Sorting: Homework 2

- 1. Generalize the SELECT algorithm to deal also with repeated values and prove that it still belongs to O(n).
- 2. Download the latest version of the code from

https://github.com/albertocasagrande/AD sorting

and

- Implement the SELECT algorithm of Ex. 1.
- Implement a variant of the QUICK SORT algorithm using above-mentioned SELECT to identify the best pivot for partitioning.
- Draw a curve to represent the relation between the input size and the execution-time of the two variants of QUICK SORT (i.e, those of Ex. 2 and Ex. 1 of this file) and discuss about their complexities.
- 3. (Ex. 9.3-1 in [1]) In the algorithm SELECT, the input elements are divided into chunks of 5. Will the algorithm work in linear time if they are divided into chunks of 7? What about chunks of 3?
- 4. (Ex. 9.3-5 in [1] Suppose that you have a "black-box" worst-case linear-time subroutine to get the position in A of the value that would be in position n/2 if A was sorted. Give a simple, linear-time algorithm that solves the selection problem for an arbitrary position i.
- 5. Solve the following recursive equations by using both the recursion tree and the substitution method:

$$\circ T_1(n) = 2 * T_1(n/2) + O(n)$$

Using the **recursion tree**, we have that, choosing cn as representative for O(n)

$$egin{aligned} T_1(n) &= 2*T_1(n/2) + O(n) \ &\leq 2*T_1(n/2) + cn \ &\leq 2*(2*T_1(n/4) + cn/2) + cn \ &= 4*T_1(n/4) + 2cn \ &\leq 4*(2*T_1(n/8) + cn/4) + 2cn \ &= 8*T_1(n/8) + 3cn \ &\leq \ldots \ &\leq 2^{\log_2 n}T_1(0) + \log_2 n*cn \ &= n*0 + cn\log_2 n \in O(n\log n) \end{aligned}$$

or directly

$$T_1(n) = 2*T_1(n/2) + O(n) \leq \sum_{i=0}^{\log_2 n} 2^i c \frac{n}{2^i} = \sum_{i=0}^{\log_2 n} cn = cn \sum_{i=0}^{\log_2 n} 1 = cn \log_2 n \in O(n \log n)$$

Using the **substitution method**, we guess that $T_1(n) \in O(n \log n)$. We select a representative for $O(n \log n)$ and O(n), e.g. $cn \log n$ and c'n. We assume that $\forall m < n, \ T_1(m) \le cm \log m$. If this is the case,

$$egin{aligned} T_1(n) &= 2*T_1(n/2) + c'n \ &\leq 2*cn/2\log(n/2) + c'n \ &= cn(\log n - \log 2) + c'n \ &= cn\log n - cn\log 2 + c'n \ &= cn\log n - cn + c'n \end{aligned}$$

if $c'n-cn \leq 0 \iff c'n \leq cn \iff c \geq c'$ then $T_1(n) \leq cn \log n$. Thus we have proved by induction that $\forall n \in \mathbb{N}, \ T_1(n) \leq cn \log n$ for a proper c. So $T_1(n) \in O(n \log n)$.

$$\circ T_2(n) = T_2(\lceil n/2 \rceil) + T_2(\lceil n/2 \rceil) + \Theta(1)$$

Using the **recursion tree**, we have that, choosing c as representative for O(1):

$$\begin{split} T_2(n) &= T_2(\lceil n/2 \rceil) + T_2(\lfloor n/2 \rfloor) + \Theta(1) \\ &= T_2(\lceil n/2 \rceil) + T_2(\lfloor n/2 \rfloor) + c \\ &= (T_2(\lceil \lceil n/2 \rceil/2 \rceil) + T_2(\lfloor \lceil n/2 \rceil/2 \rfloor) + c) + (T_2(\lceil \lfloor n/2 \rfloor/2 \rceil) + T_2(\lfloor \lfloor n/2 \rfloor/2 \rfloor) + c) + c \end{split}$$

if n is even then we can simply remove the floor and ceiling functions, if n is odd instead, so if n=m+1 with m even, we have that

