GMSE: an R package for generalised management strategy evaluation

Supporting Information 1

A. Bradley Duthie, Jeremy J. Cusack, Isabel L. Jones, Erlend B. Nilsen, Rocío Pozo, O. Sarobidy Rakotonarivo, Bram Van Moorter, and Nils Bunnefeld

2017-11-06

Extended introduction to the genetic algorithm applied in GMSE

A genetic algorithm is called in the predefined GMSE manager and user models to simulate human decision making. As of GMSE version 0.3.1.9, this includes one independent call to the genetic algorithm for each decision-making agent in every GMSE time step. Therefore, one run of the genetic algorithm occurs to 10 simulate the manager's policy setting decisions in each time step (unless otherwise defined through non-default 11 manage_freq values greater than 1), and one run occurs to simulate each individual user's action decisions in 12 each time step (unless otherwise defined through non-default group_think = TRUE, in which case one user 13 makes decions that all other users follow identically. Each run of the genetic algorithm mimics the evolution 14 by natural selection of a population of potential manager or user strategies over multiple generations, with the 15 highest fitness strategy in the terminal generation being selected as the one that the manager or user decides 16 to implement. For clarity, as in the main text, we use 'time step' to refer to a full GMSE cycle (in which multiple genetic algorithms may be run) and 'generation' to refer to a single, non-overlapping, generation of 18 potential strategies that evolve within a genetic algorithm (see Figure 1 of the main text). Below, we explain the genetic algorithm in extended detail as it occurs in GMSE v0.3.1.9 (future versions of GMSE might 20 expand upon this framework). We first explain the key data structure used, then provide an overview of the 21 processes of crossover, mutation, cost constraint, fitness evaluation, tournament selection, and replacement. 22 We then explain the fitness functions of managers and users in more detail.

²⁴ Key data structures used

The focal data structure used for tracking manager and user decisions is a three dimensional array, which
we will call ACTION (also returned as user_array by gmse_apply). Rows of ACTION correspond to recipients
of actions (resources, landscapes, or potentially other agents), and columns correspond to either recipient
properties or actions allocated to recipients. Each layer of ACTION corresponds to a unique agent, the first
of which is the manager; additional layers correspond to each user. Below shows an ACTION array, which
corresponds to a GMSE model with one manager and two users.

```
##
       , , Manager_Actions
31
32
   ##
   ##
                  Act Type_1 Type_2 Type_3
                                                    Util. U land U loc. Scare Cull
33
                   -2
                             1
                                     0
                                               1000.0000
                                                                 0
                                                                          0
                                                                                 0
                                                                                      0
   ## Resource
34
                                     0
                   -1
                             1
                                             0
                                                   0.0000
                                                                 0
                                                                          0
                                                                                 0
                                                                                      0
   ## Landscape
   ## Res cost
                     1
                             1
                                     0
                                             0
                                                                 0
                                                                          0
                                                                                10
                                                                                      10
                                                -360.5442
36
                                     0
   ## U1_cost
                     2
                             1
                                             0
                                                   0.0000
                                                                 0
                                                                          0
                                                                                 0
                                                                                      0
   ## U2 cost
                             1
                                     0
                                             0
                                                   0.0000
                                                                          0
                                                                                 0
                                                                                      0
38
   ##
                  Castrate
                            Feed Help_off
                          0
                                0
                                           0
   ## Resource
                          0
                                0
                                           0
                                                 0
   ## Landscape
                               10
   ## Res_cost
                         10
                                          10
                                              110
```

```
## U1 cost
                            0
                                   0
                                              0
                                                     0
43
   ## U2 cost
                            0
                                   0
                                              0
                                                     0
44
   ##
45
   ##
       , , User_1_Actions
   ##
47
                    Act Type_1 Type_2 Type_3 Util. U_land U_loc. Scare Cull Castrate
   ##
   ## Resource
                     -2
                               1
                                        0
                                                 0
                                                       -1
                                                                  0
                                                                          0
                                                                                       70
                                                                                                    0
49
                                        0
                                                        0
                                                                                  0
                                                                                        0
   ##
      Landscape
                     -1
                               1
                                                 0
                                                                 0
                                                                          0
                                                                                                    0
50
       Res_cost
                      1
                               1
                                        0
                                                 0
                                                        0
                                                                 0
                                                                          0
                                                                                  0
                                                                                        0
                                                                                                    0
   ##
51
                      2
                                        0
                                                 0
                                                        0
                                                                          0
                                                                                  0
                                                                                        0
                                                                                                    0
   ##
      {\tt U1\_cost}
                               1
                                                                 0
52
   ##
       U2_cost
                      3
                               1
                                        0
                                                 0
                                                         0
                                                                 0
                                                                          0
                                                                                  0
                                                                                        0
                                                                                                    0
53
   ##
                    Feed
                          Help_off
54
   ## Resource
                        0
                                   0
                                        10
55
                        0
                                   0
   ##
       Landscape
                                        18
56
                        0
                                   0
                                         0
      Res_cost
57
      U1_cost
                        0
                                   0
                                         0
58
                        0
                                   0
                                         0
   ##
      U2_cost
   ##
60
   ##
61
          , User_2_Actions
   ##
62
   ##
                    Act Type_1 Type_2 Type_3 Util. U_land U_loc. Scare
                                                                                    Cull Castrate
63
                     -2
                                        0
                                                 0
                                                                          0
   ## Resource
                               1
                                                       -1
                                                                                       68
64
                                        0
                                                 0
                                                        0
                                                                 0
                                                                          0
                                                                                  0
                                                                                        0
                                                                                                    0
      Landscape
                     -1
                               1
   ##
65
                      1
                               1
                                        0
                                                 0
                                                        0
                                                                          0
                                                                                  0
                                                                                        0
                                                                                                    0
   ##
      Res cost
                                                                 0
66
                      2
                                        0
                                                 0
                                                        0
                                                                                  0
                                                                                        0
                                                                                                    0
67
   ##
      U1 cost
                               1
                                                                 0
                                                                          0
   ##
       U2 cost
                      3
                               1
                                        0
                                                 0
                                                        0
                                                                 0
                                                                          0
                                                                                  0
                                                                                        0
                                                                                                    0
68
   ##
                    Feed
                          Help_off
                                     None
69
   ## Resource
                        0
                                   0
                                        17
70
                        0
                                   0
                                        15
   ## Landscape
71
   ## Res_cost
                        0
                                   0
                                         0
72
   ## U1_cost
                        0
                                   0
                                         0
73
   ## U2_cost
                        0
                                   0
                                         0
74
```

