

PAKISTAN MOVEMENT

1927-1939

Cambridge O Level Pakistan Studies 2059. Examination in June and November 2011

Key Question: How successful was the Pakistan Movement in the years 1927 to 1939?

Focus points:

- Why did Jinnah produce his 14 Points of 1929?
- How successful were the three Round Table Conferences of 1930-32?
- How important was the Government of India Act 1935?
- Why was Congress Rule (1937-39) unpopular with many Muslims?

Specified content:

- The Simon Commission 1927
- The Nehru Report 1928
- Jinnah's 14 Points
- Allama Iqbal's Allahabad Address 1930
- The Round Table Conferences
- The Communal Award of 1932
- The Government of India Act 1935
- Rehmat Ali and the Pakistan National Movement
- Congress rule 1937-39, its significance to the Pakistan Movement and the 'Day of Deliverance' 1939

Timeline of Events (1927-1940)

1. 1927 Delhi Muslim Proposals
2. 1927 Simon Commission
3. 1928 Nehru Report
4. 1929 Jinnah's 14 Points
5. 1930 Gandhi's Salt March
6. 1930 Allahabad Address
7. 1930-32 The Round Table Conferences
8. 1933 Chaudhry Rehmat Ali's Idea of Pakistan

9. 1935 The Government of India Act 1935
10. 1937 The Elections
11. 1937-1939 Congress Atrocities
12. 1938 League Grown as a Mass Movement
13. 1939 Outbreak of The Second World War
14. 1939 Day of Deliverance – 22 December
15. 1940 August Offer

DELHI PROPOSALS:

Considering separate electorates to be the main hindrance in improving Hindu-Muslim relations, Quaid-i-Azam proposed that if the Hindus agreed to provide certain safeguards, the Muslims would give up this demand. Consequently, the proposals were formally approved at a conference held by the Muslims in 1927 at Delhi, and are now called “The Delhi-Muslim Proposals”. Following are the safeguards that were proposed:

- Muslims should be given one third of the seats in the Central Legislature through joint electorate.
- Sindh should be given full provincial status
- All British reforms in India should be extended to Balochistan and NWFP.
- The number of seats to be given to Muslims in Punjab and Bengal should be proportional to the Muslim population living there.
- Unless and until the above proposals were implemented, the Muslims would never surrender the right of their representation through separate electorates.
- In addition to provisions like religious freedom, there was to be a further guarantee in the constitution that on communal matters no bill or resolution would be considered or passed if three-fourth of the members of the community concerned were opposed to it.
- These proposals were to be accepted or rejected in total. So, in effect, the Muslims agreed to give up the separate electorates in form of the reservation of seats.

Unfortunately, the Congress first accepted but later rejected the proposals.

SIMON COMMISSION:

The Government of India Act 1919 stated that a commission was to be set up after 10 years to enquire into the working of the reforms set up in 1919. The British Conservative government feared that they might lose to the Labor Party which would be too sympathetic to the Indian nationalism and the party might make too many concessions. The British government appointed a commission under **Sir John Simon** in **November 1927**. The commission, which had

no Indian members, was being sent to investigate India's constitutional problems and make recommendations to the government on the future constitution of India.

The Congress decided to boycott the Simon Commission and challenged Lord Birkenhead, Secretary of State for India, to produce a constitution acceptable to the various elements in India.

There was a clear split in the Muslim League. **Sir Muhammad Shafi**, who wanted to cooperate with the commission, decided to convene a Muslim League session in Lahore in December 1927. The other faction led by Jinnah stood for the boycott of the commission. This faction held a Muslim League session at Calcutta, and decided to form a subcommittee to confer with the working committee of the Indian National Congress and other organizations, with a view to draft a constitution for India.

Later on, the commission was considered an insult to India and all the parties protested against it.

(c) Which of the following was the most important in the development of the Pakistan Movement:

- (i) Jinnah's 14 Points 1929;**
- (ii) Government of India Act 1935;**
- (iii) Congress Rule 1937-1939?**

Explain your answer with reference to all three of the above.

[14]

NEHRU REPORT 1928:

Since all the parties did not agree with Simon commission because it was decided only by the British so Nehru produced his own reform which was approved by an All Parties Conference in 1928. Its main demands were:

- Immediate Dominion Status for India.
- Joint electorates in India.

- There should be federal form of government with residuary powers vested in the center.
- There should be bi-cameral legislature.
- The protection of minorities through a system of reserving seats in the two chambers.
- Hindi to be the national language.
- The vote for all men and women.
- Muslims should enjoy one-fourth representation in the Central Legislature.
- Sindh to be separated from Bombay only if the Committee certified that it was financially self-sufficient to bear its expenses.
- The N.W.F.P. should be given full provincial status.

