

Li Yong

## The identity crisis of Chinese graduates in France

### 在法国的中国留学毕业生的身份认同危机

**Abstract:** This paper focuses on the mutation of personal identity in the migration process in order to understand the international mobility experience of today's Chinese students. Considering the myth of self-starters and the ideals of success that are at the origin of the mobility project of young Chinese, the new social conditions that they face in the new country to which they migrate to, in this case, France, often render their project ineffective, causing an identity crisis. This chapter analyzes the causes, the forms of expression and their attempts at resolving the identity crises through a study on the biographies of Chinese graduates working in France after their university training.

**摘要：**本文旨在探讨个人身份在迁移过程中的变化，以深入了解当今中国学生的国际流动经历。考虑到年轻人流动项目的起源——自我创业的神话和成功理想，以及他们在移居到新国家（在本例中为法国）后所面临的新社会条件，这些条件往往使他们的项目无效，导致了身份认同危机的产生。本章分析了这些身份认同危机的原因、表现形式以及中国留学生在法国完成大学教育后工作的生平传记，从中探讨他们解决身份认同危机的尝试。

## 1 Introduction

### 1 引言

China experienced a phase of *chuguore* (出国热, "fever of studying abroad") in the 1990s when the government relaxed the restrictions on self-funded studies abroad (Xiang 2003). This international educational movement continued in the following decades, and today Chinese students are systematically among the top three nationalities in the academic systems of almost all OECD countries. This large-scale movement is producing its "perverse effects" (Boudon 1979) on Chinese students on the move, particularly the aspect of finding jobs in the labor markets, both in their host country and in their home country. Consequently, for Chinese students who arrived in France in the early 2000s, recent changes in the socio-economic contexts of migration undermine their old patterns of social success as well as their old forms of identification, forcing them to reexamine their life goals and their personal identities. These readjustments are not without their consequences and in this case bring about "identity crises." This study analyzes the causes and forms of expression of these identity crises among Chinese graduate migrants, as well as their efforts and strategies to overcome them. The empirical data for this study is from a thesis in sociology on the professional integration of Chinese graduates in France (Li 2016). The article begins with setting the societal context of Chinese student mobility, the theoretical perspective on migration and identities, as well as the research methods. Adopting the conceptual framework of Claude Dubar (2004) about identity construction, the

identity crises are analyzed in two stages: (1) the main sources of the crises with a focus on the social causes of the feeling of failure are examined; (2) the identity adjustments of Chinese graduates are studied, by examining intrapersonal processes alongside interpersonal dynamics.

中国在20世纪90年代经历了一段 chuguore（出国热，“留学热潮”）的阶段，当时政府放宽了对自费留学的限制（项2003）。这场国际教育运动在随后的几十年中持续进行，如今，中国学生在几乎所有经合组织国家(经济合作与发展组织成员国)的学术体系中都是排名前三的国籍之一。这场大规模的迁移运动对正在移动中的中国学生产生了其“逆反效应”（Boudon 1979），特别是在寻找劳动力市场上的工作方面，无论是在他们的寄居国还是在祖国。因此，对于在21世纪初抵达法国的中国学生来说，**迁移的社会经济背景的最新变化破坏了他们的旧社会成功模式以及他们的旧身份形式，迫使他们重新审视自己的人生目标和个人身份。** 这些调整并非没有后果，在这种情况下导致了“身份危机”。本研究分析了中国研究生迁移中身份危机的原因和表现形式，以及他们克服这些危机的努力和策略。本研究的实证数据来自一篇关于中国留学生在法国职业融合方面的社会学论文（李2016）。文章以描述中国学生流动的社会背景、迁移和身份的理论视角以及研究方法开篇。采用Claude Dubar（2004）关于身份建构的概念框架，分析了身份危机的两个阶段：(1)主要的危机源头，重点关注导致失败感的社会原因；(2)研究了中国毕业生的身份调整，通过研究内部个人过程和人际动态。

## 2 Student mobility, a migration traversed by problematic tensions

### 2 学生流动，一场充满问题纷争的迁移之旅

Since the beginning of the third millennium, France has experienced an upswing in the number of Chinese students in its higher education system. Apart from a small group of scholars who came to the country through the exchange programs, France attracts a population of mainly self-financed Chinese who have not been able to pursue higher education in their countries in a prestigious university or discipline and who seek to increase their value through a foreign diploma. In the context of the establishment of a professional immigration policy in France (Charles et al. 2013) this migratory trend has led to the entry of a large number of Chinese graduates into the French labor market. However, for young Chinese in France, the quest for employment responds above all to Chinese norms of social success.

自第三千年初以来，法国高等教育系统中的中国学生数量呈上升趋势。除了一小部分通过交换项目来到法国的学者外，法国吸引的主要是自费的中国留学生，他们无法在自己国家的知名大学或专业接受高等教育，希望通过国外文凭提升自身价值。在法国建立职业迁移政策的背景下，这种迁移趋势导致大量中国毕业生进入法国劳动力市场。然而，对于在法国的中国年轻人来说，就业的追求首先符合中国社会成功的规范。

#### 2.1 The genesis of a self-transformation project

##### 2.1 自我转型项目的起源

The Chinese migrants in the study arrived in France in the last wave of student migration in the 2000s, funding themselves in order to pursue their own projects. In many ways, these young people were already part of a privileged minority in Chinese society: They are graduates of a “school marathon” since most of them have passed the gaokao (高考)<sup>1</sup> and have started part of their

schooling in Chinese universities<sup>2</sup>. However, my respondents do not belong to the dominant elites who have a relatively smooth path because of their privilege. Nor do they come from the lower classes. They are part of the educated middle classes (managers, technicians, administrative staff, entrepreneurs, etc.)<sup>3</sup> who support the education of their children but cannot afford the tuition fees of Anglo-

研究中的中国迁移是在 2000 年代学生迁移的最后一波浪潮中抵达法国的，他们自费来法国追求自己的项目。在许多方面，这些年轻人已经是中国社会的一部分特权少数群体：他们是“学校马拉松”的毕业生，因为他们中的大多数已经通过了高考<sup>1</sup>，并已经在中国大学<sup>2</sup>开展了一部分的学习。然而，我的受访者不属于由于特权而拥有相对平稳路径的主导精英阶层，也不来自下层阶级。他们属于受过教育的中产阶级（管理人员、技术人员、行政人员、企业家等）<sup>3</sup>，他们支持子女的教育，但无法支付大学的学费，

<sup>1</sup> Gaokao is China's National Higher Education Entrance Examination.

<sup>2</sup> Among the 38 people who have completed part of their schooling in the Chinese higher education system, 22 universities are attached to the "211" program (13 of which are included in the "985" program). These are institutions of excellence that receive priority funding from the state and they aim to become world-class universities in the twenty-first century.

<sup>3</sup> More than half of the 45 respondents have a parent who has received higher education.

<sup>1</sup> 高考 是中国的全国高等教育入学考试。

<sup>2</sup> 在完成了部分中国高等教育的 38 名受访者中，有 22 所大学参与了“211”计划（其中有 13 所还包括在“985”计划中）。这些都是享有卓越声誉的机构，它们获得国家优先资助，并旨在成为 21 世纪的世界一流大学。

<sup>3</sup> 45 名受访者中超过一半的人的父母接受过高等教育。

## 102 Li Yong

Saxon universities. The social and financial gamble undertaken by these migrants is enormous.

无法支付盎格鲁-撒克逊大学的学费。这些迁移承担的社会和经济赌注是巨大的。

In post-socialist China, the reforms of the 1990s in various fields (higher education, work, health, housing, etc.) accelerated the process of individualization of Chinese society (Yan 2009, 2010). This almost totally constrained individualization accompanies an ideology that is aligned with the cult of excellence through the sense of academic achievement and social success (Rouleau-Berger and Yan 2017). The Chinese family of the urban middle classes became the site of an “enterprising self” (Hoffman 2006; Zhang and Ong 2008). While family education differs from case to case, the parents of respondents have a common focus on success in school, autonomy and the ethics of the incessant effort.

在后社会主义中国，上世纪90年代在各个领域（高等教育、工作、健康、住房等）的改革加速了中国社会的个性化进程（Yan 2009, 2010）。这种近乎完全受限的个性化伴随着一种与学业成就和社会成功相契合的卓越崇拜的意识形态（Rouleau-Berger and Yan 2017）。城市中产阶级的中国家庭成为“进取

自我”的场所（Hoffman 2006；Zhang 和 Ong 2008）。虽然家庭教育因案例而异，但受访者的父母都共同关注学业成功、自主性和不断努力的伦理。

In the context of increasing competition, goals of studying abroad are envisaged by young people and their families as a rational investment in human capital to meet the demands of the labor market. Through migration, the students want to be stimulated, to forge themselves through trials, to become more efficient, and hope to be rewarded upon their return to China by gaining access to promising professional positions. While migration is framed by students as an expression of their desire to discover, their studies abroad almost always require a significant financial investment by their families. While some parents have used their entire lives' savings, others have sold their apartment to fund their children's international studies. The family's financial and emotional investment in the migration project is therefore particularly important and weighs on migrants as an obligation to succeed on their journey.

在竞争日益激烈的背景下，青年和其家人将出国留学的目标视为对人力资本的理性投资，以满足劳动力市场的需求。通过迁移，学生希望受到激励，通过考验锻造自己，变得更加高效，并希望在回国后通过获得有前途的职业岗位来获得回报。尽管学生将迁移视为他们渴望发现的一种表达，但他们的海外学习几乎总是需要家庭进行重大的财务投入。一些家长用尽了一生的积蓄，其他一些家长出售了他们的公寓来资助孩子的国际学习。因此，家庭在迁移项目中的财务和情感投资尤为重要，在旅途中这份责任的重量压在迁移者的肩上成为了一种必须成功的使命。

## 2.2 From the myth of the foreign diploma to the myth of foreign professional experience

### 2.2 从海外学位神话到海外专业经验的神话

The historical contexts connected to the mobility of Chinese students have changed dramatically. In the years following the reform and opening-up of China (since 1978), a simple return with a foreign diploma was enough to ensure the foreign graduate a good job. However, with the increase in students returning with an international graduate degree and rising unemployment among graduates (Lian 2009; Rocca 2007), simply obtaining a foreign degree is no longer enough. Today, the Chinese labor market has adopted a much more “mature” and discriminating attitude towards recruiting international graduates (Hao and Welch 2012, 243).

与中国学生流动相关的历史背景发生了巨大变化。自中国改革开放以来（自1978年起），持有海外学位简单地回国就足以确保海外留学生获得一份好工作。然而，随着持有国际毕业学位的学生数量增加以及毕业生失业率上升（Lian 2009; Rocca 2007），仅仅获得海外学位已经不再足够。如今，中国劳动市场对招聘国际毕业生采取了更加“成熟”和挑剔的态度（Hao and Welch 2012, 243）。

Educational mobility paths tend to be hierarchical in China. Foreign-trained students divided into two groups: graduates from renowned foreign universities.

中国的教育流动路径往往是分层次的。海外培训的学生分为两组：来自知名海外大学的毕业生



with foreign professional experiences, known as great haigui (海归),<sup>4</sup> and those of less well-known establishments, with no professional experience, referred to as small haigui. The myth of the foreign diploma has been replaced by the myth of foreign professional experience in the Chinese labor market. The official narrative is that Chinese students abroad should ideally acquire their first professional work experience in the host country before returning to China. Intimidated by dramatic stories of the haigui remaining unemployed in major Chinese cities, Chinese graduates trained in France increasingly strive to improve their employability by putting themselves through the French labor market.

带有海外专业经历的人被称为大海归（海归<sup>4</sup>，而那些在较不知名的机构接受过教育、没有专业经验的被称为小海归。海外学历的神话已被中国劳动力市场中海外职场经历的神话所取代。官方说法是，中国留学生应该在回国前最好在留学国获得第一份专业工作经验。受到海归在中国主要城市仍然失业的戏剧性故事的吓唬，接受法国培训的中国毕业生越来越努力通过法国劳动力市场来提高自己的就业能力。

In many respects, Chinese students find themselves in a double bind situation (Roulleau-Berger 2007). To be able to reintegrate successfully into the Chinese labor market, they must first demonstrate their employability in the French labor market, which is notoriously exclusionary and currently hit by the crisis. With the overall decrease in the volume of work in the French labor market, many students have no chance of finding a job corresponding to their initial training despite their good intentions. Some cannot even find an internship in the country of training and are forced to look for opportunities in China. And even if they find work in France, before closing this migratory cycle (China-France-China), they are exposed to a multitude of risks. Their paths are strongly marked by uncertainties.

在许多方面，中国学生陷入了困境（Roulleau-Berger 2007）。为了能够成功重新融入中国劳动力市场，他们必须首先证明自己在法国劳动力市场的就业能力，而法国劳动力市场以排他性而闻名，目前也受到危机的打击。随着法国劳动力市场工作量的整体减少，尽管许多学生怀有积极的意图，也找不到与其初始培训相符的工作。有些人甚至在留学国找不到实习机会，被迫在中国寻找机会。即使他们在法国找到工作，在结束这一迁移循环（中国-法国-中国）之前，他们也面临着众多风险。他们的道路充满了不确定性。

The young Chinese place themselves under tremendous pressure to avoid failing because their parents underwent great personal sacrifices to send them abroad. And this injunction to success does not only concern studies and work, it also extends to areas related to marriage, family life, the upbringing of their children, and so forth. As a result, many migrants are regularly confronted with internal contradictions and normative dilemmas. Faced with the gap between the social norms of success they have internalized and the practical impossibility of complying with them, crises are bound to emerge during the process of migration.

年轻的中国人面临着巨大的压力，要避免失败，因为他们的父母为了送他们出国进行了巨大的个人牺牲。这种成功的命令不仅涉及学业和工作，还涉及与婚姻、家庭生活、子女教育等相关的领域。因此，许多迁移经常面临内部矛盾和规范困境。面对他们内化的社会成功规范与实际无法达成之间存在差距时，迁移过程中危机必然会出现。

### 3 The theoretical perspective:

### 3 理论视角：

#### Migration and identity dynamics

#### 迁移与身份动态

Migration involves many transitions in different areas of individual existence and can trigger important questions around identity. Historically, the transition from a community-based society to a societally-dominated society has created acute

迁移涉及个人生活各个领域的许多转变，并可能触发有关身份认同的重要问题。从历史上看，从以社区为基础的社会向以社会为主导的社会转变已经产生了严重的

<sup>4</sup> *In Chinese, haigui means: Chinese graduates returned from abroad; literally: the sea turtles (haigui, 海龟).*

<sup>4</sup> 在中文中，海归的意思是：中国留学归来的毕业生；字面意思：海龟（海龟，海龟）。

#### 104 Li Yong

identity crises<sup>5</sup> among immigrants. It is no coincidence that during the origin of the sociological traditions of Chicago, there have been numerous analyses of migratory trajectories through the stories of immigrants (Thomas and Znaniecki 1998). In this vein, Camilleri et al. studied the dynamics of transmission processes and the adjustments between the prescribed, desired and acquired identities, the renegotiation of identities with the population of the host country and the implementation of the “identity strategies” by immigrants (Camilleri et al. 1990).

