

# On redundant Sylow subgroups

Benjamin Sambale\*

December 17, 2023

## Abstract

A Sylow  $p$ -subgroup  $P$  of a finite group  $G$  is called *redundant* if every  $p$ -element of  $G$  lies in a Sylow subgroup different from  $P$ . Generalizing a recent theorem of Maróti–Martínez–Moretó, we show that for every non-cyclic  $p$ -group  $P$  there exists a solvable group  $G$  such that  $P$  is redundant in  $G$ . Moreover, we answer several open questions raised by Maróti–Martínez–Moretó.

**Keywords:** Sylow subgroups, covering,  $p$ -elements

**AMS classification:** 20D20

## 1 Introduction

By Sylow’s theorem, every  $p$ -element of a finite group  $G$  lies in some Sylow  $p$ -subgroup of  $G$ . In the past, group theorists were interested in groups with *trivial-intersection* Sylow subgroups, i. e. every non-trivial  $p$ -element lies in a *unique* Sylow subgroup. In the present paper we are interested in opposite situation: groups whose  $p$ -elements all lie in at least two Sylow subgroups for a fixed prime  $p$ . Mikko Korhonen [9] has asked 10 years ago whether such groups actually exist. A positive answer was given by Jack Schmidt [9] using a group  $G$  with elementary abelian Sylow  $p$ -subgroups. Most recently, Maróti–Martínez–Moretó [11, Theorem A] have shown that for a given  $p$ -group  $P$  of exponent  $p$  there exists a solvable group  $G$  with  $P \in \text{Syl}_p(G)$  such that every element of  $P$  lies in a Sylow subgroup different from  $P$ . They called such a Sylow subgroup *redundant* in  $G$ , and so do we (by Sylow’s theorem, either all or no Sylow  $p$ -subgroup is redundant and in the former case every  $p$ -element lies in at least two Sylow subgroups).

In general, it is easy to see that redundant Sylow subgroups must be non-cyclic. Maróti–Martínez–Moretó have speculated on p. 483 that the restriction on the exponent of  $P$  in their theorem might be superfluous. In this paper, we show in Theorem 1 that this is indeed the case. In contrast to the proof of [11, Theorem A] (which depends a deep theorem of Turull and the solvable case of Thompson’s theorem), our proof is elementary. Using a refined method in Theorem 2, we also provide examples where the number of Sylow  $p$ -subgroups  $\nu_p(G)$  of  $G$  only depends on  $p$ . In particular, we show that  $\nu_2(G) = 27$  is the smallest possible value for a group  $G$  with a redundant Sylow 2-subgroup. We also determine the minimum of  $\nu_p(G)$  for  $p$ -solvable groups in Theorem 7. This is a contribution to [11, Question 8.5].

Let  $G_p$  be the set of  $p$ -elements of  $G$ . In [11, p. 846], the authors state that there are very few groups  $G$  such that  $|G_p| < \nu_p(G)$  and only examples with elementary abelian Sylow  $p$ -subgroups are known. Our

---

\*Institut für Algebra, Zahlentheorie und Diskrete Mathematik, Leibniz Universität Hannover, Welfengarten 1, 30167 Hannover, Germany, sambale@math.uni-hannover.de

construction yields such examples for every non-cyclic  $p$ -group  $P$ . This leads to a negative answer to [11, Question 8.7]. On the other hand, we provide a positive answer to [11, Question 8.8] in Theorem 9.

## 2 Results

**Theorem 1.** *For every non-cyclic  $p$ -group  $P$  and every prime  $q \neq p$  there exists an elementary abelian  $q$ -group  $N$  such that  $P$  acts on  $N$  and  $G := N \rtimes P$  has the following properties:*

- (i)  $P$  is redundant in  $G$ .
- (ii)  $|G_p| < \frac{1}{q^{p-1}}|G|$ .
- (iii)  $G_p$  is covered by  $\frac{1}{q^{p-1}}\nu_p(G)$  Sylow  $p$ -subgroups.