Jinnah's 14 Points

(b) Why did Jinnah produce his 14 Points in 1929?

7

(c) 'Was the introduction of Jinnah's 14 points in 1929 the most important factor in the development of the Pakistan Movement between 1928 and 1935?' Give reasons for your answer.

14

Reasons for introducing 14 Points

1. Reactions to Nehru Report's extremist and Pro-Hindu demands such as:
 - Hindi to be made national language.
 - Rejection to the right of separate electorates for Muslims that they enjoyed since 1909.
 - Jinnah proposed three amendments to Nehru Report at an All Parties Conference in Calcutta in 1928:
 1. One third representation in the Central Legislature.
 2. Punjab and Bengal seats on the basis of population for at least ten years.
 3. Residuary powers with the provinces and not with the center.

Jinnah's amendments to Nehru Report were ignored and he had no choice left but to present 14 points to secure the position of Muslims. Nehru Report marked the end of any future cooperation between Congress and League. Congress and the League's leading leaders were disillusioned with the Congress and were never to trust her again.

2. The 14 Points set out the demands of any future negotiations with either Congress or the British Government. Jinnah did not agree to any constitutional reforms which did not incorporate 14 points in later years.
3. The demands were also to form the basis of the Muslims demands for a separate homeland. It also convinced them that the Hindus and Muslims were two separate nations and following 14 points was the only solution to resolve Hindu Muslim differences.

JINNAH'S 14 POINTS

In response to Nehru Report, Jinnah presented his famous 14 points to protect the rights and interests of the Muslims

- Federal system of government.
- Provincial autonomy.
- Adequate representation of minorities in legislatures.
- 1/3rd Seats for Muslims in the Central Legislature.
- Separate electorates.
- Liberty of religion and culture.
- Sindh to be separated from Bombay.
- Reforms in NWFP and Baluchistan.
- Adequate share for Muslims in government services.
- 1/3 share in all cabinets.

14 points were made by Jinnah to counter the Nehru Report which was responsible in parting of ways. Although it was accepted by All-Party Conference it asked for too many sacrifices from

the Muslims. It was made to protect the Muslim interests. He made it clear that Hindi will not be the administrative language, election would be with separate electorate and any territorial changes will not affect Muslim majority in Bengal, Punjab and NWFP.

GANDHI'S SALT MARCH - 1930

After rejection of 14 points and Nehru Report, Gandhi launched a non-cooperation Movement again.

The Salt March was led by Gandhi from his retreat near Allahabad to the seaside village of Dandi.

- Nehru report rejected by Muslim League and British.
- Congress re-launched his non-cooperation campaign.
- The march was against the unfair salt laws that imposed restriction on Indians about extracting and processing that.
- It was a 24 day march that violated the Salt Laws publicly.
- British goods, shops, schools, colleges were boycotted.
- It gave the opportunities for the Indians to disregard all unfair laws and show opposition to British. At last, both Gandhi and Nehru were arrested.

ALLAHBAD ADDRESS - 1930

(b) Why was Dr. Allama Muhammad Iqbal an important influence on the struggle for a separate homeland for Pakistan? [7]

Allama Iqbal had an important influence on the struggle for a separate homeland due to his following contributions:

- In 1930 Dr. Allama Iqbal was asked to chair a meeting of the Muslim League in Allahabad. In his address he called for the Muslims of the subcontinent to work towards achieving a homeland for their very survival. He argued that Islam had given its followers a system which united the Muslims of subcontinent into one nation. There

would be no peace for the Hindus and Muslim living in the same land because these two communities had different culture, religion, language, outlook to life etc. He also stated that he would like to see Punjab, Sindh, Balochistan and NWFP into a single state either inside or outside the British Empire. This address is considered important because for the first time a Muslim leader suggested a separate state for Muslims a solution to Indian problem the protection of Muslim rights by demanding a separate State.

- Allama Iqbal was the first Muslim leader to suggest the partition of the sub-continent keeping in mind the two nation theory and has therefore been called the Father of the ideology of Pakistan. Iqbal gave the Muslims a clear objective to work and formed the basis of the Pakistan resolution.
- He invited Jinnah in 1934 to guide Indians. It was a crucial time and there was no dynamic Muslim leader to guide the people and to handle Indian National Congress and British when Government of India Act 1935 was about to release.
- He wrote poems and essays to inspire Muslims of India for a political struggle for a separate homeland.

