Question Answering Using First Order Logic

Ananya Banerjee

The University of Texas at Dallas Richardson, TX 75080 USA {axb170053@utdallas.edu}

Abstract

Question Answering is a paradigm of Artificial Intelligence which uses Knowledge Bases to find answers. Our Q/A system uses a Knowledge Base custom made by us, which consists of First Order Logic Axioms for the Supermarket domain (Groceries and Meat). These axioms are used to then query for answers to questions asked by the user.

Keywords: First Order Logic, Knowledge Representation, Artificial Intelligence

1. Introduction

Construction of a system capable of mimicking human-like reasoning capabilities has been a area of research for scientists for over a decade. Since real-time data that we get is usually of unstructured form, it makes the job much more difficult. Hence, the first step is to build a system capable of taking unstructured data as input, which in itself is a humongous challenge. This is quite an active area of research nowadays. Another approach towards solving this problem would be converting unstructured textual data to a reasonable structured form and then using that data in our systems. Several efforts had been made towards building structured form of the collected data. One of the most popular forms are creation of Knowledge Base which contains enough information to facilitate reasoning.



2. Assumptions

Our domain Supermarket is restricted to just Groceries and Meat. In other words, we assume that our Supermarket only sells Groceries and Meat. We further limit our Groceries to Fruits, Vegetables, Dairy Product and Others(which consists of Miscellaneous other food items). For the full list of what items fall under each subcategory, please refer to Appendix A and B.

We also make several real world assumptions to ensure that our system is capable of answering questions with good enough accuracy. The assumptions are as follows:

- 1. A person can either be a customer or staff at a time, not both.
- 2. All supermarkets in our universe mimic each other.
- 3. Product or items are same as each other.
- 4. Any person who buys Product will receive a receipt.
- 5. Any person who wishes to return the Product must bring their receipt.
- 6. All our Dairy Product contain Milk.
- 7. Conversely, if any product contains milk, then we classify it as a Dairy Product.
- 8. Oil, Water, Milk and Energy Drink are the only Liquids in our system.
- 9. Everything else is deemed as a solid.
- 10. We put Eggs under Meat to simplify categorization of Vegetarians from Non-Vegetarians.
- 11.Our universe doesn't have Eggetarians.
- 12. We only sell sweet yogurt and salty butter in our supermarket.
- 13. We also assume that Fruits and Vegetables can

be Fresh, Frozen or Canned.

- 14. We consider any product that contains sugar as sweet in taste.
- 15.We consider any product that contains salt as salty in taste.
- 16. We also deem only Sweet, Salty, Sour and Tangy as Tastes.
- 17. Similarly, we only deem Round, Oval or Elliptical as Shapes.
- 18. We only consider Red, Blue, Green, Yellow, Black, White, Purple, Pink and Orange as colors.
- 19. We assume that Frozen Product can never be Canned or Fresh and vice versa.
- 20. We also deem all vegetables as not fit to be eaten raw.
- 21. We deem all fruits fit to be eaten raw or after cooking.
- 22. We also assume that Bread is often eaten with butter and Cereal is eaten with Milk.
- 23. Further, we only accept Cash, Debit and Credit as payment methods.
- 24. All Solids are measured in Pounds.
- 25. All Liquids are measured in Ounces.
- 26. Only an Adult can buy products from the Supermarket.
- 27. If the Supermarket is open, then there will be atleast Staff in the Supermarket.

3. Methodology

We build our English axioms based on the above pre-decided rules of our Supermarket universe. The full list of the axioms can be found in Appendix C. We make approximately 120 axioms to make our supermarket deem as close to reality as possible. We then convert these axioms into First Order Logic. The full list of First Order Logic axioms can be found in Appendix D. We lastly convert these FOL Axioms into CNF Form. The full list of these can be found in Appendix E. We use Prover9 to build our question answering system. Prover9 uses Resolution Refutation on the axioms listed in Appendix E and gives a proof as a answer.

An example of how we give input to Prover9 and the proof it generates is as shown below.

Assumption:

Tomatoes(Roma).

Question:

ENGLISH: Are Roma Tomatoes Red?
GOAL: Red(Roma).

Please do note that the assumption mentioned here is in addition to all the CNF axioms that we provide in Appendix E.

4. Results

To test durability and efficiency of our system, we decided to test a variety of inter and intra category questions to our system. For inter category check, we checked if any two Product within the same category were correctly identified by the system or not. In other words, we checked if one product which is chicken and another product which is pork, were identified as two different Product by our system.

Given below are the assumptions and the goal that we provide to Prover9(apart from axioms in Appendix E).

Assumption:

Chicken(C). Pork(P).

Question:

ENGLISH: Are chicken and pork the same *Product?*

GOAL: C != P.

These assumptions and goals generate the following proof using Prover9's resolution refutation.

```
### PROOF ------

# Proof 1 at 0.25 (+ 0.01) seconds.

# Length of proof is 8.

# Level of proof is 3.

# Maximum clause weight is 7.

# Given clauses 0.

# Given clauses 0.

# Given clauses o.

# Given clauses o.

# Given clauses o.

# Given clauses o.

# Chicken(x) | Product(x). [assumption].

# Chicken(x) | Product(x). [resolve(44, b, 43, a)].

# Chicken(c). [assumption].

# Product(x) | -Product(y) | x != y. [assumption].

# Product(x) | -Product(x). [resolve(263, a, 264, a)].

# Product(x). [resolve(263, a, 264, a)].

# Product(x). [resolve(421, a, 387, a)].

# Product(x). [resolve(421, a, 387, a)].

# Product(x). [resolve(421, a, 387, a)].
```

Next, we tested whether our system was capable of differentiating between Product belonging to two different categories. We checked if Yogurt belonging to the Category "DairyProduct" and Watermelon belonging to the category "Vegetables" was correctly differentiated by our system was not.

Assumption:

```
Yogurt(Y).
Watermelon(W).
```

Ouestion:

ENGLISH: Is Yogurt the same as Water-melon?

GOAL: Y != W.

These assumptions and goals above generate the following proof using Prover9's resolution refutation.

The next step was to test for durability. We tested whether our system could identify indirectly implied relations correctly. We gave the system assmptions stating that chocolate contains sugar. We asked to prove whether it means chocolate is sweet or not.

