Discover Life Bee Checklist Archive

Poelen, JH https://orcid.org/0000-0003-3138-4118

Seltmann, KC https://orcid.org/0000-0001-5354-6048

2023-08-29

Abstract

Digital biodiversity knowledge resources are increasingly available openly on the internet. Some of these potentially valuable resources are still actively curated, whereas others may have lost their maintenance/curators due to life events, funding, or a change in institutional policy. This data publication records a snapshot of the authoritative resource on the biodiversity of bees: Ascher, J. S. and J. Pickering. 2022. Discover Life bee species guide and world checklist (Hymenoptera: Apoidea: Anthophila). http://www.discoverlife.org/mp/20q?guide=Apoidea\_species Draft-55, 17 November 2020. The reason for making this snapshot is to provide a citable data package containing the Discover Life Bee Checklist for use in data synthesis and integration workflows. This data package is versioned and made verifiable using Preston, a biodiversity data tracker. With this publication, verifiable versions of the Discover Life Bee Checklist can now be cited and copied regardless of physical location.

Table of Contents

:warning: work in progress

# Introduction

Life on Earth is supported by a complex and diverse network of interactions between organisms and their surroundings. With the advancement of digital storage, processing, and networking technologies, (community) scientists now have the ability to access digital datasets that document various aspects of life on Earth through the internet. However, there is growing evidence indicating that these easily accessible digital datasets might eventually become unavailable due to broken links or undergo changes over time, a phenomenon known as “linkrot” or “content drift” (Elliott, Poelen, and Fortes 2020, 2023). In order to mitigate the risk of losing or altering valuable digital biodiversity datasets, researchers are employing content-based data tracking methods. Here, these methods are applied to a widely used digital resource for bee names, specifically the DiscoverLife Bee Checklist (Ascher and Pickering 2022).

The Discover Life Bee Checklist is the most comprehensive checklist for bees in the West and is commonly referenced for ecological research. It is constructed via a collaboration between John S. Ascher and John Pickering, drawing on taxonomic publications and prior work by many people. The list is periodically peer-reviewed by ITIS as part of the GBIF-supported World Bee Checklist project. For more information about the checklist and its sources, see <https://www.discoverlife.org/mp/20q?act=x_guide_credit&guide=Apoidea_species>.

# Methods

To help version a snapshot of the Discover Life Bee Checklist, the following openly available tools were used: bash, Preston, grep, xmllint, cut, and xargs. With these tools the following archiving workflow was implemented:

#!/bin/bash  
#  
# Makes an archive of DiscoverLife Bee checklist and associated species pages.  
#  
  
preston track "https://www.discoverlife.org/mp/20q/?act=x\_checklist&guide=Apoidea\_species&flags=HAS"\  
 | grep hasVersion\  
 | preston cat\  
 | xmllint --html --xpath '//table//tr/td/i/a/@href' -\  
 | cut --delimiter '"' -f2\  
 | sed 's+^+https://www.discoverlife.org+g'\  
 | xargs -L100 preston track   
  
# retry previously failed web requests, if needed.  
preston ls -l tsv\  
 | grep well-known\  
 | grep hasVersion\  
 | cut -f1\  
 | xargs preston track

In this workflow, on line 6, the command preston track captures a snapshot of HTML pages that contain references to pages for various bee species. The result of this tracking process is a detailed stream of statements describing the tracking steps. This output is then passed to grep hasVersion through a Linux pipe, which filters and selects only the statements that connect the web addresses with the discovered content.

Subsequently, the content associated with these statements is streamed to the standard output using the preston cat command. From this streamed content, URLs to the species pages are generated. This is done by first extracting relevant HTML fragments using an XPath query. Then, these fragments are transformed into URLs using a combination of string parsing (using the cut –delimiter ‘“’ -f2 command) and stream editing (with sed 's+^+https://www.discoverlife.org+g').

The resulting URLs, which lead to pages about bee species, are organized into blocks of 100 URLs each and tracked using the Preston tool. The workflow includes a retry procedure to account for potential failures in making web requests. This ensures that web locations that initially fail to provide content are retried to compensate for any issues.

# Results

The resulting archive can access a versioned copy of the Discover Life Bee Checklist. The archive contains over 20k HTML pages that appear to be consistently structured. This consistent structure allows scripts or other computer programs to transform the data into a format suitable for reuse automatically.

