Compatibility between `tuple` and tuple-like objects

Document #:	P2165R1
Date:	2021-01-31
Project:	Programming Language C++
Audience:	LEWG
Reply-to:	Corentin Jabot <corentin.jabot@gmail.com>

Abstract

We propose to make tuples of 2 elements and pairs comparable. We extend construction, comparison, and assignment between tuple and any object following the tuple protocol, and generalize `tuple_cat`

Tony tables

Before	After

`constexpr std::pair  p {1, 3.0};`
`constexpr std::tuple t {1.0, 3};`
`static_assert(std::tuple(p) == t);`
`static_assert(std::tuple(p) <=> t == 0);`
	`constexpr std::pair  p {1, 3.0};`
	`constexpr std::tuple t {1.0, 3};`
	`static_assert(p == t);`
	`static_assert(p <=> t == 0);`

Revisions

R1

- The wording in R0 was non-sensical
- Add a note on deduction guide
- Modify `tuple_cat` to unconditionally support `tuple-like` entities

Motivation

`pair`s are platonic tuples of 2 elements. `pair` and `tuple` share most of their interface.

Notably, a tuple can be constructed and assigned from a pair. However, `tuple` and `pair` are not comparable. This proposal fixes that.

This makes tuple more consistent (assignment and comparison usually form a pair, at least in regular-ish types), and makes the library ever so slightly less surprising.

Following that reasoning, we can extend support for these operations to any tuple-like object, aka objects following the tuple protocol.

Design

We introduce an exposition only concept `tuple-like` which can then be used in the definition of tuples construction, comparison and assignment operators.

A type satisfies *`tuple-like`* if it implements the tuple protocol (`std::get`, `std::tuple_element`, `std::tuple_size`)

That same concept can be used in [ranges] to simplify the specification. `pair` is not modified as to not introduce dependencies between `<pair>` and `<tuple>`.

In comparisons, One of the 2 objects has to be a tuple, this is done so that comparison operators can be made hidden friends, and to avoid enormous overload sets.

We also make `tuple_cat` support any *`tuple-like`* parameter. This is conditionally supported by implementations already (but may be restricted to pair and array, we generalize that).

Questions For LEWG

Should `tuple-like` and `pair-like` be named concepts (as opposition to exposition only) ?

CTAD issues

A previous version of this paper modified the deduction guides to using the tuple-like constructors for tuple-like objects.

But this would change the meaning of `tuple {array<int, 2>{}}`. The current version does not add or modify deduction guides. As such, `tuple {boost::tuple<int, int>{}}` is deduced as `std::tuple<boost::tuple<int, int>>`

This is obviously not ideal, but, it is a pre-exising problem in C++20. `tuple pair<int, int>` is currently deduced to `std::tuple<int, int>`, while other tuple-like objects T are deduced as `std::tuple<T>`, which may be surprising. This is the same problem that all deduction guides involving wrapper types, and may require a more comprehensive fix, for example:

```
tuple {pair, pair } // ok
tuple {pair} // ill-formed / deprecated
tuple {std::of_value, pair }  // tuple<pair<foo, bar>>
tuple {std::of_elems, pair }  // tuple<foo, bar>
```

Future work

Tuple comparison operators are good candidates for hidden friends.