在迁移者中的身份危机。在芝加哥社会学传统的起源期间，通过迁移者的故事分析了大量的迁移轨迹（Thomas and Znaniecki 1998）。在这一脉络中，Camilleri等人研究了传播过程的动态和在预设的、渴求的与获得的身份之间的调整，与东道国人口的身份重新谈判以及迁移者实施“身份策略”的过程（Camilleri等人 1990）。

In an intrapersonal model, Baumeister distinguishes two categories of identity-related problems: First, *identity deficits* emerge, when the individual is unable to establish personal goals and values or maintain commitments to them. The formation of a well-defined sense of self is inadequate, and the individual engages in self-questioning to seek new sources of meaning and fulfillment. Second, identity conflicts occur, when a person has difficulties in reconciling different components of personal identity that prescribe behaviors which are incompatible between them. In recent decades, the bulk of research on identity crises of migrants has been focused on the issue of identity conflicts. Situated implicitly in a social identity framework, this body of research examines the process of ethnic and cultural identity shifts among immigrants and their children, in relation to the processes of acculturation and interethnic contacts (Leong and Ward 2000, 763–764).<sup>6</sup>

在个体内部模型中, Baumeister区分了两类与身份相关的问题:首先,当个体无法建立个人目标和价值观或维持对它们的承诺时,就会出现 *身份缺失*。形成一个明确的自我感是不充分的,个体会进行自我质疑,以寻求新的意义和满足感的来源。其次,当一个人难以协调个人身份中规定了彼此不兼容行为的不同组成部分时,就会发生 *身份冲突*。在近几十年的迁移者身份危机研究中,大部分都集中在身份冲突问题上。这一研究体系隐含地位于社会身份框架中,考察了迁移者及其子女在文化认同和种族认同转变过程中,与文化适应和族际接触过程的关系 (Leong and Ward 2000, 763–764)。在近几十年的迁移者身份危机研究中,大部分都集中在身份冲突问题上。这一研究体系隐含地位于社会身份框架中,考察了迁移者及其子女在文化认同和种族认同转变过程中,与文化适应和族际接触过程的关系 (Leong and Ward 2000, 763–764) <sup>6</sup>。

On the other hand, the issue of identity deficit has received scant attention from migration scholars. During migration, the value that migrants attach to ideas of success can become problematic, especially when they are weakened by a multitude of difficulties that they face, finding it challenging to achieve their initial objectives. Sociologists are quite familiar with the process of “globalized individuation from below” in which migrants experience social disqualification and downward social mobility during migration. Many migrants undergo social and professional downgrades in the host country, due to ethno-racial discriminations or unfair immigration policies (Cattelain et al. 2005; Lévy 2005; Mahut 2017; Zhao 2009). In ethnic enclaves, some Chinese migrants suffer extreme economic exploitation at the hands of their fellow Chinese and are confined to “survival circuits” (Chuang 2013; Yun

另一方面,身份缺失的问题却很少受到迁移者学者的关注。在迁移者过程中,迁移者对成功观念的重视可能变得问题重重,尤其是当他们因面临诸多困难而变得脆弱,发现实现初始目标具有挑战性时。社会学家非常熟悉“自下而上的全球化个体化”过程,其中迁移者在迁移过程中经历社会资格丧失和社会阶层下降。由于种族歧视或不公平的迁移者政策,许多迁移者在东道国经历了社会和职业降级 (Cattelain et al. 2005; Lévy 2005; Mahut 2017; Zhao 2009)。在族裔聚居区,一些中国迁移者遭受同胞的极端经济剥削,被限制在“生存循环”中 (Chuang 2013; Yun

<sup>5</sup> The term “identity crisis” was coined by E. H. Erikson in his book *Childhood and Society* (1950), inspired by the experience of emigration, immigration, and Americanization. Although the author applied his concept mainly in the study of adolescent development, it has been used in the context of immigrant adaptation in this research.

<sup>6</sup> Such conflicts can be experienced differently across generations. While first-generation migrants remain mostly loyal to their culture of origin, immigrant children are frequently torn between two sets of identities and commitments (Sommers 1969; Wang 2016b). <sup>5</sup>

<sup>5</sup> “身份危机”一词由E. H. Erikson在其1950年的著作《童年与社会》中首创,灵感来源于迁移者、移居和美国化的经历。尽管该作者主要在青少年发展研究中应用了这一概念,但在本研究中已将其用于迁移者适应的背景中。

<sup>6</sup> 这种冲突在不同代之间的体验可能不同。第一代迁移者大多忠于他们的原始文化,而迁移者子女经常两套身份和承诺之间挣扎 (Sommers 1969; Wang 2016b)。

## 在法国的中国留学生的身份认同危机 105

et al. 2006); The uncertainty of their legal status in the country condemns some Chinese migrants to extreme precariousness in all aspects of their lives, with no hope of success in their host country or returning to their country of origin. These social trials can lead to disillusionment, the loss of self, breakdown of personal identity and mental suffering emblematically manifesting as mental illnesses (Wang 2016a, 2017).

在国家中的法律地位不确定使一些中国迁移者在生活的各个方面极度不稳定，没有在东道国成功或返回原籍国的希望。这些社会考验可能导致幻灭、自我丧失、个人身份瓦解和以精神疾病象征性地表现的心理痛苦（Wang 2016a, 2017）。

But the identity deficit is not only a question linked to the loss of motivation or blurring of objectives. More often, migrants remain attached to the norms of social success inherited from their social milieu, but these norms lose their practical relevance in the context of migration and appear gradually as “misleading norms” (Widmer and Spini 2017) that penalize the migrants. The migrants experience a growing dissonance towards their old forms of identity. Consequently, during migration individuals and groups often display hysteresis<sup>7</sup>, a profound discrepancy between internalized social norms and the new objective conditions in which they are located. Bourdieu and Sayad (1964) discuss the hysteresis in relation to the problems of disorientation that many Algerian peasants faced when they had to live in the city. Even after years of urban life, some individuals could not adapt to their new life context, because they continued to refer to the norms and ways of thinking that were characteristic of their lives in the countryside (Chudzikowski and Mayrhofer 2011). This phenomenon is common among Chinese graduates in France. The historical context of educational mobility has changed dramatically, but the ideal of social success, inherited from a period of strong economic growth, continues to set the standard for migrants and their families.

但身份缺失不仅仅是与动力丧失或目标模糊有关的问题。更多时候，迁移者仍然依附于他们从社会环境中继承的社会成功规范，但这些规范在迁移者背景下失去了实际相关性，并逐渐表现为“误导性规范”（Widmer and Spini 2017），惩罚了迁移者。迁移者经历了对旧身份形式的日益不协调。因此，在迁移者过程中，个人和群体经常表现出迟滞，即内化的社会规范与他们所处的新客观条件之间的深刻差异。布迪厄和萨亚德（1964）讨论了迟滞与许多阿尔及利亚农民在必须在城市生活时面临的迷失问题有关。即使在城市生活多年后，一些人也无法适应他们的新生活环境，因为他们继续参照他们在乡村生活中特有的规范和思维方式（Chudzikowski and Mayrhofer 2011）。这种现象在法国的中国毕业生中很常见。教育流动的历史背景发生了巨大变化，但是来自经济高速增长时期的社会成功理想，继续为迁移者及其家庭设定标准。

Thus, in the case of Chinese student migrants in France they display both identity deficit and identity conflicts and these identity deficits bring about identity conflicts. Transitions in relationships and the changing situational contexts are likely to provoke identity crises. It is necessary to take into account the dual change inherent in migration: not only are migrants dealing with the transition from one country to another (hence from one system of cultural references to another), but also the transformation of socio-economic contexts in the country of origin during the stay of migrants abroad, making reintegration of migrants in their country of origin problematic (Sussman 2011). Identity crises



are therefore not synonymous with social marginalities or passing crises. They potentially concern all student migrants, during their entire migratory journeys. Regarding self-construction in migration, these are two hypotheses:

因此，在法国的中国学生迁移者案例中，他们既表现出身份缺失也表现出身份冲突，这些身份缺失引发了身份冲突。关系的转变和情境背景的变化很可能引发身份危机。有必要考虑迁移者固有的双重变化：迁移者不仅要处理从一个国家到另一个国家的转变（因此从一个文化参照体系到另一个），而且还要处理在迁移者海外逗留期间原籍国社会经济背景的转变，使得迁移者在原籍国的重新融入成为问题（Sussman 2011）。因此，身份危机并不等同于社会边缘化或过渡性危机。它们可能关系到所有学生迁移者，在他们整个迁移者旅程中。关于迁移者中的自我构建，这里有两个假设：

First, the construction of personal identity is an articulation of two heterogeneous processes: on the one hand, a biographical process by which the

首先，个人身份的构建是两个异质过程的表达：一方面，是一个传记过程，通过这个过程，

<sup>7</sup> *hysteresis means looking back in ancient Greek.*

<sup>7</sup> *hysteresis 迟滞, 在古希腊语中意味着回望过去。*

## 106 Li Yong

Chinese students build their “self-images for themselves” from their “inherited” identities, but also from their “lived trajectories” during their studies and their work in France. The so-built “identities for oneself” are nothing but “the story they tell themselves about what they are” (Laing 1991, 114) and what Goffman calls “real” social identities. On the other hand, a relational process by which students are assigned “virtual” social identities in their interactions with significant others: the institutions and their “identity-giving” agents, but also the group of peers, relatives, etc. Identity-based configurations are relatively stable, but still evolving forms of compromise between the results of these two variously articulated transactions (Dubar 2004, 112).

中国学生从他们的“遗传”身份，以及他们在法国学习和工作期间的“经历轨迹”中构建自己的“自我形象”。如此构建的“自我身份”也不过是“他们自述的，关于自己是什么的故事”（Laing 1991, 114），以及戈夫曼所说的“真实”社会身份。另一方面，是一个关系过程，通过这个过程，学生在与重要第三方的互动中被赋予“虚拟”的社会身份，这些第三方有：机构及其“赋予身份”的代理人，但也包括同伴、亲戚等群体。基于身份的配置相对稳定，却仍是这两种不同上述交易结果之间妥协的不断演化形式。（Dubar 2004, 112）。

Secondly, the construction of the life-course of the Chinese student migrant is part of a reflexive process that implies changes in his personal identity. The term “reflexive” means that in the migration process, the migrant continues to modify his life plans to adapt to new situations; it also means that the biographical process is accompanied by a profound change in self-identity.

其次，中国学生迁移者生命轨迹的塑造是个人身份变化的反思性过程的一部分。“反思性”指的是在迁移者过程中，迁移者不断调整其生活规划以适应新环境；同时也指这一过程伴随着对自我认同的深刻反

思和变革。

## 4 Methodology

### 4 方法论

Questions of Identity are basically questions of language: to be able to identify oneself or to be identified means to describe oneself in words. In order to capture this narrative identity (Ricoeur 1985)<sup>8</sup>, the author used the life story that assumes the establishment of a particular relationship between the researcher and the person then considered as a subject (Bertaux 2010).

身份问题本质上是语言问题：能够认知自己或被认知意味着用语言描述自己。为了捕捉这种叙事身份（Ricoeur 1985）<sup>8</sup>，作者使用了生活故事，假设研究者和当时被视为主体的人之间建立了特定的关系（Bertaux 2010）。

During the years 2007–2016, I studied a group of Chinese graduates who remained in France after their university training, mainly for work reasons. The field survey took place in the Normandy region and in Île-de-France. In total, I have interviewed 45 migrant students working in different segments of the French labor market: 23 employees, five researchers, nine entrepreneurs and businessmen and eight who are in other professions. My respondents are between 25 and 36 years old. Nearly half of them are women (20 out of 45). The research also includes accompanying respondents in the evolution of their life project, through second or third wave interviews, observations and informal contacts. The repeated narratives allow me to compare the self-analyzation of my respondents over time and better understand their identity adjustment operations.

在2007年至2016年间，我研究了一组在大学培训后留在法国的中国毕业生，主要出于工作原因。田野调查在诺曼底地区和Île-de-France地区进行。总共，我采访了45名在法国劳动市场不同部门工作的迁移者学生：23名雇员，5名研究人员，9名企业家和商人以及8名其他职业人士。我的受访者年龄在25至36岁之间。他们中近一半是女性（45中的20）。研究还包括通过第二或第三轮访谈、观察和非正式接触，陪伴受访者在其人生项目的演变中。如此反复的叙述让我能够比较我的受访者随着时间而演变的自我分析，并更好地理解他们身份调整的操作。

<sup>8</sup> “Narrative identity” is to be understood as an ability to recite one’s own existence (Ricoeur 1985).

<sup>8</sup> “叙事身份”应理解为叙述一个人自己存在的能力（Ricoeur 1985）。

#### The identity crisis of Chinese graduates in France 107

#### 在法国的中国留学毕业生的身份认同危机 107

Claude Dubar, speaking of the difficulties of studying the identity formation of our contemporaries has remarked that speaking of one’s life is a high-risk exercise: “not only does one not tell his intimate life to anyone, but it is only told when it goes wrong and to therapists. Therefore, it is unlikely that sociologist can easily collect relevant materials.” (Dubar 2010, 209) However, some interviewees

seem to grasp the interview situation as an opportunity to be heard and explain themselves, “to build their own point of view on themselves and on the world” (Bourdieu 1993, 1407). It was not uncommon for my respondents to tell me intimate details that affect their personal identities. My listening stance, the social proximity between me, the researcher and my respondents and my interviewing strategies (such as disclosing information about myself) have certainly fostered this accompanied self-analysis (Bourdieu 1993, 1408).

克洛德·迪巴尔 (Claude Dubar) 在谈到研究我们这个时代的人的身份形成的困难时指出, 谈论一个人的生活是一项高风险的行为: “人不仅不会向任何人透露他的私生活, 而且只有在出问题时会向治疗师讲述。因此, 社会学家很难轻易收集到相关材料。” (Dubar 2010, 209) 然而, 一些受访者似乎抓住了访谈的机会, 用以被倾听并解释自己, “构建他们自己对自己和世界的观点” (布迪厄 1993, 1407)。对我来说, 受访者告诉我影响他们个人身份的亲密细节并不少见。我的倾听态度、我作为研究者与我的受访者之间的社会接近性以及我的访谈策略 (例如披露有关我自己的信息) 无疑促进了这种伴随的自我分析 (布迪厄 1993, 1408)。

## 5 Identities under threat

### 5 激流中的自我认同

We can distinguish two main sources of identity crises among migrants: the first is related to the risks and uncertainties inherent in the migration process, to incidents perceived by migrants as “biographical accidents,” for example, unemployment and subsequent marital or family conflicts; the second is an experience shared among a generation of migrants, such as feeling a gap between themselves and their peers, reported by many respondents.

