A lagrangian mechanics oriented approach to neural networks

A S Roberts

Department of Physics, University of Bath, Claverton Down, Bath BA2 7AY, UK

Abstract. Lorem ipsum dolor sit amet, consectetuer adipiscing elit. Ut purus elit, vestibulum ut, placerat ac, adipiscing vitae, felis. Curabitur dictum gravida mauris. Nam arcu libero, nonummy eget, consectetuer id, vulputate a, magna. Donec vehicula augue eu neque. Pellentesque habitant morbi tristique senectus et netus et malesuada fames ac turpis egestas. Mauris ut leo. Cras viverra metus rhoncus sem. Nulla et lectus vestibulum urna fringilla ultrices. Phasellus eu tellus sit amet tortor gravida placerat. Integer sapien est, iaculis in, pretium quis, viverra ac, nunc. Praesent eget sem vel leo ultrices bibendum. Aenean faucibus. Morbi dolor nulla, malesuada eu, pulvinar at, mollis ac, nulla. Curabitur auctor semper nulla. Donec varius orci eget risus. Duis nibh mi, congue eu, accumsan eleifend, sagittis quis, diam. Duis eget orci sit amet orci dignissim rutrum.

1. Introduction

1.1. Neural Networks in Physics

Machine learning has become the latest addition to the modern physicists toolkit with a broad range of applications from deep learning for imaging in medical physics [1] to large scale data analysis in astrophysics [2]. Machine learning and often neural networks are allowing physicists to tackle problems which were previously intractable due to the size and scale of the computational required. To understand how this tool can be used one must first understand how the tool works.

Neural networks are the most common form of machine learning and work by finding a generalised non-linear function (the neural network) between the input and output spaces. The input space is the space of data in which patterns aim to be discovered. For medical imaging this might be pixel values for a certain size image or in astrophysics it may be a range of luminosity values attributed to certain wavelengths of light. The output space is similar, a space of possible outputs such as possible classifications of an astrophysical object with respective confidence levels.

One of the main draws of neural networks is the ability to apply the function to any object in the input space, even if previously unseen. The neural network can be seen as a connected graph where each node and connection has a weighting (weights and biases respectively). To obtain a function that can accurately predict an outcome for any element of the input space the neural network has to be trained. This training involves taking a known subset of the input and output spaces called the training data set along with a loss function $f_{\rm loss}$. The loss function compares the neural networks calculated outputs with the known (true) outputs in the training data. Starting with a randomly initialised neural network (randomised weights and biases) the following process can be repeated to slowly optimise the network:

- (i) Pass an element of the training data through the neural network
- (ii) Calculate losses for the output
- (iii) Take the gradient of the loss function with respect to the weights and biases in the neural network
- (iv) Update the weights and biases according to $-\nabla f_{\rm loss}$ to minimise the loss of the function

By repeating this process local minima of the loss function can be found thereby optimising the neural network. Ideally, a global minima would be found but this is not guaranteed by the method outlined above. Optimisation algorithms such as Adaptive Moment Estimation (ADAM) optimiser [3] can be implemented in order to increase these chances by varying the size of the updates made when taking the gradient of the loss function.

With the ability to identify possibly unseen patterns in data, neural networks are an ideal tool for physicists. One area of neural network development related to this is that of physics informed neural networks (PINN's). These are neural networks that have been given a priori knowledge such as basic physical laws. This knowledge can be encoded into the model in a multitude of ways. Physics informed layers of the neural network are one such encoding such as layers that enforce conservation laws for fluid dynamics. Another encoding is via loss function formulation where the loss function incorporates terms derived from the governing physics equations. These terms will act to penalise the model for deviation from known physical laws.

1.2. Lagrangian Mechanics

Here we provide a brief overview of Lagrangian Mechanics, a formalism of classical mechanics prioritising the energy of a system as its initial reference point.

