

Comparison of treatments - CH₄, NH₃, CO₂ with select approaches only

Sasha D. Hafner and Frederik Dalby

10 November, 2022

Purpose

Compare different slurry handling systems in terms of methane emission.

Prep

```
rm(list = ls())

source('../functions/rbindf.R')
source('../functions/dfcombos.R')
source('../functions/ggsave2x.R')

library('DescTools')
library('dplyr')
library('tidyr')
library('readxl')
library('multcomp')
library('ggplot2')
library('FSA')

sessionInfo()

## R version 4.2.1 (2022-06-23)
## Platform: x86_64-pc-linux-gnu (64-bit)
## Running under: Ubuntu 22.04.1 LTS
##
## Matrix products: default
## BLAS:   /usr/lib/x86_64-linux-gnu/blas/libblas.so.3.10.0
## LAPACK: /usr/lib/x86_64-linux-gnu/lapack/liblapack.so.3.10.0
##
## locale:
##  [1] LC_CTYPE=en_US.UTF-8      LC_NUMERIC=C
##  [3] LC_TIME=en_US.UTF-8      LC_COLLATE=en_US.UTF-8
##  [5] LC_MONETARY=en_US.UTF-8  LC_MESSAGES=en_US.UTF-8
##  [7] LC_PAPER=en_US.UTF-8     LC_NAME=C
##  [9] LC_ADDRESS=C             LC_TELEPHONE=C
## [11] LC_MEASUREMENT=en_US.UTF-8 LC_IDENTIFICATION=C
##
## attached base packages:
```

```
## [1] stats      graphics  grDevices utils      datasets  methods  base
##
## other attached packages:
## [1] FSA_0.9.3      ggplot2_3.3.6    multcomp_1.4-20  TH.data_1.1-1
## [5] MASS_7.3-58    survival_3.2-13  mvtnorm_1.1-3    readxl_1.4.1
## [9] tidyr_1.2.0     dplyr_1.0.9      DescTools_0.99.46 rmarkdown_2.14
## [13] nvimcom_0.9-82
##
## loaded via a namespace (and not attached):
## [1] Rcpp_1.0.8.3    lattice_0.20-45  class_7.3-20     zoo_1.8-11
## [5] assertthat_0.2.1 digest_0.6.29    utf8_1.2.2       R6_2.5.1
## [9] cellranger_1.1.0 evaluate_0.15     rootSolve_1.8.2.3 e1071_1.7-11
## [13] highr_0.9        httr_1.4.3       pillar_1.7.0     rlang_1.0.2
## [17] Exact_3.1        rstudioapi_0.13  data.table_1.14.2 Matrix_1.5-1
## [21] labeling_0.4.2    splines_4.2.1    stringr_1.4.0     tinytex_0.38
## [25] munsell_0.5.0     proxy_0.4-27     compiler_4.2.1    xfun_0.30
## [29] pkgconfig_2.0.3   htmltools_0.5.2  tidyselect_1.1.2  tibble_3.1.7
## [33] lmom_2.9          expm_0.999-6     codetools_0.2-18  fansi_1.0.3
## [37] crayon_1.5.1      withr_2.5.0      grid_4.2.1        gtable_0.3.0
## [41] lifecycle_1.0.1   DBI_1.1.3         magrittr_2.0.3    scales_1.2.0
## [45] gld_2.6.5         cli_3.3.0         stringi_1.7.6     farver_2.1.0
## [49] ellipsis_0.3.2    generics_0.1.2    vctrs_0.4.1       boot_1.3-28
## [53] sandwich_3.0-2    tools_4.2.1       glue_1.6.2        purrr_0.3.4
## [57] fastmap_1.1.0     yaml_2.3.5        colorspace_2.0-3  knitr_1.39
```

Measurement data

Get stacked data with high-resolution measurements. Calculate mean emission rate by period.

```
dat <- read.csv('../data/dat_stacked.csv')

emis_dat <- summarise(group_by(dat, period, treatment),
  mean_CH4_barn = mean(CH4_rate/pigs, na.rm = T),
  mean_CH4_slurry = mean(CH4_emis_rate/pigs, na.rm = T),
  mean_NH3_barn = mean(NH3_emis_rate/pigs, na.rm = T),
  mean_CO2_barn = mean(CO2E, na.rm = T),
  mean_CO2_slurry = mean(CO2_emis_rate, na.rm = T))
```

