Statistical Methods for Analysis with Missing Data

Lecture 7 setup: example of EM algorithm

Mauricio Sadinle

Department of Biostatistics

W UNIVERSITY of WASHINGTON

Previous Lecture

The EM algorithm for ML estimation with missing data:

- ▶ General derivation of the algorithm
- ▶ The EM algorithm under MAR
 - The Expectation step:

$$Q_{\theta}(\theta \mid \theta^{(t)}) = E \left[\log p(z_{(r)}, Z_{(\bar{r})} \mid \theta) \mid Z_{(r)} = z_{(r)}, \theta^{(t)} \right]$$
$$= \int_{Z_{(\bar{r})}} p(z_{(\bar{r})} \mid z_{(r)}, \theta^{(t)}) \log p(z \mid \theta) \ dz_{(\bar{r})}$$

The Maximization step:

$$heta^{(t+1)} = rg \max_{ heta} \, Q_{ heta}(heta \mid heta^{(t)})$$

Example with two categorical variables



Today's Lecture

- ► Continued example of EM for two categorical variables
- ► Coding it in R
- Assessing variability of estimates via the bootstrap

- ▶ Let $Z_i = (Z_{i1}, Z_{i2}), Z_{i1}, Z_{i2} \in \{1, 2\}, Z_i$'s are i.i.d.
- ▶ Therefore

$$p(Z_{i1} = z_{i1}, Z_{i2} = z_{i2} \mid \theta) = \pi_{z_{i1}z_{i2}}$$

▶ The likelihood of the study variables is

$$L(\theta) = \prod_{i} \pi_{z_{i1}z_{i2}}$$

$$= \prod_{i} \left[\prod_{k,l} \pi_{kl}^{l(z_{i1}=k,z_{i2}=l)} \right]$$

$$= \prod_{i} \left[\prod_{k,l} \pi_{kl}^{W_{ikl}} \right]$$

$$V_{ikl} = I(Z_{i1} = k, Z_{i2} = l), k, l \in \{1, 2\}$$

- ▶ Let $Z_i = (Z_{i1}, Z_{i2}), Z_{i1}, Z_{i2} \in \{1, 2\}, Z_i$'s are i.i.d.
- ► Therefore

$$p(Z_{i1} = z_{i1}, Z_{i2} = z_{i2} \mid \theta) = \pi_{z_{i1}z_{i2}},$$

▶ The likelihood of the study variables is

$$L(\theta) = \prod_{i} \pi_{z_{i1}z_{i2}}$$

$$= \prod_{i} \left[\prod_{k,l} \pi_{kl}^{l(z_{i1}=k,z_{i2}=l)} \right]$$

$$= \prod_{i} \left[\prod_{k,l} \pi_{kl}^{W_{ikl}} \right]$$

$$W_{ikl} = I(Z_{i1} = k, Z_{i2} = l), k, l \in \{1, 2\}$$

- ▶ Let $Z_i = (Z_{i1}, Z_{i2})$, $Z_{i1}, Z_{i2} \in \{1, 2\}$, Z_i 's are i.i.d.
- ► Therefore

$$p(Z_{i1} = z_{i1}, Z_{i2} = z_{i2} \mid \theta) = \pi_{z_{i1}z_{i2}},$$

▶ The likelihood of the study variables is

$$L(\theta) = \prod_{i} \pi_{z_{i1}z_{i2}}$$

$$= \prod_{i} \left[\prod_{k,l} \pi_{kl}^{l(z_{i1}=k, z_{i2}=l)} \right]$$

$$= \prod_{i} \left[\prod_{k,l} \pi_{kl}^{W_{ikl}} \right]$$

$$W_{ikl} = I(Z_{i1} = k, Z_{i2} = l), k, l \in \{1, 2\}$$

- ▶ Let $Z_i = (Z_{i1}, Z_{i2}), Z_{i1}, Z_{i2} \in \{1, 2\}, Z_i$'s are i.i.d.
- ► Therefore