*Proof.*

- (i) Let  $V$  be the regular  $\mathbb{F}_q P$ -module with basis  $B := \{v_x : x \in P\}$ . Then  $P$  acts trivial on  $Z := \langle \prod_{x \in P} v_x \rangle$ . Let  $N := V/Z \cong C_q^{|P|-1}$  and  $G := N \rtimes P$ . Since  $P$  acts transitively on  $B$ , it follows that  $C_N(P) = 1$  and  $N_G(P) = P$ . Let  $x \in P$ . Since  $P$  is not cyclic,

$$w := \prod_{c \in \langle x \rangle} v_c Z \in C_N(x) \setminus \{1\}.$$

Hence,  $x = wxw^{-1} \in wPw^{-1} \in \text{Syl}_p(G) \setminus \{P\}$ . This shows that  $P$  is redundant in  $G$ .

- (ii) Let  $R \subseteq P$  be a set of representatives for the conjugacy classes of  $P$ . By construction, every  $p$ -element of  $G$  is conjugate to a unique element  $x \in R$ . Let  $g \in C_G(x)$  and write  $g = ny$  with  $n \in N$  and  $y \in P$ . Then  $xy \equiv xg \equiv gx \equiv yx \pmod{N}$  and therefore  $[x, y] \in P \cap N = 1$ . This shows that  $y \in C_P(x)$ ,  $n \in C_N(x)$  and  $C_G(x) = C_N(x)C_P(x)$ . Every right coset  $C$  of  $\langle x \rangle$  in  $P$  determines an element  $w_C := \prod_{c \in C} v_c \in C_V(x)$ . It is easy to check that the elements  $\{w_C : C \in \langle x \rangle \backslash P\}$  form a basis of  $C_V(x)$ . This yields

$$|C_N(x)| = |C_V(x)/Z| = q^{|P:\langle x \rangle|-1} \geq q^{p-1}.$$

Hence,

$$|G_p| = \sum_{x \in R} |G : C_G(x)| = \sum_{x \in R} |P : C_P(x)| |N : C_N(x)| < \frac{|N|}{q^{p-1}} \sum_{x \in R} |P : C_P(x)| = \frac{1}{q^{p-1}} |G|.$$

- (iii) Since  $P$  is non-cyclic, there exist maximal subgroups  $P_1, \dots, P_{p+1} \leq P$  such that  $P = P_1 \cup \dots \cup P_{p+1}$ . Then  $N_i := C_N(P_i) \cong C_q^{p-1}$  for  $i = 1, \dots, p+1$  by the argument of (ii). Since  $P_j \trianglelefteq P$ , each  $P_i$  acts on  $N_j$ . For  $i \neq j$ , we have  $N_i \cap N_j = C_N(\langle P_i, P_j \rangle) = C_N(P) = 1$ . By the Fitting decomposition (see [7, Theorem 4.34]), we obtain

$$N_j = C_{N_j}(P_i) \times [P_i, N_j] = [P_i, N_j] \leq [P_i, N].$$

Since  $N = N_i \times [P_i, N]$ , it follows that

$$N_i \cap \prod_{j \neq i} N_j \leq N_i \cap [P_i, N] = 1.$$

Therefore,  $N_1 \times \dots \times N_{p+1} \leq N$ . We choose a basis  $b_{i,1}, \dots, b_{i,p-1}$  of  $N_i$  for every  $i = 1, \dots, p+1$ . Then the elements  $b_{i,j}$  are linearly independent and can be extended to a basis  $B$  of  $N$ . For  $w \in N$  and  $b \in B$  let  $w_b$  be the coefficient of  $w$  with respect to  $b$ . Define

$$T := \left\{ w \in N : \forall j = 1, \dots, p-1 : \sum_{i=1}^{p+1} w_{b_{i,j}} \equiv 0 \pmod{q} \right\}.$$

Then  $|T| = \frac{1}{q^{p-1}}|N|$ . Let  $n \in N$  and  $x \in P$  be arbitrary. There exist  $i$  and  $t \in T$  such that  $x \in P_i$  and  $t_b = n_b$  for all  $b \in B \setminus \{b_{i,1}, \dots, b_{i,p-1}\}$ . It follows that  $t^{-1}n \in N_i \leq C_N(x)$  and  $nxn^{-1} = txt^{-1} \in tPt^{-1}$ . Hence,  $G_p$  is covered by  $\{tPt^{-1} : t \in T\}$ .  $\square$

If  $q^{p-1} > |P|$  in the situation of Theorem 1, then  $|G_p| < |N| = |G : N_G(P)| = \nu_p(G)$  by (ii). If  $p$  or  $q$  goes to infinity, (iii) furnishes a counterexample to [11, Question 8.7]. At the same time, it provides some evidence for [11, Question 8.6]. If  $P$  contains a cyclic subgroup of index  $p$ , one can show that  $G_p$  cannot be covered by less than  $\frac{1}{q^{p-1}}\nu_p(G)$  Sylow subgroups.

