

XXXXX

Via Email: XXXXXX@gmail.com

**FOI request 8723: Request for information on the Hitachi Super Express Train and resubmission of FOI request 8457**

This is sent further to my email of 13 April 2012. Thank you for your recent request for information on the above two subjects.

You requested:

1) To resubmit your FOI request FOI8457, confining the search to the Department for Transport's National Projects team. Your original request stated that you wished

*to determine whether communication has been made by any civil servant employed, directly or indirectly by the Department for Transport, regarding Thameslink, Crossrail or the Intercity Express programme through their personal e-mail accounts.*

2) *Any and all information concerning the Hitachi Super Express train and specifically any work involved in investigating cheaper to purchase, fund or operate alternatives offered by any suppliers, including but not limited to ALSTOM, Bombardier, Siemens and CAF.*

3) *Full anticipated operating costs for Hitachi Super Express and a like for like cost analysis for all other comparable trains in the UK (and overseas if available).*

In answer to your questions:

1) The DfT building block unit National Projects was dissolved in early 2011. The majority of that team now work in the DfT Major Network Upgrades unit. For the purpose of your enquiry we have requested that all current civil servants who previously served in National Projects, as well as all current civil servants who now serve in major Network Upgrades, search their personal e-mail accounts for correspondence on the subjects you have listed.

Ten civil servants were asked to conduct a search (one member of Major Network Upgrades is currently on long term sick-leave and was not contacted to request a search). The majority of civil servants, eight, returned a nil-return. Two civil servants found items relevant to your request: these have been collated in Annex A, in order of date of reception. All names of persons below the grade of Senior Civil Servant have been redacted.

Every e-mail in Annex A is copied to at least one official DfT e-mail address. Nevertheless the use of private e-mail accounts to conduct Government business

contravenes the Department's policy on secure use of Government Internet, and the breaches have been flagged to the appropriate internal disciplinary body.

2) The decision to appoint Hitachi as preferred bidder for the IEP rolling stock contract followed a competitive procurement process. Full details of the procurement process, including the relevant evaluation criteria, are contained in the IEP Invitation to Tender, published 16 November 2007, which is available on the Department's website: <http://www.dft.gov.uk/topics/iep/>. Three consortia pre-qualified for the competition: Alstom-Barclays, Express Rail Alliance (a consortium led by Siemens and Bombardier) and Hitachi Europe (now Agility Trains). Alstom-Barclays withdrew from the competition before tabling a bid. Guidance on the confidentiality of the procurement process is outlined in the IEP Evaluation Process Document, available on the DfT's archived website: <http://webarchive.nationalarchives.gov.uk/20100304012206/http://www.dft.gov.uk/pgr/rail/pi/iep/iepinvitationtotender/>.

Through the open procurement process under the European Union rules, including the placing of an OJEU notice, all of the manufacturers that you name were invited to bid alone for the Intercity Express Programme. The evaluation ensured that the most economically advantageous tender was selected of the ones that pre-qualified and submitted.

The Department carried out further value for money work on the Intercity Express Programme following the publication of the Foster Review in July 2010. At Annex B please find the results of the Department's appraisal of the Intercity Express Programme (IEP) bi-mode train option, which was carried out in December 2010, relative to a do-minimum option of refurbishing HST trains, and in comparison to the option of coupling electric to diesel rolling stock at electrification boundaries. This work informed the Secretary of State's decision to resume the programme in March 2011.

3) At Annex C please find details of anticipated operating costs for the IEP train fleet that were used in the economic appraisal work above. These are based on the Department's experience in the IEP procurement process and are not the exact costs of either bidder.

There is no directly equivalent rolling stock (ETCS equipped, 125mph top speed, 26m intercity vehicles, non-tilt, with a comparable performance regime, etc.) entering into service at a similar time as the IEP, so it is not possible to do a like-for-like cost analysis.

If you have any queries about this letter, please contact me. Please remember to quote the reference number above in any future communications.

Yours sincerely,

If you are unhappy with the way the Department has handled your request or with the decisions made in relation to your request you may complain within two calendar months of the date of this letter by writing to the Department's Information Rights Unit at:

Zone D/04  
Ashdown House  
Sedlescombe Road North  
Hastings  
East Sussex TN37 7GA  
E-mail: [FOI-Advice-Team-DFT@dft.gsi.gov.uk](mailto:FOI-Advice-Team-DFT@dft.gsi.gov.uk)

Please see attached details of DfT's complaints procedure and your right to complain to the Information Commissioner.

### **Your right to complain to DfT and the Information Commissioner**

You have the right to complain within two calendar months of the date of this letter about the way in which your request for information was handled and/or about the decision not to disclose all or part of the information requested. In addition a complaint can be made that DfT has not complied with its FOI publication scheme.

Your complaint will be acknowledged and you will be advised of a target date by which to expect a response. Initially your complaint will be re-considered by the official who dealt with your request for information. If, after careful consideration, that official decides that his/her decision was correct, your complaint will automatically be referred to a senior independent official who will conduct a further review. You will be advised of the outcome of your complaint and if a decision is taken to disclose information originally withheld this will be done as soon as possible.

If you are not content with the outcome of the internal review, you have the right to apply directly to the Information Commissioner for a decision. The Information Commissioner can be contacted at:

Information Commissioner's Office  
Wycliffe House  
Water Lane  
Wilmslow  
Cheshire  
SK9 5AF

# Annex B

## **ECML + GWML Summary, £m, 2002-03 prices, present value**

	Value for Money	BCR	NPV	PVC		PVB
<b>ECML + GWML</b>						
<b>IEP bi-mode</b>	High	2.2	1,951	DfT costs	1,133	3,542
				Non-DfT costs	457	
				Total costs	1,590	
<b>Coupling</b>	Medium	1.9	1,604	DfT costs	1,343	3,379
				Non-DfT costs	433	
				Total costs	1,776	

### **Notes:**

- (i) BCR is defined as PVB divided by PVC to Government (DfT Costs + Non-DfT costs)
- (ii) value for money takes into account non-monetised impacts such as improvements in air quality, reduction in greenhouse gases, improved interior quality of rolling stock
- (iii) demand cap at 2032-33
- (iv) the proposed BCR metric assumes that the indirect tax losses are treated as a disbenefit rather than as a cost to DfT
- (v) IEP Rolling Stock Options assume Great Western Main Line electrification to Oxford, Newbury and Bristol (via Bristol Parkway & Bath)

## Annex C

### IEP Modelling Assumptions

#### Capital Costs

In the recent appraisal of the Intercity Express Programme, the average capital rental costs of a bi-mode set were assumed to be around £180,000 per month and the average capital rental costs of an electric set were assumed to be around £170,000 per month.

#### Operating Costs

£			
	<i>Maintenance</i>	<i>Fuel</i>	<i>Variable track access charge</i>
<i>Bi-mode</i>			
When under diesel power	2.74	1.72	0.63
When under electric power	1.78	1.34	
<i>Electric</i>	1.78	1.32	0.57

#### Notes

All of the above costs are based on five-car short sets, and are given at 2009-10 prices.

The trains are for deployment in 2016-18 (and thus the capital costs include rolled up BEAMA inflation until that date, but are then deflated by RPI back to 2009-10).