

Detailed Experimental Results

Additionally, we provide the detailed experimental results on the two public datasets (*i.e.*, PolNeAR and Riqua) and one proprietary dataset (*i.e.*, PoliticsZH). In the experiments, we use accuracy, precision, recall, and $F1$ to evaluate the performances of “Exact Match”, “Begin Match” and “Jaccard”. The corresponding experiments results are detailed in Table 1, Table 2 and Table 3, respectively. CRF and Cofe in the three tables refer to the models using CRF and Cofe based on word vectors directly to extract quotations.

From the results shown in the three tables, we have the following observations. First, CofeNet achieves significant advantages on all datasets and all evaluation metrics. It proves that our proposed CofeNet achieves the state-of-the-art performance on quotation extraction. Second, Cofe-based models perform better than CRF-based models. It reveals that our CofeNet is competitive and robust. Third, compared with the extraction of *source* and *cue*, almost all cases are better than CRF. It reveals that CofeNet achieves a more stable and substantial improvement in *content* extraction from the perspective of extraction targets. Last, our proposed CofeNet achieves more improvement on begin match and Jaccard than exact match. The above phenomena show that CofeNet has significant advantages in processing complicated text with variable lengths.

Table 1: Exact Match on PolNeAR, Riqua and PoliticsZH datasets.