so it follows that

$$\begin{split} T_2(n) &= T_2(\lceil n/4 \rceil) + T_2(\lceil n/4 \rceil) + T_2(\lceil n/4 \rceil) + T_2(\lfloor n/4 \rfloor) + 3c \\ &= 3T_2(\lceil n/4 \rceil) + T_2(\lfloor n/4 \rfloor) + 3c \\ &= 3(T_2(\lceil \lceil n/4 \rceil/2 \rceil) + T_2(\lfloor \lceil n/4 \rceil/2 \rfloor) + c) + (T_2(\lceil \lfloor \lceil n/4 \rfloor/2 \rceil) + T_2(\lfloor \lfloor \lceil n/4 \rfloor/2 \rfloor) + c) + 3c \\ &= 3(T_2(\lceil n/8 \rceil) + T_2(\lceil n/8 \rceil) + c) + (T_2(\lceil n/8 \rceil) + T_2(\lfloor \lceil n/8 \rfloor) + c) + 3c \\ &= 3T_2(\lceil n/8 \rceil) + 3T_2(\lceil n/8 \rceil) + 3c + T_2(\lceil n/8 \rceil) + T_2(\lfloor \lceil n/8 \rceil) + c + 3c \\ &= 7T_2(\lceil n/8 \rceil) + T_2(\lfloor \lceil n/8 \rceil) + 7c \\ &= \dots \\ &= (2^{\log_2 n} - 1)T(0) + T(0) + c(2^{\log_2 n} - 1) \\ &= 0 + 0 + c(n-1) \in O(n) \end{split}$$

Or alternatively

We have that the tree is complete up to the length of the shortest branch (which is the rightmost) \rightarrow it is the shortest branch, while the left one is the longest.

For sure there exist a power of 2 between n and 2n, and between $\frac{n}{2}$ and n, so the length of the recursion tree is $\leq \log_2(2n)$ and $\geq \log_2(\frac{n}{2})$.

$$T_2(n) \geq \sum_{i=0}^{\log_2(\frac{n}{2})} c2^i = c \sum_{i=0}^{\log_2(\frac{n}{2})} 2^i = c \cdot \frac{2^{\log_2(\frac{n}{2})+1}-1}{2-1} = c \cdot \left(2\left(\frac{n}{2}\right)-1\right) = c(n-1) = cn-c \in \Omega(n)$$

$$T_2(n) \leq \sum_{i=0}^{\log_2(2n)} c'2^i = c' \sum_{i=0}^{\log_2(2n)} 2^i = c' \cdot \frac{2^{\log_2(2n)+1}-1}{2-1} = c' \cdot (2(2n)-1) = c'(4n-1) = 4c'n-c' \in O(n)$$

So we have that $T_2(n) \in \Theta(n)$.

Using the **substitution method**, we guess that $T_2 \in O(n)$ and we select the function cn as representative, and we select c' as representative of $\Theta(1)$. Inductive assumption: we assume that $\forall m < n, \ T_2(m) \leq cm$. We want to prove that $\forall n, \ T_2(n) \leq cn$. If this is the case we have that

$$egin{aligned} T_2(n) &= T_2(\lceil n/2
ceil) + T_2(\lfloor n/2
ceil) + \Theta(1) \ &\leq T_2(\lceil n/2
ceil) + T_2(\lfloor n/2
ceil) + c' \ &\leq c \lceil n/2
ceil + c \lfloor n/2
ceil + c' \ &\leq c (\lceil n/2
ceil + \lfloor n/2
ceil) + c' \ &\leq cn + c' \end{aligned}$$

But this is **not** what we wanted to prove, we cannot conclude anything! This doesn't prove $T_2 \in O(n)$ because $cn+c' \nleq cn$: but we are not able to prove it for a term of lower order. The problem is that we selected the wrong representative for O(n), let us choose $cn-d \in O(n)$. Inductive assumption: we assume that $\forall m < n, \ T_2(m) \leq cm-d$. We want to prove that $\forall n, \ T_2(n) \leq cn-d$.

$$egin{aligned} T_2(n) &= T_2(\lceil n/2
ceil) + T_2(\lfloor n/2
ceil) + \Theta(1) \ &\leq T_2(\lceil n/2
ceil) + T_2(\lfloor n/2
ceil) + c' \ &\leq c \lceil n/2
ceil - d + c \lfloor n/2
ceil - d + c' \ &\leq c (\lceil n/2
ceil + \lfloor n/2
ceil) - 2d + c' \ &\leq cn - 2d + c' \end{aligned}$$

If $c'-d \le 0 \iff c' \le d$, then $T_2(n) \le cn-d$. Thus we have proved by induction that $\forall n \in \mathbb{N}, T_2(n) \le cn-d$ for proper c and d. So $T_2(n) \in O(n)$.

