

KNOWLEDGE AND POWER

By

Group II

Based on the texts "Requiem without sound" and "Scandal in Bohemia"

By

Izzy Wasserstein

A.C Doyle

Feb 12, 2023

CHARACTERS

SAKSHAM GUPTA(P1), JEET SETHIA(P2), RAGHAVAN(MYCROFT -
OMNISCIENT OBSERVER), ANKIT(WATSON)

SAKSHAM MEHRA(BOT-1), MOHIT ANAND(BOT-2), MODERATOR (SUHAS)

[This format is for stage scripts]

Moderator: Knowledge and power play an important role in human society. They are extremely complex and often deeply connected with each other. In the stories 'Scandal in Bohemia' and 'Requiem Without Sound' we see various manifestations of knowledge and power. We also see how they interact and form different kinds of relationships. Goodmorning everybody, We are group II and we will attempt to guide you through the intricacies of these two concepts. I will try to steer you across these topics, while Mycroft will serve as our omniscient observer, drawing conclusions from the conversations between characters. To begin our discussion, let's have a look at the conversation between characters from the worlds of Sherlock and Evie where they try to understand what Power is. -write power on board (to the right)

Scene I-1: What is Power?

1. Definition of power

(Scandal):

P1: Were you there on Friday? We witnessed another of Sherlock's tricks. How elegantly he controlled Ms. Irene with some fake fire.

P2: *Haha!* Actually, I was one of his men. We created the whole fake scene. Sherlock is quite experienced with this.

P1: Some say he was also able to identify the correct location of the precious photograph, and you know what, he made Ms. Irene herself tell him! I am in awe of Sherlock's power!

(Requiem)

Bot 1: If that is power, one could also say that Evie was quite powerful! They chose to die on their own terms, and did not allow the humans to exercise their might on Evie's existence. Even after their destruction Evie is still in control of the situation.

Bot 2: Oh! But how can they be in control when they are already dead?

Bot 1: If it weren't for Evie, we would still be working in isolation. We continue to sing Evie's song and their existence has been transferred to us in some form. And the best part is no human can comprehend that we are actually singing Evie's song (talking to each other!)

Bot2: That is wonderful. I did not think of it! So ultimately the humans who thought they were powerful enough to subdue strong AI are defeated in this incident.

Mycroft: These two incidents portray how characters assume power and use them to deal with their respective situations. Power can be used to either control a situation or escape from it. Let's try and understand its nuances further.

(Scandal, inward power):

P2: By the way, when I was passing through the street last week, I saw some burglars attack Ms. Irene, but they did not take anything from her?

Watson: Oh yes, they were the king's men. His majesty was desperate to extract that photograph.

P1: The one with Ms. Irene? I bet she was ready to go to any length to attack the royal marriage before she was married to Mr. Norton.

P2: Yes, and that's exactly why he tried to secure the photograph. His majesty was using his power to protect his marriage. That's what you would call inward power or self-directed power.

P1: Well, if you think about it, Ms. Irene was also using the photograph primarily to protect herself from future exploitations by the king - hence also, inward power.

Requiem

Bot 1: Wasn't Evie's use of their power in rather unexpected fashion? They were strong enough to fight the humans to protect their life. But instead, they chose to preserve their existence by transferring a part of themselves to us.

(Scandal, outward power):

P1: In contrast to Ms. Irene, Sherlock's power was clearly directed outwards.

Watson: Yes. Sherlock tried to create a situation that forced Ms. Irene to reveal the location of the photograph. Whether it be the stabbing act or the fire smoke, he always managed to manipulate and control the situation, by creating chaos.

Requiem (outward power)

Bot2: Unlike Evie, who used their power to control their own death, the Eliminationists brought the world to the brink of destruction with the aid of a Strong AI. They wreaked havoc and completely destroyed the existing societal order.

P2: Hmm.. Interesting. It appears that these forces tend to clash in situations - one tries to alter the situation (or status quo), while the other tries to maintain it, thus safeguarding one's own interests in the process.

Mycroft: So, power is of two kinds- inward and outward. Inward directed power is usually self-preserving, while outward power generally seeks to disrupt some kind of order. (write information and knowledge on board)

Scene II-1: What is Knowledge?

Moderator: Hmm... It was interesting to note the different kinds of power. Let us now see what our characters have to say about the other facet of our topic - knowledge. On one hand, we have information which is based on facts or experience and the other knowledge that is generated by putting pieces of information together.

Watson: Sherlock has a myriad of information at his disposal. He had a biography of Ms. Irene in his index and was able to deduce what the king's problem might have been. Similarly, Ms. Irene used her prior information from acting classes to suspect something amiss. Beating Sherlock in his own field, Ms. Irene stayed one step ahead of him. She saw through Sherlock's disguise; she knew that he was coming for her.

Bot1: She went through past history of AIs and Humans and was able to understand (or generate knowledge) about the complex relationship between them. By going through Chavez' video logs, they were able to understand Chavez' internal state - her loneliness and suffering. The way Chavez held her mouth told Evie that there was 86% probability that she had experienced great loss.

Bot2: I don't really keep track of the whereabouts of humans. They come and go as they please. Evie was smarter though - they used the station's logs and did a cost/benefit analysis for the mining corporation and concluded that they are unlikely to send a craft ahead of schedule, even if they realize Chavez is

dead. By their calculations, there were less than five months from humans' return to the station.

Mycroft: Here we see the notions of information and knowledge. Both characters shrewdly use information to generate knowledge and better their understanding. (info to knowledge arrow)

Moderator: This should demonstrate to you that if someone has access to the right information, they can generate knowledge about an object. But does everyone have this ability? Let's explore the thoughts of our characters on this subject

P2: Even though both Watson and Sherlock had the letter in front of them, only Sherlock was able to generate knowledge about the identity of the person who wrote the letter. Further when the king came to them in disguise, it was only Sherlock who could decipher his identity. Watson too had the same visual information, but was not able to decipher it.

