title: 'Group Project #1' author: "Bianca Brusco, Clare Clingain, Kaushik Mohan, & Frankie Wunschel" date: "April 10, 2018" output: pdf\_document

# Part 1: Frankie

# Create 1st grade variable

```
classroom <- classroom %>% mutate(Math1 = mathkind + mathgain)
```

### Random Intercepts for classroom, nested in schools UMM

```
model1 <- lmer(Math1~(1|schoolid/classid),data=classroom)</pre>
summary(model1)
## Linear mixed model fit by REML. t-tests use Satterthwaite's method [
## lmerModLmerTest]
## Formula: Math1 ~ (1 | schoolid/classid)
##
      Data: classroom
##
## REML criterion at convergence: 11944.6
##
## Scaled residuals:
##
       Min
                 1Q Median
                                   3Q
                                           Max
## -5.1872 -0.6174 -0.0204 0.5821 3.8339
##
## Random effects:
## Groups
                       Name
                                    Variance Std.Dev.
                                    85.46
## classid:schoolid (Intercept)
                                               9.244
                       (Intercept) 280.68 16.754
                                    1146.80 33.864
## Residual
## Number of obs: 1190, groups: classid:schoolid, 312; schoolid, 107
##
## Fixed effects:
##
                Estimate Std. Error
                                           df t value Pr(>|t|)
## (Intercept) 522.540
                               2.037 104.406 256.6 <2e-16 ***
## Signif. codes: 0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
                             ICC_{class} = \frac{85.46}{1146.8 + 280.68 + 85.46} \approx .056
                            ICC_{school} = \frac{280.68}{1146.8 + 280.68 + 85.46} \approx .186
                                Math1st_{ijk} = \beta_{0ijk} + \zeta_k + \eta_{jk} + \epsilon_{ijk}
```

 $\zeta_k \sim N(0, \sigma_\zeta^2), \eta_{jk} \sim N(0, \sigma_\eta^2), \text{ and } \epsilon_{ijk} \sim N(0, \sigma_\epsilon^2), \text{ all are independent of each other}$ 

#### Model with School Level Predictors Added

```
model2 <- lmer(Math1~housepov+(1|schoolid/classid),data=classroom)</pre>
summary(model2)
## Linear mixed model fit by REML. t-tests use Satterthwaite's method [
## lmerModLmerTest]
## Formula: Math1 ~ housepov + (1 | schoolid/classid)
##
     Data: classroom
## REML criterion at convergence: 11927.4
##
## Scaled residuals:
      Min 1Q Median
                            3Q
##
                                     Max
## -5.1142 -0.6011 -0.0350 0.5600 3.8154
## Random effects:
## Groups
                               Variance Std.Dev.
                   Name
## classid:schoolid (Intercept)
                                82.36 9.075
                  (Intercept) 250.93 15.841
## schoolid
## Residual
                                1146.95 33.867
## Number of obs: 1190, groups: classid:schoolid, 312; schoolid, 107
##
## Fixed effects:
              Estimate Std. Error
                                      df t value Pr(>|t|)
## (Intercept) 531.294 3.341 102.809 159.024 <2e-16 ***
## housepov
              -45.783 14.236 111.063 -3.216
## ---
## Signif. codes: 0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
## Correlation of Fixed Effects:
           (Intr)
## housepov -0.810
anova(model1, model2, refit = F)
## Data: classroom
## Models:
## model1: Math1 ~ (1 | schoolid/classid)
## model2: Math1 ~ housepov + (1 | schoolid/classid)
         Df AIC BIC logLik deviance Chisq Chi Df Pr(>Chisq)
## model1 4 11953 11973 -5972.3
                                  11945
## model2 5 11937 11963 -5963.7
                                  11927 17.186
                                                       3.39e-05 ***
## Signif. codes: 0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
```

Change in  $\sigma_{\zeta}^2$ : decreased to 250.93 from 280.63  $\sigma_{\eta}^2$  decreases to 82.36 from 85.46  $\sigma_{\epsilon}^2$  slightly increases to 1146.95 from 1146.8

The ANOVA/LRT has a pvalue of almost zero, 3.39e-05, thus we reject the  $H_0$  at our  $\alpha = 0.05$  and meaning that it makes sense to include the school level predictor, housepov.

#### Model with all Class Level Predictors Added

```
model3 <- lmer(Math1~housepov+mathknow+yearstea+mathprep+(1|schoolid/classid),data=classroom)
summary(model3)
## Linear mixed model fit by REML. t-tests use Satterthwaite's method [
## lmerModLmerTest]
## Formula:
## Math1 ~ housepov + mathknow + yearstea + mathprep + (1 | schoolid/classid)
     Data: classroom
##
## REML criterion at convergence: 10821
## Scaled residuals:
      Min
              1Q Median
##
                            30
## -3.5552 -0.6118 -0.0311 0.5863 3.8315
##
## Random effects:
                            Variance Std.Dev.
## Groups
                  Name
## classid:schoolid (Intercept)
                              94.36 9.714
## schoolid (Intercept) 223.31 14.943
                             1136.43 33.711
## Residual
## Number of obs: 1081, groups: classid:schoolid, 285; schoolid, 105
## Fixed effects:
                                     df t value Pr(>|t|)
             Estimate Std. Error
-41.62116 14.08835 109.83227 -2.954 0.00383 **
## housepov
## mathknow
              2.55143 1.44530 231.06566
                                         1.765 0.07883 .
## yearstea
             ## mathprep
             -0.75440 1.42809 203.20767 -0.528 0.59790
## ---
## Signif. codes: 0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
## Correlation of Fixed Effects:
          (Intr) houspv mthknw yearst
##
## housepov -0.568
## mathknow -0.052 0.082
## yearstea -0.264 0.077 0.030
## mathprep -0.666 0.032 0.004 -0.175
```

### creating reducted dataset taking away missing data

```
classroom_red = na.omit(classroom)
model2_red <- lmer(Math1~housepov+(1|schoolid/classid),data=classroom_red)
model3_red <- lmer(Math1~housepov+mathknow+yearstea+mathprep+(1|schoolid/classid),data=classroom_red)
anova(model2_red, model3_red, refit = F)

## Data: classroom_red
## Models:
## model2_red: Math1 ~ housepov + (1 | schoolid/classid)
## model3_red: Math1 ~ housepov + mathknow + yearstea + mathprep + (1 | schoolid/classid)
## Df AIC BIC logLik deviance Chisq Chi Df Pr(>Chisq)
```

```
## model2_red 5 10838 10862 -5413.8 10828 ## model3_red 8 10837 10877 -5410.5 10821 6.5771 3 0.08667 . ## --- ## Signif. codes: 0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1 Change in \sigma_{\epsilon}^2 and \sigma_{\eta}^2: \sigma_{\epsilon}^2 decreased to 1136.43, \sigma_{\eta}^2 increased to 94.36; \sigma_{\epsilon}^2 = 223.31
```

The reason epsilon was reduced but eta was not is because the new model explains what is happening at a student level, but not at a classroom level. In addition adding the classroom level predictors makes it so that more of the overall variation is explained by "structured" variation rather than by unstructured ( $\epsilon$ ) May increase because of sample decrease (missing data) –

The anova test comparing the school level predictor to the model with the classroom predictors has a p-value 0.087, so we fail to reject the null hypothesis at our  $\alpha = 0.05$  and thus though boarderline to significance, it still concludes that the models are not different so adding the classroom level predictors isn't necessary.

# Add all student-level predictors

##

```
model4 <- lmer(Math1~housepov+mathknow+yearstea+mathprep+sex+minority+ses+(1|schoolid/classid),data=cla
summary(model4)
## Linear mixed model fit by REML. t-tests use Satterthwaite's method [
## lmerModLmerTest]
## Formula:
## Math1 ~ housepov + mathknow + yearstea + mathprep + sex + minority +
##
       ses + (1 | schoolid/classid)
##
      Data: classroom
##
## REML criterion at convergence: 10729.5
##
## Scaled residuals:
##
       Min
                10 Median
                                       Max
   -3.8580 -0.6134 -0.0321 0.5971
##
##
## Random effects:
##
   Groups
                     Name
                                 Variance Std.Dev.
##
   classid:schoolid (Intercept)
                                   93.89
                                           9.69
                                  169.45
                                          13.02
   schoolid
                     (Intercept)
##
   Residual
                                 1064.95
                                          32.63
## Number of obs: 1081, groups:
                                 classid:schoolid, 285; schoolid, 105
##
## Fixed effects:
##
                 Estimate Std. Error
                                             df t value Pr(>|t|)
## (Intercept)
                539.63042
                            5.31210 275.38922 101.585
                                                         < 2e-16 ***
                                                 -1.335
## housepov
                -17.64847
                            13.21757 113.87774
                                                            0.184
## mathknow
                  1.35004
                             1.39168 234.49776
                                                  0.970
                                                            0.333
## yearstea
                  0.01129
                             0.14141
                                      226.80899
                                                  0.080
                                                            0.936
                             1.37583
                                     205.27157
                                                 -0.201
                                                            0.841
## mathprep
                 -0.27705
                 -1.21419
                             2.09483 1022.42136
                                                 -0.580
                                                            0.562
## sex
## minority
                -16.18678
                             3.02605
                                     704.47889
                                                 -5.349 1.20e-07 ***
## ses
                 10.05075
                             1.54484 1066.56223
                                                  6.506 1.18e-10 ***
## Signif. codes: 0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
```

```
## Correlation of Fixed Effects:

## (Intr) houspy mthknw yearst mthprp sex minrty

## housepov -0.451

## mathknow -0.083  0.058

## yearstea -0.259  0.071  0.029

## mathprep -0.631  0.038  0.004 -0.172

## sex  -0.190 -0.007  0.007  0.016 -0.006

## minority -0.320 -0.178  0.115  0.024  0.001 -0.011

## ses  -0.121  0.082 -0.007 -0.028  0.053  0.020  0.162
```

We test this new block compared to the model with just school level predictors as the classroom level predictors were not significant.

model4\_red <- lmer(Math1~housepov+mathknow+yearstea+mathprep+sex+minority+ses+(1|schoolid/classid),data
anova(model2\_red, model4\_red, refit = F)</pre>

```
## Data: classroom red
## Models:
## model2_red: Math1 ~ housepov + (1 | schoolid/classid)
## model4_red: Math1 ~ housepov + mathknow + yearstea + mathprep + sex + minority +
                  ses + (1 | schoolid/classid)
## model4_red:
##
                       BIC logLik deviance Chisq Chi Df Pr(>Chisq)
                  AIC
## model2_red 5 10838 10862 -5413.8
                                       10828
## model4_red 11 10752 10806 -5364.8
                                       10730 98.023
                                                         6 < 2.2e-16 ***
## ---
## Signif. codes: 0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
anova(model3, model4, refit = F)
```

 $\sigma_{\epsilon}^2$  decreased to 1064.95,  $\sigma_{\eta}^2$  decreased to 93.89,  $\sigma_{\zeta}^2$  decreased to 169.45

School level may drop because sstudents may be similar within schools but different between schools, or the fact that math know directly effects school level effects, better schools tend to have better teachers

```
math \\ \hat{1}st_{ijk} = \beta_{0ijk} + \zeta_k + \eta_{jk} + \epsilon_{ijk} + \beta_1 Housepov_k + \beta_2 Mathknow_{jk} + \beta_3 YearsTea_{jk} + \beta_4 Mathprep_{jk} + \beta_5 sex_{ijk} + \beta_6 minority_{ijk} + \beta_6
```

The anova test comparing the model with school and classroom level predictors to the model with almost all the predictors has a p-value that is approximately zero at < 2.2e-16, so we reject  $H_0$  and conclude that it makes sense to include student level predictors. Moreover, the Chi-Sq test comparing the model with just school level predictors to the model with almost all predictors has a p-value < 2.2e-16, so we conclude that the model with student level predictors (as a block) improves compared to the model with only school-level predictors both somewhat reiterating the other.