Lagrange's formalism considers a set of generalised coordinates $\{q_1, q_2, \ldots, q_n, \dot{q}_1, \dot{q}_2, \ldots, \dot{q}_n, t\}$ (hereon denoted as the vectors \mathbf{q} and $\dot{\mathbf{q}}$) which are used to express the kinetic, T, and potential, V, energies of the system. The Lagrangian

$$\mathcal{L}(\mathbf{q}, \dot{\mathbf{q}}, t) = T(\mathbf{q}, \dot{\mathbf{q}}, t) - V(\mathbf{q}, \dot{\mathbf{q}}, t) \tag{1}$$

is defined as the difference between the two energies of the system. The Lagrangian provides the final object of interest the action, S, defined as

$$S = \int_{t_1}^{t_2} \mathcal{L}(\mathbf{q}, \dot{\mathbf{q}}, t) dt$$
 (2)

a functional of which stationary points are of interest. Hamilton's principle [4] that these stationary points are where the Lagrangian models physical reality i.e. $\delta S=0$.

From here the equations of motions (EoMs) can be obtained by applying the Euler-Lagrange equation which is equivalent to minimising the action (and thus finding its stationary points)

$$\frac{\partial \mathcal{L}}{\partial q_i} - \frac{d}{dt} \left(\frac{\partial \mathcal{L}}{\partial \dot{q}_i} \right) = 0 \tag{3}$$

where we obtain n differential equations for the n generalised coordinates. Equation 3 then provides a generalised form for the EoMs of a conservative system.

1.2.1. Example: Simple Harmonic Oscillator

A motivating example may be that of the 1dimensional simple harmonic oscillator given by the differential equation

$$\ddot{x} = x \tag{4}$$

with position x, mass m and spring constant k. The kinetic energy of this system is then given by

$$T = \frac{1}{2}m\dot{x}^2\tag{5}$$

and the potential energy by

$$V = \frac{1}{2}kx^2 \tag{6}$$

This gives the lagrangian

$$\mathcal{L} = \frac{1}{2}m\ddot{x}^2 - \frac{1}{2}kx^2 \tag{7}$$

which when inputted into equation 3 once again provides our known equation of motion

$$\ddot{x} = \frac{k}{m}x\tag{8}$$

Conservation laws can also be identified through the use of lagrangian mechanics via Noether's Theorem [4]. It states that every differentiable symmetry of the action for a conservative system has a corresponding conservation law. The conserved values are often known as Noether currents when considered as functions of time.

1.2.2. Nonconservative Lagrangians

Galley, Tsang and Stein [5] propose a generalisation of Noether's Theorem to allow for non-conservative systems. This works by generalising to the nonconservative lagrangian, Λ , of the form

$$\Lambda = \mathcal{L}(\mathbf{q_1}, \dot{\mathbf{q}_1}, t) - \mathcal{L}(\mathbf{q_2}, \dot{\mathbf{q}_2}, t) + K(\mathbf{q_1}, \dot{\mathbf{q}_1}, \mathbf{q_2}, \dot{\mathbf{q}_2}, t)$$
(9)

where \mathcal{L} is the lagrangian as defined previously and K is an additional coupling term physically similar to a non-conservative potential. The generalised coordinates are doubled, as explained by Galley [6], from $\mathbf{q}, \dot{\mathbf{q}}$ to $\mathbf{q}_1, \dot{\mathbf{q}}_1, \mathbf{q}_2, \dot{\mathbf{q}}_2$. This allows for the conversion of Hamiltons principle from a boundary value problem (i.e. "minimise the action passing through given initial and final values") to an initial value problem involving twice the degrees of freedom. These new generalised coordinates must satisfy $q_1(t) = q_2(t)$ and $\dot{q}_1(t) = \dot{q}_2(t)$ for $t \in \{t_i, t_f\}$.

Galley [6] also shows that K must be antisymmetric in swapping the indices and therefore must also vanish for $\mathbf{q}_1 = \mathbf{q}_2, \dot{\mathbf{q}}_1 = \dot{\mathbf{q}}_2$.