If  $P$  is the Klein four-group and  $q = 3$ , then the construction of the proof above yields the group  $G \cong \text{SmallGroup}(108, 40)$  with  $\nu_2(G) = 27$ , which was mentioned in [11, Introduction]. Question 8.5 of [11] asks for the smallest possible value of  $\nu_p(G)$  when  $G$  has a redundant Sylow  $p$ -subgroup. Our proof of Theorem 1 yields  $\nu_p(G) = |N| = q^{|P|-1}$ . We give a better bound, which only depends on  $p$ .

**Theorem 2.** *For every non-cyclic  $p$ -group  $P$  there exists a solvable group  $G$  such that  $P$  is redundant in  $G$  and  $\nu_p(G) = q^{p+1}$ , where  $q > 1$  is the smallest prime power congruent to 1 modulo  $p$ .*

*Proof.* Since  $P$  is non-cyclic, there exist maximal subgroups  $P_1, \dots, P_{p+1} \leq P$  such that  $P = P_1 \cup \dots \cup P_{p+1}$ . Since  $q \equiv 1 \pmod{p}$ , the finite field  $\mathbb{F}_q$  contains a primitive  $p$ -th root of unity. Hence, for  $i = 1, \dots, p+1$  there exists a 1-dimensional  $\mathbb{F}_q P$ -module  $N_i$  with kernel  $P_i$ . Define  $N = N_1 \oplus \dots \oplus N_{p+1}$ . Since every  $x \in P$  lies in some  $P_i$ , it follows that  $C_N(x) > 1 = C_N(P)$ . Now by the proof of Theorem 1(i) (or using [11, Corollary 3.2]), it follows that  $P$  is redundant in  $G := N \rtimes P$  and  $\nu_p(G) = |N| = q^{p+1}$  (we do not need that  $P$  acts faithfully on  $N$ ).  $\square$

Theorem 2 provides the following upper bounds for the minimal values of  $\nu_p(G)$ :

$p$	2	3	5	7	11	13	17	19	23	29
$\min_{q \equiv 1 \pmod{p}} q^{p+1}$	$3^3$	$2^8$	$11^6$	$2^{24}$	$23^{12}$	$3^{42}$	$103^{18}$	$191^{20}$	$47^{24}$	$59^{30}$

Now we work in the opposite direction by finding lower bounds on  $\nu_p(G)$ . The following result settles the case  $p = 2$ .

**Theorem 3.** *Let  $G$  be a finite group with a redundant Sylow 2-subgroup. Then  $\nu_2(G) \geq 27$ .*

*Proof.* Let  $N$  be the kernel of the conjugation action of  $G$  on  $\text{Syl}_2(G)$ , i.e.  $N$  is the intersection of all Sylow normalizers. Let  $P \in \text{Syl}_2(G)$ . Since  $P$  is the unique Sylow 2-subgroup of  $PN$ , the map  $\text{Syl}_2(G) \rightarrow \text{Syl}_2(G/N)$ ,  $P \mapsto PN/N$  is a bijection and  $P$  is redundant in  $\text{Syl}_2(G)$  if and only if  $PN/N$  is redundant in  $G/N$ . Hence, we may assume that  $N = 1$ . Then  $G$  is a transitive permutation group of degree  $\nu_2(G)$ . We run through the database of all transitive groups of odd degree up to 25 in GAP [3]. For each such group we can quickly check whether the stabilizer has a normal Sylow 2-subgroup. If this is the case, we check whether  $G$  has a redundant Sylow 2-subgroup using [11, Lemmas 2.1 and 2.6]. It turns out that there are no examples with  $\nu_2(G) < 27$ .  $\square$

With the same method, we obtain  $\nu_3(G) \geq 49$  and  $\nu_5(G) \geq 51$  whenever  $G$  has a redundant Sylow  $p$ -subgroup for  $p = 3$  or  $p = 5$  respectively. The next lemma improves [11, Theorem 8.4] with an easier proof.

