

**HOW SUCCESSFUL WERE
THE DEMOCRATIC
GOVERNMENTS AFTER
ZIA'S MARTIAL LAW
REGIME?**

Benazir Bhutto (1988-90)

CAIE Exam Questions:

- 1. Why was Benazir Bhutto dismissed from office in 1990? [7]**
- 2. What was the 'Pucca Qila Massacre'? [4]**

How did she come into power?

- Election 1988 – won majority of seats but formed a govt. based on coalition with ANP in the center and MQM in Sindh.
- Became PM while Ghulam Ishaq Khan was President.

Initial Problems as PM

- Nawaz Sharif was a popular leader in Punjab. He attracted masses against her.
- Growing influence of MQM in Karachi.
- Army Intelligence agencies.
- Difficulties in working with Ghulam Ishaq Khan on appointment of military and judicial services.
- Corruption of Asif Ali Zardari.
- Islamic radicalists.

Policies

- Wanted democracy and Islamic political freedom and social and health reforms.
- Ending ban on trade and students unions, releasing political prisoners, rural electrification.

- Foreign policy revised - re-entry into Common Wealth in 1989. Hosted SAARC conference in December 1988.

Failures

- Inflation, unemployment, growing population, burden on education and health.
- Failed to cope with drug abuse.
- Opposition's 'no confidence' motion in October 1989 failed but had damaging effects.
- No new laws were passed for women and Hudood Ordinance not repealed.
- MQM and Sindh- violence in Karachi.
- Operation against MQM - Pucca Qila Massacre in 1990.
- Alleged Corruption-use of family members in government.

The government was dismissed by president Ishaq on 2nd August 1990 by using the 8th amendment.

What was the Pucca Qila massacre? [4]

Reward each correct statement with 1 mark. 2 marks can be awarded for a developed statement. Candidates might refer to **May 1990, in Hyderabad, 40 supporters of MQM killed by police. Women and children included. Such violence led to the President (Ghulam Ishaq Khan) dismissing the government in August 1990.**

Nawaz Sharif (1990-93)

How did he come into power?

- Elections 1990 – won 106 seats / majority of seats.
- Formed a coalition government under the coalition named Islami Jamhoori Ittehad (IJI).

Economic Policies / Success

- Industrialization program.
- Privatization of shipping, electricity supply, airlines and telecommunications.

- Barotha Power Project-Gawadar mini port.
- Employment through yellow cabs.
- Motorway project.
- Shariah Bill passed.

Failures

- Lack of capital-US aid stopped.
- Fall of BCCI in 1991 due to corruption - investor suffered losses.
- Cooperative Societies Scandal.
- Law and order decline.
- Violence and increased use of weapons – spread of “Kalashnikov Culture”.
- No efforts to implement Shariah Bill.
- Clashes in Kashmir.

Dismissal in 1993 by President

- Differences with President Ishaq on the appointment of the COAS led to his dismissal under 58 IIB. Nawaz, however, challenged his dismissal in the Supreme Court which restored him. It led to a deadlock between the ‘Big Two’ and there were chances of an army takeover again. Finally both the PM and President resigned and Wasim Sajjad, Chairman of Senate became President.

Benazir Bhutto (1993-96)

Policies/Successes

- Agenda of Change to improve social service, women and health issues.
- Women police stations and Women development banks were established.

Failures

- Kashmir tensions.

- Opposition demonstrations and prosecution of opposition members.
- Terrorism/bombings.
- Unemployment/inflation.
- IMF concerns following devaluation of the Pakistan rupee.
- Balance of payments problems.
- Unrest in the army.
- Dismissal of the Chief Minister of Punjab Mian Manzoor Wattoo.
- Family feuds.
- Opposition from Nawaz Sharif, train march, strikes and protests.
- Murder of Mir Murtaza Bhutto in which Asif Zardari was accused.

Government Dismissed

- Her government was dismissed on charges of corruption, misgovernment by her own party president, Farooq Ahmad Khan Leghari.

Nawaz Sharif as PM (1997-99)

Policies

- Introducing 13th amendment to undo the 8th amendment.
- Anti-Defection Bill (to prevent horse trading) to control changeover of parties by politicians.
- Increasing repression and check on journalists - Najam Sethi case.
- Nuclear testing 1998, ban on aid from the US and the West.
- Conflict with Supreme Court and dismissal of Chief Justice Sajjad Ali Shah.
- Conflict with Army led to General Jehangir Karamat's resignation.

