

A review of R neural network packages with NNbenchmark: ease of use and accuracy – working title

by Salsabila Mahdi, Akshaj Verma, John C. Nash, Christophe Dutang, Patrice Kiener

Abstract Possible format: 1) the overall purpose of the study and the research problem(s) you investigated; 2) the basic design of the study; 3) major findings or trends found as a result of your analysis; and, 4) a brief summary of your interpretations and conclusions.

Introduction

R Statistical Software, as any opensource platform, has relied on its contributors to keep it up to date with the latest developments. One of the many is neural networks. Neural networks are a class of models, based on the brain's own connections system, in the growing field of machine learning. Before, they were a theory with not much practical implementation, partly because of how computationally demanding their algorithms are. A neural network algorithm involves complicated calculations for each gradual "step" into the direction of the optimal solution, namely, determining the gradient of the cost function recursively. Parameters are adjusted accordingly for each iteration from this information. Manually computing partial gradients from complex nonlinear models is taxing. With the help of modern technology and its high-level code, implementing a neural network is relatively simple.

However, the utilization of computers should not only be done effectively but also efficiently. Instead of calculating first-order derivatives, and moving incrementally forward by a predetermined learning rate, it is better to adjust the size of each step according to its curvature. The second-order derivative provides this information. Numerical methods can take this further. The Hessian, a matrix of the second derivatives, is approximated instead of perfectly derived. Such algorithms are known as Quasi-Newton algorithms. Broyden-Fletcher-Goldfarb-Shanno (BFGS) is a well-known example of an algorithm from this class. We believed that these second-order algorithms would perform better than first-order algorithms in terms of finding the optimal solution.

Regardless of our belief, it is crucial to conduct a thorough examination to assess the quality of these training algorithms in R. There is much code, but barely any comparison. In particular, packages that provide neural network of the perceptron type (one input layer, one normalized layer, one hidden layer with a nonlinear activation function that is usually $\tanh()$, one normalized layer, one output layer) for regression purpose (i.e. $NN(X_1, \dots, X_n) = E[Y]$) were the focus of this research. At the very least, this research will serve as a framework for future research on neural network benchmarking.

Methodology

Our research process was largely divided into the following 3 phases.

Phase 1 - Preparation

Datasets => NEED TO BE FINISHED

All the datasets used are nonlinear. Linear data sets are more simple and can even be solved with OLS (Ordinary Least Squares) regression. This is why we believe to truly set apart the ability of neural networks we needed to go beyond linear regression. Varying difficulties between data sets helped to classify further package's algorithms accuracy. One site was used for 3 of the multivariate data sets. Sonja Surjanovic and Derek Bingham of Simon Fraser University created this resourceful website to evaluate the design and analysis of computer models. Links to each dataset and their level of difficulty:

- <http://www.sfu.ca/~ssurjano/fried.html> (Friedman - average)
- <http://www.sfu.ca/~ssurjano/detpep10curv.html> (Dette - medium)
- <http://www.sfu.ca/~ssurjano/ishigami.html> (Ishigami - high)

The other multivariate dataset, Ref153, was taken from ... 3 of the univariate datasets were taken from NIST at: https://www.itl.nist.gov/div898/strd/nls/nls_main.shtml. Gauss1 and Gauss2 have a low level of difficulty to solve. Gauss3 is average. Dmod1, Dmod2 are from ... Dreyfus1 is a pure neural network which has no error. This can make it difficult for algorithms that assume an error

exists. Dreyfus2 is Dreyfus1 with errors. NeuroOne from ...
Wood ...

Packages

Searching through the thousands of packages title or the package description one by one would have taken a long time. With [RWsearch](#) (Kiener, 2020) we were able to automate the process. All packages that have “neural network” as a keyword in the package title or in the package description were included.

