

*Ratified Minutes of*

THE ORDINARY MEETING OF THE DEBATE SELECTION COMMITTEE

6th Week Trinity Term 2019

Monday 3rd June

Morris Room, 09:30

**Present:** The Chair of the Debate Selection Committee (Lee Chin Wee, *Trinity College*), The Access, Communications and Equity Officer *cum* Deputy Returning Officer (Dominic Brind, *Magdalen College*), The DSC Deputy Secretary (Xavier Redmond, *Magdalen College*), The Standing Committee Delegate (Beatrice Barr, *St Peter's College*), The DSC Treasurer (Bryan Yan, *Keble College*), The Director of Training (Rachel O'Nunain, *Trinity College*)

**Attending:** The Ordinary Member (Jamie Johnson, *Pembroke College*)

**Late:** The Internals Officer (Brian Wong, *Wolfson College*)

**Apologies:**

**Absent:** The Externals Officer (Jason Xiao, *Wadham College*), The DSC Secretary *cum* Librarian (Sara Singh Dube, *St. Hugh's College*)

*DSC opens at 10:31*

**Apologies**

The CDSC has received apologies from the DSC Secretary *cum* Librarian for an immovable academic commitment, and from the Externals Officer for illness.

**Requests to pass Absences from Previous Meetings**

**The CDSC moves to past the Director of Training's absence from the previous week's meeting of DSC due to an immovable academic commitment.**

Seconded by the Access, Communications and Equity Officer *cum* Deputy Returning Officer .

*The motion passes nem. Con.*

**Matters arising from Previous Minutes**

## **Ratification of Minutes**

### **Business of the CDSC**

#### Decisions on Oxford Schools Deputy Convenors

The CDSC explains that Mr Luke Dunne and Ms Staša Kučer have applied to be Deputy Convenors of Oxford Schools. He asks what role they will each do within the convening team.

The Access, Communications and Equity Officer *cum* Deputy Returning Officer suggests that their roles are delegated within the convening team. This could take the form of one person working on admin, with the other two working on the representation of the convening team to external teams as well as to Oxford debating.

The CDSC proposes that these Deputy Convenor positions are passed, and that DSC should subsequently liaise with Mr Oliver Tushingham.

#### **The CDSC moves to appoint Mr Luke Dunne and Ms Staša Kučer as Deputy Convenors of Oxford Schools.**

Seconded by the Access, Communications and Equity Officer *cum* Deputy Returning Officer .

*The motion passes nem. con.*

#### Changes to Standing Order H9

The CDSC explains that Standing Order H8 stipulates that those chosen to speak or judge at EUDC must have either competed in a pro am or completed four weekly squads training sessions. Standing Order H9, however, only indicates that this is a requirement for those selected to *speak* at EUDC. He asks if this is an oversight.

The Director of Training says that she wrote the relevant Standing Order, and that this was certainly an oversight.

The CDSC suggests removing the clauses from H9, as H9 only modifies H8 selection criteria.

The Access, Communications and Equity Officer *cum* Deputy Returning Officer says that this seems correct, and avoids a situation in which certain individuals are eligible only to trial for worlds.

The CDSC says that he will bring the proposal in this form to TSC.

#### WUDC Trial Date

The CDSC proposes moving WUDC trials to Sunday of Second Week, in order that welcome drinks can first be held in First Week.

The DSC Treasurer asks if trials have always taken place on Sunday of Week 2.

The CDSC agrees that this is usually the case, though the Ex-CDSC (Andrew Seow, *Lincoln College*) may have held them in First Week.

### Helper points

The DSC Deputy Secretary notes that nobody has got in touch with him about helper points.

### Oxford IV Dates

The CDSC explains that Michaelmas Term 2019 at Oxford begins a week earlier later than usual, meaning that the Oxford and Cambridge IVs will clash this year. He proposes moving the IV a week earlier, and has checked this with every CA and the President-elect. The only CA who is unable to attend a week earlier is Ms Emma Lucas. He asks whether the IV should be moved a week earlier and an alternative CA found, or if DSC should attempt to convince Cambridge to move the Cambridge IV.