Assumption:

```
Chocolate(Cadbury).

Sugar(S).

Contains(Cadbury, S).
```

Question:

```
ENGLISH: Is chocolate sweet?

GOAL: IsSweet(Cadbury).
```

These assumptions and goals above generate the following proof using Prover9's resolution refutation.

We further checked if our system understood the concept of Vegetarians v/s Non Vegetarians or not. We gave the system assumptions stating that Ana bought pork. We asked the system whether it meant she was Vegetarian or not.

Assumption:

```
Person(Ana).
Pork(P).
Buys(Ana, P).
```

Question:

ENGLISH: Ana buys pork. Is she Vegetarian?

```
GOAL: -Vegetarian (Ana).
```

These assumptions and goals above generate the following proof using Prover9's resolution refutation.

One another test that we performed tested if our system was capable of understanding intuition well. We gave our system data about John buying products at the Supermarket. We asked the system whether his money decreased or not.

Assumption:

```
Person(John).
Product(P).
Buys(John, P).
Money(z).
```

Ouestion:

ENGLISH: *Does John's Money decreases?* **GOAL:** *IsDecreased(z).*

These assumptions and goals generate the following proof using Prover9's resolution refutation.

We did several other tests such as the ones mentioned and our system passed quite a lot of them, if not all.

5. Conclusion

Thus, we can say that we though our system gives good results, it is still not a complete system. We need to infuse it with more human-like reasoning and knowledge to make it capable of adapting and understanding real word scenarios. We also believe that merely using a Knowledge Base in the traditional sense might not be enough to capture all aspects of the real world. It might be quite interesting to see more creative ways to build artificially intelligent systems capable of giving human-like performance in real-time.

Acknowledgements

We would like to thank Dr Dan Moldovan for his brilliant outlook on Knowledge Representations and continued motivation and support throughout the duration of the project.

References

- ¹ Stuart Russell and Peter Norvig, *Artificial Intelligence: A Modern Approach*. Prentice Hall Press, 2009.
- ² Kurt Bollacker, Colin Evans, Praveen Paritosh, Tim Sturge, and Jamie Taylor, *Freebase: a collaboratively created graph database for structuring human knowledge*. CM SIGMOD international conference on Management, 2008.

12

6. Appendix A

General Objects

SuperMarket(x)

IsOpen(x)

Person(x), People(x)

Staff(x) Customer(x) IsProbable(x)

IsVisiting _ Supermarket(x)

AtTime(x) Adult(x)

Product(x), Items(x) Kids(x), IsChild(x)

Debit(x) Credit(x) Cash(x)

Is _ Acceptable _ payment(x)

Receipt(x)
Money(x)
IsIncreased(x)
IsDecreased(x)
ParkingLot(x)
HasCar(x)
Vegetarians(x)

Non _ Vegetarians(x)

Liquid(x)
Solid(x)
Pounds(x)
Ounces(x)
Groceries(x)
Color(x)

Red(x), Blue(x), Green(x), Black(x), Grey(x),

Yellow(x), Pink(x), Pink(x),

Brown(x), Purple(x)

Round(x) IsSweet(x) IsSalty(x) Frozen(x)

Canned(X) Fresh(x)

Oval(x)

IsTangy(x)

Is Tangy(x)
IsSour(x)

Others(x)

Sugar(x)

Salt(x) Food(x)

Leafy _ Vegetables(x)

Tastes(x)

Shapes(x) EatenRaw(x)

EatenAfterCooking(x)

General Relations

Sees(x,y) In(x,y) Meets(x,y) Contains(x,y) Knows(x,y) Buys(x,y) Eats(x,y)

Can _ accompany(x,y)
Pays _ using(x,y)
Returns(x,y)
Parked(x,y)

In(x,y), Contains(x,y) MeasuredIn(x,y)

Sells(x,y)
Made(x,y)
Has(x,y)
HasShape(x,y)
HasTaste(x)
Is(x,y)
EqualTo(x,y)

Equal To(x,y)
EatenWith(x,y)
BoughtWith(x,y)
IsAvailable(x,y)

Receives(x, y)

7. Appendix B

Dairy Product

Butter Milk Cheese Yogurt

Others

Cereal Bread Rice Oil Sugar Chocolate **Energy Drink** Water

Icecream Popsicle

Vegetables

Potatoes Onions Jalapenos Bell Pepper Cabbage Cauliflower Okra

Green Onions

Ginger **Tomatoes** Broccoli Lemon Spinach Kale Fenugreek

Fruits

Apples Oranges Grapes Strawberries Blackberries Blueberries Raspberry Kiwi

Watermelon

Cherry Banana Mangoes

Pear

Meat

Eggs Chicken Beef Sausage Pork Bacon Turkey

Fish - Salmon, Tuna

Spices

Green _ Cardamom

Cloves Pepper Salt Garlic

Italian Seasoning

Cumin

Mustard Seeds

Paprika Basil Oregano

8. Appendix C: English Axioms

- 23. Liquids are measured in ounces.
- 1. Person in the supermarket are either staff or 24. Meat are Solids. customer.
 - 25. Fruits are Solids.
- 2. If the supermarket is open, then there are people in the supermarket.()
 - 26. Vegetables are Solids.
- 3. If a person buys Product then they eat them. 27. Groceries are available in the supermarket.
- 4. If a person buys Product then they are 28. Meat is available in the supermarket. adults.
 - 29. None of the Product sold in the supermarket are

5. Adults cannot be kids.

made in the supermarket.

6. Kids cannot be adults.

- 30. Color are Red, Blue, Green, Black, Yellow, Pink, White, Orange, Purple.
- 7. A person can be either an Adult or a kid
- 31. Product attributes are color, taste, shape.
- 8. Acceptable **Payment** Method include 2. Butter is a Dairy Product Credit, Debit or Cash.
 - 33. DairyProduct are Product.

9. Items are Product.

- 34. Milk is a Dairy Product
- 10. If a person returns a product, then they must 35. Cheese is a Dairy Product have a receipt.
- 36. Yogurt is a Dairy Product 11. If a person returns a product then their money increases.
 - 37. If a product contains milk, then it is a Dairy Product.
- 12. If a person buys a product, then their money decreases.
 - 38. Dairy product, contains milk.
- 13. Supermarket contains a parking lot.
- 39. Butter contains milk.
- 14. If a person buys meat, then they are non-40. Cheese contains milk. vegetarians.
- 15. If a person does not buy meat, then they are 42. Yogurt is sweetened.
- 41. Yogurt contains milk.
- vegetarians.
 - 43. Butter can be salted or unsalted.
- 16. A vegetarian cannot be a Non-vegetarian
- 44. Cheese is salted.

and solid.

