

Timestamp	Your full name	Overall Evaluation (2: Accept, 0: Borderline, -2: Reject)	Confidence	Evaluation Comment	Detailed Evaluation: Results (Chapter 5)	Detailed Evaluation: Tools Development (Appendix A)	Detailed Evaluation: Development Process T3 (Appendix B)	Detailed Evaluation: State of the Art (Appendix C)
4/5/2013 8:52:25	Jonas Helming	-1	0 Low	The document starts like it would describe the openETCS project, not a specific part. The motivation of the document is not explicit until chapter 3. I suggest to remove the generic part.				
4/9/2013 0:35:14	Stefan Rieger (TWT)	2	1 High	The document fulfills my expectations. It covers the essential aspects related to the CENELC standards and the implications for the openETCS project. Question to 1.2: Does the CENELEC only apply to Software code or also the design artifacts and the model? A clear division between tools and application software (EVC code ...) would be good for dividing what is meant by software. e.g. In Table B4: Is EN50128 5.3.2.4 really concerned with tools or rather with the EVC-software? In Table B4 solutions for document file formats are already proposed - is the list correct there and should we use well- established document formats or do we have other criteria? In Table B4 5.3.2.12 shared documents is an essential part of github. Why is it not advised? Why no documents to be created, does not the QA plan specify something on github? In Table B5: Reference to tools or software ment? Concerning C7.2: Is maintenance part of the openETCS project or should it be foreseen as concept? In the Summary there is a recommendation to include EN 50126 and EN 50129 in an early phase of the project. It may be an issue for this report. Concerning Chapter A.4: Are modelling tool part of 'Design refinement tools?'	2	2	2	2
4/12/2013 21:57:39	Marc Behrens	1	0 Low		1	1	0	1
4/22/2013 10:22:04	Cecile Braunstein	2	1 High	The document seems really useful. The name of appendix C is not pertinent regarding C5 that is not state of the art but application to openETCS	1	2	2	1
4/22/2013 12:41:56	All4tec	1	1 High		1	2	2	1
4/24/2013 14:36:51	Armand Nachef (CEA)	2	2 Expert	Excellent concise survey on the safety and security requirements of the CENELEC standards.	2	2	2	2
	Result	1.17			1.40	1.80	1.60	1.40