Now we want to prove that $T_2(n)\in\Omega(n)$. We select the representative $cn\in\Omega(n)$ and the representative $c'\in\Theta(1)$. Inductive assumption: we assume that

 $\forall m < n, \ T_2(m) \geq cm$. We want to prove that $\forall n, \ T_2(n) \geq cn$.

$$egin{aligned} T_2(n) &= T_2(\lceil n/2
ceil) + T_2(\lfloor n/2
ceil) + \Theta(1) \ &\geq T_2(\lceil n/2
ceil) + T_2(\lfloor n/2
ceil) + c' \ &\geq c \lceil n/2
ceil + c \lfloor n/2
ceil + c' \ &\geq c (\lceil n/2
ceil + \lfloor n/2
ceil) + c' \ &\geq cn + c' \ &\geq cn \end{aligned}$$

Thus we have that $T_2(n) \geq cn$, so we have proved by induction that $\forall n \in \mathbb{N}$, $T_2(n) \geq cn$ for a proper c. Then $T_2(n) \in \Omega(n)$. Therefore we have proved that $T_2(n) \in \Theta(n)$.

By using substitution method, you can prove that $T_2(n) \in O(n^2)$. This is not wrong, because $O(n) \subseteq O(n^2)$, however this is a curse complexity bound.

$$\circ T(n) = T\left(\frac{1}{5}n\right) + T\left(\frac{3}{4}n\right) + \Theta(n)$$

This equation is weird because it is totally unbalanced! All the branches are different in length! Let's call $\alpha=\frac{1}{5}$ and $\beta=\frac{3}{4}$. On the i-th level all the nodes contains $\alpha^j\beta^{i-j}$; the number of nodes on the i-th level having $\alpha^j\beta^{i-j}$ elements to deal with is the number of possible way in which we can select j left moves over i total moves: so $\binom{i}{j}$ moves in total. Thus at each level i we have

$$\sum_{j=0}^{i} \binom{i}{j} \alpha^{j} \beta^{i-j} n$$

So this is the total number of elements we need to deal with at the i-th level of our recursion tree. We have that

$$\sum_{i=0}^i inom{i}{j} lpha^j eta^{i-j} n = (lpha + eta)^i \cdot n$$

To do an over approximation of the complexity, let's suppose that the tree has infinite length. So

$$T(n) \leq \sum_{i=0}^{\infty} (\alpha+\beta)^i \cdot n = \sum_{i=0}^{\infty} \left(\frac{1}{5} + \frac{3}{4}\right)^i \cdot n = \sum_{i=0}^{\infty} \left(\frac{19}{20}\right)^i \cdot n.$$

Because of the convergence of geometric series $\left(\frac{19}{20}<1\right)T(n)\leq \frac{1}{1-\frac{19}{20}}n=20n$, so $T(n)\in O(n)$.

Can we lower bound it? Of course yes, since just the first call of our recursive call costs $\Theta(n)$, so $T(n) \in \Omega(n)$. Thus $T(n) \in \Theta(n)$.