ROUND TABLE CONFERENCES 1930-32

- | |
|---|
| <p>1. (b) Why were three Round Table Conferences held between 1930 and 1932? [7]</p> <p>2. (c) How successful were the three Round Table Conferences of 1930-1932? Explain your answer. [14]</p> <p>3. (c) 'The Round Table Conference of 1930 achieved more than those of 1931 and 1932'. Do you agree or disagree? Give reasons for your answer. [14]</p> |
|---|

Simon Commission produced a report in 1930. It recommended separate electorates for Muslims but rejected 1/3rd seats in central legislature and separation of Sindh from Bombay. In order to discuss these recommendations with Indian Leaders, RTCs were called in London from 1930-32 which would discuss the future constitution of India.

Background/Reasons for calling RTCs

Hindu Muslim Disunity

- Nehru report rejected by Muslims.
- Fourteen points rejected by Congress.

Disapproval of Simon Commission Report leading to political instability in India

- Simon report criticized by major political parties.
- Civil disobedience movement launched by Congress in 1930.
- Political tension in India- No workable political solution for India was agreed upon.

To work on constitutional solutions for India with consultation of Indians

- To discuss the recommendations of the Simon Report.
- To frame a new set of reforms for India with the consent of all political parties

RTCS (1930-32)

1st Round Table Conference

- Began in London on 12th Nov 1930.
- Congress boycotted it as it had issued ultimatum that unless Nehru report enforced, it would not participate in further constitutional discussions.
- Muslim delegation included **Jinnah, Aga Khan, Moulana M. Ali Jauhar, Sir Shafi and Maulvi Fazl-ul-Haq.**

This RTC was attended by all the parties except Congress as they were busy in their non-cooperation movement. The absence of the largest party meant the conference was bound to fail.

However the conference did make some grounds:

- Federal system of government.
- Princely states to cooperate in the formation of a federation.

- Diarchy to be abolished.
- Dominion status for India.

Gandhi Irwin Pact - 1931

- British government was eager to include Congress in the 2nd RTC.
- Government approached Congress for talks.
- Gandhi and Nehru were in jail.
- Lord Irwin, the Viceroy held talks with Gandhi.
- Agreement signed on 5th March 1931.
- Congress agreed to end the civil disobedience movement.
- Congress would participate in the 2nd RTC.
- Government to withdraw all ordinances to curb Congress.
- Government to release all prisoners arrested during civil disobedience movement.
- All political charges to be withdrawn.

2nd Round Table Conference

- Second conference started on 7th Sept 1931.
- Congress represented by Gandhi.
- Muslim league represented by Jinnah and Allama Iqbal.
- Two committees set up to do necessary work for minority affairs and federal structure.
Gandhi was a member of both committees.
- Gandhi refused to accept the rights of minorities.
- Claimed to be the sole representative of all Indians.

Reasons for failure

- The Second RTC also proved failure because of Gandhi's stubborn attitude by claiming there was no minority problem in India and Congress represented all the citizens of India to which everyone objected.

- The second reason for the failure was that the Labor Party had lost power in Britain and the new government was less keen to reach compromise in India. However, it was decided in the conference that NWFP and Sindh would be made provinces.
- Jinnah commented, "India is governed by the old system of divide and rule. We divide, you rule."
- British warned that if agreement could not be reached, they would impose their own solutions to Indian problems.

3rd Round Table Conference

- Started in London on 17th Nov 1932 and ended on 24th Nov 1932.
- Congress refused to participate because Gandhi had started his civil disobedience movement again and had been jailed.
- Jinnah did not take part as he was disappointed with the proceedings of first two conferences.

This was held on November 1932 which stood a little chance of success.

- In this conference Congress did not attend it and the new Viceroy Lord Wellington was less prepared to make concessions.
- Moreover, Jinnah had gone into voluntary exile and even though he was in London when the conference was taken place but he was not invited.
- In August 1932 British Prime Minister Ramsay Macdonald announced the 'Communal Award' to protect the position of minorities.
- Muslims were given weightage in Hindu Majority areas but Muslim majority in Punjab and Bengal was reduced.
- Congress rejected but Muslim League had to accept because it demanded it.

Outcome of the conferences

- Government became aware of the demands of Indian people.
- Abolition of Diarchy in provinces.

- Separation of Sindh.
- Communal Award.

First RTC

Successes:

- Federal System for India approved.
- Sindh to be given a separate identity and a government.

Failures:

- Congress boycotted it.
- Deadlock on federal system.
- Minorities' sub-committee couldn't reach a conclusion.

Second RTC

- Gandhi took a hard line and refused to recognize the problems of the minorities.
Muslims took a hard line against Congress to protect their position. The new British National government was less keen to reach a compromise in India.
- Congress attended.
- Minorities entered into an agreement on their demands.