我们可以区分迁移者身份危机的两个主要来源: 第一个与迁移过程中固有的风险和不确定性有关, 以及迁移者所感知的“传记性事故”, 例如, 失业及随之而来的婚姻或家庭冲突; 第二个是一代迁移者之间的共同经历, 如许多受访者报告的, 感觉自己与同龄人之间存在差距。

#### 5.1 Ideal of success in a crisis

##### 5.1 危机中的成功理想

The ideal of social success has played an important role in the genesis of inter-national studies projects for young Chinese today (Li 2015). For migrants who are engaged in such a strong mobility project, migration is envisaged primarily as a way to improve their access to opportunities. The success of their project is measured by a double comparison: first, a comparison with themselves, because through their studies abroad the respondents wish to obtain a more favorable position compared to the one, they would have occupied, if they had stayed in China. Second, a comparison with others, because the migrants are expected to surpass non-migrant members of their original social milieu: childhood friends, university classmates, former work colleagues, for example.

社会成功的理想在当今中国年轻人的国际学习项目产生中发挥了重要作用 (李, 2015年)。对于参与这样强大迁移项目的迁移者来说, 迁移者主要被设想为一种提高他们获取机会的途径。他们项目的成功通过双重比较来衡量: 首先, 与自己的比较, 因为通过国外的学习, 受访者希望相对于如果他们留在

中国，他们将占据一个更有利的位置。其次，与他人的比较，因为迁移者们预计要超越原始社会环境中的非迁移者成员：童年朋友、大学同学、前工作同事等。

For Chinese students, the ways in which they attempt to fulfil this ideal are largely inherited from their Chinese experience, particularly in the (secondary) school system. Thus, the arrival in France implies for these young Chinese a

对于中国学生来说，他们尝试实现这一理想的方式很大程度上是从他们的中国经验中继承而来，尤其是在（中等）学校体系中。因此，对于这些年轻的中国人来说，到达法国意味着

### 108 Li Yong

change of“cultural model.”It is necessary to be strong, hardworking, but above all to be oneself. It is this imperative to find their path in an uncertain environment that can be difficult for many young migrants. During the interview, Sun (25 years old, Master Global Management, trainee) was seized with a sense of confusion and loss. She regretted not having worked hard enough in her MBA training in France to optimize her performance: the hours of training were light and the level of supervision was low. She did not exhaust her energy to pass the exams. At the same time, Sun feels a certain nostalgia for her“fighting state”when she was in her last year of high school, during the preparation of thegaokao. Her dissatisfaction is all the greater as her Chinese friend in Australia seems to have shown a greater personal performance, since he always seemed to be busy with his homework:

面对文化模式的变化。人必须强大、勤奋，但最重要的是要做自己。在不确定的环境中找到自己的道路对许多年轻的移民来说可能很困难且至关重要的。在采访中，孙（25岁，硕士全球管理，实习生）感到困惑和失落。她后悔自己在法国MBA培训中没有努力工作以优化自己的表现：培训时间很短，监督水平很低。她没有耗尽精力去通过考试。与此同时，孙对她在高中最后一年（高考备考期间）的“奋斗状态”感到某种怀旧。她的不满更加强烈，因为她在澳大利亚的中国朋友似乎表现出更优的个人表现，因为他似乎总是忙于做家庭作业：

Sun:“according to my friend in Australia—he studies law there. He will die! Each time I call him, he is very busy: he has to work his paper, study the files, prepare the projects, make presentations. But he is very satisfied. He often told me that he must go to the library. I said, why you have to go to the library and I’m always at home?”

Interviewer:“Hey!”

Sun:“Because he went abroad at the same time as me, but he has to study a few more years. Why is he still in the library and I always at home? It’s very different! I thought at first that it’s like the United States, we work like crazy every day for memoirs and projects. But it’s okay, we’re not pushed that far!”

Interviewer:“You are not pushed to a state like you imagined.”

Sun:“It’s okay. A little below this state. I spent one or two nights for presentations, other wise, it’s OK! I have once or twice reviewed my courses before exams. But I do not read everything, because no one does it. What’s the point of reading everything?”



Interviewer: "There is no longer this feeling of competition for good will!"

Sun: "No. I felt that I am not adapted. [...] I am a little disappointed."

孙：“根据我在澳大利亚的朋友说——他在那里学习法律。他会累死的！每次我给他打电话，他都很忙：他得完成论文，学习案例，准备项目，做演讲。但他很满意。他经常告诉我他必须去图书馆。我说，你为什么必须去图书馆而我总是在家呢？”

采访者：“嘿！”

孙：“因为他和我同时出国，但他得多学几年。为什么他还在图书馆而我总是在家呢？太不一样了！起初我以为就像在美国一样，我们每天都为了论文和项目疯狂工作。但没关系，我们没有被推到那么远！”

采访者：“你没有被推到你想象的那种状态。”

孙：“还好。稍微低于那种状态。我为了演讲花了一两个晚上，其他时候都还好！我考试前有一两次复习我的课程。但我没有读所有的东西，因为没有人那么做。读完所有东西有什么意义呢？”

采访者：“不再有为了美好憧憬而竞争的感觉了！”

孙：“没有。我觉得我不适应。[...] 我有点失望。”

In France, it is Alain Ehrenberg (Ehrenberg 2008, 2010, 2011) who has correctly diagnosed this “weakening of the ego” that affects many of our contemporaries. According to the author, this malaise results from the inability of the individual to cope with the change of the cultural model: in recent decades, there has been in France a transition from the individual conforming to the norms of his social milieu to “the individual-trajectory to the conquest of his personal identity” (Ehrenberg 2008). The transition to a “new model” is particularly difficult for adult generations, given their past experiences and the persistence of their values. In the case of the Chinese student migrants we studied, it is the migrants themselves who embrace the model of the individual as a “self-sculptor”. By committing themselves to international mobility, they pursue the ideal of self-realization, self-surpassing, and being efficient. However,

在法国，正是阿兰·埃伦伯格（Alain Ehrenberg）准确诊断了影响我们许多同代人的“自我削弱”现象。根据作者的说法，这种不适源于个体无法应对文化模式的变化：近几十年来，法国经历了从个体遵循其社会环境的规范向“个体-轨迹征服个人身份”（Ehrenberg 2008）的转变。向“新模式”的过渡对成年一代来说尤其困难，鉴于他们的过去经历和价值观的持续性。在我们研究的中国学生移民案例中，正是移民本身拥抱了作为“自我塑造者”的个体模型。通过致力于国际流动，他们追求自我实现、自我超越和高效的理想。然而

## The identity crisis of Chinese graduates in France 109

### 在法国的中国留学毕业生的身份认同危机 109

when“personal adequacy”is highly dependent on the individual's competitive performance, it is not surprising to find that some respondents experienced a “feeling of inadequacy,”an impression of“not being up to the mark”,whenthey did not fully devote their time and energy to“productive”activities.

当“个人适应性”高度依赖于个体的竞争性表现时，一些受访者体验到一种“不足感”，即在他们没有完全投入时间和精力于“生产性”活动时，会有一种“达不到标准”的印象，这并不令人惊讶。

Thus, the transition from one cultural model to another is likely to create identity crises, which result in a“feeling of loss,”an impression of“maladjustment,”a“disappointment,”as Sun put it in her narrative. If migration is conducive to the emergence of identity crises, there are small depressions related to the “misery of the position”(Bourdieu 1993) and big depressions caused by ordeals of rupture: the impossibility of finding a job corresponding to the quality of the obtained diploma, dismissal, unemployment, and correlatively, the threat of losing the right of residence, conflicts with relatives, etc. Crises, because they concern“vital beliefs, strongly internalized values, models underlying ordinary existence”(Dubar 2010, 167), can be experienced in dramatic ways. The individual“suffers from himself”. The self-image turns negative, foremost“in one'sown eyes”(Dubar 2010, 167). It becomes difficult to bear. These trials can lead, in some cases, to withdrawal and attempts to escape. On this subject, the following experience of a young engineer is very illustrative.

**因此，从一个文化模型过渡到另一个文化模型很可能会引发身份危机，导致一种“失落感”，一种“不适应”的印象正如孙在她的叙述中所表达的“失望”。如果说迁移有助于身份危机的出现，那么这些危机既有与“地位的悲惨”（布迪厄 1993）相关的小型抑郁，也有因撕裂的考验而引起的大型抑郁：找不到与获得的文凭相符的工作、被解雇、失业，以及相应地，失去居留权的威胁、与亲人的冲突等。危机，因为涉及到“生命信仰、深度内化的价值观、支撑日常存在的模型”（Dubar 2010, 167），可以以戏剧性的方式体验。个体“因自己而受苦”。自我形象变得负面，最重要的是“在自己眼中”（Dubar 2010, 167）。这变得难以承受。这些考验在某些情况下，可能导致撤退和逃避的尝试。关于这个话题，以下一位年轻工程师的经历非常具有说明性。**

In 2008, I interviewed an unemployed young engineer in Paris. A few months after our interview, this young man developed a gastric ulcer that was probably related to his anxieties and his unregulated single life. During his hospitalization in Paris, won by a feeling of shame and a desire for introspection, he decided to cut off unilaterally all contact with the outside world. His parents in China, having no sign of life from their only son for several weeks, began to look for him everywhere. After having exhausted their personal contact directories, they contacted the Chinese embassy in France. The latter finally found him through the Chinese student associations.

2008年，我在巴黎采访了一位失业的年轻工程师。采访几个月后，这位年轻人因焦虑和不规律的单身生活而患上了胃溃疡，这很可能与他的焦虑有关。在巴黎住院期间，被羞愧感和自省欲望所击败，他决定单方面切断与外界的所有联系。他在中国的父母，几周没有从他们唯一的儿子那里得到任何生活迹象，开始四处寻找他。在耗尽了他们的个人联系目录后，他们联系了法国的中国大使馆。后者最终通过中国学生会找到了他。

This individual story illustrates how employment in France represents a crucial identity issue for young Chinese graduates and how its absence is fraught with psychic and relational consequences. In short, the ideal of social success is called into question, either because the individual blames

himself or herself for not having known how to give the best of oneself, or because he or she is unable to achieve this ideal in its prescribed form. It follows identity crises that disturbs the self-image, self-esteem and the very definition that the person gives “from self to oneself.” But identity crises also result from the gap that migrants experience when comparing their situation with those of others, especially their non-migrant peers.

这个个体的故事说明了在法国就业对年轻中国毕业生来说是一个关键的身份问题，以及其缺席充满了心理和关系后果。简而言之，社会成功的理想受到质疑，不是因为个体责备自己没有能够尽力，就是因为他或她无法以规定的形式实现这一理想。接踵而至的身份危机，扰乱了自我形象、自尊，以及人对“自我至自我的”(自我内在对话)定义。但是，身份危机也源于移民在比较自己的情况与他人，尤其是非移民同龄人的情况时所经历的差距。

110 Li Yong

## 5.2 A double gap

### 5.2 一个双重差距

In the context of student migration, because most of my respondents plan to return to China, the students tend to view their peers in China as a point of reference to evaluate the success or failure of their project: childhood friends, high school and university classmates, former colleagues at work, etc. The migrants constantly wondered if they “made it.” This is not only a question of whether they have achieved the targets they had set for themselves when they left their country, but also if they are “doing better” than others, especially better than those who have not emigrated.

在学生移民的背景下，由于我的大多数受访者计划返回中国，学生们倾向于将他们在中国的同龄人作为评估自己项目成功或失败的参照点：童年朋友、高中和大学同学、以前的工作同事等。移民们不断地问自己是否“成功了”。这不仅仅是一个问题，关于他们是否实现了离开国家时为自己设定的目标，还包括他们是否“做得更好”，尤其是比那些没有移民的人做得更好。

For the respondents, reflections on this subject are often a source of disappointment, since the most successful people are always used as a benchmark. Migrants agree that in comparison to themselves, their peers advance faster on family and professional levels and enjoy more favorable living conditions. The feeling of lagging behind is sorely felt, especially when students have arrived in France a long time ago. In fact, this malaise, commonly shared by this generation of Chinese student migrants, has deeper objective reasons.

对于受访者而言，关于这个主题的反思常常是失望的来源，因为最成功的人总是被用作基准。移民们认同，与自己相比，他们的同龄人在家庭和职业层面上进展得更快，并享有更有利的生活条件。尤其是当学生很久以前就来到法国时，落后的感觉尤其强烈。事实上，这种不安，这一代中国学生移民普遍共有，有着更深层的客观原因。

Firstly, to achieve the same degree of social mobility, migration almost always imposes an additional investment on migrants in terms of time compared to non-migrants. For example, by coming to France, Chinese students spend a substantial amount of time learning a foreign language in order to

adapt to an education system different from the Chinese system and to complete their training. This investment in terms of time is all the more important as the student's career is part of the logic of conversion: the change of discipline, the reorientation towards another specialty considered as more rewarding, the "refreshing in training in France after having already worked in China", as my interviewees said, etc.<sup>9</sup> This extension of schooling has multiple consequences on the subsequent life-courses of the Chinese graduates:<sup>10</sup> The entry of the migrant into working life is postponed, as well as his or her access to more stable administrative status in the host country (for example, a residence card rather than a student residence permit). Romantic relationships are often destabilized or relegated to the second level for the benefit of a professional career; entry into married and parental life is delayed, and so on. As a result, the migrant feels that

首先，为了达到相同程度的社会流动性，相比非移民，移民几乎总是需要在时间上投入额外的投资。例如，来到法国的中国学生需要花费大量时间学习外语，以适应与中国教育系统不同的教育系统并完成他们的培训。这种时间上的投资尤其重要，因为学生的职业生涯是转换逻辑的一部分：学科的变更、向被视为更有回报的其他专业的重新定向、“在中国已经工作后在法国的再培训”（正如我的受访者所说）<sup>9</sup>，等等。这种延长的学习期对中国毕业生的后续人生轨迹有多重影响：<sup>10</sup> **移民进入工作生活被推迟，以及他或她在东道国获得更稳定的行政地位的机会被推迟（例如，居留卡而不是学生居留许可）。为了职业生涯的利益，浪漫关系常常会变得不稳定或降级到第二优先级；进入婚姻和为人父母的生活被推迟，等等。** 结果，移民感到

<sup>9</sup> *It is significant that the average age of foreign students in France is higher than that of French students (25.8 years versus 22.1 years) (Paivandi and Vourc'h 2005).*

<sup>10</sup> *In an analysis in terms of cost-benefit, we can surmise that the prolongation of schooling imposes on individuals the economic and non-economic costs that are non-negligible, for an uncertain benefit in terms of social mobility (Boudon 1973, 209).*

<sup>9</sup> 值得注意的是，法国外国学生的平均年龄高于法国学生（25.8岁对比22.1岁）（Paivandi和Vourc'h 2005）。

<sup>10</sup> 在成本-效益分析中，我们可以推测，延长的学习期对个体强加了不可忽视的经济和非经济成本，对于社会流动性的不确定收益（Boudon 1973, 209）。

## The identity crisis of Chinese graduates in France 111

### 在法国的中国留学毕业生的身份认同危机 111

he or she is lagging behind in different areas of life compared to his or her peers who remained in their country.

