```
- MODULE ZabWithQTest -
```

This is the test for formal specification for the Zab consensus algorithm, which adds some restrictions like the number of rounds and number of transactions broadcast based on ZabWithQ.

In this spec, we do model checking for Zab with the scale of 2 rounds of execution and 2 delivered value.

This work is driven by Junqueira F P, Reed B C, Serafini M. Zab: High-performance broadcast for primary-backup systems

Extends Integers, FiniteSets, Sequences, Naturals, TLC

The set of server identifiers

Constant Server

The set of requests that can go into history

CONSTANT Value

Server states

It is unnecessary to add state ELECTION, we can own it by setting leaderOracle to Null. CONSTANTS Follower, Leader, ProspectiveLeader

Message types

CONSTANTS CEPOCH, NEWEPOCH, ACKE, NEWLEADER, ACKLD, COMMITLD, PROPOSE, ACK, O

Additional Message types used for recovery when restarting CONSTANTS RECOVERYREQUEST, RECOVERYRESPONSE

the maximum round of epoch (initially $\{0,\,1,\,2\}$), currently not used CONSTANT Epoches

Return the maximum value from the set S

 $Maximum(S) \stackrel{\Delta}{=} \text{ if } S = \{\} \text{ Then } -1$

ELSE CHOOSE $n \in S : \forall m \in S : n \geq m$

Return the minimum value from the set S

 $Minimum(S) \stackrel{\triangle}{=} \text{ if } S = \{\} \text{ Then } -1$

Else choose $n \in S : \forall m \in S : n \leq m$

 $Quorums \triangleq \{Q \in SUBSET \ Server : Cardinality(Q) * 2 > Cardinality(Server)\}$

Assume QuorumsAssumption $\triangleq \land \forall Q \in Quorums : Q \subseteq Server$

 $\land \forall Q1, Q2 \in Quorums : Q1 \cap Q2 \neq \{\}$

 $None \stackrel{\triangle}{=} CHOOSE \ v : v \notin Value$

 $NullPoint \triangleq \text{CHOOSE } p: p \notin Server$

The server's state(Follower, Leader, Prospective Leader).

 ${\tt VARIABLE}\ state$

The leader's epoch or the last new epoch proposal the follower acknowledged (namely epoch of the last NEWEPOCH accepted, f.p in paper). VARIABLE currentEpoch

The last new leader proposal the follower acknowledged (namely epoch of the last NEWLEADER accepted, f.a in paper). VARIABLE leaderEpoch

The identifier of the leader for followers. Variable leaderOracle

The history of servers as the sequence of transactions. VARIABLE history

The messages repersenting requests and responses sent from one server to another. msgs[i][j] means the input buffer of server j from server i.

VARIABLE msgs

The set of servers which the leader think follow itself (Q in paper). VARIABLE cluster

The set of followers who has successfully sent $\it CEPOCH$ to pleader in pleader. VARIABLE $\it cepochRecv$

The set of followers who has successfully sent ACK-E to pleader in pleader. VARIABLE ackeRecv

The set of followers who has successfully sent ACK-LD to pleader in pleader. VARIABLE ackldRecv

ackIndex[i][j] means leader i has received how many ACK messages from follower j. So ackIndex[i][i] is not used. VARIABLE ackIndex

 $current Counter[i] \ \ {\it means the count of transactions client requests leader}.$ VARIABLE current Counter

 $sendCounter[i] \ \mbox{means the count of transactions leader has broadcast.}$ VARIABLE sendCounter

initial History[i] means the initial history of leader i in epoch current Epoch[i]. VARIABLE initial History

commitIndex[i] means leader/follower i should commit how many proposals and sent COMMIT messages. It should be more formal to add variable applyIndex/deliverIndex to represent the prefix entries of the history that has applied to state machine, but we can tolerate that $applyIndex(deliverIndex\ here) = commitIndex$. This does not violate correctness. $(commitIndex\ increases\ monotonically\ before\ restarting)$

Variable commitIndex

commitIndex[i] means leader i has committed how many proposals and sent COMMIT messages. VARIABLE committedIndex

Hepler matrix for follower to stop sending CEPOCH to pleader in followers. Because CEPOCH is the sole message which follower actively sends to pleader. VARIABLE cepochSent

the maximum epoch in $\it CEPOCH$ pleader received from followers.

Variable tempMaxEpoch

the maximum leaderEpoch and most up-to-date history in ACKE pleader received from followers. VARIABLE tempMaxLastEpoch

Because pleader updates state and broadcasts NEWLEADER when it receives ACKE from a quorum of followers, and initialHistory is determined. But tempInitialHistory may change when receiving other ACKEs after entering into phase2. So it is necessary to split initialHistory with tempInitialHistory.

VARIABLE tempInitialHistory

the set of all broadcast messages whose tpye is proposal that any leader has sent, only used in verifying properties. So the variable will only be changed in transition LeaderBroadcast1.

VARIABLE proposalMsgsLog

Helper set for server who restarts to collect which servers has responded to it. VARIABLE recoveryRespRecv

the maximum epoch and corresponding leaderOracle in RECOVERYRESPONSE from followers. VARIABLE recoveryMaxEpoch

 ${\tt VARIABLE}\ recovery MEO racle$

Variable recoverySent

```
Persistent state of a server: history, currentEpoch, leaderEpoch serverVars \triangleq \langle state, currentEpoch, leaderEpoch, leaderOracle, history, commitIndex \rangle leaderVars \triangleq \langle cluster, cepochRecv, ackeRecv, ackldRecv, ackIndex, currentCounter, sendCounter, initialHistempVars <math>\triangleq \langle tempMaxEpoch, tempMaxLastEpoch, tempInitialHistory \rangle recoveryVars \triangleq \langle recoveryRespRecv, recoveryMaxEpoch, recoveryMEOracle, recoverySent \rangle
```

 $vars \; \stackrel{\triangle}{=} \; \langle server Vars, \; msgs, \; leader Vars, \; temp \, Vars, \; recovery \, Vars, \; cepoch Sent, \; proposal Msgs Log \rangle$

```
LastZxid(his) \triangleq \text{IF } Len(his) > 0 \text{ THEN } \langle his[Len(his)].epoch, \ his[Len(his)].counter \rangle
ELSE \ \langle -1, -1 \rangle
```

```
Add a message to msgs – add a message m to msgs[i][j]

Send(i, j, m) \triangleq msgs' = [msgs \ \text{EXCEPT} \ ![i][j] = Append(msgs[i][j], m)]

Send2(i, j, m1, m2) \triangleq msgs' = [msgs \ \text{EXCEPT} \ ![i][j] = Append(Append(msgs[i][j], m1), m2)]
```