The DSC Deputy Secretary proposes moving the IV rather than likely losing half the attending teams.

The Director of Training agrees, suggesting it is the fault of Oxford that the dates clash.

The CDSC explains that it is the University's fault that term dates are at an unusual time in Michaelmas. The Director of Training notes that she told the CDSC this. The CDSC apologises for mansplaining the situation to the Director of Training.

The CDSC adds that Ms Emma Lucas has proposed alternative CAs: Lisa Schallenberg and Roel Becker. He says that both are good picks, though Lucia Arce should also be considered.

The Director of Training notes that Ms Schallenberg has not spoken at a university level for around a year. Her last big CA job was Oxford Wom\*n's in 2016. This might be an issue as she will struggle to pull international judges and teams.

The DSC Deputy Secretary adds that her markets are WSDC and Europe, which is not enough.

The CDSC proposes asking Ms Arce first.

The DSC Treasurer agrees, suggesting that Mr Becker should not be asked first as a female CA should not ideally be replaced by a male one. The DSC Deputy Secretary agrees.

The CDSC agrees. He proposes asking Ms Arce, followed by Ms Schallenberg, followed by Mr Becker.

The DSC Treasurer asks when the IV will be moved to. The CDSC responds that it will be moved a week earlier in term, which corresponds to the same dates as usual. The Access, Communication and Equity Officer explains that this is Friday and Saturday of Fourth Week.

The DSC Deputy Secretary asks whether Oxford Wom\*n's will also be moved. The CDSC responds that it will.

## **Business of the DSC Deputy Secretary**

### Increasing the number of Convenor Applications

The DSC Secretary proposes three measures for convincing debaters to apply to convene, particularly to convene Oxford Schools.

The first proposed measure is treating convening Oxford Schools regional rounds as a pathway to convening tournaments later. He notes that convening regional rounds is often perceived as an annoyance, which takes a lot of work but conveys little prestige. He proposes that Schools convenors convey the

message that regional round convening acts as an extended interview for Oxford Schools convening to regional convenors.

The CDSC proposes that this is applied not just to applying to convene Schools, but to convening generally.

The DSC Treasurer agrees that this would make this an easier sell, as convening Oxford Schools does not seem to be particularly popular.

The Deputy DSC Secretary adds that it is not the case that this has not been happening, but that it should be formalised.

The Director of Training further notes that regional round convening should be treated simply as a test of competence and organisational skills.

The DSC Deputy Secretary continues with his second proposal, that DSC should informally tap people on the shoulder who they think should apply for schools. He explains that this happens already, but that those who are not asked feel alienated and become even less inclined to apply. As such, he proposes tapping *everyone* on the shoulder.

The CDSC adds that since there are eight members of DSC, each person messaging 3 potential applicants could have a large reach.

The DSC Deputy Secretary adds that many of those who aren't heavily involved in debating in Michaelmas or Hilary would be competent, so should be asked. The CDSC notes that Mr Dunne and Ms Kučer were only convinced to apply to be Deputy Convenors because members of DSC asked around.

The DSC Deputy Secretary continues, saying that his third proposal is that Schools Convenors do not post on the Oxford Debaters page panicking, as this scares people out of the job. While he commends it as an *effective* tactic, it is perhaps not productive in the long term. The CDSC agrees.

The DSC Deputy Secretary adds that certain tactics, such as changing the Oxford Debaters cover photo and posting photos from trains back from regional rounds, have been very effective.

The Director of Training explains that having made a squads feedback survey, squad coaches and debaters have found squads a bit of a task. She proposes that those in this room and debaters more widely should be careful with their tone.

### **Business of the Access, Communications and Equity Officer *cum* Deputy Returning Officer**

The Access, Communications, and Equity Officer explains that Deputy Convenors are not in the Standing Orders for helper point purposes.

*The Internals Officer enters at 09:57*

The Access, Communications and Equity Officer *cum* Deputy Returning Officer proposes that the DSC should be able to appoint Deputy Convenors where they see fit. He asks how many helper points this should be worth.

The DSC Deputy Secretary proposes giving a few fewer helper points than for convenors.