与他们留在原国的同龄人相比，他或她在生活的不同领域落后了。

Thinking of his six years spent in France, four years of graduate studies and two years of work as a programmer, Zheng (32 years old, Master of engineering, programmer) considers that he is late compared to his friends in China from the professional and family point of view. In addition, his living



conditions in Paris are not better than those of his friends in China. His fiancé, Hong (30 years old, Master of management, employee in a financial management company) shares his observation:

想他在法国度过的六年，四年的研究生学习和两年的程序员工作，郑（32岁，工程硕士，程序员）认为自己在职业和家庭方面比他在中国的朋友晚了。此外，他在巴黎的生活条件不比他在中国的朋友们好。他的未婚妻洪（30岁，管理硕士，金融管理公司雇员）分享了他的观察：

Zheng: "For me, the biggest question faced by Chinese in France is knowing where we are going. [...] This is a question mainly asked by those who have worked for one or two years in France. If you came to France after gaokao, you completed your Master training and worked for one or two years, it's been already six or seven years. For me, it's been almost six years. You must spend seven years to have a stable status. You must spend six or seven years to become a real employee, to have a place in French society. Meanwhile, your friends in China have advanced to a certain level. For example, my classmates."

郑：“对我来说，中国人在法国面临的最大问题是知道我们要去哪里。[...] 这主要是那些在法国工作了一两年的人提出的问题。如果你高考后来到法国，完成了硕士培训并工作了一两年，那么已经六七年了。对我来说，已经快六年了。你必须花七年时间才能有一个稳定的状态。你必须花六七年时间才能成为真正的雇员，才能在法国社会中有一席之地。与此同时，你在中国的朋友已经达到了一定的水平。比如，我的同学。”

Hong: "They have all bought their houses and their cars."

洪：“他们都买了房子和车。”

Zheng: "Not for all, but even for those who have not yet had them, they are very successful in their careers. Those who are in the business, they are already directors of their companies; those who are in the political world, they are already section chiefs or department heads. They can rise in rank step by step. They already have their families, their children. The housing, yes; the car, not for everyone. They are entering the middle class. Because they have worked for six years, their savings are much higher than ours. We spent six years in France to study at the university, to returning to the engineering school,<sup>11</sup> to work. In fact, we have no advantage over them."

郑：“不是所有人，但即使对于那些还没有的人，他们在职业上非常成功。那些在商界的，他们已经是公司的董事；那些在政界的，他们已经是科长或部门负责人了。他们可以一步步升职。他们已经有了自己的家庭，他们的孩子。房子，是的；车，不是每个人都有。他们正在进入中产阶级。因为他们工作了六年，他们的储蓄比我们的多得多。我们在法国花了六年时间在大学学习，回到工程学校工作。实际上，我们对他们没有任何优势。”

Secondly, on a global scale, there are high-speed lanes that accelerate the tempo of individual life, as well as slow tracks that "slow down" the pace of the development of individual life (Urry 2005). When Chinese students came to France, they felt as if they were being captured in a slow path of social life: economic growth is almost nil, social changes are not visible to the uninitiated. However, during their stay in France, the socio-economic landscape has changed radically in China. With an annual growth

rate approaching 10 %, China's GDP doubles every seven years with multiple consequences for Chinese nationals:<sup>12</sup> modification of urban

其次，在全球范围内，有加速个人生活节奏的快车道，也有“放慢”个人生活发展节奏的慢车道（Urry 2005）。当中国学生来到法国时，他们感觉自己被困在了社会生活的慢车道上：经济增长几乎为零，社会变化对外行来说不可见。然而，在他们留在法国期间，中国的社会经济景观发生了根本性的变化。随着年增长率接近10%，中国的GDP每七年翻一番，给中国国民带来了多重后果：城市的改变

<sup>11</sup> *Before coming to France, Zheng worked for two years as a programmer in Chongqing, China.*

<sup>11</sup> 来法国之前，郑在中国重庆作为程序员工作了两年。

<sup>12</sup> *After a period of strong growth (1991–2011), Chinese growth has been slowing down in recent years. In 2015, China's growth was 6.9 %, the lowest rate ever recorded in a quarter of a century. The Chinese government lowered its growth forecast for the years leading up to 2020 to 6.5 %. A sufficient rate in the eyes of Chinese leaders to fulfill their promise to the people: a doubling of the average income of Chinese between 2010 and 2020 (Harold 2016).*

<sup>12</sup> 经过一段强劲增长期（1991–2011），中国增长在近年来有所放缓。2015年，中国的增长率为6.9%，是四分之一一个世纪以来最低的记录。中国政府将2020年之前的增长预测下调至6.5%。在中国领导人看来，这一增长率足以实现他们对人民的承诺：2010年到2020年间中国人均收入翻倍（Harold 2016）。

## 112 Li Yong

landscapes, general increase in incomes, expansion of the labor market, emergence of new sectors of activity, transformation of consumption patterns, access of the middle classes to property, etc. The young graduates who have stayed in the country are driven by this dynamic. They are therefore part of a rapid path of social mobility: they must act quickly, seize opportunities that are available, make bifurcations, move quickly from one place to another. In the manner of an astronaut for whom space travel has had a slowing effect of time, Chinese migrants experience a sense of immobility in time when they return to the country of origin: The outside world has radically changed without them.<sup>13</sup>

土地景观的变化，收入的普遍增加，劳动市场的扩大，新活动领域的出现，消费模式的转变，中产阶级对财产的获取等。留在国内的年轻毕业生被这种动态所驱动。因此，**他们是社会流动快速路径的一部分：他们必须迅速行动，抓住可用的机会，创造分叉，快速从一个地方移动到另一个地方。**就像对于宇航员而言，太空旅行有时间减缓的效果一样，**中国移民在返回原籍国时体验到一种时间上的静止感：外部世界在没有他们参与的情况下发生了剧烈的变化。**<sup>13</sup>

Chinese development has led to the trivialization of “foreign things” and “experiences abroad.” The gap in income levels between Europe and China has been reduced. There is a demystification of life abroad through the intensifying exchange of goods and information between China and the rest of the world as well as the development of mass tourism. The way Chinese look at their compatriots abroad has changed and in turn, the ways in which overseas Chinese perceive and define themselves has evolved as well. Today, many Chinese migrants in France experience a sense of relative deprivation,

bitterness or even feeling ashamed of themselves when comparing their living conditions with those of their better-performing peers in China. On this subject,Zheng commented:

中国的发展导致了“外国事物”和“海外经历”的平凡化。“欧洲与中国之间的收入水平差距已被缩小。通过中国与世界其他地区之间日益增强的货物和信息交流以及大众旅游的发展，生活在海外的神秘感被揭开。中国人对海外同胞的看法发生了变化，反过来，海外华人对自己的认知和定义也发生了演变。今天，许多在法国的中国移民在与他们表现更好的中国同龄人比较生活条件时，体验到了一种相对剥夺感、痛苦甚至对自己感到羞愧。对此，郑评论道：

In addition, China today is very open [the English term is used]. Everything that can be found abroad can be found in China. But everything that can be found in China is not necessarily found abroad. The pace of development in China is well above the French pace. [...] On the other hand, this can create a feeling of [...] gap that the older generations of Chinese students abroad hardly experienced. At the time, for those who stayed in France after their training, whatever job they did, they had a much better life than those who worked in China. Because in the 1980s and 1990s, or at the beginning of the years of reform and opening-up, the level of income in China was very low, and people did not have as much freedom as today. Today we do what we want, don't we?

此外，今天的中国非常开放[使用了英语术语]。国外能找到的东西，在中国也能找到。但在中国能找到的东西，并不一定在国外能找到。中国的发展速度远高于法国的速度。[...] 另一方面，这可能会造成一种[...]差距感，这是早期海外中国学生几乎没有经历过的。那时候，对于那些在培训后留在法国的人，无论他们做什么工作，他们的生活都比在中国工作的人要好得多。因为在1980年代和1990年代，或者改革开放初期，中国的收入水平非常低，人们没有今天这么多的自由。今天我们想做什么就做什么，不是吗？

Now, China has become much better. This created a feeling of...how to say it in Chinese? [...]miwang(迷惘,“puzzlement”) among Chinese students abroad. That is, we do not know how to work toward our future. First, there is this sense of gap in terms of success at work; for those who have never worked, they have experienced an even greater sense of gap. We have the feeling that we have ruined our lives, spending our money in France without having the least result. We're ashamed of ourselves by comparing ourselves with others.

现在，中国变得好多了。这造成了一种...用中文怎么说呢？[...]迷惘，海外的中国学生感到迷惘。也就是说，我们不知道如何为我们的未来努力。首先，就工作成功而言，有这种差距感；对于那些从未工作过的人来说，他们经历了更大的差距感。我们感觉我们毁了自己的生活，在法国花费我们的金钱却没有任何成果。通过与他人比较，我们为自己感到羞愧。

[...] For those who work abroad, they also have this feeling of injustice. Especially for those who did not have good results after a few years of work. You have to find your

[...] 对于那些在国外工作的人来说，他们也有这种不公平的感觉。特别是对于那些几年工作后没有好的成果的人。你必须找到你的

<sup>13</sup> The intensity of this feeling may vary depending on individual characteristics and individual experiences.

<sup>13</sup> 这种感觉的强度可能根据个人特征和个体经历而有所不同。

## The identity crisis of Chinese graduates in France 113

### 在法国的中国留学毕业生的身份认同危机 113

place [in society]. [...] It takes ten years to know what we can really do: five years of study and five years of work. It was after ten years of stay that we finally improved our French to a level somewhat comparable with that of the French. At first you had the ideal of life; after all that time, it is very difficult to always stay true to your ideal.

找到[在社会中的]位置。[...] 要花十年时间才知道我们真正能做什么：五年的学习和五年的工作。是在停留十年之后，我们的法语水平终于有所提高，与法国人相比较为接近。起初你有生活的理想；经过这么长时间，始终忠于你的理想变得非常困难。

The acknowledgment of delay thus creates a double gap in migrants: first, a gap with oneself because of the ideals of success to which one clings. In the words of Paul Ricœur (1985, 422), we can talk about “the distance from the horizons of expectation” (“*After all that time, it is very difficult to always stay true to your ideal*”). The migrants have difficulties imagining their future life, which feels both opaque and uncertain (“*We do not know how to act for our future*”). Then a gap with others: We can talk about the “narrowing of experience space.” The more the migrants feel that they are lagging behind their peers in China, the more they experience a sense of disconnection from the social reality of their homeland. They struggle to “give meaning” to their interactions with their compatriots. “As a result, the double transaction, with others and oneself, is hurting. Words are lacking to make it work and each is thus referred to the close management of its daily life and to very contextual, diverse and shattered identifications.” (Dubar 2010, 208–209)

因此，对延迟的认识在移民中创造了双重差距：首先，由于坚持成功的理想而与自己产生差距。。用保罗·里科尔（Paul Ricœur 1985, 422）的话说，我们可以谈论“期望视野的距离”（“*经过这么长时间，始终忠于你的理想变得非常困难*”）。移民难以想象他们的未来生活，感觉既模糊又不确定（“*我们不知道如何为我们的未来采取行动*”）。然后是与他人之间的差距：我们可以谈论“经验空间的缩小”。移民越是感觉自己落后于中国的同龄人，就越经历与祖国社会现实脱节的感觉。他们努力“赋予”与同胞互动的意义。“因此，与他人和自己的双向交易是伤人的。缺乏言辞来使其运作，每个人因此被指向其日常生活的密切管理以及非常情境化、多样化和破碎化的认同。”（Dubar 2010, 208–209）

## 6 The reshaping of identity and its resistance

### 6 身份的重塑及其阻力

When student migration leads to increasingly uncertain horizons, it does not automatically imply the recognition of others. Migrants experience a double gap, with themselves and with others. This double gap is at the beginning of a crisis of the modes of identification and thus of the identity forms *for others* but also for *oneself*. But it is necessary to postulate that the migrant, with intensive work on himself or herself, can get out of these crises by changing his or her life goals and by assigning



meaning to his or her lived experiences. This work on oneself can lead to an identity reshaping, when the situation expresses an important change, a conflict or significant contradictions. However, this reshaping is not without resistance, especially from the migrant's native environment.

当学生移民导致日益不确定的前景时，并不自动意味着他人的认可。移民体验到了双重差距，与自己与他人。**这种双重差距是认同方式危机的起点，因此也是为 他人 但也为 自己的身份形态的起点。**但必须假设，通过对自身的深入工作，移民可以通过改变他或她的人生目标和赋予他或她所经历的经验以意义，从这些危机中走出。当情况表达了重要的变化、冲突或显著的矛盾时，这种自我工作可以导致身份的重塑。然而，这种重塑并非没有阻力，尤其是来自移民的本土环境。

## 6.1 Identity reflexivity : The rise of identity for oneself

### 6.1 身份反思：自我身份的崛起

For Giddens (1987, 64–77) dissonance is at the origin of individual reflexivity. The reflexive consciousness is needed when the practical consciousness embodied in the routinization of existence is disrupted, blocked, ineffective. For Chinese student migrants, when their stay in a foreign country is prolonged,

对于吉登斯（Giddens 1987, 64–77）来说，不协调是个体反思的起源。当存在的常规化在被破坏、阻塞、无效时，需要反思性意识。对于中国学生移民来说，当他们在外国的逗留时间延长时，

#### 114 Li Yong

the merely instrumental reflexivity of practical sense (how to do it?) is coupled with a more fundamental reflexivity (what should I do? what do I want to do?), which in turn leads to the identity reflexivity (what am I? who am I?) (Le Bart 2008, 225). In many respects, the importance of reflexivity is directly proportional to the tensions and dissatisfaction produced by the various findings of practical impotence (Martuccelli 2002, 525). Therefore, migrants who have experienced vicissitudes during their stay in France are also developing great insight into their own journeys.