$$p(Z_{i1} = z_{i1}, Z_{i2} = z_{i2} \mid \theta) = \pi_{z_{i1}z_{i2}},$$

▶ The likelihood of the study variables is

$$L(\theta) = \prod_{i} \pi_{z_{i1}z_{i2}}$$

$$= \prod_{i} \left[\prod_{k,l} \pi_{kl}^{l(z_{i1}=k,z_{i2}=l)} \right]$$

$$= \prod_{i} \left[\prod_{k,l} \pi_{kl}^{W_{ikl}} \right]$$

$$W_{ikl} = I(Z_{i1} = k, Z_{i2} = l), k, l \in \{1, 2\}$$

- ▶ Let $Z_i = (Z_{i1}, Z_{i2}), Z_{i1}, Z_{i2} \in \{1, 2\}, Z_i$'s are i.i.d.
- ► Therefore

$$p(Z_{i1} = z_{i1}, Z_{i2} = z_{i2} \mid \theta) = \pi_{z_{i1}z_{i2}},$$

▶ The likelihood of the study variables is

$$L(\theta) = \prod_{i} \pi_{z_{i1}z_{i2}}$$

$$= \prod_{i} \left[\prod_{k,l} \pi_{kl}^{I(z_{i1}=k,z_{i2}=l)} \right]$$

$$= \prod_{i} \left[\prod_{k,l} \pi_{kl}^{W_{ikl}} \right]$$

$$W_{ikl} = I(Z_{i1} = k, Z_{i2} = l), k, l \in \{1, 2\}$$



- ▶ Let $R_i = (R_{i1}, R_{i2})$, $R_{i1}, R_{i2} \in \{0, 1\}$, R_i 's are i.i.d.
- ▶ Denote the *i*th realized value as $r_i = (r_{i1}, r_{i2})$
- Note that if $r_i = 10$ and $z_{i1} = k$ we observe

$$W_{ik+} \equiv \sum_{l} W_{ikl} = \sum_{l} I(Z_{i1} = k, Z_{i2} = l) = I(Z_{i1} = k)$$

▶ If $r_i = 01$ and $z_{i2} = I$ we observe

$$W_{i+1} \equiv \sum_{k} W_{ikl} = \sum_{k} I(Z_{i1} = k, Z_{i2} = l) = I(Z_{i2} = l)$$

$$\pi_{k+} = \sum_{l} \pi_{kl}, \quad \text{and} \quad \pi_{+l} = \sum_{k} \pi_{l}$$

- ▶ Let $R_i = (R_{i1}, R_{i2})$, $R_{i1}, R_{i2} \in \{0, 1\}$, R_i 's are i.i.d.
- ▶ Denote the *i*th realized value as $r_i = (r_{i1}, r_{i2})$
- Note that if $r_i = 10$ and $z_{i1} = k$ we observe

$$W_{ik+} \equiv \sum_{l} W_{ikl} = \sum_{l} I(Z_{i1} = k, Z_{i2} = l) = I(Z_{i1} = k)$$

▶ If $r_i = 01$ and $z_{i2} = I$ we observe

$$W_{i+1} \equiv \sum_{k} W_{ikl} = \sum_{k} I(Z_{i1} = k, Z_{i2} = l) = I(Z_{i2} = l)$$

$$\pi_{k+} = \sum_{l} \pi_{kl}, \quad \text{and} \quad \pi_{+l} = \sum_{k} \pi_{kl}$$

- ▶ Let $R_i = (R_{i1}, R_{i2})$, $R_{i1}, R_{i2} \in \{0, 1\}$, R_i 's are i.i.d.
- ▶ Denote the *i*th realized value as $r_i = (r_{i1}, r_{i2})$
- ▶ Note that if $r_i = 10$ and $z_{i1} = k$ we observe

$$W_{ik+} \equiv \sum_{l} W_{ikl} = \sum_{l} I(Z_{i1} = k, Z_{i2} = l) = I(Z_{i1} = k)$$