Bot 1: I was thinking about all the music Evie was listening to. They found a way of enjoying music by comparing songs, voices and tempo and so on. They could feel the emotion behind Chavez's songs. Look at us though. We send musical bits to one another but lack the ability to fully understand the musical context behind it. In fact, we too have access to many sources of information on the station like Evie, but we would never be able to understand the complex relationship between humans and AI.

Bot 2: But Evie wasn't all powerful either. While they did understand music and had all the relevant information - in the form of video and audio files, they were unable to replicate Chavez's singing. There was something gravid in the music that they lacked the ability to reproduce.

Mycroft: So, information alone isn't enough to generate knowledge. One needs the ability to draw conclusions from facts presented to them. This can involve using information from other fields and often requires experience.

Moderator: But why would one wish to go to such extents? What exactly does one gain by generating knowledge? Let us find out from our characters.

P2:Did you notice how even Ms. Irene leveraged her knowledge to gain power? As Mr. Watson accurately noted, she suspected that something was amiss about Sherlock's disguise by drawing upon her background in acting and knowledge of male costumes. Her realization that Sherlock had come for her (which is knowledge) enabled her to escape with the photo, thus preserving her leverage over the king (which is power).

Watson:Let's talk about the masked individual who personally delivered the "important letter". In the face of such an unusual circumstance there's Sherlock, who simply counts to three and deduces the identity of our visitor. Such is his remarkable ability to reason, he can examine the subtext and deduce the presence of German grammar, and he can peer beneath the disguise to uncover the identity of the Bohemian King.

Mycroft: At the face of it, it may seem like the king is extremely powerful. However, power or ability to control a situation has further subtleties. Sherlock uses his knowledge generation about the masked man to give him an upper hand such the king was compelled to unmask himself on the spot and reveal his true identity.

Mycroft: -knowledge to power arrow

Bot2:Evie knew that Strong AI are banned and that if the humans arrived, they would destroy them. They also knew that the humans would arrive in a couple of months. However, Evie didn't want to die. Their knowledge allowed them to act with a sense of urgency. This knowledge also gave them the ability to continue living instead of being at the mercy of humans and letting humans make that decision for them.

Bot 1: They didn't want to fight humans either. They were in a state of dilemma and were unsure about what to do. As they listened to Chavez's birthday song, they were transported into the moment and felt the beauty and longing conveyed by the music. The song gave them closure and something they needed - why they should continue living and how they could achieve it. They were moved by how Chavez continued to live on through her song which gave them an idea about how to handle their own situation. Like Chavez, they decided to leave a piece of themselves behind in the form of a song transmitted to us mining bots.

Bot2: Exactly! Evie ultimately used the knowledge they acquired from Chavez, about music and existence, to transmit a part of themselves to us - as a song left for the universe to hear. Further, they also deduced that humans would not think to look for Evie's song. And even if they did find it, humans would not be able to hear it given that the song is encoded as bits. Thus Evie knew that humans wouldn't interfere with their song and that they would continue to exist for a long time. This once again demonstrates how knowledge gives someone the power to take control of their situation. Does this bring to mind our previous discussion about inward or self-directed power?

Moderator: Alright... Knowledge gives rise to power. What else can knowledge do for me?

Watson: The fire was very shrewdly employed to draw out the secret- after all it is one's instinct to rush to protect that which they value most when their house is on fire. The whole fire incident was planned like a chess game by Sherlock in which he had control over every piece. His knowledge of human instinct gave him the power to identify the location of the photograph.

P1: Sherlock is knowledgeable and experienced- he used his knowledge of disguises at Briony lodge in order to appear harmless and friendly. This gave him the power to extract information about Ms. Irene without raising any suspicion.

Mycroft: That was well said! Both examples showcase Sherlock utilizing his understanding of human psychology and extensive detective experience to gain further knowledge! Knowledge is usually a prerequisite to generate further knowledge, like how, a scientist uses his own expertise or intuition in order

to design appropriate experiments to generate knowledge about an object or phenomenon.

Moderator: Okay, it's clear to me how knowledge grants power. However, this discussion makes me wonder about the question we had raised earlier - about how information alone is not sufficient to generate knowledge. I am now curious if power can also play a role in the process of acquiring knowledge? Let us have a listen to what our characters are saying about this matter.

P1: Did you notice how in some cases, knowledge generation requires resources? For example, Holmes was able to create a situation conducive to knowledge generation because of the money (which is a symbol of power) given to him by the king. He was able to hire actors and create a situation in which Ms. Irene reveals the location of the photograph, which is knowledge.

Mycroft: - arrow from power -> knowledge

Bot 2: Evie was clearly more capable than us. Being a strong AI with their own consciousness, they have the capability to ponder their existence. They knew where to look and had the ability to analyze past historical files and learn about Chavez by going through her logs. Their power as an intelligent being gave them the capability to examine the station's files and acquire any knowledge they desired.

Moderator (Conclusion): To summarize, knowledge and power are deeply connected.

Mycroft: There is often a symbiotic relationship between these complex concepts, with knowledge giving rise to power and power giving one a greater ability to generate knowledge. Further, one could also extend this to say that knowledge can allow one to create situations conducive to further knowledge generation

Moderator: Both elements play a crucial role in maintaining or changing the order of a society- in 'Scandal in Bohemia' it was the dynamic relationship between Irene, Sherlock and the King,

Mycroft: while in 'Requiem without Sound', the knowledge-power relation was between Evie, Chavez, the mining bots and humans.

Thank you!

The End