### Random Slope for Teacher-level predictor varying at school-level

```
rst.1 <-lmer(Math1~housepov+mathknow+yearstea+mathprep+sex+minority+ses+(1+mathknow||schoolid)+(1|class
summary(rst.1)
## Linear mixed model fit by REML. t-tests use Satterthwaite's method [
## lmerModLmerTest]
## Formula:
## Math1 ~ housepov + mathknow + yearstea + mathprep + sex + minority +
      ses + (1 + mathknow || schoolid) + (1 | classid)
##
     Data: classroom
## REML criterion at convergence: 10729.5
##
## Scaled residuals:
      Min 10 Median
                              30
                                     Max
## -3.8580 -0.6134 -0.0321 0.5971 3.6598
##
## Random effects:
                          Variance Std.Dev.
## Groups
              Name
## classid
             (Intercept) 9.389e+01 9.690e+00
## schoolid mathknow
                          4.260e-11 6.527e-06
## schoolid.1 (Intercept) 1.694e+02 1.302e+01
## Residual
                          1.065e+03 3.263e+01
## Number of obs: 1081, groups: classid, 285; schoolid, 105
##
## Fixed effects:
##
                Estimate Std. Error
                                           df t value Pr(>|t|)
## (Intercept) 539.63042 5.31210 275.38921 101.585 < 2e-16 ***
## housepov
            -17.64847 13.21757 113.87774 -1.335
                                                         0.184
## mathknow
                1.35004 1.39168 234.49776
                                              0.970
                                                         0.333
                0.01129 0.14141 226.80899 0.080
## yearstea
                                                         0.936
                -0.27705 1.37583 205.27156 -0.201
## mathprep
                                                         0.841
## sex
                -1.21419 2.09483 1022.42136 -0.580
                                                         0.562
## minority
              -16.18678
                           3.02605 704.47889 -5.349 1.20e-07 ***
                10.05075    1.54484 1066.56223    6.506 1.18e-10 ***
## ses
## ---
## Signif. codes: 0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
## Correlation of Fixed Effects:
           (Intr) houspv mthknw yearst mthprp sex
                                                    minrty
## housepov -0.451
## mathknow -0.083 0.058
## yearstea -0.259 0.071 0.029
## mathprep -0.631 0.038 0.004 -0.172
         -0.190 -0.007 0.007 0.016 -0.006
## minority -0.320 -0.178  0.115  0.024  0.001 -0.011
           -0.121 0.082 -0.007 -0.028 0.053 0.020 0.162
ranova(rst.1,refit=F)
## ANOVA-like table for random-effects: Single term deletions
##
## Model:
```

```
## Math1 ~ housepov + mathknow + yearstea + mathprep + sex + minority +
##
      ses + (1 | schoolid) + (0 + mathknow | schoolid) + (1 | classid)
                                        npar logLik
##
                                                       AIC
## <none>
                                           12 -5364.8 10754
## (1 | schoolid)
                                           11 -5376.5 10775 23.410 1
## mathknow in (0 + mathknow | schoolid)
                                          11 -5364.8 10752 0.000 1
## (1 | classid)
                                          11 -5368.1 10758 6.741 1
##
                                         Pr(>Chisq)
## <none>
## (1 | schoolid)
                                          1.309e-06 ***
## mathknow in (0 + mathknow | schoolid)
                                          0.999999
## (1 | classid)
                                           0.009422 **
## ---
## Signif. codes: 0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
There is not a need for the random slope for math knowledge at a school level as the p value is not significant
rst.2 <-lmer(Math1~housepov+mathknow+yearstea+mathprep+sex+minority+ses+(1+yearstea||schoolid)+(1|class
summary(rst.2)
## Linear mixed model fit by REML. t-tests use Satterthwaite's method [
## lmerModLmerTest]
## Formula:
## Math1 ~ housepov + mathknow + yearstea + mathprep + sex + minority +
      ses + (1 + yearstea || schoolid) + (1 | classid)
##
      Data: classroom
##
##
## REML criterion at convergence: 10729.5
## Scaled residuals:
##
               1Q Median
                                3Q
      Min
                                       Max
## -3.8485 -0.6149 -0.0323 0.5980 3.6600
##
## Random effects:
## Groups
                           Variance Std.Dev.
               (Intercept) 9.266e+01 9.62593
## classid
## schoolid
              yearstea
                           9.669e-03 0.09833
## schoolid.1 (Intercept) 1.685e+02 12.97894
## Residual
                           1.065e+03 32.63452
## Number of obs: 1081, groups: classid, 285; schoolid, 105
##
## Fixed effects:
                Estimate Std. Error
                                             df t value Pr(>|t|)
                           5.30865 266.34157 101.645 < 2e-16 ***
## (Intercept) 539.60060
                          13.21854 113.56407
## housepov
                                                -1.340
               -17.71727
                                                          0.183
## mathknow
                 1.33198
                          1.39177 234.33551
                                                0.957
                                                          0.340
## yearstea
                 0.01124
                            0.14193 122.38000
                                                 0.079
                                                          0.937
                            1.37610 204.91605
## mathprep
                -0.26633
                                                -0.194
                                                          0.847
## sex
                -1.21077
                            2.09476 1022.22247
                                                -0.578
                                                          0.563
               -16.16833
                            3.02641 702.64837 -5.342 1.24e-07 ***
## minority
## ses
                10.04529
                            1.54490 1066.09768
                                                6.502 1.21e-10 ***
## ---
## Signif. codes: 0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
##
```

```
## Correlation of Fixed Effects:
##
            (Intr) houspv mthknw yearst mthprp sex
                                                   minrty
## housepov -0.450
## mathknow -0.082
                   0.057
## yearstea -0.258 0.070 0.028
## mathprep -0.632 0.037 0.003 -0.172
          -0.190 -0.007 0.006 0.015 -0.006
## minority -0.320 -0.179 0.115 0.023 0.001 -0.010
           -0.121 0.082 -0.007 -0.027 0.053 0.020 0.162
ranova(rst.2, refit=F)
## ANOVA-like table for random-effects: Single term deletions
## Model:
## Math1 ~ housepov + mathknow + yearstea + mathprep + sex + minority +
       ses + (1 | schoolid) + (0 + yearstea | schoolid) + (1 | classid)
                                         npar logLik
                                                       AIC
## <none>
                                           12 -5364.8 10754
## (1 | schoolid)
                                           11 -5374.7 10771 19.8301 1
## yearstea in (0 + yearstea | schoolid)
                                          11 -5364.8 10752 0.0070 1
## (1 | classid)
                                           11 -5367.7 10757 5.9158 1
##
                                         Pr(>Chisq)
## <none>
## (1 | schoolid)
                                          8.464e-06 ***
## yearstea in (0 + yearstea | schoolid)
                                            0.93342
## (1 | classid)
                                            0.01501 *
## ---
## Signif. codes: 0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
There seems to be no need for for the random slope for years teaching at a school level as the p value is
insignificant at .933
rst.3 <-lmer(Math1~housepov+mathknow+yearstea+mathprep+sex+minority+ses+(1+mathprep||schoolid)+(1|class
summary(rst.3)
## Linear mixed model fit by REML. t-tests use Satterthwaite's method [
## lmerModLmerTest]
## Formula:
## Math1 ~ housepov + mathknow + yearstea + mathprep + sex + minority +
       ses + (1 + mathprep || schoolid) + (1 | classid)
##
##
      Data: classroom
##
## REML criterion at convergence: 10729.5
## Scaled residuals:
              1Q Median
## -3.8580 -0.6134 -0.0321 0.5971 3.6598
## Random effects:
## Groups
                           Variance Std.Dev.
              Name
## classid
               (Intercept)
                            93.89
                                     9.69
## schoolid
              mathprep
                              0.00
                                     0.00
## schoolid.1 (Intercept) 169.45 13.02
## Residual
                           1064.95 32.63
```

## Number of obs: 1081, groups: classid, 285; schoolid, 105

```
## Fixed effects:
##
                Estimate Std. Error
                                            df t value Pr(>|t|)
## (Intercept) 539.63042 5.31210 275.38917 101.585
                                                       < 2e-16 ***
## housepov
               -17.64847
                          13.21758 113.87771
                                               -1.335
                                                          0.184
## mathknow
                                                 0.970
                                                          0.333
                 1.35004
                          1.39168 234.49776
                            0.14141 226.80899
                                                 0.080
                                                          0.936
## yearstea
                 0.01129
## mathprep
                -0.27705
                            1.37583 205.27157
                                                -0.201
                                                          0.841
## sex
                -1.21419
                            2.09483 1022.42137
                                                -0.580
                                                          0.562
## minority
               -16.18678
                            3.02605 704.47892
                                               -5.349 1.20e-07 ***
                                                 6.506 1.18e-10 ***
## ses
                10.05075
                            1.54484 1066.56223
## ---
## Signif. codes: 0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
##
## Correlation of Fixed Effects:
##
            (Intr) houspv mthknw yearst mthprp sex
                                                     minrty
## housepov -0.451
## mathknow -0.083
                   0.058
## yearstea -0.259 0.071
                          0.029
## mathprep -0.631 0.038 0.004 -0.172
## sex
           -0.190 -0.007 0.007 0.016 -0.006
## minority -0.320 -0.178  0.115  0.024  0.001 -0.011
           -0.121 0.082 -0.007 -0.028 0.053 0.020 0.162
## ses
ranova(rst.3, refit=F)
## ANOVA-like table for random-effects: Single term deletions
##
## Model:
## Math1 ~ housepov + mathknow + yearstea + mathprep + sex + minority +
      ses + (1 | schoolid) + (0 + mathprep | schoolid) + (1 | classid)
##
                                        npar logLik
                                                       AIC
## <none>
                                          12 -5364.8 10754
## (1 | schoolid)
                                          11 -5371.6 10765 13.6179 1
## mathprep in (0 + mathprep | schoolid)
                                          11 -5364.8 10752 0.0000 1
                                          11 -5368.3 10759 7.1357 1
## (1 | classid)
##
                                        Pr(>Chisq)
## <none>
## (1 | schoolid)
                                          0.000224 ***
## mathprep in (0 + mathprep | schoolid)
                                          1.000000
## (1 | classid)
                                          0.007556 **
## ---
## Signif. codes: 0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
```

There seems to be no need for for the random slope for math prep at a school level as the p value is insignificant at 1.00

Question: Why housepov bad idea?

##

**Answer:** There is only one data point per school, so we cannot have a random slope since we can't even calculate a slope.

