

# Modular I/O Reasoning in DimSum

Alex Loitzl<sup>1</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Institute of Science and Technology Austria (ISTA)

March, 2025







- Formally verified compiler
  - Proof covers all optimizations
  - Correct w.r.t. the modeled semantics
- Discrepancies between hardware and model
  - Cannot implement correct calling conventions
  - Cannot support TriCore architecture
- Suboptimal code generation
  - Inserted moves
  - Higher register pressure

$$\llbracket \text{echo}_{\text{rec}} \oplus \text{getc}_{\text{spec}} \rrbracket \sqsubseteq \llbracket \text{echo}_{\text{spec}} \rrbracket$$

```
int echo () :=
  let c := getc();
  putc(c);
  return 0;
```



```
getc_spec :=
  Spec.forever(
    TExists '(f, vs, h);
    TVis (In, Call f vs h);;
    TAssume (f = "getc");;
    TAssume (vs = []);;
    v ← TGet;
    TPut (v + 1);;
    TVis (Out, Return v h)).
```

0



```
echo_getc_spec :=
  TExists '(f, vs, h);
  Tvis (In, Call f vs h);;
  TAssume (f = "echo");;
  TAssume (vs = []);;
  v ← TGet;
  TPut (v + 1);;
  TCallRet "putc" [v] h;
  TVis (Out, Return 0 h);;
  TUb.
```

0

(Call f vs h)



```
int echo () :=
  let c := getc();
  putc(c);
  return 0;
```



```
getc_spec :=
  Spec.forever(
    TExists '(f, vs, h);
    TVis (In, Call f vs h);;
    TAssume (f = "getc");;
    TAssume (vs = []);;
    v ← TGet;
    TPut (v + 1);;
    TVis (Out, Return v h)).
```

0



```
echo_getc_spec :=
  TExists '(f, vs, h);
  Tvis (In, Call f vs h);;
  TAssume (f = "echo");;
  TAssume (vs = []);;
  v ← TGet;
  TPut (v + 1);;
  TCallRet "putc" [v] h;
  TVis (Out, Return 0 h);;
  TUb.
```

0



Call f vs h

```
int echo () :=
  let c := getc();
  putc(c);
  return 0;
```



```
getc_spec :=
  Spec.forever(
    TExists '(f, vs, h);
    TVis (In, Call f vs h);;
    TAssume (f = "getc");;
    TAssume (vs = []);;
    v ← TGet;
    TPut (v + 1);;
    TVis (Out, Return v h)).
```

0



(Call f vs h)



```
echo_getc_spec :=
  TExists '(f, vs, h);
  Tvis (In, Call f vs h);;
  TAssume (f = "echo");;
  TAssume (vs = []);;
  v ← TGet;
  TPut (v + 1);;
  TCallRet "putc" [v] h;
  TVis (Out, Return 0 h);;
  TUb.
```

0

Call f vs h

```
int echo () :=
  let c := getc();
  putc(c);
  return 0;
```



```
getc_spec :=
  Spec.forever(
    TExists '(f, vs, h);
    TVis (In, Call f vs h);;
    TAssume (f = "getc");;
    TAssume (vs = []);;
    v ← TGet;
    TPut (v + 1);;
    TVis (Out, Return v h)).
```

0



(Call f vs h)



```
echo_getc_spec :=
  TExists '(f, vs, h);
  Tvis (In, Call f vs h);;
  TAssume (f = "echo");;
  TAssume (vs = []);;
  v ← TGet;
  TPut (v + 1);;
  TCallRet "putc" [v] h;
  TVis (Out, Return 0 h);;
  TUb.
```

0

Call f vs h

```
int echo () :=
  let c := getc();
  putc(c);
  return 0;
```



```
getc_spec :=
  Spec.forever(
    TExists '(f, vs, h);
    TVis (In, Call f vs h);;
    TAssume (f = "getc");;
    TAssume (vs = []);;
    v ← TGet;
    TPut (v + 1);;
    TVis (Out, Return v h)).
```