For convenience a change of coordinates is often performed due to physical motivation. These are $q_{-} = (q_1 - q_2)/2$ and $q_{+} = (q_1 + q_2)/2$ where the former can be considered a hypothetical displacement that

galley figure

vanishes in the physical limit $q_- \to 0$ and the latter the physically relevant component of the coordinates. Note here that equation 9 continues to satisfy the Euler Lagrange equation (equation 3) when evaluated in the physical limit (PL). This is formulated as

$$\frac{d}{dt} \left[\frac{\partial \Lambda}{\partial \dot{q}_{-}} \right]_{PL} - \left[\frac{\partial \Lambda}{\partial q_{-}} \right]_{PL} = 0 \tag{10}$$

1.2.3. Hamiltonian Mechanics

Another formulation of classical mechanics similar to lagrangian mechanics is that of Hamiltonian mechanics. As the name suggests the object of interest here is the classical Hamiltonian H defined as

$$H = T + V \tag{11}$$

This produces first order ordinary differential equations (ODEs) as the equations of motion

$$\frac{dq_i}{dt} = \frac{\partial H}{\partial p_i}, \frac{dp_i}{dt} = -\frac{\partial H}{\partial q_i}$$
 (12)

This formulation is often useful for symplectic integrators [7] as discussed in section 1.3.

1.3. Slimplectic Integrator

Integrators are another tool within the modern physicists toolbox. Many physics problems have non-analytic solutions and this is where integrators make their appearance. Many integrators exist and are specialised for different applications. The Runge-Kutta method [8] is a well known and widely applied group of methods used for a balanced trade off between accuracy and efficiency. RK45 is perhaps paramount of these with an efficient method of finding solutions to problems with stronger than 4th order accuracy. One issue that Runge-Kutta faces however is that of compounding error. Whilst any one term has bounded error when using Runge-Kutta for integration, the total accumulation of error is not bounded causing issues for systems evolved over longer time periods.

A remedy to this is another class of integrators called Symplectic integrators. These preserve (up to computational rounding) the differential 2-form called the symplectic form. Preservation of the symplectic form is analogous to preservation of certain physical constants. Due to this preservation the symplectic integrator is often used in integration of systems over long time scales. This is particularly common in orbital mechanics [9,10] but also finds uses in statistical algorithms [11].

One construction of symplectic integrators is via the means of variational integrators which are determined by the variation of a discretised action. This differs from traditional numerical integrators, such as Runge-Kutta, which discretises the equations of motion themselves.

Symplectic integrators are often used to solve Hamiltonian systems numerically. One common approach used for symplectic integrators is splitting methods such as the leapfrog and Verlet [12] methods. These work by splitting the Hamiltonian into smaller, more manageable parts and iteratively solving the system. By splitting the Hamiltonian like this the integrator can approximate solutions whilst preserving important geometric properties (such as the symplectic form, volume or energy) at a global level.

1.3.1. The "Slimplectic" Integrator

Tsang et al. [13] have developed a variational integrator, the "Slimplectic" integrator, from the nonconservative action principle [5]. Starting with equation 10 the action integral $S = \int_{t_i}^{t_f} \Lambda(q_{\pm}, q_{\pm}, t) dt$ is discretised using Galerkin-Gauss-Lobatto (GGL) quadrature [14] as shown in figure 1.3.1. The GGL quadrature is chosen as it is an even order method and therefore symmetric under time reversal $(t \to -t)$. The interval $t \in [t_n, t_{n+1}]$ has r+2 quadrature points given by

$$t_n^{(i)} \equiv t_n + (1+x_i)\frac{\Delta t}{2} \tag{13}$$

where $\Delta t = (t_{n+1} - t_n)/2$, $x_0 \equiv -1, x_{r+1} \equiv 1$ and x_i is the *i*th root of dP_{r+1}/dx , the derivative of the (r+1)th Legendre polynomial $P_{r+1}(x)$.

