

### 1. Expansion of Green function from first principles

Treat  $G(\mathbf{x}, \mathbf{x}')$  as a function of  $\mathbf{x}'$ , and expand it into spherical harmonic basis

$$G(\mathbf{x}, \mathbf{x}') = \sum_{l=0}^{\infty} \sum_{m=-l}^l R_{lm}(\mathbf{x}; r') Y_{lm}(\theta', \phi') \quad (1)$$

Taking the Laplacian with respect to  $\mathbf{x}'$  yields

$$\nabla'^2 G = \sum_{l=0}^{\infty} \sum_{m=-l}^l \left[ \frac{1}{r'^2} \frac{\partial}{\partial r'} \left( r'^2 \frac{\partial R_{lm}}{\partial r'} \right) \right] Y_{lm} + R_{lm} \nabla'^2_{\theta', \phi'} Y_{lm} \quad (2)$$

where  $\nabla'^2_{\theta', \phi'}$  is the angular components of the Laplacian  $\nabla'^2$ , for which the spherical harmonics satisfy the differential equation

$$\nabla'^2_{\theta', \phi'} Y_{lm} = -\frac{l(l+1)}{r'^2} Y_{lm} \quad (3)$$

Thus from (2), (3) we have

$$\begin{aligned} \nabla'^2 G &= \sum_{l=0}^{\infty} \sum_{m=-l}^l \left[ \frac{1}{r'^2} \frac{\partial}{\partial r'} \left( r'^2 \frac{\partial R_{lm}}{\partial r'} \right) - \frac{l(l+1)}{r'^2} R_{lm} \right] Y_{lm} = -4\pi \delta(\mathbf{x} - \mathbf{x}') \\ &= -4\pi \frac{\delta(r - r')}{r'^2} \delta(\phi - \phi') \delta(\cos \theta - \cos \theta') \end{aligned} \quad (4)$$

(It is worth noting that the Green function Laplacian relation has been defined to be with respect to  $\mathbf{x}'$  instead of  $\mathbf{x}$ . In the past notes, since we have been dealing with Dirichlet boundary conditions where  $G(\mathbf{x}, \mathbf{x}')$  is symmetric in the arguments, we could use  $\nabla^2$  and  $\nabla'^2$  interchangeably. But for Neumann boundary conditions, Green function is not generally symmetric, we must stick to  $\nabla'^2$ .)

Since (see (3.56))

$$\sum_{l=0}^{\infty} \sum_{m=-l}^l Y_{lm}^*(\theta, \phi) Y_{lm}(\theta', \phi') = \delta(\phi - \phi') \delta(\cos \theta - \cos \theta') \quad (5)$$

We write

$$R_{lm}(\mathbf{x}; r') = h_l(r, r') Y_{lm}^*(\theta, \phi) \quad (6)$$

to turn (4) into

$$\sum_{l=0}^{\infty} \left[ \frac{1}{r'^2} \frac{\partial}{\partial r'} \left( r'^2 \frac{\partial h_l}{\partial r'} \right) - \frac{l(l+1)}{r'^2} h_l \right] \sum_{m=-l}^l Y_{lm}^*(\theta, \phi) Y_{lm}(\theta', \phi') = -4\pi \frac{\delta(r - r')}{r'^2} \delta(\phi - \phi') \delta(\cos \theta - \cos \theta') \quad (7)$$

Thus we want to find  $h_l(r, r')$  satisfying

$$\frac{\partial}{\partial r'} \left( r'^2 \frac{\partial h_l}{\partial r'} \right) - l(l+1) h_l = -4\pi \delta(r - r') \quad (8)$$

If we scale  $h_l(r, r')$  such that

$$g_l(r, r') \equiv \frac{2l+1}{4\pi} h_l(r, r') \quad (9)$$

then by the addition theorem of spherical harmonics, we can write the Green function as

$$G(\mathbf{x}, \mathbf{x}') = \sum_{l=0}^{\infty} g_l(r, r') \left[ \frac{4\pi}{2l+1} \sum_{m=-l}^l Y_{lm}^*(\theta, \phi) Y_{lm}(\theta', \phi') \right] = \sum_{l=0}^{\infty} g_l(r, r') P_l(\cos \gamma) \quad (10)$$

which is the hinted form given by the problem statement.