So just solving this problem we proved a new theorem:

Theorem: Let α and β be two natural numbers. If $\alpha+\beta<1$, then $T(n)=T(\alpha n)+T(\beta n)+\Theta(n)$ belongs to $\Theta(n)$.

$$\circ T_3(n) = 3 * T_3(n/2) + O(n)$$

Using the **recursion tree**, we have that, choosing cn as representative for O(n):

$$\begin{array}{l} T_3(n) = 3*T_3(n/2) + O(n) \\ \leq 3*T_3(n/2) + cn \\ \leq 3*(3*T_3(n/4) + cn/2) + cn \\ = 9*T_3(n/4) + 3/2cn + cn \\ = 9*T_3(n/4) + 3/2cn + cn \\ \leq 9*(3*T_3(n/8) + cn/4) + 3/2cn + cn \\ = 27*T_3(n/8) + 9/4cn + 3/2cn + cn \\ \leq 27*(3*T_3(n/16) + cn/8) + 9/4cn + 3/2cn + cn \\ = 81*T_3(n/16) + 27/8cn + 9/4cn + 3/2cn + cn \\ \leq \cdots \\ \leq \cdots \\ \leq 3^{\log_2 n} \cdot T_3(0) + \sum_{i=0}^{\log_2 n} \left(\frac{3}{2}\right)^i \cdot cn \\ = 0 + cn \cdot \frac{(3/2)^{(\log_2 n) + 1} - 1}{3/2 - 1} = cn \cdot \frac{\frac{3^{(\log_2 n) + 1} - 2^{(\log_2 n) + 1}}{2^{(\log_2 n) + 1}}}{\frac{3 - 2}{2}} \\ = 2cn \cdot \frac{3 \cdot 3^{\log_2 3 \cdot \log_3 n} - 2n}{2n} = c(3 \cdot (3^{\log_3 n})^{\log_2 3} - 2n) \\ = c(3 \cdot n^{\log_2 3} - 2n) = 3cn^{\log_2 3} - 2cn \in O(n^{\log_2 3}) \end{array}$$

because since $\log_b n = \log_b a \cdot \log_a n$ we have that $\log_2 n = \log_2 3 \cdot \log_3 n$. Or directly

$$egin{aligned} T_3(n) &= 3*T_3(n/2) + O(n) \leq \sum_{i=0}^{\log_2 n} 3^i c rac{n}{2^i} = cn \sum_{i=0}^{\log_2 n} \left(rac{3}{2}
ight)^i = cn \cdot rac{(3/2)^{(\log_2 n) + 1} - 1}{3/2 - 1} \ &= cn \cdot rac{rac{3^{(\log_2 n) + 1} - 2^{(\log_2 n) + 1}}{2^{(\log_2 n) + 1}}}{rac{3 - 2}{2}} = 2cn \cdot rac{3 \cdot 3^{\log_2 3 \cdot \log_3 n} - 2n}{2n} = c(3 \cdot (3^{\log_3 n})^{\log_2 3} - 2n) \ &= c(3 \cdot n^{\log_2 3} - 2n) = 3cn^{\log_2 3} - 2cn \in O(n^{\log_2 3}) \end{aligned}$$

Using the **substitution method**, we guess that $T_3 \in O(n^{\log_2 3})$ and we select the function $cn^{\log_2 3} - dn$ as representative, and we select c'n as representative of O(n). Inductive assumption: we assume that $\forall m < n, \ T_3(m) \leq cm^{\log_2 3} - dm$. We want to prove that $\forall n, \ T_3(n) \leq cn^{\log_2 3} - dn$. If this is the case we have that

$$egin{aligned} T_3(n) &= 3*T_3(n/2) + O(n) \ &\leq 3\left(c\left(rac{n}{2}
ight)^{\log_2 3} - drac{n}{2}
ight) + c'n \ &= 3crac{n^{\log_2 3}}{2^{\log_2 3}} - n\left(rac{3}{2}d - c'
ight) \ &= 3crac{n^{\log_2 3}}{3} - n\left(rac{3d - 2c'}{2}
ight) \ &= cn^{\log_2 3} - rac{3d - 2c'}{2}n \end{aligned}$$

if $\frac{3d-2c'}{2} \leq d \Longleftrightarrow 3d-2c' \leq 2d \Longleftrightarrow d \leq 2c'$, then $T_3(n) \leq cn^{\log_2 3} - dn$. Thus we have proved by induction that $\forall n \in \mathbb{N}, \ T_3(n) \leq cn^{\log_2 3} - dn$ for a proper c and d. So $T_3(n) \in O(n^{\log_2 3})$.

