

Assessment Schedule – 2014**History: Analyse evidence relating to an historical event of significance to New Zealanders (91436)****Evidence Statement****Question One: Cause and effect**

N1	N2	A3	A4	M5	M6	E7	E8
ONE cause <i>OR</i> effect is referred to.	ONE cause of the Highland Clearances is referred to. <i>AND</i> ONE effect is referred to.	Any of TWO possible causes described, with reference to source material. <i>AND</i> Any of TWO possible consequences / effects of the Clearances are described, with reference to source material:	TWO of the possible <i>causes</i> described, with specific and detailed reference to the source material <i>AND</i> TWO of the possible <i>effects</i> described, with specific and detailed reference to the source material.	At least TWO causes are explained. One cause is explained in detail, with specific references to source material. Connections are made between events in the Highlands, and economic and social change there and elsewhere: a development of the argument presented in the first paragraph of Source B: or another such argument. <i>AND</i> At least TWO effects are explained in some detail, with specific reference to source material. Reference must be made to both Sources B and C. One consequence is explained in detail. To show a 'thorough' understanding of the evidence, the candidate will make connections between the different forces that caused the Clearances and the impact on people's lives, both socially and culturally, and will 'read' the painting by explaining it as a representation of	At least TWO causes are explained in detail, with specific reference to source material, e.g. the candidate recognises that the causes of the Clearances continue to be a focus for disagreement between historians / writers, or some such argument. <i>AND</i> Multiple possible effects are explained in detail, with specific reference to source material. Reference is made to Sources A, B, and C. To show a 'thorough' understanding of the evidence, candidates will identify detailed connections between the different forces that caused the Clearances and the impact on people's lives, both socially and culturally.	A detailed and insightful explanation of at least TWO causes is given, e.g. the candidate argues that the fact that disagreement about the causes continues suggests that history is not 'fixed', that the past continues to be reinterpreted and that the use of the phrase 'ethnic cleansing' suggests a link to more modern examples of forced social dislocation, reinforcing the argument of the fluidity of the past. <i>AND</i> A detailed and perceptive explanation of at least TWO effects is given, e.g. the candidate refers to short-term effects and long-term effects. The diminishing of the cultural foundations of Gaelic life could be explained in some detail as the table is analysed, e.g. the candidate refers to Source G, and its account of the impact of migrants on Canadian history. <i>OR</i>	A comprehensive and insightful explanation of at least TWO causes is given. Causes are examined / analysed to show a commonality, an argument for the manner in which causes of a particular event are interconnected, e.g. the candidate argues for the relative importance of one cause over another. <i>AND</i> A comprehensive and insightful explanation of at least TWO effects is given, e.g. the candidate argues the complexity of the particular effects of an event, and makes connections to other sources to help establish this complexity. <i>AND / OR</i> A connection between events in Scotland and New Zealand is made: the actions of John McKenzie, who, in witnessing one injustice, is instrumental in creating another one in New Zealand.

				the effect of the Clearances on a personal level.		A connection between events in Scotland and New Zealand is made: the actions of John McKenzie, who, in witnessing one injustice, is instrumental in creating another one in New Zealand.	
--	--	--	--	---	--	--	--

N0 = No response; no relevant evidence.

Sample evidence for Question One

Possible causes of the Highland Clearances:

- agricultural change as part of the Industrial Revolution which affected much of 18th and early part of the 19th century
- people replaced by sheep
- capitalism becoming a dominant economic force
- an early version of 'ethnic cleansing'
- an attempt to destroy the clan system
- an attempt on the part of the ruling elite to consolidate their power
- changing weather patterns leading to poor harvests
- a rising population
- pressure on Highlanders to emigrate
- a desire for a better life sees the emergence of mass migration.

Possible consequences of the Highland Clearances:

- dislocation of families
- emigration to far off lands
- personal loss / grief as a consequence of forced removal from land
- decreasing numbers of Gaelic speakers in Scotland.