Dataset	Model	Source				Cue				Content			
		Pre.	Rec.	F1	Acc.	Pre.	Rec.	F1	Acc.	Pre.	Rec.	F1	Acc.
PolNeAR	Rule	27.8	6.7	10.7	5.7	67.6	13.7	22.8	12.9	26.0	3.2	5.6	2.9
	CoreNLP	32.1	8.9	13.9	7.5	-	-	-	-	59.2	10.3	17.5	9.6
	CRF	62.6	42.4	50.6	33.8	66.3	44.7	53.4	36.4	36.8	23.5	28.6	16.7
	Cofe	64.1	60.2	62.1	45.0	69.0	58.4	63.3	46.3	59.6	43.6	50.4	33.7
	CNN	55.6	50.1	52.7	35.8	59.3	57.4	58.4	41.2	17.9	14.7	16.2	8.8
	w. CRF	63.1	59.1	61.0	43.9	66.7	59.0	62.6	45.6	46.9	38.0	42.0	26.6
	w. Cofe	60.5	63.9	62.2	45.1	63.7	60.5	62.1	45.0	52.1	44.5	48.0	31.6
	GRU	49.9	43.5	46.5	30.3	63.1	55.5	59.1	41.9	56.7	46.9	51.3	34.5
	w. CRF	68.0	63.7	65.8	49.0	68.2	62.7	65.3	48.5	59.3	51.5	55.1	38.0
	w. Cofe	70.2	64.0	67.0	50.3	70.0	63.0	66.3	49.6	65.6	52.3	58.2	41.1
Riqua	LSTM	52.4	41.2	46.1	30.0	63.8	54.2	58.6	41.5	55.7	46.0	50.4	33.7
	w. CRF	73.0	59.5	65.5	48.8	73.8	58.1	65.0	48.2	64.6	47.8	55.0	37.9
	w. Cofe	71.5	64.6	67.9	51.4	68.5	62.1	65.1	48.3	64.7	52.5	58.0	40.8
	BiLSTM	63.8	64.4	64.1	47.2	65.7	61.1	63.3	46.3	57.4	49.9	53.4	36.4
	w. CRF	73.1	66.4	69.6	53.4	72.2	62.0	66.7	50.0	66.0	53.4	59.0	41.9
	w. Cofe	71.0	71.3	71.2	55.2	69.4	64.8	67.0	50.4	65.5	59.2	62.2	45.1
	BiLSTM-L2	69.6	68.3	68.9	52.6	67.2	63.6	65.4	48.6	60.4	55.1	57.6	40.5
	w. CRF	71.8	70.4	71.1	55.2	68.1	66.1	67.1	50.5	62.5	59.4	60.9	43.8
	w. Cofe	71.9	74.7	73.3	57.9	66.1	66.3	66.2	49.5	64.7	62.6	63.6	46.7
	BERT	80.9	81.3	81.1	68.2	76.8	71.4	74.0	58.7	71.1	66.8	68.9	52.6
PoliticsZH	w. CRF	81.5	82.9	82.2	69.8	75.0	74.7	74.9	59.8	72.4	69.7	71.0	55.1
	w. Cofe	82.9	83.6	83.2	71.3	75.9	74.7	75.3	60.4	74.9	71.1	72.9	57.4
	Rule	29.8	11.7	16.8	9.2	57.5	26.7	36.5	22.3	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0
	CoreNLP	26.4	20.0	22.8	12.8	-	-	-	-	97.2	47.5	63.8	46.9
	CRF	60.5	38.3	46.9	30.7	52.7	68.6	59.6	42.5	39.5	46.6	42.7	27.2
	Cofe	83.6	46.7	59.9	42.8	92.9	75.6	83.3	71.4	93.8	89.6	91.7	84.6
	CNN	74.2	40.8	52.7	35.8	95.7	76.7	85.2	74.2	46.0	44.3	45.2	29.2
	w. CRF	64.5	40.8	50.0	33.3	91.6	75.6	82.8	70.7	47.0	45.3	46.1	29.9
	w. Cofe	85.5	49.2	62.4	45.4	93.0	76.7	84.1	72.5	87.7	84.2	85.9	75.3
	GRU	71.4	45.8	55.8	38.7	80.0	74.4	77.1	62.8	93.5	91.4	92.5	86.0
PoliticsZH	w. CRF	71.2	39.2	50.5	33.8	87.7	74.4	80.5	67.4	94.4	91.9	93.1	87.1
	w. Cofe	76.3	50.8	61.0	43.9	94.2	75.6	83.9	72.2	96.3	93.7	95.0	90.4
	LSTM	71.6	40.0	51.3	34.5	90.9	69.8	79.0	65.2	96.2	91.9	94.0	88.7
	w. CRF	79.7	45.8	58.2	41.0	92.8	74.4	82.6	70.3	95.7	91.0	93.3	87.4
	w. Cofe	81.7	48.3	60.7	43.6	93.0	76.7	84.1	72.5	96.7	93.2	94.9	90.4
	BiLSTM	83.6	42.5	56.4	39.2	94.4	77.9	85.4	74.4	93.9	90.5	92.2	85.5
	w. CRF	78.7	49.2	60.5	43.4	94.2	75.6	83.9	72.2	96.7	91.9	94.2	89.0
	w. Cofe	79.7	49.2	60.8	43.7	98.5	75.6	85.5	74.7	97.2	92.8	94.9	90.3
	BiLSTM-L2	79.8	55.8	65.7	48.9	95.6	75.6	84.4	73.0	97.1	91.9	94.4	89.4
	w. CRF	84.0	52.5	64.6	47.7	95.6	75.6	84.4	73.0	96.2	91.0	93.5	87.8
PoliticsZH	w. Cofe	81.5	55.0	65.7	48.9	94.4	77.9	85.4	74.4	96.3	93.2	94.7	90.0
	BERT	77.5	71.7	74.5	59.3	94.7	83.7	88.9	80.0	95.4	93.2	94.3	89.2
	w. CRF	88.3	69.2	77.6	63.4	95.8	79.1	86.6	76.4	96.7	92.3	94.4	89.5
	w. Cofe	81.2	82.5	81.8	69.2	92.5	86.1	89.2	80.4	94.1	94.6	94.4	89.3
	Rule	82.5	75.4	78.8	64.9	88.4	73.5	80.3	67.1	3.9	0.2	0.4	0.2
	CoreNLP	68.1	26.5	38.1	23.5	-	-	-	-	0.3	0.2	0.2	0.1
	CRF	82.3	80.9	81.6	68.9	81.2	78.7	80.0	66.6	51.3	41.2	45.7	29.6
	Cofe	88.2	90.4	89.3	80.7	85.9	85.2	85.5	74.7	72.0	70.7	71.3	55.4
	CNN	81.5	83.4	82.5	70.2	82.4	80.4	81.4	68.6	38.0	32.5	35.0	21.2
	w. CRF	85.9	87.7	86.8	76.6	83.4	81.3	82.3	70.0	60.6	61.3	61.0	43.9
	w. Cofe	87.6	90.0	88.8	79.8	85.3	86.6	86.0	75.4	72.4	71.8	72.1	56.4
PoliticsZH	GRU	84.2	86.8	85.5	74.6	81.9	82.2	82.1	69.6	65.9	65.5	65.7	48.9
	w. CRF	88.6	86.8	87.7	78.1	85.2	85.1	85.2	74.2	72.7	71.8	72.2	56.5
	w. Cofe	88.1	90.8	89.4	80.9	86.5	86.2	86.4	76.0	73.4	75.1	74.2	59.0
	LSTM	84.3	85.4	84.9	73.7	82.7	83.2	82.9	70.9	70.5	67.8	69.1	52.8
	w. CRF	87.4	89.5	88.5	79.3	85.5	85.3	85.4	74.5	72.4	70.8	71.6	55.7
	w. Cofe	86.8	92.1	89.4	80.8	83.5	87.4	85.4	74.6	69.2	74.1	71.6	55.7
	BiLSTM	87.4	87.5	87.5	77.7	85.4	87.1	86.2	75.8	72.1	68.5	70.3	54.1
	w. CRF	88.3	92.1	90.1	82.1	87.6	88.1	87.9	78.3	72.5	73.6	73.0	57.5
	w. Cofe	90.3	92.5	91.4	84.1	87.3	88.3	87.8	78.3	74.5	74.8	74.7	59.6
	BiLSTM-L2	87.9	89.7	88.8	79.8	86.1	87.4	86.7	76.6	73.2	71.1	72.1	56.4
PoliticsZH	w. CRF	89.2	92.3	90.8	83.1	86.5	89.1	87.8	78.2	71.9	72.6	72.2	56.5
	w. Cofe	90.0	94.2	92.1	85.3	86.6	88.5	87.6	77.9	75.4	77.1	76.3	61.6
	BERT	91.9	93.4	92.6	86.3	89.0	89.9	89.5	80.9	70.9	76.8	73.7	58.4
	w. CRF	91.5	95.3	93.4	87.6	88.6	91.2	89.9	81.6	75.9	78.5	77.1	62.8
	w. Cofe	92.2	95.3	93.7	88.2	89.9	90.7	90.3	82.3	77.3	78.8	78.0	64.0