(to use when needed in text, testing how long references will be) 1 **AMORE** (Limas et al., 2020), 2 **ANN2** (Lammers, 2020), 3 **appnn** (Família et al., 2015), 4 **autoencoder** (Dubossarsky and Tyshetskiy, 2015), 5 **automl** (Boulangé, 2020), 6 **BNN** (Jia, 2018), 7 **brnn** (Rodriguez and Gianola, 2020), 8 **Buddle** (Kim, 2020), 9 **CaDENCE** (Cannon, 2017a), 10 **cld2** (Ooms, 2018), 11 **cld3** (Ooms, 2020), 12 **condmixt** (Carreau, 2020), 13 **DamiaNN** (Siniakowicz, 2016), 14 **deep** (Mayer, 2019), 15 **deepdive** (Balakrishnan, 2020), 16 **deepnet** (Rong, 2014), 17 **deepNN** (Taylor, 2020), 18 **DNMF** (Jia and Zhang, 2015), 19 **elmNNRcpp** (Mouselimis and Gosso, 2018), 20 **ELMR** (Petrozziello, 2015), 21 **EnsembleBase** (Mahani and Shara-biani, 2016), 22 **evclass** (Denoeux, 2017), 23 **gamls.add** (Stasinopoulos et al., 2020), 24 **gcForest** (Jing, 2018), 25 **GMDH** (Dag and Yozgatligil, 2016), 26 **GMDH2** (Dag et al., 2019), 27 **GMDHreg** (Tilve, 2019), 28 **gnn** (Hofert and Prasad, 2020), 29 **grnn** (Chasset, 2013a), 30 **h2o** (LeDell et al., 2020), 31 **hybridEnsemble** (Ballings et al., 2015), 32 **isingLenzMC** (Suzen, 2016), 33 **keras** (Allaire and Chollet, 2019), 34 **kerasR** (Arnold, 2017), 35 **leabRa** (Titz, 2017), 36 **learNN** (Quast, 2015), 37 **LilRhino** (Barton, 2019), 38 **min-pack.lm** (Elzhov et al., 2016), 39 **MachineShop** (Smith, 2020), 40 **monmlp** (Cannon, 2017b), 41 **neural** (Nagy, 2014), 42 **neuralnet** (Fritsch et al., 2019), 43 **NeuralNetTools** (Beck, 2018), 44 **NeuralSens** (Portela González et al., 2020), 45 **NlinTS** (Hmamouche, 2020), 46 **nlsr** (Nash and Murdoch, 2019), 47 **nnet** (Ripley, 2020), 48 **nnetpredint** (Ding, 2015), 49 **nnfor** (Kourentzes, 2019), 50 **nntrf** (Aler and Valls, 2020), 51 **nnli2bRcpp** (Nikolaidis, 2020), 52 **onnx** (Tang and ONNX Authors, 2018), 53 **OptimClassifier** (Perez-Martin et al., 2020), 54 **OSTSC** (Dixon et al., 2017), 55 **pn** (Chasset, 2013b), 56 **polyreg** (?), 57 **predictoR** (with contributions from Diego Jimenez A. and D., 2019), 58 **qrnn** (Cannon, 2019), 59 **QuantumOps** (?), 60 **quarrint** (Barthelemy et al., 2016), 61 **radiant.model** (Nijs, 2020), 62 **rasclass** (Wiesmann and Quinn, 2016), 63 **rcane** (Suresh et al., 2018), 64 **regressor** (Rodriguez R., 2019), 65 **rminer** (Cortez, 2020), 66 **rnn** (Quast and Fichou, 2019), 67 **RSNNS** (Bergmeir, 2019), 68 **ruta** (Charte et al., 2019), 69 **simpleNeural** (Dernoncourt, 2020), 70 **snnR** (Wang et al., 2017), 71 **softmaxreg** (Ding, 2016), 72 **Sojourn.Data** (Hibbing and Lyden, 2019), 73 **spnn** (Ebrahimi, 2020), 74 **TeachNet** (Steinbuss, 2018), 75 **tensorflow** (Allaire and Tang, 2019), 76 **tfestimators** (Allaire et al., 2018), 77 **trackdem** (Bruijning et al., 2020), 78 **TrafficBDE** (Chatzopoulou et al., 2018), 79 **tsensembler** (?), 80 **validann** (Humphrey, 2017), 81 **zFactor** (Reyes, 2019).

Phase 2 - Exploration of each package and development of template

Exploration

However, not all packages that had the keyword were fit for the scope of our research. Some didn't have any functions to make neural networks. They were simply meta-packages. Others were not regression neural networks of the perceptron type or were only made for specific purposes. We learned this through reading documentation and trying out example code. **Template => TO REVISE AFTER 2020 CODE**

As we inspected the packages, we developed a template for benchmarking. This template's structure is as follows:

- (1) Set up of environment - loading packages, setting directory, options;
- (2) Summary of datasets;
- (3) A loop over datasets which contained (a) setting parameters for a specific dataset (b) selecting benchmark options (c) the training of a neural network with a package's tuned functions (d) calculation of RMSE and MAE (e) plot each training over one initial graph, then plot the best result (f) adding results to the appropriate *.csv file and (g) clearing up environment for next loop; and
- (4) Clearing up the environment for the next package. (5) It is optional to print warnings.

