

No part of the candidate evidence in this exemplar material may be presented in an external assessment for the purpose of gaining credits towards an NCEA qualification.

3

91436



914360



NEW ZEALAND QUALIFICATIONS AUTHORITY  
MANA TOHU MĀTAURANGA O AOTEAROA

QUALIFY FOR THE FUTURE WORLD  
KIA NOHO TAKATŪ KI TŌ ĀMUA AO!

SUPERVISOR'S USE ONLY

## Level 3 History, 2015

### 91436 Analyse evidence relating to an historical event of significance to New Zealanders

2.00 p.m. Friday 20 November 2015  
Credits: Four

Achievement	Achievement with Merit	Achievement with Excellence
Analyse evidence relating to an historical event of significance to New Zealanders.	Analyse, in depth, evidence relating to an historical event of significance to New Zealanders.	Comprehensively analyse evidence relating to an historical event of significance to New Zealanders.

Check that the National Student Number (NSN) on your admission slip is the same as the number at the top of this page.

**You should attempt ALL the questions in this booklet.**

Pull out Resource Booklet 91436R from the centre of this booklet.

If you need more room for any answer, use the extra space provided at the back of this booklet.

Check that this booklet has pages 2–11 in the correct order and that none of these pages is blank.

**YOU MUST HAND THIS BOOKLET TO THE SUPERVISOR AT THE END OF THE EXAMINATION.**

**Achievement**

**TOTAL**

**09**

ASSESSOR'S USE ONLY

**INSTRUCTIONS**

Read ALL the sources in Resource Booklet 91436R before you begin answering the questions in this booklet.

**QUESTION ONE: CAUSE AND EFFECT**

Refer to the **Introduction**, and **Sources A, B, C, and D** in the resource booklet when answering this question. You may refer to other sources in the resource booklet to expand your answer.

An important historical relationship is cause and effect.

Analyse and explain possible causes and effects of Colin Scrimgeour's actions and involvement with radio in the 1930s.

As said in Source A Colin Scrimgeour had a section on private radio 12R in the 1930s which made him one of the most popular men in the country. He had to bring comfort and hope during the great depression. This would have been inspired by his mother because as said in Source D the introduction his mother wanted him to make something out of his life. Therefore he wanted to be on radio. Scrimgeour also helped with Labour's votes for government so the coalition government played his radio session as stated in introduction and Source A. After years of commercial broadcasting came to fruition when he was made head of the commercial service in 1936 (Source A). Scrimgeour was good at holding onto his audience's attention and was recognised by people who didn't listen to his show.

His nickname on radio was Uncle Scim (introduction)  
was urging his listeners of his session  
called 'Friendly Road (sources)' to vote for  
labour and this would help the labour  
campaign. From having his parents pay  
away and his mother not wanting  
him to waste his life, would of  
given him encouragement to be in  
the radio and give people hope  
during the great depression. //

## QUESTION TWO: PERSPECTIVES

ASSESSOR  
USE ONLY

Refer to **Sources E, F, and G** in the resource booklet when answering this question. You may refer to other sources in the resource booklet to expand your answer.

An important consideration for a historian studying the past is the difference between accounts of the same historical event.

Analyse and explain the ways in which Colin Scrimgeour has been viewed by differing groups of people at differing periods of time.

A civil servant William Renwick goes on to explain how Scrimgeour was a significant figure in New Zealand ~~and~~ history but yet he was quickly forgotten. He believes Scrimgeour's world is like Alice's ~~and~~ wonderland world (Source F). Scrim was huge in his day and Auckland is different than from what it was. Renwick says how Scrim is a striking pioneer in commercial radio in Auckland. This is said in a Book review by William Renwick. Renwick believes Scrim should more be acknowledged and is an important part of political history in New Zealand.

A pamphlet written by Scrim's political enemy, ~~days~~ goes on to say how he made such bitter and unfounded attacks upon the prime minister and labour party after Michael Savage died. Scrim went up against Peter Fraser, his political enemy for prime minister.

which he did not win (Source G)  
The source's evidence is familiar with him  
talking about voting for the Labour party  
which he now attacks. This  
pamphlet was replied with the  
intention of saying 'the truth about  
Mr. Scrimgeour.' 1/1

### QUESTION THREE: RELIABILITY AND/OR USEFULNESS OF EVIDENCE

ASSESSOR'S  
USE ONLY

Refer to **Sources H, I, and J** in the resource booklet when answering this question. You may refer to other sources in the resource booklet to expand your answer.

An important consideration for a historian is the reliability and/or the usefulness of historical sources.

Analyse and explain how reliable and/or useful these sources would be to a historian studying the significance of Colin Scrimgeour and the related actions of the New Zealand Government in the 1930s and 1940s.

Source H gives a brief explanation of what happened in the ~~late~~ 1940s and further on. It would be a reliable source as it was written by an Scrimgeour son yet it could be biased and only mentioning good things about him because it's his father. But it does give information that is useful and from a different perspective.