Third RTC

- Congress absent again.
- Gulf too great between the two political parties. White paper was published in 1933 (a report of the RTCs which was taken to British parliament to decide on the future constitution).

CHAUDARY REHMAT ALI

- He was a student of Cambridge University in 1930s who attended RTCs.
- He believed in partition of India as the solution to Hindu Muslim problem even in 1930s when there was no concept of an independent state for the Muslims.
- He gave the idea of Central South Asian Republics comprising of Muslim majority areas of India, Iran, Afghanistan and neighboring Muslim Countries.
- Wrote a pamphlet 'Now or Never' which gained lot of popularity in 1930s.
- Coined the word "PAKISTAN".
- Pakistan National Movement formed by him.
- He was not supported by Muslim League and Jinnah and his ideas were different from those of Allama Iqbal.
- Presented the idea of Pakistan far ahead of his time.

Government of India Act 1935

1. **Why was the Government of India Act of 1935 so important to the future of the sub-continent?** [7]
2. **(b) Why was there so much opposition to the Government of India Act of 1935?** [7]
3. **(c) which of the following contributed the most to the Pakistan National Movement:**
 - (i) **Allama Iqbal's Address of 1930**
 - (ii) **Chaudhry Rehmat Ali's Scheme of Pakistan**
 - (iii) **Muhammad Ali Jinnah's Lahore Resolution of 1940**

Explain your answer with reference to all three of the above [14]

After the failure of the Round Table Conferences, the British announced some proposals how India should be governed. As a result of these conferences a white paper report was issued which was presented to the British government. On the basis of that report Government of India Act was introduced which became the constitution of India. It had the following main features:

- India was to be a federation including both the provinces of India and princely states.
- Governor General was Head of the Federation and could exert special powers in the reserved subjects.
- Provincial governors had special power to interfere in the provincial reserved matters.
- Only provincial part of Act was implemented.
- There were to be two houses of parliament at central government level; Upper House (council of state 250 members) and Lower House Assembly 125 members.
- Provincial autonomy was to be granted.
- Diarchy was dropped at provincial level, but introduced at central government level.
- The number of provinces was increased to 11 by giving the NWFP the status of provinces and creating two new provinces. Orissa and Sindh.

Reaction of Indians and Reasons for Rejection

- The act was rejected by both the League and the Congress.
- Nehru called the act “charter of slavery” and “a machine with strong brakes and no engine”.
- To Jinnah it was “unacceptable, thoroughly rotten and fundamentally bad”.
 1. Diarchy system was dropped at provincial level but introduced at center. That means Governor General enjoyed ultimate power on reserved subjects like defense, foreign affairs and administration of tribal areas. Indians wanted complete transfer of power at that time and were not ready to accept the British control.
 2. Provincial governors also had the authority to dismiss ministers and even the right to dismiss the whole administration and proclaim emergency. That gave an impression to Indians that elected representatives had no real authority even in the provinces.
 3. Although the Act increased the number of voters but in actual terms there was limited franchise. The property qualification for voting meant that only 25% population had the right to vote. Indians demanded unconditional complete parliamentary democracy so they rejected 1935 Act. This Act was rejected by Indians because it did not meet the expectations of Indians.

Importance of Government of India Act 1935

- It was the major acting act before and after a few year of independence in both India and Pakistan. Independence Act 1947 was the amended version of 1935 Act. Till 1956 when the first constitution was introduced, Pakistan was governed on the basis of 1935 Act.
- Proper form of democratic parliamentary system was introduced in this Act. Central Assembly and Council of State were enlarged and number of voters increased from 6 million to 30 million.
- Provincial autonomy was allowed to a great extent and new provinces of Orissa, Sindh and NWFP were created.
- For the first time during British rule large proportion of the local population was given an opportunity to exercise some powers and voice their options. However there was property qualification which limited the franchise to 1/4th of the population.
- This Act gave a right to princely states to participate politically in affairs which concerned the sub-continent.
- Present day Pakistan's administrative and police structure is a modified form of this Act.

(c) Was the introduction of Jinnah's 14 Points in 1929 the most important factor in the development of the Pakistan movement between 1928 and 1935? Give reasons for your answer.