This process was made easier with tools from the NNbenchmark package. (FROM LAST YEAR, HOPEFULLY WE CAN SAY OTHERWISE THIS YEAR:) It is not on CRAN yet and can instead be found at <https://github.com/pkR-pkR/NNbenchmark>. Our templates for each package can be found in the companion repository, <https://github.com/pkR-pkR/NNbenchmarkTemplates>.

Phase 3 - Collection of and analysis of results

Collection After the templates were finished, the packages were looped on all datasets. Results were collected in the directory of the templates repository. **Analysis** To rank the how well a package

converged and its speed, we developed the following method: 1. The results datasets are loaded into the R environment as one large list. The dataset names, package:algorithm names and all 10 run numbers, durations, and RMSE are extracted from that list 2. For the duration score (DUR), the duration is averaged by dataset. 3 criteria for the RMSE score by dataset are calculated: a. The minimum value of RMSE for each package:algorithm as a measure of their best performance b. The median value of RMSE for each package:algorithm as a measure of their average performance, without the influence of outliers c. The spread of the RMSE values for each package which is measured by the difference between the median and the minimum RMSE (d51) 3. Then, the ranks are calculated for every dataset and the results are merged into one wide dataframe. a. The duration rank only depends on the duration. b. For minimum RMSE values, ties are decided by duration mean, then the RMSE median c. For median RMSE values, ties are decided by the RMSE minimum, then the duration mean d. The d51 rank only depends on itself 4. A global score for all datasets is found by a sum of the ranks (of duration, minimum RMSE, median RMSE, d51 RMSE) of each package:algorithm for each dataset 5. The final table is the result of ranking by the global minimum RMSE scores for each package:algorithm

To rank how easy or not a package was to use (TO BE DISCUSSED FURTHER): - Functionality (util): scaling, input, output, trace - Documentation (docs): examples, structure/functions, vignettes

Results

Tables (NOTE: FINAL MEASURE FOR CONVERGENCE - RMSE RANKS? OR A COMBINATION OF OTHER MEASURES? As in Christophe's recent email: L1 MAE(), L2 RMSE(), Linfinity (WAE))

(ALSO: THE FOLLOWING IS SIMPLY ALPHABETIC LIST FOR ALL TESTED, I WILL DIVIDE THE TABLE INTO 4: 2nd ORDER always recommended, 1st ORDER recommended, 1st ORDER not recommended, untested packages)

Table X: Ratings

No	Name (package::algorithm)	RMSE	DUR	UTIL	DOCS	OVERALL
1	AMORE::train.ADAPTgd AMORE::train.ADAPTgdwm AMORE::train.BATCHgd AMORE::train.BATCHgdwm					
2	automl					
3	ANN2::neuralnetwork.sgd ANN2::neuralnetwork.adam ANN2::neuralnetwork.rmsprop					
4	brnn					
5	CaDENCE					
6	deepnet::gradientdescent					
7	elmNNRcpp					
8	ELMR					
9	h2o::deeplearning					
10	keras					
11	kerasformula					
12	kerasR					
13	minpack.lm::nlsLM					
14	MachineShop::fit.NNetModel()					
15	monmlp::fit.BFGS monmlp::fit.Nelder-Mead					
16	neural::mlptrain					
17	neuralnet::backprop neuralnet::rprop+ neuralnet::rprop- neuralnet::sag neuralnet::slr					
18	nlsr::nlxb					
19	nnet::nnet.BFGS					
20	qrnn::qrnn.fit					
21	radiant.model::radiant.model					
22	rcane::rlm					
23	rminer::fit					
24	RSNNS::BackpropBatch RSNNS::BackpropChunk RSNNS::BackpropMomentum RSNNS::BackpropWeightDecay RSNNS::Quickprop RSNNS::Rprop RSNNS::SCG RSNNS::Std-Backpropagation					
25	ruta					
26	simpleNeural::sN.MLPtrain					
27	snnR					
28	softmaxreg					
29	tensorflow::AdadelataOptmizer tensorflow::AdagradOptmizer tensorflow::AdamOptmizer tensorflow::FtrlOptmizer tensorflow::GradientDescent tensorflow::MomentumOptmizer					
30	tfestimators					
31	tsensembler					
32	validann::Nelder-Mead validann::BFGS validann::CG validann::L-BFGS-B validann::SANN validann::Brent					

(THE FOLLOWING IS JUST AN ALPHABETICALLY ORDERED LIST OF CURRENTLY UNTESTED PACKAGES)