Remove a message from msgs – discard head of msgs[i][j]

```
Discard(i, j) \triangleq msgs' = \text{if } msgs[i][j] \neq \langle \rangle \text{ Then } [msgs \text{ except } ![i][j] = Tail(msgs[i][j])]
                                                           ELSE msgs
 Leader/Pleader broadcasts a message to all other servers in Q
Broadcast(i, m) \stackrel{\Delta}{=} msgs' = [ii \in Server \mapsto [ij \in Server \mapsto IF \land ii = i]
                                                                                     \land ij \in cluster[i] \text{ THEN } Append(msgs[ii][ij], m)
                                                                                                            ELSE msgs[ii][ij]]
BroadcastToAll(i, m) \stackrel{\triangle}{=} msgs' = [ii \in Server \mapsto [ij \in Server \mapsto \text{IF } \land ii = i \land ij \neq i \text{ THEN } Append(msgs[ii]] 
                                                                                                                   ELSE msgs[ii][ij]]
 Combination of Send and Discard – discard head of msgs[j][i] and add m into msgs[i][j]
Reply(i, j, m) \stackrel{\triangle}{=} msgs' = [msgs \ \text{EXCEPT} \ ![j][i] = Tail(msgs[j][i]),
                                                         ![i][j] = Append(msqs[i][j], m)
Reply2(i, j, m1, m2) \stackrel{\triangle}{=} msgs' = [msgs \ \text{EXCEPT} \ ![j][i] = Tail(msgs[j][i]),
                                                                  ![i][j] = Append(Append(msgs[i][j], m1), m2)]
clean(i, j) \stackrel{\Delta}{=} msgs' = [msgs \ \text{EXCEPT} \ ![i][j] = \langle \rangle, \ ![j][i] = \langle \rangle]
 Define initial values for all variables
Init \stackrel{\triangle}{=} \land state
                                        = [s \in Server \mapsto Follower]
           \land currentEpoch
                                        = [s \in Server \mapsto 0]
           \land leaderEpoch
                                        = [s \in Server \mapsto 0]
                                        = [s \in Server \mapsto NullPoint]
           \land leaderOracle
           \wedge history
                                        = [s \in Server \mapsto \langle \rangle]
           \land \ msgs
                                         = [i \in Server \mapsto [j \in Server \mapsto \langle \rangle]]
                                        = [i \in Server \mapsto \{\}]
           \wedge cluster
           \land cepochRecv
                                        = [s \in Server \mapsto \{\}]
           \land ackeRecv
                                        = [s \in Server \mapsto \{\}]
                                        = [s \in Server \mapsto \{\}]
           \land \ ackldRecv
           \wedge ackIndex
                                        = [i \in Server \mapsto [j \in Server \mapsto 0]]
                                        = [s \in Server \mapsto 0]
           \land currentCounter
           \land sendCounter
                                        = [s \in Server \mapsto 0]
                                         = [s \in Server \mapsto 0]
           \land commitIndex
           \land committedIndex
                                        = [s \in Server \mapsto 0]
           \land initialHistory
                                        = [s \in Server \mapsto \langle \rangle]
                                        = [s \in Server \mapsto FALSE]
           \land cepochSent
           \land tempMaxEpoch
                                        = [s \in Server \mapsto 0]
           \land tempMaxLastEpoch = [s \in Server \mapsto 0]
           \land tempInitialHistory = [s \in Server \mapsto \langle \rangle]
           \land recoveryRespRecv = [s \in Server \mapsto \{\}]
           \land recoveryMaxEpoch = [s \in Server \mapsto 0]
           \land recovery MEO racle = [s \in Server \mapsto NullPoint]
           \land recoverySent
                                        = [s \in Server \mapsto FALSE]
```

```
\land proposalMsgsLog = \{\}
```

```
A server becomes pleader and a quorum servers knows that.
Election(i, Q) \triangleq
           test restrictions
          \land \forall s \in Server : currentEpoch[s] \leq 1 \land Len(history[s]) \leq 2
          \wedge i \in Q
                                      = [s \in Server \mapsto if \ s = i \ Then \ ProspectiveLeader
          \wedge state'
                                                                       ELSE IF s \in Q THEN Follower
                                                                                           ELSE state[s]
          \land cluster'
                                                       EXCEPT ![i] = Q cluster is first initialized in election, not phase1.
                                      = [cluster]
          \land cepochRecv'
                                      = [cepochRecv EXCEPT ![i] = \{i\}]
          \land ackeRecv'
                                      = [ackeRecv \quad EXCEPT \ ![i] = \{i\}]
          \land ackldRecv'
                                      = [ackldRecv \ EXCEPT \ ![i] = \{i\}]
          \land ackIndex'
                                      = [ii \in Server \mapsto [ij \in Server \mapsto
                                                             If ii = i then 0
                                                                        ELSE ackIndex[ii][ij]]
          \land committedIndex'
                                      = [committedIndex]
                                                                   EXCEPT ![i] = 0
          \land initialHistory'
                                      = [initial History]
                                                                EXCEPT ![i]
                                                                                     =\langle\rangle
          \wedge tempMaxEpoch'
                                      = [tempMaxEpoch]
                                                                     EXCEPT ![i] = currentEpoch[i]]
          \land tempMaxLastEpoch' = [tempMaxLastEpoch \quad \texttt{EXCEPT} \ ![i] = currentEpoch[i]]
          \land tempInitialHistory' = [tempInitialHistory \ EXCEPT \ ![i]]
          \land leaderOracle'
                                      = [s \in Server \mapsto if \ s \in Q \ Then \ i
                                                                        ELSE leaderOracle[s]
          \land leaderEpoch'
                                      = [s \in Server \mapsto if \ s \in Q \ Then \ currentEpoch[s]]
                                                                        ELSE leaderEpoch[s]
          \land cepochSent'
                                      = [s \in Server \mapsto if \ s \in Q \ Then \ False
                                                                        ELSE cepochSent[s]
                                      = [ii \in Server \mapsto [ij \in Server \mapsto
          \land msgs'
                                                             If ii \in Q \lor ij \in Q then \langle \rangle
                                                                                      ELSE msqs[ii][ij]]
           \land \texttt{UNCHANGED} \ \langle \textit{currentEpoch}, \textit{history}, \textit{commitIndex}, \textit{currentCounter}, \textit{sendCounter}, \textit{proposalMsgsLog} \rangle
 The action should be triggered once at the beginning.
 Because we abstract the part of leader election, we can use global variables in this action.
InitialElection(i, Q) \triangleq
          test restrictions
         \land currentEpoch[i] \le 2
         \land Len(history[i]) \leq 2
         \land \forall s \in Server : state[s] = Follower \land leaderOracle[s] = NullPoint
         \land Election(i, Q)
         \land UNCHANGED \langle currentEpoch, history, commitIndex, currentCounter, sendCounter, recoveryVars, pre-
```

The leader finds timeout with another follower.

