

Alan McGaughey  
Associate Professor  
Department of Mechanical Engineering  
Carnegie Mellon University  
Pittsburgh, PA 15213-3890  
Tel: (412) 268-9605  
Fax: (412) 268-3348  
Email: mcgaughey@cmu.edu

April 8, 2013

Dear *Physical Review B* Editor:

The manuscript BP11533: “Comparison and evaluation of spectral-energy methods for predicting phonon properties” was concerned with the evaluation of a proposed phonon spectral energy method, \Phi' [PRB 81 081411 (2010)] , which was compared to the correct phonon spectral energy method, \Phi [PRB 34 5058 (1986), PRB 79 064301 (2009)]. This manuscript BP11533 was rejected for publication by *Physical Review B*, but was recently accepted for publication in the *Journal of Computational and Theoretical Nanoscience*.

The current manuscript, BC12512, is unrelated to the manuscript BP11533. In the manuscript BP11533, we perform the normal mode decomposition method (NMD) using the correct formulation, as first introduced in [PRB 34 5058 (1986)]. We extended this formulation by using VC-NMD, which uses the vibrational modes of the virtual crystal (VC) to perform the mapping of the atomic trajectories.

Please let us know if any further information is necessary.

Sincerely,

A description...

Alan McGaughey