**Lemma 4.** *Let  $G$  be a finite group with a redundant Sylow  $p$ -subgroup. Then  $\nu_p(G) \geq p^2 + p + 1$ .*

*Proof.* Let  $P \in \text{Syl}_p(G)$  be covered by  $P_1, \dots, P_k \in \text{Syl}_p(G) \setminus \{P\}$  such that  $k$  is as small as possible. Then  $P \cap P_i \neq P \cap P_j$  for  $i \neq j$ . Since  $P$  is not the union of  $p$  proper subgroups, we must have  $k \geq p + 1$ . Let  $g \in N_P(P \cap P_i) \setminus P_i$ . Then  $g \notin N_G(P_i)$ , since otherwise  $P_i \langle g \rangle$  would be a  $p$ -subgroup larger than  $P_i$ . Hence, the Sylow subgroups  $P_i^{g^j}$  for  $j = 1, \dots, p$  are pairwise distinct and

$$P \cap P_i^{g^j} = P^{g^j} \cap P_i^{g^j} = (P \cap P_i)^{g^j} = P \cap P_i.$$

In this way we obtain  $kp$  Sylow  $p$ -subgroups different from  $P$ . Hence,  $\nu_p(G) \geq kp + 1 \geq p^2 + p + 1$ .  $\square$

**Lemma 5.** *Let  $G$  be a finite group with a redundant Sylow  $p$ -subgroup. Then  $\nu_p(G)$  is not a prime.*

*Proof.* Let  $G$  be a minimal counterexample with  $P \in \text{Syl}_p(G)$  redundant. As in the proof of Theorem 3, we may assume that  $G$  is a transitive permutation group of prime degree  $q := |\text{Syl}_p(G)|$ . By a result of Burnside,  $G$  is a subgroup of the affine group  $C_q \rtimes C_{q-1}$  or a 2-transitive almost simple group (see [2, Corollary 3.5B and Theorem 4.1B]). The first case is impossible, since  $P$  must be non-cyclic. The latter case can be investigated with the classification of the finite simple groups (see [2, p. 99] or [5]). More precisely, the socle  $N$  of  $G$  is one of the following simple groups:

- (i)  $N = A_q$ . Since the stabilizer  $A_{q-1}$  must have a normal Sylow  $p$ -subgroup, it follows that  $q = 5$  and  $p = 2$ . By Theorem 3, neither  $G = A_5$  nor  $G = S_5$  has a redundant Sylow 2-subgroup.
- (ii)  $N = \text{PSL}(2, 11)$  with  $q = 11$ . Here  $|G : N| \leq 2$  and the stabilizer is isomorphic to  $A_5$ , so it cannot have a normal Sylow  $p$ -subgroup.
- (iii)  $N = M_{11} = G$  with  $q = 11$ . Again the stabilizer  $M_{10}$  has no normal Sylow  $p$ -subgroup.
- (iv)  $N = M_{23} = G$  with  $q = 23$ . Here the stabilizer  $M_{22}$  is simple.
- (v)  $N = \text{PSL}(n, r)$  with  $q = \frac{r^n - 1}{r - 1}$  where  $n$  is a prime. Suppose that  $n \mid r - 1$ . Then  $q = 1 + r + \dots + r^{n-1} \equiv n \equiv 0 \pmod{n}$  and  $q = n$ . But this contradicts  $q > r - 1$ . Hence,  $\gcd(n, r - 1) = 1$  and  $N = \text{SL}(n, r)$ . Here  $G$  acts on the set of lines or hyperplanes of  $\mathbb{F}_r^n$ . In both cases the stabilizer, say  $N_v$  contains a copy of  $\text{GL}(n - 1, r)$ . If  $n > 2$ , then  $|\text{GL}(n - 1, r)|$  is divisible by  $r^{\frac{r^{n-1} - 1}{r - 1}} = q - 1$ . In particular,  $N_v$  has a non-trivial Sylow  $p$ -subgroup, which cannot be normal since  $\text{GL}(n - 1, r)$  is involved in  $N_v$ . Consequently,  $n = 2$  and  $q = r + 1$  is a Fermat prime. Now  $G/N$  is a cyclic 2-group. For  $p > 2$  it is well-known that the Sylow  $p$ -subgroup of  $N$  and  $G$  are cyclic (see [10, 8.6.9]). Hence,  $p = 2$  and  $G = PN$ . The upper unitriangular matrices constitute a Sylow 2-subgroup  $Q \leq P$  of  $N$ . We consider  $x := \begin{pmatrix} 1 & 1 \\ 0 & 1 \end{pmatrix} \in Q$ . It is easy to see that  $C_N(x) = Q$ . In particular,  $Q$  is the only Sylow 2-subgroup of  $N$  containing  $x$ . Since  $N_G(P) \leq N_G(P \cap N) = N_G(Q)$  and  $\nu_p(G) = q$  is a prime, we have