With (9) substituted into (8), we have the differential equation for  $g_l$ :

$$\frac{\partial}{\partial r'} \left( r'^2 \frac{\partial g_l}{\partial r'} \right) - l(l+1)g_l = -(2l+1)\delta(r-r') \quad (11)$$

which admits general form when  $r \neq r'$ , with the coefficients as function of  $r$  and to be determined:

$$g_l(r, r') = \begin{cases} Ar'^l + Br'^{-(l+1)} & \text{for } r' < r \\ Cr'^l + Dr'^{-(l+1)} & \text{for } r' > r \end{cases} \quad (12)$$

Integrating (11) over the infinitesimal range  $[r - \epsilon, r + \epsilon]$  gives

$$r'^2 \frac{\partial g_l}{\partial r'} \Big|_{r+\epsilon} - r'^2 \frac{\partial g_l}{\partial r'} \Big|_{r-\epsilon} = -(2l+1) \quad (13)$$

## 2. Radial boundary condition of $g_l(r, r')$

The general Neumann boundary condition is given by

$$\oint_S \frac{\partial G}{\partial n'} da' = -4\pi \quad (14)$$

of which a special case is prescribed as equation (1.45)

$$\frac{\partial G(\mathbf{x}, \mathbf{x}')}{\partial n'} = -\frac{4\pi}{S} \quad (15)$$

It is a special case since we impose an additional restriction that every point on  $S$  has the same normal gradient.

We are going to impose (15) to our Green function (10):

$$-\frac{4\pi}{S} = -\frac{1}{a^2 + b^2} = \frac{\partial G(\mathbf{x}, \mathbf{x}')}{\partial n'} = \begin{cases} \sum_{l=0}^{\infty} \frac{\partial g_l(r, r')}{\partial r'} \cdot P_l(\cos \gamma) & \text{for } \mathbf{x}' \text{ on outer shell} \\ \sum_{l=0}^{\infty} -\frac{\partial g_l(r, r')}{\partial r'} \cdot P_l(\cos \gamma) & \text{for } \mathbf{x}' \text{ on inner shell} \end{cases} \quad (16)$$

By orthogonality of Legendre basis, we can conclude

$$\frac{\partial g_l(r, r')}{\partial r'} \Big|_{r'=a \text{ or } b} = \begin{cases} 0 & \text{for } l > 0 \\ \frac{1}{a^2 + b^2} \text{ or } -\frac{1}{a^2 + b^2} & \text{for } l = 0 \end{cases} \quad (17)$$

## 3. Solution to part (a)

To find  $g_l(r, r')$  for  $l > 0$ , we will apply the following constraints to determine the coefficients in (12):

(a) Neumann condition (17) on the inner and outer spheres:

$$\frac{\partial g_l(r, r')}{\partial r'} \Big|_{r'=a} = lAa^{l-1} - (l+1)Ba^{-(l+2)} = 0 \quad (18)$$

$$\frac{\partial g_l(r, r')}{\partial r'} \Big|_{r'=b} = lCb^{l-1} - (l+1)Db^{-(l+2)} = 0 \quad (19)$$

(b) Continuity at  $r' = r$ :

$$Ar^l + Br^{-(l+1)} = Cr^l + Dr^{-(l+1)} \quad (20)$$

(c) Discontinuity of derivative at  $r' = r$  (13):

$$lCr^{l+1} - (l+1)Dr^{-l} - lAr^{l+1} + (l+1)Br^{-l} = -(2l+1) \quad (21)$$

From (18), (19):

$$B = \frac{l}{l+1} a^{2l+1} A \quad (22)$$

$$D = \frac{l}{l+1} b^{2l+1} C \quad (23)$$

From (20):

$$D - B = r^{2l+1}(A - C) \quad (24)$$

From (21):

$$\begin{aligned} l(A - C)r^{l+1} + (l+1)(D - B)r^{-l} &= 2l + 1 && \text{by (24)} && \implies \\ (2l+1)(A - C)r^{l+1} &= 2l + 1 && && \implies \\ A - C &= r^{-(l+1)} && \text{by (24)} && \implies \end{aligned} \quad (25)$$

$$D - B = r^l \quad (26)$$

Inserting (22), (23), (25) into (26) gives

$$\frac{l}{l+1} \{b^{2l+1}[A - r^{-(l+1)}] - a^{2l+1}A\} = r^l \quad \implies$$

$$(b^{2l+1} - a^{2l+1})A = \frac{l+1}{l} r^l + \frac{b^{2l+1}}{r^{l+1}} \quad \implies$$

$$A = \frac{1}{b^{2l+1} - a^{2l+1}} \left( \frac{l+1}{l} r^l + \frac{b^{2l+1}}{r^{l+1}} \right) \quad \text{by (22)} \quad \implies \quad (27)$$

$$B = \frac{1}{b^{2l+1} - a^{2l+1}} \left[ a^{2l+1} r^l + \frac{l}{l+1} \frac{(ab)^{2l+1}}{r^{l+1}} \right] \quad \text{by (26)} \quad \implies \quad (28)$$

$$D = \frac{1}{b^{2l+1} - a^{2l+1}} \left[ b^{2l+1} r^l + \frac{l}{l+1} \frac{(ab)^{2l+1}}{r^{l+1}} \right] \quad \text{by (23)} \quad \implies \quad (29)$$

$$C = \frac{1}{b^{2l+1} - a^{2l+1}} \left( \frac{l+1}{l} r^l + \frac{a^{2l+1}}{r^{l+1}} \right) \quad (30)$$