- 17. A person can either be a vegetarian or a non₄₅. Milk can be sweetened or unsweetened vegetarian.
 - 46. If the product is milk, then it is white in color and
- 18. Any product can either be liquid or solid.
- liquid.
- 19. Liquid Product are either milk or water of 7. If the product is butter, then it is yellow in color energy_d rinkoroil.
 - 48. If the product is yogurt then it is white in color

20. Liquid Product are not solid.

- and solid.
- 21. Solid Product are any product that is not liquid.
- 49. If the product is cheese, then it is yellow or white in color and solid.
- 22. Solids are measured in pounds.

- 50. Dairy Product are part of Groceries.
- 51. Vegetables can be Frozen Vegetables or Canned Vegetables or Fresh Vegetables.
- 52. Fruits can be Frozen or Canned or Fresh Fruits. 74. Apples are red in color and sweet and sour in taste.
- 53. Frozen items cannot be Fresh Items or Canned 5. Strawberries and Raspberry are red in color and Items.
- Items.
- Items.
- 56. Vegetables are part of Groceries.
- 57. Fruits are part of Groceries.
- 58. Potatoes or Onions or Jalapenos or Bell Pepper or 80. Kiwi is green in color and tangy in taste. Cabbage or Okra or Green Onions or Ginger or Tomatoes or Broccoli or Mushrooms or Lemon 1. Cherry is red in color and sweet in taste. or Spinach or Kale or Fenugreek is vegetables
- 59. Potatoes are oval or round in shape.
- 60. Potatoes can be red, brown, yellow or white.
- 61. Tomatoes are round in shape.
- 62. Tomatoes are red or green in color
- 63. Jalapenos are green, red, yellow or orange ing6. Fruits cannot be Dairy Product. color.
- 64. Bell Pepper are green, red, yellow or orange in color.
- 65. Cabbages are green or purple in color.
- 66. Green Onions are Onions
- 67. Onions can be white or purple.
- 68. Broccoli is green in color.
- 69. Lemon is yellow or green in color and round in shape.
- 70. Leafy_V eqetables are also vegetables.
- 71. Leafy Vegetables include Kale, Spinach and fenugreek.
- 72. Kale, Spinach and fenugreek are green in color. 95. Spices are groceries.

- 73. Apples or Oranges or Grapes or Strawberries or Blackberry or Blueberry or Raspberry or Kiwi or Watermelon or Cherry or Banana or Mangoes or Pear are Fruits.
- - sweet in taste.
- 54. Fresh Items cannot be Canned Items or Frozen 76. Grapes are round in shape and come in black, red and green colors and sweet in taste.
- 55. Canned items cannot be Frozen items or Fresh 77. Oranges, Pears and Mangoes are yellow or orange in color and sweet or tangy in taste.
 - 78. Banana is yellow in color and sweet in taste.
 - 79. Blueberry and black berry are black in color and sweet in taste.
 - 82. Blueberry, strawberry, raspberry, blackberry are berries.
 - 83. Berries are sweet in taste.
 - 84. Watermelon are green in color and sweet in taste and round in shape.
 - 85. Fruits cannot be Vegetables.

 - 87. Vegetable cannot be Dairy Product
 - 88. Eggs or Chicken or Beef or Turkey or Sausage or Pork or Bacon or Fish is Meat.
 - 89. Meat can be Frozen, Canned or Fresh.
 - 90. Meat cannot Dairy Product.
 - 91. Meat cannot be Fruits.
 - 92. Eggs are white or brown in color and oval in shape.
 - 93. Meat cannot be Vegetables.
 - 94. Green Cardamom or Cloves or Pepper or Salt or Garlic or Italian Seasoning or Cumin Seeds or Mustard Seeds or Paprika or Smoked Paprika or Basil or Oregano are Spices

- 96. Spices cannot be fruits, vegetables, meat or dairly23. Meat is Product. Product.
 - 124. Money is Cash, Debit or Credit.
- 97. If a product is sweet then it has sugar in it.
- 125. Groceries are Product.
- 98. If a product is salty then it has salt in it.
- 126. Only Adults can buy products.
- 99. Icecream and Popsicle are frozen foods.
- 100. Other items in supermarket include Cereal, Bread, rice, Oil, Sugar, chocolate, energy drink, bottled water.
- 101. Other items are groceries.
- 102. Milk and cereal are eaten together.
- 103. Bread and butter are eaten together
- 104. Sugar can be both white and brown in color.
- 105. Sugar is sweet in taste.
- 106. Chocolate contains sugar.
- 107. Energy Drink is a liquid and it is sweet in taste.
- 108. Sweet, sour, tangy, salty are tastes.
- 109. Round, Oval, Elliptical are Shapes.
- 110. If it's a vegetable then it can't be eaten raw.
- 111. If it's a fruit, then it can be eaten raw or after cooking.
- 112. Dairy Product can be eaten raw or cooked.
- 113. Meat can only be eaten raw not cooked.
- 114. Other items may or may not be eaten raw or after cooking.
- 115. No two Product are the same.
- 116. Salmon and Tuna are fishes.
- 117. No two colors are the same.
- 118. No two taste are the same.
- 119. No staff can be the same as customer.
- 120. No two shapes are the same.
- 121. Groceries are Product.
- 122. Ice cream and Popsicle are others.