Table 2: Begin Match on PolNeAR, Riqua and PoliticsZH datasets.

Dataset	Model	Source				Cue				Content			
		Pre.	Rec.	F1	Acc.	Pre.	Rec.	F1	Acc.	Pre.	Rec.	F1	Acc.
PolNeAR	Rule	33.7	8.1	13.0	7.0	74.8	15.2	25.3	14.5	48.6	5.9	10.5	5.5
	CoreNLP	49.1	13.6	21.3	11.9	-	-	-	-	63.3	11.0	18.7	10.3
	CRF	69.6	47.2	56.2	39.1	78.5	53.0	63.3	46.3	65.4	41.7	50.9	34.2
	Cofe	72.6	68.2	70.3	54.2	76.5	64.8	70.2	54.1	75.2	55.0	63.6	46.6
	CNN	69.5	62.6	65.9	49.1	69.0	66.7	67.8	51.3	67.1	55.2	60.6	43.4
	w. CRF	72.4	67.7	69.9	53.8	74.6	65.9	70.0	53.8	69.8	56.6	62.5	45.4
	w. Cofe	67.9	71.7	69.8	53.6	71.8	68.1	69.9	53.7	69.1	59.0	63.6	46.7
	GRU	62.5	54.4	58.2	41.0	72.8	64.0	68.1	51.7	71.8	59.3	65.0	48.1
	w. CRF	74.3	69.5	71.9	56.1	75.2	69.1	72.0	56.2	70.8	61.5	65.8	49.0
	w. Cofe	76.2	69.5	72.7	57.2	76.7	69.0	72.7	57.1	75.4	60.1	66.9	50.2
	LSTM	64.1	50.3	56.4	39.3	73.4	62.4	67.5	50.9	72.4	59.8	65.5	48.7
	w. CRF	79.1	64.5	71.1	55.1	81.3	64.1	71.7	55.8	77.4	57.3	65.8	49.1
	w. Cofe	76.5	69.2	72.7	57.1	75.5	68.5	71.8	56.0	73.9	60.0	66.2	49.5
Riqua	BiLSTM	74.1	74.7	74.4	59.2	75.3	70.1	72.6	57.0	72.4	62.9	67.3	50.7
	w. CRF	79.5	72.3	75.7	60.9	79.9	68.6	73.8	58.5	77.5	62.8	69.4	53.1
	w. Cofe	77.9	78.3	78.1	64.0	76.5	71.5	73.9	58.7	74.5	67.4	70.8	54.7
	BiLSTM-L2	77.4	76.0	76.7	62.2	74.6	70.6	72.6	57.0	73.7	67.3	70.3	54.2
	w. CRF	78.5	76.9	77.7	63.5	74.7	72.5	73.6	58.2	72.3	68.8	70.5	54.5
	w. Cofe	77.8	80.8	79.3	65.6	74.2	74.4	74.3	59.1	73.2	70.8	72.0	56.3
	BERT	86.0	86.4	86.2	75.7	84.2	78.3	81.1	68.2	81.2	76.3	78.7	64.9
	w. CRF	85.8	87.2	86.5	76.2	82.2	81.8	82.0	69.5	80.5	77.4	78.9	65.2
	w. Cofe	86.7	87.5	87.1	77.1	83.0	81.6	82.3	69.9	81.8	77.6	79.6	66.2
	Rule	29.8	11.7	16.8	9.2	57.5	26.7	36.5	22.3	10.0	1.4	2.4	1.2
	CoreNLP	26.4	20.0	22.8	12.8	-	-	-	-	97.2	47.5	63.8	46.9
	CRF	65.8	41.7	51.0	34.3	58.0	75.6	65.7	48.9	79.3	93.7	85.9	75.3
	Cofe	89.6	50.0	64.2	47.2	92.9	75.6	83.3	71.4	97.6	93.2	95.4	91.2
PoliticsZH	CNN	83.3	45.8	59.1	42.0	95.7	76.7	85.2	74.2	97.2	93.7	95.4	91.2
	w. CRF	76.3	48.3	59.2	42.0	91.6	75.6	82.8	70.7	96.2	92.8	94.5	89.5
	w. Cofe	89.9	51.7	65.6	48.8	93.0	76.7	84.1	72.5	97.6	93.7	95.6	91.6
	GRU	80.5	51.7	62.9	45.9	80.0	74.4	77.1	62.8	96.3	94.1	95.2	90.8
	w. CRF	84.9	46.7	60.2	43.1	87.7	74.4	80.5	67.4	96.7	94.1	95.4	91.2
	w. Cofe	86.3	57.5	69.0	52.7	94.2	75.6	83.9	72.2	97.7	95.0	96.3	92.9