 $LeaderTimeout(i, j) \triangleq$

```
test restrictions
                                        \land currentEpoch[i] \le 2
                                       \land Len(history[i]) \le 2
                                       \land state[i] \neq Follower
                                       \wedge j \neq i
                                       \land j \in cluster[i]
                                       \land LET newCluster \stackrel{\triangle}{=} cluster[i] \setminus \{j\}
                                                IN \land \lor \land newCluster \in Quorums
                                                                                                      \land cluster' = [cluster \ EXCEPT \ ![i] = newCluster]
                                                                                                      \wedge clean(i, j)
                                                                                                      \land UNCHANGED \langle state, cepochRecv, ackeRecv, ackldRecv, ackIndex, committedIndex, initial
                                                                                                                                                                                         tempMaxEpoch, tempMaxLastEpoch, tempInitialHistory, leaderOracle, le
                                                                                        \lor \ \land \ newCluster \not \in \ Quorums
                                                                                                      \wedge Let Q \stackrel{\Delta}{=} choose q \in \mathit{Quorums} \colon i \in q
                                                                                                                               v \stackrel{\Delta}{=} \text{CHOOSE } s \in Q: TRUE
                                                                                                                      IN Election(v, Q)
                                                                                                               \exists Q \in Quorums : \land i \in Q
                                                                                                                                                                                                            \land \exists v \in Q : Election(v, Q)
                                       \land UNCHANGED \langle currentEpoch, history, commitIndex, currentCounter, sendCounter, recoveryVars, property Vars, property Vars,
    A follower finds timeout with the leader.
FollowerTimeout(i) \stackrel{\Delta}{=}
                                         test restrictions
                                       \land currentEpoch[i] \le 2
                                       \land Len(history[i]) \le 2
                                       \land state[i] = Follower
                                       \land leaderOracle[i] \neq NullPoint
                                       \land \exists Q \in Quorums : \land i \in Q
                                                                                                                                              \land \exists v \in Q : Election(v, Q)
                                       \land UNCHANGED \langle currentEpoch, history, commitIndex, currentCounter, sendCounter, recoveryVars, property Vars, property Vars,
     A server halts and restarts.
     Like Recovery protocol in View-stamped Replication, we let a server join in cluster
     by broadcast recovery and wait until receiving responses from a quorum of servers.
Restart(i) \triangleq
                                              test restrictions
                                          \land currentEpoch[i] \le 2
                                          \land Len(history[i]) \le 2
                                          \land commitIndex' = [commitIndex \ EXCEPT \ ![i] = 0]
                                          \land cepochSent' = [cepochSent \ EXCEPT \ ![i] = FALSE]
                                                                                                                             = [ii \in \mathit{Server} \mapsto [ij \in \mathit{Server} \mapsto \mathsf{IF} \ ij = i \ \mathsf{THEN} \ \langle \rangle
                                           \land msgs'
                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       ELSE msgs[ii][ij]]]
```

```
\land recoverySent' = [recoverySent \ EXCEPT \ ![i] = FALSE]
          ∧ UNCHANGED ⟨currentEpoch, leaderEpoch, history, leaderVars, temp Vars,
                              recoveryRespRecv, recoveryMaxEpoch, recoveryMEOracle, proposalMsqsLog \rangle
RecoveryAfterRestart(i) \stackrel{\Delta}{=}
          test restrictions
         \land currentEpoch[i] < 2
         \wedge Len(history[i]) < 2
         \land state[i] = Follower
         \land leaderOracle[i] = NullPoint
         \land \neg recoverySent[i]
         \land recoveryRespRecv' = [recoveryRespRecv \ EXCEPT \ ![i] = \{\}]
         \land recoveryMaxEpoch' = [recoveryMaxEpoch \ EXCEPT \ ![i] = currentEpoch[i]]
         \land recovery MEO racle' = [recovery MEO racle \ EXCEPT \ ![i] = NullPoint]
                                   = [recoverySent]
                                                            EXCEPT ![i] = TRUE
         \land recoverySent'
         \land BroadcastToAll(i, [mtype \mapsto RECOVERYREQUEST])
         \land UNCHANGED \langle serverVars, leaderVars, tempVars, cepochSent, proposalMsqsLog <math>\rangle
HandleRecoveryRequest(i, j) \triangleq
          test restrictions
         \land currentEpoch[i] \le 2
         \land Len(history[i]) \le 2
         \land msgs[j][i] \neq \langle \rangle
         \land \mathit{msgs}[j][i][1].\mathit{mtype} = RECOVERYREQUEST
         \land Reply(i, j, [mtype \mapsto RECOVERYRESPONSE,
                          moracle \mapsto leaderOracle[i],
                          mepoch \mapsto currentEpoch[i])
         \land UNCHANGED \langle serverVars, leaderVars, tempVars, cepochSent, recoveryVars, proposalMsgsLog <math>\rangle
HandleRecoveryResponse(i, j) \stackrel{\Delta}{=}
          test restrictions
         \land currentEpoch[i] \le 2
         \land Len(history[i]) \le 2
         \land msgs[j][i] \neq \langle \rangle
         \land \mathit{msgs}[j][i][1].\mathit{mtype} = \mathit{RECOVERYRESPONSE}
         \land \text{ LET } msg \stackrel{\triangle}{=} msgs[j][i][1]
                 infoOk \stackrel{\triangle}{=} \land msg.mepoch \ge recoveryMaxEpoch[i]
                               \land msg.moracle \neq NullPoint
                 \vee \wedge infoOk
                     \land recoveryMaxEpoch' = [recoveryMaxEpoch \ EXCEPT \ ![i] = msg.mepoch]
                     \land recovery MEO racle' = [recovery MEO racle \ EXCEPT \ ![i] = msg.moracle]
                  \lor \land \neg infoOk
                     \land UNCHANGED \langle recoveryMaxEpoch, recoveryMEOracle \rangle
         \wedge Discard(j, i)
         \land recoveryRespRecv' = [recoveryRespRecv \ Except \ ![i] = \text{if} \ j \in recoveryRespRecv[i] \ \text{Then} \ recoveryRespRecv[i]
                                                                                                                ELSE recoveryRe
```

```
FindCluster(i) \stackrel{\triangle}{=}
          test restrictions
         \land currentEpoch[i] \le 2
         \land Len(history[i]) \le 2
         \land state[i] = Follower
         \land leaderOracle[i] = NullPoint
         \land recoveryRespRecv[i] \in Quorums
         \land LET infoOk \stackrel{\triangle}{=} \land recoveryMEOracle[i] \neq i
                               \land recovery MEO racle[i] \neq Null Point
                               \land currentEpoch[i] \le recoveryMaxEpoch[i]
           IN
                 \vee \wedge \neg infoOk
                     \land recoverySent' = [recoverySent \ EXCEPT \ ![i] = FALSE]
                     \land UNCHANGED \langle currentEpoch, leaderOracle, msgs \rangle
                  \vee \wedge infoOk
                     \land currentEpoch' = [currentEpoch \ EXCEPT \ ![i] = recoveryMaxEpoch[i]]
                     \land leaderOracle' = [leaderOracle \ EXCEPT \ ![i] = recoveryMEOracle[i]]
                     \land Send(i, recoveryMEOracle[i], [mtype \mapsto CEPOCH,
                                                            mepoch \mapsto recoveryMaxEpoch[i])
                    \land UNCHANGED recoverySent
         \land UNCHANGED \langle state, leaderEpoch, history, commitIndex, leaderVars, tempVars,
                             recoveryRespRecv, recoveryMaxEpoch, recoveryMEOracle, cepochSent, proposalMsgsL
 In phase f11, follower sends f.p to pleader via CEPOCH.
FollowerDiscovery1(i) \triangleq
          test restrictions
         \land currentEpoch[i] \le 2
         \land Len(history[i]) \le 2
         \land state[i] = Follower
         \land \ leaderOracle[i] \neq NullPoint
         \land \neg cepochSent[i]
         \wedge LET leader \stackrel{\Delta}{=} leaderOracle[i]
                 Send(i, leader, [mtype \mapsto CEPOCH,
                                     mepoch \mapsto currentEpoch[i])
         \land cepochSent' = [cepochSent \ EXCEPT \ ![i] = TRUE]
         \land UNCHANGED \langle serverVars, leaderVars, temp Vars, recovery Vars, proposalMsgsLog <math>\rangle
```

 \land UNCHANGED $\langle serverVars, leaderVars, tempVars, cepochSent, recoverySent, proposalMsqsLoq <math>\rangle$

In phase l11, pleader receives CEPOCH from a quorum, and choose a new epoch e'

as its own l.p and sends NEWEPOCH to followers.

