



xxxxxxxxxxxxx
Campaign for Better Transport

By Email: xxxxxxxx

xxxxxxxxxx
Department for Transport
Local Transport Funding
Growth & Delivery
Zone 3/29
Great Minster House
33 Horseferry Road
London
SW1P 4DR
Direct Line: 0207 944 xxxx
xxxxxxxxxx

Web Site: www.dft.gov.uk

Our Ref: E0008699

12 March 2012

Dear xxxxxxx,

Thank you for your request for information about the latest carbon estimates for all road schemes in the following categories:

1. In the supported pool
2. In the development pool
3. Planned by the Highways Agency
4. That are being considered by the DfT

For the avoidance of doubt, the Department for Transport understands your categories to represent:

1. Supported Pool local authority major transport schemes set out in the October 2010 announcement – Investment in Local Major Transport Schemes (<http://assets.dft.gov.uk/publications/investment-in-local-major-transport-schemes/transport-schemes.pdf>).
2. Development Pool local authority major transport schemes set out in the January 2012 Investment in Local Major Transport Schemes: 2nd Update (<http://www.dft.gov.uk/publications/local-major-transport-schemes/>).
3. Schemes being delivered by the Highways Agency Major Projects Division as set out in the spending review announcement in October 2010 and the Autumn Statement in November 2011 (<http://www.highways.gov.uk/roads/29356.aspx>).
4. Other road schemes being considered by the DfT.

Where the data is available, we have provided the carbon impacts for each road scheme over the 60 year appraisal period as requested or the carbon impacts converted to CO₂ equivalents – see Table 1 for DfT Supported Pool schemes and Table 2 for Highways Agency schemes.

Please note that in the Tables below, a + carbon value indicates an increase in carbon over the 60 year appraisal period and a – carbon value indicates a reduction in carbon.

1. Schemes in the Supported Pool

Scheme	Approval Status	Carbon Benefit* (£000s, Present Value)	CO ₂ eq over appraisal period (tonnes)***	Comment
Thornton to Switch Island Link**	Programme Entry	10,908	-357,500	
Heysham to M6 Link Road**	Programme Entry	-5,100	Not available	A single year increase of 23,514 tonnes of CO ₂ reported for a future year (2010)
Taunton Northern Inner Distributor Road**	Programme Entry	8,548	Not available	
East of Exeter**	In Construction	955	-42,647	
Leeds Station Southern Access**	Programme Entry	400	Not available	
Ipswich Fit for the 21 st Century**	Programme Entry	-1,108	Not available	
A57 M1 J31 to Todwick Crossroads**	Programme Entry	N/A		Not monetised – qualitative assessment “neutral”
Mansfield Public Transport Interchange**	In construction	N/A		Not monetised
Mersey Gateway	Programme Entry	3,582	-150,477	
Midland Metro Phase Line 1 Improvements City Centre Extension	Full Approval	668	-6,297	Information taken from Full Approval submission
* Negative values indicate a disbenefit				
** Schemes were originally assessed using historic carbon values – original figures were uplifted by 150% as part of Spending Review adjustments (SR10 adjusted figures reported here).				
*** Carbon impacts were not always recorded in the Appraisal Summary Table over the full appraisal period. Carbon impacts converted to CO ₂ equivalents using a factor of 44/12.				

2. Schemes in the Development Pool

The Department has published an update document setting out the Development Pool process in more detail and, for the 41 schemes where decisions have been announced, we have published the Department's internal assessment of the bids using the 5 elements of the Transport Business Case, as well as the individual funding offer letters for each scheme. The assessment sheets contain information about the carbon estimates for these schemes. Therefore under section 21 of the Act (the full text of the exemption is attached at Annex A), we are not required to provide information which is reasonably accessible to you. The information is available on the Department's website at the following link:

<http://www.dft.gov.uk/publications/local-major-transport-schemes/>.

