

**Subject:** [RJournal 2023-15] journal submission  
**From:** Rob Hyndman <rob.hyndman@monash.edu>  
**Date:** 2023-02-27, 01:08  
**To:** "profjcnash@gmail.com" <profjcnash@gmail.com>

Hi John

Thank you for submitting your "Refactoring `nls()`: a constructive critique" to the R Journal. It was allocated to me to handle as an Executive Editor.

The paper is written in a form that may be of interest to the R core team, and at times reads like a proposal to R-core to re-write `nls()`, but it is not particularly useful for regular R developers or users in its current form, and (in my view) the R Journal is not really the appropriate vehicle for this type of communication. I would prefer to see a reframing of the paper to focus on the `nlsr` package, with contrasts to the `nls()` function where appropriate. This would combine the proposed "Refactoring" paper with the existing Introduction vignette to the `nlsr` package, plus some additional discussion of other packages. It would cover such questions as:

- \* What does the `nlsr` package provide that the `nls()` function does not (and vice-versa)?
- \* What does the `nlsr` package do better than the `nls()` function (and vice-versa)?
- \* When should a user use the `nlsr` package rather than the `nls()` function?
- \* How does `nlsr` compare to the other available NLS packages such as `nls2`, `minpack.lm`, `onls` and `gslnls`?

If you and Arkajyoti are amenable to such a reframing/rewrite of this work, I'd be happy to consider it for the R Journal.

When you have your revised article ready, please submit a zip containing all relevant files through the article submission at <https://journal.r-project.org/submissions.html>. You will need to include the article id listed in the Subject line into the form.

As this is a major rewrite, there is no time limit on the resubmission. But if you choose not to resubmit, I'd appreciate it if you could let me know.

All the best,  
Rob

**Professor Rob J Hyndman** (he/him)  
Department of Econometrics & Business Statistics  
Monash University  
[robjhyndman.com](http://robjhyndman.com)