To obtain approximations of values for $\dot{q}_{n,\pm}^{(i)}(t)$ at the quadrature points the derivative matrix [15]

$$D_{ij} = \begin{cases} -(r+1)(r+2)/(2\Delta t) & i = j = 0\\ (r+1)(r+2)/(2\Delta t) & i = j = r+1\\ 0 & i = j \notin \{0, r+1\}\\ \frac{2P_{r+1}(x_i)}{P_{r+1}(x_j)(x_i - x_j)\Delta t} & i \neq j \end{cases}$$

$$(14)$$

is used to give

$$\dot{q}_{n,\pm}(t_n^{(i)}) \simeq \sum_{j=0}^{r+1} D_{ij} q_{n,\pm}^{(j)}$$
 (15)

where Tsang et al. [13] provides more explanation as to the reasoning for this approximation.

GGL quadrature allows any functional $\int F dt$ to be approximated over an interval of time by a discrete

wobbly tsan figure

) --- 1- -- T---

Replace Ima



Figure 1. The discretisation of time used within the GGL method. This is used to approximate the action to N timesteps between t_i and t_f . Between t_n and t_{n+1} the quadrature discretises r times as according to equation ??

functional F_d given by

$$F_d^n \equiv F_d \left(q_{n,\pm}, \left\{ q_{n,\pm}^{(i)} \right\}_{i=1}^r, q_{n+1,\pm}, t_n \right)$$

$$\equiv \sum_{i=0}^{r+1} w_i F \left(q_{n,\pm}^{(i)}, \dot{\phi}_{n,\pm}^{(i)}, t_n^{(i)} \right), \tag{16}$$

where w_i is a weighting given by

$$w_i \equiv \frac{\Delta t}{(r+1)(r+2)[P_{r+1}(x_i)]^2}.$$
 (17)

With a discretisation of \dot{q}_{\pm} the action can be discretised by applying the methodology of equation 16 to equation 9 defined as

$$S_d[t_0, t_{N+1}] \equiv \sum_{n=0}^{N} \Lambda_d \left(q_{n,\pm}, \left\{ q_{n,\pm}^{(i)} \right\}_{i=1}^r, q_{n+1,\pm}, t_n \right).$$
(18)

This can

1.4. Loss Functions

2. Method

3. Results

Lorem ipsum dolor sit amet, consectetuer adipiscing elit. Ut purus elit, vestibulum ut, placerat ac, adipiscing vitae, felis. Curabitur dictum gravida mauris. Nam arcu libero, nonummy eget, consectetuer

id, vulputate a, magna. Donec vehicula augue eu neque. Pellentesque habitant morbi tristique senectus et netus et malesuada fames ac turpis egestas. Mauris ut leo. Cras viverra metus rhoncus sem. Nulla et lectus vestibulum urna fringilla ultrices. Phasellus eu tellus sit amet tortor gravida placerat. Integer sapien est, iaculis in, pretium quis, viverra ac, nunc. Praesent eget sem vel leo ultrices bibendum. Aenean faucibus. Morbi dolor nulla, malesuada eu, pulvinar at, mollis ac, nulla. Curabitur auctor semper nulla. Donec varius orci eget risus. Duis nibh mi, congue eu, accumsan eleifend, sagittis quis, diam. Duis eget orci sit amet orci dignissim rutrum.

Nam dui ligula, fringilla a, euismod sodales, sollicitudin vel, wisi. Morbi auctor lorem non justo. Nam lacus libero, pretium at, lobortis vitae, ultricies et, tellus. Donec aliquet, tortor sed accumsan bibendum, erat ligula aliquet magna, vitae ornare odio metus a mi. Morbi ac orci et nisl hendrerit mollis. Suspendisse ut massa. Cras nec ante. Pellentesque a nulla. Cum sociis natoque penatibus et magnis dis parturient montes, nascetur ridiculus mus. Aliquam tincidunt urna. Nulla ullamcorper vestibulum turpis. Pellentesque cursus luctus mauris.