`summarise()` has grouped output by 'period'. You can override using the
`groups` argument.

```
emis_dat$treatment <- factor(emis_dat$treatment)
```

Analysis

Loop through all variables, fit models, print results. Crude and a lot of pages. . .

```
for (y in c('mean_CH4_barn', 'mean_CH4_slurry', 'mean_NH3_barn', 'mean_CO2_barn', 'mean_CO2_slurry')) {
  cat('\n')
  cat('\n', rep(c(y, '\n'), 4), '\n')
  cat('\n')

  emis_dat$y <- emis_dat[, y, drop = TRUE]
```

```

m2 <- aov(log10(y) ~ factor(period) + treatment, data = emis_dat)
d2 <- glht(m2, linfct = mcp(treatment = "Dunnett"))

cat('Transformed aov summary:\n')
print(summary(m2))
cat('\n', rep(c(y, '\n'), 4), '\n')
cat('Transformed lm summary:\n')
print(summary.lm(m2))
cat('\n', rep(c(y, '\n'), 4), '\n')
cat('Transformed Dunnetts test:\n')
print(summary(d2))
cat('\n', rep(c(y, '\n'), 4), '\n')
cat('Transformed confidence intervals:\n')
print(100 * (10^confint(m2) - 1))

cat('\n', rep(c(y, '\n'), 4), '\n')
cat('Transformed relative reduction (coef):\n')
print(round(100 * (10^coef(m2)[-1:-2] - 1), 1))

cat('\n\n')
cat('\n', rep(paste('end', y), 3), '\n')
cat('\n')
}

```

```

##
##
## mean_CH4_barn
## mean_CH4_barn
## mean_CH4_barn
## mean_CH4_barn
##
##
## Transformed aov summary:
##          Df Sum Sq Mean Sq F value    Pr(>F)
## factor(period)  3 0.0276  0.00919   1.649    0.246
## treatment      3 0.4397  0.14657  26.295 8.71e-05 ***
## Residuals      9 0.0502  0.00557
## ---
## Signif. codes:  0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.01 '*' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
## 4 observations deleted due to missingness
##
## mean_CH4_barn
## mean_CH4_barn
## mean_CH4_barn
## mean_CH4_barn
##
## Transformed lm summary:
##
## Call:
## aov(formula = log10(y) ~ factor(period) + treatment, data = emis_dat)
##
## Residuals:
##          Min          1Q          Median          3Q          Max

```

```

## -0.102154 -0.039526 -0.002392 0.032105 0.091454
##
## Coefficients:
##              Estimate Std. Error t value Pr(>|t|)
## (Intercept)      0.86010    0.04938  17.417 3.06e-08 ***
## factor(period)2      0.01949    0.05279   0.369 0.72057
## factor(period)3     -0.04276    0.05279  -0.810 0.43886
## factor(period)4     -0.08831    0.05279  -1.673 0.12869
## treatmentfrequentflushing -0.19613    0.05279  -3.715 0.00481 **
## treatmentslurryfunnels -0.42879    0.05279  -8.122 1.96e-05 ***
## treatmentslurrytrays  -0.36226    0.05279  -6.862 7.37e-05 ***
## ---
## Signif. codes:  0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.01 '*' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
##
## Residual standard error: 0.07466 on 9 degrees of freedom
## (4 observations deleted due to missingness)
## Multiple R-squared:  0.9031, Adjusted R-squared:  0.8384
## F-statistic: 13.97 on 6 and 9 DF, p-value: 0.0004169
##
##
## mean_CH4_barn
## mean_CH4_barn
## mean_CH4_barn
## mean_CH4_barn
##
## Transformed Dunnetts test:
##
## Simultaneous Tests for General Linear Hypotheses
##
## Multiple Comparisons of Means: Dunnett Contrasts
##
##
## Fit: aov(formula = log10(y) ~ factor(period) + treatment, data = emis_dat)
##
## Linear Hypotheses:
##              Estimate Std. Error t value Pr(>|t|)
## frequentflushing - control == 0 -0.19613    0.05279  -3.715 0.0123 *
## slurryfunnels - control == 0   -0.42879    0.05279  -8.122 <0.001 ***
## slurrytrays - control == 0    -0.36226    0.05279  -6.862 <0.001 ***
## ---
## Signif. codes:  0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.01 '*' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
## (Adjusted p values reported -- single-step method)
##
##
## mean_CH4_barn
## mean_CH4_barn
## mean_CH4_barn
## mean_CH4_barn
##
## Transformed confidence intervals:
##              2.5 %      97.5 %
## (Intercept)      460.25781 837.156197
## factor(period)2    -20.55591 37.693033
## factor(period)3    -31.16405 19.306934