Going back to (12), we obtain  $g_l(r, r')$  for  $l > 0$ :

$$\begin{aligned} g_l(r, r') &= \begin{cases} \frac{1}{b^{2l+1} - a^{2l+1}} \left[ \frac{l+1}{l} (rr')^l + b^{2l+1} \frac{r'^l}{r^{l+1}} + a^{2l+1} \frac{r^l}{r'^{l+1}} + \frac{l}{l+1} \frac{(ab)^{2l+1}}{(rr')^{l+1}} \right] & \text{for } r' < r \\ \frac{1}{b^{2l+1} - a^{2l+1}} \left[ \frac{l+1}{l} (rr')^l + a^{2l+1} \frac{r'^l}{r^{l+1}} + b^{2l+1} \frac{r^l}{r'^{l+1}} + \frac{l}{l+1} \frac{(ab)^{2l+1}}{(rr')^{l+1}} \right] & \text{for } r' > r \end{cases} \\ &= \frac{r^l}{r'^{l+1}} + \frac{1}{b^{2l+1} - a^{2l+1}} \left[ \frac{l+1}{l} (rr')^l + \frac{l}{l+1} \frac{(ab)^{2l+1}}{(rr')^{l+1}} + a^{2l+1} \left( \frac{r^l}{r'^{l+1}} + \frac{r'^l}{r^{l+1}} \right) \right] \end{aligned} \quad (31)$$

Take a note of the symmetry in  $r, r'$ , we will discuss in more details in the last section.

#### 4. Solution to part (b)

Let's apply the same constraints for  $g_0(r, r')$  in form (12):

(a) Neumann condition (17):

$$\left. \frac{\partial g_l(r, r')}{\partial r'} \right|_{r'=a} = -\frac{B}{a^2} = \frac{1}{a^2 + b^2} \quad \implies \quad B = -\frac{a^2}{a^2 + b^2} \quad (32)$$

$$\left. \frac{\partial g_l(r, r')}{\partial r'} \right|_{r'=b} = -\frac{D}{b^2} = -\frac{1}{a^2 + b^2} \quad \implies \quad D = \frac{b^2}{a^2 + b^2} \quad (33)$$

(b) Continuity at  $r' = r$ :

$$A + \frac{B}{r} = C + \frac{D}{r} \quad (34)$$

(c) Discontinuity of derivative at  $r' = r$  (13):

$$-D + B = -1 \quad (35)$$

We see that (35) is redundant given (32), (33), so we have an underconstrained system. We can arbitrarily set

$$C = f(r) \quad \text{and thus} \quad A = f(r) + \frac{1}{r} \quad (36)$$

In summary

$$\begin{aligned} g_0(r, r') &= \begin{cases} f(r) + \frac{1}{r} - \left( \frac{a^2}{a^2 + b^2} \right) \frac{1}{r'} & \text{for } r' < r \\ f(r) + \left( \frac{b^2}{a^2 + b^2} \right) \frac{1}{r'} & \text{for } r' > r \end{cases} \\ &= \frac{1}{r} - \left( \frac{a^2}{a^2 + b^2} \right) \frac{1}{r'} + f(r) \end{aligned} \quad (37)$$

The fact that  $f(r)$  will not affect the potential calculation is proved in a similar way to Prob 1.14, where  $f(r)$  can be taken out of the integral in  $d^3x'$  and  $da'$ , and use Gauss's theorem to show its contribution to  $\Phi(\mathbf{x})$  is zero.

### 5. Symmetry of Neumann Green function $G(\mathbf{x}, \mathbf{x}')$ in $\mathbf{x}, \mathbf{x}'$

In general, Neumann Green functions are not necessarily symmetric in their arguments  $\mathbf{x}, \mathbf{x}'$ , but in problem (1.14) we have proved that

$$H(\mathbf{x}, \mathbf{x}') = G(\mathbf{x}, \mathbf{x}') - F(\mathbf{x}) \quad \text{where} \quad F(\mathbf{x}) = \frac{1}{S} \oint_S G(\mathbf{x}, \mathbf{x}') da' \quad (38)$$

is symmetric in  $\mathbf{x}, \mathbf{x}'$ , i.e.,  $H(\mathbf{x}, \mathbf{x}') = H(\mathbf{x}', \mathbf{x})$ .