 $\land state[i] = ProspectiveLeader$

 $Leader Handle CEPOCH(i, j) \triangleq$ test restrictions

 $\land tempMaxEpoch[i] \le 1$ $\land Len(history[i]) \le 2$

```
\land msgs[j][i] \neq \langle \rangle
        \land msgs[j][i][1].mtype = CEPOCH
        ∧ ∨ new message - modify tempMaxEpoch and cepochRecv
              \land NullPoint \notin cepochRecv[i]
              \land LET newEpoch \stackrel{\triangle}{=} Maximum(\{tempMaxEpoch[i], msgs[j][i][1].mepoch\})
                 IN tempMaxEpoch' = [tempMaxEpoch Except ![i] = newEpoch]
              \land cepochRecv' = [cepochRecv \ EXCEPT \ ![i] = IF j
                                                                          \in cepochRecv[i] THEN cepochRecv[i]
                                                                                                 ELSE cepochRecv[i] \cup \{j\}
              \wedge Discard(j, i)
           V new follower who joins in cluster / follower whose history and commitIndex do not match
              \land \mathit{NullPoint} \in \mathit{cepochRecv}[i]
              \land \lor \land NullPoint \notin ackeRecv[i]
                    \land Reply(i, j, [mtype \mapsto NEWEPOCH,
                                    mepoch \mapsto leaderEpoch[i])
                 \lor \land NullPoint \in ackeRecv[i]
                    \land Reply2(i, j, [mtype \mapsto NEWEPOCH,
                                      mepoch \mapsto leaderEpoch[i],
                                                        \mapsto NEWLEADER,
                                     [mtype]
                                                        \mapsto currentEpoch[i],
                                      mepoch
                                      minitialHistory \mapsto initialHistory[i]
              \land UNCHANGED \langle cepochRecv, tempMaxEpoch \rangle
        \land cluster' = [cluster \ Except \ ![i] = \text{if} \ j \in cluster[i] \ \text{then} \ cluster[i] \ \text{else} \ cluster[i] \cup \{j\}]
        \land UNCHANGED \land server Vars, ackeRecv, ackldRecv, ackIndex, currentCounter, sendCounter, initialHist
                           committedIndex,\ cepochSent,\ tempMaxLastEpoch,\ tempInitialHistory,\ recoveryVars,\ points
 Here I decide to change leader's epoch in l12&l21, otherwise there may exist an old leader and
 a new leader who share the same expoch. So here I just change leaderEpoch, and use it in handling ACK-E.
LeaderDiscovery1(i) \stackrel{\Delta}{=}
         test restrictions
        \land tempMaxEpoch[i] \leq 1
        \land Len(history[i]) \le 2
        \land state[i] = ProspectiveLeader
        \land cepochRecv[i] \in Quorums
        \land leaderEpoch' = [leaderEpoch \ EXCEPT \ ![i] = tempMaxEpoch[i] + 1]
        \land cepochRecv' = [cepochRecv \ EXCEPT \ ![i] = \{NullPoint\}]
        \land Broadcast(i, [mtype \mapsto NEWEPOCH,
                           mepoch \mapsto leaderEpoch'[i])
        ∧ UNCHANGED \(\state\), currentEpoch, leaderOracle, history, cluster, ackeRecv, ackldRecv, ackIndex, co
                           initialHistory, commitIndex, committedIndex, cepochSent, tempVars, recoveryVars, p
In phase f12, follower receives NEWEPOCH. If e' > f.p then sends back ACKE,
 and ACKE contains f.a and hf to help pleader choose a newer history.
FollowerDiscovery2(i, j) \triangleq
```