```

```

## factor(period)4          -38.01840    7.426925
## treatmentfrequentflushing -51.64433 -16.189624
## treatmentsslurryfunnels  -71.69999 -50.950230
## treatmentsslurrytrays    -67.01512 -42.830377
##
## mean_CH4_barn
## mean_CH4_barn
## mean_CH4_barn
## mean_CH4_barn
##
## Transformed relative reduction (coef):
##          factor(period)3          factor(period)4 treatmentfrequentflushing
##                -9.4                -18.4                -36.3
##    treatmentsslurryfunnels    treatmentsslurrytrays
##                -62.7                -56.6
##
##
## end mean_CH4_barn end mean_CH4_barn end mean_CH4_barn
##
##
## mean_CH4_slurry
## mean_CH4_slurry
## mean_CH4_slurry
## mean_CH4_slurry
##
##
## Transformed aov summary:
##          Df Sum Sq Mean Sq F value    Pr(>F)
## factor(period)  3 0.1753   0.0584    1.645 0.247169
## treatment      3 2.4274   0.8091   22.784 0.000154 ***
## Residuals      9 0.3196   0.0355
## ---
## Signif. codes:  0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.01 '*' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
## 4 observations deleted due to missingness
##
## mean_CH4_slurry
## mean_CH4_slurry
## mean_CH4_slurry
## mean_CH4_slurry
##
## Transformed lm summary:
##
## Call:
## aov(formula = log10(y) ~ factor(period) + treatment, data = emis_dat)
##
## Residuals:
##      Min       1Q   Median       3Q      Max
## -0.286000 -0.112487  0.001559  0.122449  0.208276
##
## Coefficients:
##              Estimate Std. Error t value Pr(>|t|)
## (Intercept)      0.8369     0.1246   6.714 8.71e-05 ***

```

```

## factor(period)2          -0.1602      0.1333  -1.202  0.259872
## factor(period)3          -0.1996      0.1333  -1.498  0.168306
## factor(period)4          -0.2891      0.1333  -2.169  0.058165 .
## treatmentfrequentflushing -0.3109      0.1333  -2.333  0.044532 *
## treatmentslurryfunnels   -1.0124      0.1333  -7.597  3.34e-05 ***
## treatmentslurrytrays     -0.7443      0.1333  -5.586  0.000341 ***
## ---
## Signif. codes:  0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.01 '*' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
##
## Residual standard error: 0.1885 on 9 degrees of freedom
## (4 observations deleted due to missingness)
## Multiple R-squared:  0.8906, Adjusted R-squared:  0.8177
## F-statistic: 12.21 on 6 and 9 DF,  p-value: 0.0007015
##
##
## mean_CH4_slurry
## mean_CH4_slurry
## mean_CH4_slurry
## mean_CH4_slurry
##
## Transformed Dunnetts test:
##
## Simultaneous Tests for General Linear Hypotheses
##
## Multiple Comparisons of Means: Dunnett Contrasts
##
##
## Fit: aov(formula = log10(y) ~ factor(period) + treatment, data = emis_dat)
##
## Linear Hypotheses:
##
##              Estimate Std. Error t value Pr(>|t|)
## frequentflushing - control == 0  -0.3109      0.1333  -2.333    0.105
## slurryfunnels - control == 0     -1.0124      0.1333  -7.597 <0.001 ***
## slurrytrays - control == 0       -0.7443      0.1333  -5.586 <0.001 ***
## ---
## Signif. codes:  0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.01 '*' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
## (Adjusted p values reported -- single-step method)
##
##
## mean_CH4_slurry
## mean_CH4_slurry
## mean_CH4_slurry
## mean_CH4_slurry
##
## Transformed confidence intervals:
##
##              2.5 %      97.5 %
## (Intercept)    258.87112 1214.877588
## factor(period)2  -65.45962   38.424082
## factor(period)3  -68.45616   26.415149
## factor(period)4  -74.32747    2.885282
## treatmentfrequentflushing -75.58357  -2.148699
## treatmentslurryfunnels   -95.14531  -80.544331
## treatmentslurrytrays    -90.99974  -63.930546
##