There were 45 schemes in total and decisions for the remaining 4 schemes - Leeds New Generation Transport (Trolleybus), South Essex Rapid Transit (Essex/Thurrock/Southend), Waverley Link Road (Rotherham) and Bexhill to Hastings Link Road (East Sussex) - were deferred and we have not yet published any documents for these schemes. It is intended to publish the assessment of the bids for these schemes and the decision letters once the deferment period is over and decisions have been made later this year. Therefore this

information is being withheld in reliance on the exemption at Section 22 - 'information intended for future publication' of the Freedom of Information Act 2000.

Section 22 is a qualified exemption which means we are required to balance the public interest in disclosing the information against withholding it. There is a clear public interest in these 4 remaining local major transport schemes. The department should be open, honest and transparent about how it reached decisions in relation to these schemes. However it's also important that we are able to publish information in a manner, form and timing of our own choosing. The Department is currently busy considering these schemes and plans to publish the information you seek later this year. We consider that a single publication of this information having fully considered all of the facts is in the public interest. Therefore on balance the public interest in maintaining the exemption outweighs the public interest in disclosure, see Annex B. I would be happy to send you a link to the information once it has been published if you would find it useful.

3. Highways Agency Schemes

Table: Change in Carbon Emissions over the 60 Year Appraisal Period for Highways Agency Schemes

Scheme	Change in Carbon Emissions (tonnes)	Approval Status
A23 Handcross to Warninglid	+61,646	Approved for advanced works
M62 Jn25-30 Managed Motorway	-370,096	Under construction
M4 Jn19-20 & M5 Jn15-17 Managed Motorway	+275,579	Under construction
A11 Fiveways to Thetford	+79,651	Being Assessed
M6 Jn5-8 Managed Motorway	-32,586	Approved to proceed to construction
M1 Jn32-35a Managed Motorway (a)	+30,971	Being Assessed
M25 Jn5-6/7 Managed Motorway (a)	+745,333	Being Assessed
M25 Jn23-27 Managed Motorway	Not available	Being Assessed
M1 Jn28-31 Managed Motorway	Not available	Being Assessed
A556 Knutsford – Bowdon (a)	+79,472	Being Assessed
M60 Jn8-12 Managed Motorway	Not available	Being Assessed
M60 Jn12-15 Managed Motorway	Not available	Being Assessed
M62 Jn18-20 Managed Motorway	Not available	Being Assessed
M1 Jn39-42 Managed Motorway	Not available	Being Assessed
M3 Jn2-4a Managed Motorway	Not available	Being Assessed
A45/A46 Tollbar End Improvement	+359	Being Assessed
A14 Kettering Bypass	Not available	Being Assessed
M1 Jn19 / M6 Improvement (a)	+321,070	Being Assessed
M6 Jn10a-13 Managed Motorway	Not available	Being Assessed
A453 Widening	+21,171	Being Assessed
A1 Dishford to Leeming	+301,126	Under construction
M1 Jn19 Catthorpe Viaduct	Not available	Under construction
A3 Hindhead (b)	Increase in the opening year	Completed
M25 Jn16-23	+869,560	Under construction
M25 Jn27-30	+142,894	Under construction
M1 Jn10-13 Managed Motorway	+1,172,708	Under construction

A46 Newark to Widmerpool (b)	Increase in the opening year	Under construction
A421 Bedford to M1 (b)	Increase in the opening year	Completed
Notes (a) Information on changes in carbon emissions are indicative and based on previously completed scheme assessments. The presented carbon emissions are subject to change following completion of the latest assessments. (b) Information provided in the scheme's AST presents carbon values for the opening year only and not the 60 year appraisal. Approval Status: Being Assessed – the schemes is currently or in the near future subject to completion of an air quality assessment including calculation of carbon		

4. Other schemes being considered by the Department

In relation to local authority major schemes being considered, I can confirm that the Department holds draft Business Case material for the proposed SEMMMS A6 to Manchester Airport Relief Road scheme but this is held with a view to publication of the full business case shortly and is therefore being withheld in reliance on the exemption at section 22(1) of the FOI Act which relates to information intended for future publication.

