leader in financial services and manufacture

O2. Sulmaan P. Ralim, Wadham, 091418

- family anecdote
- proposition has talked about a homogeneous working class
 - ↳ just exceptionalism from the proposition

- P3. Eddie Fitt, Jesus, 091252
→ Exceptionalism raised aspirations for everyone, particularly women
→ winning Falklands as a tangible example of achievement
- Q3. Katie E Hartin, St Peter's, 096817
→ Thatcher assumed that because she could do it then
everyone could
↳ Not possible

1. Elliot Bromley, St Edmund Hall,
5th elected member of the Standing Committee
(closing proposition)

- Thatcher's privatisation spread wealth and ownership
- ↳ workers buying shares in these declining organisations
- ↳ changed attitudes
- Her compared to an President incredibly, even ironically
- Britain was the sick man of Europe and someone needed to take the medicine
- Society where people are free to make choices and take responsibility for those choices
- Thatcher threw off the chains of socialism
 - ↳ when people choose; they should freedom
- Don't think of Thatcher as someone of privilege but of freedom
- ordinary people cared deeply for

2. Ray Williams (closing opposition)

- Thatcher swept away generations of political orthodoxy
- 'war is peace' and sed quotes are right expect from 1984
- 'not for the working class themselves to chose their heroes'
- Not for the working class is not national, it is international
- Working class is speaking her mind
- cannot accuse her of speaking her mind
- Criticism of the Librarian and leaders, their resignation, as well as supporting an impeachment of the Librarian

Thursday 7th Jan

After debate

THBT Thatcher was a hero for the working classes

Postponed Private Business - 22.50.

Motion to Private Business Motion: Mr Hugh Bellamy, Director of Digital Operations, LMT

- Prohibited standing order changes at time of misselections
- Accepts Terence Kandler, Ex-RO's, motion [LMT's amendment]

No speakers in opposition

Motion passes

Questions to Officer

Mr Adam Watson, Ex-Standing Committee, Hertford College

Question on suppression of amendment, Mr Ray Williams. Rules cited were all on amendment.

President: Will make a written argue on the noticeboard.

Mr Watson: Who wrote the ruling? Did the LibDems? Do you know what a rider is? Did he issue it on the noticeboard so it could be more difficult to overturn? Was this an exercise in statutory construction? Did you desirably want to keep the president replies to each question that he will post a written reply on the noticeboard.

To the LibDems: Do you know who wrote the notice? Was it

Brendan McCracken, Oriel
Mr McCracken left the room - will respond on noticeboard in writing

Mr Horvat: Officers in charge cannot respond on noticeboard. ex-President: Does the president think his conduct is legitimate

New College (is this a subversion of principle of transparency?)

President: Will reply on the noticeboard.

Mr Horvat: Is there any question to which you would reply to in charge

President: Will reply on the noticeboard

Horvat to LibDems: re TT&G, pledged to 'stop enrage rules changes' + 'only'

It is important to state keep manifesto promises?

Display office not to make concrete steps towards this.

When will be launch slate page for these terms election?

What term election?

WE
HO
HO
in the
Mr Watson to P
Horvat to
er
Mr Thornton
Balliol College
Mr Hos

Mr Watson

The R

After debate
Chair: Sam

Joseph Ga

o role model
o not all we

Amy Greg

o look at work
o not enough to
Jeremy O

o willing to be

Chaitanya K

o no real

Benjamin Pe

o working gra

Grang M ou

o global work

• Kitsu K Egerton 096278

- benefit to country irrelevant
- harmful to working class

Rai Saad Khan 092312

- broke glass ceiling - feminism intersectional
- even unintentionally

Thomas Laver 090965

- Terrible influence on country
- reduced standing of working class in soc

Adam R Wilkinson-Hill 095162

- Welsh communities
- Stole livelihood & aspiration

Tianxin Zhang 096151

- class mobility is a myth
- shut down mines & removed livelihood

Minutes: Beth Molyneux

Debate closed at 11.13pm

8PM

Public Business Meeting - Thursday 14th February 2019

Questions to the President:

From James Beaumont proxy for the Ex-CC, Julian Kirk, Magdalen College

1. Why did the President fail to submit a timely budget in 0th week as ratified by Rule
The president responds that this has been done in meetings of the finance committee and Standing committee

2. Why has the President's agent, namely the Bursar, failed to present an account detailing the society's performance as required by Rule 63(c)?
The president responds that this has all been done and the accounts can be viewed in the general office

3. Can the President explain why his invitation to our Bill Dandye was rescinded?

4. Will the president apologise to members of the Society affected by the meeting
drive survey that carried out as President-Elect in Michaelmas Term 2018, which is in breach of the European Union's General Data Regulation?
The president responds that they have already discussed this issue with the standing committee

Were any
Wiley slate offers made?
How many people were told to advise RO might not
in the chamber Members get the answers for offers if they will not answer
Mr Watson to President: Did he ask RO for ceiling before ruling? President: will reply on
Honourable to library. Philosophical differences between Board/Bailey w.r.t. to
emergency standing 6th week # 17/18. Will he say what he opposed or not offer.
Mr Thomas Laver: Does he believe record of own voice? to the Ex-President, Stephen Horncastle
Balliol College to the Ex-President, Stephen Horncastle
Mr Horncastle: Amongst To uphold transparency: should make
university transparent.

