

UNDERSTANDING FAMILY LAW

UNDERSTANDING FAMILY LAW

Fourth Edition

John DeWitt Gregory

Distinguished Professor of Law Emeritus

Maurice A. Deane School of Law at Hofstra University

Peter Nash Swisher

Professor of Law

University of Richmond School of Law

Robin Fretwell Wilson

Class of 1958 Law Alumni Professor of Law

Washington and Lee University School of Law



CAROLINA ACADEMIC PRESS

Durham, North Carolina

ISBN: 978-0-7698-4744-3
eBook ISBN: 978-1-4224-8661-0

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Gregory, John DeWitt

Understanding family law / John DeWitt Gregory, Emeritus Distinguished Professor of Family Law, Hofstra University Maurice Deane School of Law, Peter Nash Swisher, Professor of Law, University of Richmond School of Law, Robin Fretwell Wilson, Class of 1958 Law Alumni Professor of Law, Washington and Lee University School of law -- Fourth edition.

p.cm.

Includes index.

ISBN 978-0-7698-4744-3

1. Domestic relations--United States. I. Swisher, Peter N., 1944- II. Wilson, Robin Fretwell. III. Title.

KF505.G734 2013

346.7301'5--dc23

2013001038

This publication is designed to provide authoritative information in regard to the subject matter covered. It is sold with the understanding that the publisher is not engaged in rendering legal, accounting, or other professional services. If legal advice or other expert assistance is required, the services of a competent professional should be sought.

Copyright © 2013 Carolina Academic Press, LLC
All Rights Reserved

No copyright is claimed in the text of statutes, regulations, and excerpts from court opinions quoted within this work.

Carolina Academic Press, LLC
700 Kent Street
Durham, North Carolina 27701
Telephone (919) 489-7486
Fax (919) 493-5668
www.caplaw.com

Printed in the United States of America
2018 printing

DEDICATION

To William Wilford Gregory, who taught me whatever I know about the unbought grace
of life

— John DeWitt Gregory

To Karen and Stephanie

— Peter Nash Swisher

To Walter Wadlington, a teacher and scholar to emulate

— Robin Fretwell Wilson

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Chapter 1	AN INTRODUCTION TO FAMILY LAW	1
§ 1.01	GENERAL INTRODUCTION	1
[A]	Legislative Regulation of Family Law	2
[B]	Judicial Regulation of Family Law	2
[C]	The Role of the Family Law Practitioner	5
§ 1.02	WHAT IS A FAMILY?	7
[A]	The Traditional Family	8
[B]	The Nontraditional Family	12
§ 1.03	STATE REGULATION OF FAMILY LAW	15
§ 1.04	FEDERAL REGULATION OF FAMILY LAW	16
§ 1.05	CONSTITUTIONAL PARAMETERS TO FAMILY LAW REGULATION	18
Chapter 2	MARRIAGE AND MARRIAGE ALTERNATIVES	21
§ 2.01	INTRODUCTION	21
§ 2.02	CONSENSUAL ALTERNATIVES TO MARRIAGE	22
[A]	Nonmarital Cohabitation: Contract Implications	24
[B]	Nonmarital Cohabitation: Property Issues	26
[C]	Nonmarital Cohabitation: Status Implications of Domestic Partnerships and Civil Unions	27
§ 2.03	MARRIAGE: A STATUS OR CONTRACT?	31
§ 2.04	FORMAL STATUTORY MARRIAGE	35
§ 2.05	INFORMAL MARRIAGES	36
[A]	Common Law Marriage	36
[B]	Putative Marriage	38
[C]	Marriage by Proxy	40
[D]	De Facto “Marriage”	41
[E]	“Marriage” by Estoppel	42
§ 2.06	THE LAST-IN-TIME MARRIAGE PRESUMPTION	44
§ 2.07	PROOF OF MARRIAGE	45
§ 2.08	CAPACITY AND INTENT TO MARRY	46
[A]	Void and Voidable Marriages	46
[B]	Same Sex Marriage	47
[C]	Bigamous and Polygamous Marriage	52
[D]	Incestuous Marriage: Prohibited Degrees of Kinship	53
[E]	Underage Marriage	55
[F]	Mental and Physical Incapacity	56
[1]	Mental Incapacity	56

