

The Ratified Minutes of
THE ORDINARY MEETING OF THE STANDING COMMITTEE
8th Week Hilary Term 2019
4th March 2019
TV Room, 16:00

Present:

The Librarian (Mr Brendan McGrath, *Oriel College*), **The Treasurer** (Ms Amy Gregg, *Somerville College*), **The Secretary** (Mr Nicholas Leah, *Lincoln College*), **The Elected Member** (Mr Chaitanya Kediya, *Exeter College*), **The Elected Member** (Mr Shining Zhao, *University College*), **The Elected Member** (Ms Mahi Joshi, *Trinity College*), **The Elected Member** (Mr Jim Brennan, *St Peter's College*), **The Elected Member** (Mr Elliot Bromley, *St Edmund Hall*), **The Elected Member** (Ms Olivia Leigh, *Keble College*), **The Elected Member** (Mr Rai Saad Khan, *Christ Church*), **The President-Elect** (Ms Genevieve Athis, *Christ Church*), **The Librarian-Elect** (Ms Sara Dube, *St Hugh's College*), **The Treasurer-Elect** (Mr Charlie Coverman, *Brasenose College*), **The Ex-President** (Mr Stephen Horvath, *New College*)

Attending:

The Senior Treasurer (Mr Stephen Dixon, *Downing College, Cambridge*), **The Senior Librarian** (Mr Sean Power, *Oriel College*), **The Bursar** (Mrs Lindsay Warne), **The Returning Officer** (Mr Liam Frahm, *Jesus College*), **The Chair of the Debate Select Committee** (Mr Chin Lee Wee, *Trinity College*), **The Access Officer** (Ms Amelia Harvey, *Kellogg College*), Mr Troels Boesen, *St John's College*, Mr Charlie Willis, *Wadham College*, Mr Nebojša Jovanović, *St Peter's College*, Ms Louise Kandler, *Lady Margaret Hall*

Absent:

The President (Mr Daniel Wilkinson, *Oriel College*), **The Chair of the Consultative Committee** (Mr James Dix, *Christ Church*), **The Access Officer** (Ms Amelia Harvey, *Kellogg College*),

The Treasurer in the President's absence opens the meeting at 16:09

Apologies

The Treasurer notes that the President has received no apologies.

Requests to Pass Absences from Previous Meetings

The Treasurer moves that the Standing Committee pass Ms Olivia Leigh's absence from the 7th week ordinary meeting of the Standing Committee due to an immovable academic commitment with good reason

Seconded by the Librarian.

The motion passes nem. con.

The Treasurer moves that the Standing Committee pass the Chair of the Consultative Committee's absence from the 7th week ordinary meeting of the Standing Committee due to an immovable academic commitment with good reason

Seconded by the Librarian.

The motion passes nem. con.

The Treasurer moves that the Standing Committee pass the Librarian's absence from the 7th week ordinary meeting of the Standing Committee due to a pressing and extraordinary engagement with good reason

Seconded by the Librarian.

The motion passes nem. con.

The Treasurer moves that the Standing Committee pass the Returning Officer's absence from the 7th week ordinary meeting of the Standing Committee due to society business of paramount importance with good reason

Seconded by the Librarian.

The motion passes nem. con.

Matters Arising from Previous Minutes

The Elected Member (Mr Chaitanya Kediya, *Exeter College*) discusses the event feedback form that went live last week.

The Secretary states that they will discuss this in their business.

Ratification of Minutes

The Treasurer moves that the Standing Committee ratify the minutes from the 6th week Hilary Term 2019 Ordinary Meeting of the Standing Committee

Seconded by Mr Shining Zhao.

The motion passes nem. con.

The Treasurer moves that the Standing Committee ratify the minutes from the 7th week Hilary Term 2019 Ordinary Meeting of the Standing Committee

Seconded by Mr Shining Zhao.

The motion passes nem. con.

The President

Business of the President:

Press requests

The Treasurer notes that they have received no details about press requests. **The Librarian** notes that neither have they.

The President-Elect states that the Standing Committee have not heard about the President's press requests for two weeks. They add that this is not acceptable.

The President-Elect propose that the Standing Committee mandate the President to give details of their press requests from the last two weeks

Seconded by the Treasurer-Elect.

