

David Thomas and Barbara Roggema (eds.), with Juan Pedro Monferrer Sala, Johannes Pahlitzsch, Mark Swanson, Herman Teule, and John Tolan, *Christian-Muslim Relations. A Bibliographic History. Volume 1 (600-900)* (History of Christian-Muslim Relations 11; Leiden – Boston: Brill, 2009). Hardback. 944 pp; \$310.00.

AARON MICHAEL BUTTS, YALE UNIVERSITY

The volume under review is the first part of a general survey of written sources on Christian-Muslim relations from 600 to the present day. This first volume deals with the period of 600-900, and subsequent volumes will follow treating 900-1050 (vol. 2), 1050-1200 (vol. 3), 1200-1350 (vol. 4), etc. In addition to appearing in print form, all of the volumes are available in an online edition, which will continue to be updated with corrections and new bibliography.¹⁴ If this first volume is any indication of what is to come, this multi-volume work is destined to be an indispensable reference tool for all scholars working on Christian-Muslim relations.

The bulk of the volume under review consists of more than two hundred entries dedicated to works on Christian-Muslim relations from 600 to 900. The criteria for inclusion of a work are defined as follows: “inclusion was decided according to whether a work is written substantially about or against the other faith, or contains significant information or judgments that cast light on attitudes of one faith towards the other” (p. viii). The entries aim to cover exhaustively all of the relevant recorded works, whether extant or not. The majority of the entries deal with works written in Arabic, Greek, and Syriac though there are also entries for works in Armenian, Coptic, Georgian, Latin, and Old Church Slavonic.

All of the entries strictly follow the same template. Each begins with a section on the author, which provides the author’s name, date of birth, place of birth, date of death, place of death, a biography, and bibliography (divided into primary sources and secondary sources). This section on the author is not meant to be exhaustive, but rather it “contains sufficient information for a reader to pursue further details about the author and his general activities” (p. ix). The author sections, then, serve as a useful

¹⁴ <<http://referenceworks.brillonline.com/browse/christian-muslim-relations>> (accessed 5.29.2012).

encyclopedia-type resource with ample references, especially for the primary sources. In fact, on more than one occasion, this reviewer has consulted the volume only to read one of these biographies. Thus, the volume functions as a useful reference work even when one is not at that moment working on Christian-Muslim relations.

Following the section on the author, lemmata are given for each work by the author that deals directly with Christian-Muslim relations. Each lemma provides the title of the work, date, original language, description, significance, manuscripts, editions and translations, and bibliography. This section of each entry is intended to be exhaustive in having a lemma for every recorded work, whether surviving or lost. When pushed to its logical conclusion, this exhaustive approach is at times trying for the reader: the *al-Radd 'alā l-thalāth firaq min al-Naṣārā* 'The refutation of the three Christian sects' by Abū 'Īsā l-Warrāq (pp. 698-700), for instance, receives three different lemmata based solely on Ibn al-Nadīm's mention of three versions/recensions (long, medium, and short). In general, however, the exhaustiveness of the lemmata is a strength of the volume. Many of the lemmata go well beyond the typical summary of scholarship that one finds in a reference work of this type and present the results of fresh research. This is nowhere more obvious than in the fact that a number of unedited texts receive lemmata. Among the many positive attributes of the lemmata, the inclusion of the relevant manuscripts and the exhaustive bibliography are especially appreciated. The thoroughness of the lemmata can be exemplified by Lamoreaux's treatment of Theodore Abū Qurra, which extends more than fifty pages (pp. 439-491), includes more than six pages of bibliography on the author, and provides details on numerous unedited works, in Greek and Arabic, that are not otherwise available.

The entries in the bibliographic survey are organized chronologically. This has its advantages and disadvantages. On the positive side, the organization of the volume allows for an insightful diachronic picture of Christian-Muslim relations that highlights new developments and changes across time. This picture is especially sharp if one reads through the entire volume sequentially. On the negative side, however, the organization is a significant hindrance to locating entries since so many of the authors and texts can only be approximately dated. In fact, this

reviewer finds it impossible to locate any entry without referring to the index.

In addition to the entries dedicated to individual works, the volume begins with six introductory essays that are intended to cover works that do not fit easily within the format of the bibliographic survey: Jaakko Hämmen-Anttila, "Christians and Christianity in the Qur'ān" (21-30), Claude Gilliot, "Christians and Christianity in Islamic exegesis" (31-56), Suleiman A. Mourad, "Christians and Christianity in the *Sīra* of Muḥammad" (57-71), David Cook, "Christians and Christianity in *ḥadīth* works before 900" (73-82), David M. Freidenreich, "Muslims in canon law, 650-1000" (83-98), and David M. Freidenreich, "Christians in early and classical Sunnī law" (99-114). Each of these essays provides a good summary of the *status quaestionis* of scholarship on its particular topic.