Source J is promoting Scrimgeour show. It is useful as it is a copy from the time Scrimgeour was doing his show. But it's not useful if you wanted to collect useful in depth information from Scrimgeour's life. But it doesn't give a lot of information about what happened in Scrimgeour's life in the 1930s and 1940s.

Source I isn't useful for collecting information about his year on radio in the 1930s & 1940s. It tells more about Scrim going ~~into~~ into the air force ~~and~~ the conflict between Fraser and Scrim really show in that source and how they dispute each other. But it could be useful for writing about what happens after Scrim gets kicked off the air. It gives accurate facts as it was written close to the time he was around and it is reliable to use as it goes further than just Scrim's radio days.

Achievement exemplar for 91436 2015			Total score	09
Q	Grade score	Annotation		
1	A3	This candidate has explained a cause and effect, but has not reached the standard for A4 as there is limited use of evidence to support ideas. This explanation cannot be M5 as it does not reach the 'in-depth' descriptor for M5, nor does it contain two causes and two effects. The sources are referred to, but in support of, and forming large sections of, the narrative. The historical concepts of cause and effect are only implied.		
2	A3	This response is A3 as it has interpreted the evidence to explain two perspectives. This is a very limited response that largely relies on the sources and provides little commentary from the candidate. An A4 response would provide a little more specific reference to the sources. This response is better than a N2 response as it has demonstrated the ability to communicate two perspectives.		
3	A3	This response is A3 as it has identified and explained issues of reliability in two of the sources. Source H is assessed as being "useful because it is from a different perspective" and has some reliability issues because it is from "Scrim's son... and could only mention good things about him". Source J is not assessed correctly and the candidate has offered little relevant information about the film poster. Source I has the valid comment that it shows "the conflict between Fraser and Scrim really shows in this source and how they despise each other". The candidate has interpreted the question poorly in this response, but has still shown understanding of the concepts of reliability and usefulness for an A3.		



91436



914360



NEW ZEALAND QUALIFICATIONS AUTHORITY  
MANA TOHU MĀTAURANGA O AOTEAROA

QUALIFY FOR THE FUTURE WORLD  
KIA NOHO TAKATŪ KI TŌ ĀMUA AO!

3

SUPERVISOR'S USE ONLY

## Level 3 History, 2015

### 91436 Analyse evidence relating to an historical event of significance to New Zealanders

2.00 p.m. Friday 20 November 2015  
Credits: Four

Achievement	Achievement with Merit	Achievement with Excellence
Analyse evidence relating to an historical event of significance to New Zealanders.	Analyse, in depth, evidence relating to an historical event of significance to New Zealanders.	Comprehensively analyse evidence relating to an historical event of significance to New Zealanders.

Check that the National Student Number (NSN) on your admission slip is the same as the number at the top of this page.

**You should attempt ALL the questions in this booklet.**

Pull out Resource Booklet 91436R from the centre of this booklet.

If you need more room for any answer, use the extra space provided at the back of this booklet.

Check that this booklet has pages 2–11 in the correct order and that none of these pages is blank.

**YOU MUST HAND THIS BOOKLET TO THE SUPERVISOR AT THE END OF THE EXAMINATION.**

**Achievement**

**TOTAL**

**09**

ASSESSOR'S USE ONLY

**INSTRUCTIONS**

Read ALL the sources in Resource Booklet 91436R before you begin answering the questions in this booklet.

ASSESSOR'S  
USE ONLY

**QUESTION ONE: CAUSE AND EFFECT**

Refer to the **Introduction**, and **Sources A, B, C, and D** in the resource booklet when answering this question. You may refer to other sources in the resource booklet to expand your answer.

An important historical relationship is cause and effect.

Analyse and explain possible causes and effects of Colin Scrimgeour's actions and involvement with radio in the 1930s.

There were many possible causes and effects of Colin Scrimgeour's actions and involvement with radio in the 1930's, one cause being he seems to be a very humble man who has had a tuff life, leaving school at the age of 11 and him having a lack of education he wouldn't be able to really get a better ~~a~~ job back then. Causes of his actions was because he enjoyed what he did which was to entertain the ~~da~~ public hence the programs name 'friendly road', this show though did have many consequences as he seems in my opinion to have become possibly drunk with power and began to bring his own views into the show urging his listeners to vote for Labour but there could be a possibility he was forced into ~~da~~ promoting the Labour party. A consequence of his actions with the radio

in the 1930's is he would be shut down and sent off into a war zone killing him. It was said that he made a lot of enemies while on the radio and it could well have been one who had done that to him. A cause for him being on the radio is that the general public needed someone who could distract them from the war going ~~on~~ around them and he was the man to do it and he did quite successfully. It could have been a reason why his enemies wanted it out in the public his mistakes so they could give the public a reason to stop thinking about the war and something less depressing/  
Painful. //

## QUESTION TWO: PERSPECTIVES

ASSESSOR'S  
USE ONLY

Refer to **Sources E, F, and G** in the resource booklet when answering this question. You may refer to other sources in the resource booklet to expand your answer.

