Description of the Needham Schroeder public key protocol and its attack

The Needham Schroeder public key protocol P_{NSPK} can be described as follows.

$$A \rightarrow B: \{\langle A, N_a \rangle\}_{\mathsf{pub}(B)}$$

 $B \rightarrow A: \{\langle N_a, N_b \rangle\}_{\mathsf{pub}(A)}$
 $A \rightarrow B: \{N_b\}_{\mathsf{pub}(B)}$

Initial knowledge: We suppose that agents A and B initially know public keys pub(C) of agent C, for any agent C.

Data generated during the protocol: N_a is a nonce generated by A. N_b is a nonce generated by B.

Protocol description: Alice starts the protocol by sending her identity A together with a freshly generated random number N_a . This message is encrypted using an asymmetric encryption algorithm with B's public key (denoted pub(B)). We suppose that only agent Bob (whose identity is B) knows the secret key corresponding to pub(B).

Next Bob receives the message $\{A, N_a\}_{\mathsf{pub}(B)}$ sent by Alice. Using his private key, Bob decrypts the message. He sends the received nonce N_a together with a freshly generated nonce N_b encrypted with A's public key $(\mathsf{pub}(A))$ to Alice.

Finally Alice receives the message $\{N_a, N_b\}_{\mathsf{pub}(A)}$. She decrypts the message and checks that the nonce N_A corresponds to the nonce previously generated and sent to Bob. She sends the nonce N_b to Bob encrypted with Bob's public key. Upon reception of this message Bob decrypts it and checks that the nonce corresponds to the one previously generated.

Security properties:

- Authentification: When Bob receives the last message $(\{N_b\}_{pub(B)})$, this message was indeed sent by Alice.
- Confidentiality: Both Alice and Bob are the only to know N_b .

Cost of the protocol:

$$\begin{array}{lcl} f(P_{NSPK}) & = & f(\{\langle A, N_a \rangle\}_{\mathsf{pub}(B)}) + f(\{\langle N_a, N_b \rangle\}_{\mathsf{pub}(A)}) + f(\{N_b\}_{\mathsf{pub}(B)}) \\ & = & 54 + 54 + 3 \\ & = & 111 \end{array}$$

(Note that the NSPK protocol was not designed with the cost function in mind.)

Attack on the Needham-Schroeder protocol

17 years after the publication of the protocol Gavin Lowe discovered an attack that may occur in the presence of an active adversary. The attack has been coined man-in-the-middle attack. It is illustrated in figure 1. Agent A starts a session with a dishonest agent C. Agent C uses this message to fake being A to B. B responds to A. As B's message contains the nonce N_a , A accepts the message thinking it originates from C. Therefore A sends to C the nonce N_b encrypted with C's public key. C can recover the nonce N_b and end the protocol with B who thinks having executed the protocol with B.

$$\begin{array}{c} \mathbf{A} \xrightarrow{\{A,N_a\}_{\mathsf{pub}(C)}} \mathbf{C} \\ & \downarrow \\ & \mathbf{C}(\mathbf{A}) \xrightarrow{\{A,N_a\}_{\mathsf{pub}(B)}} \mathbf{B} \\ & \mathbf{C}(\mathbf{A}) \xleftarrow{\{N_a,N_b\}_{\mathsf{pub}(A)}} \mathbf{B} \\ \mathbf{A} \xleftarrow{\{N_a,N_b\}_{\mathsf{pub}(A)}} \mathbf{C} \\ \mathbf{A} \xrightarrow{\{N_b\}_{\mathsf{pub}(C)}} \mathbf{C} \\ & \mathbf{C}(\mathbf{A}) \xrightarrow{\{N_b\}_{\mathsf{pub}(B)}} \mathbf{B} \end{array}$$

Figure 1: Lowe's attack on the Needham Schroeder public key protocol.