The Nehru Report of 1928 was produced in response to demands for future constitutional reforms and the committee, which drew it up, had minimal Muslim representation. It reported on the future of the sub-continent by looking to dominion status with no need for separate electorates. This totally alienated the Muslims and marked the end of any future co-operation between them and the Congress. However, Jinnah made one final attempt to preserve the relationship in his 14 Points of 1929 in which he proposed three amendments to the report. These proposals were met with refusal and marked what he called –the parting of the ways. The 14 points set out the demands of any future negotiations with either Congress or the British Government. The demands were also to form the basis of the Muslims demands for a

separate homeland. It also convinced them that the Hindus and Muslims were two separate nations and that was to be further developed by Allama Iqbal in 1930. The 1st Round Table Conference proposed a federal system for India which was approved. Sind was to be given a separate identity and a provincial govt. However, Congress boycotted it and there was deadlock on the federal system. The minorities' sub-committee couldn't reach a conclusion. In the 2nd RTC Congress attended and minorities entered into an agreement on their demands. However, in the 3rd RTC Congress was absent again and the gulf proved too great between the two sides. The Government of India Act of 1935 introduced a federal system of government which was disappointing to the Muslim League who had expected more concessions from the British. However, the increased number of provinces was in line with the Indian demands. The period of the Congress Rule and the associated atrocities ensured that the Muslim League became the focal point for all Muslims. The chief Ministers of Bengal and Assam all joined the Muslim League.

THE ELECTIONS OF 1937

- Congress and League opposed the elections because they were planned according to Government of India Act 1935 and this Act was rejected by Congress and League both.
 - Nehru wanted to boycott the elections to show his party's disapproval of the Act. However, later taking part in the elections was seen as an advantage. Through elections, INC could carry its message across India to millions of people.
- Jinnah became life-time president of Muslim league and laid down basic principles as:
- a. India should have self-government.
 - b. They should be given provincial autonomy.
 - c. The rights of minorities should be safeguarded.
- Jinnah and congress believed that they could never work together.

Election Results

- A great disappointment to the League. Congress won absolute majority in 5 provinces and was single largest party in 4 others.
- It was invited to form government in United Provinces, Central Provinces, Bihar, Madras, Bombay, Assam and NWFP.
- Muslim League did not do well even in Muslim majority areas of Punjab, Sindh and Bengal.
- Muslim League won only **109** of **482** seats reserved for Muslims. In Punjab, they won just **1** out of **86** Muslim seats and lost badly to **The Punjab Unionist Party**.
- Elections brought success to the Congress.
- League faced defeat which was also beneficial as it helped to correct its image problem, reorganization and get its message across Muslim population of India.
- It was an eye opener to Muslim League because they learned that they have more support in Muslim minority areas where they were threatened by Hindu domination than the Muslim majority areas.
- Muslim League learned the skills of election campaign and had an experience of contesting elections

The Congress atrocities 1937-1939

(c) 'The main reason why Congress rule (1937-39) was so hated was because of the introduction of the Wardha Scheme'. Do you agree or not? Explain your answer. [14]

(b) Why did Muslims object to the rule of the Congress party between 1937 and 1939? [7]

Reasons for Hating the Congress Rule/Observing Day of Deliverance 22nd December 1939

After success in the elections, Congress treated the Muslim with disrespect. The Congress leaders soon introduced some series of measures which totally threatened Muslim culture and identity

1. A threat to Muslim Culture and Identity

- **Band-e-Matram** - a nationalist Hindu song, singing of this song was made compulsory throughout India that offended Muslims. It included lyrics which said Muslims should be expelled from India. The song was written by a Bengali novelist **Bankim Chatterjee** in his novel **Anadamath**.
- **The Wardha Scheme** - an educational scheme based on Gandhi's views which banned Islamic studies throughout schools and Hindi were medium of instruction spinning of wheel was made compulsory.
- **Viddhiya Mandir Scheme** - Another attempt was made to erase the Muslim culture by introducing a new educational policy that was aimed at converting all non-Hindus to Hinduism. Under the scheme the students were asked to pay homage to Gandhi's picture every day in their assemblies in the schools by bowing in front of his picture with folded arms in Hindu style of worshipping and singing hymns in his praise. Quite surprisingly, **Dr. Zakir Hussain**, a Congress Muslim who later went on to become the third President of India, was the author of the Scheme.

2. Denying Religious Freedom to Muslims

- Children had to bow in front of Gandhi's picture. This was taken as an attack on Muslim culture and religion.
- The Congress Tyranny – It was to erase the Muslim culture, Muslims were forbidden to eat beef, call for AZAAN was banned, attacks were carried out at mosques and anti-Muslim riots took place in which Muslim property and houses were attacked.

3. Strong Campaign by All India Muslim League to expose Congress Tyranny

- League became a Mass movement by 1938. They built up support at grass root level.
- The Chief Ministers of Assam, Bengal, Punjab join the League by 1938
Hindu Muslim relations further declined.