First three DiscoverLife Bee Checklist HTML resources tracked. The first contains the [index page of species pages](data/c4/fc/c4fc072c4977b8a55fc386402b6b2b3128f9de27349e61b369c887ce88e525e8). The following two are locations, and associated content identifiers, to species pages associated with [*Andrena angustior*](data/30/91/3091d3029b4349a8b851cabd982da9d805d881ad0d334eac9c87d7c738ac676f) and [*Andrena angusticrus*](data/af/e0/afe0f96a9c6d8e5aacddc00e79ef18eac4a8d48f2bec888d5d800feca2d37aae). This table was generated using preston alias -l tsv | tail -n3 | tac | cut -f1-3 | mlr --hi --itsvlite --omd cat .

| discoverlife url | content id |
| --- | --- |
| […guide=Apoidea\_species&flags=HAS](https://www.discoverlife.org/mp/20q/?act=x_checklist&guide=Apoidea_species&flags=HAS) | [sha256:c4f…](data/c4/fc/c4fc072c4977b8a55fc386402b6b2b3128f9de27349e61b369c887ce88e525e8) |
| […Andrena+angustior](https://www.discoverlife.org/mp/20q?search=Andrena+angustior) | [sha256;3091…](data/30/91/3091d3029b4349a8b851cabd982da9d805d881ad0d334eac9c87d7c738ac676f) |
| […Andrena+angusticrus](https://www.discoverlife.org/mp/20q?search=Andrena+angusticrus) | [sha256:afe0…](data/af/e0/afe0f96a9c6d8e5aacddc00e79ef18eac4a8d48f2bec888d5d800feca2d37aae) |

The current content identifiers of this versioned package of DiscoverLife Bee Checklist html resources are:

hash://sha256/86e7ce5f3df9a136a2957de5655261c007b95e217b2f0901988ffb39ee0230fe

hash://md5/55fe2b12ab306704ce332d97723b95af

## Example 1. List Most Frequently Appearing Bee Subgenus Names

DiscoverLife species pages document subgenera associated with bee species in html fragments such as:

<small>Subgenus: <a href="/mp/20p?see=Archianthidium&amp;name=Trachusa&amp;flags=subgenus:"><i>Archianthidium</i></a></small>

[The html fragment](https://linker.bio/line:hash://sha256/ce144a314ef4bafa714f6921506544730910935a870786964506dc18c65349dd!/L60) above was seen at a page describing [*Trachusa forcipata*](https://www.discoverlife.org/mp/20q?search=Trachusa+forcipata) with content id [hash://sha256/ce144a314ef4bafa714f6921506544730910935a870786964506dc18c65349dd](data/ce/14/ce144a314ef4bafa714f6921506544730910935a870786964506dc18c65349dd).

To query for the top 10 most frequently appearing subgenera appearing in the pages, you can use:

preston ls\  
 --remote https://linker.bio,https://softwareheritage.org\  
 --anchor hash://sha256/86e7ce5f3df9a136a2957de5655261c007b95e217b2f0901988ffb39ee0230fe\  
 -l tsv\  
 | grep -v well-known\  
 | grep hasVersion\  
 | cut -f3\  
 | preston cat\  
 | grep "Subgenus:"\  
 | sed 's+<br>.\*<i>++g'\  
 | sed 's+</i></a></small>++g'\  
 | sort\  
 | uniq -c\  
 | sort -nr\  
 | head

The result is shown in the table below.

Top 10 most frequent appearances of (likely) subgenus names in the bee species pages ordered by decreasing frequency:

| frequency | subgenus |
| --- | --- |
| 5600 | None |
| 765 | Uncertain |
| 448 | Perdita |
| 403 | Dialictus |
| 259 | Hemihalictus |
| 209 | Eutricharaea |
| 179 | Ctenonomia |
| 161 | Homalictus |
| 152 | Anthidium |
| 151 | Lasioglossum |

## Example 2. List Bee Hosts

The Discover Life Bee Checklist contains information about (plant) hosts associated with specific bees. This information is captured in HTML snippets such as:

<p><table width="80%"><tr><td><a name="Hosts"><table cellspacing="0" cellpadding="0" border="0"><tr><td colspan=2"><b>Hosts</b> &middot; <a href="/mp/20m?kind=Agapostemon+texanus&m\_i=h&m\_order=0">map</a></td></tr><tr><td><u>Family</u></td><td><u>Scientific name</u> <font size="-1" face="sans-serif">@ source (<u>records</u>)</font></td></tr><tr><td valign="top"><a href="/20/q?search=Asteraceae">Asteraceae</a>&nbsp;&nbsp;</td><td valign="top" nowrap><a href="/20/q?search=Achillea+millefolium">Achillea millefolium</a><font size="-1" face="sans-serif"> @ UCMS\_ENT <a href="/mp/20l?id=UCMS\_ENT00058904;UCMS\_ENT00058903">(2)</a></font></td></tr>

as extracted from [line 538](https://linker.bio/line:hash://sha256/7168d15fe822bc6770954b9e3a3b64b62f05ccad636c293e9d5a07d6fb173ddc!/L538) of [content](data/71/68/7168d15fe822bc6770954b9e3a3b64b62f05ccad636c293e9d5a07d6fb173ddc) associated with DiscoverLife Bee page on [*Agapostemon texanus*](https://www.discoverlife.org/mp/20q?search=Agapostemon+texanus).