test restrictions $\land currentEpoch[i] \le 2$

```
\land Len(history[i]) \le 2
         \land state[i] = Follower
         \land msgs[j][i] \neq \langle \rangle
         \land \mathit{msgs}[j][i][1].\mathit{mtype} = \mathit{NEWEPOCH}
         \wedge \text{ LET } msg \stackrel{\triangle}{=} msgs[j][i][1]
                \vee new NEWEPOCH – accept and reply
                     \land currentEpoch[i] < msg.mepoch
                     \land \lor \land leaderOracle[i] = j
                            \land currentEpoch' = [currentEpoch \ EXCEPT \ ![i] = msg.mepoch]
                            \land Reply(i, j, [mtype])
                                                            \mapsto ACKE,
                                                            \mapsto msg.mepoch,
                                             mepoch
                                             mlastEpoch \mapsto leaderEpoch[i],
                                             mhf
                                                            \mapsto history[i])
                         \lor \land leaderOracle[i] \neq j
                            \wedge Discard(j, i)
                            \land UNCHANGED currentEpoch
                  \lor \land currentEpoch[i] = msg.mepoch
                     \land \lor \land leaderOracle[i] = j
                            \land Reply(i, j, [mtype])
                                                            \mapsto ACKE,
                                             mepoch
                                                            \mapsto msg.mepoch,
                                             mlastEpoch \mapsto leaderEpoch[i],
                                             mhf
                                                            \mapsto history[i]
                            \land UNCHANGED currentEpoch
                         \vee It may happen when a leader do not update new epoch to all followers in Q, and a new election begi
                            \land leaderOracle[i] \neq j
                            \wedge Discard(i, i)
                            \land \ \mathtt{UNCHANGED} \ \ currentEpoch
                     stale NEWEPOCH-diacard
                     \land currentEpoch[i] > msg.mepoch
                     \wedge Discard(j, i)
                     \land UNCHANGED currentEpoch
         \land UNCHANGED \langle state, leaderEpoch, leaderOracle, history, leaderVars,
                              commitIndex, cepochSent, tempVars, recoveryVars, proposalMsqsLog
 In phase l12, pleader receives ACKE from a quorum,
 and select the history of one most up-to-date follower to be the initial history.
LeaderHandleACKE(i, j) \triangleq
          test restrictions
         \land currentEpoch[i] \le 2
         \land Len(history[i]) \le 2
         \land state[i] = ProspectiveLeader
         \land msgs[j][i] \neq \langle \rangle
         \land msgs[j][i][1].mtype = ACKE
         \wedge \text{ LET } msg \stackrel{\triangle}{=} msgs[j][i][1]
                  infoOk \stackrel{\triangle}{=} \lor msg.mlastEpoch > tempMaxLastEpoch[i]
```

```
\lor \land msg.mlastEpoch = tempMaxLastEpoch[i]
                                                     \land \lor LastZxid(msg.mhf)[1] > LastZxid(tempInitialHistory[i])[1]
                                                          \lor \land LastZxid(msq.mhf)[1] = LastZxid(tempInitialHistory[i])[1]
                                                               \land LastZxid(msg.mhf)[2] \ge LastZxid(tempInitialHistory[i])[2]
                           \lor \land leaderEpoch[i] = msg.mepoch
                                \land \lor \land infoOk
                                          \land tempMaxLastEpoch'
                                                                                       = [tempMaxLastEpoch]  EXCEPT ![i] = msg.mlastEpoch]
                                                                                        = [tempInitialHistory EXCEPT ![i] = msg.mhf]
                                          \land tempInitialHistory'
                                          \land UNCHANGED \langle tempMaxLastEpoch, tempInitialHistory \rangle
                                 Followers not in Q will not receive NEWEPOCH, so leader will receive ACKE only when the source is in
                                \land ackeRecv' = [ackeRecv \ EXCEPT \ ![i] = IF \ j \notin ackeRecv[i] \ THEN \ ackeRecv[i] \cup \{j\}
                                                                                                                                                ELSE ackeRecv[i]
                            \lor \land leaderEpoch[i] \neq msq.mepoch
                                \land UNCHANGED \langle tempMaxLastEpoch, tempInitialHistory, ackeRecv <math>\rangle
              \wedge Discard(j, i)
              \land UNCHANGED \langle serverVars, cluster, cepochRecv, ackldRecv, ackIndex, currentCounter,
                                             sendCounter, initialHistory, committedIndex, cepochSent, tempMaxEpoch, recoveryVertical initialHistory, tempMaxEpoch, tempMaxE
LeaderDiscovery2Sync1(i) \stackrel{\Delta}{=}
               test restrictions
              \land currentEpoch[i] \le 2
              \land Len(history[i]) \le 2
              \land state[i] = ProspectiveLeader
              \land ackeRecv[i] \in Quorums
              \land currentEpoch'
                                               = [currentEpoch \quad EXCEPT ! [i]]
                                                                                                                 = leaderEpoch[i]
              \wedge history'
                                                 = [history]
                                                                                 EXCEPT ![i]
                                                                                                                 = tempInitialHistory[i]]
              \land initial History'
                                                = [initial History EXCEPT ![i]]
                                                                                                                 = tempInitialHistory[i]]
              \land ackeRecv'
                                                = [ackeRecv]
                                                                                   EXCEPT ![i]
                                                                                                                 = \{NullPoint\}
                                                                                   EXCEPT ![i][i] = Len(tempInitialHistory[i])]
              \land ackIndex'
                                                 = [ackIndex]
               until now, phase1(Discovery) ends
                                                                         \mapsto NEWLEADER,
              \land Broadcast(i, [mtype])
                                                                         \mapsto currentEpoch'[i],
                                           mepoch
                                           minitialHistory \mapsto history'[i]
              \land UNCHANGED \langle state, leaderEpoch, leaderOracle, commitIndex, cluster, cepochRecv, ackldRecv,
                                             currentCounter, sendCounter, committedIndex, cepochSent, tempVars, recoveryVars,
 Note1: Delete the change of commitIndex in LeaderDiscovery2Sync1 and FollowerSync1, then we can promise that
         commitIndex of every server increases monotonically, except that some server halts and restarts.
 Note2: Set cepochRecv, ackeRecv, ackldRecv to {NullPoint} in corresponding three actions to
         make sure that the prospective leader will not broadcast NEWEPOCH/NEWLEADER/COMMITLD twice.
 In phase f21, follower receives NEWLEADER. The follower updates its epoch and history,
 and sends back ACK-LD to pleader.
FollowerSync1(i, j) \triangleq
```

```
test restrictions
         \land currentEpoch[i] \le 2
         \land Len(history[i]) \le 2
         \land state[i] = Follower
         \land msgs[j][i] \neq \langle \rangle
         \land msgs[j][i][1].mtype = NEWLEADER
         \wedge LET msg \stackrel{\triangle}{=} msgs[j][i][1]
                 replyOk \stackrel{\Delta}{=} \land currentEpoch[i] \leq msg.mepoch
                               \land leaderOracle[i] = j
                 \vee new NEWLEADER – accept and reply
           IN
                    \land replyOk
                    \land currentEpoch' = [currentEpoch \ EXCEPT \ ![i] = msg.mepoch]
                    \land leaderEpoch' = [leaderEpoch \ EXCEPT \ ![i] = msg.mepoch]
                                                        EXCEPT ![i] = msq.minitialHistory]
                                        = [history]
                    \land Reply(i, j, [mtype])
                                                \mapsto ACKLD,
                                     mepoch \mapsto msq.mepoch,
                                     mhistory \mapsto msg.minitialHistory)
                 \vee stale NEWLEADER - discard
                    \wedge \neg replyOk
                    \wedge Discard(j, i)
                    \land UNCHANGED \langle currentEpoch, leaderEpoch, history \rangle
         ∧ UNCHANGED \(\state\), commitIndex, leaderOracle, leaderVars, tempVars, cepochSent, recoveryVars, p
 In phase l22, pleader receives ACK-LD from a quorum of followers, and sends COMMIT-LD to followers.
LeaderHandleACKLD(i, j) \triangleq
          test restrictions
         \land currentEpoch[i] \le 2
         \land Len(history[i]) \le 2
         \land state[i] = ProspectiveLeader
         \land msgs[j][i] \neq \langle \rangle
         \land msgs[j][i][1].mtype = ACKLD
         \wedge LET msg \stackrel{\triangle}{=} msgs[j][i][1]
               \vee new ACK-LD - accept
                    \land currentEpoch[i] = msg.mepoch
                    \land ackIndex' = [ackIndex \ EXCEPT \ ![i][j] = Len(initialHistory[i])]
                    \land ackldRecv' = [ackldRecv \ EXCEPT \ ![i] = \text{if} \ j \notin ackldRecv[i] \ THEN \ ackldRecv[i] \cup \{j\}
                                                                                             ELSE ackldRecv[i]
                 \vee stale ACK-LD - discard
                    \land currentEpoch[i] \neq msg.mepoch
                    \land UNCHANGED \langle ackldRecv, ackIndex \rangle
         \wedge Discard(j, i)
         ∧ UNCHANGED ⟨serverVars, cluster, cepochRecv, ackeRecv, currentCounter,
                            sendCounter, initialHistory, committedIndex, tempVars, cepochSent, recoveryVars, p
LeaderSync2(i) \triangleq
```

```
test restrictions
         \land currentEpoch[i] \le 2
        \land Len(history[i]) \le 2
        \land state[i] = ProspectiveLeader
        \land ackldRecv[i] \in Quorums
        \land commitIndex'
                              = [commitIndex \quad EXCEPT \ ![i] = Len(history[i])]
        \land committedIndex' = [committedIndex \ EXCEPT \ ![i] = Len(history[i])]
                        = [state]
                                                  EXCEPT ![i] = Leader]
        \wedge state'
        \land currentCounter' = [currentCounter \ Except \ ![i] = 0]
        \land sendCounter' = [sendCounter \ Except ![i] = 0]
        \land ackldRecv'
                              = [ackldRecv]
                                                   EXCEPT ![i] = \{NullPoint\}]
        \land Broadcast(i, [mtype \mapsto COMMITLD])
                          mepoch \mapsto currentEpoch[i],
                          mlength \mapsto Len(history[i])
        \land UNCHANGED \langle currentEpoch, leaderEpoch, leaderOracle, history, cluster, cepochRecv,
                           ackeRecv, ackIndex, initialHistory, tempVars, cepochSent, recoveryVars, proposalMsg
In phase f22, follower receives COMMIT-LD and delivers all unprocessed transaction.
FollowerSync2(i, j) \triangleq
         test restrictions
        \land currentEpoch[i] \le 2
        \land Len(history[i]) \le 2
        \land state[i] = Follower
        \land msgs[j][i] \neq \langle \rangle
        \land msgs[j][i][1].mtype = COMMITLD
        \wedge LET msg \stackrel{\triangle}{=} msgs[j][i][1]
                replyOk \stackrel{\triangle}{=} \land currentEpoch[i] = msg.mepoch
                              \land leaderOracle[i] = j
           IN
                 \lor new COMMIT\text{-}LD - commit all transactions in initial history
                    Regradless of Restart, it must be true because one will receive NEWLEADER before receiving COMMIT-
                    \land replyOk
                   \land \lor \land Len(history[i]) = msg.mlength
                         \land commitIndex' = [commitIndex \ EXCEPT \ ![i] = Len(history[i])]
                         \wedge Discard(j, i)
                       \lor \land Len(history[i]) \neq msg.mlength
                          \land Reply(i, j, [mtype \mapsto CEPOCH,
                                         mepoch \mapsto currentEpoch[i])
                         \land UNCHANGED commitIndex
                    >: stale COMMIT-LD - discard
                     <: In our implementation, '<' does not exist due to the guarantee of Restart
                    \land \neg replyOk
                   \wedge Discard(j, i)
                   \land UNCHANGED commitIndex
        \land UNCHANGED \langle state, currentEpoch, leaderEpoch, leaderOracle, history,
                           leaderVars, tempVars, cepochSent, recoveryVars, proposalMsgsLog \rangle
```

```
In phase l31, leader receives client request and broadcasts PROPOSE.
ClientRequest(i, v) \triangleq
          test restrictions
         \land currentEpoch[i] \le 2
         \land Len(history[i]) \le 1
         \wedge state[i] = Leader
         \land currentCounter' = [currentCounter \ EXCEPT \ ![i] = currentCounter[i] + 1]
         \land LET newTransaction \stackrel{\triangle}{=} [epoch \mapsto currentEpoch[i],
                                          counter \mapsto currentCounter'[i],
                                         value \mapsto v
                 \land history' = [history \ EXCEPT \ ![i] = Append(history[i], newTransaction)]
                 \land ackIndex' = [ackIndex \ EXCEPT \ ![i][i] = Len(history'[i])] necessary, to push commitIndex
         \land UNCHANGED \langle msqs, state, currentEpoch, leaderEpoch, leaderOracle, commitIndex, cluster, cepochR
                            ackeRecv, ackldRecv, sendCounter, initialHistory, committedIndex, tempVars, cepoch
LeaderBroadcast1(i) \stackrel{\Delta}{=}
          test restrictions
         \land \ currentEpoch[i] \leq 2
         \land Len(history[i]) \le 2
         \wedge state[i] = Leader
         \land sendCounter[i] < currentCounter[i]
         \land LET toBeSentCounter \stackrel{\triangle}{=} sendCounter[i] + 1
                                       \triangleq Len(initialHistory[i]) + toBeSentCounter
                 to Be Sent Index
                                       \stackrel{\Delta}{=} history[i][toBeSentIndex]
                 toBeSentEntry
           IN
                 \land Broadcast(i, [mtype])
                                                 \mapsto PROPOSE
                                    mepoch
                                                \mapsto currentEpoch[i],
                                    mproposal \mapsto toBeSentEntry)
                 \land sendCounter' = [sendCounter except ![i] = toBeSentCounter]
                 \land LET m \stackrel{\triangle}{=} [msource \mapsto i, mtype \mapsto PROPOSE, mepoch \mapsto currentEpoch[i], mproposal \mapsto tol
                    IN proposalMsgsLog' = proposalMsgsLog \cup \{m\}
         \land UNCHANGED \langle serverVars, cepochRecv, cluster, ackeRecv, ackldRecv, ackIndex,
                            current Counter,\ initial History,\ committed Index,\ temp\ Vars,\ recovery\ Vars,\ cepoch Sent
 In phase f31, follower accepts proposal and append it to history.
FollowerBroadcast1(i, j) \triangleq
          test restrictions
         \land currentEpoch[i] \le 2
         \land Len(history[i]) \le 2
         \land state[i] = Follower
```