An important consideration for a historian studying the past is the difference between accounts of the same historical event.

Analyse and explain the ways in which Colin Scrimgeour has been viewed by differing groups of people at differing periods of time.

There were many differing groups of people at differing periods of time who had viewed Colin Scrimgeour ~~trav~~ and formed their own opinions on him. An example of this is William ~~Don Blum~~ Blumfield <sup>1936</sup> who labelled the image 'The Stranger of 12B', New Zealand Observer, 7 december 1936. This image in my opinion portrays Colin Scrimgeour in a negative light as his face in the cartoon looks mean and creepy and has him sitting behind a desk. The purpose of this was possibly to give people what they wanted to see as Colin was gaining a lot of popularity back then, and which is why a News paper would try bring him down to make it more interesting possibly for the reader as they are in the business to sell papers and only parts of the truth or not at all. Another view of Colin Scrimgeour was by Michael field who wrote a book ~~about~~ review of Scrim: The man with the mike. He believes that Colin Scrimgeour was

a very important man as he says "Scrim was an undoubtedly significant figure in New Zealand's 20th century political history." But he also believes that Colins was ~~an~~ very up himself as ~~he~~ Michael Field ~~says~~ calls him a "Methodist minister with a giant opinion of himself." This is bad but he goes onto suggest that he was corrupt as his broadcasts ~~were~~ <sup>were</sup> actively censored and monitored by prime ministers and he says "including his saintly hero, Michael Joseph Savage." Which ~~implies~~ <sup>implies</sup> he is biased but you have to take this with a grain of salt due to the fact it is just a book review, and the reviewer could be just trying to make the review more entertaining for the ~~review~~ ~~reviewer~~ reader and we are unsure whether the book is reliable or not. Another opinion was a ~~by~~ ~~in~~ ~~The Scrim Lee papers in 193~~ ~~1940~~ ~~(1986)~~

Pamphlet written by Scrimgeour's political enemies in the 1943 election. The <sup>view</sup> ~~opi~~ this text has is strongly negative towards Scrimgeour as it is basically making up stories to try discredit all the things he has said on the radio e.g. "He persistently evaded the directions of the Government and finally was suspended after a flagrant breach of instructions given to him." I would not trust this resource as it is far too biased but is useful to see the views and values of ~~the~~ those people back then.

I find source I to be not ~~that~~<sup>very</sup> reliable as the same paper produced another article before discrediting Scrimgeour also the paper possibly could have altered some of the context said to make it more interesting to the ~~reading~~ reader in an attempt to sell more papers. But some of these events do seem true were Scrimgeour called to the Army but we can't be sure of the context, it might not be true but it still can be used as a source to show how papers portrayed Scrimgeour back then. I find source J to be extremely useful as it gives us an image from a picture not a cartoon of the man behind the mike and the manner in which they portrayed him when they call him "New Zealand's first great National talkie." I do have my doubts on ~~this~~ ~~the~~ account of it being biased as the purpose of the image was to sell tickets but is still a useful source to use. //

### QUESTION THREE: RELIABILITY AND/OR USEFULNESS OF EVIDENCE

ASSESSOR'S  
USE ONLY

Refer to **Sources H, I, and J** in the resource booklet when answering this question. You may refer to other sources in the resource booklet to expand your answer.

An important consideration for a historian is the reliability and/or the usefulness of historical sources.

Analyse and explain how reliable and/or useful these sources would be to a historian studying the significance of Colin Scrimgeour and the related actions of the New Zealand Government in the 1930s and 1940s.

I believe Source H to be a fairly useful resource as the man who wrote this was Colin Scrimgeour's son, I find it useful because his ~~son~~ son would have had some insight into his father's life, as he would have been close to him. But I would be unsure about the reliability because he would have been fairly young seeing this but mainly because I would imagine him to be very biased possibly altering the truth to put his father in a positive light and try to portray the Government ~~as~~ negatively which he does by claiming they called his father up for military service and tried to put him on the front line with his weak heart thus killing him and claims his father's ~~was~~ "voice was said to speak for the ordinary people of New Zealand." I would think this to be unreliable as it is from a biased view but still useful as a perspective.

Achievement exemplar for 91436 2015			Total score	09
Q	Grade score	Annotation		
1	A3	This is A3 as the candidate has identified causes and effects, although there is very limited use of evidence. The sources are only referenced implicitly. This level of writing does not have 'depth' and could not reach M5 even if there was use of specific evidence from the sources.		
2	A3	The candidate has demonstrated an understanding of the cartoonist's perspective of Colin Scrimgeour, although the candidate has not fully understood the context of the cartoon. The second perspective largely paraphrases the book review and barely reaches the threshold for demonstrating an understanding of a second perspective.		
3	A3	The candidate has explained a valid reason for Source H to be useful to an historian, and why its reliability may be questionable. There is very limited depth and little specific reference to the sources, hence an A3 grade.		