$$\circ \ T_4(n) = 7 * T_4(n/2) + \Theta(n^2)$$

Using the **recursion tree**, we have that, choosing cn^2 as representative for $\Theta(n^2)$:

$$\begin{split} &= 7*T_4(n/2) + cn^2 \\ &= 7*\left(7*T_4\left(\frac{n}{4}\right) + c\left(\frac{n}{2}\right)^2\right) + cn^2 \\ &= 49*T_4\left(\frac{n}{4}\right) + 7c\left(\frac{n}{2}\right)^2 + cn^2 \\ &= 49*\left(7*T_4\left(\frac{n}{8}\right) + c\left(\frac{n}{4}\right)^2\right) + 7c\left(\frac{n}{2}\right)^2 + cn^2 \\ &= 343*T_4\left(\frac{n}{8}\right) + 49c\left(\frac{n}{4}\right)^2 + 7c\left(\frac{n}{2}\right)^2 + cn^2 \\ &= \dots \\ &= 7^{\log_2 n}T_4(0) + \sum_{i=0}^{\log_2 n} 7^i \cdot c\left(\frac{n}{2^i}\right)^2 \\ &= 0 + cn^2 \sum_{i=0}^{\log_2 n} \left(\frac{7}{4}\right)^i = cn^2 \cdot \frac{(7/4)^{(\log_2 n) + 1} - 1}{7/4 - 1} \\ &= cn^2 \cdot \frac{7^{(\log_2 n) + 1} - 4^{(\log_2 n) + 1}}{\frac{7 - 4}{4}} = \frac{4}{3}cn^2 \cdot \frac{7 \cdot 7^{\log_2 7 \cdot \log_7 n} - 4 \cdot 4^{\log_2 n}}{4 \cdot 4^{\log_2 n}} \\ &= \frac{4}{3}cn^2 \cdot \frac{7 \cdot (7^{(\log_7 n)})^{\log_2 7} - 4 \cdot (2^{(\log_2 n)})^2}{4 \cdot (2^{(\log_2 n)})^2} = \frac{4}{3}cn^2 \cdot \frac{7 \cdot n^{\log_2 7} - 4n^2}{4n^2} \\ &= \frac{7}{3}cn^{\log_2 7} - \frac{4}{3}cn^2 \in O(n^{\log_2 7}) \end{split}$$

Or directly

$$\begin{split} T_4(n) &= 7*T_4(n/2) + \Theta(n^2) \leq \sum_{i=0}^{\log_2 n} 7^i c \left(\frac{n}{2^i}\right)^2 = cn^2 \sum_{i=0}^{\log_2 n} \left(\frac{7}{4}\right)^i = cn^2 \cdot \frac{(7/4)^{(\log_2 n) + 1} - 1}{7/4 - 1} \\ &= cn^2 \cdot \frac{\frac{7^{(\log_2 n) + 1} - 4^{(\log_2 n) + 1}}{4^{(\log_2 n) + 1}}}{\frac{7 - 4}{4}} = \frac{4}{3} cn^2 \cdot \frac{7 \cdot 7^{\log_2 7 \cdot \log_7 n} - 4 \cdot 4^{\log_2 n}}{4 \cdot 4^{\log_2 n}} \\ &= \frac{4}{3} cn^2 \cdot \frac{7 \cdot (7^{\log_7 n})^{\log_2 7} - 4 \cdot (2^{\log_2 n})^2}{4 \cdot (2^{\log_2 n})^2} = \frac{4}{3} cn^2 \cdot \frac{7 \cdot n^{\log_2 7} - 4n^2}{4n^2} \\ &= \frac{7}{3} cn^{\log_2 7} - \frac{4}{3} cn^2 \in O(n^{\log_2 7}) \end{split}$$