$$\nu_p(N) = |N : N_N(Q)| = |N : N \cap N_G(Q)| = |NN_G(Q) : N_G(Q)| \mid |G : N_G(P)| = \nu_p(G)$$

and  $\nu_p(N) = \nu_p(G)$ . Therefore,  $P$  is the only Sylow 2-subgroup of  $G$  containing  $Q$  and  $x$ . Thus,  $P$  is not redundant and we derived a contradiction.  $\square$

Now we consider  $p$ -solvable groups. For  $H \leq P \in \text{Syl}_p(G)$  let  $\lambda_G(H)$  be the number of Sylow  $p$ -subgroups of  $G$  containing  $H$ . The following result was proved using Wielandt's subnormalizers.

**Lemma 6** (Casolo). *Let  $G$  be a  $p$ -solvable group and  $H \leq P \in \text{Syl}_p(G)$ . Let  $\mathcal{M}$  be the set of  $p'$ -quotients in a normal series of  $G$  whose quotients are  $p$ -groups or  $p'$ -groups. Then*

$$\lambda_G(H)|N_G(P) : P| = \prod_{Q \in \mathcal{M}} |C_Q(H)|.$$

*Proof.* See Theorems 2.6 and 2.8 in [1]. □

**Theorem 7.** *Let  $G$  be a  $p$ -solvable group with a redundant Sylow  $p$ -subgroup. Then  $\nu_p(G) \geq q^{p+1}$ , where  $q > 1$  is the smallest prime power congruent to 1 modulo  $p$ .*

*Proof.* Let  $P \in \text{Syl}_p(G)$  and  $\mathcal{M}$  as in Lemma 6. Choosing  $H = P$  in Lemma 6 yields

$$|N_G(P) : P| = \prod_{Q \in \mathcal{M}} |C_Q(P)|.$$

Let  $N := \times_{Q \in \mathcal{M}} Q$  and  $\tilde{G} := N \rtimes P$ . Then  $\nu_p(G) = |G : N_G(P)| = |\tilde{G} : N_{\tilde{G}}(P)| = \nu_p(\tilde{G})$ . Now let  $H \leq P$  be a cyclic subgroup. Since  $P$  is redundant in  $G$ , we have  $\lambda_G(H) > 1$ . In this situation Lemma 6 shows that  $\lambda_{\tilde{G}}(H) > 1$ . Hence,  $P$  is redundant in  $\tilde{G}$  and we may assume that  $G = \tilde{G}$  is  $p$ -nilpotent and  $N = O_{p'}(G)$ . Then  $C_N(x) > C_N(P)$  for all  $x \in P$ . We consider  $N$  as a  $P$ -set via the conjugation action. By a theorem of Hartley–Turull [6] (see also [7, Theorem 3.31]), there exists an abelian group  $A$  and an isomorphism of  $P$ -sets  $\varphi : N \rightarrow A$ , i. e.  $\varphi(n^x) = \varphi(n)^x$  for all  $x \in P$  and  $n \in N$ . In particular,  $C_A(x) = \varphi(C_N(x)) > \varphi(C_N(P)) = C_A(P)$ . Hence,  $P$  is redundant in  $A \rtimes P$  and