9. Appendix D :First Order Logic Axioms

- $\forall x Person(x) \land \forall y Supermarket(y) \land In(x,y) \Rightarrow Staff(x) \lor Customer(x)$
- $\forall x Supermarket(x) \land IsOpen(x) = > \exists y Person(y) \land In(y, x)$
- $\forall x \forall y Person(x) \land Product(y) \land Buys(x,y) => Eats(x,y)$
- $\forall x \forall y Person(x) \land Product(y) \land Buys(x,y) => Adult(x)$
- $\forall x Adult(x) => Kids(x)$
- $\forall x Kids(x) => Adult(x)$
- $\forall x Person(x) = > Adult(x) \lor Kids(x)$
- $\forall x Is Acceptable Payment(x) => Cash(x) \lor Debit(x) \lor Credit(x)$
- $\forall x Items(x) = > Product(x)$
- $\forall x \forall y Person(x) \land Product(y) \land Buys(x,y) => \exists z Receipt(z) \land Has(x,z)$
- $\forall x \forall y Person(x) \land Product(y) \land Returns(x, y) \Rightarrow \exists z Receipt(z) \land Has(x, z)$
- $\forall x \forall y Person(x) \land Product(y) \land$ $Returns(x,y) \Rightarrow \exists z Money(z) \land Has(x,z) \land$ IsIncreased(z)
- $\forall x \forall y Person(x) \land Product(y) \land Buys(x,y) => \exists z Money(z) \land Has(x,z) \land IsDecreased(z)$
- $\forall x Supermarket(x) = > \exists y Parking_Lot(y) \land Contains(x, y)$
- $\forall x \forall y Person(x) \land Meat(y) \land Buys(x, y) => Non_V egetarian(x)$
- $\forall x \forall y Person(x) \land Meat(y) \land Buys(x,y) => Vegetarian(x)$
- $\forall x Vegetarian(x) => Non_V egetarian(x)$
- $\forall x Person(x) = \bigvee egetarian(x) \lor Non_V egetarian(x)$
- $\bullet \ \forall x Product(x) \texttt{=>} Liquid(x) \lor Solid(x) \\$
- $\forall x Milk(x) = > Liquid(x)$
- $\forall x Oil(x) = > Liquid(x)$
- $\forall xWater(x) = > Liquid(x)$
- $\forall x Energy_D rink(x) => Liquid(x)$
- $\forall x Liquid(x) => Solid(x)$
- $\forall x Solid(x) => Liquid(x)$

- $\forall x \forall y Solid(x) \land Pounds(y) => MeasuredIn(x, y)$
- $\forall x \forall y Liquid(x) \land$ Ounces(y) = MeasuredIn(x, y)
- $\forall x \forall y Groceries(x) \land Supermarket(y) => Is Available(x, y)$
- $\forall x \forall y Meat(x) \land$ Supermarket(y) => IsAvailable(x, y)
- $\forall x \forall y Supermarket(x) \land Product(y) \land Sells(x, y) => Made(y, x)$
- $\forall x Red(x) = > Color(x)$
- $\forall x Blue(x) = > Color(x)$
- $\forall x Green(x) = > Color(x)$
- $\forall x Black(x) = > Color(x)$
- $\forall x Yellow(x) = >Color(x)$
- $\forall x Pink(x) = > Color(x)$
- $\forall xWhite(x) = >Color(x)$
- $\forall x Orange(x) = > Color(x)$
- $\forall x Purple(x) = > Color(x)$
- $\forall x Butter(x) = Dairy Product(x)$
- $\forall x Dairy Product(x) = > Product(x)$
- $\forall x Milk(x) = > DairyProduct(x)$
- $\forall x Cheese(x) = > DairyProduct(x)$
- $\forall x Yogurt(x) = > DairyProduct(x)$
- $\forall x \forall y Product(x) \land Milk(y) \land Contains(x, y) => Dairy Product(x)$
- $\forall x Dairy Product(x) = > \exists y Milk(y) \land Contains(x, y)$
- $\forall x \forall y Butter(x) \land Milk(y) = Contains(x, y)$
- $\forall x \forall y Cheese(x) \land Milk(y) => Contains(x, y)$
- $\forall x \forall y Yogurt(x) \land Milk(y) => Contains(x, y)$
- $\forall x Y ogurt(x) = > IsSweet(x)$
- $\forall x Butter(x) = > IsSalted(x) \lor IsSalted(x)$
- $\forall x Cheese(x) = > IsSalted(x)$
- $\forall x Milk(x) = Sweet(x) \lor IsSweet(x) \forall x$
- $\forall y Product(x) \land Milk(y) \land Is(x,y) => White(x) \forall x$
- $\forall y Product(x) \land Milk(y) \land Is(x, y) => Liquid(x) \forall x$
- $\forall y Product(x) \land Butter(y) \land Is(x, y) => Yellow(x) \forall x$

- $\forall y Product(x) \land Butter(y) \land$ $Is(x,y) => Solid(x) \forall x$
- $\forall y Product(x) \land Yogurt(y) \land$ $Is(x,y) => White(x) \forall x$
- $\forall y Product(x) \land Yogurt(y) \land$ $Is(x,y) = Solid(x) \forall x$
- $\forall y Product(x) \land Cheese(y) \land$ $Is(x,y) = Yellow(x) \lor White(x) \forall x$
- $\forall y Product(x) \land Cheese(y) \land$ $Is(x,y) => Solid(x) \forall x Dairy Product(x) => Grocenies(x) \cap reen_Onions(x) => Onions(x) => On$
- $\forall x Vegetables(x) = > Frozen(x) \lor Canned(x) \lor$ Fresh(x)
- $\forall x Fruits(x) = \Rightarrow Frozen(x) \lor Canned(x) \lor$ Fresh(x)
- $\forall x Frozen(x) => Canned(x)$
- $\forall x Frozen(x) => Fresh(x)$
- $\forall x Fresh(x) => Canned(x)$
- $\forall x Fresh(x) => Frozen(x)$
- $\forall x Canned(x) => Fresh(x)$
- $\forall x Canned(x) => Frozen(x)$
- $\forall x Vegetables(x) = Sroceries(x)$
- $\forall x Fruits(x) = Sroceries(x)$
- $\forall x Potatoes(x) = Vegetables(x)$
- $\forall x Onions(x) = \forall v equal to S(x)$
- $\forall x Jalapenos(x) = \forall x Jalap$
- $\forall x Bell_p eppers(x) = Vegetables(x)$
- $\forall x Cabbages(x) = Vegetables(x)$
- $\forall xOkra(x) = Veqetables(x)$
- $\forall x Green_Onions(x) = \forall v egetables(x)$
- $\forall x Ginger(x) = Vegetables(x)$
- $\forall x Tomatoes(x) = \forall x Tomatoes(x)$
- $\forall x Broccoli(x) = \forall x Broc$
- $\forall x Mushrooms(x) = \forall x Mushr$
- $\forall x Lemons(x) = \forall v Lemons$
- $\forall x Spinach(x) = \forall v Spinach(x) = \forall$
- $\forall x Kale(x) = Vegetables(x)$
- $\forall x Fenugreek(x) = Vegetables(x)$
- $\forall x Potatoes(x) = >Oval(x) \lor Round(x)$