# Allowing correlations with random intercepts

### ONE BY ONE

```
rstc.1 <-lmer(Math1~housepov+mathknow+yearstea+mathprep+sex+minority+ses+(1+mathknow|schoolid)+(1|class
summary(rstc.1)
## Linear mixed model fit by REML. t-tests use Satterthwaite's method [
## lmerModLmerTest]
## Formula:
## Math1 ~ housepov + mathknow + yearstea + mathprep + sex + minority +
      ses + (1 + mathknow | schoolid) + (1 | classid)
##
     Data: classroom
##
## REML criterion at convergence: 10729.5
## Scaled residuals:
      Min
             1Q Median
                            3Q
## -3.8581 -0.6131 -0.0324 0.5969 3.6603
## Random effects:
                      Variance Std.Dev. Corr
## Groups
          Name
## classid (Intercept) 9.394e+01 9.69205
## schoolid (Intercept) 1.693e+02 13.01223
           mathknow 8.596e-04 0.02932 1.00
##
                      1.065e+03 32.63393
## Residual
## Number of obs: 1081, groups: classid, 285; schoolid, 105
##
## Fixed effects:
##
               Estimate Std. Error
                                         df t value Pr(>|t|)
## (Intercept) 539.64037 5.31212 275.37948 101.587 < 2e-16 ***
## housepov -17.64148 13.21274 103.97679 -1.335
                                                     0.185
               1.35459 1.39203 214.63820
                                            0.973
## mathknow
                                                   0.332
## yearstea
              0.01114 0.14141 226.85277 0.079 0.937
## mathprep
             -0.27753 1.37601 201.27912 -0.202 0.840
               -1.21329 2.09485 1021.79964 -0.579
                                                   0.563
## sex
              -16.19376 3.02609 703.81038 -5.351 1.18e-07 ***
## minority
               ## ses
## Signif. codes: 0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
## Correlation of Fixed Effects:
           (Intr) houspv mthknw yearst mthprp sex
                                               minrty
## housepov -0.451
## mathknow -0.082 0.057
## yearstea -0.259 0.071 0.029
## mathprep -0.631 0.038 0.004 -0.173
          -0.190 -0.007 0.007 0.016 -0.006
## minority -0.320 -0.178  0.115  0.024  0.001 -0.011
          -0.121 0.082 -0.007 -0.028 0.053 0.020 0.162
ranova(rstc.1, refit=F)
```

## ANOVA-like table for random-effects: Single term deletions

```
##
## Model:
## Math1 ~ housepov + mathknow + yearstea + mathprep + sex + minority +
      ses + (1 + mathknow | schoolid) + (1 | classid)
                                        npar logLik
                                                       AIC
                                                              LRT Df
## <none>
                                          13 -5364.8 10756
## mathknow in (1 + mathknow | schoolid)
                                         11 -5364.8 10752 0.0003 2
## (1 | classid)
                                          12 -5368.1 10760 6.6768 1
##
                                        Pr(>Chisq)
## <none>
## mathknow in (1 + mathknow | schoolid)
                                          0.999840
                                          0.009767 **
## (1 | classid)
## Signif. codes: 0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
```

The correlated math knowledge is insignificant and seems to add no value to the model.

### yearstea

```
rstc.2 <-lmer(Math1~housepov+mathknow+yearstea+mathprep+sex+minority+ses+(1+yearstea|schoolid)+(1|class
summary(rstc.2)
## Linear mixed model fit by REML. t-tests use Satterthwaite's method [
## lmerModLmerTest]
## Formula:
## Math1 ~ housepov + mathknow + yearstea + mathprep + sex + minority +
##
      ses + (1 + yearstea | schoolid) + (1 | classid)
##
     Data: classroom
##
## REML criterion at convergence: 10723.7
## Scaled residuals:
##
      Min
           1Q Median
                             3Q
                                    Max
## -3.7462 -0.6036 -0.0290 0.6041 3.8449
##
## Random effects:
## Groups Name
                       Variance Std.Dev. Corr
## classid (Intercept)
                        37.9283 6.1586
   schoolid (Intercept) 366.1148 19.1341
##
##
           yearstea
                         0.5523 0.7432
                                        -0.78
                       1066.4510 32.6566
## Residual
## Number of obs: 1081, groups: classid, 285; schoolid, 105
##
## Fixed effects:
               Estimate Std. Error
                                         df t value Pr(>|t|)
## (Intercept) 538.95245 5.48825 222.69673 98.201 < 2e-16 ***
## housepov
              -17.13994 13.45959 119.63687 -1.273
                                                      0.205
## mathknow
               1.04635 1.34381 209.72527 0.779
                                                    0.437
                                  75.76696 0.140
## yearstea
                0.02204 0.15766
                                                      0.889
                          1.34549 190.82671
## mathprep
               0.05046
                                            0.038
                                                      0.970
                          2.08774 1024.45936 -0.640
## sex
               -1.33553
                                                      0.523
## minority
             -16.44555
                          2.99655 669.50401 -5.488 5.77e-08 ***
              ## ses
```

```
## ---
## Signif. codes: 0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
## Correlation of Fixed Effects:
           (Intr) houspv mthknw yearst mthprp sex
                                                     minrty
## housepov -0.455
## mathknow -0.085 0.049
## yearstea -0.370 0.084 0.012
## mathprep -0.606 0.050 0.014 -0.139
           -0.184 -0.004 0.008 0.009 -0.004
## minority -0.305 -0.169 0.122 0.032 -0.007 -0.012
           -0.119 0.079 -0.001 -0.019 0.049 0.022 0.168
## ses
ranova(rstc.2,refit=F)
## ANOVA-like table for random-effects: Single term deletions
##
## Model:
## Math1 ~ housepov + mathknow + yearstea + mathprep + sex + minority +
##
      ses + (1 + yearstea | schoolid) + (1 | classid)
##
                                        npar logLik
                                                       AIC
                                                              I.R.T Df
                                          13 -5361.8 10750
## <none>
## yearstea in (1 + yearstea | schoolid)
                                          11 -5364.8 10752 5.8254 2
## (1 | classid)
                                          12 -5362.3 10749 0.9028 1
##
                                        Pr(>Chisq)
## <none>
## yearstea in (1 + yearstea | schoolid)
                                           0.05433 .
## (1 | classid)
                                           0.34202
## ---
## Signif. codes: 0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
```

This correlated random slope for years teaching is right on the cusp of signicance and should be observed further in attempts to understand its need for adding it to the model it has a p value of .0543.

# mathprep

## Random effects:

```
rstc.3 <-lmer(Math1~housepov+mathknow+yearstea+mathprep+sex+minority+ses+(1+mathprep|schoolid)+(1|class
summary(rstc.3)
## Linear mixed model fit by REML. t-tests use Satterthwaite's method [
## lmerModLmerTest]
## Formula:
## Math1 ~ housepov + mathknow + yearstea + mathprep + sex + minority +
       ses + (1 + mathprep | schoolid) + (1 | classid)
##
      Data: classroom
##
## REML criterion at convergence: 10724.7
##
## Scaled residuals:
      Min
                1Q Median
                                3Q
## -3.8542 -0.6034 -0.0221 0.5915 3.6475
```

```
Groups
                        Variance Std.Dev. Corr
            Name
                                  8.858
##
   classid (Intercept)
                          78.46
##
   schoolid (Intercept)
                         552.76
                                23.511
##
                                  3.986
            mathprep
                          15.89
                                          -1.00
##
   Residual
                         1064.26 32.623
## Number of obs: 1081, groups: classid, 285; schoolid, 105
## Fixed effects:
##
                Estimate Std. Error
                                             df t value Pr(>|t|)
## (Intercept)
               538.60855
                           5.60813 159.88774
                                                96.041
                                                        < 2e-16 ***
## housepov
               -14.01306
                          12.88689 116.05900
                                                -1.087
                                                          0.279
## mathknow
                 1.29884
                            1.37194 229.68146
                                                 0.947
                                                          0.345
## yearstea
                -0.02586
                            0.13949 223.50098
                                                -0.185
                                                          0.853
## mathprep
                 0.04074
                            1.34845 139.04228
                                                 0.030
                                                          0.976
                            2.08697 1023.15084
                                                -0.559
                                                          0.576
## sex
                -1.16759
## minority
                -16.46422
                            2.99524 663.67316
                                                -5.497 5.52e-08 ***
                                                 6.587 7.04e-11 ***
## ses
                10.14166
                            1.53961 1060.93421
## ---
## Signif. codes: 0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
## Correlation of Fixed Effects:
            (Intr) houspv mthknw yearst mthprp sex
## housepov -0.461
## mathknow -0.071 0.027
## yearstea -0.260 0.089
                          0.049
## mathprep -0.692 0.107
                          0.012 -0.155
            -0.183 0.003 0.002 0.023 -0.008
## minority -0.275 -0.187 0.107 0.025 -0.035 -0.013
           -0.121 0.095 -0.001 -0.033 0.061 0.024 0.161
ranova(rstc.3, refit=F)
## ANOVA-like table for random-effects: Single term deletions
##
## Model:
## Math1 ~ housepov + mathknow + yearstea + mathprep + sex + minority +
       ses + (1 + mathprep | schoolid) + (1 | classid)
##
##
                                         npar logLik
                                                       AIC
                                                              LRT Df
                                           13 -5362.3 10751
## <none>
## mathprep in (1 + mathprep | schoolid)
                                           11 -5364.8 10752 4.8144 2
## (1 | classid)
                                           12 -5364.9 10754 5.0971 1
##
                                         Pr(>Chisq)
## <none>
## mathprep in (1 + mathprep | schoolid)
                                           0.09007 .
## (1 | classid)
                                            0.02397 *
## Signif. codes: 0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
```

The correlated math prep is just a bit to high with a pvalue of .09, thus it is insignificant and seems to add no value to the model.

Question: Anything unusual about the variances? Why might this have occurred? (hint: what did you add to the model?)

**Answer:** The random slope for mathknow greatly increases in the second model, which is probably due to its correlation with the random intercept at the school-level.

There seems to be an issue with the model as the slope and intercept correlation is negative one, this could be due to the sample sizes of the classrooms as some only have a single observation.

## Random slopes for student-level predictors varying at classroom level

### ONE BY ONE

#### sex

```
rss.1 <-lmer(Math1~housepov+mathknow+yearstea+mathprep+sex+minority+ses+(1+sex||classid)+(1|schoolid),d
summary(rss.1)
## Linear mixed model fit by REML. t-tests use Satterthwaite's method [
## lmerModLmerTest]
## Formula:
## Math1 ~ housepov + mathknow + yearstea + mathprep + sex + minority +
      ses + (1 + sex || classid) + (1 | schoolid)
     Data: classroom
##
##
## REML criterion at convergence: 10729.5
## Scaled residuals:
##
      Min
               1Q Median
                               3Q
                                      Max
## -3.8580 -0.6134 -0.0321 0.5971 3.6598
## Random effects:
## Groups
             Name
                         Variance Std.Dev.
## classid (Intercept)
                           93.89
                                 9.69
## classid.1 sex
                            0.00
                                   0.00
## schoolid (Intercept) 169.45 13.02
## Residual
                         1064.95 32.63
## Number of obs: 1081, groups: classid, 285; schoolid, 105
##
## Fixed effects:
##
                Estimate Std. Error
                                           df t value Pr(>|t|)
## (Intercept) 539.63042 5.31210 275.38920 101.585 < 2e-16 ***
               -17.64847 13.21757 113.87773 -1.335
## housepov
                                                         0.184
## mathknow
                1.35004
                          1.39168 234.49776
                                                0.970
                                                         0.333
                                                0.080
                                                         0.936
## yearstea
                 0.01129
                            0.14141 226.80899
                -0.27705
                           1.37583 205.27157
                                               -0.201
## mathprep
                                                         0.841
                -1.21419
                                               -0.580
                            2.09483 1022.42137
                                                         0.562
## sex
               -16.18678
                            3.02605 704.47890 -5.349 1.20e-07 ***
## minority
## ses
                10.05075    1.54484    1066.56223    6.506    1.18e-10 ***
## Signif. codes: 0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
## Correlation of Fixed Effects:
           (Intr) houspv mthknw yearst mthprp sex
                                                    minrty
## housepov -0.451
## mathknow -0.083 0.058
## yearstea -0.259 0.071 0.029
```

```
## mathprep -0.631 0.038 0.004 -0.172
          -0.190 -0.007 0.007 0.016 -0.006
## minority -0.320 -0.178  0.115  0.024  0.001 -0.011
          -0.121 0.082 -0.007 -0.028 0.053 0.020 0.162
ranova(rss.1, refit=F)
## ANOVA-like table for random-effects: Single term deletions
##
## Model:
## Math1 ~ housepov + mathknow + yearstea + mathprep + sex + minority +
      ses + (1 | classid) + (0 + sex | classid) + (1 | schoolid)
##
                             npar logLik
                                            AIC
                                                    LRT Df Pr(>Chisq)
## <none>
                               12 -5364.8 10754
## (1 | classid)
                               11 -5368.0 10758 6.4894 1
                                                              0.01085 *
## sex in (0 + sex | classid) 11 -5364.8 10752 0.0000 1
                                                              1.00000
## (1 | schoolid)
                               11 -5377.1 10776 24.7881 1 6.399e-07 ***
## Signif. codes: 0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
Sex random slope with class is insignificant with a p value of 1
```

