Helga Ingimundardottir
University of Iceland
Dunhaga 5, IS-107 Reykjavik, Iceland

June 21, 2016

The Editorial Office
Journal of Scheduling

Dear JOSH Editors,

We would like submit a revised version of our paper titled: "Discovering dispatching rules from data using imitation learning: Case study for the job-shop problem" – manuscript `JOSH-D-15-00213`.

The answers from the two anonymous reviewers and associate editor's note are as follows:

Reviewer 1 remarks:

- Finding or creating proper dispatching rules is the key to solve middle to large scale factory job scheduling problems.
- The paper focuses on how to make decision based on the historic data and build several models with different optimal approaches and parameters. The simulation results indicates the models could give the reasonable solution in the particular circumstance. The impacts of the optimal approaches and parameters are also discussed.
- The paper did not mention the performance of the algorithm, such as the calculation time, and the requirements of the computer. Normally such performance are valuable for estimating the algorithm in practice.
- But anyway I suppose the paper is good for publishing.

Reviewer 2 remarks:

1. There are many language and format errors in this paper, such as unnecessary comma or missing hyphen.
2. Full of spell mistakes and grammatical errors. (in page 2, line 21, column 2 "featues (features)" or line 28 in same column "rules is(are)")
3. Unreadable, This paper needs to be proofread thoroughly. (In page 2, first column sentence in line 45 and 46 is obscure)

Associate editor The two reviewers have opposing views. Reviewer 1 recommends accept, but is not without reservation. Reviewer 2 finds the paper difficult to read. Personally I find this paper technically interesting. I

> would like to see it published eventually, but writing must be significantly improved. Not only should English be improved. The authors should make the material easier to digest by the readers.

Based on the advice received from the editor our paper has been professionally proofread. Moreover, in order to make the material easier to digest for the reader, we have made the paper more readable by reducing mathematical notation and describing more thoroughly in the main text equations, symbols, and pseudocodes.

Computational times have been addressed. These computational times are with respect to training times, or the time needed to create the dispatching rules which may take days. The dispatching rules themselves are as fast as any other commonly implemented dispatching rule, such as MWR. In practice the application of these rules is very fast and therefore of great practical importance.

Sincerely

Helga Ingimundardottir