	LSTM	83.6	46.7	59.9	42.8	90.9	69.8	79.0	65.2	97.2	92.8	94.9	90.3
	w. CRF	89.9	51.7	65.6	48.8	92.8	74.4	82.6	70.3	97.1	92.3	94.7	89.9
	w. Cofe	90.1	53.3	67.0	50.4	93.0	76.7	84.1	72.5	97.7	94.1	95.9	92.0
	BiLSTM	95.1	48.3	64.1	47.2	94.4	77.9	85.4	74.4	97.7	94.1	95.9	92.0
	w. CRF	88.0	55.0	67.7	51.2	94.2	75.6	83.9	72.2	97.6	92.8	95.1	90.7
	w. Cofe	90.5	55.8	69.1	52.8	98.5	75.6	85.5	74.7	98.6	94.1	96.3	92.9
PoliticsZH	BiLSTM-L2	84.5	59.2	69.6	53.4	95.6	75.6	84.4	73.0	98.1	92.8	95.4	91.1
	w. CRF	88.0	55.0	67.7	51.2	95.6	75.6	84.4	73.0	98.1	92.8	95.4	91.1
	w. Cofe	90.1	60.8	72.6	57.0	94.4	77.9	85.4	74.4	97.2	94.1	95.6	91.6
	BERT	81.1	75.0	77.9	63.8	94.7	83.7	88.9	80.0	97.7	95.5	96.6	93.4
	w. CRF	90.4	70.8	79.4	65.9	95.8	79.1	86.6	76.4	98.6	94.1	96.3	92.9
	w. Cofe	83.6	85.0	84.3	72.9	92.5	86.1	89.2	80.4	96.9	97.3	97.1	94.3
	Rule	83.1	75.9	79.3	65.7	89.5	74.4	81.2	68.4	64.1	3.7	7.0	3.6
	CoreNLP	70.5	27.4	39.5	24.6	-	-	-	-	3.6	1.6	2.2	1.1
	CRF	84.7	83.3	84.0	72.3	81.7	79.2	80.4	67.2	55.2	44.3	49.1	32.6
	Cofe	88.8	91.1	89.9	81.7	86.6	85.9	86.3	75.8	80.0	78.6	79.3	65.7
	CNN	86.8	88.8	87.8	78.2	84.6	82.5	83.6	71.8	80.9	69.1	74.5	59.4
	w. CRF	87.2	89.1	88.2	78.8	83.9	81.8	82.9	70.7	75.4	76.3	75.9	61.1
	w. Cofe	88.4	90.8	89.6	81.1	86.2	87.5	86.8	76.7	82.4	81.7	82.0	69.5
PoliticsZH	GRU	87.0	89.7	88.3	79.1	84.4	84.8	84.6	73.3	80.0	79.6	79.8	66.4
	w. CRF	89.9	88.1	89.0	80.2	86.0	85.9	86.0	75.4	81.8	80.8	81.3	68.5
	w. Cofe	88.8	91.5	90.1	82.0	87.2	86.8	87.0	77.0	81.0	82.8	81.9	69.3
	LSTM	87.8	88.9	88.4	79.2	84.4	84.8	84.6	73.3	83.6	80.4	82.0	69.5
	w. CRF	88.5	90.6	89.5	81.1	86.4	86.3	86.3	76.0	80.2	78.5	79.3	65.7
	w. Cofe	87.4	92.7	90.0	81.8	84.4	88.4	86.3	76.0	77.0	82.4	79.6	66.1
	BiLSTM	91.3	91.4	91.3	84.0	87.8	89.5	88.6	79.6	83.9	79.7	81.8	69.1
	w. CRF	89.6	93.5	91.5	84.4	89.0	89.6	89.3	80.7	79.7	81.0	80.3	67.1
	w. Cofe	91.4	93.6	92.5	86.0	88.2	89.1	88.7	79.6	81.8	82.1	82.0	69.4
	BiLSTM-L2	90.7	92.7	91.7	84.6	87.6	88.9	88.2	78.9	84.0	81.6	82.8	70.7
	w. CRF	90.2	93.4	91.8	84.8	87.6	90.3	88.9	80.1	80.4	81.1	80.8	67.7
	w. Cofe	90.7	95.0	92.8	86.6	87.5	89.4	88.4	79.2	82.3	84.2	83.3	71.3
	BERT	92.9	94.5	93.7	88.1	90.4	91.2	90.8	83.2	80.3	87.1	83.6	71.8
	w. CRF	92.1	96.0	94.0	88.7	89.3	92.0	90.6	82.8	83.6	86.4	85.0	73.9
	w. Cofe	92.9	96.0	94.4	89.4	90.7	91.5	91.1	83.6	86.1	87.7	86.9	76.8