Wording

� Header `<tuple>` synopsis [tuple.syn]

```
[...]

// ??, tuple creation functions
inline constexpr unspecified ignore;

template<class... TTypes>
constexpr tuple<unwrap_ref_decay_t<TTypes>...> make_tuple(TTypes&&...);

template<class... TTypes>
constexpr tuple<TTypes&&...> forward_as_tuple(TTypes&&...) noexcept;

template<class... TTypes>
constexpr tuple<TTypes&...> tie(TTypes&...) noexcept;

template<class... Tuples>
constexpr tuple<CTypes...> tuple_cat(Tuples&&...);

// ??, calling a function with a tuple of arguments
template<class F, class Tuple>
constexpr decltype(auto) apply(F&& f, Tuple&& t);


[...]

template<class T, class... Types>
constexpr const T& get(const tuple<Types...>& t) noexcept;
template<class T, class... Types>
constexpr const T&& get(const tuple<Types...>&& t) noexcept;


template <typename T, std::size_t N>   // exposition only
constexpr bool is_tuple_element = requires (T t) {
    typename tuple_element_t<N-1, remove_const_t<T>>;
    { get<N-1>(t) } -> convertible_to<tuple_element_t<N-1, T>&>;
} && is_tuple_element<T, N-1>;

template <typename T>
constexpr bool is_tuple_element<T, 0> = true;

template <typename T>
concept tuple-like // exposition only
```

```
    = !is_reference_v<T> && requires  {
    typename tuple_size<T>::type;
    same_as<decltype(tuple_size_v<T>), size_t>;
} && is_tuple_element<T, tuple_size_v<T>>;

template <typename T>
concept pair-like // exposition only
    = tuple-like<T> && std::tuple_size_v<T> == 2;

// [tuple.rel], relational operators
template<class... TTypes, class... UTypes, template<typename...> typename T>
requires tuple-like<T<UTypes...>>
constexpr bool operator==(const tuple<TTypes...>&, const tuple T<UTypes...>&);
template<class... TTypes, class... UTypes, template<typename...> typename T>
requires tuple-like<T<UTypes...>>
constexpr common_comparison_category_t<synth-three-way-result<TTypes, UTypes>...>
operator<=>(const tuple<TTypes...>&, const tuple T<UTypes...>&);

// [tuple.traits], allocator-related traits
template<class... Types, class Alloc>
struct uses_allocator<tuple<Types...>, Alloc>;

}

namespace std {
template<class... Types>
class tuple {
    public:
    // ??, tuple construction
    constexpr explicit(see below) tuple();
    constexpr explicit(see below) tuple(const Types&...);
     // only if sizeof...(Types) >= 1
    template<class... UTypes>
    constexpr explicit(see below) tuple(UTypes&&...);
    // only if sizeof...(Types) >= 1

    tuple(const tuple&) = default;
    tuple(tuple&&) = default;

    template<class... UTypes, template<typename...> typename T>
    requires tuple-like<T<UTypes...>>
    constexpr explicit(see below) tuple(const tuple T<UTypes...>&);
    template<class... UTypes, template<typename...> typename T>
    requires tuple-like<T<UTypes...>>
    constexpr explicit(see below) tuple(tuple T<UTypes...>&&);

    template<class U1, class U2>
    constexpr explicit(see below)
    tuple(const pair<U1, U2>&);   // only if sizeof...(Types) == 2
    template<class U1, class U2>
    constexpr explicit(see below)
    tuple(pair<U1, U2>&&);        // only if sizeof...(Types) == 2
```

```
// allocator-extended constructors
template<class Alloc>
constexpr explicit(see below)
tuple(allocator_arg_t, const Alloc& a);
template<class Alloc>
constexpr explicit(see below)
tuple(allocator_arg_t, const Alloc& a, const Types&...);
template<class Alloc, class... UTypes>
constexpr explicit(see below)
tuple(allocator_arg_t, const Alloc& a, UTypes&&...);
template<class Alloc>
constexpr tuple(allocator_arg_t, const Alloc& a, const tuple&);
template<class Alloc>
constexpr tuple(allocator_arg_t, const Alloc& a, tuple&&);

template<class Alloc, class... UTypes, template<typename...> typename T>
requires tuple-like<T<UTypes...>>
constexpr explicit(see below)
tuple(allocator_arg_t, const Alloc& a, const tuple T<UTypes...>&);

template<class Alloc, class... UTypes, template<typename...> typename T>
requires tuple-like<T<UTypes...>>
constexpr explicit(see below)
tuple(allocator_arg_t, const Alloc& a, tuple T<UTypes...>&&);

template<class Alloc, class U1, class U2>
constexpr explicit(see below)
tuple(allocator_arg_t, const Alloc& a, const pair<U1, U2>&);
template<class Alloc, class U1, class U2>
constexpr explicit(see below)
tuple(allocator_arg_t, const Alloc& a, pair<U1, U2>&&);

// ??, tuple assignment
constexpr tuple& operator=(const tuple&);
constexpr tuple& operator=(tuple&&) noexcept(see below);

template<class... UTypes, template<typename...> typename T>
requires tuple-like<T<UTypes...>>
constexpr tuple& operator=(const tuple T<UTypes...>&);
template<class... UTypes, template<typename...> typename T>
requires tuple-like<T<UTypes...>>
constexpr tuple& operator=(tuple T<UTypes...>&&);

template<class U1, class U2>
constexpr tuple& operator=(const pair<U1, U2>&);
 // only if sizeof...(Types) == 2
template<class U1, class U2>
constexpr tuple& operator=(pair<U1, U2>&&);
// only if sizeof...(Types) == 2
```

```
    // ??, tuple swap
    constexpr void swap(tuple&) noexcept(see below);
};
```