The Access, Communications and Equity Officer *cum* Deputy Returning Officer suggests making the provision 6-10 helper points.

The DSC Deputy Secretary notes that the rule is quite new, so this should be flexible. Over two terms, a deputy convenor could easily do more work than an IV convenor.

The CDSC supports this. Rather than having separate lines for each type of deputy convenor in the rules, the points provision should be flexible. He asks if the lower end of the points range sits at the higher end of the Wom\*n's Convenor helper points provision.

The Access, Communications and Equity Officer *cum* Deputy Returning Officer notes that Wom\*n's is worth 6-8 helper points.

The DSC Deputy Secretary suggests that Wom\*n's convening should be worth 6-10.

The CDSC explains that Wom\*n's requires managing fewer teams. However, he proposes adding in separate clauses per tournament. He asks for proposals before the next meeting

### **Business of the DSC Treasurer**

The DSC Treasurer announces that the current expenses total is £640.48, for EUDC travel, School's stash, and wristbands. He asks what the EUDC travel expenses cap is.

The CDSC replies that it is £300.

The DSC Treasurer notes that Mr Oskar Sherry has spent less than £200 on EUDC travel. The Director of Training responds that he will be working in Italy during summer, making it cheaper.

The CDSC notes that Schools expenses are late.

The Access, Communications and Equity Officer *cum* Deputy Returning Officer responds that the Schools expenses are not personal.

The CDSC notes that they were incurred on 1st March. The DSC Treasurer responds that the wristband expenses were rejected the first time. The DSC Deputy Secretary is surprised by this. The CDSC explains that an explanation was requested through the Ex-DSC Secretary (Rosa Thomas, *St Anne's College*). The DSC Deputy Secretary says that he never received such a request.

The Access, Communications and Equity Officer *cum* Deputy Returning Officer offers to explain the wristband situation instead. In consultation with the House Manager, they felt that non-paper wristbands would be less likely to fall off or be doctored. Additionally, in terms of prestige, Oxford Schools should stand out as a premium brand and superior to other tournaments. He notes that this was important for boosting the brand of schools.

The DSC Treasurer says that he sees the logic, but that the wristbands were nevertheless a waste of funds.

The CDSC agrees that the concerns were important but that the costs were more so.

The DSC Treasurer proposes giving DSC a greater view over the budgets for certain tournaments.

The Access, Communications and Equity Officer *cum* Deputy Returning Officer disagrees, saying that so many marginal decisions are made by convenors can increase small costs up to around £200. He asks whether it is legitimate for convenors to run decisions such as food choice past DSC.

The DSC Deputy Secretary proposes giving convenors clear profit targets, and trust them to achieve them.

The CDSC adds that it is frustrating to be micromanaged.

The DSC Treasurer says that there is a difference between micromanagement and looking at expenditure on a broad basis. This encompasses questions such as how much is being spent on food or alcohol overall.

The CDSC suggests that convenors bring budgets to DSC once they have been projected.

The Access, Communications and Equity Officer *cum* Deputy Returning Officer notes that there has been an increased level of management by DSC of convenors in recent years. The DSC Deputy Secretary responds that running the budget by DSC is a low bar. The Director of Training responds that there is precedence for this conflict.

The CDSC agrees. On the issue of stash expenses, he suggests it is probably acceptable not to fine the DSC Deputy Secretary as long as OrgComm aren't fined in the future.

The DSC Treasurer suggests that Ms Olivia Railton may have been fined for Wom\*n's.

The DSC Treasurer continues that convenors have been fined multiple times in the past in this situation.

The DSC Deputy Secretary suggests that DSC fine him, but insert a provision in the rules not to fine in future. DSC agrees not to fine for wristband expenses.

**The DSC Treasurer moves to pass DSC expenses of £615.48.**

Seconded by the Access, Communications and Equity Officer *cum* Deputy Returning Officer .

*The motion passes nem. con.*

**Business of the President**

No business.

**Business of the Standing Committee Delegate**

No business.

**Business of the Director of Training**

The Director of Training announces that she plans to make a pro am tracker on the Google Drive.