# minority

```
rss.2 <-lmer(Math1~housepov+mathknow+yearstea+mathprep+sex+minority+ses+(1+minority||classid)+(1|school
summary(rss.2)
## Linear mixed model fit by REML. t-tests use Satterthwaite's method [
## lmerModLmerTest]
## Formula:
## Math1 ~ housepov + mathknow + yearstea + mathprep + sex + minority +
      ses + (1 + minority || classid) + (1 | schoolid)
##
     Data: classroom
##
## REML criterion at convergence: 10729.5
##
## Scaled residuals:
              1Q Median
                               3Q
## -3.8580 -0.6134 -0.0321 0.5971 3.6598
##
## Random effects:
## Groups
             Name
                         Variance Std.Dev.
                                   9.69
## classid
             (Intercept)
                           93.89
## classid.1 minority
                            0.00
                                   0.00
## schoolid (Intercept) 169.45 13.02
                         1064.95 32.63
## Residual
## Number of obs: 1081, groups: classid, 285; schoolid, 105
## Fixed effects:
                Estimate Std. Error
                                            df t value Pr(>|t|)
## (Intercept) 539.63042 5.31210 275.38919 101.585 < 2e-16 ***
## housepov
               -17.64847 13.21758 113.87772 -1.335
                                                          0.184
                          1.39168 234.49776
## mathknow
                 1.35004
                                                0.970
                                                          0.333
```

```
0.01129 0.14141 226.80899 0.080
## yearstea
                                                         0.936
                -0.27705 1.37583 205.27157 -0.201
## mathprep
                                                         0.841
                -1.21419 2.09483 1022.42137 -0.580
                                                         0.562
## sex
## minority
                           3.02605 704.47891 -5.349 1.20e-07 ***
               -16.18678
## ses
                10.05075
                         1.54484 1066.56223 6.506 1.18e-10 ***
## ---
## Signif. codes: 0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
## Correlation of Fixed Effects:
           (Intr) houspv mthknw yearst mthprp sex
##
## housepov -0.451
## mathknow -0.083 0.058
## yearstea -0.259 0.071 0.029
## mathprep -0.631 0.038 0.004 -0.172
           -0.190 -0.007 0.007 0.016 -0.006
## minority -0.320 -0.178  0.115  0.024  0.001 -0.011
           -0.121 0.082 -0.007 -0.028 0.053 0.020 0.162
## ses
ranova(rss.1, refit=F)
## ANOVA-like table for random-effects: Single term deletions
##
## Model:
## Math1 ~ housepov + mathknow + yearstea + mathprep + sex + minority +
      ses + (1 | classid) + (0 + sex | classid) + (1 | schoolid)
##
                            npar logLik AIC
                                                  LRT Df Pr(>Chisq)
## <none>
                              12 -5364.8 10754
## (1 | classid)
                              11 -5368.0 10758 6.4894 1
                                                             0.01085 *
## sex in (0 + sex | classid) 11 -5364.8 10752 0.0000 1
## (1 | schoolid)
                              11 -5377.1 10776 24.7881 1 6.399e-07 ***
## ---
## Signif. codes: 0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
Sex random slope with class id is insignificant with a p value of 1.0.
```

## SES

##

```
rss.3 <-lmer(Math1~housepov+mathknow+yearstea+mathprep+sex+minority+ses+(1+ses||classid)+(1|schoolid),d
summary(rss.3)
## Linear mixed model fit by REML. t-tests use Satterthwaite's method [
## lmerModLmerTest]
## Formula:
## Math1 ~ housepov + mathknow + yearstea + mathprep + sex + minority +
##
       ses + (1 + ses || classid) + (1 | schoolid)
      Data: classroom
##
##
## REML criterion at convergence: 10727.9
##
## Scaled residuals:
##
      Min
               1Q Median
                                3Q
                                       Max
## -3.7163 -0.6032 -0.0331 0.5855 3.6840
```

```
Variance Std.Dev.
##
  Groups
             Name
  classid
              (Intercept)
                            87.11
                                   9.333
                            49.60
                                   7.043
## classid.1 ses
##
   schoolid (Intercept) 171.02 13.077
                          1043.44 32.302
## Residual
## Number of obs: 1081, groups: classid, 285; schoolid, 105
##
## Fixed effects:
##
                Estimate Std. Error
                                             df t value Pr(>|t|)
## (Intercept)
               539.71226
                            5.30641 274.46487 101.710
                                                        < 2e-16 ***
## housepov
               -17.50879
                           13.21775 113.44869
                                                -1.325
                                                           0.188
## mathknow
                 1.36796
                            1.38563 229.40646
                                                  0.987
                                                           0.325
                                                  0.078
## yearstea
                 0.01103
                            0.14117 226.97687
                                                           0.938
                -0.27938
                            1.37171 204.89340
                                                -0.204
                                                           0.839
## mathprep
## sex
                -1.37733
                            2.09334 1022.81818
                                                 -0.658
                                                           0.511
               -16.29362
                            3.02464 703.33762
                                                -5.387 9.78e-08 ***
## minority
## ses
                10.14363
                            1.64248 176.39739
                                                  6.176 4.41e-09 ***
## ---
## Signif. codes: 0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
##
## Correlation of Fixed Effects:
            (Intr) houspv mthknw yearst mthprp sex
##
                                                     minrty
## housepov -0.451
## mathknow -0.082
                   0.058
## yearstea -0.259 0.070
                          0.029
## mathprep -0.631 0.040
                          0.005 - 0.172
                          0.006 0.014 -0.005
            -0.190 -0.007
## minority -0.321 -0.180 0.111 0.025 0.002 -0.011
            -0.108 0.081 0.002 -0.026 0.050 0.020 0.145
ranova(rss.3, refit=F)
## ANOVA-like table for random-effects: Single term deletions
##
## Model:
## Math1 ~ housepov + mathknow + yearstea + mathprep + sex + minority +
       ses + (1 | classid) + (0 + ses | classid) + (1 | schoolid)
##
##
                             npar logLik
                                                    LRT Df Pr(>Chisq)
                                            AIC
## <none>
                                12 -5364.0 10752
## (1 | classid)
                                11 -5366.9 10756 5.9221 1
                                                               0.01495 *
## ses in (0 + ses | classid)
                               11 -5364.8 10752 1.5969
                                                               0.20634
                               11 -5376.6 10775 25.2710 1 4.982e-07 ***
## (1 | schoolid)
## Signif. codes: 0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
With a p-value of .206 ses is insignificant from an uncorrelated random slope at classroom level.
```

## Random effects:

Question: why is this a bad idea to include a classroom-level variable with random slopes at classroom-level?

Answer: It may not explain much variance due to the fact that it seems somewhat redundant.

# Allowing for correlations with random intercepts

### ONE BY ONE

#### sex

```
rssc.1 <-lmer(Math1~housepov+mathknow+yearstea+mathprep+sex+minority+ses+(1+sex|classid)+(1|schoolid),d
summary(rssc.1)
## Linear mixed model fit by REML. t-tests use Satterthwaite's method [
## lmerModLmerTest]
## Formula:
## Math1 ~ housepov + mathknow + yearstea + mathprep + sex + minority +
##
      ses + (1 + sex | classid) + (1 | schoolid)
##
     Data: classroom
##
## REML criterion at convergence: 10729
## Scaled residuals:
##
      Min 1Q Median
                             3Q
                                   Max
## -3.7565 -0.6134 -0.0307 0.5916 3.7116
##
## Random effects:
## Groups Name
                      Variance Std.Dev. Corr
## classid (Intercept) 130.07 11.41
                        31.36 5.60
                                       -0.67
           sex
## schoolid (Intercept) 169.85 13.03
## Residual
                      1056.41 32.50
## Number of obs: 1081, groups: classid, 285; schoolid, 105
##
## Fixed effects:
               Estimate Std. Error
                                         df t value Pr(>|t|)
## (Intercept) 5.400e+02 5.332e+00 2.723e+02 101.285 < 2e-16 ***
## housepov -1.829e+01 1.323e+01 1.145e+02 -1.382
                                                    0.170
## mathknow 1.306e+00 1.391e+00 2.315e+02 0.939
                                                      0.349
## yearstea 3.087e-03 1.416e-01 2.270e+02 0.022
                                                      0.983
## mathprep
           -3.459e-01 1.374e+00 2.014e+02 -0.252
                                                      0.801
             -1.197e+00 2.122e+00 2.160e+02 -0.564
## sex
                                                     0.573
           -1.619e+01 3.028e+00 7.042e+02 -5.347 1.21e-07 ***
## minority
             1.010e+01 1.544e+00 1.065e+03 6.539 9.62e-11 ***
## ses
## ---
## Signif. codes: 0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
## Correlation of Fixed Effects:
           (Intr) houspv mthknw yearst mthprp sex
## housepov -0.452
## mathknow -0.085 0.060
## yearstea -0.258 0.072 0.029
## mathprep -0.628 0.040 0.005 -0.174
          -0.203 -0.005 0.003 0.015 -0.008
## minority -0.321 -0.178  0.116  0.024  0.003 -0.009
        ## ses
```

```
ranova(rssc.1, refit=F)
## ANOVA-like table for random-effects: Single term deletions
## Model:
## Math1 ~ housepov + mathknow + yearstea + mathprep + sex + minority +
       ses + (1 + sex | classid) + (1 | schoolid)
##
                              npar logLik
                                                     LRT Df Pr(>Chisq)
                                             AIC
## <none>
                                13 -5364.5 10755
## sex in (1 + sex | classid)
                                11 -5364.8 10752 0.5003 2
## (1 | schoolid)
                                12 -5377.0 10778 24.8912 1 6.066e-07 ***
## ---
## Signif. codes: 0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
The uncorrelated random slope is insignificant with a p value of .779.
```

# minority

```
rssc.2 <-lmer(Math1~housepov+mathknow+yearstea+mathprep+sex+minority+ses+(1+minority|classid)+(1|school
summary(rssc.2)
## Linear mixed model fit by REML. t-tests use Satterthwaite's method [
## lmerModLmerTest]
## Formula:
## Math1 ~ housepov + mathknow + yearstea + mathprep + sex + minority +
      ses + (1 + minority | classid) + (1 | schoolid)
     Data: classroom
##
## REML criterion at convergence: 10726.3
## Scaled residuals:
      Min
               1Q Median
                               30
                                     Max
## -3.9037 -0.6221 -0.0295 0.6033 3.4574
##
## Random effects:
## Groups
            Name
                        Variance Std.Dev. Corr
## classid (Intercept) 225.4 15.01
                                13.09
                         171.3
                                         -0.82
            minority
## schoolid (Intercept) 157.4
                                12.55
## Residual
                        1045.3
                                32.33
## Number of obs: 1081, groups: classid, 285; schoolid, 105
##
## Fixed effects:
                Estimate Std. Error
                                           df t value Pr(>|t|)
## (Intercept) 539.73594 5.38023 270.70509 100.318 < 2e-16 ***
## housepov
               -17.34698 12.91268 103.34670 -1.343
                                                         0.182
## mathknow
                1.45702
                         1.39355 234.04713
                                               1.046
                                                         0.297
                          0.14285 234.25121 -0.115
## yearstea
                -0.01636
                                                         0.909
## mathprep
                -0.13520
                          1.37018 203.97000 -0.099
                                                         0.921
## sex
                -1.01012 2.08966 1015.73461 -0.483
                                                         0.629
## minority
               -16.48614
                            3.21756 183.20472 -5.124 7.55e-07 ***
                         1.54595 1062.82882 6.400 2.33e-10 ***
## ses
                 9.89350
```

```
## ---
## Signif. codes: 0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
## Correlation of Fixed Effects:
           (Intr) houspv mthknw yearst mthprp sex
                                                  minrty
## housepov -0.435
## mathknow -0.079 0.061
## yearstea -0.265 0.080 0.038
## mathprep -0.618 0.037 -0.006 -0.171
           -0.188 -0.009 0.009 0.015 -0.005
## minority -0.368 -0.171 0.108 0.025 -0.004 -0.009
           ## ses
ranova(rssc.2)
## ANOVA-like table for random-effects: Single term deletions
##
## Math1 ~ housepov + mathknow + yearstea + mathprep + sex + minority +
      ses + (1 + minority | classid) + (1 | schoolid)
##
                                     npar logLik
                                                   AIC
                                                          LRT Df
                                       13 -5363.2 10752
## <none>
                                       11 -5364.8 10752 3.1967
## minority in (1 + minority | classid)
## (1 | schoolid)
                                       12 -5373.2 10770 20.1422 1
##
                                     Pr(>Chisq)
## <none>
## minority in (1 + minority | classid)
                                         0.2022
## (1 | schoolid)
                                      7.189e-06 ***
## ---
## Signif. codes: 0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
```

