

Manuscript Details

Manuscript ID: MEC-13-0253

Manuscript Type: Original Article

Keywords: Climate Change, Conservation Genetics, Population Dynamics, Speciation

Date Submitted: 13-Mar-2013

Manuscript Title: Origin and demographic history of the endemic Taiwanese spruce (*Picea morrisonicola*)

Authors: Bodare, Sofia
E-Mail: sofia.bodare@ebc.uu.se

Stocks, Michael
E-Mail: michael.stocks@ebc.uu.se

Yang, Jeng-Chuann
E-Mail: yjc@tfri.gov.tw

Lascoux, Martin
E-Mail: martin.lascoux@ebc.uu.se

Editor: [Heuertz, Myriam](#)

Managing Editor: [Vines, Tim](#)

Please indicate your assessment for the below categories by selecting the appropriate response.

req Quality of Science

Experimentally and/or theoretically excellent reliable data, no fatal flaws

req Importance of Science

Research addresses a consequential question in ecology, evolution, behaviour, or conservation

Note: Molecular Ecology editorial policy requires that papers address consequential questions of general relevance to the fields of ecology, evolution, behaviour, or conservation

req Quality of Presentation

Writing is clear, methods and data analyses are transparent, ideas make sense, proper grammar and spelling is employed, redundancy is avoided

req Does this manuscript require significant reduction in length? If 'Yes', please indicate where shortening is required in your specific comments

No

req Does the Data Accessibility section list all the datasets needed to recreate the results in the manuscript? If 'No', please specify which additional data are needed in your comments to the authors.

No

req Is this manuscript worthy of a Perspective in our News and Views section? (Perspectives are short articles that highlight innovative or important papers appearing in Molecular Ecology)

No

req Recommendation

Accept

Accept, minor revisions

☒ Reject, encourage resubmission

Reject

Comments

Confidential Comments to the Editor

Dear Dr. Vines

Thank you for the opportunity of reviewing this article. The majority of comments is open to both the authors and you. The paper addresses an important question (correlation between changes in Ne and climate change) and the conclusions might be representative of a number of (endemic) species. However, I have several concerns about the methods and the interpretation of the results. As a consequence, I am not fully convinced that the results really support the hypotheses about the demographic history presented at the beginning of the article. I have suggested several ways of how the paper could be improved.

Best wishes,
Simon Aeschbacher

req Comments to the Author

Please find detailed comments in the attached PDF.

Files attached

- [ReplyToAuthors.pdf](#) [PDF](#)
☒ This file is for the Author and Editor

 Print  Close Window