Mr Watson, to President: Pres. received interpretation that question have to be
asked in the chamber

- Printed papers closed at 23.01

The President - Dominic Baad, DRO, Magdalene College

Dominic Baad

After debate
Chair: Sara Pube

23.07 - opened at

Joseph Gate 095298

- role model to climb ranks
- not all working class the same

Amy Gregg

- look at wording of motion
- not enough to say better world without here

Jeremy O Mbararia 095010

- willing to be short term villain to be long term hero

Chaitanya Kediyan 091298

- no real concern

Benjamin Penny 096714

- working class hero

Gang M Dut 094055

- global working class important to consider

Kofoworola O Braithwaite 095103

- created unions

Nikhil Shah 092865

- poll tax unfair to working class

Nils Lovegreen 098464

- Iron lady → Britain as world player

- patriotism + working class

Chin Wee Lee 091585

- pleased to see union used for debt purposes

- terrible for working class - wealth transfer from Northern to Southern

- not enough investment to ease decline

Prakrit Prasad 092374

- plan to privatise - NMS (end of) - lack of access

• Kitsu K Egerton 096278

- benefit to country irrelevant
- harmful to working class

Rai Saad Khan 092312

- broke glass ceiling - feminism intersectional
- even unintentionally

Thomas Laver 090965

- Terrible influence on country
- reduced standing of working class in soc

Adam R Wilkinson-Hill 095162

- Welsh communities
- Stole livelihood & aspiration

Tianxin Zhang 096151

- class mobility is a myth
- shut down mines & removed livelihood

Minutes: Beth Molyneux

Debate closed at 11.13pm

8PM

5
Public Business Meeting - Thursday 14th February 2019

Questions to the President:

From James Beaumont proxy for the Ex-CC, Julian Kirk, Magdalen College

1. Why did the President fail to submit a timely budget in 0th week as ratified by Rule 10th?
The president responds that this has been done in meetings of the finance committee and Standing committee

2. Why has the President's agent, namely the Bursar, failed to present an account detailing the society's performance as required by Rule 63(1)?
The president responds that this has all been done and the accounts can be viewed if you come to the general office

3. Can the President explain why his invitation to our Bill Dandye was rescinded?

4. Will the president apologise to members of the Society affected by the meeting drive survey that carried out as President-Elect in Michaelmas Term 2018, which is in breach of the European Union's General Data Regulation?
The president responds that they have already discussed this issue with the standing committee

believer Thatcher w
king Class

(Opening proposition)
we ought to be?

fighting for a cause w/
y echoes into Blair

(Opening opposition)
o think about who
are growing up

rials at right to buy were
homes to be created a h

erited, an economy that

Europe
national mining industry
coal board galvanise

can, points that Thatcher
ought have been used as

Michael Howard (proposition)

Thatcher was herself a hero as she was exceptional
state of the United Kingdom before Thatcher

her of discontent
d to make hard choices

people benefitted from her changes
million gained the dignity or home ownership
ples of the Unions and their stranglehold on workers
Thatcher, to certain were grossly inefficient and losing money

130
AYES

1	10	✓	150
2	20	✓	160
3	30	✓	170
4	40	✓	180
5	50	✓	190
6	60	✓	200
7	70	✓	210
8	80	✓	220
9	90	✓	230
10	100	✓	240
11	110	✓	250
12	120	✓	260
13	130	✓	270
14	140	4	280

..... Thatcher Debate
..... Beth Chamberlain Teller
..... 07/02/2019 (P.T.O.)

believer Thatcher w
g Class

(Opening Proposition)
ought to be?

Waiting for a cause with
echoes into Blair

(Opening opposition)

think about who
growing up

at right to buy were
told created a

an economy that

al mining industry
al board galvanise

point so that Thatcher
we been used as

Howard (proposition,

was herself a hero as she was exceptional
of the United Kingdom before Thatcher

discontent
make hard choices

blamed from her charges
the unions and their
stranglehold on workers

10	✓	150
20	✓	160
30	✓	170
40	✓	180
50	✓	190
60	✓	200
70	✓	210
80	✓	220
90	✓	230
100	✓	240
110	✓	250
120	✓	260
130	✓	270
140	✗	280

THB Thatcher was a hero Debate
for the working class

..... 07/02/2019.... (P.T.O.)

..... Varvara Reuter Teller