▶ If $r_i = 01$ and $z_{i2} = I$ we observe

$$W_{i+1} \equiv \sum_{k} W_{ikl} = \sum_{k} I(Z_{i1} = k, Z_{i2} = l) = I(Z_{i2} = l)$$

$$\pi_{k+} = \sum_{l} \pi_{kl}, \quad \text{and} \quad \pi_{+l} = \sum_{k} \pi_{kl}$$

- ▶ Let $R_i = (R_{i1}, R_{i2}), R_{i1}, R_{i2} \in \{0, 1\}, R_i$'s are i.i.d.
- ▶ Denote the *i*th realized value as $r_i = (r_{i1}, r_{i2})$
- Note that if $r_i = 10$ and $z_{i1} = k$ we observe

$$W_{ik+} \equiv \sum_{l} W_{ikl} = \sum_{l} I(Z_{i1} = k, Z_{i2} = l) = I(Z_{i1} = k)$$

▶ If $r_i = 01$ and $z_{i2} = I$ we observe

$$W_{i+1} \equiv \sum_{k} W_{ikl} = \sum_{k} I(Z_{i1} = k, Z_{i2} = l) = I(Z_{i2} = l)$$

$$\pi_{k+} = \sum_{l} \pi_{kl}, \quad \text{and} \quad \pi_{+l} = \sum_{k} \pi_{kl}$$



- ▶ Let $R_i = (R_{i1}, R_{i2})$, $R_{i1}, R_{i2} \in \{0, 1\}$, R_i 's are i.i.d.
- ▶ Denote the *i*th realized value as $r_i = (r_{i1}, r_{i2})$
- Note that if $r_i = 10$ and $z_{i1} = k$ we observe

$$W_{ik+} \equiv \sum_{l} W_{ikl} = \sum_{l} I(Z_{i1} = k, Z_{i2} = l) = I(Z_{i1} = k)$$

▶ If $r_i = 01$ and $z_{i2} = I$ we observe

$$W_{i+1} \equiv \sum_{k} W_{ikl} = \sum_{k} I(Z_{i1} = k, Z_{i2} = l) = I(Z_{i2} = l)$$

$$\pi_{k+} = \sum_{l} \pi_{kl}, \quad \text{and} \quad \pi_{+l} = \sum_{k} \pi_{kl}$$

$$Q_{\theta}(\theta \mid \theta^{(t)}) = \sum_{i} E \left[\log p(z_{i(r_{i})}, Z_{i(\bar{r}_{i})} \mid \theta) \mid Z_{i(r_{i})} = z_{i(r_{i})}, \theta^{(t)} \right]$$

$$= \sum_{i} \sum_{r} I(r_{i} = r) E \left[\log p(z_{i(r)}, Z_{i(\bar{r})} \mid \theta) \mid Z_{i(r)} = z_{i(r)}, \theta^{(t)} \right]$$

$$= \sum_{i} \left[I(r_{i} = 11) \log \pi_{z_{i1}z_{i2}} + I(r_{i} = 10) \sum_{l} \frac{\pi_{z_{i1}l}^{(t)}}{\pi_{z_{i1}+}^{(t)}} \log \pi_{z_{i1}l} + I(r_{i} = 01) \sum_{k} \frac{\pi_{kz_{i2}}^{(t)}}{\pi_{kz_{i2}}^{(t)}} \log \pi_{kz_{i2}} + I(r_{i} = 00) \sum_{l} \pi_{kl}^{(t)} \log \pi_{kl} \right]$$

$$Q_{\theta}(\theta \mid \theta^{(t)}) = \sum_{i} E \left[\log p(z_{i(r_{i})}, Z_{i(\bar{r}_{i})} \mid \theta) \mid Z_{i(r_{i})} = z_{i(r_{i})}, \theta^{(t)} \right]$$

$$= \sum_{i} \sum_{r} I(r_{i} = r) E \left[\log p(z_{i(r)}, Z_{i(\bar{r})} \mid \theta) \mid Z_{i(r)} = z_{i(r)}, \theta^{(t)} \right]$$