The above array holds all of the information on manager and user actions in the six right-most columns of each array layer. The first seven columns contain information about which resources are affected, and how they are affected. The first column Act identifies the type of action being performed; a value of -2 defines a direct action to a resource (e.g., culling of the resource), and a value of -1 defines direct action to a landscape (e.g., increasing yield). Positive values are currently only meaningful for Manager_Actions, where a value of 1 defines an action setting a uniform cost of users' direct actions on resources (i.e., costs where Act = -2 for User_1_Actions and User_2_Actions). All other values for Act are meaningless in GMSE 0.3.1.7, but might be expanded upon in future versions to allow for modification of specific user costs enacted by managers (i.e., managers having different policies for different users) or other users (e.g., users increasing the costs of other users' actions due to conflict or cooperation). Similarly, columns 2-4 refer to resource or landscape types, but only Type_1 = 1, Type_2 = 0, and Type_3 = 0 are allowed in GMSE v0.3.1.7 (i.e., only one type of resource is permitted), but future versions might allow for different resource types (e.g., Type_1 might be used to designate species, and Type_2 and Type_3 could designate stage or sex). For the rest of this supporting information, we will therefore focus only on rows 1-3 of ACTION. Column 5 Util. of ACTION defines the utility associated with the resource (where Act = -2) or landscape (where Act = -1). For managers, the target resource abundance set with GMSE argument manage_target is found in row 1 (1000 in ACTION above); for users, the value in row 1 identifies whether resources are preferred to increase (if positive) or decrease (if negative). Values of column 5 in row 2 similarly identifies whether landscape cell output is preferred by users to increase or decrease (managers do not currently have preferences for landscape output). Of special note is row 3 for Manager Actions, which defines the marginal utility of resources; that is, the adjustment to resource abundance that the manager will attempt to make based on

the manage_target and the estimated abundance produced by the observation model (in the case of the above, resource abundance is estimated at ca 1360.54, so the manager will set policy in attempt to change the population size by ca -360.54 resources). Column 6 U_land defines whether or not the utility attached to the resource or landscape output depends on it being on a landscape cell that is owned by the acting user. Related, column 7 U_loc. defines whether or not actions can be performed only on a landscape cell that is owned by the acting user. Hence values of columns 6 and 7 are binary, and affected by the land_ownership argument in gmse. Finally, columns 8-13 correspond to specific actions, either direct (where Act < 0) or indirect by setting policy (for row 3 of Manager_Actions where Res_cost = 1). The last column 13 None corresponds with no actions. See GMSE documentation for details about the effects of each action.