Table 3: $J(\text{accard})$ on PolNeAR, Riqua and PoliticsZH datasets.

Model	PolNeAR			Riqua			PoliticsZH		
	Source	Cue	Content	Source	Cue	Content	Source	Cue	Content
Rule	8.8	14.4	6.1	11.2	22.3	2.4	66.8	69.7	3.7
CoreNLP	11.1	-	12.8	17.9	-	46.9	24.3	-	4.3
CRF	42.1	44.1	42.3	32.9	46.6	62.2	72.2	68.5	66.3
Cofe	52.3	52.4	52.3	45.3	71.4	88.8	81.8	77.5	80.9
CNN	45.1	49.4	30.2	39.6	74.2	58.5	76.5	72.1	46.7
w. CRF	53.1	53.0	49.5	38.5	70.7	58.8	78.6	72.6	72.7
w. Cofe	53.3	52.5	52.2	47.6	72.5	86.1	81.3	78.2	80.3
GRU	36.7	48.8	51.3	43.4	62.8	89.6	78.1	73.6	71.5
w. CRF	56.1	55.5	57.5	39.5	67.4	90.4	80.1	76.6	81.0
w. Cofe	56.4	56.3	57.5	49.7	72.2	92.3	82.1	78.5	83.9
LSTM	35.7	47.9	50.8	39.8	65.2	90.3	78.1	74.0	74.1
w. CRF	55.2	54.6	56.2	45.8	70.3	89.2	81.1	77.7	81.6
w. Cofe	56.6	55.0	56.8	48.7	72.5	91.7	82.2	77.9	82.7
BiLSTM	60.7	57.3	59.6	51.7	73.0	90.8	83.8	79.8	77.5
w. CRF	63.1	58.0	62.9	49.8	73.0	90.1	85.2	81.1	84.2
w. Cofe	65.1	58.6	64.7	54.6	74.4	91.3	87.0	81.4	86.1
BERT	74.8	67.4	70.0	62.4	80.0	92.9	88.2	84.0	84.4
w. CRF	75.6	68.9	72.7	66.1	76.4	92.5	89.3	84.7	88.3
w. Cofe	76.4	69.4	73.2	72.6	80.4	94.1	89.8	85.4	88.7