Student Responses on A1.2 - Reader Response Prompt - MLA/CCCC Task Force Report on Writing and AI

Student 1

Artificial Intelligence's (AI) fusion into composition and rhetoric studies introduces several risks and benefits for students and professionals. From an artistic point of view, my impression of AI is that it is boring and that it lacks any imagination to use it. While AI can perfectly replicate a singer, paint portraits in seconds, and write novels, it can never recreate the humanity of art. However, as a university student and avid writer, I cannot deny that AI could be useful in the classroom, especially in language and literary studies. According to our text "While acknowledging the inherent pitfalls of generative AI, the technology affords enormous potential benefits" (Byrd 8). For example, AI can assist educators in quickly creating examples for students who may speak a different language, as well as generate questions based on the text in said language (Byrd 8). The text also acknowledges the use of AI in literary studies referencing that AI could potentially allow for information such as dates, authors, and book titles to be organized quickly, thus making research easier and more accessible (Byrd 8).

While the text introduces the benefits of using artificial intelligence for instruction, many risks and disadvantages are still associated with using AI. Academic integrity is an important expectation among all students, especially in fields such as humanities and STEM. AI challenges this integrity by potentially bypassing universities' policies and allowing students to submit work that has been written with the help of AI. The text states "…the lack of source transparency complicates and undermines the ethics of academic research and trust in the research process" (Byrd 6). For example, AI could potentially cause students to be flagged for unethical research and create false positives, negatively impacting a student's education. While AI offers positive interactions and opportunities, it can ultimately prove to cause more harm than good for students and professional writers.

References

Byrd, Antonio et al. MLA-CCCC Joint Task Force on Writing and Ai Working Paper: Overview Of ..., MLA-CCCC Joint Task Force on Writing and AI , July 2023, hcommons.org/app/uploads/sites/1003160/2023/07/MLA-CCCC-Joint-Task-Force-on-Writing-and-AI-Working-Paper-1.pdf.

Student Replies

1. Hey, I totally hear all the things you are saying and I agree because I was on the same view point you are but as I went on and read more I realized that there can be more good coming from AI. Simply from the aspect of myself I am not the best when it comes to making certain parts of my papers flow or making them go into each other without it feeling as though there has been a shift, and using AI can help people really better their papers and how they write to their stakes. As well as it can be something that can be a contended aspect with teachers because now a days educators are using more up to date rhymes and songs to help little kids learn, so Ai is more of the same thing with

upperclass students and college students if the teacher can generate how they can properly use it without students feeling as though this is their cheat its more benefits being done then there is harm. To one of your points you have made about AI and how it can pull up books, authors etc can be something that is beneficial to someone who is not so fond or good with the American language. It can help them find and understand books but it is also beneficial the the educator helping them because what if it is something the educator needs help on or needs another source for reference. This is a way that AI can be helpful but takeover at the same time my question for you is could you have a change of heart and possibly give AI a chance to actually see the benefits or you still standing on the risk are high and AI needs to go?

2. Hey, I like your discussion. I agree with you on many views that were stated. All the q A part of your discussion post that spoke to me was you stated how you do not agree with AI but admitted it can be a useful tool for students in school. In the discussion, it states, "I cannot deny that AI could be useful in the classroom, especially in language and literary studies.". I agreed with this statement because I have the same viewpoint. Even though I do not like AI as a whole, I feel that it could be beneficial to students in school. Do you feel like the benefits of AI outweigh the risk in relation to education? I feel that we never know how far people will go with AI so if it does become a part of education it needs to be observed and maintained.