 $replyOk \triangleq \land currentEpoch[i] = msg.mepoch \\ \land leaderOracle[i] = j$

 $\land \ msgs[j][i] \neq \langle \rangle$

 $\land msgs[j][i][1].mtype = PROPOSE$

 \wedge LET $msg \triangleq msgs[j][i][1]$

```
It should be that \vee msg.mproposal.counter = 1
                                   \lor msg.mrpoposal.counter = history[Len(history)].counter + 1
                     \land replyOk
                     \land history' = [history \ EXCEPT \ ![i] = Append(history[i], msg.mproposal)]
                     \land Reply(i, j, [mtype \mapsto ACK,
                                      mepoch \mapsto currentEpoch[i],
                                      mindex \mapsto Len(history'[i])])
                     If happens, \neq must be >, namely a stale leader sends it.
                     \wedge \neg replyOk
                     \wedge Discard(j, i)
                     \wedge UNCHANGED history
         \land UNCHANGED \langle state, currentEpoch, leaderEpoch, leaderOracle, commitIndex,
                             leader Vars, temp Vars, cepochSent, recovery Vars, proposalMsgsLog
 In phase 132, leader receives ack from a quorum of followers to a certain proposal,
 and commits the proposal.
LeaderHandleACK(i, j) \triangleq
          test restrictions
         \land currentEpoch[i] \le 2
         \land Len(history[i]) \le 2
         \wedge state[i] = Leader
         \land msgs[j][i] \neq \langle \rangle
         \land msgs[j][i][1].mtype = ACK
         \wedge LET msg \stackrel{\triangle}{=} msgs[j][i][1]
                  \forall It should be that ackIndex[i][j] + 1 \stackrel{\triangle}{=} msq.mindex
                     \land currentEpoch[i] = msg.mepoch
                     \land ackIndex' = [ackIndex \ EXCEPT \ ![i][j] = Maximum(\{ackIndex[i][j], \ msg.mindex\})]
                  \lor If happens, \neq must be >, namely a stale follower sends it.
                     \land currentEpoch[i] \neq msg.mepoch
                     \land UNCHANGED ackIndex
         \wedge Discard(j, i)
         ∧ UNCHANGED \(\serverVars\), cluster, cepochRecv, ackeRecv, ackldRecv, currentCounter,
                             sendCounter, initialHistory, committedIndex, tempVars, cepochSent, recoveryVars, p
LeaderAdvanceCommit(i) \stackrel{\Delta}{=}
          test restrictions
         \land currentEpoch[i] \le 2
         \land Len(history[i]) \le 2
         \wedge state[i] = Leader
         \land commitIndex[i] < Len(history[i])
                                        \triangleq \ \{i\} \cup \{k \in (\mathit{Server} \setminus \{i\}) : \mathit{ackIndex}[i][k] \geq \mathit{index}\}
         \wedge LET Agree(index)
                                        \triangleq \{index \in (commitIndex[i] + 1) .. Len(history[i]) : Agree(index) \in Quoru
                  agreeIndexes
                  newCommitIndex \stackrel{\triangle}{=} \text{ if } agreeIndexes \neq \{\} \text{ Then } Maximum(agreeIndexes)
                                                                       ELSE commitIndex[i]
                 commitIndex' = [commitIndex \ EXCEPT \ ![i] = newCommitIndex]
```

```
\land UNCHANGED \langle state, currentEpoch, leaderEpoch, leaderOracle, history,
                            msgs, leaderVars, temp Vars, cepochSent, recovery Vars, proposalMsgsLog \rangle
LeaderBroadcast2(i) \stackrel{\Delta}{=}
         test restrictions
         \land currentEpoch[i] \le 2
        \land Len(history[i]) \le 2
         \wedge state[i] = Leader
         \land committedIndex[i] < commitIndex[i]
         \land LET newCommittedIndex \stackrel{\triangle}{=} committedIndex[i] + 1
                 \land Broadcast(i, [mtype])
                                               \mapsto COMMIT,
                                    mepoch \mapsto currentEpoch[i],
                                    mindex \mapsto newCommittedIndex,
                                    mcounter \mapsto history[i][newCommittedIndex].counter])
                 \land committedIndex' = [committedIndex \ EXCEPT \ ![i] = committedIndex[i] + 1]
         \land UNCHANGED \langle serverVars, cluster, cepochRecv, ackleRecv, ackldRecv, acklndex, currentCounter,
                            sendCounter, initialHistory, tempVars, cepochSent, recoveryVars, proposalMsqsLog\
 In phase f32, follower receives COMMIT and commits transaction.
FollowerBroadcast2(i, j) \triangleq
         test restrictions
         \land currentEpoch[i] \le 2
         \land Len(history[i]) \le 2
         \land state[i] = Follower
         \land msgs[j][i] \neq \langle \rangle
         \land msgs[j][i][1].mtype = COMMIT
         \land msgs[j][i][1].mtype = COMMIT
         \wedge LET msg \stackrel{\triangle}{=} msgs[j][i][1]
                 replyOk \stackrel{\Delta}{=} \land currentEpoch[i] = msg.mepoch
                                \land leaderOracle[i] = j
                 \lor \land replyOk
           IN
                    \wedge LET infoOk \stackrel{\triangle}{=} \wedge Len(history[i]) \geq msg.mindex
                                          \land \lor \land msg.mindex > 0
                                                \land history[i][msg.mindex].epoch = msg.mepoch
                                                \land history[i][msq.mindex].counter = msq.mcounter
                                             \vee msq.mindex = 0
                       IN
                                new COMMIT - commit transaction in history
                                \land infoOk
                                \land commitIndex' = [commitIndex \ EXCEPT \ ![i] = Maximum(\{commitIndex[i], msg.: a) \}
                                \wedge Discard(j, i)
                                It may happen when the server is a new follower who joined in the cluster,
                                and it misses the corresponding PROPOSE.
                                \wedge \neg infoOk
                                \land Reply(i, j, [mtype \mapsto CEPOCH,
                                                mepoch \mapsto currentEpoch[i])
```

```
∧ UNCHANGED commitIndex
                     stale COMMIT - discard
                     \wedge \neg replyOk
                    \wedge Discard(j, i)
                     ∧ UNCHANGED commitIndex
         \land UNCHANGED \langle state, currentEpoch, leaderEpoch, history, leaderOracle,
                            leader Vars, temp Vars, cepochSent, recovery Vars, proposalMsgsLog
 There may be two ways to make sure all followers as up-to-date as the leader.
 way1: choose Send not Broadcast when leader is going to send PROPOSE and COMMIT.
 way2: When one follower receives PROPOSE or COMMIT which misses some entries between
     its history and the newest entry, the follower send CEPOCH to catch pace.
 Here I choose way2, which I need not to rewrite PROPOSE and COMMIT, but need to
 modify the code when follower receives COMMIT-LD and COMMIT.
 In phase 133, upon receiving CEPOCH, leader l proposes back NEWEPOCH and NEWLEADER.
LeaderHandleCEPOCHinPhase3(i, j) \stackrel{\Delta}{=}
          test restrictions
         \land currentEpoch[i] \le 2
         \land Len(history[i]) \le 2
         \land \, state[i] = Leader
         \land msgs[j][i] \neq \langle \rangle
         \land \mathit{msgs}[j][i][1].\mathit{mtype} = \mathit{CEPOCH}
         \wedge \text{ LET } msg \stackrel{\triangle}{=} msgs[j][i][1]
               \lor \land currentEpoch[i] \ge msg.mepoch
                    \land Reply2(i, j, [mtype \mapsto NEWEPOCH,
                                      mepoch \mapsto currentEpoch[i],
                                                         \mapsto NEWLEADER,
                                      |mtype|
                                                         \mapsto currentEpoch[i],
                                      mepoch
                                      minitialHistory \mapsto history[i]
                 \lor \land currentEpoch[i] < msg.mepoch
                     \land UNCHANGED msgs
         \land UNCHANGED \langle serverVars, leaderVars, tempVars, cepochSent, recoveryVars, proposalMsqsLoq <math>\rangle
 In phase l34, upon receiving ack from f of the NEWLEADER, it sends a commit message to f.
 Leader l also makes Q := Q \cup \{f\}.
LeaderHandleACKLDinPhase3(i, j) \stackrel{\Delta}{=}
          test restrictions
         \land currentEpoch[i] \le 2
         \land Len(history[i]) \le 2
         \wedge state[i] = Leader
         \land \, msgs[j][i] \neq \langle \rangle
         \land msgs[j][i][1].mtype = ACKLD
         \wedge \text{ LET } msg \stackrel{\triangle}{=} msgs[j][i][1]
                 aimCommitIndex \stackrel{\Delta}{=} Minimum(\{commitIndex[i], Len(msq.mhistory)\})
```

