

On page pp543, the relation

$$\frac{\partial}{\partial x'^\alpha} = \frac{\partial x'^\beta}{\partial x'^\alpha} \frac{\partial}{\partial x^\beta}, \quad (1)$$

is obtained straightforwardly by applying the partial derivative chain rule with respect to the coordinate transformation $x \leftrightarrow x'$, and this has the form given in (11.62) which indicates that $\partial/\partial x^\alpha$ is a covariant vector operator.

But the proof of the dual relationship

$$\frac{\partial}{\partial x'_\alpha} = \frac{\partial x'^\alpha}{\partial x^\beta} \frac{\partial}{\partial x^\beta} \quad (2)$$

which would have matched (11.61) and indicated that the operator $\partial/\partial x_\alpha$ is a *contravariant* vector operator, is not given in the text. We shall prove this here.

First observe that chain rule implies

$$\frac{\partial}{\partial x'_\alpha} = \frac{\partial x'^\beta}{\partial x'_\alpha} \frac{\partial}{\partial x'^\beta} \quad (3)$$

but from (11.73)

$$x'^\beta = g'^{\beta\alpha} x'_\alpha = g'^{\alpha\beta} x'_\alpha \quad (4)$$

so (3) can be written as

$$\frac{\partial}{\partial x'_\alpha} = g'^{\alpha\beta} \frac{\partial}{\partial x'^\beta}, \quad (5)$$

Since $g'^{\alpha\beta}$ is a rank-2 contravariant tensor, we can express it in terms of the unprimed counterpart (see (11.63))

$$g'^{\alpha\beta} = \frac{\partial x'^\alpha}{\partial x^\gamma} \frac{\partial x'^\beta}{\partial x^\delta} g^{\gamma\delta} \quad (6)$$

Also, we use the fact that $\partial/\partial x'^\beta$ is a contravariant vector operator to write it as (following (1))

$$\frac{\partial}{\partial x'^\beta} = \frac{\partial x^\mu}{\partial x'^\beta} \frac{\partial}{\partial x^\mu} \quad (7)$$

Plugging (6) and (7) into (5) proves (2)

$$\begin{aligned} \frac{\partial}{\partial x'_\alpha} &= \frac{\partial x'^\alpha}{\partial x^\gamma} \frac{\partial x'^\beta}{\partial x^\delta} g^{\gamma\delta} \frac{\partial x^\mu}{\partial x'^\beta} \frac{\partial}{\partial x^\mu} \\ &= \frac{\partial x'^\alpha}{\partial x^\gamma} g^{\gamma\delta} \underbrace{\left(\frac{\partial x'^\beta}{\partial x^\delta} \frac{\partial x^\mu}{\partial x'^\beta} \right)}_{\partial/\partial x^\delta} \frac{\partial}{\partial x^\mu} \\ &= \frac{\partial x'^\alpha}{\partial x^\gamma} g^{\gamma\delta} \frac{\partial}{\partial x^\delta} \\ &= \frac{\partial x'^\alpha}{\partial x^\gamma} \frac{\partial}{\partial x_\gamma} \end{aligned} \quad \begin{array}{l} \text{apply (5) to unprimed coordinates} \\ \\ \end{array} \quad (8)$$