TABLE OF CONTENTS

[2]	Physical Incapacity	57
[G]	Fraudulent Marriage	58
[H]	Marriage Under Duress	59
[I]	Sham Marriage	59
[J]	Marriage in Jest	60
§ 2.09	CONFLICT OF LAWS: WHICH MARRIAGE LAWS GOVERN?	61
§ 2.10	ANNULMENT OF MARRIAGE	62
[A]	Annulment Jurisdiction	62
[B]	Annulment Grounds and Defenses	63
[C]	Property and Support Rights on Annulment	64

Chapter 3	PROPERTY AND SUPPORT RIGHTS DURING MARRIAGE	67
§ 3.01	INTRODUCTION	67
§ 3.02	THE COMMON LAW THEORY OF PROPERTY RIGHTS	68
§ 3.03	THE “ <i>FEME SOLE</i> ESTATE” AND THE MARRIED WOMEN’S PROPERTY ACTS	69
[A]	The “ <i>Feme Sole</i> Estate”	69
[B]	The Married Women’s Property Acts	70
§ 3.04	CO-OWNERSHIP: HOW PROPERTY IS HELD VIS-À-VIS SPOUSES ..	71
[A]	Tenancy by the Entirety	71
[B]	Joint Tenancy	72
[C]	Tenancy in Common	73
§ 3.05	COMMON LAW PROPERTY RIGHTS ON DEATH OF A SPOUSE ..	74
[A]	Common Law Dower and Curtesy	75
[B]	Elective Share Statutes	76
§ 3.06	THE COMMUNITY PROPERTY SYSTEM	78
§ 3.07	THE UNIFORM MARITAL PROPERTY ACT	80
§ 3.08	MARRIAGE AS AN “ECONOMIC PARTNERSHIP”	82
§ 3.09	SUPPORT RIGHTS AND OBLIGATIONS	85
§ 3.10	THE DOCTRINE OF NECESSARIES	86
§ 3.11	SPOUSAL SUPPORT DURING SEPARATION	89
[A]	<i>Pendente Lite</i> Statutes	91
§ 3.12	STATUTORY SUPPORT OBLIGATIONS	91
[A]	Spousal and Child Support Statutes	91
[B]	Criminal Non-Support Statutes	92
§ 3.13	RIGHTS OF CONSORTIUM	93
§ 3.14	RELATIVE RESPONSIBILITY STATUTES	95
§ 3.15	SUPPORT ENFORCEMENT REMEDIES	97

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Chapter 4	MARITAL CONTRACTS AND AGREEMENTS	99
§ 4.01	INTRODUCTION	99
§ 4.02	MARRIAGE PROMISES AND PREMARITAL GIFTS	102
[A]	Breach of Promise to Marry	102
[B]	Fraudulent Inducement to Marry Actions	102
[C]	Contracts Restraining or Promoting Marriage	103
[D]	Premarital Gifts	104
§ 4.03	PREMARITAL AGREEMENTS	104
[A]	Traditional Versus Modern Approaches	104
[B]	The Uniform Premarital Agreement Act	108
§ 4.04	CONTRACTUAL AGREEMENTS BETWEEN HUSBAND AND WIFE	110
§ 4.05	POSTNUPTIAL AND SEPARATION AGREEMENTS	111
[A]	Separation Agreements: Necessary Elements	112
[B]	Separation Agreements: Application of Principles	116
Chapter 5	PROCREATION	119
§ 5.01	INTRODUCTION	119
§ 5.02	PATERNITY AND LEGITIMACY	120
[A]	Historical Background and Current Perspectives	120
[B]	The Presumption of Legitimacy	122
[C]	Children of Void and Voidable Marriages	125
[D]	Constitutional Protection of the Nonmarital Child	126
[E]	Paternity Grounds and Actions	128
[1]	The Uniform Parentage Act	129
[2]	Jurisdictional Issues	130
[3]	Private Promises and Contracts	130
[F]	Scientific Testing in Paternity Proceedings	131
[G]	Inheritance Rights	135
[H]	Artificial Insemination	137
[I]	Custody Issues	138
[J]	Claims and Defenses in Paternity Actions	140
§ 5.03	PROCREATION AND SEXUAL LIBERTY	142
[A]	The Right to Procreate	142
[B]	The Right to Sexual Liberty	143
§ 5.04	CONTRACEPTION	145
[A]	The Right to Contraception	146
[B]	Funding Contraception	148
§ 5.05	ABORTION	150
[A]	General Introduction	150
[B]	Constitutional Parameters: <i>Roe v. Wade</i>	151