Some of the information contained within the draft business case material, including the most recent assessment of the environmental impact falls under the Environmental Information Regulations 2004. This information is being withheld in reliance on the exception at 12(4)(d) - unfinished documents or incomplete data.

In applying both the qualified FOIA exemption and the EIR exception we have had to balance the public interest in withholding the information against the public interest in disclosure. The attached Annexes A and B set out the exemption and exception in full and details why the public interest test favours withholding the information. As the arguments are very similar, the public interest tests under the FOI Act and the EIR Regulations has been combined into one.

Once the final business case has been published, I would be happy to send you a link to it if you would find it useful.

If you have any queries about your request please contact me, quoting the reference number above in any future communications.

Yours sincerely,

xxxxxxxxx

Annex A

21 Information accessible to applicant by other means.

(1) Information which is reasonably accessible to the applicant otherwise than under section 1 is exempt information.

(2) For the purposes of subsection (1)—

(a) information may be reasonably accessible to the applicant even though it is accessible only on payment, and

(b) information is to be taken to be reasonably accessible to the applicant if it is information which the public authority or any other person is obliged by or under any enactment to communicate (otherwise than by making the information available for inspection) to members of the public on request, whether free of charge or on payment.

(3) For the purposes of subsection (1), information which is held by a public authority and does not fall within subsection (2)(b) is not to be regarded as reasonably accessible to the applicant merely because the information is available from the public authority itself on request, unless the information is made available in accordance with the authority's publication scheme and any payment required is specified in, or determined in accordance with, the scheme.

Annex B

Exemption in full	
<p>Section 22 (1) (a) of the FOIA - Information intended for future publication.</p> <p>The information is held by the public authority with a view to its publication, by the authority or any other person, at some future date (whether determined or not)</p> <p>Exceptions: 12 (4)(d) of the Environmental Information Regulations</p> <p>“The request relates to material which is still in the course of completion, to unfinished documents or incomplete data”</p>	
Public interest test factors for disclosure	Public interest test factors against disclosure
<p><u>Business Cases for the 4 deferred Development Pool schemes and SEMMMS</u></p> <p>Release of draft Business Case, including environmental assessment, material would promote greater transparency and accountability.</p> <p>Release of draft Business Case, including environmental assessment material would reveal how a scheme has been developed and inform those who have raised particular concerns about the inclusion of transport scheme proposals within Government Funding announcements.</p>	<p><u>Business Cases for the 4 deferred Development Pool schemes and SEMMMS</u></p> <p>Release of draft Business Case, including environmental assessment, material would represent work in progress and may not reflect a true picture of the costs, value and benefits of the value of a local major transport scheme proposal once finalised. Releasing information before it has been finally collated, analysed and checked for accuracy could, in some instances, provide inaccurate information and prove misleading</p> <p>It is important that local major transport scheme developers and the Department have the opportunity to share working drafts of Business case material to develop a joint understanding of a scheme proposal in the confidence, and understanding that the final business case will be published and open to scrutiny before a final funding decision is taken.</p> <p>The final business case for this scheme will be published once received by the Department. The scheme will be assessed in line with other local major schemes that were in the Department’s ‘Development Pool’ process, where all</p>

	Transport Business Case, funding and traffic modeling information will be published by both the Department and the promoting local authorities before a final funding decision is taken.
<p><u>Decision</u></p> <p>The Department is currently busy considering the 4 deferred Development Pool schemes and plans to publish the information later this year once the deferment period is over and decisions have been made. We consider that a single publication of this information having fully considered all of the facts is in the public interest. Therefore on balance the public interest in maintaining the exemption outweighs the public interest in disclosure.</p> <p>A full Business Case for SEMMMS including an environmental assessment for the scheme is expected to be received by the Department shortly and will be published by both the Department and the local authorities promoting the scheme. This will be consistent with the transparency process for other local major schemes within the Department's 'Development Pool' process where draft material was not published in advance of the final business case. The draft Business Case should therefore be exempted from release.</p>	