仅仅是实践感知的工具性反思（怎么做？）与更根本的反思（我应该做什么？我想做什么？）相结合，进而导致了身份反思（我是谁？我是什么？）（Le Bart 2008, 225）。在很多方面，反思的重要性与由发现各种实践无能产生的紧张和不满成正比（Martuccelli 2002, 525）。因此，在法国逗留期间经历过波折的移民也在他们自己的旅程中发展出了巨大的洞察力。

By listening to the retrospective narratives of our respondents and interviewing them several times, we can identify the traces of their identity reshaping. The self-questioning, the redefinition of one's migratory experience, the claim for uniqueness of self and the distancing of self from one's social role constitute all forms of expressing this identity reshaping.

通过倾听我们受访者的回顾性叙述并多次访谈他们，我们可以识别出他们身份重塑的痕迹。自我质疑、对自己移民经历的重新定义、对自我独特性的主张以及自我与社会角色的疏离，构成了表达这种身份重塑的各种形式。

When discussing the feeling of success, we can see that the narratives of the respondents are often characterized by critical attitudes and detachments to one's social roles. Indeed, to distance oneself from threatened forms of identity is a way of overcoming an identity crisis. This is particularly the case for the category of haigui, who are sometimes glorified, sometimes discredited by the Chinese media or in ordinary conversations: as the success of some arouses admiration and jealousy and the failures of others make them objects of scorn and mockery. This is why Xin (28 years old, Master of engineering, programmer) does not support this caricatured labeling. During his stay in China, he chose not to highlight his haigui-identity. When some parents openly praised him as a role model for family juniors, Xin tried not to enter the game.

在讨论成功感时，我们可以看到受访者的叙述往往以批判态度 and 对自己社会角色的疏离为特征。事实上，与受威胁的身份形式保持距离是克服身份危机的一种方式。对于海归这一类人来说尤其如此，他们时而被中国媒体或在日常对话中赞美，时而诋毁：一些人的成功引起钦佩和嫉妒，而另一些人的失败使他们成为被嘲笑和嘲弄的对象。这就是为什么辛（28岁，工程硕士，程序员）不支持这种夸张的标签。在他回国期间，他选择不强调自己的“海归”身份。当一些父母公开称赞他为家庭年轻一代的榜样时，辛试图不加入这场游戏。

Interviewer: "How do you feel about the perceptions of others during your stay in China?"

采访者：“在中国逗留期间，你对他人的看法有何感受？”

Xin: "I remember that during a family meal, the parents of my cousins said: You must follow the example of your big brother. I blushed to my ears and said to myself: 'Do not follow my example.' If a young person in the family did not study well, people will say, 'Don't be like him.' I am afraid that after a few years, people will say: 'Do not be like him' by pointing fingers at me. There are even pressures like that."

辛：“我记得在一次家庭聚餐中，我的堂兄弟的父母说：你们必须以你的大哥为榜样。我脸红到耳根，心想：‘别跟我的榜样。’如果家里有个年轻人学习不好，人们会说，‘别像他那样。’我害怕几年后，人们会指着我说：‘别像他那样。’甚至还有那样的压力。”

Interviewer: "You want others to say: Be like you. You're afraid that others will say: Don't be like you."

采访者：“你希望别人说：像你那样。你害怕别人说：别像你那样。”

Xin: "Neither. I just want the others to ignore me and eat their meals. I don't want to be the center of attention. It's too tiring. You live well, you have to do even better. When you live badly, others will say: Do not be like him: before he lived well; now he can't do it anymore. This is especially the case when you were born in a big family and you have many cousins. At a family meeting, all parents talk about their children, what they do, how much they earn, etc. And we young people run away from such a conversation."

辛：“两者都不是。我只希望别人忽略我，吃他们的饭。我不想成为注意的中心。太累了。你生活得好，你必须做得更好。当你生活得不好时，别人会说：别像他那样：以前他生活得好；现在他

再也做不到了。特别是当你出生在一个大家庭，有很多堂兄弟姐妹时。在家庭聚会上，所有父母都谈论他们的孩子，他们做什么，赚多少钱等。我们年轻人都会逃避这种对话。”

Interviewer: “And you, young people, do you discuss these topics between yourselves?”

采访者：“你们年轻人之间会讨论这些话题吗？”

Xin: “Never. It’s too tiring to discuss these topics with each other.”

辛：“从不。互相讨论这些话题太累了。”

## The identity crisis of Chinese graduates in France 115

### 在法国的中国留学毕业生的身份认同危机 115

When studies abroad no longer automatically lead to a status, they become an experience whose meaning remains to be defined by everyone him- or herself. Thus, faced by my question “why stay in France,” the respondents seek to justify their prolongation of stay in France (or abroad in general), by referring to personal histories and according to the resources that are most accessible to them. One thing is for sure: for the respondents, the justifications for their stay abroad are situated increasingly in the realm of self-cultivation rather than that of personal performance and self-improvement. It is no longer a question, or at least not primarily, to seek a greater social success in France—a higher income or a material comfort higher than what they can obtain in China—but to enjoy a quieter living environment, a possibility to discover oneself. The identity challenge is important. It is precisely this unique experience that gives the migrants identity matters for their self-construction. The remarkable success of friends in China can make migrants envious, but they can be comforted by their personal enrichment through their international mobility.

当留学不再自动导致身份地位时，它们变成了一种经历，其含义仍待每个人自己定义。因此，面对我提出的“为什么留在法国”的问题，受访者试图通过引用个人历史和对他们最易获取的资源进行解释，来证明他们在法国（或一般来说在国外）逗留时间延长的理由。可以肯定的是：对于受访者来说，他们留在国外的理由越来越多地处于自我修养的领域，而不是个人表现和自我提升的领域。这不再是寻求在法国获得更大社会成功的问题，或至少不是主要的问题——一个比他们在中国能获得的更高的收入或更高的物质舒适——**而是享受一个更宁静的生活环境，一个发现自我的可能性。身份挑战很重要。正是这种独特的经验，为移民的自我构建提供了身份意义。**中国朋友的显著成功可能会让移民感到羡慕，但他们可以通过他们的国际流动性带来的个人成长来得到安慰。

It is surprising to find important changes in migration and professional plans of the respondents during their stay in France. Very often, a nomadic and ambitious career gradually gives way to a more modest project rooted in the reality of the host country. At the same time, the individual measures the gap between his or her ideals of success and his or her real situation and tends to critically evaluate those same ideals.

令人惊讶的是，在法国逗留期间，受访者在移民和职业计划上的重大变化。很多时候，游牧式的、雄心勃勃的职业生涯逐渐让位于植根于东道国现实的更为温和的项目。与此同时，个体衡量自己的成功

理想与实际情况之间的差距，并倾向于批判性地评价这些理想。

Xin, who tells his story in these terms, is one of those. Before coming to study in France, this young engineer had already worked for two years in a telecommunications company in China. His initial project can be described as a strong mobility project, as he considered his studies in France as a way of accelerating his professional career. After training as an engineer, Xin found a job in an IT services company and was fired a few months later following the outbreak of the financial crisis. When I met him for the first time in July 2009, Xin worked in a Chinese restaurant to provide for his needs. He was planning to move to Canada with his Chinese girlfriend the following year. For this, he applied to the Quebec Immigration Office in Paris.

辛就是其中之一。在来法国学习之前，这位年轻工程师已经在中国的一家电信公司工作了两年。他的最初项目可以被描述为一个高流动性项目，因为他将在法国的学习视为加速其职业生涯的方式。在接受工程师培训后，辛在一家IT服务公司找到了工作，并在金融危机爆发几个月后被解雇。2009年7月我第一次见到他时，辛在一家中国餐馆工作以维持生计。他计划明年与他的中国女友移居加拿大。为此，他向巴黎的魁北克移民办公室申请。

What transforms a temporary stay into a sustainable life abroad? The meeting with his Chinese girlfriend, a student of literature at university, certainly played an important role in the decision of non-return. Since she left China at the age of 18, Xin's girlfriend has always preferred living abroad to staying in China. But more importantly, it is the will to live far away from the country of origin that underlies the choices of my interviewee. In our interview Xin describes China as a country beset by the vanity of comparison, by fierce interpersonal competition. He kept on joking about the Chinese obsession with their "face", their strong attachment to the superficial signs of social success (house, car, watch, trendy

什么将临时逗留转变为在国外的可持续生活？与他的中国女友的相遇，一位大学的文学学生，无疑在不返回的决定中扮演了重要角色。自18岁离开中国以来，辛的女友一直更喜欢在国外生活而不是留在中国。但更重要的是，远离原籍国的意愿是我采访对象选择的基础。在我们的采访中，辛将中国描述为一个充满比较虚荣、激烈人际竞争的国家。他继续开玩笑谈论中国人对他们的“面子”，他们对社会成功的表面标志（房子、汽车、手表、时髦

### 116 Li Yong

smartphones, etc.), the outbidding of Chinese parents in educational investment for their children. In this situation, for the Chinese who have gone abroad, the identity of haigui has become too heavy to bear. Especially since Xin feels ashamed to mention to his friends in China his experiences of unemployment and difficulties in France. Above all, the remoteness of the country of origin allows him not to suffer excessive social pressure. We see how Xin articulates his narrative around the ideal of emancipation, as opposed to the ideal of success. It is also in this perspective that Xin plans to educate his future child abroad:

的智能手机等)的强烈依恋，中国父母在孩子教育投资上的竞相出价。在这种情况下，对于那些出国的中国人来说，“海归”的身份变得太沉重。尤其是因为辛羞于向中国的朋友提及他在法国的失业和困难



经历。最重要的是，**远离原籍国让他不必承受过度的社会压力。我们看到辛是如何围绕解放的理想，与成功的理想相对，来叙述他的故事。**正是在这一视角下，辛计划在国外教育他的未来孩子：

Xin: "Yes. What we appreciate most here is the pleasant environment."

辛：“是的。我们在这里最欣赏的是这里宜人的环境。”

Interviewer: "You mean France or Canada?"

采访者：“你是指法国还是加拿大？”

Xin: "I mean foreign countries in general. The second thing is the education of children. If our future children are educated in China, there will be too much pressure for them. And then it'll be too hard for them. You can imagine, studying from morning until the end of the day. Not to mention all the courses added after classes. Chinese children are too tired. They're not like the kids here. The kids here are really happy. We are already very tired, it would be worse for our children. [...]"

辛：“我是指一般的国外。第二件事是孩子的教育。如果我们未来的孩子在中国接受教育，对他们来说压力会太大。然后对他们来说会太难了。你可以想象，从早到晚学习。更不用说课后加的所有课程了。中国的孩子们太累了。他们不像这里的孩子。这里的孩子真的很快乐。我们已经很累了，对我们的孩子来说会更糟。 [...]"

Interviewer: "These are your own experiences [that help you forge this idea]?"

采访者：“这些是你自己的经历[帮助你形成这个想法的]？”

Xin: "Since I was a kid, I saw that everyone was so tired. I was perhaps among the least tired. The kids here... I remember in my neighborhood there are rugby and hockey fields. On Wednesday the children do not work. They can develop their interests—make music, for example. The children are not very busy. They're very relaxed. But in China, if you want to play football, you'll have trouble finding a lawn. Here, you can find lawns everywhere as soon as you want to play sports. My girlfriend always said, she wanted to stay abroad. I thought at the beginning that China and abroad were both good for me. After I left, I found that foreign countries are more developed than China in many aspects. So, I wish to stay there if possible. I'll also bring my parents there one day."

辛：“从我还是个孩子时，我就看到每个人都那么累。我可能是其中最不累的。这里的孩子们...我记得我住的地方有橄榄球和曲棍球场。星期三孩子们不用工作。他们可以发展自己的兴趣——比如，学乐器。孩子们不是很忙。他们很放松。但在中国，如果你想踢足球，你会很难找到草坪。在这里，只要你想运动，到处都可以找到草坪。我的女朋友总是说，她想留在国外。起初我以为中国和国外对我来说都不错。我离开后，我发现国外在很多方面比中国发达得多。所以，如果可能，我希望留在那里。总有一天，我也会把我的父母带到那里。”

Very schematically, we can consider that the reflexivity of the migrants leads to a re-organization of their personal identity around the identity for oneself. This identity dynamic is palpable in the various

practices of self-expression (life stories, intimate conversations, mini-blog, etc.) that migrants use to depict who they really are. In doing so, they also hope that others will recognize them as they are.

可以非常简略地考虑，移民的反思性导致了他们围绕着个人身份的重新组织。这种身份动态在移民用来描绘他们真实自我的各种自我表达实践（生活故事、亲密对话、微博等）中是可感知的。通过这样做，他们也希望他人能够认识到他们的真实面目。

## 6.2 Identity negotiations: between singularization and conformity

### 6.2 身份协商：在个性化与一致性之间

The construction of identity results not only from a personal history but also from social interactions. We have analyzed the ways in which the subject manages intrapersonal contradictions and in this section we examine how the individual manages interpersonal contradictions. The concept of identity negotiation

身份的构建不仅源于个人历史，还来自社会互动。我们已经分析了主体如何管理内部矛盾，在这一部分我们将探讨个体如何管理人际矛盾。身份协商的概念

#### The identity crisis of Chinese graduates in France 117

#### 在法国的中国留学生的身份认同危机 117

deals with identity dynamics generated by the interaction between the subject and other individuals, especially in the individual's family and social interaction networks.

处理由主体与其他个体，特别是在个体的家庭和社会互动网络中的互动产生的身份动态。

Observing the interactions between Chinese graduates and their peers in China, it is to be noted that most of the respondents maintain contact with their peers during their stay in France: university classmates, high school classmates, childhood friends, etc. Friendship is maintained through the "virtual mobility" of migrants, almost instantaneously, thanks to communication and information technologies (messaging, email, telephone, blogs, online social networks, etc.), but also through physical mobility during their trips back to China.

观察中国毕业生及其在中国的同龄人之间的互动，值得注意的是，大多数受访者在法国逗留期间保持与同龄人的联系：大学同学、高中同学、童年朋友等。通过移民的“虚拟流动性”，几乎即时地维持了友谊，感谢通讯和信息技术（即时消息、电子邮件、电话、博客、在线社交网络等），但也通过他们回中国时的身体流动性

According to a hypothesis already formulated by Simmel (1999), there is a specific tension in the modern individual between differentiation phase and dedifferentiation phase. This tension is at the root of the ambivalent relations the respondents have with their peers in China. Depending on personal situations and contexts of interactions, migrants oscillate between the desire to get closer to their Chinese peers and the desire to maintain a distance with them. Chinese migrants wish to

receive signs of approval from their friends, but they are aware of the objective differences that separate them (from the point of view of social status, family situation, etc.). They wish to assert their singularities but fear the negative judgment of others. They want to maintain useful relationships with friends in the home country but are tired of the superficial and utilitarian aspects of sociability. The question then is how to preserve self-esteem in interactions. In this regard, the respondents' answers oscillate between conformity (being like them) and differentiation (being oneself). They cannot indulge in total conformity because it amounts to self-denial and to the admission that their project of emigration is a failure. They must beware of total differentiation, which will lead to identity wandering and marginalization in relation to their reference group.