$$= \sum_{i} \left[I(r_{i} = 11) \log \pi_{z_{i1}z_{i2}} + I(r_{i} = 10) \sum_{l} \frac{\pi_{z_{i1}l}^{(t)}}{\pi_{z_{i1}+}^{(t)}} \log \pi_{z_{i1}l} + I(r_{i} = 01) \sum_{k} \frac{\pi_{kz_{i2}}^{(t)}}{\pi_{kz_{i2}}^{(t)}} \log \pi_{kz_{i2}} + I(r_{i} = 00) \sum_{l} \frac{\pi_{kl}^{(t)}}{\pi_{kl}^{(t)}} \log \pi_{kl} \right]$$

$$Q_{\theta}(\theta \mid \theta^{(t)}) = \sum_{i} E \left[\log p(z_{i(r_{i})}, Z_{i(\bar{r}_{i})} \mid \theta) \mid Z_{i(r_{i})} = z_{i(r_{i})}, \theta^{(t)} \right]$$

$$= \sum_{i} \sum_{r} I(r_{i} = r) E \left[\log p(z_{i(r)}, Z_{i(\bar{r})} \mid \theta) \mid Z_{i(r)} = z_{i(r)}, \theta^{(t)} \right]$$

$$= \sum_{i} \left[I(r_{i} = 11) \log \pi_{z_{i1}z_{i2}} + I(r_{i} = 10) \sum_{l} \frac{\pi_{z_{i1}l}^{(t)}}{\pi_{z_{i1}+}^{(t)}} \log \pi_{z_{i1}l} + I(r_{i} = 01) \sum_{k} \frac{\pi_{kz_{i2}}^{(t)}}{\pi_{kz_{i2}}^{(t)}} \log \pi_{kz_{i2}} + I(r_{i} = 00) \sum_{l} \pi_{kl}^{(t)} \log \pi_{kl} \right]$$

$$Q_{\theta}(\theta \mid \theta^{(t)}) = \sum_{i} E \left[\log p(z_{i(r_{i})}, Z_{i(\bar{r}_{i})} \mid \theta) \mid Z_{i(r_{i})} = z_{i(r_{i})}, \theta^{(t)} \right]$$

$$= \sum_{i} \sum_{r} I(r_{i} = r) E \left[\log p(z_{i(r)}, Z_{i(\bar{r})} \mid \theta) \mid Z_{i(r)} = z_{i(r)}, \theta^{(t)} \right]$$

$$= \sum_{i} \left[I(r_{i} = 11) \log \pi_{z_{i1}z_{i2}} + I(r_{i} = 10) \sum_{l} \frac{\pi_{z_{i1}l}^{(t)}}{\pi_{z_{i1}+}^{(t)}} \log \pi_{z_{i1}l} + I(r_{i} = 01) \sum_{k} \frac{\pi_{kz_{i2}}^{(t)}}{\pi_{kz_{i2}}^{(t)}} \log \pi_{kz_{i2}} + I(r_{i} = 00) \sum_{l} \pi_{kl}^{(t)} \log \pi_{kl} \right]$$

$$Q_{\theta}(\theta \mid \theta^{(t)}) = \sum_{i} E \left[\log p(z_{i(r_{i})}, Z_{i(\bar{r}_{i})} \mid \theta) \mid Z_{i(r_{i})} = z_{i(r_{i})}, \theta^{(t)} \right]$$

$$= \sum_{i} \sum_{r} I(r_{i} = r) E \left[\log p(z_{i(r)}, Z_{i(\bar{r})} \mid \theta) \mid Z_{i(r)} = z_{i(r)}, \theta^{(t)} \right]$$

$$= \sum_{i} \left[I(r_{i} = 11) \log \pi_{z_{i1}z_{i2}} + I(r_{i} = 10) \sum_{l} \frac{\pi_{z_{i1}l}^{(t)}}{\pi_{z_{i1}+}^{(t)}} \log \pi_{z_{i1}l} + I(r_{i} = 01) \sum_{k} \frac{\pi_{kz_{i2}}^{(t)}}{\pi_{+z_{i2}}^{(t)}} \log \pi_{kz_{i2}} + I(r_{i} = 00) \sum_{l} \pi_{kl}^{(t)} \log \pi_{kl} \right]$$