0



(Call f vs h)



```
echo_getc_spec :=
  TExists '(f, vs, h);
  Tvis (In, Call f vs h);;
  TAssume (f = "echo");;
  TAssume (vs = []);;
  v ← TGet;
  TPut (v + 1);;
  TCallRet "putc" [v] h;
  TVis (Out, Return 0 h);;
  TUb.
```

0

(Call "echo" vs h)

```
int echo () :=
  let c := getc();
  putc(c);
  return 0;
```



```
getc_spec :=
  Spec.forever(
    TExists '(f, vs, h);
    TVis (In, Call f vs h);;
    TAssume (f = "getc");;
    TAssume (vs = []);;
    v ← TGet;
    TPut (v + 1);;
    TVis (Out, Return v h)).
```

0



```
echo_getc_spec :=
  TExists '(f, vs, h);
  Tvis (In, Call f vs h);;
  TAssume (f = "echo");;
  TAssume (vs = []);;
  v ← TGet;
  TPut (v + 1);;
  TCallRet "putc" [v] h;
  TVis (Out, Return 0 h);;
  TUb.
```

0

(Call "echo" [] h)

```
int echo () :=
  let c := getc();
  putc(c);
  return 0;
```



```
getc_spec :=
  Spec.forever(
    TExists '(f, vs, h);
    TVis (In, Call f vs h);;
    TAssume (f = "getc");;
    TAssume (vs = []);;
    v ← TGet;
    TPut (v + 1);;
    TVis (Out, Return v h)).
```

0



```
echo_getc_spec :=
  TExists '(f, vs, h);
  Tvis (In, Call f vs h);;
  TAssume (f = "echo");;
  TAssume (vs = []);;
  v ← TGet;
  TPut (v + 1);;
  TCallRet "putc" [v] h;
  TVis (Out, Return 0 h);;
  TUb.
```

0

```
int echo () :=  
  let c := getc();  
  putc(c);  
  return 0;
```



```
getc_spec :=  
  Spec.forever(  
    TExists '(f, vs, h);  
    TVis (In, Call f vs h);;  
    TAssume (f = "getc");;  
    TAssume (vs = []);;  
    v ← TGet;  
    TPut (v + 1);;  
    TVis (Out, Return v h)).
```

0



```
echo_getc_spec :=  
  TExists '(f, vs, h);  
  Tvis (In, Call f vs h);;  
  TAssume (f = "echo");;  
  TAssume (vs = []);;  
  v ← TGet;  
  TPut (v + 1);;  
  TCallRet "putc" [v] h;  
  TVis (Out, Return 0 h);;  
  TUb.
```

0

```
int echo () :=  
  let c := getc();  
  putc(c);  
  return 0;
```



```
getc_spec :=  
  Spec.forever(  
    TExists '(f, vs, h);  
    TVis (In, Call f vs h);;  
    TAssume (f = "getc");;  
    TAssume (vs = []);;  
    v ← TGet;  
    TPut (v + 1);;  
    TVis (Out, Return v h)).
```

0



```
echo_getc_spec :=  
  TExists '(f, vs, h);  
  Tvis (In, Call f vs h);;  
  TAssume (f = "echo");;  
  TAssume (vs = []);;  
  v ← TGet;  
  TPut (v + 1);;  
  TCallRet "putc" [v] h;  
  TVis (Out, Return 0 h);;  
  TUb.
```

0

call "getc" [] h)



```
int echo () :=
  let c := getc();
  putc(c);
  return 0;
```



```
getc_spec :=
  Spec.forever(
    TExists '(f, vs, h);
    TVis (In, Call f vs h);;
    TAssume (f = "getc");;
    TAssume (vs = []);;
    v ← TGet;
    TPut (v + 1);;
    TVis (Out, Return v h)).
```

0



```
echo_getc_spec :=
  TExists '(f, vs, h);
  Tvis (In, Call f vs h);;
  TAssume (f = "echo");;
  TAssume (vs = []);;
  v ← TGet;
  TPut (v + 1);;
  TCallRet "putc" [v] h;
  TVis (Out, Return 0 h);;
  TUb.
```