� Construction [tuple.cnstr]

[...]

```
template<class... UTypes, template<typename...> typename T>
requires tuple-like<T<UTypes...>>
constexpr explicit(see below) tuple(const ~~tuple~~ T<UTypes...>& u);
```

Constraints:

- `sizeof...(Types)` equals `sizeof...(UTypes)` and
- `is_constructible_v<T`$_i$`, const U`$_i$`&>` is `true` for all i, and
- either `sizeof...(Types)` is not 1, or (when `Types...` expands to `T` and `UTypes...` expands to `U`) `is_convertible_v<const tuple<U>&, T>`, `is_constructible_v<T, const tuple<U>&>`, and `is_same_v<T, U>` are all `false`.

Effects: Initializes each element of `*this` with the corresponding element of `u`.

Remarks: The expression inside `explicit` is equivalent to:

```
!conjunction_v<is_convertible<const UTypes&, Types>...>
```

```
template<class... UTypes, template<typename...> typename T>
requires tuple-like<T<UTypes...>>
constexpr explicit(see below) tuple(~~tuple~~ T<UTypes...>&& u);
```

Constraints:

- `sizeof...(Types)` equals `sizeof...(UTypes)`, and
- `is_constructible_v<T`$_i$`, U`$_i$`>` is `true` for all i, and
- either `sizeof...(Types)` is not 1, or (when `Types...` expands to `T` and `UTypes...` expands to `U`) `is_convertible_v<tuple<U>, T>`, `is_constructible_v<T, tuple<U>>`, and `is_same_v<T, U>` are all `false`.

Effects: For all i, initializes the i^{th} element of `*this` with `std::forward<U`$_i$`>(get<`i`>(u))`.

Remarks: The expression inside `explicit` is equivalent to:

```
!conjunction_v<is_convertible<UTypes, Types>...>
```

```
template<class U1, class U2> constexpr explicit(see below) tuple(const pair<U1, U2>& u);
```

Constraints:

- `sizeof...(Types)` is 2,

- `is_constructible_v<`T_0`, const U1&>` is `true`, and
- `is_constructible_v<`T_1`, const U2&>` is `true`.

Effects: Initializes the first element with `u.first` and the second element with `u.second`.

The expression inside `explicit` is equivalent to:

```
!is_convertible_v<const U1&, T0> || !is_convertible_v<const U2&, T1>
```

```
template<class U1, class U2> constexpr explicit(see below) tuple(pair<U1, U2>&& u);
```

Constraints:

- `sizeof...(Types)` is 2,
- `is_constructible_v<`T_0`, U1>` is `true`, and
- `is_constructible_v<`T_1`, U2>` is `true`.