- $\forall x Potatoes(x) = \Rightarrow Red(x) \lor Brown(x) \lor$ $Yellow(x) \lor White(x)$
- $\forall x Tomatoes(x) = > Round(x)$
- $\forall x Tomatoes(x) = Red(x) \vee Green(x)$
- $\forall x Jalapenos(x) = Secon(x) \lor Red(x) \lor$ $Yellow(x) \vee Orange(x)$
- $\forall x Bell_p eppers(x) = Secon(x) \lor Red(x) \lor$ $Yellow(x) \lor Orange(x)$
- $\forall x Cabbages(x) = Screen(x) \lor Purple(x)$
- $\forall x Onions(x) => White(x) \lor Purple(x)$
- $\forall x Broccoli(x) = \Rightarrow Green(x)$
- $\forall x Lemon(x) = Yellow(x) \lor Green(x)$
- $\forall x Lemon(x) = > Round(x)$
- $\forall x Leafy_V eqetables(x) = \forall x Leafy_V eqetables(x)$
- $\forall x Spinach(x) = \sum Leafy_V egetables(x)$
- $\forall x Kale(x) = \sum Leafy_V egetables(x)$
- $\forall x Fenugreek(x) = \sum Leafy_V egetables(x)$
- $\forall x Spinach(x) = \Rightarrow Green(x)$
- $\forall x Kale(x) = Sreen(x)$
- $\forall x Fenugreek(x) = Sreen(x)$
- $\forall x Apples(x) = Fruits(x)$
- $\forall x Oranges(x) = > Fruits(x)$
- $\forall x Grapes(x) = > Fruits(x)$
- $\forall x Strawberries(x) = \gt{Fruits}(x)$
- $\forall x Blackberries(x) = \gt{Fruits}(x)$
- $\forall x Blueberries(x) = > Fruits(x)$
- $\forall x Raspberry(x) = Fruits(x)$
- $\forall x Kiwi(x) = > Fruits(x)$
- $\forall x Watermelon(x) = > Fruits(x)$
- $\forall x Cherry(x) = > Fruits(x)$
- $\forall x Banana(x) = > Fruits(x)$
- $\forall x Mangoes(x) = > Fruits(x)$
- $\forall x Pear(x) = > Fruits(x)$
- $\forall x Apples(x) = Red(x)$
- $\forall x Apples(x) = > IsSweet(x) \lor IsSour(x)$
- $\forall x Strawberries(x) = > Red(x)$
- $\forall xStrawberries(x) = > IsSweet(x)$
- $\forall x Raspberry(x) = > Red(x)$
- $\forall x Raspberry(x) = > IsSweet(x)$

- $\forall xGrapes(x) = > Round(x)$
- $\forall x Grapes(x) = Red(x) \lor Green(x) \lor Black(x)$
- $\forall x Grapes(x) = > IsSweet(x)$
- $\forall x Oranges(x) = Yellow(x) \lor Orange(x)$
- $\forall xOranges(x) = > IsSweet(x) \lor IsTangy(x)$
- $\forall x Mangoes(x) = Yellow(x) \lor Orange(x)$
- $\forall x Mangoes(x) = > IsSweet(x) \lor IsTangy(x)$
- $\forall x Pear(x) = Yellow(x) \lor Orange(x)$
- $\forall x Pear(x) = > IsSweet(x) \lor IsTangy(x)$
- $\forall x Banana(x) = Yellow(x)$
- $\forall x Banana(x) = > IsSweet(x)$
- $\forall x Blackberries(x) => Black(x)$
- $\forall x Blackberries(x) = > IsSweet(x)$
- $\forall x Blueberries(x) => Black(x)$
- $\forall x Blueberries(x) = > IsSweet(x)$
- $\forall x Kiwi(x) = Sreen(x)$
- $\forall x Kiwi(x) = > IsTangy(x)$
- $\forall x Cherry(x) = > Red(x)$
- $\forall x Cherry(x) = > IsSweet(x)$
- $\forall x Blueberries(x) = \Rightarrow Berries(x)$
- $\forall x Raspberry(x) = > Berries(x)$
- $\forall xStrawberries(x) = >Berries(x)$
- $\forall x Berries(x) = > IsSweet(x)$
- $\forall xWatermelon(x) = Sreen(x)$
- $\forall xWatermelon(x) = > IsSweet(x)$
- $\forall xWatermelon(x) = > Round(x)$
- $\forall x Fruits(x) => Vegetables(x)$
- $\forall x Fruits(x) \Rightarrow DairyProduct(x)$
- $\forall x Vegetables(x) \Rightarrow DairyProduct(x)$
- $\forall x Eggs(x) => Meat(x)$
- $\forall x Chicken(x) => Meat(x)$
- $\forall x Beef(x) => Meat(x)$
- $\forall x Turkey => Meat(x)$
- $\forall x Sausage(x) = > Meat(x)$
- $\forall x Pork(x) => Meat(x)$
- $\forall x Bacon(x) = > Meat(x)$
- $\forall x Fish(x) => Meat(x)$