With this, the script below can be constructed to extract hosts from this particular species page:

preston cat 'hash://sha256/7168d15fe822bc6770954b9e3a3b64b62f05ccad636c293e9d5a07d6fb173ddc'\  
 | xmllint\  
 --html\  
 --xpath "//a[@name='Hosts']/following-sibling::\*//td/a/text()"\  
 -\  
 | grep -oE "[A-Z][a-z]{1,}[ ].\*"

where, preston cat ... streams a species page with content id hash://sha256/7168d... and selects associated host species by combining an XPath query (line 3) with a regular expression (line 4).

This script was used to generate the following list of known hosts of *Agapostemon texanus*, as claimed by (Ascher and Pickering 2022):

Achillea millefolium  
Aletris farinosa  
Arnica sp  
Aster simplex  
Aster sp  
Astragalus racemosus  
Baccharis salicina  
Baileya multiradiata  
Barbarea vulgaris  
Beta vulgaris  
Bidens ferulifolia  
Blephilia ciliata  
Chrysanthemum leucanthemum  
Chrysothamnus sp  
Chrysothamnus viscidiflorus  
Cichorium intybus  
Cirsium sp  
Cirsium vulgare  
Cleome serrulata  
Cleome sp  
Convolvulus sepium  
Conyza canadensis  
Coreopsis sp  
Ericameria nauseosa  
Erigeron annuus  
Erigeron leiomerus  
Eriogonum sp  
Erysimum repandum  
Eupatorium purpureum  
Flaveria campestris  
Fragaria virginiana  
Glaucium flavum  
Grindelia sp  
Grindelia squarrosa  
Helianthus annuus  
Helianthus anomalus  
Helianthus sp  
Heterotheca inuloides  
Heterotheca subaxillaris  
Hieracium sp  
Horkelia sp  
Kalmia latifolia  
Larrea tridentata  
Lathyrus japonicus  
Leucanthemum vulgare  
Limonium carolinianum  
Machaeranthera bigelovii  
Machaeranthera sp  
Madia elegans  
Malus pumila  
Medicago sativa  
Petrophyton caespitosum  
Phacelia sp  
Plantago lanceolata  
Poinsettia heterophylla  
Prosopis glandulosa  
Prosopis sp  
Raphanus raphanistrum  
Ratibida columnifera  
Rosa rugosa  
Rubus sp  
Rubus spp  
Salvia carduacea  
Sclerocactus wrightiae  
Senecio sp  
Solidago tenuifolia  
Sphaeralcea sp  
Taraxacum campylodes  
Tephrosia virginiana  
Teucrium canadense  
Trifolium hybridum  
Trifolium repens  
Verbena sp  
Vernonia noveboracensis

The examples above show two applications of data extraction from (Ascher and Pickering 2022): extracting most frequently appearing subgenera names, and extracting host plants for a specific species page.

# Discussion

Biodiversity datasets are available online as html pages, or structured in other digital formats. In this publication, one such resource (Ascher and Pickering 2022) was tracked and packaged into a citable biodiversity dataset containing over 20k HTML resources. The data tracking method may be applied to other currently available network-accessible biodiversity datasets in an effort to turn webpages into versioned digital research objects.

In the results, the None is explicit, meaning that there is no subgenus for the species. Uncertain indicates the species’ uncertain subgeneric placement. The other most common subgeneric names reflect the number of species within each subgenus, indicating Perdita is the most speciose subgenus.

The floral hosts listed in the Discover Life Bee Checklist are sourced from digitized museum specimen records and digitization projects. The host records also indicate the source (institution or project) that shared the data. Commonly, these come from BBSL - Bee Biology & Systematics Laboratory (USDA) and AMNH\_BEE (Ascher 2016).

# References

Ascher, John S. 2016. “Digital Bee Collections Network Data Archive from the Collaborative Databasing of North American Bee Collections Within a Global Informatics Network Project. Version: 08 Mar 2016. National Science Foundation Grants DBI 0956388 and DBI 0956340.”

Ascher, John S., and John Pickering. 2022. “Discover Life Bee Species Guide and World Checklist (Hymenoptera: Apoidea: Anthophila).” DiscoverLife. <http://www.discoverlife.org/mp/20q?guide=Apoidea_species>.

Elliott, Michael J., Jorrit H. Poelen, and José A. B. Fortes. 2020. “Toward Reliable Biodiversity Dataset References.” *Ecological Informatics* 59 (September): 101132. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecoinf.2020.101132>.

———. 2023. “Signing Data Citations Enables Data Verification and Citation Persistence.” *Scientific Data* 10 (1). <https://doi.org/10.1038/s41597-023-02230-y>.