The motion passes with 8 votes in favour (The Treasurer, The Secretary, The Ex-President, The President-Elect, The Librarian-Elect, The Treasurer-Elect, Mr Jim Brennan, Ms Mahi Joshi) and 0 votes against, including 1 abstention (The Librarian)

Financial reform

The Treasurer notes that the President is not here to discuss their financial reform change,

The Returning Officer states that they have a question for the President. They ask if it is possible to bring them back to answer certain questions. **The Treasurer** replies that the President is probably busy with an event.

The Returning Officer asks how the Brexit debate is coming along. **The Treasurer** replies that a hard working team is currently sending out invitations in the President's Office.

The Returning Officer asks how many speakers have been confirmed. **The Treasurer** replies only two: Nigel Farage and Lord Adonis.

The Returning Officer notes that they have heard that those two speakers are currently positioned on the same side of the debate.

The Senior Treasurer interjects questioning why they would have two speakers who naturally oppose each other on the same side.

The President-Elect asks if they can mandate the President to position these speakers on different sides of the debate.

The Treasurer replies that the Standing Committee cannot mandate the President to do this. **The Returning Officer** affirms this.

The Treasurer states that it is not inherently unreasonable to expect these two speakers to be on different sides of the debate. However, they note that when speakers are on the same side of a debate, but with very differing viewpoints, this can produce an excellent debate.

The Returning Officer moves that the Standing Committee grant Mr Nebojša Jovanović speaking rights for the duration of the meeting

Seconded by the Treasurer.

The motion passes nem. con.

Mr Nebojša Jovanović states that the Standing Committee cannot mandate the President to do something, but they can informally recommend that they take a particular course of action.

The Ex-President notes that they have four points to make on this issue.

First: **The Ex-President** comments on the unfortunate lack of attendance from the President at this term's meetings of the Standing Committee. They note that they never missed a Monday afternoon meeting last term. They add that whilst it is good that the society has many events, the President's absence is a matter of serious concern. They further add that the governance of the society should take priority over speaker events with very small numbers in attendance. They

note that the 4pm meeting time on a Monday is generally seen as a good time for the meeting though it could be changed.

Second: **The Ex-President** asks a philosophical question directed at the President. They ask why it is conceptually different to invite Steve Bannon than Nigel Farage.

Third: **The Ex-President** notes that the President-Elect brought about a motion last term, which meant that Presidents had to inform that, the Standing Committee about the visit of controversial speakers. They add that people only discovered that Nigel Farage was speaking from Lord Adonis's tweet at the weekend. They further add that by not informing the Standing Committee of Nigel Farage's visit the President has committed a serious dereliction of duty.

Fourth: **The Ex-President** agrees with the Ex-Returning Officer that the Standing Committee cannot pass a formal mandate, but rather they can pass an informal recommendation to the President. They add that some people know what the motion is, but there is no rule that prevents the disclosure of the motion.

The Treasurer replies that even if no rule exists about motion disclosure, the committee should not undermine the debate and risk it being released to the press.

The Treasurer adds they are wholly on board with the informal recommendation as a better alternative to formally mandating the President to act.

The Ex-President wishes to congratulate the President on securing a speaker as eminent as Nigel Farage for the Brexit debate.

The Returning Officer reads out Rule 42(c)(ii) that the President has to disclose a week before an event *in camera* if there were going to be controversial speakers.

The Librarian notes that speaking meetings are different to debates.

The Ex-President adds that since no public business meeting was called, the Brexit debate either has to be classified as a speaking meeting or an informal parliamentary debate.

The Librarian notes that it sounds like the committee needs a ruling on this.

The Treasurer says that the President has been in conversation with Nigel Farage for a while, but understands that he has not been firmly confirmed as a speaker until recently.

The Secretary states that they have been working on the organisation of the Brexit for two weeks now. They add that the President and the Brexit debate organisation team were waiting to see which other speakers were available on the Thursday before confirming Nigel Farage for the debate on Friday, as this was the only date that Nigel Farage was available to speak.

The President-Elect notes that this issue was flagged in first week because the President did not give notice of the visit of Marion Maréchal Le Pen. They add that this is a clear example of a speaking meeting. They further add they do not think an informal recommendation is enough as the President has displayed a constant refusal to come to meetings of the Standing Committee. They note that one of the most exciting things about the Presidential Chair is the governance of the society

The Treasurer notes that the President-Elect makes a fair point about the President's absence. They add that the Standing Committee is conflating informing the committee about controversial speakers and the two speakers being on the same side.