Besides, we have that

$$egin{align*} T_4(n) &= 7*T_4(n/2) + \Theta(n^2) \geq \sum_{i=0}^{\log_2 n} 7^i c igg(rac{n}{2^i}igg)^2 = c n^2 \sum_{i=0}^{\log_2 n} igg(rac{7}{4}igg)^i = c n^2 \cdot rac{(7/4)^{(\log_2 n) + 1} - 1}{7/4 - 1} \ &= c n^2 \cdot rac{7^{(\log_2 n) + 1} - 4^{(\log_2 n) + 1}}{rac{7-4}{4}} = rac{4}{3} c n^2 \cdot rac{7 \cdot 7^{\log_2 7 \cdot \log_7 n} - 4 \cdot 4^{\log_2 n}}{4 \cdot 4^{\log_2 n}} \ &= rac{4}{3} c n^2 \cdot rac{7 \cdot (7^{\log_7 n})^{\log_2 7} - 4 \cdot (2^{\log_2 n})^2}{4 \cdot (2^{\log_2 n})^2} = rac{4}{3} c n^2 \cdot rac{7 \cdot n^{\log_2 7} - 4 n^2}{4 n^2} \ &= rac{7}{3} c n^{\log_2 7} - rac{4}{3} c n^2 \in \Omega(n^{\log_2 7}) \end{split}$$

So we have that $T_4(n) \in \Theta(n^{\log_2 7}).$

 $T_4(n) = 7 * T_4(n/2) + \Theta(n^2)$

Using the **substitution method**, we guess that $T_4 \in O(n^{\log_2 7})$ and we select the function $cn^{\log_2 7} - dn^2$ as representative, and we select $c'n^2$ as representative of $\Theta(n^2)$. Inductive assumption: we assume that $\forall m < n, \ T_3(m) \leq cm^{\log_2 7} - dm^2$. We want to prove that $\forall n, \ T_4(n) \leq cn^{\log_2 7} - dn^2$. If this is the case we have that

$$egin{aligned} T_4(n) &= 7*T_4(n/2) + \Theta(n^2) \ &\leq 7 \left(c \left(rac{n}{2}
ight)^{\log_2 7} - d \left(rac{n}{2}
ight)^2
ight) + c' n^2 \ &= 7c rac{n^{\log_2 7}}{2^{\log_2 7}} - 7d rac{n^2}{4} + c' n^2 \ &= 7c rac{n^{\log_2 7}}{7} - n^2 \left(rac{7}{4}d - c'
ight) \ &= c n^{\log_2 7} - rac{7d - 4c'}{4} n^2 \end{aligned}$$

if $\frac{7d-4c'}{4} \leq d \Longleftrightarrow 7d-4c' \leq 4d \Longleftrightarrow 3d \leq 4c' \Longleftrightarrow d \leq \frac{4}{3}c'$, then $T_4(n) \leq cn^{\log_2 7} - dn^2$. Thus we have proved by induction that $\forall n \in \mathbb{N}, \ T_3(n) \leq cn^{\log_2 7} - dn^2$ for a proper c and d. So $T_3(n) \in O(n^{\log_2 7})$.

Now we want to prove that $T_4(n)\in\Omega(n^{\log_27})$. We select the representative $cn^{\log_27}\in\Omega(n^{\log_27})$ and the representative $c'n^2\in\Theta(n^2)$. Inductive assumption: we assume that $\forall m< n,\ T_4(m)\geq cm^{\log_27}$. We want to prove that $\forall n,\ T_4(n)\geq cn^{\log_27}$.

$$egin{aligned} T_4(n) &= 7*T_4(n/2) + \Theta(n^2) \ &\geq 7c \Big(rac{n}{2}\Big)^{\log_2 7} + c' n^2 \ &= 7c rac{n^{\log_2 7}}{2^{\log_2 7}} + c' n^2 \ &= 7c rac{n^{\log_2 7}}{7} + c' n^2 \ &= cn^{\log_2 7} + c' n^2 \ &\geq cn^{\log_2 7} \end{aligned}$$

Thus we have that $T_4(n) \geq c n^{\log_2 7}$, so we have proved by induction that $\forall n \in \mathbb{N}, \ T_3(n) \geq c n^{\log_2 7} - d n^2$ for a proper c. Then $T_4(n) \in \Omega(n^{\log_2 7})$. Therefore we have proved that $T_4(n) \in \Theta(n^{\log_2 7})$.

References

[1] T.H. Cormen, C.E. Leiserson, R.L. Rivest, and C. Stein. *Introduction to Algorithms*. The MIT Press. MIT Press, 2009.