Table 2: Review of Ommitted Packages

No	Name (package)	Category	Comment
1	appnn	-	
2	autoencoder	-	
3	BNN	-	
4	Buddle	-	
5	cld2	-	
6	cld3	-	
7	condmixt	-	
8	DALEX2	-	
9	DamiaNN	-	
10	DChaos	-	
11	deepNN	-	
12	DNMF	-	
13	EnsembleBase	-	
14	evclass	-	
15	gamlss.add	-	
16	gcForest	-	
17	GMDH	-	
18	GMDH2	-	
19	GMDHreg	-	
20	grnn	-	
21	hybridEnsemble	-	
22	isingLenzMC	-	
23	leabRa	-	
24	learNN	-	
25	LilRhino	-	
26	NeuralNetTools	-	tools for neural networks
27	NeuralSens	-	tools for neural networks
28	NlinTS	NA	Time Series
29	nnetpredint	-	confidence intervals for NN
30	nnfor	NA	Times Series, uses neuralnet
31	onnx	-	provides an open source format
32	OptimClassifier	NA	choose classifier parameters, nnet
33	OSTSC	-	solving oversampling classification
34	pnn	NA	Probabilistic
35	polyreg	-	polyregression ALT to NN
36	predictoR	NA	shiny interface, neuralnet
37	QuantumOps	NA	classifies MNIST, Schuld (2018)
38	quarrint	NA	specified classifier for quarry data
39	rasclass	NA	classifier for raster images, nnet?
40	regressoR	NA	a manual rich version of predictoR
41	rnn	NA	Recurrent
42	Sojourn.Data	NA	sojourn Accelerometer methods, nnet?
43	spnn	NA	classifier, probabilistic
44	TeachNet	NA	classifier, selfbuilt, slow
45	trackdem	NA	classifier for particle tracking
46	TrafficBDE	NA	specific reg, predicting traffic
47	zFactor	NA	'compressibility' of hydrocarbon gas

Discussion and Recommendations

A. Recommended: 2nd order algorithms Out of all the algorithms, these second algorithms generally performed better in terms of convergence despite being set to a much lower number of iterations, 200, than the first-order algorithms. Moreover, they performed better in terms of speed. The best in this class were [minpack.lm](#) and [nlslr](#), tied at rank number 1. The Levenberg-Marquardt (LM) algorithm used is fast and converges well. `stats::nls()` is used. However, these packages require a handwritten formula that may not be ideal for certain situations. A more popular package for neural networks is `nnet`. This might be because it is part of base R. It implements the BFGS algorithm with `stats::optim()`.

Ranked directly after are some packages that depend on `nnet` or use the same functions. They differ in how well they decide initial parameters. `rminer` (rank 4), `MachineShop` (rank 5), and `radiant.model` (rank 7) use `nnet`. Note, `radiant.model` has its iterations set to 10000, which originally made it slower

yet converge better. We used a modified version of the package. At rank 6 is validann's BFGS algorithm using `stats::optim()`. Its use of `optim`'s L-BFGS-B ranked at number 9 with CaDENCE's use of `optim`'s BFGS. **monmlp**, from the same author as CaDENCE (Alex Cannon), uses the package **optimx**'s BFGS (Nash and Varadhan, 2020).

Alex Cannon also implemented a quantile regression neural network in `qrnn` with `stats::nlm()`. It requires more iterations and is not as fast compared to the other second-order algorithms. However, it is a valuable implementation of quantile regression. Last but not least is **brnn**'s Gauss Newton algorithm which ranks at number 8. `brnn` is easy to use but does not converge as well due to a hidden constraint: a missing first parameter. Furthermore, `brnn`'s algorithm minimizes the sum of squared errors and a penalty on parameters instead of just the sum of squared errors. This may prevent parameters to get highly correlated, especially with an almost degenerated Jacobian matrix.

B. Recommended: 1st order algorithms `validann` `optim` CG RSNNS SCG h2o back-propagation RSNNS Rprop ANN2 adam CaDENCE Rprop -SLOW deepnet BP AMORE ADAPTgdwm AMORE ADAPTgd ANN2 sgd automl trainwgrad ANN2 rmsprop RSNNS BackpropChunk RSNNS BackWeightDecay RSNNS Std_Backpropagation RSNNS BackpropMomentum automl trainwpso validann `optim` NelderMead `snnR` Semi Smooth Newton RSNNS BackpropBatch validann `optim` SANN `monmlp` `optimx` Nelder Mead

C. Not recommended: 1st order algorithms <- DISCUSS CUTOFF By package `ELMR`, `elmNNRcpp` - fast ELM algorithms. Unfortunately, can't finetune, does not converge well. `neuralnet`: a large ammount of iterations, slow, erratic failures `tensorflow`: NOT EASY TO USE, subsequently `keras`, `tfestimators`, `ruta` ... user needs to understand the language However, advanced users might be able to highly specify a neural network to their needs (customization?)