The President-Elect notes that when they asked the President why Nigel Farage and Lord Adonis are on the same side of the debate, the President replied ‘because its funny.’ They add that these speakers both need to be held to account and student speakers will not be sufficient to do that. They suggest that the motion is changed to enable the two speakers to be positioned on different sides of the debate. They further add that they do not know what the format of the debate will be.

The Secretary states that it is very important that the Brexit debate is as good and interesting as it can be. They note that it is seminal moment in the history of the United Kingdom and the debate needs to be executed well. They add the Standing Committee has a duty to ensure this is the case for the benefit of the society’s membership.

The Returning Officer states that the Librarian thinks that there needs to be a ruling. They ask why the Standing Committee has not been informed about the meeting,

The Librarian replies that they imagine it will take the format of an informal parliamentary debate.

The Secretary asks the Bursar if they have anything to add.

The Bursar notes that they have received a number of calls from the Oxfordshire police service expressing their concern about the security risk with Nigel Farage speaking on Friday.

The Treasurer suggests that the Standing Committee splits two issues: one about the arrangement of speakers and one about the motion.

Mr Nebojša Jovanović notes that Rule 13 concerns the President’s mandate to decide on the motions for the debates.

The Returning Officer moves that the Standing Committee recommend to the President that Mr Nigel Farage and Lord Andrew Adonis are positioned on opposite sides of the Brexit debate on the Friday of 8th week

Seconded by the President-Elect.

The motion passes nem. con.

The Secretary notes that they coined both potential motions for the debate in a meeting with the President and the Chief of Staff last week. They suggest that the motion is changed to ‘This House Believes That Our Grandchildren Will Thank Us For Brexit.’

The Standing Committee express universal approval towards this motion suggested by the Secretary.

The Returning Officer moves that the Standing Committee recommend to the President that they change the motion of the Brexit debate to ensure that Mr Nigel Farage and Lord Andrew Adonis are positioned on opposite sides of the Brexit debate on het Friday of 8th week

Seconded by the Secretary.

The motion passes nem. con.

The Bursar notes that the President now has to organise all of the security and logistics issues for the event as nothing has been done so far.

The Returning Officer moves that the Standing Committee recommend to the President that they begin and follow through on security and logistics preparations for the Brexit debate on Friday

Seconded by Mr Jim Brennan.

The motion passes nem. con.

Ms Louise Kandler highlights the costs of the Steve Bannon event last term. They note that security issues come with financial considerations.

The Treasurer notes that the President should begin to make preparations for the event on Friday now.

The Senior Treasurer notes that the society is entitled to have Nigel Farage and the society must not bow down to the police. They add that the costs are in the society's hands.

The Bursar notes that the society would have to pay for its own security. They add that they will need get a full catering team together for Friday night, which is very short notice.

The President-Elect adds that the President needs to take into account potential security costs into their budget for the term.

The Treasurer notes that the Standing Committee could authorise this expenditure.

The Returning Officer asks Mr Troels Boesen if that is something they and their new powers can do.

The Treasurer-Elect moves that the Standing Committee grant Mr Troels Boesen speaking rights for the duration of the meeting

Seconded by the Treasurer.

The motion passes nem. con.

Mr Troels Boesen states that the current rules need to be overhauled. They add that President has got lucky on this occasion.

The Bursar says that they thought it was very clear in the rules about expenditure. **Mr Troels Boesen** replies that this section of the rules is defined by Rule 62(e). They add that it is not very clear about discretionary expenditure.

The Treasurer asks if anything one has any other business.

Questions to the President:

There are no questions to the President

The Librarian

Business of the Treasurer:

Online Noticeboard

The Librarian states that they will speak to the President-Elect about the online noticeboard.

The President-Elect notes that this is more of a Michaelmas Term project as the Trinity Term vacation is much shorter. They add it depends if Mr Hugh Bellamy is staying on the committee as the Director of Digital Operations.

The Treasurer moves that the Standing Committee grant Mr Hugh Bellamy speaking rights for the duration of the meeting

Seconded by the Treasurer-Elect.

The motion passes nem. con.

Mr Hugh Bellamy says that they are ecstatic to stay on the committee.

The Bursar notes that there could be serious implications with the online noticeboard. **Mr Hugh Bellamy** asks the Bursar if those implications related to the General Data Protection Regulation. **The Bursar** replies yes they do.

Mr Hugh Bellamy states that there will be ways to overcome this. They add that more information will be going on the website and the app. They further add that the society needs a system with track changes. They note that a big problem with the physical noticeboard is that people take things off the noticeboard.