$$\begin{aligned} Q_{\theta}(\theta \mid \theta^{(t)}) &= \sum_{i} E \left[\log p(z_{i(r_{i})}, Z_{i(\bar{r}_{i})} \mid \theta) \mid Z_{i(r_{i})} = z_{i(r_{i})}, \theta^{(t)} \right] \\ &= \sum_{i} \sum_{r} I(r_{i} = r) E \left[\log p(z_{i(r)}, Z_{i(\bar{r})} \mid \theta) \mid Z_{i(r)} = z_{i(r)}, \theta^{(t)} \right] \\ &= \sum_{i} \left[I(r_{i} = 11) \log \pi_{z_{i1}z_{i2}} + I(r_{i} = 10) \sum_{l} \frac{\pi_{z_{i1}l}^{(t)}}{\pi_{z_{i1}+}^{(t)}} \log \pi_{z_{i1}l} + I(r_{i} = 01) \sum_{k} \frac{\pi_{kz_{i2}}^{(t)}}{\pi_{+z_{i2}}^{(t)}} \log \pi_{kz_{i2}} + I(r_{i} = 00) \sum_{k} I_{kl}^{(t)} \log \pi_{kl} \right] \end{aligned}$$

Note that in the above expression we can rewrite as follows:

▶ For r = 11

$$\log \pi_{z_{i1}z_{i2}} = \sum_{k,l} I(z_{i1} = k, z_{i2} = l) \log \pi_{kl}$$

For r = 10

$$\sum_{l} \frac{\pi_{z_{i1}l}^{(t)}}{\pi_{z_{i1}+}^{(t)}} \log \pi_{z_{i1}l} = \sum_{k,l} I(z_{i1} = k) \frac{\pi_{kl}^{(t)}}{\pi_{k+}^{(t)}} \log \pi_{kl}$$

▶ For r = 01

$$\sum_{k} \frac{\pi_{kz_{12}}^{(t)}}{\pi_{+z_{12}}^{(t)}} \log \pi_{kz_{12}} = \sum_{k,l} I(z_{i2} = l) \frac{\pi_{kl}^{(t)}}{\pi_{+l}^{(t)}} \log \pi_{kl}$$

For r = 00

$$\sum_{k,l} \pi_{kl}^{(t)} \log \pi_k$$

Note that in the above expression we can rewrite as follows:

▶ For r = 11

$$\log \pi_{z_{i1}z_{i2}} = \sum_{k,l} I(z_{i1} = k, z_{i2} = l) \log \pi_{kl}$$

▶ For r = 10

$$\sum_{l} \frac{\pi_{z_{i1}l}^{(t)}}{\pi_{z_{i1}+}^{(t)}} \log \pi_{z_{i1}l} = \sum_{k,l} I(z_{i1} = k) \frac{\pi_{kl}^{(t)}}{\pi_{k+}^{(t)}} \log \pi_{kl}$$

▶ For r = 01

$$\sum_{k} \frac{\pi_{kz_{i2}}^{(t)}}{\pi_{+z_{i2}}^{(t)}} \log \pi_{kz_{i2}} = \sum_{k,l} I(z_{i2} = l) \frac{\pi_{kl}^{(t)}}{\pi_{+l}^{(t)}} \log \pi_{kl}$$

For r = 00

$$\sum_{k,l} \pi_{kl}^{(t)} \log \pi_k$$

Note that in the above expression we can rewrite as follows:

▶ For r = 11

$$\log \pi_{z_{i1}z_{i2}} = \sum_{k,l} I(z_{i1} = k, z_{i2} = l) \log \pi_{kl}$$

▶ For r = 10

$$\sum_{l} \frac{\pi_{z_{i1}l}^{(t)}}{\pi_{z_{i1}+}^{(t)}} \log \pi_{z_{i1}l} = \sum_{k,l} I(z_{i1} = k) \frac{\pi_{kl}^{(t)}}{\pi_{k+}^{(t)}} \log \pi_{kl}$$