TABLE OF CONTENTS

[C]	Constitutional Parameters: The State Response	153
[1]	Rights of the Potential Father	153
[2]	Rights of Minors	154
[3]	Health and Safety Regulations	156
[4]	Funding and Facilities	159
[5]	<i>Casey's Re-evaluation of Roe v. Wade</i>	162
[6]	Partial Birth Abortion and Infants Born Alive	164
[7]	Abortion Demonstrations and Conscientious Objections	165
§ 5.06	VOLUNTARY AND INVOLUNTARY STERILIZATION	167
[A]	Voluntary Sterilization	168
[B]	Involuntary Sterilization	169
[1]	<i>Buck and Skinner</i>	170
[2]	Modern Sterilization Issues	172
§ 5.07	ASSISTED CONCEPTION	177
[A]	Artificial Insemination	179
[B]	In Vitro Fertilization	188
[1]	Legality of and Access to In Vitro Fertilization in General	189
[2]	Leftover "Pre-Embryos" and the Right Not to Parent	190
[3]	Same-Sex Relationships	193
[4]	Third-Party Issues	194
[C]	Surrogate Motherhood	196
[1]	Traditional Surrogacy	197
[2]	Gestational Surrogacy	204
Chapter 6	ADOPTION	211
§ 6.01	ADOPTION AND TERMINATION OF PARENTAL RIGHTS	211
[A]	Introduction and Overview	211
[B]	Involuntary Termination of Parental Rights	212
[1]	Introduction	212
[2]	Statutory Requirements	212
[3]	Constitutional Considerations	213
[4]	Grounds for Termination of Parental Rights	215
[a]	Abandonment	215
[b]	Child Abuse, Neglect and Dependency	217
[c]	Failure to Provide Child Support	218
[d]	Unfitness	219
[e]	Mental or Physical Disability of the Parent	220
[f]	Best Interests of the Child	220
[C]	Independent or Private Adoption	221
[D]	Agency Adoption	224
[E]	Consent	226

TABLE OF CONTENTS

[1]	Who Must Give Consent?	226
[2]	Consent of the Unwed Father	227
[3]	Consent of Minor Parent	230
[4]	Revocation of Consent	231
[F]	Subsidized Adoptions and Children With Special Needs	232
[G]	Adult Adoption	233
[H]	Equitable Adoption	235
[I]	Second-Parent Adoption	235
[J]	Open Adoption	237
[K]	Effects of Adoption	240
Chapter 7	UNIQUE FAMILY ISSUES	243
§ 7.01	INTRODUCTION	243
§ 7.02	INTRAFAMILY TORT IMMUNITY AND LIABILITY	244
[A]	Interspousal Tort Actions	244
[B]	Child and Parent Tort Actions	247
§ 7.03	PARENTAL DISCIPLINE OF A CHILD	249
§ 7.04	PARENTAL LIABILITY FOR A CHILD'S ACT	250
§ 7.05	MEDICAL CARE FOR THE CHILD AND THE SPOUSE	251
§ 7.06	WRONGFUL DEATH, WRONGFUL BIRTH, WRONGFUL LIFE, AND WRONGFUL CONCEPTION	256
§ 7.07	REGULATION OF A CHILD'S EDUCATION	257
§ 7.08	DOMESTIC VIOLENCE	261
[A]	Spousal Abuse	263
[B]	Child Abuse	269
[C]	Spousal Rape	274
§ 7.09	CHILDREN IN NEED OF SUPERVISION	276
§ 7.10	FAMILY RIGHTS VERSUS INDIVIDUAL RIGHTS	278
Chapter 8	DIVORCE GROUNDS AND DEFENSES	281
§ 8.01	INTRODUCTION	281
[A]	Historical Background	281
[B]	Fault Grounds for Divorce and the No-Fault Revolution	282
[C]	Current Divorce Concerns and Statistics	284
[D]	The Continuing Debate Over Fault Factors in Contemporary Divorce Actions	285
§ 8.02	JURISDICTION AND VENUE	287
[A]	Divorce Jurisdiction in General	287
[B]	The Domiciliary Requirement	288
[C]	Venue	292
[D]	Service on the Defendant	292

