The paper is conditionally accepted as a short paper! I guess it means we have to trim it a lot! But, it is definitely a better news than the previous one :)

---------- Forwarded message ---------  
From: **IEEE Transactions on Automation Science and Engineering** <[onbehalfof@manuscriptcentral.com](mailto:onbehalfof@manuscriptcentral.com)>  
Date: Sat, Nov 3, 2018 at 10:43 PM  
Subject: Conditionally Accept As Short - IEEE Transactions on Automation Science and Engineering  
To: <[shiva.shahrokhi@gmail.com](mailto:shiva.shahrokhi@gmail.com)>  
CC: <[wenj@rpi.edu](mailto:wenj@rpi.edu)>, <[a.carl@ieee.org](mailto:a.carl@ieee.org)>, <[tase.eic.wang@gmail.com](mailto:tase.eic.wang@gmail.com)>

Dear Ms. Shahrokhi:  
  
Your paper T-ASE-2018-565 Planar Orientation Control and Torque Maximization Using a Swarm With Global Inputs by Shahrokhi, Shiva; Lin, Lillian; Becker, Aaron, submitted to the IEEE Transactions on Automation Science and Engineering, has been reviewed by the Associate Editor and selected Reviewers.  Copies of the reviewers' comments are enclosed.  
  
On the basis of the reviewers' ratings and comments, your contribution is CONDITIONALLY ACCEPTED as a SHORT paper in the IEEE Transactions on Automation Science and Engineering.  One of the reviewers has several further comments.  They will need to be addressed in the revision.  
Please check your Author Center to view any attachments that the reviewers may have uploaded.  
  
Please submit your revision directly to Manuscript Central by accessing the Manuscript Central V3 site at <http://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/t-ase>.  Click on AUTHOR CENTER.  Under the My Manuscripts column, click on "Manuscripts with Decisions."  This will bring up the ID number and title of your conditionally accepted paper.  
  
Under the Actions column on the extreme right of the paper title, click on "create a revision."  You can now submit 2 files:  your new revision as well as a separate Responses to Reviewers file.  
  
As you revise your conditionally accepted manuscript for submission, please take care to address the following:  
  
\* To put your contributions into the context of the most recent research, please update your Related Work section to include relevant references that have appeared in the past two years in conferences and journals. When possible, please cite the archival journal version of papers, which are more comprehensive than their conference versions.  
  
\* Please consider including multi-media with your paper so that others can build on your results. This can include datasets (in .xls or .xlsx format), presentations (in .pdf or .ppt or .pptx format), and illustrative videos (see Submission of Multimedia Material for formats):  <http://www.ieee-ras.org/tase/authorinfo#submission>  
At the time of Submission of Final Manuscript, please include in your Responses cover letter a list of the new citations and multi-media added."  
  
Please note that your revision must be submitted within 60 days of the editor's decision.  Otherwise a new ID number will be generated and the paper will be considered a new submission with the review cycle starting again.  
  
If you have difficulties or if you find your re-submission date has expired, please contact Editorial Assistant Antonia Carl at [a.carl@ieee.org](mailto:a.carl@ieee.org)  or the Editor-in-Chief Prof. Michael Yu Wang at [tase.eic.wang@gmail.com](mailto:tase.eic.wang@gmail.com)  
  
Thank you,  
  
John Wen  
Senior Editor  
[wenj@rpi.edu](mailto:wenj@rpi.edu)  
  
  
Associate Editor  
Comments to the Author:  
The authors did a good job addressing the reviewers' comments and concerns. However, there are still some comments on this revised version that need authors' attention. Please carefully address the comments provided by the reviewers to improve the quality of this manuscript.  
  
Reviewer's comments to author:  
  
Reviewer: 1  
  
Comments to the Author  
I have no further comments.   
  
Reviewer: 2  
  
Comments to the Author  
# Review  
This new version of the paper offers many improvements with respect to the previous version. The authors addressed most of the comments properly.  
  
For three distributions (uniform, triangular and normal), the authors find the optimal parameters of the distribution to maximize the torque. However, the way to drive the robots from a distribution p1 to the optimal distribution is not clear. Although  some simulations are presented, there is not a theoretical guarantee that the PD controller in (25) will reach the desired distribution. I suggest to describe the critical cases and conditions where the controller does not work.  
  
Although the granulation effect was removed, it is important to discuss it.  
  
  
# Minor details  
\* In the abstract: global field can be replaced for global signal, since the concept of field has different meanings in the literature.  
\* In the end of the introduction: briefly describe what "aggregate data" means in this context.