```

```

## mean_CH4_slurry
## mean_CH4_slurry
## mean_CH4_slurry
## mean_CH4_slurry
##
## Transformed relative reduction (coef):
##          factor(period)3          factor(period)4 treatmentfrequentflushing
##                -36.9                -48.6                -51.1
##    treatmentsslurryfunnels    treatmentsslurrytrays
##                -90.3                -82.0
##
##
##
## end mean_CH4_slurry end mean_CH4_slurry end mean_CH4_slurry
##
##
##
## mean_NH3_barn
## mean_NH3_barn
## mean_NH3_barn
## mean_NH3_barn
##
##
## Transformed aov summary:
##          Df Sum Sq Mean Sq F value Pr(>F)
## factor(period) 3 0.16370 0.05457   9.378 0.00393 **
## treatment      3 0.20644 0.06881  11.826 0.00178 **
## Residuals      9 0.05237 0.00582
## ---
## Signif. codes:  0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.01 '*' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
## 4 observations deleted due to missingness
##
## mean_NH3_barn
## mean_NH3_barn
## mean_NH3_barn
## mean_NH3_barn
##
## Transformed lm summary:
##
## Call:
## aov(formula = log10(y) ~ factor(period) + treatment, data = emis_dat)
##
## Residuals:
##      Min       1Q   Median       3Q      Max
## -0.102192 -0.047033  0.001905  0.026331  0.141972
##
## Coefficients:
##              Estimate Std. Error t value Pr(>|t|)
## (Intercept)      0.82837    0.05045   16.418 5.14e-08 ***
## factor(period)2    -0.12362    0.05394   -2.292 0.047632 *
## factor(period)3    -0.26402    0.05394   -4.895 0.000854 ***
## factor(period)4    -0.21883    0.05394   -4.057 0.002855 **
## treatmentfrequentflushing  0.10859    0.05394    2.013 0.074939 .
## treatmentsslurryfunnels  -0.15296    0.05394   -2.836 0.019534 *

```

```

## treatmentslurrytrays      -0.16569    0.05394  -3.072 0.013315 *
## ---
## Signif. codes:  0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.01 '*' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
##
## Residual standard error: 0.07628 on 9 degrees of freedom
## (4 observations deleted due to missingness)
## Multiple R-squared:  0.8761, Adjusted R-squared:  0.7934
## F-statistic: 10.6 on 6 and 9 DF, p-value: 0.0012
##
##
## mean_NH3_barn
## mean_NH3_barn
## mean_NH3_barn
## mean_NH3_barn
##
## Transformed Dunnetts test:
##
## Simultaneous Tests for General Linear Hypotheses
##
## Multiple Comparisons of Means: Dunnett Contrasts
##
##
## Fit: aov(formula = log10(y) ~ factor(period) + treatment, data = emis_dat)
##
## Linear Hypotheses:
##
##              Estimate Std. Error t value Pr(>|t|)
## frequentflushing - control == 0  0.10859    0.05394   2.013   0.1722
## slurryfunnels - control == 0    -0.15296    0.05394  -2.836   0.0481 *
## slurrytrays - control == 0      -0.16569    0.05394  -3.072   0.0332 *
## ---
## Signif. codes:  0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.01 '*' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
## (Adjusted p values reported -- single-step method)
##
##
## mean_NH3_barn
## mean_NH3_barn
## mean_NH3_barn
## mean_NH3_barn
##
## Transformed confidence intervals:
##
##              2.5 %      97.5 %
## (Intercept)    417.885106 775.9997430
## factor(period)2  -43.197429 -0.3678551
## factor(period)3  -58.888805 -27.8906482
## factor(period)4  -54.379605 -19.9814771
## treatmentfrequentflushing -3.044584 70.0605452
## treatmentslurryfunnels  -46.908680 -6.8774177
## treatmentslurrytrays  -48.441838 -9.5665877
##
## mean_NH3_barn
## mean_NH3_barn
## mean_NH3_barn
## mean_NH3_barn
##