0



(Call "getc" [] h)



```
int echo () :=
  let c := getc();
  putc(c);
  return 0;
```



```
getc_spec :=
  Spec.forever(
    TExists '(f, vs, h);
    TVis (In, Call f vs h);;
    TAssume (f = "getc");;
    TAssume (vs = []);;
    v ← TGet;
    TPut (v + 1);;
    TVis (Out, Return v h)).
```

0



```
echo_getc_spec :=
  TExists '(f, vs, h);
  Tvis (In, Call f vs h);;
  TAssume (f = "echo");;
  TAssume (vs = []);;
  v ← TGet;
  TPut (v + 1);;
  TCallRet "putc" [v] h;
  TVis (Out, Return 0 h);;
  TUb.
```

0

(Call "getc" [] h)



```
int echo () :=
  let c := getc();
  putc(c);
  return 0;
```



```
getc_spec :=
  Spec.forever(
    TExists '(f, vs, h);
    TVis (In, Call f vs h);;
    TAssume (f = "getc");;
    TAssume (vs = []);;
    v ← TGet;
    TPut (v + 1);;
    TVis (Out, Return v h)).
```

0



```
echo_getc_spec :=
  TExists '(f, vs, h);
  Tvis (In, Call f vs h);;
  TAssume (f = "echo");;
  TAssume (vs = []);;
  v ← TGet;
  TPut (v + 1);;
  TCallRet "putc" [v] h;
  TVis (Out, Return 0 h);;
  TUb.
```

0

(Call "getc" [] h)



```
int echo () :=  
  let c := getc();  
  putc(c);  
  return 0;
```



```
getc_spec :=  
  Spec.forever(  
    TExists '(f, vs, h);  
    TVis (In, Call f vs h);;  
    TAssume (f = "getc");;  
    TAssume (vs = []);;  
    v ← TGet;  
    TPut (v + 1);;  
    TVis (Out, Return v h)).
```

0



```
echo_getc_spec :=  
  TExists '(f, vs, h);  
  Tvis (In, Call f vs h);;  
  TAssume (f = "echo");;  
  TAssume (vs = []);;  
  v ← TGet;  
  TPut (v + 1);;  
  TCallRet "putc" [v] h;  
  TVis (Out, Return 0 h);;  
  TUb.
```

0

(Call "getc" [] h)



```
int echo () :=
  let c := getc();
  putc(c);
  return 0;
```



```
getc_spec :=
  Spec.forever(
    TExists '(f, vs, h);
    TVis (In, Call f vs h);;
    TAssume (f = "getc");;
    TAssume (vs = []);;
    v ← TGet;
    TPut (v + 1);;
    TVis (Out, Return v h)).
```

0



```
echo_getc_spec :=
  TExists '(f, vs, h);
  Tvis (In, Call f vs h);;
  TAssume (f = "echo");;
  TAssume (vs = []);;
  v ← TGet;
  TPut (v + 1);;
  TCallRet "putc" [v] h;
  TVis (Out, Return 0 h);;
  TUb.
```

0

(Call "getc" [] h)

```
int echo () :=  
  let c := getc();  
  putc(c);  
  return 0;
```

$\oplus$

```
getc_spec :=  
  Spec.forever(  
    TExists '(f, vs, h);  
    TVis (In, Call f vs h);;  
    TAssume (f = "getc");;  
    TAssume (vs = []);;  
    v ← TGet;  
    TPut (v + 1);;  
    TVis (Out, Return v h)).
```

0

$\sqsubseteq$

```
echo_getc_spec :=  
  TExists '(f, vs, h);  
  Tvis (In, Call f vs h);;  
  TAssume (f = "echo");;  
  TAssume (vs = []);;  
  v ← TGet;  
  TPut (v + 1);;  
  TCallRet "putc" [v] h;  
  TVis (Out, Return 0 h);;  
  TUb.
```

0

(Call "getc" [] h)

```
int echo () :=
  let c := getc();
  putc(c);
  return 0;
```

$\oplus$

```
getc_spec :=
  Spec.forever(
    TExists '(f, vs, h);
    TVis (In, Call f vs h);;
    TAssume (f = "getc");;
    TAssume (vs = []);;
    v ← TGet;
    TPut (v + 1);;
    TVis (Out, Return v h)).
```