Question Two: General and specific

N1	N2	A3	A4	M5	M6	E7	E8
<p>An attempt is made to describe</p> <p>ONE general idea</p> <p>OR</p> <p>ONE specific idea.</p>	<p>An attempt is made to describe</p> <p>ONE general</p> <p>AND</p> <p>ONE specific idea</p>	<p>The academic view of the Clearances is described accurately: the manner in which they continue to elicit a hold on the popular imagination. McAvoy's particular response to the Clearances is described: the personal opinion, the personal response to the event. A distinction is made between the general and the specific.</p>	<p>A general view of the Clearances is explained, and McAvoy's response to the events is explained with some detail, but with insubstantial reference to the source material.</p>	<p>The general and the specific are described and <i>analysed</i> accurately, and with direct reference to the source material.</p> <p>E.g. A general view might be the manner in which events can elicit not just a continuing fascination for the general population, but that attempts can be made to alleviate the wrongs of the past through public acknowledgement – the 'regret' voted for in the Scottish Parliament.</p> <p>A specific view (McAvoy's) sees the Clearances as a possible subject for a film. His view is supported by another specific opinion, that of historian Ted Cowan. McAvoy sees the event in quite specific ways that are explained: the resulting migration, the impact on individuals.</p>	<p>The candidate analyses both the general and the specific comments in some detail.</p> <p>Examples such as in M5 are developed more fully – or other references are added to show how specific comments can differ from the general.</p>	<p>Both sources are <i>analysed</i> with <i>insightfulness</i>, and supported with <i>detailed</i> reference to the source material.</p> <p>E.g. the candidate comments on the generality of the comments in Source E: the manner in which claims are made but not supported – a 'huge understatement', 'national identity', the decline of the Gaelic culture.</p> <p>The candidate shows, however, that the generality of these remarks is supported by evidence in other sources.</p> <p>E.g. the candidate examines McAvoy's assertion that the story 'could be focussed on one individual to tell it', and suggests that he had himself in mind as the 'individual' who – in a film – could tell the story.</p>	<p>Both sources are <i>comprehensively</i> analysed with <i>insightfulness</i>, and supported with <i>detailed</i> reference to the source material.</p> <p>E.g. the candidate comments on the way that Source C is the stereotypical view of the Clearances, and that a more modern approach is needed. The candidate argues that a general approach to an historical event tends to focus on patterns or trends rather than the particular – whereas in Source F, the specific view is coloured by the personal, specifically McAvoy's comment that 'history ... is only interesting because it happens to us.'</p>

N0 = No response; no relevant evidence.

Question Three: Reliability and/or usefulness

N1	N2	A3	A4	M5	M6	E7	E8
An attempt is made to explain the reliability and / or usefulness of ONE source.	An attempt is made to explain the reliability and / or usefulness of BOTH sources.	<p>ONE of the sources is <i>assessed</i> as being reliable and / or useful.</p> <p>E.g. the candidate questions the reliability of Source G as the statue could be seen as a deliberate attempt to manipulate the viewer's emotional response to the forced migration of so many Scots.</p> <p>OR</p> <p>The reliability of Source H is <i>assessed</i> in light of the text being a translation from the Gaelic, or the usefulness of such a source is used as an example of how oral sources can be of value to an historian.</p>	ONE of the sources is <i>assessed</i> as being reliable or useful as in A3, with convincing and <i>specific</i> reference to the source material.	<p>ONE of the sources is <i>evaluated</i> in terms of reliability and / or usefulness.</p> <p>E.g. the candidate refers to the usefulness of the account of the unveiling of the statue, to show how the effect of the enforced Clearances and dislocation of so many people has had a positive impact in the development of distant lands.</p>	ONE of the sources is <i>evaluated</i> in terms of reliability and / or usefulness as for M5, with a <i>detailed</i> explanation and with <i>specific</i> reference to supporting evidence for the evaluation.	<p>One of the sources is <i>evaluated</i> in terms of reliability and / or usefulness. Such an evaluation is discussed with <i>insight</i>.</p> <p>E.g. The candidate, in discussing the reliability of Source G, could refer to the manner in which information in this source is supported by other sources in this paper.</p> <p>The candidate covers the question that is posed by the use of a source that is translated (Source H): the extent to which cultural values are unable to be translated as easily or as accurately as a narrative.</p>	<p>One of the sources is <i>evaluated</i> in terms of reliability and / or usefulness. Such an evaluation is discussed with <i>insight</i> and with detailed and specific reference to the source.</p> <p>E.g. A historian might consider this song as reliable, as it reflects a view of the Clearances and their impact on individuals and society transmitted through the medium of song. The oral transmission of information is at the heart of Gaelic culture. Oral history has traditionally been regarded by many historians as lacking reliability and as having less importance than written accounts.</p> <p>This song would have had an audience – one that would have perhaps sympathised with its viewpoint, e.g. the candidate comments on the depiction of the people in Source C as a reference that supports the sense of loss and grief in the song.</p>

Note: Cross-referencing is not essential for E7 or E8.

N0 = No response; no relevant evidence.

Cut Scores

	Not Achieved	Achievement	Achievement with Merit	Achievement with Excellence
Score range	0 – 8	9 – 12	13 – 18	19 – 24