initialHistory, committedIndex, tempVars, cepochSent, recoveryVars, proposalMsqsLo

 $\land currentEpoch' = [currentEpoch \ EXCEPT \ ![i] = msg.mepoch]$

 $aimCommitCounter \triangleq \text{IF } aimCommitIndex = 0 \text{ THEN } 0 \text{ ELSE } history[i][aimCommitIndex].co$

To ensure any follower can find the correct leader, the follower should modify leaderOracle anytime when it receive messages from leader, because a server may restart and join the cluster Q halfway and receive the first message which is not NEWEPOCH. But we can delete this restriction when we ensure Broadcast function acts on the followers in the cluster not any servers in the whole system, then one server must has correct leaderOracle before it receives messages.

Let me suppose two conditions when one follower sends *CEPOCH* to leader:

 $\lor \land currentEpoch[i] = msg.mepoch$

IN

- 0. Usually, the server becomes follower in election and sends CEPOCH before receiving NEWEPOCH.
- 1. The follower wants to join the cluster halfway and get the newest history.
- 2. The follower has received *COMMIT*, but there exists the gap between its own history and *mindex*, which means there are some transactions before *mindex* miss. Here we choose to send *CEPOCH* again, to receive the newest history from leader.

```
BecomeFollower(i) \triangleq
          test restrictions
         \land currentEpoch[i] \le 2
         \land Len(history[i]) \le 2
         \land \, state[i] \neq Follower
         \land \exists j \in Server \setminus \{i\} : \land msgs[j][i] \neq \langle \rangle
                                   \land msgs[j][i][1].mtype \neq RECOVERYREQUEST
                                   \land msgs[j][i][1].mtype \neq RECOVERYRESPONSE
                                   \wedge \text{ LET } msg \stackrel{\triangle}{=} msgs[j][i][1]
                                          \land NullPoint \in cepochRecv[i]
                                           \land Maximum(\{currentEpoch[i], leaderEpoch[i]\}) < msg.mepoch
                                           \land \lor msg.mtype = NEWEPOCH
                                               \lor msg.mtype = NEWLEADER
                                               \vee msg.mtype = COMMITLD
                                               \lor msg.mtype = PROPOSE
                                               \lor msg.mtype = COMMIT
                                            \wedge state'
                                                               = [state]
                                                                                 EXCEPT ![i] = Follower]
```

```
Here we should not use Discard.
        \land UNCHANGED \land leaderEpoch, history, commitIndex, leaderVars, temp Vars, cepochSent, recovery Vars,
DiscardStaleMessage(i) \triangleq
         test restrictions
        \land currentEpoch[i] \le 2
        \land Len(history[i]) \le 2
        \land \exists j \in Server \setminus \{i\} : \land msgs[j][i] \neq \langle \rangle
                                 \land msgs[j][i][1].mtype \neq RECOVERYREQUEST
                                 \land msgs[j][i][1].mtype \neq RECOVERYRESPONSE
                                 \wedge LET msg \triangleq msgs[j][i][1]
                                        \lor \land state[i] = Follower
                                            \land \lor msg.mepoch < currentEpoch[i] \lor * Discussed before.
                                               \lor msg.mtype = CEPOCH
                                               \vee msg.mtype = ACKE
                                               \lor msg.mtype = ACKLD
                                               \vee msg.mtype = ACK
                                          \lor \land state[i] \neq Follower
                                            \land msg.mtype \neq CEPOCH
                                            \land \lor \land state[i] = ProspectiveLeader
                                                  \land \lor msg.mtype = ACK
                                                     \lor \land msg.mepoch \le Maximum(\{currentEpoch[i], leaderEpoch[i]\})
                                                        \land \lor msg.mtype = NEWEPOCH
                                                           \lor msg.mtype = NEWLEADER
                                                           \lor msg.mtype = COMMITLD
                                                           \lor msg.mtype = PROPOSE
                                                           \lor \mathit{msg.mtype} = \mathit{COMMIT}
                                               \lor \land state[i] = Leader
                                                  \land \lor msg.mtype = ACKE
                                                     \lor \land msg.mepoch \le currentEpoch[i]
                                                        \land \lor msg.mtype = NEWEPOCH
                                                           \vee msg.mtype = NEWLEADER
                                                           \lor msg.mtype = COMMITLD
                                                           \vee msg.mtype = PROPOSE
                                                           \lor msg.mtype = COMMIT
                                 \wedge Discard(j, i)
        \land UNCHANGED \langle serverVars, leaderVars, tempVars, cepochSent, recoveryVars, proposalMsgsLog <math>\rangle
```

 $\land leaderOracle' = [leaderOracle \ EXCEPT \ ![i] = j]$

 $mepoch \mapsto currentEpoch[i])$

 $\land Reply(i, j, [mtype \mapsto CEPOCH,$

Defines how the variables may transition.

 $Next \triangleq$

```
\vee \exists i, j \in Server:
                                   HandleRecoveryResponse(i, j)
          \vee \exists i, j \in Server :
                                   FindCluster(i)
          \vee \exists i, j \in Server :
                                   LeaderTimeout(i, j)
          \lor \exists i \in Server :
                                    FollowerTimeout(i)
          \vee \exists i \in Server :
                                    FollowerDiscovery1(i)
          \vee \exists i, j \in Server : LeaderHandleCEPOCH(i, j)
          \vee \exists i \in Server :
                                    LeaderDiscovery1(i)
          \forall \exists i, j \in Server :
                                   FollowerDiscovery2(i, j)
          \vee \exists i, j \in Server :
                                   LeaderHandleACKE(i, j)
          \vee \exists i \in Server :
                                    LeaderDiscovery2Sync1(i)
          \vee \exists i, j \in Server:
                                   FollowerSync1(i, j)
          \vee \exists i, j \in Server:
                                   LeaderHandleACKLD(i, j)
          \vee \exists i \in Server :
                                    LeaderSync2(i)
          \vee \exists i, j \in Server :
                                   FollowerSync2(i, j)
          \lor \exists i \in Server, v \in Value : ClientRequest(i, v)
          \vee \exists i \in Server :
                                    LeaderBroadcast1(i)
          \vee \exists i, j \in Server : FollowerBroadcast1(i, j)
          \vee \exists i, j \in Server:
                                   LeaderHandleACK(i, j)
          \vee \exists i \in Server :
                                    LeaderAdvanceCommit(i)
          \vee \exists i \in Server :
                                    LeaderBroadcast2(i)
          \vee \exists i, j \in Server : FollowerBroadcast2(i, j)
          \vee \exists i, j \in Server:
                                   LeaderHandleCEPOCHinPhase3(i, j)
          \forall \exists i, j \in Server :
                                   LeaderHandleACKLDinPhase3(i, j)
                                    DiscardStaleMessage(i)
          \vee \exists i \in Server :
          \vee \exists i \in Server:
                                    BecomeFollower(i)
Spec \stackrel{\triangle}{=} Init \wedge \Box [Next]_{vars}
 Define some variants, safety propoties, and liveness propoties of Zab consensus algorithm.
 Safety properties
 There is most one leader/prospective leader in a certain epoch.
Leadership \stackrel{\triangle}{=} \forall i, j \in Server :
                        \land \lor state[i] = Leader
                            \lor \land state[i] = ProspectiveLeader
```