Nulla malesuada porttitor diam. Donec felis erat, congue non, volutpat at, tincidunt tristique, libero. Vivamus viverra fermentum felis. Donec nonummy pellentesque ante. Phasellus adipiscing semper elit. Proin fermentum massa ac quam. Sed diam turpis, molestie vitae, placerat a, molestie nec, leo. Maecenas lacinia. Nam ipsum ligula, eleifend at, accumsan nec, suscipit a, ipsum. Morbi blandit ligula feugiat magna. Nunc eleifend consequat lorem. Sed lacinia nulla vitae enim. Pellentesque tincidunt purus vel magna. Integer non enim. Praesent euismod nunc eu purus. Donec bibendum quam in tellus. Nullam cursus pulvinar lectus. Donec et mi. Nam vulputate metus eu enim. Vestibulum pellentesque felis eu massa.

Quisque ullamcorper placerat ipsum. Cras nibh. Morbi vel justo vitae lacus tincidunt ultrices. Lorem ipsum dolor sit amet, consectetuer adipiscing elit. In hac habitasse platea dictumst. Integer tempus convallis augue. Etiam facilisis. Nunc elementum fermentum wisi. Aenean placerat. Ut imperdiet, enim sed gravida sollicitudin, felis odio placerat quam, ac pulvinar elit purus eget enim. Nunc vitae tortor. Proin tempus nibh sit amet nisl. Vivamus quis tortor vitae risus porta vehicula.

Fusce mauris. Vestibulum luctus nibh at lectus. Sed bibendum, nulla a faucibus semper, leo velit ultricies tellus, ac venenatis arcu wisi vel nisl. Vestibulum diam. Aliquam pellentesque, augue quis sagittis posuere, turpis lacus congue quam, in hendrerit risus eros eget felis. Maecenas eget erat in sapien mattis porttitor. Vestibulum porttitor. Nulla facilisi.

Sed a turpis eu lacus commodo facilisis. Morbi fringilla, wisi in dignissim interdum, justo lectus sagittis dui, et vehicula libero dui cursus dui. Mauris tempor ligula sed lacus. Duis cursus enim ut augue. Cras ac magna. Cras nulla. Nulla egestas. Curabitur a leo. Quisque egestas wisi eget nunc. Nam feugiat lacus vel est. Curabitur consectetuer.

Suspendisse vel felis. Ut lorem lorem, interdum eu, tincidunt sit amet, laoreet vitae, arcu. Aenean faucibus pede eu ante. Praesent enim elit, rutrum at, molestie non, nonummy vel, nisl. Ut lectus eros, malesuada sit amet, fermentum eu, sodales cursus, magna. Donec eu purus. Quisque vehicula, urna sed ultricies auctor, pede lorem egestas dui, et convallis elit erat sed nulla. Donec luctus. Curabitur et nunc. Aliquam dolor odio, commodo pretium, ultricies non, pharetra in, velit. Integer arcu est, nonummy in, fermentum faucibus, egestas vel, odio.

Sed commodo posuere pede. Mauris ut est. Ut quis purus. Sed ac odio. Sed vehicula hendrerit sem. Duis non odio. Morbi ut dui. Sed accumsan risus eget odio. In hac habitasse platea dictumst. Pellentesque non elit. Fusce sed justo eu urna porta tincidunt. Mauris felis odio, sollicitudin sed, volutpat a, ornare ac, erat. Morbi quis dolor. Donec pellentesque, erat ac sagittis semper, nunc dui lobortis purus, quis congue purus metus ultricies tellus. Proin et quam. Class aptent taciti sociosqu ad litora torquent per conubia nostra, per inceptos hymenaeos. Praesent sapien turpis, fermentum vel, eleifend faucibus, vehicula eu, lacus.

