

CS 245 Fall 2021:

Useful Proofs/Exercises

1	Logic06	2
1.1	Theorems	2
1.2	Exercises	6
2	Logic14	9
2.1	Exercises	9

Chapter 1

Logic06

1.1 Theorems

Theorem (*Double Negation*)

$$A \vdash \neg\neg A$$

Proof. In the forwards direction:

- | | | |
|-----|--|-------------------|
| (1) | $\neg\neg A \vdash \neg\neg A$ | (Ref) |
| (2) | $\neg\neg A, \neg A \vdash \neg\neg A$ | (+, 1) |
| (3) | $\neg A \vdash \neg A$ | (+) |
| (4) | $\neg\neg A, \neg A \vdash \neg A$ | (+, 3) |
| (5) | $A \vdash \neg\neg A$ | (\neg -, 2, 4) |

In the backwards direction:

- | | | |
|-----|---------------------------|-------------------|
| (1) | $A, \neg A \vdash A$ | (\in) |
| (2) | $A, \neg A \vdash \neg A$ | (\in) |
| (3) | $A \vdash \neg\neg A$ | (\neg +, 1, 2) |

□

Theorem (*Inconsistency Rule*)

$$\neg A, A \vdash B$$

Proof.

- | | | |
|-----|-----------------------------------|-------------------|
| (1) | $A, \neg A, \neg B \vdash A$ | (\in) |
| (2) | $A, \neg A, \neg B \vdash \neg A$ | (\in) |
| (3) | $A, \neg A \vdash B$ | (\neg -, 1, 2) |

□

Theorem (*Disjunctive Syllogism*)

$$A \vee B, \neg A \vdash B$$

Proof.

- (1) $\neg A, B \vdash B$ (\in)
- (2) $\neg A, A \vdash B$ (Inconsistency Rule)
- (3) $\neg A, A \vee B \vdash B$ (\vee -, 1, 2)

□

Theorem (*Modus Tollens*)

$\neg B, A \rightarrow B \vdash \neg A$

Proof.

- (1) $\neg B, \neg A \vee B \vdash \neg A$ (Disjunctive Syllogism)
- (2) $\neg A \vee B \vdash A \rightarrow B$ (Implication)
- (3) $\neg B, A \rightarrow B \vdash \neg A$ (Repl., 1, 2)

□

Theorem (*Contrapositive*)

$A \rightarrow B \vdash \neg A \rightarrow \neg B$
--

Proof. In the forwards direction:

- (1) $A \rightarrow B, \neg B \vdash \neg A$ (Modus Tollens)
- (2) $A \rightarrow B \vdash \neg B \rightarrow \neg A$ (\rightarrow +, 1)

In the backwards direction:

- (1) $B \vee \neg A, \neg \neg A \vdash B$ (Disjunctive Syllogism)
- (2) $B \vee \neg A, A \vdash B$ (Repl., Double Negation, 1)
- (3) $\neg \neg B \vee \neg A, A \vdash B$ (Repl., Double Negation, 2)
- (4) $\neg B \rightarrow \neg A, A \vdash B$ (Repl., Implication, 3)
- (5) $\neg B \rightarrow \neg A \vdash A \rightarrow B$ (\rightarrow +, 4)

□

Theorem (*Affirmation*)

$A \vdash B$ if and only if $\emptyset \vdash A \rightarrow B$
--

Proof. In the forwards direction:

- (1) $\emptyset \vdash A \rightarrow B$ (Premise)
- (2) $A \vdash A \rightarrow B$ (+, 1)
- (3) $A \vdash A$ (Ref)
- (4) $A \vdash B$ (\rightarrow -, 3, 2)

The backwards direction is just (\rightarrow +) on the premise.

□

Theorem (*Flip-Flop*)

If $A \vdash B$, then $\neg B \vdash \neg A$.