#### SES

```
rssc.3 <-lmer(Math1~housepov+mathknow+yearstea+mathprep+sex+minority+ses+(1+ses|classid)+(1|schoolid),d
summary(rssc.3)
## Linear mixed model fit by REML. t-tests use Satterthwaite's method [
## lmerModLmerTest]
## Formula:
## Math1 ~ housepov + mathknow + yearstea + mathprep + sex + minority +
##
       ses + (1 + ses | classid) + (1 | schoolid)
##
      Data: classroom
## REML criterion at convergence: 10725.7
##
## Scaled residuals:
                1Q Median
                                3Q
      Min
                                       Max
## -3.5688 -0.6004 -0.0316 0.5959 3.6176
##
## Random effects:
## Groups Name
                        Variance Std.Dev. Corr
```

The uncorrelated random slope for minority is insignificant with a p value of .202.

```
classid (Intercept)
                          86.06
                                  9.277
##
            ses
                          44.09
                                6.640
                                          0.75
##
  schoolid (Intercept)
                        173.16 13.159
## Residual
                        1048.32 32.378
## Number of obs: 1081, groups: classid, 285; schoolid, 105
##
## Fixed effects:
                Estimate Std. Error
##
                                            df t value Pr(>|t|)
## (Intercept) 539.52093 5.26665 269.59234 102.441 < 2e-16 ***
## housepov
               -16.28994 13.13445 111.28619 -1.240
                                                         0.217
## mathknow
                1.37996
                          1.37294 222.43201
                                                1.005
                                                          0.316
                            0.14080 227.59545
## yearstea
                 0.01605
                                                 0.114
                                                         0.909
                            1.34603 182.84309
                                               -0.280
## mathprep
                -0.37734
                                                         0.780
                            2.08794 1017.08508
                                               -0.633
                                                          0.527
## sex
                -1.32178
               -16.09272
                            3.03497 717.66470 -5.302 1.52e-07 ***
## minority
## ses
                10.05535
                            1.64507 171.13536
                                                6.112 6.44e-09 ***
## ---
## Signif. codes: 0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
## Correlation of Fixed Effects:
##
           (Intr) houspv mthknw yearst mthprp sex
                                                    minrty
## housepov -0.450
## mathknow -0.078 0.059
## yearstea -0.266 0.074 0.030
## mathprep -0.625  0.036 -0.001 -0.165
           -0.186 -0.009 0.007 0.013 -0.009
## minority -0.325 -0.181 0.108 0.021 0.004 -0.014
           -0.084 0.078 0.015 -0.024 0.056 0.022 0.142
## ses
ranova(rssc.3)
## ANOVA-like table for random-effects: Single term deletions
##
## Model:
## Math1 ~ housepov + mathknow + yearstea + mathprep + sex + minority +
##
      ses + (1 + ses | classid) + (1 | schoolid)
                             npar logLik
                                                    LRT Df Pr(>Chisq)
##
                                            AIC
                               13 -5362.8 10752
## <none>
## ses in (1 + ses | classid)
                               11 -5364.8 10752 3.8395 2
                               12 -5375.8 10776 26.0221 1 3.375e-07 ***
## (1 | schoolid)
## Signif. codes: 0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
The uncorrelated random slope for ses is insignificant with a pvalue of .147.
```

Random slopes for student-level predictors varying at school level

# ONE BY ONE

 $\mathbf{sex}$ 

```
rss.4 <-lmer(Math1~housepov+mathknow+yearstea+mathprep+sex+minority+ses+(1+sex||schoolid)+(1|classid),d
summary(rss.4)
## Linear mixed model fit by REML. t-tests use Satterthwaite's method [
## lmerModLmerTest]
## Formula:
## Math1 ~ housepov + mathknow + yearstea + mathprep + sex + minority +
      ses + (1 + sex || schoolid) + (1 | classid)
##
     Data: classroom
##
## REML criterion at convergence: 10728.9
## Scaled residuals:
      Min
           1Q Median
                           3Q
                                    Max
## -3.8578 -0.6110 -0.0259 0.5922 3.5557
##
## Random effects:
## Groups Name
                         Variance Std.Dev.
## classid (Intercept)
                           96.08 9.802
## schoolid sex
                           35.83
                                 5.986
## schoolid.1 (Intercept) 161.63 12.713
## Residual
                         1054.36 32.471
## Number of obs: 1081, groups: classid, 285; schoolid, 105
## Fixed effects:
               Estimate Std. Error
                                          df t value Pr(>|t|)
## (Intercept) 539.43517 5.30740 272.54946 101.638 < 2e-16 ***
## housepov
             -16.77661 13.22881 112.39593 -1.268
                                                     0 207
               1.40067 1.39464 234.45882
## mathknow
                                              1.004
                                                       0.316
               ## yearstea
                                                     0.919
## mathprep
               -0.27193 1.38010 205.78503 -0.197 0.844
               -1.33534
                           2.18746 138.08788 -0.610
## sex
                                                       0.543
              -16.16536
                           3.02861 704.25758 -5.338 1.27e-07 ***
## minority
## ses
                9.98477 1.54243 1058.27875 6.473 1.46e-10 ***
## ---
## Signif. codes: 0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.01 '*' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
## Correlation of Fixed Effects:
           (Intr) houspv mthknw yearst mthprp sex
                                                minrty
## housepov -0.449
## mathknow -0.081 0.055
## yearstea -0.259 0.070 0.028
## mathprep -0.633 0.036 0.004 -0.172
         -0.179 -0.010 0.007 0.013 -0.004
## minority -0.320 -0.178  0.114  0.024  0.001 -0.015
          -0.120 0.081 -0.007 -0.029 0.052 0.020 0.161
ranova(rss.4, refit=F)
## ANOVA-like table for random-effects: Single term deletions
##
## Model:
## Math1 ~ housepov + mathknow + yearstea + mathprep + sex + minority +
      ses + (1 | schoolid) + (0 + sex | schoolid) + (1 | classid)
```

The uncorrelated sex random slope at a school level is insignificant with a p value of .433.

# minority

```
rss.5 <-lmer(Math1~housepov+mathknow+yearstea+mathprep+sex+minority+ses+(1+minority||schoolid)+(1|class
summary(rss.5)
## Linear mixed model fit by REML. t-tests use Satterthwaite's method [
## lmerModLmerTest]
## Formula:
## Math1 ~ housepov + mathknow + yearstea + mathprep + sex + minority +
      ses + (1 + minority || schoolid) + (1 | classid)
##
     Data: classroom
##
## REML criterion at convergence: 10729.5
## Scaled residuals:
      Min 1Q Median
                              30
## -3.8580 -0.6134 -0.0321 0.5971 3.6598
##
## Random effects:
## Groups
              Name
                         Variance Std.Dev.
## classid
              (Intercept)
                           93.89
                                   9.69
                                   0.00
                             0.00
## schoolid minority
## schoolid.1 (Intercept) 169.45 13.02
                          1064.95 32.63
## Residual
## Number of obs: 1081, groups: classid, 285; schoolid, 105
##
## Fixed effects:
##
                Estimate Std. Error
                                           df t value Pr(>|t|)
## (Intercept) 539.63042 5.31210 275.38919 101.585 < 2e-16 ***
## housepov
               -17.64847 13.21758 113.87772 -1.335
                                                         0.184
## mathknow
                1.35004
                         1.39168 234.49776
                                               0.970
                                                         0.333
                         0.14141 226.80899
                                               0.080
                                                         0.936
## yearstea
                 0.01129
                         1.37583 205.27157 -0.201
## mathprep
                -0.27705
                                                         0.841
                -1.21419
                           2.09483 1022.42137 -0.580
                                                         0.562
## sex
## minority
               -16.18678
                           3.02605 704.47892 -5.349 1.20e-07 ***
## ses
                10.05075
                         1.54484 1066.56223 6.506 1.18e-10 ***
## Signif. codes: 0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
##
## Correlation of Fixed Effects:
           (Intr) houspv mthknw yearst mthprp sex
## housepov -0.451
## mathknow -0.083 0.058
```

```
## yearstea -0.259 0.071 0.029
## mathprep -0.631 0.038 0.004 -0.172
           -0.190 -0.007 0.007 0.016 -0.006
## minority -0.320 -0.178  0.115  0.024  0.001 -0.011
           -0.121 0.082 -0.007 -0.028 0.053 0.020 0.162
ranova(rss.5,refit=F)
## ANOVA-like table for random-effects: Single term deletions
##
## Model:
## Math1 ~ housepov + mathknow + yearstea + mathprep + sex + minority +
##
      ses + (1 | schoolid) + (0 + minority | schoolid) + (1 | classid)
##
                                        npar logLik
                                                      AIC
                                          12 -5364.8 10754
## <none>
                                          11 -5375.2 10772 20.8586 1
## (1 | schoolid)
## minority in (0 + minority | schoolid)
                                        11 -5364.8 10752 0.0000 1
## (1 | classid)
                                          11 -5368.3 10759 7.1357 1
##
                                        Pr(>Chisq)
## <none>
## (1 | schoolid)
                                         4.945e-06 ***
## minority in (0 + minority | schoolid)
                                         1.000000
                                          0.007556 **
## (1 | classid)
## ---
## Signif. codes: 0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
```

#### SES

```
rss.6 <-lmer(Math1~housepov+mathknow+yearstea+mathprep+sex+minority+ses+(1+ses||schoolid)+(1|classid),d
summary(rss.6) #IS SIG
## Linear mixed model fit by REML. t-tests use Satterthwaite's method [
## lmerModLmerTest]
## Formula:
## Math1 ~ housepov + mathknow + yearstea + mathprep + sex + minority +
       ses + (1 + ses || schoolid) + (1 | classid)
##
##
      Data: classroom
##
## REML criterion at convergence: 10724.8
## Scaled residuals:
      Min
               1Q Median
                                      Max
## -3.6138 -0.6185 -0.0290 0.5798 3.7130
## Random effects:
## Groups
              Name
                           Variance Std.Dev.
## classid
               (Intercept)
                            88.56
                                    9.411
## schoolid ses
                            72.50
                                    8.515
## schoolid.1 (Intercept) 167.98 12.961
## Residual
                           1035.12 32.173
## Number of obs: 1081, groups: classid, 285; schoolid, 105
```

