
Laurence R. Horn

A Natural History of Negation

The University of Chicago Press

Chicago and London



Contents

A Note on Notation / ix

Acknowledgments / xi

Introduction / xiii

- 1 **Negation and Opposition in Classical Logic / 1**
 - 1.1 Negation and the Legacy of Aristotle / 5
 - 1.1.1 The Footprints of Aristotle / 6
 - 1.1.2 The Stoic Opposition / 21
 - 1.1.3 Existential Import and the Square of Opposition / 23
 - 1.1.4 What Is a Negative Proposition? / 30
 - 1.1.5 Negation and the Legacy of Aristotle: Retrospect and Prospect / 35
 - 1.2 The Paradox of Negative Judgment: Negation and Its Discontents / 45
 - 1.2.1 Eliminating the Negative / 50
 - 1.2.2 Accentuating the Positive / 60
 - 1.3 Negation East and West / 79
 - 1.3.1 The Law of Contradiction and the "Eastern Mind" / 79
 - 1.3.2 Negation and Mind in the West: A Capsule View / 90
- 2 **Negation, Presupposition, and the Excluded Middle / 97**
 - 2.1 Future Contingents: The Sea Battle and Other Skirmishes / 98
 - 2.2 Vacuous Singular Terms: From Socrates to the King of France / 102
 - 2.3 Category Mistakes: The Significance of Insignificance / 110
 - 2.4 External Negation in Presuppositional and Nonpresuppositional Logics: New Solutions for Ancient Dilemmas / 122
 - 2.4.1 Negation(s) in Multivalued Logic / 122
 - 2.4.2 Negation Weak and Strong / 132
 - 2.5 Conventional Implicature and Contradiction Negation / 144

3	Markedness and the Psychology of Negation / 154
3.1	Markedness and the Acquisition of Negation / 161
3.2	Markedness and the Processing of Negation / 168
3.2.1	Issues and Problems in the Psycholinguistics of Negation / 175
3.3	Markedness and the Asymmetry Thesis / 184
3.3.1	Negative Uninformativeness within a Dualistic Model of Inference / 192

4	Negation and Quantity / 204
4.1	Scalar Predication and Subcontrariety I / 205
4.1.1	Merry Merry Subcontrary, How Does Your Logic Go? / 208
4.2	Negation and the Three-Cornered Square / 216
4.3	<i>All That Glitters</i> : Universals and the Scope of Negation / 226
4.4	Scalar Predication and Subcontrariety II / 231
4.5	The Story of O: Quantity and Negative Incorporation / 252

5	The Pragmatics of Contra(dicto)ry Negation / 268
5.1	Affixal Negation / 273
5.1.1	Contrariety and E-Negativity: The Case of <i>iN-</i> and <i>un-</i> / 273
5.1.2	Other Prefixes, Other Problems / 286
5.1.3	A Not Insignificant Problem: The Logic of Double Negation / 296
5.2	Neg-raising and Contrariety / 308
5.3	Contrariety and Understatement: From Rhetoric to Rule / 330
5.3.1	Irony, Conventionalization, and the Inferential Short Circuit / 337

6	Metalinguistic Negation / 362
6.1	On the "Ambiguity" of Negation / 363
6.2	Metalinguistic Negation and Pragmatic Ambiguity / 370
6.2.1	Pragmatic Ambiguity / 375
6.2.2	Truth vs. Assertability / 377
6.2.3	Other Metalinguistic Operators / 379
6.3	Metalinguistic Negation and Conversational Implicature / 382
6.3.1	The Scalar Cases / 382
6.3.2	Q-based vs. R-based Implicature / 387
6.4	Three Diagnostics for Metalinguistic Negation / 392
6.4.1	Incorporated Negation vs. Metalinguistic Negation / 392
6.4.2	Polarity as a Diagnostic / 397
6.4.3	Two <i>Buts</i> about Negation / 402

6.5	Other Approaches to Metalinguistic Negation /	413
6.5.1	Truth, TRUE, and Negation /	413
6.5.2	Monoguids and Ambiguists Revisited /	419
6.5.3	Metalinguistic Negation and 'negation metalinguistique' /	425
6.5.4	Negation in London /	428
6.6	Metalinguistic Negation and Surface Structure /	434

7	Negative Form and Negative Function /	445
7.1	Varieties of Negative Experience: A Typology of Descriptive Negation /	447
7.2	Aristotle as a Montague Grammarian: Negation in Extended Term Logic /	463
7.2.1	Sommers and the Limits of Term Logic /	473
7.3	Scope, Presupposition, and the Grammar of Negation /	479
7.3.1	The Representation of ETL Negation: Gazdar, Pullum, Sag, and Aristotle /	480
7.3.2	Scope and Presupposition for Russell, for Montague, and for Me /	483
7.3.3	<i>Every</i> vs. <i>Some</i> : Different Scopes for Different Folks /	490
7.3.4	Scope and Representation, Semantics and Pragmatics: A Final Conspectus /	504

Appendix 1:	On LEM and the Purported Incoherence of Multivalued Logic /	519
-------------	--	-----

Appendix 2:	Inherent Negation Revisited /	521
-------------	-------------------------------	-----

Notes /	525
---------	-----

Bibliography /	581
----------------	-----

Index /	617
---------	-----