Proof. Suppose $A \vdash B$. Then,

- | | | |
|-----|--|----------------------------|
| (1) | $A \vdash B$ | (Premise) |
| (2) | $\emptyset \vdash A \rightarrow B$ | (\rightarrow +, 1) |
| (3) | $\emptyset \vdash \neg B \rightarrow \neg A$ | (Repl., Contrapositive, 2) |
| (4) | $\neg B \vdash \neg A$ | (Affirmation, 3) |

as desired. □

Theorem (*De Morgan 1*)

$$\neg(A \vee B) \vdash \neg A \wedge \neg B$$

Proof. In the forwards direction:

- | | | |
|-----|--|---------------------|
| (1) | $\neg(A \vee B), A \vdash A$ | (\in) |
| (2) | $\neg(A \vee B), A \vdash A \vee B$ | (\vee +, 1) |
| (3) | $\neg(A \vee B), A \vdash \neg(A \vee B)$ | (\in) |
| (4) | $\neg(A \vee B) \vdash \neg A$ | (\neg +, 2, 3) |
| (5) | $\neg(A \vee B), B \vdash B$ | (\in) |
| (6) | $\neg(A \vee B), B \vdash A \vee B$ | (\vee +, 5) |
| (7) | $\neg(A \vee B), B \vdash \neg(A \vee B)$ | (\in) |
| (8) | $\neg(A \vee B) \vdash \neg B$ | (\neg +, 6, 7) |
| (9) | $\neg(A \vee B) \vdash \neg A \wedge \neg B$ | (\wedge +, 5, 8) |

Backwards:

- | | | |
|-----|--|-------------------------------|
| (1) | $\neg A \wedge \neg B, A \vee B \vdash A \vee B$ | (\in) |
| (2) | $\neg A \wedge \neg B, A \vee B \vdash \neg A \wedge \neg B$ | (\in) |
| (3) | $\neg A \wedge \neg B, A \vee B \vdash \neg A$ | (\wedge -, 2) |
| (4) | $\neg A \wedge \neg B, A \vee B \vdash \neg B$ | (\wedge -, 2) |
| (5) | $\neg A \wedge \neg B, A \vee B \vdash A$ | (Disjunctive Syllogism, 1, 4) |
| (6) | $\neg A \wedge \neg B \vdash \neg(A \vee B)$ | (\neg +, 3, 5) |

□

Theorem (*De Morgan 2*)

$$\neg(A \wedge B) \vdash \neg A \vee \neg B$$

Proof. Forwards:

- | | | |
|-----|--|-----------------------------|
| (1) | $\neg(A \wedge B), \neg(\neg A \vee \neg B) \vdash \neg(\neg A \vee \neg B)$ | (\in) |
| (2) | $\neg(A \wedge B), \neg(\neg A \vee \neg B) \vdash \neg\neg A \wedge \neg\neg B$ | (Tr., De Morgan 1, 1) |
| (3) | $\neg(A \wedge B), \neg(\neg A \vee \neg B) \vdash A \wedge B$ | (Repl., Double Negation, 2) |
| (4) | $\neg(A \wedge B), \neg(\neg A \vee \neg B) \vdash \neg(A \wedge B)$ | (\in) |
| (5) | $\neg(A \wedge B) \vdash \neg A \vee \neg B$ | (\neg -, 3, 4) |

Backwards:

- (1) $\neg A \vee \neg B, A \wedge B \vdash A \wedge B$ (\in)
- (2) $\neg A \vee \neg B, A \wedge B \vdash A$ ($\wedge -$, 1)
- (3) $\neg A \vee \neg B, A \wedge B \vdash B$ ($\wedge -$, 1)
- (4) $\neg A \vee \neg B, A \wedge B \vdash \neg \neg B$ (Double Negation, 3)
- (5) $\neg A \vee \neg B, A \wedge B \vdash \neg A \vee \neg B$ (\in)
- (6) $\neg A \vee \neg B, A \wedge B \vdash \neg A$ (Disjunctive Syllogism, 5, 4)
- (7) $\neg A \vee \neg B \vdash \neg(A \wedge B)$ ($\neg +$, 2, 6)

