UNIVERSITY OF CALIFORNIA, SANTA BARBARA

BERKELEY • DAVIS • IRVINE • LOS ANGELES • MERCED • RIVERSIDE • SAN DIEGO • SAN FRANCISCO

SANTA BARBARA • SANTA CRUZ

Bren School of Environmental Science & Management Santa Barbara, CA 93106 http://www.bren.ucsb.edu/

March 2, 2019

Dr. Brian Fath, Editor-in-Chief, *Ecological Modelling*

Dear Dr. Fath,

Enclosed please find the revision of manuscript ECOMOD-18-618, entitled "Persistent problems in the construction of matrix population models," for consideration in the special issue on Matrix Population Models, edited by Dmitrii Logofet and Rob Salguero-Gomez. The findings in the paper have not been published elsewhere, and all co-authors agree to this submission.

We have attempted to address all the points made by the reviewers; see the "response to reviewers" for details.

Our manuscript was prepared in Rmarkdown; I have included the Rmd source file as well as the derived LaTeX files.

We think that our manuscript has important messages about the need to re-assess the quality of previously published MPMs and the challenges of helping biologists (many not explicitly trained in modelling) build more reliable models in the future.

Sincerely,

Bruce E. Kendall

Professor