97

98

100

102

103

104

105

107

109

Constraints on the values that elements in the ACTION array can take are defined by a COST array (also returned as manager_array by gmse_apply) of dimensions identical to ACTION. All values in COST columns 1-7 are set to 10001, one higher than the highest possible budget of either managers or users, so neither can affect resource types or utilities. Columns 8-13 are also set to 10001, except where actions are specifically allowed. Below shows the COST array that corresponds to the above ACTION array.

```
, , Manager_Actions
110
    ##
111
    ##
                    Act Type_1 Type_2 Type_3 Util. U_land U_loc. Scare
112
                                                        10001
                                          10001 10001
    ## Resource
                  10001
                          10001
                                  10001
                                                                10001 10001 10001
113
      Landscape 10001
                          10001
                                  10001
                                          10001 10001
                                                        10001
                                                                10001 10001 10001
114
    ## Res_cost
                  10001
                          10001
                                  10001
                                          10001 10001
                                                        10001
                                                                10001 10001
                                                                                 10
115
                                  10001
                                          10001 10001
                                                        10001
                                                                10001 10001 10001
    ## U1 cost
                  10001
                          10001
116
                                  10001
                                          10001 10001
                                                        10001
                                                                10001 10001 10001
    ##
      U2_cost
                  10001
                          10001
117
    ##
                  Castrate
                             Feed Help off
                                              None
118
119
    ## Resource
                      10001 10001
                                      10001
                                                 10
    ## Landscape
                      10001 10001
                                      10001
                                                 10
120
    ## Res_cost
                      10001 10001
                                      10001
                                                 10
121
    ## U1 cost
                      10001 10001
                                      10001 10001
122
    ## U2_cost
                      10001 10001
                                      10001 10001
123
    ##
124
    ##
       , , User_1_Actions
125
    ##
126
    ##
                    Act Type_1 Type_2 Type_3 Util. U_land U_loc. Scare
                                                                               Cull
127
                                                        10001
                  10001
                          10001
                                  10001
                                          10001 10001
                                                                10001 10001
                                                                                 10
    ##
128
      Resource
       Landscape
                  10001
                                  10001
                                          10001 10001
                                                        10001
                                                                10001 10001 10001
                          10001
129
                                          10001 10001
                                                        10001
    ##
      Res cost
                  10001
                          10001
                                  10001
                                                                10001 10001 10001
130
    ## U1 cost
                  10001
                          10001
                                  10001
                                          10001 10001
                                                        10001
                                                                10001 10001 10001
131
    ##
      U2_cost
                  10001
                          10001
                                  10001
                                          10001 10001
                                                        10001
                                                                10001 10001 10001
132
    ##
                             Feed Help_off
                  Castrate
133
    ## Resource
                      10001 10001
                                      10001
                                                 10
134
                      10001 10001
    ## Landscape
                                      10001
                                                 10
135
    ## Res cost
                      10001 10001
                                      10001 10001
    ## U1 cost
                      10001 10001
                                      10001 10001
137
    ##
       U2_cost
                      10001 10001
                                      10001 10001
138
    ##
139
       , , User_2_Actions
    ##
140
    ##
141
    ##
                    Act Type_1 Type_2 Type_3 Util. U_land U_loc. Scare
                                                                               Cull
142
                                                                                 10
                  10001
                          10001
                                  10001
                                          10001 10001
                                                        10001
                                                                10001 10001
       Resource
143
       Landscape 10001
                          10001
                                  10001
                                          10001 10001
                                                        10001
                                                                10001 10001 10001
144
                                          10001 10001
                                                        10001
    ##
      Res_cost
                  10001
                          10001
                                  10001
                                                                10001 10001 10001
145
    ## U1 cost
                  10001
                          10001
                                  10001
                                          10001 10001
                                                        10001
                                                                10001 10001 10001
146
                                  10001
    ## U2 cost
                  10001
                          10001
                                         10001 10001
                                                        10001
                                                                10001 10001 10001
147
    ##
                  Castrate Feed Help off
148
```

```
## Resource
                      10001 10001
                                       10001
                                                 10
149
                      10001 10001
                                       10001
                                                 10
   ## Landscape
150
                                       10001 10001
   ## Res cost
                      10001 10001
151
   ## U1_cost
                      10001 10001
                                       10001 10001
   ## U2 cost
                      10001 10001
                                       10001 10001
153
```