□

Theorem (*Implication*)

$A \rightarrow B \vdash \neg A \vee B$
--

Proof. Forwards:

- (1) $A \rightarrow B, \neg(\neg A \vee B) \vdash \neg(\neg A \vee B)$ (\in)
- (2) $A \rightarrow B, \neg(\neg A \vee B) \vdash \neg \neg A \wedge \neg B$ (Tr., De Morgan 1, 1)
- (3) $A \rightarrow B, \neg(\neg A \vee B) \vdash A \wedge \neg B$ (Repl., Double Negation, 2)
- (4) $A \rightarrow B, \neg(\neg A \vee B) \vdash A$ ($\wedge -$, 3)
- (5) $A \rightarrow B, \neg(\neg A \vee B) \vdash A \rightarrow B$ (\in)
- (6) $A \rightarrow B, \neg(\neg A \vee B) \vdash B$ ($\rightarrow -$, 5, 4)
- (7) $A \rightarrow B, \neg(\neg A \vee B) \vdash \neg B$ ($\wedge -$, 3)
- (8) $A \rightarrow B \vdash \neg A \vee B$ ($\neg -$, 6, 7)

Backwards:

- (1) $\neg A \vee B, A \vdash A$ (\in)
- (2) $\neg A \vee B, A \vdash \neg \neg A$ (Double Negation, 1)
- (3) $\neg A \vee B, A \vdash \neg A \vee B$ (\in)
- (4) $\neg A \vee B, A \vdash B$ (Disjunctive Syllogism, 3, 2)
- (5) $\neg A \vee B \vdash A \rightarrow B$ ($\rightarrow +$, 4)

□

Theorem (*Non-Contradiction*)

$\emptyset \vdash \neg(A \wedge \neg A)$
--

Proof.

- (1) $A \wedge \neg A \vdash A \wedge \neg A$ (Ref)
- (2) $A \wedge \neg A \vdash A$ (Tr., $\wedge -$, 1)
- (3) $A \wedge \neg A \vdash \neg A$ (Tr., $\wedge -$, 1)
- (4) $\emptyset \vdash \neg(A \wedge \neg A)$ ($\neg +$, 2, 3)

□

Theorem (*Excluded Middle*)

$\emptyset \vdash A \vee \neg A$

Proof. Apply Transitivity, De Morgan 2 to Non-Contradiction. \square

Theorem (*Rule of Cases*)

$$A \rightarrow B, \neg A \rightarrow B \vdash B$$

Proof.

- (1) $A \rightarrow B, \neg A \rightarrow B, \neg B \vdash A \rightarrow B$ (\in)
- (2) $A \rightarrow B, \neg A \rightarrow B, \neg B \vdash \neg A \rightarrow B$ (\in)
- (3) $A \rightarrow B, \neg A \rightarrow B, \neg B \vdash \neg B$ (\in)
- (4) $A \rightarrow B, \neg A \rightarrow B, \neg B \vdash \neg A$ (Modus Tollens, 1, 3)
- (5) $A \rightarrow B, \neg A \rightarrow B, \neg B \vdash \neg \neg A$ (Modus Tollens, 2, 3)
- (6) $A \rightarrow B, \neg A \rightarrow B \vdash B$ $(\neg -, 4, 5)$

\square

1.2 Exercises

Exercise 1.2.1. $A \rightarrow (B \vee C), A \rightarrow \neg B, C \rightarrow \neg D \vdash A \rightarrow \neg D$

Proof. Let $\Sigma = \{A \rightarrow (B \vee C), A \rightarrow \neg B, C \rightarrow \neg D\}$.