Failures

- Undemocratic policies created unrest.

- Economic sanctions from USA Japan on nuclear testing-freezing foreign currency accounts-stock market collapsed.
- Differences with General Pervez Musharraf over Kargil issue – his plane not allowed to land - appointed ISI chief as Chief of the Army Staff.
- Army refused to accept the new chief and imposed martial law in 1999.

How did Musharraf come into power?

1. Kargil conflict increased unpopularity of Nawaz Sharif, 4000 to 6000 army men deaths by India-withdraw of forces from Kargil.
2. Dismissal of Musharraf as C-in-C and appointing of ISI Chief to replace him was not acceptable to army.
3. Plane conspiracy Case - Plane not allowed to land in Karachi - army support

CAIE Exam Questions

Why did Nawaz Sharif fall from office in 1993?

[7] marks

LEVEL 1: Simplistic answer [1]

He wasn't liked.

LEVEL 2: Identifies reasons [2-4]

He lost out on American aid.

LEVEL 3: Explains reasons [5-7]

He attempted to solve Pakistan's unemployment problem by providing cheap loans to men to buy taxis that he had imported. Few of the loans were repaid which put a strain on the economy. This was made worse when he tried to finance major investment projects that depended upon foreign aid especially from the USA. This aid was in decline and placed a severe strain on Pakistan's finances. The closure of a major bank also made matters worse. As a result of these policies Sharif and his government were blamed. The mismanagement of the Cooperative societies led to millions of Pakistanis losing their money and again the government

was blamed. In particular his family's association with loans that were made led to his image being harmed. Violence in Pakistan that related to drugs and the use of guns led to a strong response from Sharif but his actions were criticized by the opposition parties for being too repressive. Sharif came into conflict with the President over the appointment of an army chief of staff and also with the Eight Amendment. Sharif was dismissed on charges of corruption.

How successful was Benazir Bhutto as Prime Minister of Pakistan in the years 1988-90 and 1993-96? [14] marks

Successes

1988-90

- First woman to head a government of a Muslim nation
- Secured transfer of already purchased US weapons
- Ended a ban on trade unions and released political prisoners, restored students' unions
- Pakistan re-joined the Commonwealth and hosted the 4th SAARC which ended with Pakistan and India signing 3 peace agreements
- Visited USA.

1993-96

- Entered into co-operative arrangements with United States re United Nations'
- Peacekeeping operations 5000 troops to Somalia
- Some reduction in Pakistan's trade deficit
- Slight rise in foreign exchange reserves
- Loan and grant assistance from World Bank and IMF
- United States Lifted economic and military sanctions
- Hillary Clinton visited Pakistan.

Failures

1988-90

- Conflict with Nawaz Sharif and problems with relations with growth of Separatist movements
- Difference over appointment of judges amongst others between Bhutto and President

Ghulam Ishaq

- No confidence motion by opposition – failed but damaging
- Inflation and unemployment
- Drug trafficking
- Use of family members in government
- Problems in Kashmir/India
- Inept visit to Kuwait on eve of Iraqi invasion.

1993-96

- Kashmir tension
- Family feuding. Bhutto's brother murdered in 1996
- Nawaz Sharif and opposition demonstrations
- Prosecution of opposition members
- Banking scandal
- Terrorism/bombings 1995. 2000 people murdered
- Unemployment/inflation
- Unrest in army/arrest of 40 army officers in 1995
- IMF concerns 1996 follows devaluation of Pakistan rupee. Balance of payments worsened

LEVEL 5: As Level 4 – also produces a judgment or evaluation. [14]

What has been the importance of the Siachen Glacier to both India and Pakistan? [4]

Reward each correct statement with 1 mark. 2 marks can be awarded for a developed statement. Candidates might refer to :

1977 Indian Colonel Kumar first climbed the glacier. Returned in 1981. Pakistan discovered that Indians had been there and decided to defend its interest before India claimed the glacier, especially as the border in that part of Kashmir had never been drawn properly. When Pakistan soldiers moved up to the glacier they discovered 300 Indian Troops there. This meant that both sets of troops had to stay there as the glacier was an important symbol to both sides. Pakistan tried several times to remove the Indian troops from there without

success. In 1987 Musharraf led one of these assaults. In 1989 Bhutto visited the glacier to reinforce Pakistan's view of it. No official figures exist of the death toll on the glacier with estimates between 3000 and 5000, but many of these have probably been due to Avalanches and falls. No settlement has been reached, even though several meetings have been held to discuss the situation since 1989.