**Business of the Externals Officer**

In the absence of the Externals Officer, the CDSC says that teams need to be selected for the Trinity Open. He notes his disappointment that only two people have applied: Kit Mercer (Pro) and Caitlin French (Am).

*DSC moves in camera at 10:11*

*The Ordinary Member (Jamie Johnson) leaves the room at 10:11*

*DSC moves out of camera at 10:13*

*The Ordinary Member (Jamie Johnson) re-enters the room at 10:13*

The CDSC says that the Externals Officer has asked him to open applications for two teams and one judge for the Durham Open. He will open application in the week's DA.

### **Business of the Internals Officer**

The Internals Officer flags that internals for the following year should be organised over summer.

### **Any Other Business**

#### EUDC Eligibility Clause

The DSC Treasurer returns to the topic of eligibility for EUDC and WUDC trials. He says that the original intention was to have two provisions (Pro-Ams and training days) not so that individuals could actively choose, but for those for whom it would be impossible to fulfil the Pro-Am requirement. Given the lack of applications to the Trinity Open, he suggests rephrasing the clause for future batches.

The DSC Deputy Secretary flags that he too had a prior commitment which made it impossible for him to attend the Trinity Open.

The Director of Training proposes that after the selection of EUDC teams, participants are given the chance to look at their calendars and check whether they are able to do prep competitions. Those wishing to do internal training days would then have to provide DSC with a reason for this.

The CDSC agrees, saying he should have done so this term.

The Director of Training suggests putting this provision in the Standing Orders.

The CDSC asks DSC to send him proposals for this provision.

#### ICYD

#### **The CDSC moves to grant the Ordinary Member (Mr Jamie Johnson) speaking rights.**

Seconded by the Access, Communications and Equity Officer *cum* Deputy Returning Officer .

*The motion passes nem. con.*

The Ordinary Member says that of the societies he has contacted, very few are willing to host ICYD rounds due to past experience. He proposes trying smaller societies who have not been asked before, so who do not have negative experiences with ICYD.

The Ordinary Member says he has three favours to ask of DSC. The first is that members of DSC, particularly those with international connections, ask societies to host ICYD rounds.

The Access, Communications and Equity Officer *cum* Deputy Returning Officer asks whether Oxford should take on more work in order to make more profit from ICYD.

The Ordinary Member responds that it may be difficult to make a profit given that societies are given money per team.

The Access, Communications and Equity suggests that Oxford run the Oxford and London rounds. The Ordinary Member says that he is unsure, as this would depend on the deals that Oxford could get. Last year, for instance, Cambridge made a loss on the LSE round due to train fares despite their relative proximity to London.

The Director of Training asks whether it might be a good idea to take ICYD back permanently. She suggests that ICYD makes a loss because the average school team does not understand that it switches between Oxford and Cambridge from year to year.

The CDSC suggests that he is not the best person to negotiate.

The Access, Communications and Equity proposes that Oxford first run an excellent ICYD in order to prove that it should be taken back.

The Director of Training notes that Cambridge are losing money on ICYD, so Oxford should perhaps suggest taking it back for five years and giving Cambridge a cut of the profit of the rounds they would otherwise have run.

The CDSC suggests that the profit would still increase over five years even if a proportion were given to Cambridge.

The Access, Communications and Equity proposes waiting until after this year.

The DSC Treasurer asks if ICYD is at all financially viable.

The CDSC says that it is.

The Ordinary Member proposes enlarging the Oxford ICYD round. He suggests redirecting some London teams.

The CDSC says that London teams may not come to Oxford.

The CDSC adds that there is currently no ICYD requirement, as helper points are given for participation. He suggests giving two points for ICYD participation.

The DSC Treasurer is unconvinced.

The Ordinary Member makes his third point, that ICYD should be hosted on Saturday of 1st Week rather than Saturday of 0th Week, due to collections.

The Director of Training asks how this would correspond with EUDC trials. She suggests putting EUDC trials on Sunday of 0th Week.

The CDSC asks DSC to inform him of which societies people would like to reach out to.

*The CDSC closes the meeting at 10:30*