- (1) $\Sigma, A \vdash A$ (\in)
- (2) $\Sigma, A \vdash A \rightarrow (B \vee C)$ (\in)
- (3) $\Sigma, A \vdash B \vee C$ $(\rightarrow -, 2, 1)$
- (4) $\Sigma, A \vdash A \rightarrow \neg B$ (\in)
- (5) $\Sigma, A \vdash \neg B$ $(\rightarrow -, 4, 1)$
- (6) $\Sigma, A \vdash C$ (Disjunctive Syllogism, 3, 5)
- (7) $\Sigma, A \vdash C \rightarrow \neg D$ (\in)
- (8) $\Sigma, A \vdash \neg D$ $(\rightarrow -, 7, 6)$
- (9) $\Sigma \vdash A \rightarrow \neg D$ $(\rightarrow +, 8)$

\square

Exercise 1.2.2. $A \rightarrow (B \rightarrow C), C \rightarrow \neg D, \neg E \rightarrow D, A \wedge B \vdash E$

Proof. Let $\Sigma = \{A \rightarrow (B \rightarrow C), C \rightarrow \neg D, \neg E \rightarrow D, A \wedge B\}$.

- (1) $\Sigma \vdash A \wedge B$ (\in)
- (2) $\Sigma \vdash A$ $(\wedge -, 1)$
- (3) $\Sigma \vdash A \rightarrow (B \rightarrow C)$ (\in)
- (4) $\Sigma \vdash B \rightarrow C$ $(\rightarrow -, 3, 2)$
- (5) $\Sigma \vdash B$ $(\wedge -, 1)$
- (6) $\Sigma \vdash C$ $(\rightarrow -, 4, 5)$
- (7) $\Sigma \vdash C \rightarrow \neg D$ (\in)
- (8) $\Sigma \vdash \neg D$ $(\rightarrow -, 7, 6)$
- (9) $\Sigma \vdash \neg E \rightarrow D$ (\in)
- (10) $\Sigma \vdash E$ (Modus Tollens, 8, 9)

\square

Exercise 1.2.3. $\neg A \rightarrow C \vee D, B \rightarrow E \wedge F, E \rightarrow D, \neg D \vdash (A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow C$

Proof. Let $\Sigma = \neg A \rightarrow C \vee D, B \rightarrow E \wedge F, E \rightarrow D, \neg D$

- (1) $\Sigma, A \rightarrow B \vdash E \rightarrow D$ (\in)
- (2) $\Sigma, A \rightarrow B \vdash \neg D$ (\in)
- (3) $\Sigma, A \rightarrow B \vdash \neg E$ (Modus Tollens, 2, 1)
- (4) $\Sigma, A \rightarrow B \vdash \neg E \vee \neg F$ ($\vee +$, 3)
- (5) $\Sigma, A \rightarrow B \vdash \neg(E \wedge F)$ (Tr., De Morgan, 4)
- (6) $\Sigma, A \rightarrow B \vdash B \rightarrow E \wedge F$ (\in)
- (7) $\Sigma, A \rightarrow B \vdash \neg B$ (Modus Tollens, 5, 6)
- (8) $\Sigma, A \rightarrow B \vdash A \rightarrow B$ (\in)
- (9) $\Sigma, A \rightarrow B \vdash \neg A$ (Modus Tollens, 7, 8)
- (10) $\Sigma, A \rightarrow B \vdash \neg A \rightarrow C \vee D$ (\in)
- (11) $\Sigma, A \rightarrow B \vdash C \vee D$ ($\rightarrow -$, 10)
- (12) $\Sigma, A \rightarrow B \vdash C$ (Disjunctive Syllogism, 11, 2)
- (13) $\Sigma \vdash (A \rightarrow B) \rightarrow C$ ($\rightarrow +$, 12)

□

Exercise 1.2.4. $\neg(A \vee B) \rightarrow (C \rightarrow D), \neg A \wedge \neg D \vdash \neg B \rightarrow \neg C$

Proof. Let $\Sigma = \neg(A \vee B) \rightarrow (C \rightarrow D), \neg A \wedge \neg D$.