$$\nu_p(A \rtimes P) = |A : C_A(P)| = |N : C_N(P)| = \nu_p(G).$$

Thus, we may assume that  $N = A$  is abelian. Then  $C_N(P) \trianglelefteq G$ . Going over to  $G/C_N(P)$ , we may assume that  $C_N(P) = 1$ . Let  $P_1, \dots, P_{p+1} \leq P$  be maximal subgroups of  $P$  such that  $P = P_1 \cup \dots \cup P_{p+1}$ . If  $C_N(P_i) = 1$  for some  $i$ , then  $P_i$  is redundant in  $P_i N$  and  $\nu_p(P_i N) = |N| = \nu_p(G)$ . Arguing by induction on  $|G|$ , we can assume that  $N_i := C_N(P_i) > 1$  for  $i = 1, \dots, p+1$ . Using the Fitting decomposition as in the proof of Theorem 1(iii), we obtain  $N_1 \times \dots \times N_{p+1} \leq N$ . Since  $P$  acts non-trivially on each  $N_i$ , it is clear that  $|N_i| \geq q$ . In total,  $|N| \geq q^{p+1}$ . □

We remark that  $G := \text{PSL}(2, 11)$  has a redundant Sylow 2-subgroup by [11, Theorem D] and  $\nu_2(G) = 55$  is a product of only two primes. This indicates that Theorem 7 may not hold for arbitrary groups.

For  $x \in P \in \text{Syl}_p(G)$  let  $\lambda_G(x) = \lambda_G(\langle x \rangle)$ . Gheri [4] has introduced the following condition:

$$\nu_p(G)^{|P|/p} \geq \prod_{x \in P} \lambda_G(x). \tag{2.1}$$

He has shown in [4, Theorem B] that (2.1) holds for all finite groups if and only if it holds for all almost simple groups. No counterexamples are known to exist. This yields a conjectural bound for  $\nu_p(G)$ .

**Theorem 8.** *Suppose that  $G$  has a redundant Sylow  $p$ -subgroup of order  $p^n$ . If  $G$  satisfies (2.1), then*

$$\nu_p(G) \geq (p+1)^{\frac{p^n-1}{p^{n-1}-1}} > (p+1)^p.$$

*Proof.* Let  $x \in P \in \text{Syl}_p(G)$ . Since  $P$  is redundant, there exists a Sylow  $p$ -subgroup  $Q \neq P$  such that  $x \in P \cap Q$ . As in the proof of Lemma 4, we may choose  $g \in N_P(P \cap Q) \setminus Q$  such that  $Q^g, Q^{g^2}, \dots, Q^{g^p}$  are distinct Sylow  $p$ -subgroups containing  $x$ . Hence,  $\lambda_G(x) \geq p + 1$ . Moreover,  $\lambda_G(1) = \nu_p(G)$ . Now (2.1) implies

$$\nu_p(G)^{p^{n-1}} \geq \lambda_G(1) \prod_{x \in P \setminus \{1\}} \lambda_G(x) \geq \nu_p(G)(p+1)^{p^{n-1}}.$$

Since  $P$  is non-cyclic,  $n \geq 2$  and  $\frac{p^n-1}{p^{n-1}-1} > p$ . □

If  $n = 2$  in Theorem 8, then  $\nu_p(G) \geq (p+1)^{p+1}$ . This coincides with Theorem 7, whenever,  $p$  is a Mersenne prime or  $p = 2$ . The proof of [4, Theorem B] reduces (2.1) to an almost simple group  $S$  such that  $\nu_p(S) \leq \nu_p(G)$ . Then  $S$  is a primitive permutation group of degree  $\leq \nu_p(S)$ . If  $\nu_p(G)$  is small, say  $\nu_p(G) < 2^{12}$ , we can check (2.1) by running through the library of primitive groups in GAP [3]. We did not find examples among non-solvable groups improving the values in Theorem 2.

Next we answer [11, Question 8.8].

