

Alan McGaughey  
Associate Professor  
Department of Mechanical Engineering  
Carnegie Mellon University  
Pittsburgh, PA 15213-3890  
Tel: (412) 268-9605  
Fax: (412) 268-3348  
Email: mcgaughey@cmu.edu

March 22, 2013

Dear *Physical Review B* Editor:

We are submitting the manuscript titled “Evaluation of the virtual crystal approximation for predicting alloy vibrational mode properties and thermal conductivity” by Jason M. Larkin and Alan J. H. McGaughey for consideration for publication in *Physical Review B*.

Due to their low thermal conductivities, alloys are currently an active area of research, notably in the thermoelectric energy conversion field. The ability to predict alloy thermal conductivity is critical in narrowing down a large materials design space. Recent papers [e.g., *PRL* **106**, 045901 (2011), *PRL* **109**, 095901 (2012), *PRB* **85**, 184303 (2012)] have used anharmonic lattice dynamics and the virtual crystal approximation (an approach we call VC-ALD) to make such predictions.

In VC-ALD, the disorder in the alloy is treated as a perturbation. The limits of this approach have yet to be determined. In our work, we use computationally-inexpensive empirical potentials to assess the virtual crystal approximation by self-consistently treating the disorder explicitly and as a perturbation. We are not aware of any such previous study. Our results indicate that while VC-ALD is generally an accurate method, care must be taken when modeling alloys with low thermal conductivities, where significant underprediction of thermal conductivity is likely.

We suggest the following reviewers:

Davide Donadio  
Group Leader  
Max Planck Institute for Polymer Research  
donadio@mpip-mainz.mpg.de

Junichiro Shiomi  
Associate Professor  
Mechanical Engineering, University of Tokyo  
shiomi@photon.t.u-tokyo.ac.jp

Xiulin Ruan  
Assistant Professor  
Mechanical Engineering, Purdue University  
ruan@purdue.edu

We look forward to your response.

Sincerely,



Alan McGaughey