Effects: Initializes the first element with `std::forward<U1>(u.first)` and the second element with `std::forward<U2>(u.second)`.

The expression inside `explicit` is equivalent to:

```
!is_convertible_v<U1, T0> || !is_convertible_v<U2, T1>
```

```
template<class Alloc>
constexpr explicit(see below)
tuple(allocator_arg_t, const Alloc& a);
template<class Alloc>
constexpr explicit(see below)
tuple(allocator_arg_t, const Alloc& a, const Types&...);
template<class Alloc, class... UTypes>
constexpr explicit(see below)
tuple(allocator_arg_t, const Alloc& a, UTypes&&...);
template<class Alloc>
constexpr tuple(allocator_arg_t, const Alloc& a, const tuple&);
template<class Alloc>
constexpr tuple(allocator_arg_t, const Alloc& a, tuple&&);
template<class Alloc, class... UTypes, template<typename...> typename T>
requires tuple-like<T<UTypes...>>
constexpr explicit(see below)
tuple(allocator_arg_t, const Alloc& a, const ~~tuple~~ T<UTypes...>&);
template<class Alloc, class... UTypes, template<typename...> typename T>
requires tuple-like<T<UTypes...>>
constexpr explicit(see below)
tuple(allocator_arg_t, const Alloc& a, ~~tuple~~ T<UTypes...>&&);
```

```
template<class Alloc, class U1, class U2>
constexpr explicit(see below)
tuple(allocator_arg_t, const Alloc& a, const pair<U1, U2>&);
```

```
template<class Alloc, class U1, class U2>
constexpr explicit(see below)
tuple(allocator_arg_t, const Alloc& a, pair<U1, U2>&&);
```

Expects: `Alloc` meets the *Cpp17Allocator* requirements ().

Effects: Equivalent to the preceding constructors except that each element is constructed with uses-allocator construction.

� Assignment [tuple.assign]

For each `tuple` assignment operator, an exception is thrown only if the assignment of one of the types in `Types` throws an exception. In the function descriptions that follow, let i be in the range `[0, sizeof...(Types))` in order, T_i be the i^{th} type in `Types`, and U_i be the i^{th} type in a template parameter pack named `UTypes`, where indexing is zero-based.

```
constexpr tuple& operator=(const tuple& u);
```

Effects: Assigns each element of `u` to the corresponding element of `*this`.

Remarks: This operator is defined as deleted unless `is_copy_assignable_v<`T_i`>` is `true` for all i.

Returns: `*this`.

```
constexpr tuple& operator=(tuple&& u) noexcept(see below);
```

Constraints: `is_move_assignable_v<`T_i`>` is `true` for all i.

Effects: For all i, assigns `std::forward<`T_i`>(get<`i`>(u))` to `get<`i`>(*this)`.

Remarks: The expression inside `noexcept` is equivalent to the logical AND of the following expressions:

`is_nothrow_move_assignable_v<`T_i`>`

where T_i is the i^{th} type in `Types`.

Returns: `*this`.

```
template<class... UTypes, template<typename...> typename T>
requires tuple-like<T<UTypes...>>
constexpr tuple& operator=(const tuple T<UTypes...>& u);
```

Constraints:

- `sizeof...(Types)` equals `sizeof...(UTypes)` and
- `is_assignable_v<`T_i`&, const `U_i`&>` is `true` for all i.

Effects: Assigns each element of `u` to the corresponding element of `*this`.

Returns: `*this`.

`template<class... UTypes, template<typename...> typename T>`
`requires tuple-like<T<UTypes...>>`
`constexpr tuple& operator=(`~~`tuple`~~` T<UTypes...>&& u);`

Constraints:

- `sizeof...(Types)` equals `sizeof...(UTypes)` and
- `is_assignable_v<T`$_i$`&, U`$_i$`>` is `true` for all i.