0

$\sqsubseteq$

```
echo_getc_spec :=
  TExists '(f, vs, h);
  Tvis (In, Call f vs h);;
  TAssume (f = "echo");;
  TAssume (vs = []);;
  v ← TGet;
  TPut (v + 1);;
  TCallRet "putc" [v] h;
  TVis (Out, Return 0 h);;
  TUb.
```

0

```
int echo () :=  
  let c := getc();  
  putc(c);  
  return 0;
```



```
getc_spec :=  
  Spec.forever(  
    TExists '(f, vs, h);  
    TVis (In, Call f vs h);;  
    TAssume (f = "getc");;  
    TAssume (vs = []);;  
    v ← TGet;  
    TPut (v + 1);;  
    TVis (Out, Return v h)).
```

0



```
echo_getc_spec :=  
  TExists '(f, vs, h);  
  Tvis (In, Call f vs h);;  
  TAssume (f = "echo");;  
  TAssume (vs = []);;  
  v ← TGet;  
  TPut (v + 1);;  
  TCallRet "putc" [v] h;  
  TVis (Out, Return 0 h);;  
  TUb.
```

0

```
int echo () :=  
  let c := getc();  
  putc(c);  
  return 0;
```



```
getc_spec :=  
  Spec.forever(  
    TExists '(f, vs, h);  
    TVis (In, Call f vs h);;  
    TAssume (f = "getc");;  
    TAssume (vs = []);;  
    v ← TGet;  
    TPut (v + 1);;  
    TVis (Out, Return v h)).
```

1



```
echo_getc_spec :=  
  TExists '(f, vs, h);  
  Tvis (In, Call f vs h);;  
  TAssume (f = "echo");;  
  TAssume (vs = []);;  
  v ← TGet;  
  TPut (v + 1);;  
  TCallRet "putc" [v] h;  
  TVis (Out, Return 0 h);;  
  TUb.
```

0



(Return 0 h)



```
int echo () :=
  let c := getc();
  putc(c);
  return 0;
```



```
getc_spec :=
  Spec.forever(
    TExists '(f, vs, h);
    TVis (In, Call f vs h);;
    TAssume (f = "getc");;
    TAssume (vs = []);;
    v ← TGet;
    TPut (v + 1);;
    TVis (Out, Return v h)).
```

1



```
echo_getc_spec :=
  TExists '(f, vs, h);
  Tvis (In, Call f vs h);;
  TAssume (f = "echo");;
  TAssume (vs = []);;
  v ← TGet;
  TPut (v + 1);;
  TCallRet "putc" [v] h;
  TVis (Out, Return 0 h);;
  TUb.
```

0

(Return 0 h)



```
int echo () :=  
  let c := getc();  
  putc(c);  
  return 0;
```



```
getc_spec :=  
  Spec.forever(  
    TExists '(f, vs, h);  
    TVis (In, Call f vs h);;  
    TAssume (f = "getc");;  
    TAssume (vs = []);;  
    v ← TGet;  
    TPut (v + 1);;  
    TVis (Out, Return v h)).
```

1



```
echo_getc_spec :=  
  TExists '(f, vs, h);  
  Tvis (In, Call f vs h);;  
  TAssume (f = "echo");;  
  TAssume (vs = []);;  
  v ← TGet;  
  TPut (v + 1);;  
  TCallRet "putc" [v] h;  
  TVis (Out, Return 0 h);;  
  TUb.
```

0

(Return 0 h)



```
int echo () :=  
  let c := getc();  
  putc(c);  
  return 0;
```



```
getc_spec :=  
  Spec.forever(  
    TExists '(f, vs, h);  
    TVis (In, Call f vs h);;  
    TAssume (f = "getc");;  
    TAssume (vs = []);;  
    v ← TGet;  
    TPut (v + 1);;  
    TVis (Out, Return v h)).
```

1



```
echo_getc_spec :=  
  TExists '(f, vs, h);  
  Tvis (In, Call f vs h);;  
  TAssume (f = "echo");;  
  TAssume (vs = []);;  
  v ← TGet;  
  TPut (v + 1);;  
  TCallRet "putc" [v] h;  
  TVis (Out, Return 0 h);;  
  TUb.
```