The Librarian says that they are happy with Mr Hugh Bellamy's ideas and look forward to working with them.

Questions to the Librarian:

There are no questions to the Librarian

The Treasurer

Business of the Treasurer:

DSC expenses

The Treasurer notes that the Bursar and the Finance Committee have looked over the Debate Selection Committee expenses.

The Treasurer moves that the Standing Committee pass DSC expenses to the value of £285.70, as recommended by the Finance Committee

Seconded by Mr Chaitanya Kediya.

The motions passes nem. con.

Facilities fee

The Treasurer notes that people have to pay £9 up front for the printing of the term card. They say that a few people have said that they have received emails about the suspension of their membership for not paying this facilities fee.

The Bursar tells that the Treasurer that they could have asked about this in the office.

Graduate Access Membership

The Treasurer provides an update for the Standing Committee about the Graduate Access Membership. They note that they have received responses from twelve to fifteen colleges with varying levels of enthusiasm. The colleges have said that they could provide some kind of letter. They add that the access team will have a look at this now, but they are pleased with the broad positivity of the responses.

Questions to the Treasurer:

There are no questions to the Treasurer

The Secretary

The Business of the Secretary:

Event Suggestions Form and Event Feedback Form

The Secretary notes that the event suggestions form has been successfully circulated and received a number of responses. They add that the President and President-Elect have access to it.

The Secretary states that they will give the event feedback form greater thought over the vacation and work with the President-Elect to implement it for the start of Trinity term.

The Elected Member (Mr Jim Brennan, *St Peter's College*) notes that a number of their friends have been asking about who receives the event suggestions from. **The Secretary** replies that it can be seen by the President and the President-Elect. They add that they include this information on the form.

The President-Elect states that they can just edit the form.

The Secretary notes they have no further business and it has been a pleasure to serve as the Secretary this term.

Questions to the Secretary:

There are no questions to the Secretary

Mr Chaitanya Kediya

Business of Mr Chaitanya Kediya:

Mr Chaitanya Kediya has no business

Questions to Mr Chaitanya Kediya:

There are no questions to Mr Chaitanya Kediya

Mr Shining Zhao

Business of Mr Shining Zhao:

Mr Shining Zhao has no business

Questions to Mr Shining Zhao:

There are no questions to Mr Shining Zhao

Ms Mahi Joshi

Business of Ms Mahi Joshi:

Ms Mahi Joshi has no business

Questions to Ms Mahi Joshi:

There are no questions to Ms Mahi Joshi

Mr Jim Brennan

Business of Mr Jim Brennan:

Mr Jim Brennan has no business

Questions to Mr Jim Brennan:

There are no questions to Mr Jim Brennan

Mr Elliot Bromley

Business of Mr Elliot Bromley:

Mr Elliot Bromley has no business

Questions to Mr Elliot Bromley:

There are no questions to Mr Elliot Bromley

Ms Olivia Leigh

Business of Ms Olivia Leigh:

Ms Olivia Leigh has no business in their absence

Questions to Ms Olivia Leigh:

There are no questions to Ms Olivia Leigh in their absence

Mr Rai Saad Khan

Business of Mr Rai Saad Khan:

Mr Rai Saad Khan has no business

Questions to Mr Rai Saad Khan:

There are no questions to Mr Rai Saad Khan

The President-Elect

Business of the President-Elect:

The President-Elect has no business

Questions to the President-Elect:

There are no questions to the President-Elect

The Librarian-Elect

Business of the Librarian-Elect:

The Librarian-Elect has no business

Questions to the Librarian-Elect:

There are no questions to the Librarian-Elect

The Treasurer-Elect

Business of the Treasurer-Elect:

The Librarian-Elect has no business

Questions to the Treasurer-Elect:

There are no questions to the Librarian-Elect

The Ex-Officers

Business of the Ex-Officers:

The Ex-Officers have no business

Questions to the Senior Librarian:

There are no questions to the Ex-Officers

The Senior Librarian

Business of the Senior Librarian:

The Senior Librarian has no business

Questions to the Senior Librarian:

There are no questions to the Senior Librarian

The Senior Treasurer

Business of the Senior Treasurer:

The Senior Treasurer notes that they are concerned about a lot of activities going on. They add that the Bursar has a contract of employment, which details what their job is even though it is not unilaterally set in stone. They further add that the laws of the country supersede the laws of the society, particularly if people do make unreasonable demands about financial information.