The editors have taken great care to make the volume accessible to as wide a readership as possible. For this, they are certainly to be thanked. Thus, almost all foreign titles and words in the volume are translated. An (unnecessary) exception is, however, made for several quotations in Latin: *in partibus Spaniensis provinciae* (p. 340), *gens nefandissima paganorum* (p. 643), *Sarracenis perfidis Deoque contrariis* (p. 643), *Satane filii* (p. 643; presumably for *Satan[a]e filii*), *gens illa pestifer* (p. 643), *s[a]eva gens* (p. 643). In addition, all texts in non-Latin script are given in transliteration only. The transliteration systems are not explained, but they are mostly self-evident. Setting aside Syriac for the moment, the transliteration is generally accurate, though a few minor slips were spotted, e.g., Arabic *ta'riḳh* > *ta'riḳb* (p. 306) and Arabic *waḥdaniyyat* > *waḥdāniyyat* (p. 793).

The transliteration of Syriac presents more serious difficulties. In general, the East-Syriac vowel system is used, though occasionally West-Syriac vowels appear without explanation, e.g., *malpōnō* (p. 567 [biṣ]), Tell-Maḥroyo (p. 622), Suryōyē (p. 623). More problematic is the representation of the vowels themselves, in particular the use of a macron with *i*, *u*, and *o*. Throughout the volume, there does not seem to be any rationale for the use of *i* vs. *ī*, *u* vs. *ū*, and *o* vs. *ō*; compare, e.g., *i* vs. *ī* in *amirā* (p. 782) vs. *'amirā* (p. 522); *awḳit* (p. 134) vs. *awḳīt* (p. 186); *dileh* vs. *dileb* (p. 522, one word apart!); *qaddishā/ē* (pp. 152, 315; 689 [biṣ]) vs. *qaddishā/ē* (pp. 186, 222, 892); *tash'itā* (p. 600) vs. *tash'itā* (pp. 186, 892); *u* vs. *ū* in *malḳutā* (p. 239), *makṭbānut* (p. 231), *mdabbrānuteh* (p. 242) vs.

haymānūtā (p. 522); and *o* vs. *ō* in Tell-Maḥroyo (p. 622) vs. Suryōyē. Given that length is not phonemic with vowels in Syriac, it would have been far preferable to use *i*, *u*, and *o* without macron in all cases. In addition, there are a number of other inconsistencies in the transliteration of Syriac. The reduced vowel schwa is not normally indicated, but seems to be represented in *mahpekin* > *mahpkin* (p. 744). Consonantal (including diphthongs) *waw* and *yod* are usually represented as *w* and *y*, respectively, but occasionally also as *u* and *i*, e.g., *Yaunāyē* (p. 164), *mār(i)* (p. 186), *gehānan(hy)* (p. 222), *Kristiānē* (p. 745). Word initial *ʾālep* is not usually marked, but is in *ʾamīrā* (p. 522). Consonantal gemination is usually marked, but at times it is not, e.g., *medem* > *meddem* (p. 130); *meṭul* > *meṭṭul* (p. 158); *malpānā* > *mallpānā* (pp. 160, 343, 344 [*bis*]); *mdī(n)tā* > *mdī(n)ttā*, or better *mdī(n)ttā* (p. 186); *kūlāh* > *kūllāh*, or better *kullāh* (p. 188); *ʾameh* > *ʾammeh* (p. 239); *ʾeltā* > *ʾelltā* (pp. 401; 595); *shūʾālā* > *shūʾālā*, or better *shuʾālā* (p. 522; compare *shaʾel* on p. 744); *pūnāy* > *pūnnāy*, or better *punnāy* (p. 522); *apaybun* > *appaybun* (p. 744). Fricativization (*rukkākā* and *qushshāyā*) is not usually marked, but occasionally it is, e.g., *sulughismē* (p. 504). Finally, there are a number of errors: *ʾālmānyātā* > *ʾālmānāyātā* (p. 130); *min* > *men* (pp. 158, 744); *qāddishā* > *qaddishā* (p. 160); *lūttā* > *lawttā* (p. 403); *mbaym(n)ē* > *mbaymnē* (p. 506); *mammlā* > *mamillā* (p. 744); *saggiʾay* > *saggiʾay* (p. 744); *ḥadtē* > *ḥa(d)ttē* (p. 745); *ḥanpē* > *ḥanpē* (p. 745). The large number of problems with the transliteration of Syriac mars an otherwise most welcome inclusion of Syriac sources in the volume.