The uncorrelated minority random slope at school level is insignificant with a pvalue of 1.0.

```
##
## Fixed effects:
                                           df t value Pr(>|t|)
                Estimate Std. Error
## (Intercept) 539.13751 5.27917 270.54314 102.126 < 2e-16 ***
## housepov
               -16.94564 13.21116 112.82496 -1.283
                                                         0.202
## mathknow
                1.35576 1.38459 232.19983
                                              0.979
                                                        0.329
## yearstea
               0.03079 0.14052 223.94305
                                              0.219
                                                        0.827
                -0.19801 1.35994 198.59419 -0.146
## mathprep
                                                        0.884
                -1.40185 2.08170 1011.28944 -0.673
## sex
                                                        0.501
                           3.02189 700.06637 -5.469 6.32e-08 ***
## minority
               -16.52525
## ses
                 9.78982 1.82217
                                    79.01645 5.373 7.62e-07 ***
## ---
## Signif. codes: 0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
## Correlation of Fixed Effects:
           (Intr) houspv mthknw yearst mthprp sex
## housepov -0.451
## mathknow -0.079
                  0.056
## yearstea -0.260 0.070 0.028
## mathprep -0.628 0.041 0.002 -0.172
          -0.190 -0.007 0.006 0.018 -0.007
## minority -0.323 -0.180  0.110  0.024  0.001 -0.010
           -0.091 0.076 0.006 -0.019 0.042 0.017 0.124
ranova(rss.6,refit=F)
## ANOVA-like table for random-effects: Single term deletions
##
## Model:
## Math1 ~ housepov + mathknow + yearstea + mathprep + sex + minority +
      ses + (1 | schoolid) + (0 + ses | schoolid) + (1 | classid)
##
                             npar logLik
                                                    LRT Df Pr(>Chisq)
                                            AIC
## <none>
                               12 -5362.4 10749
## (1 | schoolid)
                                11 -5374.6 10771 24.2924 1 8.276e-07 ***
## ses in (0 + ses | schoolid)
                               11 -5364.8 10752 4.6972 1
                                                              0.03021 *
## (1 | classid)
                               11 -5365.7 10753 6.5177 1
                                                              0.01068 *
## Signif. codes: 0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
The uncorrelated ses random slope at school level is significant with a p value of .03.
```

#### Allowing for correlations with random intercepts

#### ONE BY ONE

#### sex

```
rssc.4 <-lmer(Math1~housepov+mathknow+yearstea+mathprep+sex+minority+ses+(1+sex|schoolid)+(1|classid),dsummary(rssc.4)

## Linear mixed model fit by REML. t-tests use Satterthwaite's method [
## lmerModLmerTest]
```

```
## Formula:
## Math1 ~ housepov + mathknow + yearstea + mathprep + sex + minority +
      ses + (1 + sex | schoolid) + (1 | classid)
     Data: classroom
##
## REML criterion at convergence: 10727.6
## Scaled residuals:
      Min
            1Q Median
                               30
                                     Max
## -3.8048 -0.6095 -0.0222 0.5969 3.5525
## Random effects:
                        Variance Std.Dev. Corr
## Groups Name
## classid (Intercept)
                         97.34 9.866
## schoolid (Intercept) 206.33 14.364
##
                          84.08
                                9.170
                                         -0.43
## Residual
                        1041.76 32.276
## Number of obs: 1081, groups: classid, 285; schoolid, 105
##
## Fixed effects:
##
                Estimate Std. Error
                                           df t value Pr(>|t|)
## (Intercept) 5.399e+02 5.363e+00 2.626e+02 100.661 < 2e-16 ***
             -1.742e+01 1.325e+01 1.136e+02 -1.314
## housepov
                                                         0.191
## mathknow
              1.379e+00 1.396e+00 2.364e+02
                                               0.988
                                                         0.324
## yearstea
              6.876e-03 1.418e-01 2.277e+02
                                              0.048
                                                         0.961
## mathprep
              -2.796e-01 1.378e+00 2.061e+02 -0.203
                                                         0.839
              -1.340e+00 2.301e+00 8.742e+01 -0.582
                                                         0.562
## sex
              -1.642e+01 3.027e+00 7.076e+02 -5.425 7.96e-08 ***
## minority
              9.928e+00 1.540e+00 1.055e+03 6.448 1.72e-10 ***
## ses
## ---
## Signif. codes: 0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
##
## Correlation of Fixed Effects:
           (Intr) houspv mthknw yearst mthprp sex
                                                    minrty
## housepov -0.449
## mathknow -0.082 0.060
## yearstea -0.258 0.072 0.027
## mathprep -0.627 0.038 0.004 -0.172
           -0.222 -0.003 0.006 0.014 -0.005
## minority -0.319 -0.178 0.114 0.024 0.004 -0.011
           -0.121 0.083 -0.006 -0.028 0.053 0.018 0.163
ranova(rssc.4, refit=F)
## ANOVA-like table for random-effects: Single term deletions
## Model:
## Math1 ~ housepov + mathknow + yearstea + mathprep + sex + minority +
      ses + (1 + sex | schoolid) + (1 | classid)
##
##
                              npar logLik
                                            AIC
                                                   LRT Df Pr(>Chisq)
                                13 -5363.8 10754
## <none>
## sex in (1 + sex | schoolid)
                                11 -5364.8 10752 1.8631 2
                                                            0.393952
                                12 -5367.6 10759 7.6414 1
## (1 | classid)
                                                            0.005704 **
## ---
## Signif. codes: 0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
```

The correlated sex random slope at school-level is insignificant with a pvalue of .394.

# minority

```
rssc.5 <-lmer(Math1~housepov+mathknow+yearstea+mathprep+sex+minority+ses+(1+minority|schoolid)+(1|class
summary(rssc.5)
## Linear mixed model fit by REML. t-tests use Satterthwaite's method [
## lmerModLmerTest]
## Formula:
## Math1 ~ housepov + mathknow + yearstea + mathprep + sex + minority +
      ses + (1 + minority | schoolid) + (1 | classid)
##
     Data: classroom
## REML criterion at convergence: 10717.5
##
## Scaled residuals:
      Min
               1Q Median
                               3Q
                                      Max
## -3.8952 -0.6358 -0.0345 0.6129 3.6444
## Random effects:
## Groups
           Name
                        Variance Std.Dev. Corr
## classid (Intercept)
                          86.69 9.311
## schoolid (Intercept)
                         381.20 19.524
##
            minority
                         343.13 18.524
                                          -0.83
## Residual
                        1039.39 32.240
## Number of obs: 1081, groups: classid, 285; schoolid, 105
##
## Fixed effects:
                Estimate Std. Error
##
                                            df t value Pr(>|t|)
## (Intercept) 5.395e+02 5.655e+00 1.731e+02 95.399 < 2e-16 ***
## housepov
            -1.606e+01 1.257e+01 9.999e+01 -1.277
                                                         0.204
## mathknow
              1.632e+00 1.359e+00 2.248e+02
                                                1.201
                                                         0.231
## yearstea
              -4.368e-03 1.376e-01 2.172e+02 -0.032
                                                         0.975
              -2.918e-01 1.335e+00 1.981e+02 -0.218
## mathprep
                                                         0.827
              -8.628e-01 2.084e+00 1.022e+03 -0.414
                                                         0.679
## sex
## minority
              -1.638e+01 3.896e+00 5.824e+01 -4.203 9.17e-05 ***
## ses
               9.431e+00 1.543e+00 1.063e+03 6.111 1.39e-09 ***
## ---
## Signif. codes: 0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.01 '*' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
## Correlation of Fixed Effects:
           (Intr) houspv mthknw yearst mthprp sex
## housepov -0.394
## mathknow -0.078 0.061
## yearstea -0.253 0.091 0.024
## mathprep -0.576 0.037 -0.002 -0.167
          -0.172 -0.013 0.010 0.014 -0.005
## minority -0.494 -0.157 0.099 0.027 -0.002 -0.014
           -0.105  0.089  -0.005  -0.021  0.052  0.024  0.113
ranova(rssc.5,refit=F) #sig
```

```
## ANOVA-like table for random-effects: Single term deletions
##
## Model:
## Math1 ~ housepov + mathknow + yearstea + mathprep + sex + minority +
       ses + (1 + minority | schoolid) + (1 | classid)
##
                                         npar logLik
                                                               I.R.T Df
                                                        AIC
                                           13 -5358.8 10744
## minority in (1 + minority | schoolid)
                                           11 -5364.8 10752 11.967
## (1 | classid)
                                           12 -5361.8 10748 6.077 1
##
                                         Pr(>Chisq)
## <none>
## minority in (1 + minority | schoolid)
                                            0.00252 **
## (1 | classid)
                                            0.01370 *
## ---
## Signif. codes: 0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
```

The correlated minority random slope at school-level is significant with a pvalue of .0025.

#### SES

```
rssc.6 <-lmer(Math1~housepov+mathknow+yearstea+mathprep+sex+minority+ses+(1+ses|schoolid)+(1|classid),d
summary(rssc.6)
## Linear mixed model fit by REML. t-tests use Satterthwaite's method [
## lmerModLmerTest]
## Math1 ~ housepov + mathknow + yearstea + mathprep + sex + minority +
      ses + (1 + ses | schoolid) + (1 | classid)
##
     Data: classroom
##
## REML criterion at convergence: 10724.4
##
## Scaled residuals:
               1Q Median
##
      Min
                               3Q
                                      Max
## -3.5646 -0.6166 -0.0264 0.5888 3.7073
##
## Random effects:
## Groups Name
                        Variance Std.Dev. Corr
## classid (Intercept)
                          86.57 9.305
## schoolid (Intercept)
                         171.18 13.083
##
                          73.37
                                  8.565
                                          0.19
            ses
                        1035.90 32.185
## Residual
## Number of obs: 1081, groups: classid, 285; schoolid, 105
##
## Fixed effects:
                Estimate Std. Error
                                            df t value Pr(>|t|)
## (Intercept) 538.72222
                          5.27647 271.13405 102.099 < 2e-16 ***
## housepov
               -15.89873
                          13.15393 111.71410 -1.209
                                                          0.229
                            1.38201 230.89932
## mathknow
                 1.26025
                                                0.912
                                                          0.363
## yearstea
                 0.03617
                            0.14002 220.42247
                                                0.258
                                                          0.796
                            1.35642 197.10752 -0.160
                                                          0.873
## mathprep
                -0.21697
## sex
                -1.40436
                            2.08074 1011.40322 -0.675
                                                          0.500
                            3.03580 668.91517 -5.358 1.16e-07 ***
              -16.26699
## minority
```

```
9.72646
                            1.82985
                                      78.36218 5.315 9.75e-07 ***
## ses
## ---
## Signif. codes: 0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
## Correlation of Fixed Effects:
##
           (Intr) houspv mthknw yearst mthprp sex
                                                    minrty
## housepov -0.449
## mathknow -0.077
                   0.057
## yearstea -0.259 0.073 0.028
## mathprep -0.627 0.039
                         0.001 -0.172
           -0.188 -0.009 0.005 0.017 -0.008
## minority -0.325 -0.182  0.108  0.021  0.002 -0.011
           -0.062 0.070 0.007 -0.021 0.045 0.018 0.117
ranova(rssc.6,refit=F) #not sig
## ANOVA-like table for random-effects: Single term deletions
##
## Model:
## Math1 ~ housepov + mathknow + yearstea + mathprep + sex + minority +
      ses + (1 + ses | schoolid) + (1 | classid)
##
                              npar logLik
                                             AIC
                                                    LRT Df Pr(>Chisq)
## <none>
                                13 -5362.2 10750
## ses in (1 + ses | schoolid)
                                11 -5364.8 10752 5.1385 2
                                                             0.07659 .
## (1 | classid)
                                12 -5365.3 10755 6.2117 1
                                                             0.01269 *
## ---
## Signif. codes: 0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
```

The correlated ses random slope at school-level is Very close to significance but not quite there with a pvalue of .0766.

Question: Report unusual changes in variance.