Student 2
My first initial thought of the risk of artificial Intelligence (AI) is that I do agree with the risk and that these are really good points but it also made me realize that this is focused upon the negative parts of AI and not the possible benefits it could give to all of our students. This first piece of information really stuck out to me because it is a lack of help for the students "Students may miss writing, reading, and thinking practice because they submit generative AI outputs as their own work or depend on generative AI summaries of texts rather than reading." This shows that students will not really have any type of real learning coming from the assignment they are writing to us about because this is not their words, so it is not showing what they have learned or helping with what they need clarification on! As well as AI coming in and taking over which could take away from the actual face to face relationship and understand that students need because not all students learn the same. So with AI coming into play and possibly taking Educators jobs could leave students struggling more and more everyday, because a lot of students are hands on learners or need that actual communication to understand not just a computer telling them what to write. "Students may have unequal access to the most elite tools since some students and institutions will be able to purchase more sophisticated versions of the technologies, which may replicate societal inequalities".

While the information we have also been provided with gives us a list of benefits that AI could do to help our students excel in so many different ways its all about how you use and the mindset you have when you are using AI apps such as ChatGPT, this app can be beneficial because it can be used to help produce better language and enhance the students vocabulary as well as helping them sound more formal in their papers and life it self "Language students can develop expertise even while using generative AI. Although it may be used to produce a rough draft of a translation, refining such translations will still require knowledge about language choices, especially with literary works." As well as this goes back to one of my points above because it can help in other ways for students who like images and pictures to help, because aI can help by providing images "Students can use generative AI to produce creative materials when developing multimodal writing projects that communicate in modes other than written text,

since generative AI can process data involving still images, sound, and moving images". AI can be used for so many different things that coupled really help boost a students academic life in the school system such as helping them properly know how to write their papers, how to make things flow in a better manner, and help them be able to map out their papers. It can be something very informational and a great take away on both ends for the educators and students "Students can use LLMs to help stimulate thought and develop drafts that are still the student's own work and to overcome psychological obstacles to tackling invention and revision. When used in these ways, LLMs have the potential to act as literacy sponsors to emerging academic writers." Within those three Benefits that I have provided I feel as though they out way the risk of AI, once again it is all about the usage of the apps and the mindset you go in with using them so as time went on I started to drift away from AI being more risky and start to feel as though its an amazing benefit that can be structured in the right way for students to succeed in their future.

MLA-CCCC Joint Task Force on Writing and Ai Working Paper: Overview Of ..., July 2023, hcommons.org/app/uploads/sites/1003160/2023/07/MLA-CCCC-Joint-Task-Force-on-Writing-and-AI-Working-Paper-1.pdf

Student Responses
1. Hey. After reading your response to the article I must say that we share incredibly similar values and beliefs regarding AI and how it could potentially negatively impact educators and students. AI is genuinely such a scary thought in the sense that it could take educator's jobs thus negatively impacting both teachers and students. As you stated in your response, not all students learn the same, which raises the concern that if AI were to be permanently integrated into professional or educational settings, society could see an even steeper decline in the quality of education. Teachers are as important as they are not solely because they educate children but because they do so in a human way. Teachers are compassionate, and understanding, and can emotionally connect with their students. By implementing AI into the classroom and getting rid of teachers it would cause several students to fail. As you previously stated, AI could potentially be helpful in educational settings but only in addition to having human teachers and by having AI training. The article implemented so many benefits to using AI in a professional setting and I believe that you added those into your response beautifully. AI is growing rapidly and as such universities, professional work spaces, and public schools should all begin to implement AI training and security courses. Excellent post, I genuinely enjoyed reading through your post and being able to discuss all that I agree with. Thank you!
2. Hey, first off I was truly intrigued by your discussion post. I like that you stated both the benefits and risks of AI because when talking about a tool as complex as AI you have to rule out the pros and cons. I agree with your risk about the tool because we have a similar perspective. A question I have for you is: Overall (as a whole) do you feel that AI is beneficial? In your discussion, you used a quote that stated "Language students can develop expertise even while using generative AI. Although it may be used to produce a rough draft of a translation, refining such translations will still require knowledge about language choices, especially with literary works." This was a great quote to you because I feel that this is one of the reasons why I am for AI. English second language students could benefit from AI by receiving personalized language learning experiences that adapt to their individual needs Using AI as a tool is key, especially in education. Great discussion post!