Effects: For all i, assigns `std::forward<U`$_i$`>(get<`i`>(u))` to `get<`i`>(*this)`.

Returns: `*this`.

~~`template<class U1, class U2> constexpr tuple& operator=(const pair<U1, U2>& u);`~~

~~*Constraints:*~~

- ~~`sizeof...(Types)` is 2 and~~
- ~~`is_assignable_v<T`$_0$`&, const U1&>` is `true`, and~~
- ~~`is_assignable_v<T`$_1$`&, const U2&>` is `true`.~~

~~*Effects:* Assigns `u.first` to the first element of `*this` and `u.second` to the second element of `*this`.~~

~~*Returns:* `*this`.~~

~~`template<class U1, class U2> constexpr tuple& operator=(pair<U1, U2>&& u);`~~

~~*Constraints:*~~

- ~~`sizeof...(Types)` is 2 and~~
- ~~`is_assignable_v<T`$_0$`&, U1>` is `true`, and~~
- ~~`is_assignable_v<T`$_1$`&, U2>` is `true`.~~

~~*Effects:* Assigns `std::forward<U1>(u.first)` to the first element of `*this` and `std::forward<U2>(u.second)` to the second element of `*this`.~~

~~*Returns:* `*this`.~~

� Tuple creation functions [tuple.creation]

`template<class... Tuples>`
`requires (tuple-like<std::remove_reference_t<Tuples>>&&...)`
`constexpr tuple<CTypes...> tuple_cat(Tuples&&... tpls);`

In the following paragraphs, let `T`$_i$ be the i^{th} type in `Tuples`, `U`$_i$ be `remove_reference_t<T`$_i$`>`, and `tp`$_i$ be the i^{th} parameter in the function parameter pack `tpls`, where all indexing is zero-based.

Expects: For all i, $\texttt{U}_i$ is the type cv_i $\texttt{tuple<Args}_i\texttt{...>}$, where cv_i is the (possibly empty) i^{th} *cv-qualifier-seq* and $\texttt{Args}_i$ is the template parameter pack representing the element types in $\texttt{U}_i$. Let $\texttt{A}_{ik}$ be the k^{th} type in $\texttt{Args}_i$. For all $\texttt{A}_{ik}$ the following requirements are met:

- If $\texttt{T}_i$ is deduced as an lvalue reference type, then $\texttt{is\_constructible\_v<A}_{ik}\texttt{,}$ cv_i $\texttt{A}_{ik}\texttt{\&>}$ `== true`, otherwise
- $\texttt{is\_constructible\_v<A}_{ik}\texttt{,}$ cv_i $\texttt{A}_{ik}\texttt{\&\&>}$ `== true`.

Remarks: The types in `CTypes` are equal to the ordered sequence of the extended types $\texttt{Args}_0\texttt{...}$, $\texttt{Args}_1\texttt{...}$, `...`, $\texttt{Args}_{n-1}\texttt{...}$, where n is equal to `sizeof...(Tuples)`. Let $\texttt{e}_i\texttt{...}$ be the i^{th} ordered sequence of tuple elements of the resulting `tuple` object corresponding to the type sequence $\texttt{Args}_i$.

Returns: A `tuple` object constructed by initializing the $k_i{}^{\text{th}}$ type element $\texttt{e}_{ik}$ in $\texttt{e}_i\texttt{...}$ with

```
get<k_i>(std::forward<T_i>(tp_i))
```

for each valid k_i and each group $\texttt{e}_i$ in order.

[*Note:* An implementation may support additional types in the template parameter pack `Tuples` that support the `tuple`-like protocol, such as `pair` and `array`. — *end note*]

� Relational operators [tuple.rel]

```
template<class... TTypes, class... UTypes, template<typename...> typename T>
requires tuple-like<T<UTypes...>>
constexpr bool operator==(const tuple<TTypes...>& t, ~~tuple~~ T<UTypes...>& u);
```

Mandates: For all `i`, where $0 \leq$ `i` $<$ `sizeof...(TTypes)`, `get<i>(t) == get<i>(u)` is a valid expression returning a type that is convertible to `bool`. `sizeof...(TTypes)` equals `sizeof...(UTypes)`.