**Answer:** Perhaps most striking is the change in variance for the random slope term on minority. Previously, it was 0. However, it jumps to 343.13 in the correlated model. The variance for the random slope term on SES also increases, but the correlated random slope is not a significant addition to our model according to the rand test results.

### Complex model

Take two predictors that had sig random slopes and add to model, test for need of one conditional on the other

minority is sig for correlated

ses is sig for uncorrelated

```
complex <-lmer(Math1~housepov+mathknow+yearstea+mathprep+sex+minority+ses+(0+ses|schoolid)+(1+minority|summary(complex)

## Linear mixed model fit by REML. t-tests use Satterthwaite's method [
## lmerModLmerTest]</pre>
```

```
## Formula:
## Math1 ~ housepov + mathknow + yearstea + mathprep + sex + minority +
      ses + (0 + ses | schoolid) + (1 + minority | schoolid) +
##
      (1 | classid)
##
     Data: classroom
##
## REML criterion at convergence: 10712.4
##
## Scaled residuals:
      Min
##
               1Q Median
                               3Q
                                      Max
## -3.6526 -0.6251 -0.0339 0.6050 3.6961
##
## Random effects:
                          Variance Std.Dev. Corr
## Groups
              Name
## classid
                           80.63
                                   8.979
              (Intercept)
##
   schoolid
              (Intercept) 404.54 20.113
##
                           336.04 18.332
                                           -0.84
              minority
## schoolid.1 ses
                            74.93
                                  8.656
## Residual
                          1009.73 31.776
## Number of obs: 1081, groups: classid, 285; schoolid, 105
##
## Fixed effects:
                Estimate Std. Error
##
                                           df t value Pr(>|t|)
## (Intercept) 539.05335 5.66468 165.74621 95.160 < 2e-16 ***
              -15.32111 12.49443 99.25865 -1.226
## housepov
                                                        0.223
## mathknow
                1.67475 1.35000 221.33588
                                               1.241
                                                         0.216
## yearstea
                 0.02102
                         0.13657 213.65672
                                              0.154
                                                         0.878
                -0.23546 1.31730 191.22014 -0.179
## mathprep
                                                         0.858
                -1.03871 2.06951 1010.41144 -0.502
                                                         0.616
## sex
                                     55.41065 -4.282 7.43e-05 ***
## minority
               -16.72884
                            3.90720
## ses
                 9.19654
                         1.82272
                                     82.48814
                                              5.046 2.65e-06 ***
## ---
## Signif. codes: 0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
## Correlation of Fixed Effects:
           (Intr) houspv mthknw yearst mthprp sex
## housepov -0.395
## mathknow -0.072 0.060
## yearstea -0.254 0.093 0.024
## mathprep -0.568 0.040 -0.004 -0.166
         -0.170 -0.014 0.010 0.017 -0.005
## minority -0.509 -0.149 0.092 0.027 -0.003 -0.013
           -0.080 0.083 0.006 -0.011 0.041 0.020 0.087
ranova(complex, refit=F)
## Warning: Model failed to converge with 1 negative eigenvalue: -1.2e-04
## ANOVA-like table for random-effects: Single term deletions
##
## Model:
## Math1 ~ housepov + mathknow + yearstea + mathprep + sex + minority +
      ses + (0 + ses | schoolid) + (1 + minority | schoolid) +
##
      (1 | classid)
##
                                       npar logLik
                                                      AIC
                                                              LRT Df
```

```
14 -5356.2 10740
## <none>
## ses in (0 + ses | schoolid)
                                          14 -5358.8 10746 5.1200 0
                                          12 -5362.4 10749 12.3899
## minority in (1 + minority | schoolid)
## (1 | classid)
                                          13 -5358.9 10744 5.3724
##
                                        Pr(>Chisq)
## <none>
## ses in (0 + ses | schoolid)
## minority in (1 + minority | schoolid)
                                           0.00204 **
## (1 | classid)
                                           0.02046 *
## ---
## Signif. codes: 0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
```

Question: Is the more complex model (with both random slopes in it) justified?

**Answer:** The complex model is justified since the rand test shows that the random slopes are both statistically significant at the 0.05 level, the only question revolves around statistical significance justifying compared to the Bayesian approach that would push for a simpler model.

The equation for the complex model is given by the following:

 $Math \hat{1}st_{ijk} = \beta_0 + \beta_1 housepov_k + \beta_2 math know_{jk} + \beta_3 yearstea_{jk} + \beta_4 math prep_{jk} + \beta_5 *sex_{ijk} + \beta_{6k} *ses_{ijk} + \beta_{7k} *minority_{ijk} + \zeta_0 math know_{jk} + \beta_2 math know_{jk} + \beta_3 math know_{jk} + \beta_4 math know_{jk} + \beta_5 math$ 

where  $\zeta_{0k} \sim N(0, \sigma_{\zeta_0}^2)$ ,  $\zeta_{6k} \sim N(0, \sigma_{\zeta_6}^2)$ ,  $\zeta_{7k} \sim N(0, \sigma_{\zeta_7}^2)$ ,  $\eta_{jk} \sim N(0, \sigma_{\eta}^2)$ , and  $\epsilon_{ijk} \sim N(0, \sigma_{\epsilon}^2)$ , all independent of each other.

#### summary(model1)

```
## Linear mixed model fit by REML. t-tests use Satterthwaite's method [
## lmerModLmerTest]
## Formula: Math1 ~ (1 | schoolid/classid)
##
      Data: classroom
##
## REML criterion at convergence: 11944.6
##
## Scaled residuals:
##
      Min
                1Q Median
                                3Q
                                       Max
## -5.1872 -0.6174 -0.0204 0.5821
                                   3.8339
##
## Random effects:
                                 Variance Std.Dev.
##
  Groups
                     Name
   classid:schoolid (Intercept)
                                   85.46
                                           9.244
##
  schoolid
                                  280.68
                                          16.754
                     (Intercept)
   Residual
                                 1146.80
                                          33.864
## Number of obs: 1190, groups: classid:schoolid, 312; schoolid, 107
##
## Fixed effects:
               Estimate Std. Error
                                        df t value Pr(>|t|)
## (Intercept) 522.540
                             2.037 104.406
                                             256.6
## ---
## Signif. codes: 0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
```

 $V_C$ ,  $V_S$ , and  $V_E$  Question: For UCM, write down:  $V_C$ ,  $V_S$ ,  $V_E$  for the three variance components (simply the estimates). Think of them as possibly varying with a covariate, though.

**Answer:** For the UCM,  $V_C = 85.46$ ,  $V_S = 280.68$ , and  $V_E = 1146.80$ 

```
summary(model4)
```

```
## Linear mixed model fit by REML. t-tests use Satterthwaite's method [
## lmerModLmerTest]
## Formula:
## Math1 ~ housepov + mathknow + yearstea + mathprep + sex + minority +
##
      ses + (1 | schoolid/classid)
##
     Data: classroom
##
## REML criterion at convergence: 10729.5
##
## Scaled residuals:
##
      Min
               1Q Median
                               3Q
                                      Max
## -3.8580 -0.6134 -0.0321 0.5971
                                  3.6598
##
## Random effects:
## Groups
                                Variance Std.Dev.
                    Name
## classid:schoolid (Intercept)
                                  93.89
                                          9.69
## schoolid
                    (Intercept) 169.45
                                        13.02
## Residual
                                1064.95 32.63
## Number of obs: 1081, groups: classid:schoolid, 285; schoolid, 105
##
## Fixed effects:
                                            df t value Pr(>|t|)
                Estimate Std. Error
## (Intercept) 539.63042
                          5.31210 275.38922 101.585 < 2e-16 ***
## housepov
               -17.64847
                          13.21757 113.87774
                                               -1.335
                                                          0.184
## mathknow
                1.35004
                          1.39168 234.49776
                                                0.970
                                                          0.333
                 0.01129
## yearstea
                            0.14141 226.80899
                                                 0.080
                                                          0.936
## mathprep
                -0.27705
                            1.37583 205.27157
                                                -0.201
                                                          0.841
                                               -0.580
                                                          0.562
## sex
                -1.21419
                            2.09483 1022.42136
## minority
               -16.18678
                            3.02605 704.47889
                                                -5.349 1.20e-07 ***
## ses
                10.05075
                            1.54484 1066.56223
                                                6.506 1.18e-10 ***
## Signif. codes: 0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
## Correlation of Fixed Effects:
##
           (Intr) houspv mthknw yearst mthprp sex
                                                     minrty
## housepov -0.451
## mathknow -0.083
                   0.058
## yearstea -0.259 0.071
                          0.029
## mathprep -0.631 0.038 0.004 -0.172
           -0.190 -0.007 0.007 0.016 -0.006
## minority -0.320 -0.178  0.115  0.024  0.001 -0.011
           -0.121 0.082 -0.007 -0.028 0.053 0.020 0.162
```

**Question:** For the most complicated (all fixed effects) random INTERCEPTS ONLY model, what are:  $V_C$ ,  $V_S$ ,  $V_E$ ?

**Answer:** For the most complicated fixed effects model with only random intercepts,  $V_C = 93.89$ ,  $V_S = 169.45$ , and  $V_E = 1064.95$ .

Question: By what fraction did these each decrease with the new predictors in the model?

**Answer:**  $V_C$  increased  $\frac{93.89}{85.46}$ 

**\$V\_S\$** decreased **\$\frac{169.45}{280.68}\$** 

```
summary(rss.6)
```

```
## Linear mixed model fit by REML. t-tests use Satterthwaite's method [
## lmerModLmerTest]
## Formula:
## Math1 ~ housepov + mathknow + yearstea + mathprep + sex + minority +
      ses + (1 + ses || schoolid) + (1 | classid)
##
     Data: classroom
##
## REML criterion at convergence: 10724.8
##
## Scaled residuals:
      Min
##
               1Q Median
                               3Q
                                      Max
  -3.6138 -0.6185 -0.0290 0.5798
                                   3.7130
##
## Random effects:
## Groups
              Name
                          Variance Std.Dev.
## classid
              (Intercept)
                            88.56
                                    9.411
## schoolid
              ses
                            72.50
                                    8.515
## schoolid.1 (Intercept)
                          167.98 12.961
## Residual
                          1035.12 32.173
## Number of obs: 1081, groups: classid, 285; schoolid, 105
## Fixed effects:
                Estimate Std. Error
                                            df t value Pr(>|t|)
## (Intercept) 539.13751 5.27917 270.54314 102.126 < 2e-16 ***
## housepov
               -16.94564
                          13.21116 112.82496
                                               -1.283
                                                          0.202
## mathknow
                                                 0.979
                 1.35576
                          1.38459 232.19983
                                                          0.329
## yearstea
                 0.03079
                            0.14052 223.94305
                                                 0.219
                                                          0.827
## mathprep
                -0.19801
                            1.35994 198.59419
                                                -0.146
                                                          0.884
                -1.40185
                            2.08170 1011.28944
                                               -0.673
## sex
                                                          0.501
               -16.52525
                            3.02189 700.06637
                                               -5.469 6.32e-08 ***
## minority
                 9.78982
                            1.82217
                                                5.373 7.62e-07 ***
## ses
                                      79.01645
## ---
## Signif. codes: 0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
##
## Correlation of Fixed Effects:
           (Intr) houspv mthknw yearst mthprp sex
## housepov -0.451
## mathknow -0.079 0.056
## yearstea -0.260 0.070 0.028
## mathprep -0.628 0.041
                         0.002 - 0.172
           -0.190 -0.007 0.006 0.018 -0.007
## minority -0.323 -0.180  0.110  0.024  0.001 -0.010
           -0.091 0.076 0.006 -0.019 0.042 0.017 0.124
```

**Question:** Now consider the model with a random slope in ses. What are:  $V_C$ ,  $V_S(ses = 0)$ ,  $V_E$ ? We need to list 'ses=0' here, or we don't know how to use the slope variance

**Answer:** For the model with a random slope in ses at the school level,  $V_C = 88.56$ ,  $V_S(ses = 0) = 167.98$ , and  $V_E = 1035.12$ .