▶ For r = 01

$$\sum_{k} \frac{\pi_{kz_{i_2}}^{(t)}}{\pi_{t+z_{i_2}}^{(t)}} \log \pi_{kz_{i_2}} = \sum_{k,l} I(z_{i_2} = l) \frac{\pi_{kl}^{(t)}}{\pi_{t+l}^{(t)}} \log \pi_{kl}$$

▶ For r = 00

$$\sum_{k,l} \pi_{kl}^{(t)} \log \pi_{kl}$$

Note that in the above expression we can rewrite as follows:

▶ For r = 11

$$\log \pi_{z_{i1}z_{i2}} = \sum_{k,l} I(z_{i1} = k, z_{i2} = l) \log \pi_{kl}$$

▶ For r = 10

$$\sum_{l} \frac{\pi_{z_{i1}l}^{(t)}}{\pi_{z_{i1}+}^{(t)}} \log \pi_{z_{i1}l} = \sum_{k,l} I(z_{i1} = k) \frac{\pi_{kl}^{(t)}}{\pi_{k+}^{(t)}} \log \pi_{kl}$$

▶ For r = 01

$$\sum_{k} \frac{\pi_{kz_{i2}}^{(t)}}{\pi_{t+z_{i2}}^{(t)}} \log \pi_{kz_{i2}} = \sum_{k,l} I(z_{i2} = l) \frac{\pi_{kl}^{(t)}}{\pi_{tl}^{(t)}} \log \pi_{kl}$$

▶ For r = 00

$$\sum_{k,l} \pi_{kl}^{(t)} \log \pi_{kl}$$

Let's define the "predicted" W_{ikl} at the (t+1)th iteration as

$$W_{ikl}^{(t+1)} = W_{ikl}I(r_i = 11) + W_{ik+}\frac{\pi_{kl}^{(t)}}{\pi_{k+}^{(t)}}I(r_i = 10) + W_{i+1}\frac{\pi_{kl}^{(t)}}{\pi_{k+}^{(t)}}I(r_i = 01) + \pi_{kl}^{(t)}I(r_i = 00)$$

With this notation

E step:

$$Q_{ heta}(heta \mid heta^{(t)}) = \sum_{i,k,l} W_{ikl}^{(t+1)} \log \pi_{kl}$$

► M step:

$$\pi_{kl}^{(t+1)} = \frac{1}{n} \sum_{i} W_{ikl}^{(t+1)}$$

Or equivalently,

► E step:

$$W_{ikl}^{(t+1)} = W_{ikl}I(r_i = 11) + W_{ik+}\frac{\pi_{kl}^{(t)}}{\pi_{k+}^{(t)}}I(r_i = 10) + W_{i+l}\frac{\pi_{kl}^{(t)}}{\pi_{+l}^{(t)}}I(r_i = 01) + \pi_{kl}^{(t)}I(r_i = 00)$$

M step:

$$\pi_{kl}^{(t+1)} = \frac{1}{n} \sum_{i} W_{ikl}^{(t+1)}$$

Note that the M step can be written as:

$$\pi_{kl}^{(t+1)} = \frac{1}{n} \sum_{i} W_{ikl}^{(t+1)}$$

$$= \frac{1}{n} \left(n_{11kl} + \frac{\pi_{kl}^{(t)}}{\pi_{k+}^{(t)}} n_{10k+} + \frac{\pi_{kl}^{(t)}}{\pi_{+l}^{(t)}} n_{01+l} + \pi_{kl}^{(t)} n_{00++} \right),$$

where

$$n_{11kl} = \sum_{i} W_{ikl} I(r_i = 11), \quad n_{10k+} = \sum_{i} W_{ik+} I(r_i = 10),$$

 $n_{01+l} = \sum_{i} W_{i+l} I(r_i = 01), \quad n_{00++} = \sum_{i} I(r_i = 00)$

This combines E and M into a single step!

R Time!

Open file LectureO7code.R

Summary

Main take-aways from today's lecture:

- Example of EM algorithm for categorical variables
- Bootstrap confidence intervals

Next lecture:

► Introduction to Bayesian inference! (why??)