- $\forall x Meat(x) = > Frozen(x) \lor Canned(x) \lor Fresh(x)$
- $\forall x Meat(x) => DairyProduct(x)$
- $\forall x Meat(x) => Fruits(x)$
- $\forall x Eggs(x) = Brown(x) \lor White(x)$
- $\forall x Eggs(x) => Oval(x)$
- $\forall x Meat(x) => Vegetables(x)$
- $\forall x Green_Cardamom(x) = > Spices(x)$
- $\forall x Cloves(x) = > Spices(x)$
- $\forall x Pepper(x) = Spices(x)$
- $\forall x Salt(x) = Spices(x)$
- $\forall x Garlic(x) = > Spices(x)$
- $\forall x Italian_S easoning(x) => Spices(x)$
- $\forall x Cumin_S eeds(x) = Spices(x)$
- $\forall x Mustard_S eeds(x) => Spices(x)$
- $\forall x Paprika(x) = Spices(x)$
- $\forall x Smoked_P aprika(x) = Spices(x)$
- $\forall x Basil(x) = > Spices(x)$
- $\forall x Oregano(x) = Spices(x)$
- $\forall x Spices(x) = \Rightarrow Groceries(x)$
- $\forall x Spices(x) => DairyProduct(x)$
- $\forall x Spices(x) => Fruits(x)$
- $\forall x Spices(x) => Vegetables(x)$
- $\forall x Spices(x) => Meat(x)$
- $\forall x \forall y Product(x) \land IsSweet(x) \land Sugar(y) \Rightarrow Contains(x, y)$
- $\forall x \forall y Product(x) \land IsSalty(x) \land Salt(y) => Contains(x, y)$
- $\forall x Icecream(x) = Frozen(x)$
- $\forall x Popsicle(x) = > Frozen(x)$
- $\forall x Cereal(x) = > Others(x)$
- $\forall x Bread(x) = > Others(x)$
- $\forall x Rice(x) = > Others(x)$
- $\forall x Oil(x) => Others(x)$
- $\forall x Sugar(x) = >Others(x)$
- $\forall x Chocolate(x) = > Others(x)$
- $\forall x Energy_D rink(x) = >Others(x)$
- $\forall xWater(x) = >Others(x)$
- $\forall xOthers(x) = Scroceries(x)$

- $\bullet \ \forall x \forall y Cereal(x) \land Milk(y) => EatenWith(x,y)$
- $\forall x \forall y Bread(x) \land Butter(y) = \gt{EatenWith}(x, y)$
- $\forall x Sugar(x) => White(x) \lor Brown(x)$
- $\forall x Sugar(x) = > IsSweet(x)$
- $\forall x \forall y Chocolate(x) \land Sugar(y) \Rightarrow Contains(x, y)$
- $\forall x Energy_D rink(x) = > Liquid(x)$
- $\forall x Energy_D rink(x) => IsSweet(x)$
- $\forall x Is Sweet(x) = Tastes(x)$
- $\forall x Is Sour(x) = > Tastes(x)$
- $\forall x Is Tangy(x) = Tastes(x)$
- $\forall x Is Salty(x) = > Tastes(x)$
- $\forall x Round(x) = Shapes(x)$
- $\forall xOval(x) = Shapes(x)$
- $\forall x Elliptical(x) => Shapes(x)$
- $\forall x Vegetables(x) = \sum Eaten After Cooking(x)$
- $\forall x Vegetables(x) => EatenRaw(x)$
- $\forall xFruits(x) = \sum EatenRaw(x) \lor EatenAfterCooking(x)$
- $\forall x Dairy Product(x) = \gt{EatenRaw}(x) \lor EatenAfterCooking(x)$
- $\forall x Meat(x) = > EatenAfterCooking(x)$
- $\forall x Meat(x) => EatenRaw(x)$
 - $\forall x Cereal(x) \texttt{=>} EatenRaw(x) \lor EatenAfterCooking(x)$
- $\forall x Bread(x) = \gt{EatenRaw}(x) \lor EatenAfterCooking(x)$
- $\forall x Rice(x) => EatenRaw(x) \lor EatenAfterCooking(x)$
- $\forall xOil(x) => EatenRaw(x) \lor EatenAfterCooking(x)$
- $\forall x Sugar(x) = > EatenRaw(x) \lor EatenAfterCooking(x)$
- $\forall x Chocolate(x) = > EatenRaw(x) \lor EatenAfterCooking(x)$

- $\forall xWater(x) = > EatenRaw(x) \lor EatenAfterCooking(x)$
- $\forall x \forall y Product(x) \land Product(y) = >(x! = y)$
- $\forall x Salmon(x) = > Fish(x)$
- $\forall x Tuna(x) = > Fish(x)$
- $\forall x \forall y Color(x) \land Color(y) = > (x! = y)$
- $\forall x \forall y Tastes(x) \land Tastes(y) = > (x! = y)$
- $\forall x Staff(x) = > -Customer(x)$
- $\forall x Customer(x) = -Staff(x)$
- $\forall x \forall y Shapes(x) \land Shapes(y) = > (x! = y)$
- $\forall x Groceries(x) = > Product(x)$
- $\forall x Icecream(x) = > Others(x)$
- $\forall x Popsicle(x) = >Others(x)$

 $\forall x Energy_D rink(x) = \gt{EatenRaw}(x) \lor EatenAfterCooking(x)$

10. Appendix E: CNF Axioms	-Person(x) -Product(y) -Returns(x,y) Has(x,f(x)) $$
-Person $(x) \mid$ -Supermarket $(x) \mid$ -In $(x,y) \mid$ Staff $(x) \mid$ Customer (x)	
-Staff(x) -Customer(x)	-Person(x) -Product(y) -Returns(x,y) IsIncreased(f(x)) $$
-Customer(x) \mid -Staff(x)	-Person(x) -Product(y) -Buys(x,y) Money($f(x)$)
$-Person(x) \mid -Product(y) \mid -Buys(x,y) \mid Adult(x)$	-Person(x) -Product(y) -Buys (x,y) $Has(x,f(x))$
$-Person(x) \mid -Money(y) \mid Has(x,y)$	
-Money(x) $Cash(x)$ $Debit(x)$ $Credit(x)$	-Person(x) -Product(y) -Buys (x,y) IsDecreased(f(x))
-Supermarket(x) -IsOpen(x) $Person(f(x))$	-Supermarket(x) Parking $_$ Lot(f(x)).
-Supermarket(x) -IsOpen(x) $In(f(x),x)$	-Supermarket(x) Contains(x,f(x)) $$
$-Person(x) \mid -Product(y) \mid -Buys(x,y) \mid Eats(x,y)$	$-Product(x) \mid -Product(y) \mid (x != y)$
$-Person(x) \mid -Product(y) \mid -Buys(x,y) \mid Adult(x)$	-Person(x) -Meat(y) -Buys(x,y) Non _ Vegetarian (x)
$-Adult(x) \mid -Kids(x)$	-Person(x) -Meat(y) Buys(x,y) Vegetarian (x)
-Kids (x) -Adults (x)	- Vegetarian(x) - Non _ Vegetarian(x)
-Person(x) Adult(x) Kids(x) $$	-Person(x) Vegetarian(x) Non _ Vegetarian(x)
-IsAcceptablePayment(x) $Cash(x)$ $Debit(x)$ $Credit(x)$	$-Product(x) \mid Liquid(x) \mid Solid(x)$
-Items(x) $Product(x)$	-Milk(x) Liquid(x) $^{\cdot}$
$-Person(x) \mid -Product(y) \mid -Returns(x,y) \mid$	$-Oil(x) \mid Liquid(x)$
Receipt $(f(x))$	-Water(x) Liquid(x) $^{\cdot}$
-Person(x) -Product(y) -Returns(x,y) $Has(x,f(x))$	-Energy $_$ Drink(x) Liquid(x).
-Person(x) -Product(y) -Returns(x,y) Money(f(x)):	-Liquid (x) -Solid (x) .
Money(f(x))	$-Solid(x) \mid -Liquid(x)$