- (1) $\Sigma, \neg B \vdash \neg(A \vee B) \rightarrow (C \rightarrow D)$ (\in)
- (2) $\Sigma, \neg B \vdash (\neg A \wedge \neg B) \rightarrow (C \rightarrow D)$ (Repl., De Morgan, 1)
- (3) $\Sigma, \neg B \vdash \neg A \wedge \neg D$ (\in)
- (4) $\Sigma, \neg B \vdash \neg A$ ($\wedge -$, 3)
- (5) $\Sigma, \neg B \vdash \neg B$ (\in)
- (6) $\Sigma, \neg B \vdash \neg A \wedge \neg B$ ($\wedge +$, 4, 5)
- (7) $\Sigma, \neg B \vdash C \rightarrow D$ ($\rightarrow -$, 2, 6)
- (8) $\Sigma, \neg B \vdash \neg D$ ($\wedge -$, 3)
- (9) $\Sigma, \neg B \vdash \neg C$ (Modus Tollens, 8, 7)
- (10) $\Sigma \vdash \neg B \rightarrow \neg C$ ($\rightarrow +$, 9)

□

Exercise 1.2.5. $B \vee A, B \rightarrow A \vdash \neg(A \rightarrow \neg A)$

Proof. Let $\Sigma = \{B \vee A, B \rightarrow A\}$

- (1) $\Sigma, A \rightarrow \neg A, \neg B \vdash \neg B$ (\in)
- (2) $\Sigma, A \rightarrow \neg A, \neg B \vdash B \vee A$ (\in)
- (3) $\Sigma, A \rightarrow \neg A, \neg B \vdash A$ (Disjunctive Syllogism, 1, 2)
- (4) $\Sigma, A \rightarrow \neg A \vdash \neg B \rightarrow A$ ($\rightarrow +$, 3)
- (5) $\Sigma, A \rightarrow \neg A \vdash B \rightarrow A$ (\in)
- (6) $\Sigma, A \rightarrow \neg A \vdash A$ (Tr., Rule of Cases, 4, 5)
- (7) $\Sigma, A \rightarrow \neg A \vdash A \rightarrow \neg A$ (\in)
- (8) $\Sigma, A \rightarrow \neg A \vdash \neg A$ ($\rightarrow -$, 7)
- (9) $\Sigma \vdash \neg(A \rightarrow \neg A)$ ($\neg +$, 6, 8)

□

Chapter 2

Logic14

2.1 Exercises

Exercise 2.1.1. $\forall x \forall y P(x, y) \vdash \forall y \forall x P(x, y)$

Proof.

- | | | |
|-----|--|---------------------------------------|
| (1) | $\forall x \forall y P(x, y) \vdash \forall x \forall y P(x, y)$ | (Ref) |
| (2) | $\forall x \forall y P(x, y) \vdash \forall y P(a, y)$ | ($\forall -$, 1) |
| (3) | $\forall x \forall y P(x, y) \vdash P(a, b)$ | ($\forall -$, 2) |
| (4) | $\forall x \forall y P(x, y) \vdash \forall x P(x, b)$ | ($\forall +$, 3, a not elsewhere) |
| (5) | $\forall x \forall y P(x, y) \vdash \forall y P(x, y)$ | ($\forall +$, 4, b not elsewhere) |

□

Exercise 2.1.2. $\forall x P(x) \vdash \forall y P(y)$

Proof.

- | | | |
|-----|--|---------------------------------------|
| (1) | $\forall x P(x) \vdash \forall x P(x)$ | (Ref) |
| (2) | $\forall x P(x) \vdash P(a)$ | ($\forall -$, 1) |
| (3) | $\forall x P(x) \vdash \forall y P(y)$ | ($\forall +$, 2, a not elsewhere) |

□

Exercise 2.1.3. $\neg \exists x P(x) \vdash \forall x \neg P(x)$

Proof.