By algorithm: `neuralnet rprop+` `neuralnet rprop-` `neuralnet slr` - once ranked well with 100000 iterations AMORE BATCHgd CaDENCE pso psoptim - need to reconfigure? `elmNNRcpp` - fast, no iterations RSNNS Quickprop (?) AMORE BATCHgdwm `tensorflow` MomentumOptimizer `tensorflow` AdamOptimizer `ELMR` - fast, no iterations `tensorflow` GradientDescentOptimizer `keras` rmsprop `keras` adagrad `keras` sgd `keras` adadelta `tensorflow` AdagradOptimizer `keras` adam `tensorflow` FtrlOptimizer `neuralnetwork` sag `tensorflow` AdadeltaOptimizer `neuralnet` backprop - note, might not actually reflect standings, somehow from template to template the learning rate disappeared. Will fix this in future runs

D. Untested => TO DO - LIST

Conclusion => TO DO AFTER 2020 CODE

Future work

As the algorithms for neural networks continue to grow, there will always be more to validate. For current algorithms in R, our research should be extended to encompass more types of neural networks and their data formats (classifier neural networks, recurrent neural networks, and so on). Different rating schemes and different parameters for package functions can also be tried out.

Acknowledgements

This work was possible due to the support of the Google Summer of Code initiative for R during years 2019 and 2020. Students Salsabila Madhi (2019 and 2020) and Akshaj Verma (2019) are grateful to Google for the financial support.

Bibliography

- R. Aler and J. Valls. *nntrf: Supervised Data Transformation by Means of Neural Network Hidden Layers*, 2020. URL <https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=nntrf>. R package version 0.1.0. [p2]
- J. Allaire and F. Chollet. *keras: R Interface to 'Keras'*, 2019. URL <https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=keras>. R package version 2.2.5.0. [p2]
- J. Allaire and Y. Tang. *tensorflow: R Interface to 'TensorFlow'*, 2019. URL <https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=tensorflow>. R package version 2.0.0. [p2]
- J. Allaire, Y. Tang, K. Ushey, and K. Kuo. *tfestimators: Interface to 'TensorFlow' Estimators*, 2018. URL <https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=tfestimators>. R package version 1.9.1. [p2]

