

View Letter

Close

Date: 14 Mar 2020
To: "Zhihua Wei" zhihua_wei@tongji.edu.cn,zhihua.wei@hotmail.com
From: Witold pedrycz eesserver@eesmail.elsevier.com
Reply To: Witold pedrycz wpedrycz@ualberta.ca
Subject: Decision on INS-D-19-4012R1

Re: INS-D-19-4012R1

Dear Dr. Wei,

We have received the decision on your paper entitled "Improved General Attribute Reduction Algorithms".

The Editor's and the reviewers' comments are as follows:

Reviewer #1: The authors have addressed my commnets. In my point of view, it can be published in INS.

Reviewer #2: My concerns have been resolved. However, by examing other reviewers' comments, I think the authors still need to revise this manuscript.
 For Question 5 of reviewer #1, the "significance test" does not mean the feature selection methods based on attribute significane. In fact, the reviewer wants to see the significance test result based on your "mean\pm std" over each dataset, such as t-test, Friedman test or others.

Reviewer #3: The authors answered my objections and comments. In this aspect, I have only the following comment:

The hash functions, (pages 16-17).
 Taking into account the answer to my previous objections about hash functions and the related changes in the manuscript:
 I would hesitate to call them hash function. They create keys for hashing. The keys are then hashed by a function implemented in python's dictionary. I recommend use notation key(), and call them key converter / key generator.

English langue has been improved but the language quality is still quite bad, mainly in missing/wrong articles. I recommend the authors to hire a native speaker to help them with the grammar check. (I am not a native speaker myself, therefore I do not dare to propose corrections).

other issues:
 line 45: easily understanding -> easily understandable
 line 88-92: the sentence is too long and hard to understand
 line 295: missing = in (4)
 line 352: doesn't -> does not
 line 444: "/" -> ``/''
 line 620: Figure 2 shown -> Figure 2 shows

math symbols:
 \angle , \angle are better symbols for angle brackets than $<$ $>$
 IND, POS, BND, max, argmax, etc should not be in italics
 (they are not variables, they are exactly given sets/operators).

spacing in math expressions:
 for example: line 129: there should be spaces around $|$, and no

spaces inside angle brackets.

line 388: "Excepts, it is notable that hash functions are also the data structure in programming." -- I don't understand what you want to say.

fig 1. avoid using the colors, line separators would be better here.

Note: Please double check the author names provided in the manuscript source file so that authorship related changes are made in the revision stage. If your manuscript is accepted, any authorship change will involve approval from co-authors and respective editor handling the submission and this may cause a significant delay in publishing your manuscript.

In view of these comments the Editor-in-Chief, Professor Witold Pedrycz, has decided that the paper can be reconsidered for publication after the points raised by the referees have been addressed.

When you log-in to your Main Menu, you will see a menu item called 'Submission Needing Revision'. You will find your submission record there. Also, the reviewer(s) may have uploaded a file with detailed comments on your manuscript. Click on "View Reviewer Attachments" to access any detailed comments from the reviewer(s) that may have been included.

When submitting your revised manuscript, please make sure that you upload the source files (e.g. Word or .TeX and other files in a .zip file which the system will automatically unzip). Uploading a PDF file at this stage will create delays should your manuscript be finally accepted for publication. If your revised submission does not include the source files, we will contact you to request them.

We look forward to receiving the revised version of your paper together with a reply to the reports and a summary of the revisions made.

Please note that this journal offers a new, free service called AudioSlides: brief, webcast-style presentations that are shown next to published articles on ScienceDirect (see also <http://www.elsevier.com/audioslides>). If your paper is accepted for publication, you will automatically receive an invitation to create an AudioSlides presentation.

The revised version of your submission is due by 13 May 2020.

Information Sciences features the Interactive Plot Viewer, see: <http://www.elsevier.com/interactiveplots>. Interactive Plots provide easy access to the data behind plots. To include one with your article, please prepare a .csv file with your plot data and test it online at <http://authortools.elsevier.com/interactiveplots/verification> before submission as supplementary material.

Include interactive data visualizations in your publication and let your readers interact and engage more closely with your research. Follow the instructions here: <https://www.elsevier.com/authors/author-services/data-visualization> to find out about available data visualization options and how to include them with your article.

MethodsX file (optional)

We invite you to submit a method article alongside your research article. This is an opportunity to get full credit for the time and money you have spent on developing research methods, and to increase the visibility and impact of your work. If your research article is accepted, your method article will be automatically transferred over to the open access journal, MethodsX, where it will be editorially reviewed and published as a separate method article upon acceptance. Both articles will be linked on ScienceDirect. Please use the MethodsX template available here when preparing your article: <https://www.elsevier.com/MethodsX-template>. Open access fees apply.

Kind regards,

Witold pedrycz
Editor-in-Chief
%JOURNALFULLTITLE

Data in Brief (optional):

We invite you to convert your supplementary data (or a part of it) into an additional journal publication in Data in Brief, a multi-disciplinary open access journal. Data in Brief articles are a fantastic way to describe supplementary data and associated metadata, or full raw datasets deposited in an external

repository, which are otherwise unnoticed. A Data in Brief article (which will be reviewed, formatted, indexed, and given a DOI) will make your data easier to find, reproduce, and cite.

You can submit to Data in Brief via the Information Sciences submission system when you upload your revised Information Sciences manuscript. To do so, complete the template and follow the co-submission instructions found here: www.elsevier.com/dib-template. If your Information Sciences manuscript is accepted, your Data in Brief submission will automatically be transferred to Data in Brief for editorial review and publication.

Please note: an open access Article Publication Charge (APC) is payable by the author or research funder to cover the costs associated with publication in Data in Brief and ensure your data article is immediately and permanently free to access by all. For the current APC see: www.elsevier.com/journals/data-in-brief/2352-3409/open-access-journal

Please contact the Data in Brief editorial office at dib-me@elsevier.com or visit the Data in Brief homepage (www.journals.elsevier.com/data-in-brief/) if you have questions or need further information.

Close