- | | | |
|-----|---|------------------------------------|
| (1) | $\Sigma, P(t) \vdash P(t)$ | (\in) |
| (2) | $\Sigma, P(t) \vdash \exists x P(x)$ | ($\exists +$, 1) |
| (3) | $\Sigma, P(t) \vdash \neg \exists x P(x)$ | (\in) |
| (4) | $\Sigma \vdash \neg P(t)$ | ($\neg +$, 2, 3) |
| (5) | $\Sigma \vdash \forall x \neg P(x)$ | ($\forall +$, t not elsewhere) |

□

Exercise 2.1.4. $\forall x \neg P(x) \vdash \neg \exists x P(x)$

Proof.

- (1) $\Sigma, \exists x P(x), P(u) \vdash P(u)$ (\in)
- (2) $\Sigma, \exists x P(x), P(u) \vdash \forall x \neg P(x)$ (\in)
- (3) $\Sigma, \exists x P(x), P(u) \vdash \neg P(u)$ (Tr., $\forall -$, 2)
- (4) $\Sigma, P(u) \vdash \neg \exists x P(x)$ ($\neg +$, 1, 3)
- (5) $\Sigma, \exists x P(x) \vdash \neg \exists x P(x)$ ($\exists -$, u not elsewhere)
- (6) $\Sigma, \exists x P(x) \vdash \exists x P(x)$ (\in)
- (7) $\Sigma \vdash \neg \exists x P(x)$ ($\neg +$, 5, 6)

□

Exercise 2.1.5. $\forall x (P(x) \rightarrow Q(x)), \exists x (R(x) \wedge \neg Q(x)), \forall x (R(x) \rightarrow P(x) \vee S(x)) \vdash \exists x (R(x) \vee S(x))$

Proof. Let $\Sigma = \{\forall x (P(x) \rightarrow Q(x)), \forall x (R(x) \rightarrow P(x) \vee S(x))\}$

- (1) $\Sigma, R(u) \wedge \neg Q(u) \vdash R(u) \wedge \neg Q(u)$ (\in)
- (2) $\Sigma, R(u) \wedge \neg Q(u) \vdash \neg Q(u)$ ($\wedge -$, 1)
- (3) $\Sigma, R(u) \wedge \neg Q(u) \vdash \forall x (P(x) \rightarrow Q(x))$ (\in)
- (4) $\Sigma, R(u) \wedge \neg Q(u) \vdash P(u) \rightarrow Q(u)$ ($\forall -$, 3)
- (5) $\Sigma, R(u) \wedge \neg Q(u) \vdash \neg P(u)$ (modus tollens, 2, 4)
- (6) $\Sigma, R(u) \wedge \neg Q(u) \vdash \forall x (R(x) \rightarrow P(x) \vee S(x))$ (\in)
- (7) $\Sigma, R(u) \wedge \neg Q(u) \vdash R(u) \rightarrow P(u) \vee S(u)$ ($\forall -$, 6)
- (8) $\Sigma, R(u) \wedge \neg Q(u) \vdash R(u)$ ($\wedge -$, 1)
- (9) $\Sigma, R(u) \wedge \neg Q(u) \vdash P(u) \vee S(u)$ ($\rightarrow -$, 8, 7)
- (10) $\Sigma, R(u) \wedge \neg Q(u) \vdash S(u)$ (Disjunctive Syllogism, 9, 5)
- (11) $\Sigma, R(u) \wedge \neg Q(u) \vdash R(u) \vee S(u)$ ($\vee +$, 8, 10)
- (12) $\Sigma, R(u) \wedge \neg Q(u) \vdash \exists x (R(x) \vee S(x))$ ($\exists +$, 11)
- (13) $\Sigma, \exists x (R(x) \wedge \neg Q(x)) \vdash \exists x (R(x) \vee S(x))$ ($\exists -$, 12, u not elsewhere)

□