- T. Arnold. *kerasR: R Interface to the Keras Deep Learning Library*, 2017. URL <https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=kerasR>. R package version 0.6.1. [p2]
- R. Balakrishnan. *deepdive: Deep Learning for General Purpose*, 2020. URL <https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=deepdive>. R package version 1.0.1. [p2]
- M. Ballings, D. Vercamer, and D. Van den Poel. *hybridEnsemble: Build, Deploy and Evaluate Hybrid Ensembles*, 2015. URL <https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=hybridEnsemble>. R package version 1.0.0. [p2]
- J. Barthelemy, T. Carletti, L. Collier, V. Hallet, M. Moriame, and A. Sartenaer. *quarrint: Interaction Prediction Between Groundwater and Quarry Extension Using Discrete Choice Models and Artificial Neural Networks*, 2016. URL <https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=quarrint>. R package version 1.0.0. [p2]
- T. Barton. *LilRhino: For Implementation of Feed Reduction, Learning Examples, NLP and Code Management*, 2019. URL <https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=LilRhino>. R package version 1.2.0. [p2]
- M. W. Beck. *NeuralNetTools: Visualization and Analysis Tools for Neural Networks*, 2018. URL <https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=NeuralNetTools>. R package version 1.5.2. [p2]
- C. Bergmeir. *RSNNS: Neural Networks using the Stuttgart Neural Network Simulator (SNNS)*, 2019. URL <https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=RSNNS>. R package version 0.4-12. [p2]
- A. Boulangé. *automl: Deep Learning with Metaheuristic*, 2020. URL <https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=automl>. R package version 1.3.2. [p2]
- M. Bruijning, M. D. Visser, C. A. Hallmann, and E. Jongejans. *trackdem: Particle Tracking and Demography*, 2020. URL <https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=trackdem>. R package version 0.5.2. [p2]
- A. J. Cannon. *CaDENCE: Conditional Density Estimation Network Construction and Evaluation*, 2017a. URL <https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=CaDENCE>. R package version 1.2.5. [p2]
- A. J. Cannon. *monmlp: Multi-Layer Perceptron Neural Network with Optional Monotonicity Constraints*, 2017b. URL <https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=monmlp>. R package version 1.1.5. [p2]
- A. J. Cannon. *qrnn: Quantile Regression Neural Network*, 2019. URL <https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=qrnn>. R package version 2.0.5. [p2]
- J. Carreau. *condmixt: Conditional Density Estimation with Neural Network Conditional Mixtures*, 2020. URL <https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=condmixt>. R package version 1.1. [p2]
- D. Charte, F. Charte, and F. Herrera. *ruta: Implementation of Unsupervised Neural Architectures*, 2019. URL <https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=ruta>. R package version 1.1.0. [p2]
- P.-O. Chasset. *grnn: General regression neural network*, 2013a. URL <https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=grnn>. R package version 0.1.0. [p2]
- P.-O. Chasset. *pnn: Probabilistic neural networks*, 2013b. URL <https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=pnn>. R package version 1.0.1. [p2]
- A. Chatzopoulou, K. Koupidis, and C. Bratsas. *TrafficBDE: Traffic Status Prediction in Urban Places using Neural Network Models*, 2018. URL <https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=TrafficBDE>. R package version 0.1.0. [p2]
- P. Cortez. *rminer: Data Mining Classification and Regression Methods*, 2020. URL <https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=rminer>. R package version 1.4.5. [p2]
- O. Dag and C. Yozgatligil. *GMDH: Short Term Forecasting via GMDH-Type Neural Network Algorithms*, 2016. URL <https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=GMDH>. R package version 1.6. [p2]
- O. Dag, E. Karabulut, and R. Alpar. *GMDH2: Binary Classification via GMDH-Type Neural Network Algorithms*, 2019. URL <https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=GMDH2>. R package version 1.5. [p2]
- T. Denoeux. *evclass: Evidential Distance-Based Classification*, 2017. URL <https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=evclass>. R package version 1.1.1. [p2]
- D. Dernoncourt. *simpleNeural: An Easy to Use Multilayer Perceptron*, 2020. URL <https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=simpleNeural>. R package version 0.1.3. [p2]