0

Call "putc" 0 h)



```
int echo () :=
  let c := getc();
  putc(c);
  return 0;
```



```
getc_spec :=
  Spec.forever(
    TExists '(f, vs, h);
    TVis (In, Call f vs h);;
    TAssume (f = "getc");;
    TAssume (vs = []);;
    v ← TGet;
    TPut (v + 1);;
    TVis (Out, Return v h)).
```

1



```
echo_getc_spec :=
  TExists '(f, vs, h);
  Tvis (In, Call f vs h);;
  TAssume (f = "echo");;
  TAssume (vs = []);;
  v ← TGet;
  TPut (v + 1);;
  TCallRet "putc" [v] h;
  TVis (Out, Return 0 h);;
  TUb.
```

0

(Call "putc" 0 h)



```
int echo () :=
  let c := getc();
  putc(c);
  return 0;
```



```
getc_spec :=
  Spec.forever(
    TExists '(f, vs, h);
    TVis (In, Call f vs h);;
    TAssume (f = "getc");;
    TAssume (vs = []);;
    v ← TGet;
    TPut (v + 1);;
    TVis (Out, Return v h)).
```

1



```
echo_getc_spec :=
  TExists '(f, vs, h);
  Tvis (In, Call f vs h);;
  TAssume (f = "echo");;
  TAssume (vs = []);;
  v ← TGet;
  TPut (v + 1);;
  TCallRet "putc" [v] h;
  TVis (Out, Return 0 h);;
  TUb.
```

0

```
int echo () :=
  let c := getc();
  putc(c);
  return 0;
```



```
getc_spec :=
  Spec.forever(
    TExists '(f, vs, h);
    TVis (In, Call f vs h);;
    TAssume (f = "getc");;
    TAssume (vs = []);;
    v ← TGet;
    TPut (v + 1);;
    TVis (Out, Return v h)).
```

1



(Call "putc" 0 h)



```
echo_getc_spec :=
  TExists '(f, vs, h);
  Tvis (In, Call f vs h);;
  TAssume (f = "echo");;
  TAssume (vs = []);;
  v ← TGet;
  TPut (v + 1);;
  TCallRet "putc" [v] h;
  TVis (Out, Return 0 h);;
  TUb.
```

0

```
int echo () :=
  let c := getc();
  putc(c);
  return 0;
```



```
getc_spec :=
  Spec.forever(
    TExists '(f, vs, h);
    TVis (In, Call f vs h);;
    TAssume (f = "getc");;
    TAssume (vs = []);;
    v ← TGet;
    TPut (v + 1);;
    TVis (Out, Return v h)).
```

1



(Call "putc" 0 h)



```
echo_getc_spec :=
  TExists '(f, vs, h);
  Tvis (In, Call f vs h);;
  TAssume (f = "echo");;
  TAssume (vs = []);;
  v ← TGet;
  TPut (v + 1);;
  TCallRet "putc" [v] h;
  TVis (Out, Return 0 h);;
  TUb.
```

0

```
int echo () :=
  let c := getc();
  putc(c);
  return 0;
```



```
getc_spec :=
  Spec.forever(
    TExists '(f, vs, h);
    TVis (In, Call f vs h);;
    TAssume (f = "getc");;
    TAssume (vs = []);;
    v ← TGet;
    TPut (v + 1);;
    TVis (Out, Return v h)).
```

1



(Call "putc" 0 h)



```
echo_getc_spec :=
  TExists '(f, vs, h);
  Tvis (In, Call f vs h);;
  TAssume (f = "echo");;
  TAssume (vs = []);;
  v ← TGet;
  TPut (v + 1);;
  TCallRet "putc" [v] h;
  TVis (Out, Return 0 h);;
  TUb.
```

1



```
int echo () :=
  let c := getc();
  putc(c);
  return 0;
```



```
getc_spec :=
  Spec.forever(
    TExists '(f, vs, h);
    TVis (In, Call f vs h);;
    TAssume (f = "getc");;
    TAssume (vs = []);;
    v ← TGet;
    TPut (v + 1);;
    TVis (Out, Return v h)).
```