Note that in default GMSE parameters, culling = TRUE, but all other actions are false. Hence the Cull 154 column 9 is the only column besides column 13 None in which cost is less than 10001. Manager's actions in 155 ACTION directly affect the cost of users performing one of the five possible actions on resources (columns 8-12). 156 This can be verified in ACTION where the manager has set the cost of scaring to 10, and the corresponding 157 COST of resource culling (row 1) is 10 for both users. The cost of the manager affecting the cost of user 158 actions is always set to the minimum_cost defined in GMSE; here the default 10 is used. This minimum_cost also defines cost values for None, in which the user or manager does nothing, as might occur if the manager 160 wants to permit culling and therefore does not want to invest any of their manager_budget to increasing the cost of culling. Both ACTION and COST are updated in each time step unless manage_freq > 1, in which case 162 COST and Manager_Actions in ACTION are at the frequency defined. 163

General overview of key aspects of the genetic algorithm

165 It is the ACTION array that is affected by the genetic algorithm.

- 166 Crossover
- 167 Mutation
- 168 Cost constraint
- 169 Fitness evaluation
- 170 Tournament selection
- 171 Replacement

Detailed explanation of manager and user fitness functions

- 173 Manager fitness function
- User fitness function

Thanks for the clarification regarding the equation. I'll try to answer as best as I can – apologies if this has been unclear. At the broadest scale, the equation for user fitness would be on L367 in the strategy fitness 176 function (https://github.com/bradduthie/gmse/blob/master/src/game.c#L376). Here's what's going on: 177 Users are predicting how their actions will change the quantities of things in the model (either resources or 178 landscape output), and these changes are individually multiplied by the users' utilities for that thing. The 179 change multiplied by utility for each thing is summed across all things to get a value for fitness. Note that 180 positive change times positive utility, and negative change times negative utility, will increase fitness (i.e., 181 increasing the thing users want more of and decreasing the things they want less of). Hence, an equation 182 describing user fitness would be the below,

$$F_{user} = \sum_{i=1}^{N} \Delta A_i \times U_i$$

184 .

Where F_{user} is user fitness, N is the total number of things that might be of interest (at the moment N=2 in GMSE, one resource and, potentially, one landscape value), ΔA_i is the change in the abundance of thing i, and U_i is the utility of thing i from the perspective of the user (apologies for the LaTeX code – attached a PNG of the conversion). I want to stress though that I would not consider this equation to be central to the GMSE framework – if someone else has a better approach for defining fitness, or defining any of the terms listed above, or wants to expand upon it to include new things, then that would be awesome! The above just works well as a heuristic tool to get users to act in such a way as to maximise their interests in harvesting or getting more crop yield (as is my intent), but it's not based on first principles and I don't claim it to be particularly special.

The values of ΔA_i are calculated for resources and the landscape in the functions res_to_counts and land_to_counts, respectively (and U_i is specified a priori in the model depending on other parameters – namely land_ownership). Again, a bit of heuristic is needed here because there cannot be any perfect way of exactly predicting how a users actions will increase or decrease resources – there are too many complex factors (e.g., behaviour of other stakeholders, demographic stochasticity, movement of resources on the landscape, and interactions between resources and the landscape). Even if we could include all of these things somehow, it would be a bit unrealistic in that real stakeholders would never have this much information. The predicted direct effect of actions on resources is shown in lines 268-272 (https://github.com/bradduthie/gmse/blob/master/src/game.c#L268), and the array 'jaco' (a sort of Jacobian matrix) accounts for interactions between landscape and resources on line 286. Something similar happens in the land_to_counts function. The manager's genetic algorithm works in a similar way (the above equation applies), but with the need to dynamically update utility values based on current resource abundance, and to account for the predicted actions of users in finding ΔA_i .