- X. Ding. *nnetpredint: Prediction Intervals of Multi-Layer Neural Networks*, 2015. URL <https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=nnetpredint>. R package version 1.2. [p2]
- X. Ding. *softmaxreg: Training Multi-Layer Neural Network for Softmax Regression and Classification*, 2016. URL <https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=softmaxreg>. R package version 1.2. [p2]
- M. Dixon, D. Klabjan, and L. Wei. *OSTSC: Over Sampling for Time Series Classification*, 2017. URL <https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=OSTSC>. R package version 0.0.1. [p2]
- E. Dubossarsky and Y. Tyshetskiy. *autoencoder: Sparse Autoencoder for Automatic Learning of Representative Features from Unlabeled Data*, 2015. URL <https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=autoencoder>. R package version 1.1. [p2]
- R. Ebrahimi. *spnn: Scale Invariant Probabilistic Neural Networks*, 2020. URL <https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=spnn>. R package version 1.2.1. [p2]
- T. V. Elzhov, K. M. Mullen, A.-N. Spiess, and B. Bolker. *minpack.lm: R Interface to the Levenberg-Marquardt Nonlinear Least-Squares Algorithm Found in MINPACK, Plus Support for Bounds*, 2016. URL <https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=minpack.lm>. R package version 1.2-1. [p2]
- C. Família, S. R. Dennison, A. Quintas, and D. A. Phoenix. *appnn: Amyloid Propensity Prediction Neural Network*, 2015. URL <https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=appnn>. R package version 1.0-0. [p2]
- S. Fritsch, F. Guenther, and M. N. Wright. *neuralnet: Training of Neural Networks*, 2019. URL <https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=neuralnet>. R package version 1.44.2. [p2]
- P. R. Hibbing and K. Lyden. *Sojourn.Data: Supporting Objects for Sojourn Accelerometer Methods*, 2019. URL <https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=Sojourn.Data>. R package version 0.1.0. [p2]
- Y. Hmamouche. *NlinTS: Models for Non Linear Causality Detection in Time Series*, 2020. URL <https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=NlinTS>. R package version 1.3.8. [p2]
- M. Hofert and A. Prasad. *gmn: Generative Neural Networks*, 2020. URL <https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=gmn>. R package version 0.0-2. [p2]
- G. B. Humphrey. *validann: Validation Tools for Artificial Neural Networks*, 2017. URL <https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=validann>. R package version 1.2.1. [p2]
- B. Jia. *BNN: Bayesian Neural Network for High-Dimensional Nonlinear Variable Selection*, 2018. URL <https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=BNN>. R package version 1.0.2. [p2]
- Z. Jia and X. Zhang. *DNMF: Discriminant Non-Negative Matrix Factorization*, 2015. URL <https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=DNMF>. R package version 1.3. [p2]
- X. Jing. *gcForest: Deep Forest Model*, 2018. URL <https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=gcForest>. R package version 0.2.7. [p2]
- P. Kiener. *RWsearch: Lazy Search in R Packages, Task Views, CRAN, the Web. All-in-One Download*, 2020. URL <https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=RWsearch>. R package version 4.8.0. [p2]
- J. Kim. *Buddle: A Deep Learning for Statistical Classification and Regression Analysis with Random Effects*, 2020. URL <https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=Buddle>. R package version 2.0.1. [p2]
- N. Kourentzes. *nnfor: Time Series Forecasting with Neural Networks*, 2019. URL <https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=nnfor>. R package version 0.9.6. [p2]
- B. Lammers. *ANN2: Artificial Neural Networks for Anomaly Detection*, 2020. URL <https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=ANN2>. R package version 2.3.3. [p2]
- E. LeDell, N. Gill, S. Aiello, A. Fu, A. Candel, C. Click, T. Kraljevic, T. Nykodym, P. Aboyoun, M. Kurka, and M. Malohlava. *h2o: R Interface for the 'H2O' Scalable Machine Learning Platform*, 2020. URL <https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=h2o>. R package version 3.30.0.1. [p2]
- M. C. Limas, J. B. O. Mere, A. G. Marcos, F. J. M. de Pison Ascacibar, A. V. P. Espinoza, F. A. Elias, and J. M. P. Ramos. *AMORE: Artificial Neural Network Training and Simulating*, 2020. URL <https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=AMORE>. R package version 0.2-16. [p2]
- A. S. Mahani and M. T. Sharabiani. *EnsembleBase: Extensible Package for Parallel, Batch Training of Base Learners for Ensemble Modeling*, 2016. URL <https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=EnsembleBase>. R package version 1.0.2. [p2]

- B. L. Mayer. *deep: A Neural Networks Framework*, 2019. URL <https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=deep>. R package version 0.1.0. [p2]
- L. Mouselimis and A. Gosso. *elmNNRcpp: The Extreme Learning Machine Algorithm*, 2018. URL <https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=elmNNRcpp>. R package version 1.0.1. [p2]
- A. Nagy. *neural: Neural Networks*, 2014. URL <https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=neural>. R package version 1.4.2.2. [p2]
- J. C. Nash and D. Murdoch. *nlsr: Functions for Nonlinear Least Squares Solutions*, 2019. URL <https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=nlsr>. R package version 2019.9.7. [p2]
- J. C. Nash and R. Varadhan. *optimx: Expanded Replacement and Extension of the 'optim' Function*, 2020. URL <https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=optimx>. R package version 2020-4.2. [p6]
- V. Nijs. *radiant.model: Model Menu for Radiant: Business Analytics using R and Shiny*, 2020. URL <https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=radiant.model>. R package version 1.3.10. [p2]
- V. Nikolaidis. *nnlib2Rcpp: A Collection of Neural Networks*, 2020. URL <https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=nnlib2Rcpp>. R package version 0.1.2. [p2]
- J. Ooms. *cld2: Google's Compact Language Detector 2*, 2018. URL <https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=cld2>. R package version 1.2. [p2]
- J. Ooms. *cld3: Google's Compact Language Detector 3*, 2020. URL <https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=cld3>. R package version 1.3. [p2]
- A. Perez-Martin, A. Perez-Torregrosa, M. Vaca-Lamata, and A. J. Verdu-Jover. *OptimClassifier: Create the Best Train for Classification Models*, 2020. URL <https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=OptimClassifier>. R package version 0.1.5. [p2]
- A. Petrozziello. *ELMR: Extreme Machine Learning (ELM)*, 2015. URL <https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=ELMR>. R package version 1.0. [p2]
- J. Portela González, A. Muñoz San Roque, and J. Pizarroso Gonzalo. *NeuralSens: Sensitivity Analysis of Neural Networks*, 2020. URL <https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=NeuralSens>. R package version 0.2.0. [p2]
- B. Quast. *learNN: Examples of Neural Networks*, 2015. URL <https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=learNN>. R package version 0.2.0. [p2]
- B. Quast and D. Fichou. *rnn: Recurrent Neural Network*, 2019. URL <https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=rnn>. R package version 0.9.8. [p2]
- A. R. Reyes. *zFactor: Calculate the Compressibility Factor 'z' for Hydrocarbon Gases*, 2019. URL <https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=zFactor>. R package version 0.1.9. [p2]
- B. Ripley. *nnet: Feed-Forward Neural Networks and Multinomial Log-Linear Models*, 2020. URL <https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=nnet>. R package version 7.3-14. [p2]
- P. P. Rodriguez and D. Gianola. *brnn: Bayesian Regularization for Feed-Forward Neural Networks*, 2020. URL <https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=brnn>. R package version 0.8. [p2]
- O. Rodriguez R. *regressoR: Regression Data Analysis System*, 2019. URL <https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=regressoR>. R package version 1.1.8. [p2]
- X. Rong. *deepnet: deep learning toolkit in R*, 2014. URL <https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=deepnet>. R package version 0.2. [p2]
- D. Siniakowicz. *DamiaNN: Neural Network Numerai*, 2016. URL <https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=DamiaNN>. R package version 1.0.0. [p2]
- B. J. Smith. *MachineShop: Machine Learning Models and Tools*, 2020. URL <https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=MachineShop>. R package version 2.4.0. [p2]
- M. Stasinopoulos, B. Rigby, V. Voudouris, and D. Kiose. *gamlss.add: Extra Additive Terms for Generalized Additive Models for Location Scale and Shape*, 2020. URL <https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=gamlss.add>. R package version 5.1-6. [p2]
- G. Steinbuss. *TeachNet: Fits Neural Networks to Learn About Backpropagation*, 2018. URL <https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=TeachNet>. R package version 0.7.1. [p2]