```



```

## Transformed relative reduction (coef):
##          factor(period)3          factor(period)4 treatmentfrequentflushing
##                -45.6                -39.6                28.4
##    treatmentsslurryfunnels    treatmentsslurrytrays
##                -29.7                -31.7
##
##
##
## end mean_NH3_barn end mean_NH3_barn end mean_NH3_barn
##
##
##
## mean_CO2_barn
## mean_CO2_barn
## mean_CO2_barn
## mean_CO2_barn
##
##
## Transformed aov summary:
##          Df    Sum Sq  Mean Sq F value Pr(>F)
## factor(period)  3 0.005206 0.001736   1.563  0.265
## treatment      3 0.005640 0.001880   1.693  0.237
## Residuals      9 0.009993 0.001110
## 4 observations deleted due to missingness
##
## mean_CO2_barn
## mean_CO2_barn
## mean_CO2_barn
## mean_CO2_barn
##
## Transformed lm summary:
##
## Call:
## aov(formula = log10(y) ~ factor(period) + treatment, data = emis_dat)
##
## Residuals:
##      Min       1Q   Median       3Q      Max
## -0.043025 -0.014750  0.000852  0.013497  0.043762
##
## Coefficients:
##              Estimate Std. Error t value Pr(>|t|)
## (Intercept)      3.28390    0.02204 148.994 <2e-16 ***
## factor(period)2    -0.03678    0.02356  -1.561  0.1530
## factor(period)3    -0.04633    0.02356  -1.966  0.0808 .
## factor(period)4    -0.01587    0.02356  -0.674  0.5174
## treatmentfrequentflushing  0.03308    0.02356   1.404  0.1939
## treatmentsslurryfunnels  -0.01475    0.02356  -0.626  0.5468
## treatmentsslurrytrays   -0.01062    0.02356  -0.451  0.6628
## ---
## Signif. codes:  0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.01 '*' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
##
## Residual standard error: 0.03332 on 9 degrees of freedom
## (4 observations deleted due to missingness)
## Multiple R-squared:  0.5205, Adjusted R-squared:  0.2008

```

```

## F-statistic: 1.628 on 6 and 9 DF,  p-value: 0.2451
##
##
## mean_CO2_barn
## mean_CO2_barn
## mean_CO2_barn
## mean_CO2_barn
##
## Transformed Dunnetts test:
##
## Simultaneous Tests for General Linear Hypotheses
##
## Multiple Comparisons of Means: Dunnett Contrasts
##
##
## Fit: aov(formula = log10(y) ~ factor(period) + treatment, data = emis_dat)
##
## Linear Hypotheses:
##
## Estimate Std. Error t value Pr(>|t|)
## frequentflushing - control == 0  0.03308    0.02356   1.404   0.405
## slurryfunnels - control == 0    -0.01475    0.02356  -0.626   0.866
## slurrytrays - control == 0     -0.01062    0.02356  -0.451   0.941
## (Adjusted p values reported -- single-step method)
##
##
## mean_CO2_barn
## mean_CO2_barn
## mean_CO2_barn
## mean_CO2_barn
##
## Transformed confidence intervals:
##
##           2.5 %           97.5 %
## (Intercept)      171310.927986 2.155536e+05
## factor(period)2      -18.732086 3.877700e+00
## factor(period)3      -20.499137 1.619034e+00
## factor(period)4      -14.724380 9.000402e+00
## treatmentfrequentflushing      -4.549047 2.200665e+01
## treatmentslurryfunnels      -14.504227 9.281805e+00
## treatmentslurrytrays      -13.687076 1.032630e+01
##
## mean_CO2_barn
## mean_CO2_barn
## mean_CO2_barn
## mean_CO2_barn
##
## Transformed relative reduction (coef):
##           factor(period)3           factor(period)4 treatmentfrequentflushing
##           -10.1             -3.6             7.9
## treatmentslurryfunnels treatmentslurrytrays
##           -3.3             -2.4
##
##
## end mean_CO2_barn end mean_CO2_barn end mean_CO2_barn