	- Cheese(x) DairyProduct(x) $$
$-Solid(x) \mid -Pounds(y) \mid MeasuredIn(x,y)$	- Yogurt(x) DairyProduct(x)
-Liquid(x) -Ounces(y) MeasuredIn(x,y) · -Groceries(x) -Supermarket(y) IsAvailable(x,y) ·	-Product(x) -Milk(y) -Contains(x,y) DairyProduct(x) - DairyProduct(x) Milk(f(x))
-Meat(x) -Supermarket(y) IsAvailable(x,y)	- DairyProduct(x) Contains(x, f(x))
$-Meat(x) \mid Solid(x)$	-Butter(x) -Milk (y) Contains(x,y)
-Meat (x) Product (x) .	-Cheese(x) -Milk (y) Contains(x,y)
$-Supermarket(x) \mid -Product(y) \mid -Sells(x,y) \mid \\ -Made(y,x) \cdot$	-Yogurt(x) \mid -Milk (y) \mid Contains(x,y)
$-Red(x) \mid Color(x)$	$-Yogurt(x) \mid IsSweet(x)$
-Blue(x) $Color(x)$	-Butter(x) $IsSalted(x)$ $-IsSalted(x)$
$-Green(x) \mid Color(x)$	-Cheese(x) $IsSalted(x)$
-Black $(x) \mid Color(x)$	- $Milk(x) \mid IsSweet(x) \mid -IsSweet(x)$
-Yellow(x) Color(x) $$	-Product(x) \mid -Milk(y) \mid -Is(x,y) \mid White(x)
$-Pink(x) \mid Color(x)$	$-Product(x) \mid -Milk(y) \mid -Is(x,y) \mid Liquid(x)$
-White(x) $Color(x)$	$-Product(x) \mid -Butter(y) \mid -Is(x,y) \mid Yellow(x)$
-Orange(x) Color(x).	-Product(x) -Butter(y) -Is(x,y) Solid(x) $$
-Purple(x) $Color(x)$	-Product(x) -Yogurt(y) -Is(x,y) White(x)
$-Color(x) \mid -Color(y) \mid (x != y).$	$-Product(x) \mid -Yogurt(y) \mid -Is(x,y) \mid Solid(x)$
- Butter(x) DairyProduct(x)	-Product(x) -Cheese(y) -Is(x,y) Yellow(x) White(x)
- DairyProduct (x) Product(x)	$-Product(x) \mid -Cheese(y) \mid -Is(x,y) \mid Solid(x)$
- Milk (x) DairyProduct(x)	-DairyProduct(x) Groceries(x)

-Groceries(x) $Product(x)$	-Mushrooms (x) Vegetables(x)
-Vegetables(x) Frozen (x) Canned(x) Fresh (x)	-Lemons(x) Vegetables(x)
-Fruits(x) Frozen (x) Canned(x) Fresh (x)	-Spinach(x) Vegetables(x)
-Frozen(x) - Canned (x)	-Kale(x) Vegetables(x)
-Frozen(x) -Fresh(x)	-Fenugreek (x) Vegetables(x)
-Fresh (x) - Canned (x)	-Potatoes(x) $Oval(x)$ $Round(x)$
-Fresh (x) - Frozen (x)	-Potatoes(x) Red(x) Brown(x) Yellow(x) White(x)
-Canned (x) - Fresh (x) .	-Tomatoes(x) Round(x) $$
-Canned (x) - Frozen (x)	-Tomatoes(x) $Red(x)$ $Green(x)$
-Vegetables(x) Groceries(x)	-Jalapenos(x) Green(x) Red(x) Yellow(x) Orange(x)
-Fruits(x) Groceries(x)	-Bell _ peppers(x) Green(x) Red(x) Yellow(x) Orange(x)
-Potatoes (x) Vegetables (x)	
-Onions(x) $Vegetables(x)$	-Cabbages(x) $Green(x)$ $Purple(x)$
-Jalapenos(x) Vegetables(x)	-Green $_$ Onions(x) Onions(x)
-Bell _ pepper(x) Vegetables(x)	-Onions(x) White(x) Purple(x) $^{\cdot}$
-Cabbages(x) Vegetables(x)	-Broccoli (x) Green(x)
-Okra(x) Vegetables(x)	-Lemon(x) Yellow(x) Green(x).
-Green _ Onions(x) Vegetables(x)	-Lemon(x) Round(x) $$
	-Leafy $_$ Vegetables(x) $ $ Vegetables(x) $^{\cdot}$
-Ginger(x) Vegetables(x)	-Spinach (x) Leafy _ Vegetables(x).
-Tomatoes(x) Vegetables(x)	-Kale (x) Leafy _ Vegetables(x).
-Broccoli(x) Vegetables(x)	-Fenugreek (x) Leafy _ Vegetables(x)