Form (10) gives rise to

$$\begin{aligned} H(\mathbf{x}, \mathbf{x}') &= G(\mathbf{x}, \mathbf{x}') - \frac{1}{S} \oint_S \sum_{l=0}^{\infty} g_l(r, r') P_l(\cos \gamma) da' \\ &= G(\mathbf{x}, \mathbf{x}') - \frac{1}{4\pi(a^2 + b^2)} \sum_{l=0}^{\infty} \int_0^{2\pi} d\phi' \int_0^{\pi} \sin \theta' d\theta' [g_l(r, a) a^2 + g_l(r, b) b^2] P_l(\cos \gamma) \end{aligned} \quad (39)$$

Using the addition theorem, we can calculate the angular integral

$$\begin{aligned} \int_0^{2\pi} d\phi' \int_0^{\pi} \sin \theta' d\theta' P_l(\cos \gamma) &= \frac{4\pi}{2l+1} \sum_{m=-l}^l Y_{lm}^*(\theta, \phi) \int_0^{2\pi} d\phi' \int_0^{\pi} \sin \theta' d\theta' \underbrace{\sqrt{\frac{2l+1}{4\pi}} e^{im\phi'} P_l^m(\cos \theta')}_{Y_{lm}(\theta', \phi')} \\ &= \sqrt{\frac{4\pi}{2l+1}} \sum_{m=-l}^l Y_{lm}^*(\theta, \phi) 2\pi \delta_{m0} \int_0^{\pi} \sin \theta' d\theta' P_l^m(\cos \theta') \\ &= \sqrt{\frac{4\pi}{2l+1}} Y_{l0}^*(\theta, \phi) 2\pi \int_{-1}^1 dx P_l(x) \\ &= \sqrt{\frac{4\pi}{2l+1}} Y_{l0}^*(\theta, \phi) 4\pi \delta_{l0} = 4\pi \delta_{l0} \end{aligned} \quad (40)$$

which turns (39) into

$$\begin{aligned} H(\mathbf{x}, \mathbf{x}') &= G(\mathbf{x}, \mathbf{x}') - \underbrace{\frac{g_0(r, a) a^2 + g_0(r, b) b^2}{a^2 + b^2}}_{\equiv \bar{g}_0(r)} \\ &= g_0(r, r') - \bar{g}_0(r) + \sum_{l=1}^{\infty} g_l(r, r') P_l(\cos \gamma) \end{aligned} \quad (41)$$

Then the symmetry  $H(\mathbf{x}, \mathbf{x}') = H(\mathbf{x}', \mathbf{x})$  implies

$$g_0(r, r') - \bar{g}_0(r) + \sum_{l=1}^{\infty} g_l(r, r') P_l(\cos \gamma) = g_0(r', r) - \bar{g}_0(r') + \sum_{l=1}^{\infty} g_l(r', r) P_l(\cos \gamma') \quad (42)$$

where

$$\cos \gamma = \sin \theta \sin \theta' \cos(\phi - \phi') + \cos \theta \cos \theta' \quad (43)$$

and  $\cos \gamma'$  is obtained from  $\cos \gamma$  by the exchange  $\theta \leftrightarrow \theta', \phi \leftrightarrow \phi'$ , which gives the same value as  $\cos \gamma$ .

Applying the orthogonality of Legendre basis to (42) yields

$$g_0(r, r') - \overline{g_0}(r) = g_0(r', r) - \overline{g_0}(r') \quad (44)$$

$$g_l(r, r') = g_l(r', r) \quad \text{for } l > 0 \quad (45)$$

This shows explicitly that  $g_l(r, r')$  is symmetric for  $l > 0$ , and we can choose  $f(r) = -\overline{g_0}(r)$  to make  $g_0(r, r')$  symmetric. In particular, for (37), we end up with

$$f(r) = -\overline{g_0}(r) = -\left(\frac{a^2}{a^2 + b^2}\right)\frac{1}{r} + C \quad (46)$$

Ignoring the inconsequential constant  $C$ , we end up with a symmetric  $g_0$ :

$$g_0(r, r') = \left(\frac{b^2}{a^2 + b^2}\right)\frac{1}{r_{>}} - \left(\frac{a^2}{a^2 + b^2}\right)\frac{1}{r_{<}} \quad (47)$$