4. Discussion

Lorem ipsum dolor sit amet, consectetuer adipiscing Ut purus elit, vestibulum ut, placerat ac, Curabitur dictum gravida adipiscing vitae, felis. mauris. Nam arcu libero, nonummy eget, consectetuer id, vulputate a, magna. Donec vehicula augue eu neque. Pellentesque habitant morbi tristique senectus et netus et malesuada fames ac turpis egestas. Mauris ut leo. Cras viverra metus rhoncus sem. Nulla et lectus vestibulum urna fringilla ultrices. Phasellus eu tellus sit amet tortor gravida placerat. Integer sapien est, iaculis in, pretium quis, viverra ac, nunc. Praesent eget sem vel leo ultrices bibendum. Aenean faucibus. Morbi dolor nulla, malesuada eu, pulvinar at, mollis ac, nulla. Curabitur auctor semper nulla. Donec varius orci eget risus. Duis nibh mi, congue eu, accumsan eleifend, sagittis quis, diam. Duis eget orci sit amet orci dignissim rutrum.

Nam dui ligula, fringilla a, euismod sodales, sollicitudin vel, wisi. Morbi auctor lorem non justo. Nam lacus libero, pretium at, lobortis vitae, ultricies et, tellus. Donec aliquet, tortor sed accumsan

bibendum, erat ligula aliquet magna, vitae ornare odio metus a mi. Morbi ac orci et nisl hendrerit mollis. Suspendisse ut massa. Cras nec ante. Pellentesque a nulla. Cum sociis natoque penatibus et magnis dis parturient montes, nascetur ridiculus mus. Aliquam tincidunt urna. Nulla ullamcorper vestibulum turpis. Pellentesque cursus luctus mauris.

Nulla malesuada porttitor diam. Donec felis erat, congue non, volutpat at, tincidunt tristique, libero. Vivamus viverra fermentum felis. Donec nonummy pellentesque ante. Phasellus adipiscing semper elit. Proin fermentum massa ac quam. Sed diam turpis, molestie vitae, placerat a, molestie nec, leo. Maecenas lacinia. Nam ipsum ligula, eleifend at, accumsan nec, suscipit a, ipsum. Morbi blandit ligula feugiat magna. Nunc eleifend consequat lorem. Sed lacinia nulla vitae enim. Pellentesque tincidunt purus vel magna. Integer non enim. Praesent euismod nunc eu purus. Donec bibendum quam in tellus. Nullam cursus pulvinar lectus. Donec et mi. Nam vulputate metus eu enim. Vestibulum pellentesque felis eu massa.

Quisque ullamcorper placerat ipsum. Cras nibh. Morbi vel justo vitae lacus tincidunt ultrices. Lorem ipsum dolor sit amet, consectetuer adipiscing elit. In hac habitasse platea dictumst. Integer tempus convallis augue. Etiam facilisis. Nunc elementum fermentum wisi. Aenean placerat. Ut imperdiet, enim sed gravida sollicitudin, felis odio placerat quam, ac pulvinar elit purus eget enim. Nunc vitae tortor. Proin tempus nibh sit amet nisl. Vivamus quis tortor vitae risus porta vehicula.

Fusce mauris. Vestibulum luctus nibh at lectus. Sed bibendum, nulla a faucibus semper, leo velit ultricies tellus, ac venenatis arcu wisi vel nisl. Vestibulum diam. Aliquam pellentesque, augue quis sagittis posuere, turpis lacus congue quam, in hendrerit risus eros eget felis. Maecenas eget erat in sapien mattis porttitor. Vestibulum porttitor. Nulla facilisi. Sed a turpis eu lacus commodo facilisis. Morbi fringilla, wisi in dignissim interdum, justo lectus sagittis dui, et vehicula libero dui cursus dui. Mauris tempor ligula sed lacus. Duis cursus enim ut augue. Cras ac magna. Cras nulla. Nulla egestas. Curabitur a leo. Quisque egestas wisi eget nunc. Nam feugiat lacus vel est. Curabitur consectetuer.