根据西梅尔（Simmel 1999）已经提出的假设，现代个体之间存在特定的张力，即在差异化阶段和去差异化阶段之间。这种张力是受访者与他们在中国的同龄人之间矛盾关系的根源。根据个人情况和互动背景，移民在靠近他们的中国同龄人的愿望与与他们保持距离的愿望之间摇摆不定。中国移民希望从朋友那里收到认可的信号，但他们意识到将他们分开的客观差异（从社会地位、家庭情况等角度）。他们希望维护自己的独特性，但害怕别人的负面评价。他们想要与祖国的朋友保持有益的关系，但厌倦了社交的表面和功利性方面。那么问题就是如何在互动中保持自尊。在这方面，受访者的回答在一致性（像他们一样）和差异化（做自己）之间摇摆。**他们不能沉迷于完全的一致性，因为这相当于自我否定和承认他们的移民项目是失败的。他们必须警惕完全的差异化，这将导致身份漂泊和相对于他们的参考群体的边缘化。**

Thus, some actions of my respondents can be read as identity strategies (Le Bart 2008, 220). For example, migrants take care of their image on the Internet. The personal spaces of migrants (mini-blog, QQ, personal portals of alumni networks, etc.) become aesthetic performances of describing (and depicting in images) oneself. Some of them regularly publish journals, photos on the themes of travel or cooking. Some women shopkeepers are connected almost permanently during their working days. They chat via instant messengers with their friends in China. The topics of discussions are rarely about work, career or income, but about fashion, cosmetics, children and the like. These themes that have the advantage of being light and serve as points of convergence between two very different social worlds.

因此，我的一些受访者的行为可以被视为身份策略（Le Bart 2008, 220）。例如，移民在互联网上注意他们的形象。移民的个人空间（微博、QQ、校友网络的个人门户等）成为描述（并以图像描绘）自己的美学表现。他们中的一些人定期发布旅行或烹饪主题的日记、照片。一些女性店主在工作日几乎永久在线。他们通过即时消息与中国的朋友聊天。讨论的主题很少涉及工作、职业或收入，而是关于时尚、化妆品、孩子等。这些主题的优点是轻松，并且作为两个非常不同的社会世界之间的汇合点。

### 118 Li Yong

Compared to remote communications, face-to-face interactions have a heavier identity dimension. Trips to China are opportunities for migrants to see their friends and acquaintances. My respondents commonly say that they prefer to meet friends with whom “we feel good,” who “bring us something.” Some respondents avoid superficial or utilitarian sociability, such as alumni meetings, which have become avenues for networking and staging the success of some former classmates in some cases.

与远程通讯相比，面对面的互动具有更深重的身份维度。回国之旅为移民提供了与朋友和熟人见面的机会。我的受访者通常说他们更愿意与“让我们感觉良好”、“给我们带来某些东西”的朋友见面。一些受访者避免表面或功利性的社交，比如校友会，这在某些情况下已成为网络建设和展示一些前同学成功的渠道。

The taste of “Chinese” for comparison is a phenomenon reported by many respondents who criticize this “vanity” of their compatriots. Zheng states that he avoids engaging in income discussions which he considers futile. When asked to compare their personal situations with those of their comrades who remained in China, my respondents gave me two typical answers: the first is to deny any interest in comparison; the second is to deny any possibility of comparison. The comparison is at the very foundation of the identification process. According to Lemaine and Kastersztein (1972), when the individual who compares himself to others perceives a devaluation, a handicap, he will at first try to make himself incomparable to, or at least, not be inferior (Kastersztein 1990, 40). Indeed, the circumvention of the comparison can be the first step of a singularization strategy. The perception of devaluation (e.g. the comparison of income) leads the respondents to search for strategies of compensation and originality. They managed to move the criteria of comparison, to invent new dimensions of judgments or evaluation of the ways of doing things and of being with others (Kastersztein 1990, 37).

许多受访者报告了中国人喜欢比较的现象，并批评了同胞们的这种“虚荣”。郑表示他避免参与他认为是徒劳的收入讨论。当被要求与留在中国的同志们的个人情况进行比较时，我的受访者给出了两个典型的回答：第一个是否认比较的任何兴趣；第二个是否认比较的任何可能性。比较是身份认同过程的基础。根据Lemaine和Kastersztein（1972年），当个体在与其他人比较时感知到贬值、劣势时，他首先会尝试使自己无法比较，或至少不比别人差（Kastersztein 1990，40）。实际上，规避比较可以是个性化策略的第一步。贬值感知（例如，收入比较）导致受访者寻求补偿和原创性的策略。他们设法改变比较的标准，发明新的判断维度或评估做事和与人相处的方式（Kastersztein 1990，37）。

During their stay in France, the interviewed Chinese student migrants are increasingly attached to an ideal of personal emancipation: they want to exist as singular individuals, irreducible by nature to any other. At the same time, they face the imperative of social success in a competitive environment. Where they think they exist for themselves, they are immediately caught by social pressures since others remind them of their position on a social scale of success. Thus, even if Zheng has only disdain for comparisons of income, he constantly faces the same question when he meets other Chinese: “How much do you earn?”:

在法国逗留期间，受访的中国学生移民越来越倾向于个人解放的理想：他们想要作为独特的个体存在，本质上不可还原为任何其他个体。同时，他们面临着在竞争环境中社会成功的要求。在他们认为自己为自己而存在时，他们立刻被社会压力所困扰，因为其他人提醒他们他们在成功的社会等级上的位置。因此，即使郑对收入的比较只有鄙视，他在遇到其他中国人时也不断面临同样的问题：“你挣多少钱？”：

In Paris, when you meet Chinese people, the first question many people will ask you is: “how much is your salary?” I have the impression that the French are less likely to ask a question like that. Some will still ask for your salary, but not so often. It is truly a cult of wage comparison:

those who have a high salary are very satisfied with themselves and place themselves above others; those with lower wages have their heads down.

在巴黎，当你遇到中国人时，许多人会问你的第一个问题是：“你的薪水多少？”我觉得法国人不太可能问这样的问题。一些人仍会询问你的薪水，但不是那么频繁。这真是一种工资比较的崇拜：那些薪水高的人对自己非常满意，并把自己置于他人之上；那些工资较低的人则垂头丧气。

For some respondents, the use of anonymity or even invisibility can be a way of avoiding devaluation. Despite these strategies, migrants cannot escape the judgments of others as long as they are not out of the world. Moreover, thanks

对于一些受访者来说，使用匿名甚至隐身可以是避免贬值的一种方式。尽管有这些策略，只要他们不脱离世界，移民就无法逃避他人的判断。此外，由于

### The identity crisis of Chinese graduates in France 119

#### 在法国的中国留学生的身份认同危机 119

to new information and communication technologies, especially the Internet, migrants continue to live and be aware of every moment in their home environment, regardless of their physical location. This configuration increases identity pressure, especially regarding social success. Indeed, some interactions between Chinese migrants are tainted by rivalry. The respondents are sometimes targeted by their friends in a pride contest. Qian told me a “story between girls” on this topic:

由于新的信息和通信技术，尤其是互联网，移民继续生活并时刻意识到自己在家乡的环境，无论他们的身体位置如何。这种配置增加了身份压力，尤其是关于社会成功的压力。实际上，一些中国移民之间的互动被竞争所玷污。受访者有时会在骄傲竞赛中成为朋友的攻击目标。钱给我讲了一个关于这个话题的“女孩间的故事”：

Some time ago, a college classmate felt good. She found, I don't know how, my phone number. She asked me a lot of questions on the first day, knowing that we respect the privacy of others abroad. She started by asking me questions: Do you have a boyfriend? Is he Chinese or French? How much do you earn? Did you buy a condo? Are you married? Do you have any children? [...] I was really embarrassed by these questions. But I realized that she felt good. Otherwise, she wouldn't ask me all these questions.

不久前，一个大学同学感觉不错。她找到了我的电话号码，我不知道她是怎么找到的。第一天她问了我很多问题，知道我们在国外会尊重别人的隐私。她开始问我问题：你有男朋友吗？他是中国人还是法国人？你挣多少钱？你买公寓了吗？你结婚了吗？你有孩子吗？[...] 这些问题真的让我很尴尬。但我意识到她感觉很好。否则，她不会问我这么多问题。

Chinese migrants, because their departures are part of an aspirational project, automatically draw the attention of others when they return to China. They are subject to an obligation to demonstrate their exceptional qualities. If many young Chinese graduates no longer support this ambient pressure, is it because their personal identity built on the logic of differentiation during their years of residence in



France, stumbles against a normative and binding vision of social success when they return? Xin says he's tired of living constantly under the eyes of others:

中国移民，因为他们的离开是一个有抱负的项目的一部分，当他们回到中国时自动会引起别人的注意。他们必须证明自己的特殊品质。如果许多年轻的中国毕业生不再支持这种普遍的压力，是因为他们在法国居住期间基于差异化逻辑构建的个人身份，在回国时与规范性和约束性的社会成功观念相冲突吗？辛说他厌倦了在别人的目光下不断生活：

When you come home from abroad, people look at you differently. You must be like this, you must not be like that. Basically, you have to be different from the others. Regardless of the looks of others, you have this requirement for yourself. It's as if I do not live for myself, but for others. I have to prove something to the others. It's very tiring.

当你从国外回家时，人们会以不同的方式看待你。你必须是这样的，你不能是那样的。基本上，你必须与其他人不同。不管别人的目光，你对自己有这个要求。就好像我不是为自己而活，而是为了别人。我必须向别人证明一些东西。这非常累人。

Let us now consider identity negotiations between migrants and their parents. These negotiations take a different turn since parents are both relentless judges and stakeholders of the social mobility project of the student migrants. The role of parents is not limited to preparation for their child's departure. Chinese parents continue to support their children throughout their migration path despite the geographical distance between them. The intensity and importance of these gifts tend to generate a sense of obligation in the migrants toward their parents. For their part, Chinese parents not only hope that their children will succeed in their studies and their career, but also that they will make the transition to parental life "in time" in the new context. This causes great anxiety for young Chinese people, especially women (Wang 2015). Some then try to escape this injunction to succeed by evoking an ideal of Western emancipation, claiming fidelity to oneself. But this reorientation, relatively easy to live as long as one stays abroad would be available to a lesser degree for those who return to their home country.

现在让我们考虑移民和他们父母之间的身份协商。这些协商采取了不同的转向，因为父母既是无情的评判者，又是学生移民的社会流动项目的利益相关者。父母的角色不仅限于为孩子的离开做准备。中国父母继续在整个迁移路径上支持他们的孩子，尽管他们与孩子之间存在地理距离。这些礼物的强度和重要性往往在移民中产生对父母的义务感。对中国父母来说，他们不仅希望自己的孩子在学习和职业上成功，而且还希望他们“及时”在新的环境中过渡到父母生活。这给年轻的中国人，尤其是女性（王2015）造成了巨大的焦虑。一些人试图通过唤起西方解放的理想，声称对自己忠诚，来逃避这个命令的成功。但这种重新定向，只要一个人留在国外就相对容易生活，对于那些返回祖国的人来说会在较小程度上可用。

## 120 Li Yong

The young graduates who have returned from France, like other haigui, want to make use of their foreign training. It is not only a question of making a particularly important human and financial investment profitable, but also of preserving a sense of biographical continuity. Many respondents

say that it is unthinkable for them to have a job that has nothing to do with their French training. In addition, the desire to surpass non-migrant peers is still the focus. However, the statutory exceptionality of foreign graduates is being challenged today in the Chinese labor market. Unless they have a particularly interesting profile, repatriated Chinese graduates are unlikely to be paid much higher than the local average.

从法国返回的年轻毕业生，就像其他的海归一样，希望利用他们的海外学习经历。这不仅仅是为了使特别重要的人力和财力投资盈利，还为了保持一种生活经历的连续性。许多受访者表示，对他们而言，从事与他们在法国培训无关的工作是难以想象的。此外，超越非移民同龄人的愿望仍然是焦点。然而，如今在中国劳动市场上，外国毕业生的身份特殊性正在受到挑战。除非他们有一个特别有趣的简历，否则回国的中国毕业生不太可能比本地平均水平获得更高的薪酬。

But for young graduates, the hardest experiences to face are the reactions of their loved ones. When the period of inactivity continues, the halo of haigui gradually turns into a stigma of haidai(海待),<sup>14</sup> Parents who rejoiced at the return of their children are beginning to worry. They also witness a profound disillusionment. The hope that their offspring will become ren shang ren(人上人, "the man above men") fades. Also subjected to a great deal of pressure from all sides, parents hope that their children come out of a deviant situation as soon as possible. With good will, parents do not hesitate to advise their children to revise their expectations downward: before finding an ideal job, it is better to seize what is immediately available and roughly correct with respect to the local standard. This is what is meant by qi lü zhao ma(骑驴找马, "looking for the horse on a donkey"). Hong knows the weight of this parental pressure. She explains that it was this pressure that pushed her to give up her plan to return to China:

但对年轻毕业生而言，最难面对的经历是他们亲人的反应。当不活跃的期间持续时，海归的光环逐渐变成了(海待)<sup>14</sup>的耻辱。曾经为孩子归来而高兴的父母开始担忧。他们也目睹了深刻的幻灭。希望他们的子女成为人上人（人上人，意为“超越常人”）的希望逐渐消失。同样承受着来自四面八方的巨大压力，父母希望他们的孩子尽快走出偏离常规的境地。出于好意，父母不会犹豫地建议他们的孩子降低期望：在找到理想工作之前，最好抓住当前立即可得且大致符合当地标准的工作。这就是骑驴找马（qi lü zhao ma, “骑着驴找马”）的意思。洪知道这种父母压力的重量。她解释说，正是这种压力促使她放弃了回国的计划：

Hong: "Because we are used to taking the pressure on our own abroad. We are no longer used to endorsing pressure from others. And the pressure exerted by the family is not the same as the pressure of others. If it was a friend who was pressing you, you can give a damn. You do not contact him for 10 days, and you will contact him later. But it's not the same for the family. If you do not want to contact them, they will come to see you directly! Your mother will shout: That's good, you have strong wings now. You don't want to listen to me anymore!"