Question: What are:  $V_S(ses = -0.50)$ ,  $V_S(ses = +0.5)$ ?

**Answer:** In this model, in which the random slope for SES is uncorrelated with the random school-level intercept,  $V_S(ses = -0.50) = 167.98 + (-.5)^272.50 + 2(-.5)0167.9872.50 = 186.105$ , and  $V_S(ses = +0.5) = 167.98 + (.5)^272.50 + 2*(.5)0167.98*72.50 = 186.105$ 

```
summary(rssc.5)
```

```
## Linear mixed model fit by REML. t-tests use Satterthwaite's method [
## lmerModLmerTest]
## Formula:
## Math1 ~ housepov + mathknow + yearstea + mathprep + sex + minority +
       ses + (1 + minority | schoolid) + (1 | classid)
##
##
      Data: classroom
##
## REML criterion at convergence: 10717.5
##
## Scaled residuals:
      Min
               1Q Median
                                      Max
##
  -3.8952 -0.6358 -0.0345 0.6129
                                   3.6444
##
## Random effects:
                        Variance Std.Dev. Corr
##
   Groups
            Name
##
   classid (Intercept)
                          86.69
                                  9.311
##
   schoolid (Intercept)
                         381.20 19.524
##
                         343.13 18.524
            minority
                                          -0.83
  Residual
                        1039.39 32.240
## Number of obs: 1081, groups: classid, 285; schoolid, 105
##
## Fixed effects:
##
                Estimate Std. Error
                                            df t value Pr(>|t|)
## (Intercept) 5.395e+02 5.655e+00 1.731e+02
                                                95.399
                                                       < 2e-16 ***
## housepov
              -1.606e+01 1.257e+01 9.999e+01
                                                -1.277
                                                          0.204
## mathknow
               1.632e+00
                          1.359e+00 2.248e+02
                                                 1.201
                                                          0.231
## yearstea
              -4.368e-03
                          1.376e-01 2.172e+02
                                                -0.032
                                                          0.975
              -2.918e-01
                          1.335e+00 1.981e+02
                                                -0.218
                                                          0.827
## mathprep
              -8.628e-01 2.084e+00 1.022e+03
                                                -0.414
                                                          0.679
## sex
              -1.638e+01 3.896e+00 5.824e+01
                                                -4.203 9.17e-05 ***
## minority
               9.431e+00 1.543e+00 1.063e+03
                                                 6.111 1.39e-09 ***
## ses
## ---
## Signif. codes: 0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
## Correlation of Fixed Effects:
##
            (Intr) houspv mthknw yearst mthprp sex
                                                     minrty
## housepov -0.394
## mathknow -0.078 0.061
## yearstea -0.253 0.091 0.024
## mathprep -0.576  0.037 -0.002 -0.167
           -0.172 -0.013 0.010 0.014 -0.005
## minority -0.494 -0.157 0.099 0.027 -0.002 -0.014
            -0.105 0.089 -0.005 -0.021 0.052 0.024 0.113
```

Question: Now consider the model with a random slope in minority. What are:  $V_C$ ,  $V_S(minority = 0)$ ,  $V_E$ ? We need to list 'minority=0' here, or we don't know how to use the slope variance

**Answer:** For the model with a random slope in minority at the school level,  $V_C = 86.69$ ,  $V_S(minority = 0) = 381.20$ , and  $V_E = 1039.39$ .

```
Question: What are: V_S(minority = 0.25), V_S(minority = +0.50), V_S(minority = +0.75)?
Answer: In this model, in which the random slope for minority is correlated with the random school-level,
intercept, V_S(minority = 0.25) = 381.20 + (0.25)^2 343.13 + 2(0.25)(-0.83)\sqrt{381.20} * \sqrt{343.13} = 252.5549,
V_S(minority = +0.50) = 381.20 + (0.50)^2 343.13 + 2(0.50)(-0.83)\sqrt{381.20} * \sqrt{343.13} = 166.801, and
V_S(minority = +0.75) = 381.20 + (0.25)^2 343.13 + 2(0.25)(-0.83)\sqrt{381.20} * \sqrt{343.13} = 123.9384.
summary(complex)
## Linear mixed model fit by REML. t-tests use Satterthwaite's method [
## lmerModLmerTest]
## Formula:
## Math1 ~ housepov + mathknow + yearstea + mathprep + sex + minority +
       ses + (0 + ses | schoolid) + (1 + minority | schoolid) +
##
##
       (1 | classid)
##
      Data: classroom
##
## REML criterion at convergence: 10712.4
##
## Scaled residuals:
##
                10 Median
       Min
                                 3Q
                                         Max
  -3.6526 -0.6251 -0.0339 0.6050
                                     3.6961
##
## Random effects:
## Groups
               Name
                            Variance Std.Dev. Corr
                              80.63
                                      8.979
##
    classid
                (Intercept)
##
    schoolid
               (Intercept)
                             404.54
                                     20.113
               minority
                             336.04 18.332
                                               -0.84
## schoolid.1 ses
                              74.93
                                      8.656
## Residual
                            1009.73
                                     31.776
## Number of obs: 1081, groups: classid, 285; schoolid, 105
##
## Fixed effects:
##
                 Estimate Std. Error
                                               df t value Pr(>|t|)
## (Intercept)
                539.05335
                              5.66468 165.74621
                                                   95.160
                                                           < 2e-16 ***
## housepov
                -15.32111
                             12.49443
                                        99.25865
                                                   -1.226
                                                              0.223
## mathknow
                  1.67475
                              1.35000 221.33588
                                                    1.241
                                                              0.216
                                                              0.878
## yearstea
                  0.02102
                              0.13657 213.65672
                                                    0.154
## mathprep
                 -0.23546
                            1.31730 191.22014
                                                   -0.179
                                                              0.858
                                                   -0.502
## sex
                 -1.03871
                              2.06951 1010.41144
                                                              0.616
## minority
                -16.72884
                              3.90720
                                         55.41065 -4.282 7.43e-05 ***
                  9.19654
                              1.82272
                                         82.48814
                                                    5.046 2.65e-06 ***
## ses
## ---
## Signif. codes: 0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
## Correlation of Fixed Effects:
##
            (Intr) houspv mthknw yearst mthprp sex
## housepov -0.395
## mathknow -0.072 0.060
## yearstea -0.254 0.093 0.024
## mathprep -0.568 0.040 -0.004 -0.166
            -0.170 -0.014 0.010 0.017 -0.005
## minority -0.509 -0.149 0.092 0.027 -0.003 -0.013
## ses
            -0.080 0.083 0.006 -0.011 0.041 0.020 0.087
```

**Question:** Now consider the model with a random slope in ses & minority. What are:  $V_C$ ,  $V_S(minority = 0, ses = 0)$ ,  $V_E$ ? We need to list 'ses=0, minority=0' here, or we don't know how to use the slope variance.

**Answer:** For the model with a random slope in ses & minority,  $V_C = 80.63$ ,  $V_S(minority = 0, ses = 0) = 404.54$ , and  $V_E = 1009.73$ .

```
Question: What are: V_S(ses = 0, minority = 0.50), V_S(ses = 0.50, minority = 0), V_S(ses = 0.50, minority = 0.50)?
```

**Answer:** In this model, in which the random slope for ses is uncorrelated with the random intercept, but the random slope for minority is correlated with the random intercept,

```
V_S(ses = 0, minority = 0.50) = 404.54 + (0)^2 74.93 + (0.50)^2 336.04 + 200404.5474.93 + 2*(0.50)(-0.83)\sqrt{404.54} * \sqrt{336.04} = 182.5268,
```

```
V_S(ses = 0.50, minority = 0) = 404.54 + (0.50)^2 74.93 + (0)^2 336.04 + 20.500404.5474.93 + 2*(0)(-0.83)\sqrt{404.54} * \sqrt{336.04} = 423.2725
```

 $V_S(ses = 0.50, minority = 0.50) = 404.54 + (0.50)^2 74.93 + (0.50)^2 336.04 + 20.500404.5474.93 + 2 * (0.50)(-0.83)\sqrt{404.54} * \sqrt{336.04} = 201.2593$ 

#### summary(complex)

```
## Linear mixed model fit by REML. t-tests use Satterthwaite's method [
## lmerModLmerTest]
## Formula:
## Math1 ~ housepov + mathknow + yearstea + mathprep + sex + minority +
       ses + (0 + ses | schoolid) + (1 + minority | schoolid) +
##
##
       (1 | classid)
##
      Data: classroom
##
## REML criterion at convergence: 10712.4
##
## Scaled residuals:
                1Q Median
##
                                 30
                                        Max
  -3.6526 -0.6251 -0.0339
##
                            0.6050
                                     3.6961
##
## Random effects:
##
   Groups
               Name
                           Variance Std.Dev. Corr
##
   classid
               (Intercept)
                             80.63
                                      8.979
##
   schoolid
               (Intercept)
                            404.54
                                     20.113
##
               minority
                             336.04
                                     18.332
                                              -0.84
##
   schoolid.1 ses
                             74.93
                                      8.656
   Residual
                           1009.73
                                     31.776
## Number of obs: 1081, groups: classid, 285; schoolid, 105
##
## Fixed effects:
##
                 Estimate Std. Error
                                              df t value Pr(>|t|)
## (Intercept)
                539.05335
                             5.66468 165.74621
                                                  95.160
                                                          < 2e-16 ***
## housepov
                -15.32111
                            12.49443
                                        99.25865
                                                  -1.226
                                                            0.223
## mathknow
                  1.67475
                             1.35000
                                      221.33588
                                                   1.241
                                                            0.216
## yearstea
                  0.02102
                             0.13657
                                       213.65672
                                                   0.154
                                                            0.878
                                                            0.858
## mathprep
                 -0.23546
                             1.31730
                                      191.22014
                                                  -0.179
                 -1.03871
                                                  -0.502
## sex
                             2.06951 1010.41144
                                                            0.616
                             3.90720
                                        55.41065
                                                  -4.282 7.43e-05 ***
## minority
                -16.72884
## ses
                  9.19654
                             1.82272
                                        82.48814
                                                   5.046 2.65e-06 ***
## ---
## Signif. codes: 0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
```

**Question:** In the last model, what is a "likely" (+/- 1 sd) range for  $\eta_{0ik}$ 

**Answer:** For the complex model, the "likely" range for  $\eta 0jk$  is 71.651 to 89.609.

**Question:** Can we make a similar statement about  $\zeta_{0k}$ ?

**Answer:** Mathmatically we can with a range of 384.427 to 424.653 though we can do this it doesn't make much sense due to the correlated nature of this with the minority variable the values wouldn't hold much meaning and are easily misinterpreted.

**Question:** If you had a large value for  $\eta_{0jk}$ , would you expect a large or small or "any" value for: the two random slope terms,  $\zeta_{1k}$  and  $\zeta_{2k}$  for ses and minority?

**Answer:** If you have a very large  $\eta_{0jk}$  you would expect a small value for  $\zeta_{1k}$  and  $\zeta_{2k}$  but the  $\zeta_{2k}$  would not be as small due to its negative correlation with our  $\zeta_{0k}$  which is effected by our eta value

**Question:** If you had a large value for  $\zeta_{0k}$ , would you expect a large or small or "any" value for: the two random slope terms,  $\zeta_{1k}$  and  $\zeta_{2k}$  for ses and minority (discuss each separately)?

**Answer:** For  $\zeta_{1k}$  would increase in the same direction but it could be any value due to the lack of correlation, keeping in mind that  $\zeta_{0k}$  will create a ceiling effect of sorts for  $\zeta_{1k}$ . While  $\zeta_{2k}$  would be very small because of the correlation because of the two variables are negatively correlated.