TABLE OF CONTENTS

[E]	Bilateral Divorces	293
[F]	Ex Parte Divorces	293
[G]	Migratory Divorces	294
[1]	Sister State Divorces	294
[2]	Foreign Country Divorces	297
[H]	The Divisible Divorce Doctrine	300
[I]	Long-Arm Statutes	302
[J]	Collateral Attack and Estoppel	303
§ 8.03	DIVORCE GROUNDS AND DEFENSES	306
[A]	Introduction	306
[B]	Fault Grounds for Divorce	306
[1]	Bed and Board Divorces and Absolute Divorces	306
[2]	Adultery Grounds	307
[3]	Cruelty Grounds	309
[4]	Desertion Grounds	311
[5]	Other Miscellaneous Fault Grounds	312
[C]	Defenses to Fault-Based Divorce	313
[1]	Connivance	313
[2]	Collusion	314
[3]	Condonation and Cohabitation	315
[4]	Recrimination	315
[5]	Justification	317
[6]	Other Defenses	317
[D]	Divorce Based upon Living Separate and Apart	318
[E]	No-Fault Divorce Grounds	320
[F]	Effect of Fault on Property Division and Spousal Support	322
[G]	“Economic Fault”	325
[H]	Divorce Practice and Procedure	325
[I]	Appellate Review	327
§ 8.04	ETHICAL ISSUES FOR THE FAMILY LAWYER	328
[A]	Dual Representation in Divorce Proceedings	328
[B]	Confidential Information	332
[C]	Attorney Fees on Divorce	334
[D]	Sexual Relations with a Divorce Client	335
[E]	Candor Toward the Court and Withdrawal from the Case	337
[F]	Pro Se Divorces	338
[G]	Representing Children	340
§ 8.05	ALTERNATIVE DISPUTE RESOLUTION	341
[A]	Divorce Mediation	341
[B]	Arbitration	345
[C]	Collaborative Law	348

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Chapter 9	SPOUSAL AND CHILD SUPPORT ON DIVORCE	351
§ 9.01	INTRODUCTION	351
§ 9.02	JURISDICTION FOR SPOUSAL AND CHILD SUPPORT	354
[A]	The Doctrine of Continuing Jurisdiction	354
[B]	The Doctrine of Divisible Divorce	354
[C]	Interstate Enforcement Legislation	355
[D]	State Long-Arm Statutes	356
[E]	Child Support Jurisdiction: The <i>Kulko</i> Case	356
§ 9.03	SPOUSAL SUPPORT FACTORS AND JUDICIAL DISCRETION	358
[A]	General Factors	359
[B]	Fault as a Factor in Spousal Support	361
§ 9.04	FORMS OF SPOUSAL SUPPORT	362
[A]	Temporary Spousal Support <i>Pendente Lite</i>	362
[B]	“Permanent” Spousal Support	363
[C]	“Rehabilitative” Spousal Support	365
[D]	New or Hybrid Forms of Alimony	371
§ 9.05	MODIFICATION OF SPOUSAL SUPPORT	374
§ 9.06	CHILD SUPPORT	385
[A]	Basic Concepts	385
[B]	Temporary Child Support <i>Pendente Lite</i>	388
[C]	Statutory Child Support Guidelines	388
[D]	Duration of the Child Support Obligation	397
[E]	Modification of Child Support	402
[F]	Enforcement of Spousal and Child Support Orders	408
[1]	Support Arrearage Issues and Defenses	409
[2]	State Enforcement Remedies	410
[a]	Contempt Proceedings	410
[b]	Other State Law Remedies	413
[3]	Interstate Enforcement	414
[a]	Traditional Interstate Enforcement	414
[b]	The Uniform Reciprocal Enforcement of Support Acts	416
[c]	The Uniform Interstate Family Support Act	416
[4]	Federally Mandated Support Enforcement Remedies	419
[a]	Income Withholding	420
[b]	Security for Payments	421
[c]	Income Tax Refund Intercepts	422
[d]	Child Support Guidelines	423
[e]	Parent Locator Service	423
[f]	The Child Support Recovery Act of 1992	424
[g]	The Personal Responsibility and Work Opportunity Reconciliation Act of 1996	425