```

```

##
##
##
## mean_CO2_slurry
## mean_CO2_slurry
## mean_CO2_slurry
## mean_CO2_slurry
##

## Warning in eval(predvars, data, env): NaNs produced

## Transformed aov summary:
##           Df Sum Sq Mean Sq F value Pr(>F)
## factor(period) 3 0.1472 0.04908   2.132  0.174
## treatment      3 0.1642 0.05473   2.377  0.146
## Residuals      8 0.1842 0.02302
## 5 observations deleted due to missingness
##
## mean_CO2_slurry
## mean_CO2_slurry
## mean_CO2_slurry
## mean_CO2_slurry
##

## Transformed lm summary:
##
## Call:
## aov(formula = log10(y) ~ factor(period) + treatment, data = emis_dat)
##
## Residuals:
##      Min       1Q   Median       3Q      Max
## -0.18531 -0.09133 -0.02469  0.10005  0.18567
##
## Coefficients:
##              Estimate Std. Error t value Pr(>|t|)
## (Intercept)      2.56610    0.10115  25.370 6.24e-09 ***
## factor(period)2    -0.25049    0.10728  -2.335  0.0478 *
## factor(period)3    -0.22894    0.11861  -1.930  0.0897 .
## factor(period)4    -0.15958    0.10728  -1.487  0.1752
## treatmentfrequentflushing  0.18967    0.10728   1.768  0.1151
## treatmentslurryfunnels   -0.09050    0.10728  -0.844  0.4234
## treatmentslurrytrays     0.01625    0.11861   0.137  0.8944
## ---
## Signif. codes:  0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.01 '*' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
##
## Residual standard error: 0.1517 on 8 degrees of freedom
## (5 observations deleted due to missingness)
## Multiple R-squared:  0.6284, Adjusted R-squared:  0.3497
## F-statistic: 2.255 on 6 and 8 DF, p-value: 0.1423
##
##
## mean_CO2_slurry
## mean_CO2_slurry
## mean_CO2_slurry
## mean_CO2_slurry
##

```

```

## Transformed Dunnetts test:
##
##   Simultaneous Tests for General Linear Hypotheses
##
## Multiple Comparisons of Means: Dunnett Contrasts
##
##
## Fit: aov(formula = log10(y) ~ factor(period) + treatment, data = emis_dat)
##
## Linear Hypotheses:
##
##               Estimate Std. Error t value Pr(>|t|)
## frequentflushing - control == 0  0.18967    0.10728   1.768   0.257
## slurryfunnels - control == 0    -0.09050    0.10728  -0.844   0.747
## slurrytrays - control == 0      0.01625    0.11861   0.137   0.998
## (Adjusted p values reported -- single-step method)
##
##
## mean_CO2_slurry
## mean_CO2_slurry
## mean_CO2_slurry
## mean_CO2_slurry
##
## Transformed confidence intervals:
##
##               2.5 %          97.5 %
## (Intercept)    21420.44495 62901.3732762
## factor(period)2    -68.22298   -0.7090119
## factor(period)3    -68.55520   10.8069763
## factor(period)4    -60.82376   22.4107036
## treatmentfrequentflushing  -12.44678  173.5701916
## treatmentslurryfunnels    -54.06948   43.5152357
## treatmentslurrytrays    -44.69744   94.8783278
##
## mean_CO2_slurry
## mean_CO2_slurry
## mean_CO2_slurry
## mean_CO2_slurry
##
## Transformed relative reduction (coef):
##
##           factor(period)3           factor(period)4 treatmentfrequentflushing
##                -41.0                -30.7                54.8
## treatmentslurryfunnels treatmentslurrytrays
##                -18.8                 3.8
##
##
## end mean_CO2_slurry end mean_CO2_slurry end mean_CO2_slurry

```