- A. Suresh, S. Acharekar, H. Chao, and S. Y. Biradar. *rcane: Different Numeric Optimizations to Estimate Parameter Coefficients*, 2018. URL <https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=rcane>. R package version 1.0. [p2]
- M. Suzen. *isingLenzMC: Monte Carlo for Classical Ising Model*, 2016. URL <https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=isingLenzMC>. R package version 0.2.5. [p2]
- Y. Tang and ONNX Authors. *onnx: R Interface to 'ONNX'*, 2018. URL <https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=onnx>. R package version 0.0.2. [p2]
- B. Taylor. *deepNN: Deep Learning*, 2020. URL <https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=deepNN>. R package version 1.0. [p2]
- M. V. Tilve. *GMDHreg: Regression using GMDH Algorithms*, 2019. URL <https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=GMDHreg>. R package version 0.2.0. [p2]
- J. Titz. *leabRa: The Artificial Neural Networks Algorithm Leabra*, 2017. URL <https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=leabRa>. R package version 0.1.0. [p2]
- Y. Wang, P. Lin, Z. Chen, Z. Bao, and G. J. M. Rosa. *snnR: Sparse Neural Networks for Genomic Selection in Animal Breeding*, 2017. URL <https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=snnR>. R package version 1.0. [p2]
- D. Wiesmann and D. Quinn. *rasclass: Supervised Raster Image Classification*, 2016. URL <https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=rasclass>. R package version 0.2.2. [p2]
- O. R. R. with contributions from Diego Jimenez A. and A. N. D. *predictoR: Predictive Data Analysis System*, 2019. URL <https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=predictoR>. R package version 1.1.0. [p2]

- The dreamed NN package: Recommendation to package authors
- Conclusion
- Acknowledgments

For the acknowledgements, maybe : « » + later some acknowledgements to the referees.

How do we proceed?

Salsabila Mahdi
Universitas Syiah Kuala
Jl. Syech Abdurrauf No.3, Aceh 23111, Indonesia
bila.mahdi@mhs.unsyiah.ac.id

Akshaj Verma
Affiliation
line 1
line 2
akshajverma7@gmail.com

John C. Nash
Affiliation
line 1
line 2
nashjc@uottawa.ca

Christophe Dutang
Univ. Paris-Dauphine, Univ. PSL, CNRS, CEREMADE
Place du Ml de Lattre de Tassigny, 75016 Paris, France
dutang@ceremade.dauphine.fr

Patrice Kiener
InModelia
5 rue Malebranche, 75005 Paris, France
patrice.kiener@inmodelia.com