-Spinach $(x) \mid Green(x)$	-Raspberry(x) Sweet(x).
-Kale $(x) \mid Green(x)$	-Grapes $(x) \mid Round(x)$
-Fenugreek $(x) \mid Green(x)$	-Grapes(x) $Red(x)$ $Green(x)$ $Black(x)$
-Apples (x) Fruits (x) .	-Grapes(x) $Sweet(x)$
-Oranges(x) Fruits(x)	-Oranges(x) Yellow(x) Orange(x) $$
-Grapes(x) Fruits(x) $$	-Oranges(x) $IsSweet(x) IsTangy(x)$
-Strawberries(x) Fruits(x)	-Mangoes(x) Yellow(x) Orange(x) $^{\cdot}$
-Blackberries(x) Fruits(x)	-Mangoes(x) $IsSweet(x)$ $IsTangy(x)$
-Blueberries(x) Fruits(x)	-Pear(x) Yellow(x) Orange(x)
-Raspberry(x) Fruits(x) $$	-Pear(x) $IsSweet(x)$ $IsTangy(x)$
-Kiwi (x) Fruits (x) .	-Banana(x) Yellow(x)
-Watermelon(x) Fruits(x)	-Banana(x) Sweet(x)
-Cherry(x) Fruits(x) $$	-Blackberries(x) Black(x)
-Banana(x) Fruits(x)	-Blackberries(x) IsSweet(x)
-Mangoes(x) Fruits(x) $$	-Blueberries(x) Black(x)
-Pear(x) Fruits(x)	-Blueberries(x) IsSweet(x)
-Apples(x) $\mid \text{Red}(x)$	-Kiwi (x) Green (x) .
-Apples(x) $Sweet(x) Sour(x)$	-Kiwi(x) IsTangy(x) $$
-Strawberries(x) $Red(x)$	-Cherry(x) $\mid \text{Red}(x)$
-Strawberries(x) Sweet(x)	-Cherry(x) $IsSweet(x)$
-Raspberry(x) $Red(x)$	-Blueberries(x) Berries(x)

-Raspberry(x) Berries(x)	-Meat(x) -Fruits(x)
-Strawberries(x) Berries(x) $^{\cdot}$	-Eggs(x) Brown(x) White(x).
-Berries(x) $IsSweet(x)$	$-Eggs(x) \mid Oval(x)$
-Watermelon $(x) \mid Green(x)$	$-Meat(x) \mid -Vegetables(x)$
-Watermelon $(x) \mid IsSweet(x)$	-Groceries(x) $Product(x)$
-Watermelon $(x) \mid Round(x)$	-Meat(x) Product(x)
-Fruits(x) -Vegetables(x)	-Green _ Cardamom(x) Spices(x)
-Fruits(x) -DairyProduct(x)	-Cloves(x) Spices(x)
-Vegetables(x) \mid -DairyProduct(x)	-Pepper(x) Spices(x) $^{\cdot}$
$-Eggs(x) \mid Meat(x)$	$-Salt(x) \mid Spices(x)$
-Chicken(x) Meat(x)	-Garlic(x) Spices(x) $^{\cdot}$
$-Beef(x) \mid Meat(x)$	-Italian _ Seasoning (x) Spices(x)
-Turkey Meat(x)	-Cumin _ Seeds (x) Spices(x).
-Sausage(x) \mid Meat(x)	-Mustard _ Seeds (x) Spices(x)
$-Pork(x) \mid Meat(x)$	-Paprika(x) Spices(x)
$-Bacon(x) \mid Meat(x)$	-Smoked _ Paprika(x) Spices(x)
$-Fish(x) \mid Meat(x)$	$-Basil(x) \mid Spices(x)$
$-Salmon(x) \mid Fish(x)$	-Oregano(x) Spices(x) $$
$-Tuna(x) \mid Fish(x)$	-Spices(x) Groceries(x)
-Meat(x) Frozen(x) Canned(x) Fresh(x)	$-Spices(x) \mid -DairyProduct(x)$
-Meat(x) -DairyProduct(x)	$-Spices(x) \mid -Fruits(x)$

-Spices(x) \mid -Vegetables(x)	-Chocolate(x) \mid -Sugar(y) \mid Contains(x,y)
-Spices(x) \mid - Meat(x).	-Energy $_$ Drink(x) Liquid(x).
-Product(x) -IsSweet(x) -Sugar(y)	-Energy $_$ Drink(x) IsSweet(x).
Contains(x,y)	$-IsSweet(x) \mid Tastes(x)$
-Product(x) \mid -IsSalty(x) \mid -Salt(y) \mid Contains(x,y)	$-IsSour(x) \mid Tastes(x)$
-Icecream(x) Frozen(x)	-IsTangy (x) Tastes (x)
-Popsicle(x) Frozen(x)	$-IsSalty(x) \mid Tastes(x)$
-Cereal (x) Others (x) .	-Tastes(x) -Tastes (y) $(x != y)$
-Icecream (x) Others (x) .	$-Round(x) \mid Shapes(x)$
-Popsicle(x)l Others(x)	$-Oval(x) \mid Shapes(x)$
$-Bread(x) \mid Others(x)$	-Elliptical(x) Shapes(x)
$-Rice(x) \mid Others(x)$	$-Shapes(x) \mid -Shapes(y) \mid (x != y)$
$-Oil(x) \mid Others(x)$	-Vegetables(x) EatenAfterCooking(x)
$-Sugar(x) \mid Others(x)$	-Vegetables(x) -EatenRaw(x)
-Chocolate(x) Others(x)	-Fruits(x) EatenRaw(x) EatenAfterCooking(x)
-Energy _ Drink (x) Others(x)	-DairyProduct(x) EatenRaw(x)
-Water(x) Others(x)	EatenAfterCooking(x)
-Others(x) Groceries(x).	-Meat(x) EatenAfterCooking(x)
-Cereal(x) \mid -Milk(y) \mid EatenWith(x,y)	-Meat (x) -EatenRaw (x)
$-Bread(x) \mid -Butter(y) \mid EatenWith(x,y)^{\cdot}$	-Cereal(x) EatenRaw(x) -EatenAfterCooking(x)
$-Sugar(x) \mid White(x) \mid Brown(x)$	$-Bread(x) \mid EatenRaw(x) \mid EatenAfterCooking(x) \cdot$
$-Sugar(x) \mid IsSweet(x)$	$-Rice(x) \mid -EatenRaw(x) \mid EatenAfterCooking(x) \cdot$

 $-Oil(x) \mid -EatenRaw(x) \mid EatenAfterCooking(x) \\ - Sugar(x) \mid EatenRaw(x) \mid EatenAfterCooking(x) \\ - Sugar(x) \mid EatenRaw(x) \mid EatenAfterCooking(x) \\ - Water(x) \mid EatenRaw(x) \mid EatenAfterCooking(x) \\ - Chocolate(x) \mid EatenRaw(x) \mid$