**Theorem 9.** *For every  $n \in \mathbb{N}$  there exists a constant  $\delta_n < 1$  with the following property: For every set of Sylow  $p$ -subgroups  $P_1, \dots, P_n$  of a finite group  $G$  we have  $G_p = P_1 \cup \dots \cup P_n$  or*

$$|P_1 \cup \dots \cup P_n| < \delta_n |G_p|.$$

*Proof.* We assume that  $G_p \neq P_1 \cup \dots \cup P_n$  and argue by induction on  $n$ . Let  $P \in \text{Syl}_p(G) \setminus \{P_1, \dots, P_n\}$ . A well-known theorem of Frobenius asserts that  $|G_p| = a|P|$  for some integer  $a \geq 2$  (see e. g. [8]). If  $n = 1$ , then the claim holds with  $\delta_1 = \frac{1}{2}$ . Now let  $n \geq 2$  and assume that  $\delta_{n-1}$  is already given. Let  $\rho_n$  be the smallest positive integer such that  $\delta_{n-1} + \frac{1}{\rho_n} < 1$ . If  $a \geq \rho_n$ , then induction yields

$$|P_1 \cup \dots \cup P_n| \leq |P_1 \cup \dots \cup P_{n-1}| + |P| \leq \delta_{n-1} |G_p| + \frac{1}{a} |G_p| \leq \left( \delta_{n-1} + \frac{1}{\rho_n} \right) |G_p|.$$

Now suppose that  $a \leq \rho_n$ . We may assume that  $P \not\subseteq P_1 \cup \dots \cup P_n$ . Hence, by [12, Theorem 1], there exists a constant  $\gamma_n < 1$  such that

$$\begin{aligned} |P_1 \cup \dots \cup P_n| &\leq |G_p \setminus P| + |(P \cap P_1) \cup \dots \cup (P \cap P_n)| \leq \frac{a-1}{a} |G_p| + \gamma_n |P| \\ &= \left( 1 - \frac{1-\gamma_n}{a} \right) |G_p| \leq \left( 1 - \frac{1-\gamma_n}{\rho_n} \right) |G_p|. \end{aligned}$$

Finally, the claim holds with

$$\delta_n := \max \left\{ \delta_{n-1} + \frac{1}{\rho_n}, 1 - \frac{1-\gamma_n}{\rho_n} \right\}. \quad \square$$

We finally remark that the prime  $p$  in Theorem 1 can be replaced by a set of primes. In fact the proof easily generalizes to the following theorem:

**Theorem 10.** *For every finite group  $H$  there exists a finite group  $G$  such that  $H$  is a Hall  $\pi$ -subgroup of  $G$  (where  $\pi$  is a set of primes) and every  $\pi$ -element of  $G$  lies in at least two Hall  $\pi$ -subgroups of  $G$ .*

## References

- [1] C. Casolo, *Subnormalizers in finite groups*, Comm. Algebra **18** (1990), 3791–3818.
- [2] J. D. Dixon and B. Mortimer, *Permutation groups*, Graduate Texts in Mathematics, Vol. 163, Springer-Verlag, New York, 1996.
- [3] The GAP Group, *GAP – Groups, Algorithms, and Programming, Version 4.12.2*; 2022, (<http://www.gap-system.org>).
- [4] P. Gheri, *On the number of  $p$ -elements in a finite group*, Ann. Mat. Pura Appl. (4) **200** (2021), 1231–1243.
- [5] R. M. Guralnick, *Subgroups of prime power index in a simple group*, J. Algebra **81** (1983), 304–311.
- [6] B. Hartley and A. Turull, *On characters of coprime operator groups and the Glauberman character correspondence*, J. Reine Angew. Math. **451** (1994), 175–219.
- [7] I. M. Isaacs, *Finite group theory*, Graduate Studies in Mathematics, Vol. 92, American Mathematical Society, Providence, RI, 2008.
- [8] I. M. Isaacs and G. R. Robinson, *On a theorem of Frobenius: solutions of  $x^n = 1$  in finite groups*, Amer. Math. Monthly **99** (1992), 352–354.
- [9] M. Korhonen, *If  $p$  is an odd prime, does every Sylow  $p$ -subgroup contain an element not in any other Sylow  $p$ -subgroup?*, <https://math.stackexchange.com/questions/299682>.
- [10] H. Kurzweil and B. Stellmacher, *The theory of finite groups*, Universitext, Springer-Verlag, New York, 2004.
- [11] A. Maróti, J. Martínez and A. Moretó, *Covering the set of  $p$ -elements in finite groups by Sylow  $p$ -subgroups*, J. Algebra **638** (2024), 840–861.
- [12] B. Sambale and M. Tărnăuceanu, *On the size of coset unions*, J. Algebraic Combin. **55** (2022), 979–987.