 $\land NullPoint \in ackeRecv[i]$ prospective leader determines its epoch after broadcasting NEWLE

 $\vee \exists i \in Server, Q \in Quorums : InitialElection(i, Q)$

Restart(i)

RecoveryAfterRestart(i)

HandleRecoveryRequest(i, j)

 $\vee \exists i \in Server :$

 $\vee \exists i \in Server :$

 $\forall \exists i, j \in Server :$

 $\lor \land state[j] = ProspectiveLeader$ $\land NullPoint \in ackeRecv[j]$ $\land currentEpoch[i] = currentEpoch[j]$

 $\land \lor state[j] = Leader$

```
\Rightarrow i = i
```

```
Here, delivering means deliver some transaction from history to replica. We can assume deliverIndex = commitIndex.
 So we can assume the set of delivered transactions is the prefix of history with index from 1 to commitIndex.
 We can express a transaction by two-tuple < epoch, counter > according to its uniqueness.
equal(entry1, entry2) \stackrel{\triangle}{=} \land entry1.epoch = entry2.epoch
                               \land entry1.counter = entry2.counter
precede(entry1, entry2) \triangleq \forall entry1.epoch < entry2.epoch
                                  \lor \land entry1.epoch = entry2.epoch
                                     \land entry1.counter < entry2.counter
 PrefixConsistency: The prefix that have been delivered in history in any process is the same.
PrefixConsistency \triangleq \forall i, j \in Server:
                              LET smaller \triangleq Minimum(\{commitIndex[i], commitIndex[j]\})
                              IN \vee smaller = 0
                                     \lor \land smaller > 0
                                        \land \forall index \in 1 ... smaller : equal(history[i][index], history[j][index])
 Integrity: If some follower delivers one transaction, then some primary has broadcast it.
Integrity \stackrel{\Delta}{=} \forall i \in Server :
                 state[i] = Follower \land commitIndex[i] > 0
                  \Rightarrow \forall index \in 1 ... commitIndex[i] : \exists msg \in proposalMsgsLog :
                       equal(msg.mproposal, history[i][index])
 Agreement: If some follower f delivers transaction a and some follower f' delivers transaction b,
         then f' delivers a or f delivers b.
Agreement \triangleq \forall i, j \in Server :
                    \land state[i] = Follower \land commitIndex[i] > 0
                    \land state[j] = Follower \land commitIndex[j] > 0
                    \forall index 1 \in 1 ... commitIndex[i], index 2 \in 1 ... commitIndex[j] :
                        \vee \exists indexj \in 1 ... commitIndex[j] :
                            equal(history[j][indexj], history[i][index1])
                        \vee \exists indexi \in 1 .. commitIndex[i] :
                           equal(history[i][indexi], history[j][index2])
 Total order: If some follower delivers a before b, then any process that delivers b
          must also deliver a and deliver a before b.
TotalOrder \stackrel{\triangle}{=} \forall i, j \in Server : commitIndex[i] \geq 2 \land commitIndex[j] \geq 2
                      \Rightarrow \forall indexi1 \in 1.. (commitIndex[i] - 1) : \forall indexi2 \in (indexi1 + 1).. commitIndex[i] :
                          LET logOk \triangleq \exists index \in 1 ... commitIndex[j] : equal(history[i][indexi2], history[j][index])
                                \vee \neg logOk
```

 $\land \exists indexj2 \in 1 ... commitIndex[j] :$

 $\land equal(history[i][indexi2], history[j][indexj2])$

 $\land \exists indexj1 \in 1 ... (indexj2-1) : equal(history[i][indexi1], history[i][indexi1])$

 $\lor \land logOk$

```
delivers b must also deliver a before b.
Local Primary Order \triangleq \text{LET } mset(i,\ e) \triangleq \{msg \in proposal MsgsLog : msg.msource = i \land msg.mproposal.epochmentries(i,\ e) \triangleq \{msg.mproposal : msg \in mset(i,\ e)\}
                                       \forall i \in Server : \forall e \in 1 ... currentEpoch[i] :
                                           \land Cardinality(mentries(i, e)) \ge 2
                                           \land \exists tsc1 \in mentries(i, e) : \exists tsc2 \in mentries(i, e) :
                                                 \land \neg equal(tsc2, tsc1)
                                                 \land \ \texttt{LET} \ \textit{tscPre} \ \stackrel{\triangle}{=} \ \textit{if} \ \textit{precede}(tsc1, \, tsc2) \ \texttt{THEN} \ \textit{tsc}1 \ \texttt{ELSE} \ \textit{tsc}2
                                                          tscNext \stackrel{\triangle}{=} \text{ if } precede(tsc1, tsc2) \text{ then } tsc2 \text{ else } tsc1
                                                    IN \forall j \in Server : \land commitIndex[j] \ge 2
                                                                               \land \exists index \in 1 ... commitIndex[j] : equal(history[j][index[j]) : equal(history[j][index[j]))
                                                        \exists index 2 \in 1 ... commitIndex[j] :
                                                               \land equal(history[j][index2], tscNext)
                                                               \wedge index2 > 1
                                                               \land \exists index1 \in 1 ... (index2 - 1) : equal(history[j][index1], tscPre)
 Global primary order: A follower f delivers both a with epoch e and b with epoch e', and e < e',
                   then f must deliver a before b.
GlobalPrimaryOrder \triangleq \forall i \in Server : commitIndex[i] > 2
                                      \Rightarrow \forall idx1, idx2 \in 1.. commitIndex[i] : \forall history[i][idx1].epoch \geq history[i][idx2].epoch
                                                                                              \lor \land history[i][idx1].epoch < history[i][idx2]
                                                                                                 \wedge idx1 < idx2
 Primary integrity: If primary p broadcasts a and some follower f delivers b such that b has epoch
                smaller than epoch of p, then p must deliver b before it broadcasts a.
PrimaryIntegrity \stackrel{\Delta}{=} \forall i, j \in Server : \land state[i] = Leader
                                                      \land state[j] = Follower \land commitIndex[j] \ge 1
                                  \Rightarrow \forall index \in 1 ... commitIndex[j] : \forall history[j][index].epoch \geq currentEpoch[i]
                                                                                   \lor \land history[j][index].epoch < currentEpoch[i]
                                                                                       \land \exists idx \in 1 ... commitIndex[i] : equal(history[i])[i]
Liveness property
Suppose that:
    - A quorum Q of followers are up.
    - The followers in Q elect the same process l and l is up.
    - Messages between a follower in Q and l are received in a timely fashion.
If I proposes a transaction a, then a is eventually committed.
```

Local primary order: If a primary broadcasts a before it broadcasts b, then a follower that

- \ ∗ Modification History
- \ * Last modified Fri Apr 30 15:47:49 CST 2021 by Dell
- \ * Created Sat Dec 05 13:32:08 CST 2020 by Dell