Forums (/forums)

Ixalan (Complete) (/spoilers/185-ixalan)

Other Spoilers

Articles (/articles)

New Posts (/new-content)

Cards (/cards)

Trading Post (/trading-post/)

Wiki (https://mtg.gamepedia.com)

Search MTG Salvation

Enjoy a console experience anytime, anywhere



Shop Now amazon

#1 (?comment=1)

#2 (?comment=2)

#3 (?comment=3)

#4 (?comment=4)

with the Nintendo Switch

HOME (/) > MTG SALVATION FORUMS (/FORUMS/) > MAGIC FUNDAMENTALS (/FORUMS/MAGIC-FUNDAMENTALS) > MAGIC RUNDAMENTALS (/FORUMS/MAGIC-FUNDAMENTALS (/ AGIC-RULINGS)

- MAGIC RULINGS ARCHIVES (/FORUMS/MAGIC-FUNDAMENTALS/MAGIC-RULINGS/MAGIC-RULINGS-ARCHIVES)
- TAPPING FOR MANA (/FORUMS/MAGIC-FUNDAMENTALS/MAGIC-RULINGS/MAGIC-RULINGS-ARCHIVES/252176-TAPPING-FOR-MANA)

tapping for mana

Mar 24, 2005 (24. 3. 2005 6:22 PM)

Search (/forums/search) Tools ()

SummerSnow >

(/members/7192summersnow)



summersnow) Join Date: 1/16/2005 Posts: 118

well, these Q may always trouble me.. so i hope someone can help mi solve

- 1) does tapping a land for mana goes on stack? eg, if a island is tap for mana, then a floodbringer (/cards/betravers-of-kamigawa/11479floodbringer) ability is used to tap that land, does the mana still exist?
- 2) does tapping a creature for mana goes on stack? eg, if a leaden myr (/cards/scars-of-mirrodin/17742-leaden-myr) is tapped for mana, then a <u>echoing decay (/cards/darksteel/10718-echoing-decay)</u> target it, does the mana still exist?

my friend always say all mana abilites, regerdless whether the type of cards(land, creatures, artifact, etc), doesnt go on stack.. is he rite?

🐩 W/U Soggy Pickles 🐩 👣 U/G Simic 👣 😘 W/B Orzhov Aggro 😘 ★WW Equip ★ R/W Boros Control

:symu::symb: U/B Ninja :symb::symu:

:symg::symu::symb: Madness-tog :symb::symu::symg



Mar 24, 2005 (24. 3. 2005 6:25 PM)

Binary **√** (/members/7576binary) MTGS Writer

Rules Guru Took Mo Rocca's kiwi



(/members/7576-binary) Join Date: 1/24/2005 Posts: 16,281

Your friend is correct. Abilities of permanents that generate mana do not use the stack, and as such cannot be responded to.

Spells that create mana (such as Dark Ritual (/cards/amonkhet-invocations/28587-dark-ritual) or Seething Song (/cards/duel-decksknights-vs-dragons/18127-seething-song)) still use the stack and can be responded to appropriately.

I am no longer on MTGS staff, so please don't contact me asking me to do staff things.:

Mar 24, 2005 (24. 3. 2005 8:37 PM)

Prizm \(\square\)(/members/5021-



(/members/5021-prizm) Location: Pasadena, CA Join Date: 9/3/2004 Posts: 1.891

Even abilities which have other aspects besides producing mana, such as Chromatic Sphere, are faster than the stack.

Quote from ljossberir »

Prizm is the key to the greatness of the US!

Quote from Phyrexian »

If hefner was a rich, gay, playboy and had hot steamy sex with hot guys would you choose him? Of course not,

Mar 24, 2005 (24. 3. 2005 8:52 PM)

Q about Piracy.

RossMills ▼ (/members/5214rossmills) Ascended Mage

(/members/5214-rossmills)

The ability resolves.

You get priority, and you can tap opponent's lands seeing as you have priority, correct? They cannot respond by tapping lands you attempt to tap, seeing as do not have priority over that effect.

Join Date: 1/2/2005 Posts: 233

<u>Mar 24, 2005 (24. 3, 2005 9:04 PM)</u> #5 (?comment=5)

Binary **▼ (/members/7576- binary)**MTGS Writer

Rules Guru Took Mo Rocca's kiwi



(/members/7576-binary) Join Date: 1/24/2005 Posts: 16,281

Same answer: mana abilities don't use the stack.

Even if they DID use the stack, in these cases it wouldn't matter. You pay the costs for an ability at the time you play it; if your opponent tries to respond to you tapping something to activate an ability, they can't prevent the ability from happening by trying to tap that permanent because it's already tapped.

Last edited by Binary (/members/7576-binary): Mar 24, 2005 (24. 3. 2005 9:07 PM)

I am no longer on MTGS staff, so please don't contact me asking me to do staff things. : $\hspace{-0.5cm} |\hspace{-0.5cm}|$

Mar 24, 2005 (24. 3. 2005 9:32 PM)

gibbons ▼ (/members/8078-gibbons)

Banned



(/members/8078-gibbons) Location: Hidden Join Date: 3/7/2005 Posts: 69

So, if my opponent tries to use Blinkmoth Urn to generate mana... Can I Twiddle it in response?