1



(Call "putc" 0 h)



```
echo_getc_spec :=
  TExists '(f, vs, h);
  Tvis (In, Call f vs h);;
  TAssume (f = "echo");;
  TAssume (vs = []);;
  v ← TGet;
  TPut (v + 1);;
  TCallRet "putc" [v] h;
  TVis (Out, Return 0 h);;
  TUb.
```

1

```
int echo () :=
  let c := getc();
  putc(c);
  return 0;
```



```
getc_spec :=
  Spec.forever(
    TExists '(f, vs, h);
    TVis (In, Call f vs h);;
    TAssume (f = "getc");;
    TAssume (vs = []);;
    v ← TGet;
    TPut (v + 1);;
    TVis (Out, Return v h)).
```

1



(Call "putc" 0 h)



```
echo_getc_spec :=
  TExists '(f, vs, h);
  Tvis (In, Call f vs h);;
  TAssume (f = "echo");;
  TAssume (vs = []);;
  v ← TGet;
  TPut (v + 1);;
  TCallRet "putc" [v] h;
  TVis (Out, Return 0 h);;
  TUb.
```

1

```
int echo () :=
  let c := getc();
  putc(c);
  return 0;
```



```
getc_spec :=
  Spec.forever(
    TExists '(f, vs, h);
    TVis (In, Call f vs h);;
    TAssume (f = "getc");;
    TAssume (vs = []);;
    v ← TGet;
    TPut (v + 1);;
    TVis (Out, Return v h)).
```

1



(Return v h)



```
echo_getc_spec :=
  TExists '(f, vs, h);
  Tvis (In, Call f vs h);;
  TAssume (f = "echo");;
  TAssume (vs = []);;
  v ← TGet;
  TPut (v + 1);;
  TCallRet "putc" [v] h;
  TVis (Out, Return 0 h);;
  TUb.
```

1

(Return v h)



```
int echo () :=  
  let c := getc();  
  putc(c);  
  return 0;
```



```
getc_spec :=  
  Spec.forever(  
    TExists '(f, vs, h);  
    TVis (In, Call f vs h);;  
    TAssume (f = "getc");;  
    TAssume (vs = []);;  
    v ← TGet;  
    TPut (v + 1);;  
    TVis (Out, Return v h)).
```



```
echo_getc_spec :=  
  TExists '(f, vs, h);  
  Tvis (In, Call f vs h);;  
  TAssume (f = "echo");;  
  TAssume (vs = []);;  
  v ← TGet;  
  TPut (v + 1);;  
  TCallRet "putc" [v] h;  
  TVis (Out, Return 0 h);;  
  TUb.
```

(Return v h)



```
int echo () :=
  let c := getc();
  putc(c);
  return 0;
```



```
getc_spec :=
  Spec.forever(
    TExists '(f, vs, h);
    TVis (In, Call f vs h);;
    TAssume (f = "getc");;
    TAssume (vs = []);;
    v ← TGet;
    TPut (v + 1);;
    TVis (Out, Return v h)).
```

1



```
echo_getc_spec :=
  TExists '(f, vs, h);
  Tvis (In, Call f vs h);;
  TAssume (f = "echo");;
  TAssume (vs = []);;
  v ← TGet;
  TPut (v + 1);;
  TCallRet "putc" [v] h;
  TVis (Out, Return 0 h);;
  TUb.
```

1

(Return 0 h)



```
int echo () :=
  let c := getc();
  putc(c);
  return 0;
```



```
getc_spec :=
  Spec.forever(
    TExists '(f, vs, h);
    TVis (In, Call f vs h);;
    TAssume (f = "getc");;
    TAssume (vs = []);;
    v ← TGet;
    TPut (v + 1);;
    TVis (Out, Return v h)).
```

1



```
echo_getc_spec :=
  TExists '(f, vs, h);
  Tvis (In, Call f vs h);;
  TAssume (f = "echo");;
  TAssume (vs = []);;
  v ← TGet;
  TPut (v + 1);;
  TCallRet "putc" [v] h;
  TVis (Out, Return 0 h);;
  TUb.
```

