

Dataset Annotation Guideline

Weizhe Yuan

1 Aspect Typology

We define a typology that contains 8 aspects, which are **Summary**, **Motivation/Impact**, **Originality**, **Soundness/Correctness**, **Substance**, **Replicability**, **Meaningful Comparison** and **Clarity**. The detailed explanations for each aspect is shown below.

- **Summary:** What was done in the paper?
- **Motivation/Impact:** Does the paper address an important problem? Are other people (practitioners or researchers) likely to use these ideas or build on them?
- **Originality:** Are there new research topic, technique, methodology, or insight?
- **Soundness/Correctness:** Is the proposed approach sound? Are the claims in the paper convincingly supported.
- **Substance:** Does the paper contains substantial experiments to demonstrate the effectiveness of proposed methods? Are there detailed result analysis? Does it contain meaningful ablation studies?
- **Replicability:** Is it easy to reproduce the results and verify the correctness of the results? Is the supporting dataset and/or software provided?
- **Meaningful Comparison:** Are the comparisons to prior work sufficient given the space constraints? Are the comparisons fair?
- **Clarity** For a reasonably well-prepared reader, is it clear what was done and why? Is the paper well-written and well-structured?

2 Annotation Tips

TO BE CONTINUED...