Everybody's got something to hide except for me and my monkey.

Ouote from Sutherlands >

Huh... the only word that comes to mind is pwned...

Mar 24, 2005 (24. 3. 2005 9:41 PM)

Binary ▼ (/members/7576binary) MTGS Writer Rules Guru

Took Mo Rocca's kiwi



(/members/7576-binary) Join Date: 1/24/2005 Posts: 16.281

If you Twiddle it when the ability goes on the stack, then the ability will fail when it tries to resolve because one of its conditions (the Urn being untapped) no longer applies.

This is true because the Urn's triggered ability is not a "mana ability" as defined by the rules:

- 406.1. A mana ability is either (a) an activated ability that could put mana into a player's mana pool when it resolves or (b) a triggered ability that triggers from a mana ability and could produce additional mana. A mana ability can generate other effects at the same time it produces mana.
- 406.2. Spells that put mana into a player's mana pool aren't mana abilities. They're played and resolved exactly like any other
 spells. Triggered abilities that put mana into a player's mana pool aren't mana abilities if they trigger from events other than
 activating mana abilities. They go on the stack and resolve like any other triggered abilities.

I am no longer on MTGS staff, so please don't contact me asking me to do staff things.:

Mar 25, 2005 (25, 3, 2005 8:07 PM)

(/members/5398-mtgphreak)
Archmage Overlord

9

MTGPhreak v

(/members/5398-mtgphreak) Join Date: 1/3/2005 Posts: 1,172

Quote from RossMills »

Q about Piracy. The ability resolves.

You get priority, and you can tap opponent's lands seeing as you have priority, correct? They cannot respond by tapping lands you attempt to tap, seeing as do not have priority over that effect.

Sign In

(https://www.mtgsalvation.com/login)

#6 (?comment=6)

#7 (?comment=7)

#8 (?comment=8)

The problem with your reasoning is that your opponent will eventually get priority before the "tap" ability resolven the "tap" ability resolven to so in fact use the stack, so each player must pass priority before this Tap resolves. Your opponent can just the player must pass priority before this Tap resolves. Your opponent can just the player must pass priority before this Tap resolves. Your opponent can just the player must pass priority before this Tap resolves. Your opponent can just the player must pass priority before this Tap resolves. Your opponent can just the player must pass priority before this Tap resolves. Your opponent can just the player must pass priority before this Tap resolves. Your opponent can just the player must pass priority before this Tap resolves. Your opponent can just the player must pass priority before this Tap resolves. Your opponent can just the player must pass priority before this Tap resolves. Your opponent can just pass priority before this Tap resolves. Your opponent can just pass priority before this Tap resolves. Your opponent can just pass priority before this Tap resolves. Your opponent can just pass priority before the "tap" ability "Tap a

(http://forums.mtgsalvation.com/http://forums.mtgsalvation.com/images/statusicon/forum_new.gif)

<u>Mar 25, 2005 (25. 3, 2005 8:31 PM)</u> #9 (?comment=9)

JeffV **▼ (/members/5256-jeffv)**MTGS Writer

Experienced Mage

(/members/5256-

jeffv)

Location: Elyria, Ohio Join Date: 1/2/2005 Posts: 110 Wrong. <u>Piracy (/cards/starter-1999/6758-piracy)</u> is not <u>Opposition (/cards/amonkhet-invocations/28907-opposition)</u>. Piracy actually allows you to use mana abilities of lands you don't control. In that case you are using mana abilities and your opponent cannot respond. If we're talking about Oppo, then you're right, but Piracy is different.

Jeff Vondruska

DCI Level 2 Judge (http://www.wizards.com/judge)
Former MTGnews.com Administrator (http://forums.mtgnews.com,
MTGnews Best Rulings Giver 2001, 2002, 2003, 2004

Remember the Ascended

MagicCardsForSale.com (http://www.magiccardsforsale.com/)

I'm selling lots of cards! Click here for my CardShark listing! (http://tinyurl.com/5wo6c)

Mar 25, 2005 (25. 3. 2005 8:56 PM)

#10 (?comment=10)

MTGPhreak ▼

(/members/5398-mtgphreak) Archmage Overlord

(/members/5398-mtgphreak)
Join Date: 1/3/2005

Posts: 1,172

OH the CARD Piracy. Sorry, never even read the card or knew that any such card to that effect existed. I just assumed he was talking about any generic tap ability.

 $(http://forums.mtgsalvation.com/http://forums.mtgsalvation.com/images/statusicon/forum_new.gif) \\$

To post a comment, please login (https://www.mtgsalvation.com/login?returnUrl=%2fforums%2fmagic-fundamentals%2fmagic-rulings%2fmagic-rulings%2fmagic-rulings%2fmagic-fundamentals

Previous Thread (/forums/magic-rulings-archives/252176-1apppintg-Foruma(//f/prumis/jus/hp)

Next Thread (/forums/magic-rulings-archives/252176-tapping-for-mana/next)

Back to Top

Enjoy a console experience anytime, anywhere

with the Nintendo Switch



Shop Now amazon

About Curse (http://www.curseinc.com/company)
Terms of Service (http://www.curse.com/terms)
Privacy Policy (http://www.curse.com/privacy)

Support (http://web-support.curse.com)

© Copyright 2005-2017, Curse Inc.