1

(Return 0 h)



```
int echo () :=
  let c := getc();
  putc(c);
  return 0;
```



```
getc_spec :=
  Spec.forever(
    TExists '(f, vs, h);
    TVis (In, Call f vs h);;
    TAssume (f = "getc");;
    TAssume (vs = []);;
    v ← TGet;
    TPut (v + 1);;
    TVis (Out, Return v h)).
```



```
echo_getc_spec :=
  TExists '(f, vs, h);
  Tvis (In, Call f vs h);;
  TAssume (f = "echo");;
  TAssume (vs = []);;
  v ← TGet;
  TPut (v + 1);;
  TCallRet "putc" [v] h;
  TVis (Out, Return 0 h);;
  TUb.
```

```
int echo () :=
  let c := getc();
  putc(c);
  return 0;
```



```
getc_spec :=
  Spec.forever(
    TExists '(f, vs, h);
    TVis (In, Call f vs h);;
    TAssume (f = "getc");;
    TAssume (vs = []);;
    v ← TGet;
    TPut (v + 1);;
    TVis (Out, Return v h)).
```

1



(Return 0 h)



```
echo_getc_spec :=
  TExists '(f, vs, h);
  TVis (In, Call f vs h);;
  TAssume (f = "echo");;
  TAssume (vs = []);;
  v ← TGet;
  TPut (v + 1);;
  TCallRet "putc" [v] h;
  TVis (Out, Return 0 h);;
  TUb.
```

1



```
int echo () :=
  let c := getc();
  putc(c);
  return 0;
```



```
getc_spec :=
  Spec.forever(
    TExists '(f, vs, h);
    TVis (In, Call f vs h);;
    TAssume (f = "getc");;
    TAssume (vs = []);;
    v ← TGet;
    TPut (v + 1);;
    TVis (Out, Return v h)).
```

1



```
echo_getc_spec :=
  TExists '(f, vs, h);
  TVis (In, Call f vs h);;
  TAssume (f = "echo");;
  TAssume (vs = []);;
  v ← TGet;
  TPut (v + 1);;
  TCallRet "putc" [v] h;
  TVis (Out, Return 0 h);;
  TUb.
```

1

$\llbracket \text{echo}_{\text{rec}} \oplus \text{getc}_{\text{spec}} \rrbracket$

$\preceq$

$\llbracket \text{echo}_{\text{spec}} \rrbracket$

$$\llbracket \text{echo}_{\text{rec}} \oplus \text{getc}_{\text{spec}} \rrbracket \approx > (\lambda \kappa_t \sigma_t,$$

$$\llbracket \text{echo}_{\text{rec}} \oplus \text{getc}_{\text{spec}} \rrbracket \approx > (\lambda \kappa_t \sigma_t, \llbracket \text{echo}_{\text{spec}} \rrbracket \approx > (\lambda \kappa_s \sigma_s,$$

$$\llbracket \text{echo}_{\text{rec}} \oplus \text{getc}_{\text{spec}} \rrbracket \approx > (\lambda \kappa_t \sigma_t, \llbracket \text{echo}_{\text{spec}} \rrbracket \approx > (\lambda \kappa_s \sigma_s, \kappa_t = \kappa_s * \sigma_t \preceq \sigma_s))$$

$$\llbracket \text{echo}_{\text{rec}} \oplus \text{getc}_{\text{spec}} \rrbracket \approx > \overbrace{(\lambda \kappa_t \sigma_t, \llbracket \text{echo}_{\text{spec}} \rrbracket \approx > (\lambda \kappa_s \sigma_s, \kappa_t = \kappa_s * \sigma_t \preceq \sigma_s))}^{\Pi_s}$$

$$\llbracket \text{echo}_{\text{rec}} \oplus \text{getc}_{\text{spec}} \rrbracket \approx > \Pi_S$$

$$\llbracket \text{echo}_{\text{rec}} \rrbracket \approx > \Pi_{\oplus}(\Pi_s)$$