

Dataset Annotation Guideline

Weizhe Yuan

1 Aspect Typology

We define a typology that contains 8 aspects, which are **Summary**, **Motivation/Impact**, **Originality**, **Soundness/Correctness**, **Substance**, **Replicability**, **Meaningful Comparison** and **Clarity**. The detailed explanations for each aspect is shown below.

- **Summary:** What was done in the paper?
- **Motivation/Impact:** Does the paper address an important problem? Are other people (practitioners or researchers) likely to use these ideas or build on them?
- **Originality:** Are there new research topic, technique, methodology, or insight?
- **Soundness/Correctness:** Is the proposed approach sound? Are the claims in the paper convincingly supported?
- **Substance:** Does the paper contains substantial experiments to demonstrate the effectiveness of proposed methods? Are there detailed result analysis? Does it contain meaningful ablation studies?
- **Replicability:** Is it easy to reproduce the results and verify the correctness of the results? Is the supporting dataset and/or software provided?
- **Meaningful Comparison:** Are the comparisons to prior work sufficient given the space constraints? Are the comparisons fair?
- **Clarity:** For a reasonably well-prepared reader, is it clear what was done and why? Is the paper well-written and well-structured?

2 Annotation Tips

We further decompose each aspect (except) **Summary** into a positive one and a negative one. For example, **Motivation** will be decomposed to **Positive Motivation** and **Negative Motivation**. As so, there are in total 15 aspects for you to choose from when annotating reviews. Below are some tips.

- Please annotate the shortest while complete span that indicates a specific aspect. Don't include specific details if the aspect has been stated clearly prior to those details.

Example: This experimental study does not seem to conduct sufficient experiments to demonstrate the advantages [Negative Substance] (say, in terms of training efficiency the capability in making the network scalable for more challenging dataset) of the proposed objective function over the existing one.

- Please be as fine-grained as possible. If a sentence contains multiple aspects, annotate them separately if they can be disentangled.

Example: The results are new [Positive Originality] and important to this field. [Positive Motivation]