The Elected Member (Mr Chaitanya Kediya, *Exeter College*) asks the Senior Treasurer if they would like to move the meeting *in camera*. They invoke Rule 23(b)(iv)(1).

The Treasurer moves the meeting in camera at 17:00

The Treasurer reopens the meeting at 17:50

Questions to the Senior Treasurer:

There are no questions to the Senior Treasurer

The Bursar

Business of the Bursar:

The Bursar has no business

Questions to the Bursar

There are no questions to the Bursar

The Returning Officer

Business of the Returning Officer

The President-Elect moves that the Standing Committee pass a motion of thank you to the Returning Officer for the efforts during the Hilary Term 2019 elections

Seconded by the Treasurer.

The motions passes nem. con.

Questions to the Bursar

There are no questions to the Bursar

The Chair of the Consultative Committee

Business of the Chair of the Consultative:

The Chair of the Consultative Committee has no business in their absence

Questions to the Chair of the Consultative Committee:

There are no questions to the Chair of the Consultative Committee in their absence

The Access Officers

Business of the Access Officers:

The Access Officers have no business

Questions to the Access Officers:

The Access Officers have no business

The Chair of the Debate Selection Committee

Business of the Chair of the Debate Selection Committee:

The Chair of the Debate Selection Committee notes that they have three proposed changes.

DSC Standing Orders Change [Pack 1] (Helper Points changes and WUDC / EUDC pro-am requirements)

The Chair of the Debate Selection Committee states that the first component of the first change is a small helper point change, changing it from 2 to a range from 1 to 3. The second component of the first change is more significant. It comes with an expectation of people doing pro-am tournament to be representatives at the European Universities Championships. The third component of the first change means that people who trial for World Universities Championships must also help with squad trials or, if they were unable to do so, must judge at Beginners' Squads.

The Chair of the Debate Selection Committee moves that the Standing Committee pass the Debate Selection Committee Standing Orders Change related to helper points changes and WUDC and EUDC pro-am requirements

Seconded by the Returning Officer.

The motions passes nem. con.

DSC Standing Orders Change [Pack 2] (Oxford Schools requirements)

The Chair of the Debate Selection Committee explains that the first component of the second change is that future Debate Selection Committees will keep track of people's contribution at Oxford Schools. The second component of the second change is about formalising the idea that you did not judge Oxford Schools or the Oxford IV, then the Debate Selection Committee should not give them money to compete in external tournaments. The third component to the second change is to ensure that debaters to give a written indication why they are unable to help with good reason.

The President-Elect asks who deems these circumstances to be with good reason. **The Chair of the Debate Selection Committee** replies that it will be the Debate Selection Committee

The Chair of the Debate Selection Committee moves that the Standing Committee pass the Debate Selection Committee Standing Orders Change related to Oxford schools requirements

Seconded by the Returning Officer.

The motions passes nem. con.

DSC Standing Orders Change [Pack 3] (Helper Points changes and Sponsorship Officer competency points)

The Chair of the Debate Selection Committee explains that the first component of the third change is about competency points for the appointment of members on the Debate Selection Committee.

The Returning Officer notes that for competency points, people are currently awarded single points. They ask if the Chair of the Debate Selection Committee would want to scale this in the future. **The Chair of the Debate Selection Committee** replies that they would not want to do this immediately but will look into it.

The Chair of the Debate Selection Committee notes that the second component of the third change is an administrative change that all members of the Debate Selection Committee get just 1 helper point at the end of each term.

The Chair of the Debate Selection Committee moves that the Standing Committee pass the Debate Selection Committee Standing Orders Change related to helper points changes and Sponsorship Officer competency points

Seconded by the Returning Officer.

The motions passes nem. con.

Questions to the Chair of the Debate Selection Committee:

There are no questions to the Chair of the Debate Selection Committee in their absence

Changes to the Composition of this Committee

There are no changes to the composition of the Standing Committee.

Any Other Business

The Elected Member (Mr Chaitanya Kediya, *Exeter College*) asks if it is possible to move any other business earlier in the schedule of discussion.

The Treasurer replies that they will have to speak to the President-Elect who will be the Chair of the Standing Committee for Trinity Term.

Ms Olivia Leigh moves that the Standing Committee ratify Mr Okorafor Ikeaguru as a Junior Member of the Library Committee

Seconded by the Librarian.

The motion passes nem. con.

Date of Next Meeting

The Treasurer states that the President-Elect will call the next meeting for Monday 11th February at 16:00.

Signed,



Nicholas Leah
Lincoln College
Secretary