洪：“因为我们习惯了在国外自己承担压力。我们不再习惯承受来自他人的压力。家庭施加的压力与他人的压力不同。如果是朋友在给你压力，你可以不理睬。你不和他联系10天，以后再联系他。但对家庭来说不是这样。如果你不想联系他们，他们会直接来看你！你妈妈会喊：好了，你现在翅膀硬了。你不想再听我的了！”

Interviewer: "You can't escape!"

采访者：“你无法逃避！”

Hong: “Impossible. In fact, this pressure concerns you directly, especially during the period when you have trouble finding a job. That’s why I was afraid to find myself unemployed in the home country. That is why some do not want to return to China without having negotiated the salary beforehand. Because ‘it’s still something’ [in French]. If you don’t have a job for a month or two months, your parents can understand you. But if you’ve been unemployed for more than three months, your parents cannot forgive

洪：“不可能逃避。实际上，这种压力直接关系到你，尤其是在你找工作困难的时期。这就是为什么我害怕在祖国失业。这就是为什么有些人不想在没有事先谈好薪水的情况下返回中国。因为‘这还是有些意义的’[用法语]。如果你一两个月没有工作，你的父母可以理解你。但如果你失业超过三个月，你的父母就无法原谅

<sup>14</sup> That is to say: the job seekers coming from abroad, literally: algae (haidai, 海带).

<sup>14</sup> 海待，意指海外归来的求职者，字面意思是海藻

## The identity crisis of Chinese graduates in France 121

### 在法国的中国留学生的身份认同危机 121

you. I insist on this point: Your parents cannot forgive you, if you do not find work for more than three months.”

“你。我坚持这一点：如果你三个月都找不到工作，你的父母无法原谅你。”

Interviewer: “No, I think [...]”

采访者：“不，我认为[...]”

Hong: “Why don’t you go take this job? You can ‘qi lü zhao ma’! That is what my parents told me directly. Anyway, you have to live with your parents. You cannot rent an apartment without having found a job; you cannot move every three days either. [...] If a haigui cries when he cannot find work, people will comment as follows: ‘Because you are too hard. How can you not find a job? Look at this company in the village, it is big, and it recruits, why don’t you go there?’ But if you really go into this business, you will realize that you can never get away with it. Because they can never satisfy you, and you can never satisfy them. What you have learned is of no interest to anyone, and what your employer is looking for, you don’t know how to give it to him.”

洪：“你为什么不去接受那份工作？你可以‘骑驴找马’！这是我父母直接对我说的。无论如何，你得和你的父母一起生活。没有找到工作，你就不能租房子；你也不能三天两头搬家。[...] 如果一个海归因为找不到工作而哭泣，人们会这样评论：‘因为你太挑剔了。你怎么会找不到工作呢？看看村里的这家公司，它很大，而且在招人，你为什么不去那里？’但如果你真的进入这个行业，你会

意识到你永远无法摆脱它。因为他们永远满足不了你，你也满足不了他们。你所学到的东西没有人感兴趣，而你的雇主在寻找的，你不知道如何给予他。”

Everyone has his or her own way of coping with this social pressure during the job search according to their resources, their experiences and their personality. Some give in to the pressure of their families by accepting a job below their expectations or even completely uninteresting to them with regard to their previous career. Other graduates, in anticipation of conflicts, choose not to live with their parents, for example by settling in a Chinese city far from that of their parents. Geographic distance saves haiguia lot of trouble with their parents related to face-to-face interactions. Other graduates, faced with relatives who suffer more from their inactivity than from their absence, decide to flee to distant countries. Several scenarios exist with the first being that of the “tragic hero”: the haigui, humiliated by his family and wounded in his self-esteem is on self-imposed exile in order to restore his pride in a new adventure. Thus, Wen (31 years old) a young electronic engineer, after six months of unsuccessful search in the Chinese labor market, went to the Republic of Congo to set up his hardware trade.

每个人都有自己应对求职社会压力的方式，这取决于他们的资源、经验和性格。一些人屈服于家庭的压力，接受了低于期望或甚至对他们来说完全无趣的工作，与他们之前的职业生涯无关。其他毕业生，为了预防冲突，选择不与父母同住，例如定居在远离父母所在城市的中国城市。地理距离为海归减轻了与父母面对面互动相关的许多麻烦。其他毕业生则面临着来自其他亲戚更多的痛苦，这些痛苦是因为他们的无所事事而不是缺席，决定逃往遥远的国家。有几种情况，**第一种是“悲剧英雄”：因家庭羞辱和自尊受损的海归，选择自我流放到新的冒险中以恢复他的骄傲。**因此，温（31岁）一位年轻的电子工程师，在中国劳动市场上六个月未能成功找到工作后，前往刚果共和国开展他的硬件贸易。

The second is that of a “fleeing individualist”: The graduate who had just returned to his country of origin seeks to emigrate to a new country with this decision speaking of his desire to live for himself, putting a distance between him and the pressures of his social environment of origin, rather than the desire to achieve greater success. This is the example of Zhang (26 years old, Master of engineering), who did not find a permanent contract in France at the end of his training and was forced to return to China. This young engineer justified his decision to emigrate to Canada by speaking of his love for nature, his “taste for elsewhere” and even his love of loneliness. The third is that of a “neurotic”: After several years of residence in France, the graduate on his return to China finds a job in a Chinese company. But he feels unsuited to his new environment. The pace of work, the busy schedules and the complexity of interpersonal relationships makes him anxious. The more

**第二种是“逃避的个体主义者”：刚刚返回原籍国的毕业生寻求移民到一个新国家，这一决定表达了他想为自己生活，将自己与原始社会环境的压力拉开距离的愿望，而不是实现更大成功的愿望。**这是张（26岁，工程硕士）的例子，他在培训结束时没有在法国找到永久合同，被迫返回中国。这位年轻工程师以对大自然的热爱、对异地的向往甚至对孤独的喜爱为由，为自己移民到加拿大的决定辩护。**第三种是“神经质者”：在法国居住几年后，毕业生回到中国在一家中国公司找到了一份工作。但他感觉自己不适应新环境。工作节奏、繁忙的日程和人际关系的复杂性让他感到焦虑。随着时间**

time passes, the more unbearable life in China seems to him until this anxiety brings out somatic symptoms: insomnia, endocrine disorders and so on. At the same time, the graduate idealizes his country of formation and develops a nostalgia for his years lived in France. In some situations, the individual ends up resigning from his company in China and returning to Europe to find a job there.

的推移，生活在中国对他来说变得越来越难以忍受，直到这种焦虑引发了躯体症状：失眠、内分泌紊乱等。同时，毕业生理想化他的培训国家，并对他在法国生活的年份产生了怀旧之情。在某些情况下，个体最终辞去中国公司的工作，并返回欧洲寻找工作。

## 7 Conclusion

## 7 结论

Identity crises today affect many young Chinese who came to France with a project of self-transformation. These crises are rooted in personal experiences of break-up, such as integration difficulties and unemployment. But they are rooted more deeply in the difficulties of the respondents to find a comfortable positioning of their identity in a context of high-speed social changes: the rise of China, the gentrification of a fraction of the Chinese population and the trivialization of international mobility seem to invalidate the very foundations of the emigration projects of the respondents. The result is a widespread malaise in this generation of young migrants who experience a “double gap”: a gap between the self and the ego-ideal, and a gap between the migrant and his reference group, including his peers who have remained in the society of origin.

当今的身份危机影响了许多带着自我转变项目来法国的年轻中国人。这些危机植根于个人经历的断裂，如融入困难和失业。但更深层地，它们植根于受访者在高速社会变革背景下找到一个舒适的身份定位的困难：中国的崛起、中国人口一部分的中产化和国际流动的平凡化似乎使受访者的移民项目的基础失去效力。结果是这一代年轻移民普遍存在的不安，他们经历了一个“双重差距”：自我与理想自我之间的差距，以及移民与他的参考群体（包括留在原社会的同龄人）之间的差距。

We also showed how Chinese migrants try to overcome their crises by moving away from their original plans and asserting a unique self. During their stay abroad, the different dimensions of personal identity are recomposed in favor of an identity for oneself, which tends to take precedence over the identity for others. But our graduates cannot easily escape the injunction to succeed. Their identity adjustment operations are only half effective in the best case, and the ideal of a triumphal return cannot be dismissed by any degree of assertion of self in France. By focusing on individuality and its modifications during migration, this study sheds new light on student migration since inter-ethnic relations have been studied more frequently than the long-term experiences of individuals. If immigration trajectories appear as “trajectories of suffering” (Riemann and Schütze 1991), this suffering must also be understood in the structural disorder of the trajectories of migrants and in the widening gap between the experiences of migrants and their ideals of success. Migrants appear from this point of view as actors who evaluate their situations through outdated categories thereby experiencing multiple gaps. More generally, to describe this dynamic of personal identity among Chinese migrants and overseas Chinese allows us to better understand both the particular



experiences of the Chinese subject in mobility and the main expressions of modern distress (Martuccelli 2002, 479–482).

我们还展示了中国移民如何通过远离他们的原始计划并坚持独特的自我来尝试克服他们的危机。在他们的海外生活期间，个人身份的不同维度重新组合，以支持自我的身份，而这种身份往往优先于他人的身份。但我们的毕业生无法轻易逃避成功的命令。**他们的身份调整操作在最好的情况下也只是一半有效的，任何程度的自我主张都不能摒弃胜利的归来理想。**通过关注个体性及其在移民过程中的变化，这项研究为学生移民提供了新的视角，因为跨种族关系比个体的长期经历更频繁地被研究。**如果移民轨迹出现为“苦难轨迹”（Riemann和Schütze 1991），这种苦难也必须在移民轨迹的结构混乱以及移民的经历与他们的成功理想之间不断扩大的差距中被理解。**从这个角度来看，移民似乎是通过过时的类别评估他们的情况从而经历多重差距的行动者。更普遍地说，描述中国移民和海外华人个人身份的这种动态，让我们能更好地理解中国移动主体的特殊经历和现代困境的主要表达（Martuccelli 2002, 479-482）。

### The identity crisis of Chinese graduates in France 123

在法国的中国留学毕业生的身份认同危机 123

## Bibliography

### 参考书目

Baumeister, Roy F. *Identity: Cultural change and the struggle for self*. New York and Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1986.

罗伊·F·鲍迈斯特《身份：文化变革和自我斗争》。纽约和牛津：牛津大学出版社，1986年。

Baumeister, Roy F., Jeremy P. Shapiro, and Dianne M. Tice. “Two kinds of identity crisis.” *Journal of Personality* 53.3 (1985): 407–424.

罗伊·F·鲍迈斯特、杰里米·P·沙皮罗和戴安妮·M·泰斯。“两种身份危机。”《个性心理学杂志》53.3（1985）：407–424。

Bertaux, Daniel. *Les récits de vie* (3e ed.). Paris: Armand Colin, 2010.

丹尼尔·贝尔托《生活故事》（第三版）。巴黎：阿尔芒·科林，2010年。

Boudon, Raymond. *L'inégalité des chances: la mobilité sociale dans les sociétés industrielles*. Paris: Armand Colin, 1973.

雷蒙德·布杜《机会的不平等：工业社会中的社会流动性》。巴黎：阿尔芒·科林，1973年。

Boudon, Raymond. *Effets pervers et ordre social* (2e ed.). Paris: PUF, 1979.

雷蒙德·布杜《负面效应与社会秩序》（第二版）。巴黎：PUF，1979年。

Bourdieu, Pierre. “Comprendre.” *La misère du monde*. Ed. Pierre Bourdieu. Paris: Seuil, 1993. 1389 – 1447.

皮埃尔·布迪厄“理解。”《世界的苦难》。皮埃尔·布迪厄编辑。巴黎：Seuil，1993。1389-1447。

Bourdieu, Pierre, and Abdelmalek Sayad. *Le déracinement: La crise de l'agriculture traditionnelle en Algérie*. Paris: Editions de Minuit, 1964.

皮埃尔·布迪厄和阿卜杜勒马利克·萨亚德《根除：阿尔及利亚传统农业的危机》。巴黎：米涅出版社，1964 年。

Camilleri, Carmel, Joseph Kastarsztein, Edmond-Marc Lipiansky, Hanna Malewska-Peyre, Isabelle Taboada-Leonetti, and Ana Vasquez (Eds.). *Stratégies identitaires*. Paris: PUF, 1990.

卡梅尔·卡米勒利、约瑟夫·卡斯特斯泽因、埃德蒙·马克·利皮安斯基、汉娜·马勒斯卡-佩伊尔、伊莎贝尔·塔博阿达-莱奥内蒂和安娜·瓦斯奎兹（编辑）。《身份策略》。巴黎：PUF，1990 年。

Cattelain, Chloé, Marylène Lieber, Claire Saillard, and Sébastien Ngugen. "Les déclassés du Nord. Une nouvelle migration chinoise en France." *Revue Européenne des Migrations Internationales* 21.3 (2005): 27–52.

克洛伊·卡特兰、玛丽莲·利贝尔、克莱尔·赛拉尔和塞巴斯蒂安·阮根。“北方阶级下降者。法国的新一波中国移民。”《国际移民评论》21.3（2005）：27–52。

Charles, Nicolas, Cécile Jolly, and Frédéric Lainé. "Etudiants étrangers et marché du travail. Une comparaison Allemagne, France, Royaume-Uni." *Rapports & Documents. Premier Ministre*, 2013. 尼古拉斯·查尔斯、塞西尔·朱利和弗雷德里克·莱内。“外国留学生和劳动力市场。德国、法国、英国的比较。”《报告与文件。总理》，2013 年。

Chuang, Ya-Han. "Les 'aventuriers' et les 'naufragés': deux types d'immigrés chinois à Paris, ou une face cachée du miracle chinois." *Migrations et Société* 149.25 (2013): 179–191.

莫欧·尧汉。“‘冒险者’和‘遇难者’：巴黎的两种中国移民，或者中国奇迹的另一面。”《移民和社会》149.25（2013）：179–191。

Chudzikowski, Katharina, and Wolfgang Mayrhofer. "In search of the blue flower? Grand social theories and career research: The case of Bourdieu's theory of practice." *Human Relations* 64.1 (2011): 19–36.

卡塔琳娜·丘吉科夫斯基和沃尔夫冈·迈罗夫。“寻找蓝花？大社会理论与职业研究：以布迪厄的实践理论为例。”《人际关系》64.1（2011）：19–36。

Dubar, Claude. *La socialisation* (3e ed.). Paris: Armand Colin, 2004.

克洛德·迪巴《社会化》（第三版）。巴黎：阿尔芒·科林，2004 年。

Dubar, Claude. *La crise des identités: L'interprétation d'une mutation* (4e ed.). Paris: PUF, 2010.