TABLE OF CONTENTS

[h]	Deadbeat Parents Punishment Act of 1998 and the Deficit Reduction Act of 2005	426
§ 9.07	FEDERAL TAX CONSEQUENCES OF CHILD AND SPOUSAL SUPPORT	426
[A]	Alimony or Spousal Support Payments	427
[B]	Child Support Payments	429
[C]	Dependency Exemption for Children	430
[D]	Deductibility of Legal Fees	431
[E]	Other Divorce Related Taxation Issues	431
[1]	Transfer of Property	431
[2]	Head of Household Status	433
[3]	Joint Returns	433
[4]	The Family Home	434
[5]	Retirement Plans	434
[6]	Stock Transfers and Redemptions	434
[7]	Federal Estate and Gift Taxes	435
§ 9.08	BANKRUPTCY	435
[A]	Support Obligations	436
[B]	Property Division Debts	442
[C]	Marital Liens	442
[D]	Automatic Stay	444
[E]	Exempt Property	444
Chapter 10	EQUITABLE DISTRIBUTION OF PROPERTY	447
§ 10.01	INTRODUCTION	447
§ 10.02	COMMUNITY PROPERTY ORIGINS	448
§ 10.03	CHARACTERIZING PROPERTY FOR THE PURPOSE OF EQUITABLE DISTRIBUTION	449
[A]	Dual Property Equitable Distribution Jurisdictions	449
[B]	All Property Equitable Distribution Jurisdictions	451
§ 10.04	CHARACTERIZING PROPERTY AS MARITAL OR SEPARATE: CHANGE IN CLASSIFICATION	452
[A]	The Marital Property Presumption	452
[B]	Judicial Development of Classification Rules	452
[1]	Inception of Title	452
[2]	Source of Funds	453
[3]	Transmutation	454
[C]	Tracing	455
§ 10.05	APPRECIATION OF SEPARATE PROPERTY DURING MARRIAGE	455
§ 10.06	GIFTS AND INHERITANCES	458
[A]	Statutory Approaches	458

TABLE OF CONTENTS

[B]	Judicial Treatment	459
[1]	Gifts or Inheritances From a Third Party to Either Spouse	459
[2]	To the Spouses Jointly	460
[3]	Interspousal Transfers	460
[4]	Was There a Gift?	462
§ 10.07	PERSONAL INJURIES AND WORKERS' COMPENSATION	463
[A]	Introduction	463
[B]	Approaches to Classification	463
§ 10.08	LICENSES, DEGREES AND ENHANCED EARNINGS	465
[A]	Overview	465
[B]	Statutory Treatment	465
[C]	Degree or License Not Property	465
[D]	Degree or License as Marital Property	467
[E]	Alternative Remedies for the Supporting Spouse	469
[1]	Overview	469
[2]	Reimbursement or Rehabilitation	470
§ 10.09	PROFESSIONAL GOODWILL	471
[A]	Goodwill: Definitions and Basic Concepts	471
[B]	Classification of Professional Goodwill	472
[1]	Community Property Influences	472
[2]	Classification of Goodwill for Equitable Distribution	473
[a]	Professional Goodwill as Divisible Property	473
[b]	Professional Goodwill Not Divisible	475
[c]	Professional Goodwill Divisible if Independent of Individual	476
[C]	Valuation	477
[1]	Book Value	478
[2]	Capitalization of Excess Earnings	478
[3]	Buy-Sell Agreements	479
[4]	Discount for Minority Interest	480
§ 10.10	PENSIONS AND RETIREMENT BENEFITS	480
[A]	Overview	480
[B]	Basic Terms and Concepts	480
[C]	Characterization of Pension Benefits	481
[1]	Majority View — All Pensions Marital Property	481
[2]	Classification of Pensions — Minority View	483
[D]	Valuation and Distribution of Pensions	483
[E]	Disability Benefits	485
[F]	Federal Pensions	486
[G]	Qualified Domestic Relations Orders (QDROs)	486
[H]	Military Retirement Benefits	487
§ 10.11	VALUATION OF ASSETS: GENERAL PRINCIPLES	488