Student 3
AI is a potential risk to language, literature, and writing instruction. I feel there are risks for everything in life, but I would say the risks outweigh the benefits. In the article "MLA-CCCC Joint Task Force on Writing and AI" it states, "Societal conversations are underway as well about the costs of LLMs, including the spread of misinformation, biased outputs, privacy and copyright violations, and environmental costs.". (Bryd 6) This quote explains how AI will affect students not only in schools but their overall way of thinking.

While reading about the potential risks of AI, I was intrigued by a few. The first risk that caught my eye was "Students may not see writing or language study as valuable since machines can mimic these skills.". (Bryd 7) This is a potential risk because students may not see writing or language study as valuable since AI can mimic these skills. It can potentially undermine the development of communication and critical thinking skills. Another risk that I observed is that "Teachers will need to spend time and energy developing critical AI literacy (that is, literacy about the nature, capacities, and risks of AI tools as well as how they might be used), which will divert their attention away from other teaching practices and course content unless adequate resources are given to build it into the curriculum." (Bryd 7) As a teacher, this poses a threat to me because we will spend more time on AI than what students need to learn. The last potential risk that I noticed is "Uneven access to AI text generators may increase inequities between scholars of different institutions or countries.". (Bryd 8) This risk describes how schools with limited access to advanced AI tools may face disadvantages in producing high-quality research and academic work. It can also widen the gap in academic achievements and knowledge dissemination.

"MLA-CCCC Joint Task Force on Writing and Ai Working Paper: Overview of the Issues, Statement of Principles, and Recommendations." MLA-CCCC Joint Task Force on Writing and AI, aiandwriting.hcommons.org/working-paper-1/. Accessed 22 Jan. 2024.

Student Responses

1. Hi. The quote "Students may not see writing or language study as valuable since machines can mimic these skills" really showcases what the article is about. While AI can be beneficial in education, students mustn't lose respect for writing. especially because technical writing skills are so important in a professional setting. Writing isn't just important in school, it is important to be a strong writer for emails, proposals, projects, and any other work-related task. Your inclusion of this quote is so important because it is one of the biggest fears in education currently as AI continues to gain popularity among students. Overall, I genuinely liked your post and felt that you included a good bit of information. That being said, remember to include in-text citations, especially for direct quotes, I don't want you to lose points when the rest of your response was fantastic!

2. Hey. I really enjoyed reading the response you have made about AI! I really noticed how you talked about how teachers may have to focus their lectures and teaching around how to use AI. Which in my opinion I do not feel as though all lectures, or the main point of the lessons educators will have to do will be based on AI. "Societal conversations are underway as well about the costs of LLMs, including the spread of misinformation, biased outputs, privacy and copyright violations, and environmental costs." When you stated this quote it really made me sit back and think about my perspective. I never really put this too far into my thought because AI is just pulling information from so many sources, it may not always be true, or come from a site that is not technically true or a

site that should be taken away from. I also believe that using AI can still be very beneficial because it can have people using better word play, upping their grammar, helping them know the dos and don'ts of thinking. As well as helping them better their way of communicating when it comes to emails, papers etc. I disagree with the risk you mentioned about the students not really being about to see the value in writing or the language studies. Using AI can improve their writing skills and help them see the main points. Or help them really understand what their educator is talking to them about , as well as helping them have better word play and not stick to a certain level can help them boost their language. Know times of when they should talk formally and informally because at the end of the day, like I stated in my initial response it is all about how the people have in their mind and how they use AI. So with all of that being said, do you believe that if teachers planned out how to incorporate AI with their own personal lessons that it would be a way to get everyone what they want? Teachers being able to do their own lessons, while students being able to have access to AI for the proper reasons and sources?