克洛德·迪巴《身份危机：对变异的解释》（第四版）。巴黎：PUF，2010 年。

Ehrenberg, Alain. *La fatigue d'être soi: dépression et société*. Paris: Odile Jacob, 2008.

阿兰·埃伦伯格《厌倦自我：抑郁症与社会》。巴黎：奥迪勒·雅各布，2008 年。

Ehrenberg, Alain. *La société du malaise*. Paris: Odile Jacob, 2010.

阿兰·埃伦伯格《不安的社会》。巴黎：奥迪勒·雅各布，2010 年。

Ehrenberg, Alain. *Le culte de la performance* (3e ed.). Paris: Hachette Pluriel, 2011.

阿兰·埃伦伯格《表现的崇拜》（第三版）。巴黎：哈歇特多元出版社，2011 年。

Erikson, Erik Homburger. *Childhood and Society*. New York: W. W. Norton, 1950.

埃里克·霍姆伯格·爱利克斯《童年与社会》。纽约：W·W·诺顿，1950年。

Giddens, Anthony. *La constitution de la société* (1re ed. 1977). Paris: PUF, 1987.

安东尼·吉登斯《社会的构成》（第一版，1977年）。巴黎：PUF，1987年。

Hao, Jie, and Anthony Welch. “A tale of sea turtles: Job-seeking experiences of Hai Gui (high-skilled returnees) in China.” *Higher Education Policy* 25.2 (2012): 243–260.

郝杰和安东尼·韦尔奇。“海龟的故事：中国海归（高技能回归者）求职经历。”《高等教育政策》25.2（2012）：243–260。

Harold, Thibault. “La croissance chinoise à son plus bas depuis 25 ans, 19. January 2016.”

[http://www.lemonde.fr/economie/article/2016/01/19/la-croissance-chinoise-tombe-a-6-9-en-2015\\_4849455\\_3234.html](http://www.lemonde.fr/economie/article/2016/01/19/la-croissance-chinoise-tombe-a-6-9-en-2015_4849455_3234.html) (2 May 2016).

蒂博·哈罗德。“中国的增长创下25年来的最低水平，2016年1月19日”。

[http://www.lemonde.fr/economie/article/2016/01/19/la-croissance-chinoise-tombe-a-6-9-en-2015\\_4849455\\_3234.html](http://www.lemonde.fr/economie/article/2016/01/19/la-croissance-chinoise-tombe-a-6-9-en-2015_4849455_3234.html)（2016年5月2日）。

Hoffman, Lisa. “Autonomous choices and patriotic professionalism: on governmentality in late-socialist China.” *Economy and Society* 35.4 (2006): 550–570.

丽莎·霍夫曼。“自主选择与爱国专业精神：关于晚期社会主义中国的统治论。”《经济与社会》35.4（2006）：550–570。

Kastersztein, Joseph. “Les stratégies identitaires des acteurs sociaux: approche dynamique des finalités.” *Stratégies identitaires*. Ed. Carmel Camilleri. Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, 1990. 27–41.

约瑟夫·卡斯特斯泽因。“社会行为者的身份策略：目标的动态方法。”《身份策略》。卡梅尔·卡米勒利编。巴黎：法国大学出版社，1990年。27–41页。

Laing, Ronald David. *Soi et les autres* (L. Gilberte, Trans.). Paris: Gallimard, 1991.

罗纳德·戴维·兰恩《自我和他人》（L. Gilberte译）。巴黎：加利玛出版社，1991年。

## 124 Li Yong

Le Bart, Christian. *L'individualisation*. Paris: Presses de Sciences Po, 2008.

克里斯蒂安·勒巴尔《个体化》。巴黎：法政大学出版社，2008年。

Lemaine, Gérard, and Joseph Kastersztein. “Recherches sur l'originalité sociale, la différenciation et l'incomparabilité.” *Bulletin de Psychologie* 25 (1972): 673–693.

热拉尔·勒梅纳和约瑟夫·卡斯特斯泽因。“关于社会原创性、差异化和不可比性的研究。”《心理学通讯》25（1972）：673–693。

Leong, Chan-Hoong, and Colleen Ward. “Identity conflict in sojourners.” *International Journal of Intercultural Relations* 24.6 (2000): 763–776.

梁展鸿和科琳·沃德。“旅居者的身份冲突。”《国际文化关系杂志》24.6（2000）：763–776。

Lévy, Florence. "Les femmes du Nord, une migration au profil atypique." *Hommes & Migrations* 1254 (2005): 45–57.

弗洛伦斯·莱维。“北方的女性，一个具有典型特征的移民。”《人类与移民》1254（2005）：45–57。

Li, Yong. "A risk perspective on Chinese student migration in France." *Chinese Educational Migration and Student-Teacher Mobilities: Experiencing Otherness*. Ed. Fred Dervin. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2015. 106–126.

李勇。“中国学生在法国的移民风险视角。”《中国教育移民与师生流动：体验他者》。弗雷德·德尔文编。贝辛斯托克：Palgrave Macmillan，2015年。106–126页。

Li, Yong. *Condamnés à réussir. Insertion professionnelle des diplômés chinois en France, nouvelles dynamiques migratoires et identitaires*. Rouen: Université de Rouen, 2016.

李勇《注定成功：中国留法毕业生的职业融入，新的移民和身份动态》。鲁昂：鲁昂大学，2016年。

Lian, Si. (ed.). *Yizu: Daxue biyesheng jujucun shilu* (Ant Communities: Description of the Village of University Graduates). Guilin: Guangxi Normal University Press, 2009.

连思（编辑）。《移族：大学毕业生居住村描述》。桂林：广西师范大学出版社，2009年。

Mahut, David. *Le déclassement dans la migration. Ethnographie d'une petite bourgeoisie bamakoise installée à Paris*. Paris: L'Harmattan, 2017.

大卫·马胡《移民中的阶层降低：一个定居在巴黎的巴马科小资产阶级的民族志》。巴黎：拉尔马丹，2017年。

Martuccelli, Danilo. *Grammaires de l'individu*. Paris: Éditions Gallimard, 2002.

丹尼洛·马图切利《个体的语法》。巴黎：加利玛出版社，2002年。

Paivandi, Saeed, and Ronan Vourc'h. *Profils et conditions de vie des étudiants étrangers, 1ère partie*. OVE Infos. 2005. [http://www.ove-national.education.fr/medias/files/ove-infos/oi12\\_oi\\_12\\_050705\\_basse\\_def.pdf](http://www.ove-national.education.fr/medias/files/ove-infos/oi12_oi_12_050705_basse_def.pdf) (13 December 2018).

赛义德·帕伊万迪和罗南·沃尔赫《外国留学生的生活条件和特点，第一部分》。OVE Infos。2005年。[http://www.ove-national.education.fr/medias/files/ove-infos/oi12\\_oi\\_12\\_050705\\_basse\\_def.pdf](http://www.ove-national.education.fr/medias/files/ove-infos/oi12_oi_12_050705_basse_def.pdf)（2018年12月13日）。

Ricœur, Paul. *Temps et récit* (Vol. 3). Paris: Seuil, 1985.

保罗·里康《时间与叙述》（第三卷）。巴黎：Seuil，1985年。

Riemann, Gerhard, and Fritz Schütze. "'Trajectory' as a basic theoretical concept for analyzing suffering and disorderly social processes." *Social Organization and Social Processes. Essays in Honor of Anselm Strauss*. Ed. David R. Maines. New York: DeGruyter, 1991. 333–357.

格哈德·里曼和弗里茨·舒茨。“‘轨迹’作为分析苦难和无序社会过程的基本理论概念。”《社会组织与社会过程。献给安塞尔姆·施特劳斯的论文》。戴维·R·梅恩斯编辑。纽约：DeGruyter，1991年。333–357页。

Rocca, Jean-Louis. "Quand la Chine redécouvre la question sociale." *Le Monde diplomatique*, May 2007, 10–11. <http://www.monde-diplomatique.fr/2007/05/ROCCA/14698> (3 December 2018).

让-路易斯·罗卡。“当中国重新发现社会问题。”《外交政策世界报》，2007年5月，10-11页。  
<http://www.monde-diplomatique.fr/2007/05/ROCCA/14698> (2018年12月3日)。

Roulleau-Berger, Laurence. “Introduction: Nouvelles migrations chinoises et marchés du travail européens.” *Nouvelles migrations chinoises et travail en Europe*. Ed. Laurence Roulleau-Berger. Toulouse: Presses universitaires du Mirail, 2007. 9–16.

劳伦斯·鲁洛·伯杰。“导论：新移民与欧洲劳动力市场。”《新的中国移民与欧洲工作》。劳伦斯·鲁洛·伯杰编。图卢兹：米拉耶大学出版社，2007年。9–16页。

Roulleau-Berger, Laurence. “Individuation ‘située’ et ‘globalisée’, grammaires de la reconnaissance et du mépris en Europe de l’Ouest et en Chine continentale.” *La reconnaissance à l’épreuve: explorations socio-anthropologiques*. Ed. Jean-Paul Payet and Alain Battegay. Villeneuve d’Ascq: Presses universitaires du Septentrion, 2008. 287–294.

劳伦斯·鲁洛·伯杰。“‘特定’和‘全球化’的个体化，西欧和中国大陆的承认和轻视语法。”《认知考验：社会人类学探索》。让-保尔·派耶和阿兰·巴特加伊编辑。维尔纳夫-达斯克：北方大学出版社，2008年。287–294页。

Roulleau-Berger, Laurence, and Jun Yan. *Travail et migration. Jeunesses chinoises à Shanghai et Paris*. La Tour d’Aigues: Editions de l’aube, 2017.

劳伦斯·鲁洛·伯杰和峻延《劳动与移民。上海和巴黎的中国青年》。拉图尔代吉：黎明出版社，2017年。

Simmel, Georg. *Sociologie: études sur les formes de la socialisation*. Paris: PUF, 1999.  
格奥尔格·西美尔《社会学：对社会化形式的研究》。巴黎：PUF，1999年。

Sommers, Vita S. “Resolution of an Identity Conflict in a Japanese-American Patient: A Contribution to the Treatment of ‘Psychocultural’ Neurosis.” *American Journal of Psychotherapy* 23.1 (1969): 119–134.

维塔·S·索默斯。“解决日裔美国患者的身份冲突：对‘心理文化’神经症治疗的贡献。”《美国心理治疗杂志》23.1 (1969)：119–134。

Sussman, Nan M. *Return Migration and Identity: A global phenomenon, a Hong Kong case*. Hong Kong: Hong Kong University Press, 2011.

南·M·萨斯曼《返回移民与身份认同：全球现象，香港案例》。香港：香港大学出版社，2011年。

Thomas, William, and Florian Znaniecki. *Le paysan polonais en Europe et aux Etats-Unis. Récit d’un immigrant* (first edition: Chicago, 1919). Paris: Nathan, 1998.

威廉·托马斯和弗洛里安·兹纳涅茨基《波兰农民在欧洲和美国。一个移民的故事》（第一版：芝加哥，1919年）。巴黎：Nathan，1998年。

Urry, John. “Les systèmes de la mobilité.” *Cahiers Internationaux de Sociologie* 118.1 (2005): 23–35.  
约翰·厄里《流动性的系统》。《国际社会学杂志》118.1 (2005)：23–35。

## The identity crisis of Chinese graduates in France 125

### 在法国的中国留学毕业生的身份认同危机 125



Wang, Simeng. "Des 'soucis matrimoniaux' dans le contexte transnational: le cas des migrants et des migrantes chinois qualifiés à Paris." *Migrations et Société* 27.157 (2015): 149–166.

王思梦。“跨国背景下的‘婚姻问题’：巴黎有技术的中国移民案例。”《移民与社会》27.157（2015）：149–166。

Wang, Simeng. "Entre stratégie et moralité. Des migrants chinois en situation irrégulière face à la 'clause de maladie'." *Politix* 114.2 (2016a): 205–227.

王思梦。“策略与道德之间：非法居留的中国移民面对‘疾病条款’。”《Politix》114.2（2016a）：205–227。

Wang, Simeng. "Souffrances psychiques et mobilité sociale ascendante. Le cas des adolescents français d'origine chinoise à Paris." *Hommes & Migrations* 1314.2 (2016b): 11–18.

王思梦。“心理痛苦与社会上升的移动性：巴黎中国裔青少年的案例。”《人类与移民》1314.2（2016b）：11–18。

Wang, Simeng. *Illusions et souffrances. Les migrants chinois à Paris*. Paris: Editions Rue d'Ulm/Presses de l'Ecole normale supérieure, 2017.

王思梦《幻想与痛苦：巴黎的中国移民》。巴黎：Rue d'Ulm/Presses de l'Ecole normale supérieure, 2017年。

Widmer, Eric D., and Dario Spini. "Misleading Norms and Vulnerability in the Life Course: Definition and Illustrations." *Research in Human Development* 14.1 (2017): 52–67.

埃里克·D·威德默和达里奥·斯皮尼。“生命过程中的误导性规范和脆弱性：定义和说明。”《人类发展研究》14.1（2017）：52–67。

Xiang, Biao. "Emigration from China: A sending country perspective." *International Migration* 41.3 (2003): 21–48.

向飙。“从中国移民的角度看移民问题。”《国际移民》41.3（2003）：21–48。

Yan, Yunxiang. *The individualization of Chinese society*. Oxford and New York: Berg Publishers, 2009.

严运祥《中国社会的个人化》。牛津和纽约：Berg Publishers，2009年。

Yan, Yunxiang. "The Chinese path to individualization." *The British Journal of Sociology* 61.3 (2010): 489–512.

严运祥。“中国通往个人化的道路。”《英国社会学杂志》61.3（2010）：489–512。

Yun, Gao, Florence Lévy, and Véronique Poisson. "De la migration au travail. L'exploitation extrême des Chinois-e-s à Paris." *Travail, Genre et Société* 16.2 (2006): 53–74.

高云、弗洛伦斯·莱维和维罗尼克·普瓦松。“从移民到工作：巴黎华人的极端剥削。”《劳动，性别和社会》16.2（2006）：53–74。

Zhang, Li, and Aihwa Ong (Eds.). *Privatizing China: socialism from afar*. Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 2008.

张力和翁爱华（编辑）。《私有化中国：远离的社会主义》。纽约州伊萨卡：康奈尔大学出版社，2008年。

Zhao, Yeqin. “Les illusions perdues d’une Chinoise du Nord à Belleville.” *Terrains & Travaux* 2 (2009): 195–211.

赵叶琴。“一个北方中国妇女在贝尔维尔的幻想丧失。”《地形与工作》2（2009）：195–211。

**126 Li Yong**