While the entire volume will be of interest to scholars in the field of Syriac Studies, it should be pointed out that there are a large number of entries dedicated specifically to authors and texts belonging to the Syriac tradition. As a future reference, it may be worth concluding with a list of these:

- ʾAbdishūʾ ibn Bahrīz (Church of the East; Swanson, 550-552)
- Abū l-ʾAbbās ʾĪsā ibn Zayd (Church of the East; Swanson, 857-858)
- Abū l-Faḍl ʾAlī ibn Rabban al-Naṣrānī (Church of the East; Swanson, 652-653)
- Abū l-Faraj Saʾīd ibn ʾAlī l-Anbārī (Church of the East; Swanson, 859-860)
- Abū l-Khayr ʾĪsā ibn Hibat Allāh (Church of the East; Swanson, 861-862)
- Abū Nūḥ al-Anbārī (Church of the East; Swanson, 397-400)

- Abū Rā'īṭa l-Takrītī (Syriac Orthodox; Toenies Keating, 567-581)
- Affair of the death of Muḥammad* (Roggema, 401-402)
- Affair of the Qur'an* (Roggema, 595-596)
- al-Jāmi' wujūh al-imān* (Melkite; Swanson, 791-798)
- 'Ammār al-Baṣṭī (Church of the East; Beaumont, 604-610)
- Apocalypse of Pseudo-Ephrem* (Suermann, 160-162)
- Apocalypse of Pseudo-Ezra* (Debié, 239-241)
- Apocalypse of Pseudo-Methodius* (Greisiger, 163-171)
- Athanasius of Balad (Syriac Orthodox; Teule, 157-159)
- Christological discussion* (Toenies Keating, 553-555)
- Chronicle of Khuzistan* (Teule, 130-132)
- Confession which Ka'b al-Aḥbār handed down to the Ishmaelites* (Roggema, 403-405)
- Debate between Israel of Kashkar and al-Sarakhṣī* (Roggema, 840-843)
- Debate of Theodore Abū Qurra* (Bertaina, 556-564)
- Dionysius of Tell-Maḥrē (Syriac Orthodox; Teule, 622-626)
- Disputation between a monk of Bēt Ḥālē and an Arab Notable* (Roggema, 268-273)
- Disputation of John and the Emir* (Roggema, 782-785)
- Disputation of the monk Ibrāhīm al-Ṭabarānī* (Melkite; Swanson, 876-881)
- Edessene Apocalypse* (Greisiger, 172-175)
- Fī tatblīth Allāh al-wāḥid* (Melkite; Swanson, 330-333)
- Giwarghis I (Church of the East; Teule, 151-153)
- Gospel of the Twelve Apostles* (Greisiger, 222-225)
- Ḥunayn ibn Ishāq (Church of the East; Roggema, 768-779)
- Isho'yahb III of Adiabene (Church of the East; Teule, 133-136)
- Israel of Kashkar (Church of the East; Holmberg, 757-761)
- Jacob of Edessa (Syriac Orthodox; Teule, 226-233)
- Job of Edessa (Roggema, 502-509)
- John bar Penkāyē (Syriac Orthodox; Greisiger, 176-181)
- John of Damascus (Melkite; Gle, 295-301)
- John the Stylite of Mār Z'ura at Sarug (Suermann, 314-316)
- Joshua the Stylite of Zuqnin (= Pseudo-Dionysius of Tell-Maḥrē) (Syriac Orthodox; Harrak, 322-326)
- Legend of Sergius Baḥirā* (Roggema, 600-603)
- Leontius of Damascus (Melkite; Lamoreaux, 406-410)

- Life of Gabriel of Qartmin* (Syriac Orthodox; Palmer, 892-897)
Life of John of Edessa (Melkite; Lamoreaux, 898-901)
Maronite Chronicle (Teule, 145-147)
Martyrdom of Anthony (Rawḥ al-Qurashī) (Melkite; Vila, 498-501)
Martyrdom of Michael of Mār Saba (Roggema, 911-915)
Masā'il wa-ajwiba 'aqliyya wa-ilāhiyya (Melkite; Salah and Swanson, 661-663)
Martyrdom of 'Abd al-Masīḥ (Melkite; Vila, 684-687)
Michael the Synkellos (Melkite; Kolia-Dermitzaki, 627-632)
Nonnus of Nisibis (Syriac Orthodox; Teule, 743-745)
Peter of Bayt Ra's (Swanson, 902-906)
Sixty martyrs of Jerusalem (Efthymiadis, 327-329)
Stephen Maṇṣūr (Melkite; Vila, 388-389, 393-396; Nanobashvili, 390-393)
Symeon of Samosata (Syriac Orthodox; Palmer, 186-189)
Testimonies of the prophets about the dispensation of Christ (Debié, 242-244)
Theodore Abū Qurra (Melkite; Lamoreaux, 439-491)
Theodore bar Koni (Church of the East; Teule, 343-346)
Theophilus of Edessa (Teule, 305-308)
Thomas of Margā (Church of the East; Teule, 688-690)
Timothy I (Church of the East; Heimgartner, 515-519, 522-526; Roggema, 519-522, 527-531)
Uṣṭāth al-Rāhib (Salah and Swanson, 907-910)
Yūḥannā ibn al-Ṣalt (Church of the East; Roggema, 849-851)