TABLE OF CONTENTS

§ 10.12 FAIR AND EQUITABLE DISTRIBUTION	489
[A] Introduction	489
[B] Factors in Equitable Distribution	490
[C] Equal Division and Starting Points	491
[D] Dissipation of Assets and Marital Misconduct	491
[1] Overview	491
[2] What Conduct Constitutes Dissipation?	491
[3] Burden of Proof	492
[4] Remedies for Dissipation	493
[5] Marital Misconduct or Fault	493
[E] Marital Debts and Liabilities	494
[F] The Marital Home	495
Chapter 11 CHILD CUSTODY AND VISITATION	497
§ 11.01 INTRODUCTION	497
§ 11.02 CHILD CUSTODY JURISDICTION	497
[A] Traditional Rules	500
[B] The Uniform Child Custody Jurisdiction Act and the Uniform Child Custody Jurisdiction and Enforcement Act	501
[1] Jurisdictional Prerequisites	503
[2] Restraints on Jurisdiction	506
[3] Recognition and Enforcement of Custody Decrees	507
[4] Effect of a Party's Conduct on Jurisdiction	509
[C] The Parental Kidnapping Prevention Act of 1980	510
[1] Scope of Application	511
[2] Similarities and Differences between the Federal and State Statutes ..	511
[3] Personal Jurisdiction	514
[D] The Hague Convention on International Child Abduction	514
§ 11.03 FACTORS IN DISPUTED CHILD CUSTODY CASES	522
[A] The Best Interests of the Child	522
[B] Doctrinal Presumptions	523
[1] The Tender Years Presumption	523
[2] The Natural Parent Presumption	525
[3] The Primary Caretaker Presumption	527
[C] The Effect of Parental Conduct on Custody Determinations	528
[1] Statutory Provisions Relating to Parental Conduct	529
[2] Judicial Approaches	529
[D] Relative Considerations Between Fit Parents	532
[1] The Gender of the Parents	532
[2] The Child's Preference in Custody Determinations	533
[a] Statutory Treatment	533

TABLE OF CONTENTS

[b]	Judicial Approaches	533
[3]	Race	535
[4]	Religion	536
[5]	Physical Condition of the Custodial Parent	539
§ 11.04	JOINT CUSTODY	541
[A]	Introduction and Overview	541
[B]	Statutory Joint Custody Provisions	542
[C]	Judicial Treatment of Joint Custody	543
§ 11.05	VISITATION	545
[A]	Right of Noncustodial Parent to Visitation	545
[1]	Illustrative Statutes	546
[2]	Enforcement of Visitation	546
[a]	Statutory Remedies	546
[b]	Judicial Remedies	547
[B]	Restrictions on Visitation	548
[C]	Visitation and Child Support	550
[1]	Illustrative Statutes	550
[2]	Case Law	550
[D]	Visitation by Third Parties	551
[1]	The Common Law Rule	551
[2]	Third Party Visitation Statutes	552
[3]	Grandparent Visitation	552
[4]	Stepparent Visitation	554
[5]	“De Facto Parent” Visitation	555
§ 11.06	MODIFICATION OF CHILD CUSTODY	557
[A]	Introduction and Overview	557
[B]	Judicial Standards for Modification of Custody Decrees	558
§ 11.07	RELOCATION OF CUSTODIAL PARENT	559
[A]	Statutory Restrictions	559
[B]	Court Ordered Limitations on Relocation by a Custodial Parent	559
§ 11.08	INTERFERENCE WITH CHILD CUSTODY	562
[A]	State Criminal Sanctions	562
[B]	Tortious Interference With Custody	563
§ 11.09	MEDIATION OF CHILD CUSTODY DISPUTES	563
TABLE OF CASES		TC-1
INDEX		I-1