Suspendisse vel felis. Ut lorem lorem, interdum eu, tincidunt sit amet, laoreet vitae, arcu. Aenean faucibus pede eu ante. Praesent enim elit, rutrum at, molestie non, nonummy vel, nisl. Ut lectus eros, malesuada sit amet, fermentum eu, sodales cursus, magna. Donec eu purus. Quisque vehicula, urna sed ultricies auctor, pede lorem egestas dui, et convallis elit erat sed nulla. Donec luctus. Curabitur et nunc. Aliquam dolor odio, commodo pretium, ultricies non, pharetra in, velit. Integer arcu est, nonummy in,

fermentum faucibus, egestas vel, odio.

Sed commodo posuere pede. Mauris ut est. Ut quis purus. Sed ac odio. Sed vehicula hendrerit sem. Duis non odio. Morbi ut dui. Sed accumsan risus eget odio. In hac habitasse platea dictumst. Pellentesque non elit. Fusce sed justo eu urna porta tincidunt. Mauris felis odio, sollicitudin sed, volutpat a, ornare ac, erat. Morbi quis dolor. Donec pellentesque, erat ac sagittis semper, nunc dui lobortis purus, quis congue purus metus ultricies tellus. Proin et quam. Class aptent taciti sociosqu ad litora torquent per conubia nostra, per inceptos hymenaeos. Praesent sapien turpis, fermentum vel, eleifend faucibus, vehicula eu, lacus.

5. Conclusion

Acknowledgments

References

- [1] Sahiner B, Pezeshk A, Hadjiiski L M, Wang X, Drukker K, Cha K H, Summers R M and Giger M L 2019 Med.~Phys. 46 e1–e36
- [2] Vanderplas J, Connolly A, Ivezić Ž and Gray A 2012 Introduction to astroml: Machine learning for astrophysics Conference on Intelligent Data Understanding (CIDU) pp 47 –54
- [3] Kingma D P and Ba J 2017 Adam: A method for stochastic optimization (*Preprint* 1412.6980)
- [4] Goldstein H 1980 Classical Mechanics (Addison-Wesley)
- [5] Galley C R, Tsang D and Stein L C 2014 Publisher: arXiv Version: 1 URL https://arxiv.org/abs/1412.3082
- [6] Galley C R 2013 Phys. Rev. Lett. 110(17) 174301 URL https://link.aps.org/doi/10.1103/PhysRevLett.110. 174301
- [7] Sanz-Serna J 1992 Acta Numerica 1 243 286
- [8] DeVries P and Hasbun J 2011 A First Course in Computational Physics (Jones & Bartlett Learning) p 215 ISBN 9780763773144
- [9] Wisdom J and Holman M 1991 The Astronomical Journal 102 1528–1538
- [10] Rein H and Tamayo D 2015 Monthly Notices of the Royal Astronomical Society 452 376–388 ISSN 0035-8711
- [11] Brooks S, Gelman A, Jones G and Meng X L 2011 Handbook of Markov Chain Monte Carlo (Chapman and Hall/CRC) ISBN 9780429138508 URL http://dx.doi. org/10.1201/b10905
- [12] Verlet L 1967 Phys. Rev. 159(1) 98-103 URL https:// link.aps.org/doi/10.1103/PhysRev.159.98
- [13] Tsang D, Galley C R, Stein L C and Turner A 2015 The Astrophysical Journal Letters 809 L9 URL https: //dx.doi.org/10.1088/2041-8205/809/1/L9
- [14] Farr W M and Bertschinger E 2007 The Astrophysical Journal 663 1420-1433 (Preprint astro-ph/0611416)
- [15] Boyd J P 2001 Chebyshev and Fourier spectral methods (Courier Corporation)