Returns: `true` if `get<i>(t) == get<i>(u)` for all `i`, otherwise `false`. For any two zero-length tuples `e` and `f`, `e == f` returns `true`.

Effects: The elementary comparisons are performed in order from the zeroth index upwards. No comparisons or element accesses are performed after the first equality comparison that evaluates to `false`.

```
template<class... TTypes, class... UTypes, template<typename...> typename T>
requires tuple-like<T<UTypes...>>
constexpr common_comparison_category_t<synth-three-way-result<TTypes, UTypes>...>
operator<=>(const tuple<TTypes...>& t, const ~~tuple~~ T<UTypes...>& u);
```

Effects: Performs a lexicographical comparison between `t` and `u`. For any two zero-length tuples `t` and `u`, `t <=> u` returns `strong_ordering::equal`. Otherwise, equivalent to:

```
if (auto c = synth-three-way(get<0>(t), get<0>(u)); c != 0) return c;
return t_tail <=> u_tail;
```

where $\mathtt{r}_{\text{tail}}$ for some tuple `r` is a tuple containing all but the first element of `r`.

[*Note:* The above definition does not require $\mathtt{t}_{\text{tail}}$ (or $\mathtt{u}_{\text{tail}}$) to be constructed. It may not even be possible, as `t` and `u` are not required to be copy constructible. Also, all comparison functions are short circuited; they do not perform element accesses beyond what is required to determine the result of the comparison. — *end note*]

� Range utilities [range.utility]

� Sub-ranges [range.subrange]

The `subrange` class template combines together an iterator and a sentinel into a single object that models the `view` concept. Additionally, it models the `sized_range` concept when the final template parameter is `subrange_kind::sized`.

```
namespace std::ranges {
    template<class From, class To>
    concept convertible-to-non-slicing =                    // exposition only
    convertible_to<From, To> &&
    !(is_pointer_v<decay_t<From>> &&
    is_pointer_v<decay_t<To>> &&
    not-same-as<remove_pointer_t<decay_t<From>>, remove_pointer_t<decay_t<To>>>);

    template<class T>
    concept pair-like =                                     // exposition only
    !is_reference_v<T> && requires(T t) {
        typename tuple_size<T>::type;                       // ensures tuple_size<T> is complete
        requires derived_from<tuple_size<T>, integral_constant<size_t, 2>>;
        typename tuple_element_t<0, remove_const_t<T>>;
        typename tuple_element_t<1, remove_const_t<T>>;
        { get<0>(t) } -> convertible_to<const tuple_element_t<0, T>&>;
        { get<1>(t) } -> convertible_to<const tuple_element_t<1, T>&>;
    };

    template<class T, class U, class V>
    concept pair-like-convertible-from =                    // exposition only
    !range<T> && pair-like<T> &&
    constructible_from<T, U, V> &&
    convertible-to-non-slicing<U, tuple_element_t<0, T>> &&
    convertible_to<V, tuple_element_t<1, T>>;
```

� Elements view [range.elements]

� Class template `elements_view` [range.elements.view]

```
namespace std::ranges {
    template<class T, size_t N>
    concept has-tuple-element =                   // exposition only
```

```
    tuple-like<T> && tuple_size_v<T> < N;
    requires(T t) {
      typename tuple_size<T>::type;
      requires N < tuple_size_v<T>;
      typename tuple_element_t<N, T>;
      { get<N>(t) } -> convertible_to<const tuple_element_t<N, T>&>;
  };
```

Acknowledgments

References

[N4861] Richard Smith *Working Draft, Standard for Programming Language C++*
https://wg21.link/N4861