

Heritage Whitby Advisory Committee Minutes
August 14, 2018 -7:00 PM
Committee Room One
Whitby Municipal Building

Present: Kirstyn Allam
Margaret Clayton
Lynn Collins, Vice-Chair (arrived at 7:35 p.m.)
Meredith Dodge
John Ecker, Chair
Katherine Hull
Heather Kearney (left at 10:03 p.m.)
Rick McDonnell
Vincent Santamaura
Brian Winter

Also Present: Councillor Gleed, Mayor's Designate
Sarah Ferencz, Library Archivist
Stacey Kursikowski, Staff Liaison, Planner II - Heritage and
Downtowns
Heather Oerlemans, Council and Committee Coordinator
(Recording Secretary)

Regrets: Joyce Marshall

1. Disclosures of Interest

1.1 There were no disclosures of interest.

2. Approval of Previous Minutes

2.1 Minutes - June 12, 2018

Recommendation:

Moved By Vincent Santamaura

That the Heritage Whitby Advisory Committee minutes of June 12, 2018
be approved.

Carried

3. Presentations/Deputations

3.1 Ivan Sirman, Project Manager, ATE Contracting Co. Ltd.
Re: 680 Winchester Road West - Proposed Demolition of Barn and
Dilapidated Outbuildings on a Listed Property

Stacey Kursikowski provided an overview of the property and stated that the existing dwelling was built in 1915 and has numerous outbuildings. The owner was seeking permission to demolish seven dilapidated outbuildings for the purpose of cleaning up the property and had no intention of de-listing the property or demolishing the dwelling. As such, staff requested a scoped Heritage Impact Assessment to focus on the outbuildings.

Ivan Sirman, Project Manager, ATE Contracting Co. Ltd., appeared before the Committee and provided further details of the proposed demolition including:

- a report on the dilapidated and unsafe conditions of the barn;
- safety concerns regarding the structural integrity of the outbuildings; and
- the heritage consultants' conclusion that the outbuildings had no heritage value.

A brief question and answer period ensued between Committee Members and Mr. Sirman regarding:

- the process for determining that the outbuildings were dilapidated and unsafe;
- details of the dilapidated condition of the outbuildings; and
- the lack of historical records documenting the location, size and use of the outbuildings on the property.

Recommendation:

Moved By Katherine Hull

That the Heritage Whitby Advisory Committee is in support of the demolition permit for the dilapidated outbuilding on the property municipally known as 680 Winchester Road West, and requests that site documents be provided regarding the particulars of each building subject to demolition including photographs, location, building dimensions, and use.

Carried

3.2 Kerry Teeling-Kane, Property Owner
Re: 800 Centre Street South - Heritage Permit for Porch Reconstruction
to a Part IV Designated Property

Kerry Teeling-Kane was not in attendance, therefore Stacey Kursikowski provided information regarding the request for a Heritage Permit for porch reconstruction to the property municipally known as 800 Centre Street South. Ms. Kursikowski advised that the property owner had completed the reconstruction without a Heritage Permit or the input and approval of staff or the Committee. Ms. Kursikowski was seeking feedback from the Committee Members on the completed redesign. Vincent Santamaura provided an overview of the Regency Cottage style which included a "light and lacy" design with rounded post edges. The Committee reviewed several examples of Regency Cottage style porches to assess whether or not the reconstruction reflected the appropriate style. It was the consensus of the Committee that the reconstruction of the porch did not reflect the design elements of the Regency Cottage style. Ms. Kursikowski provided an overview of the discussions with Ms. Teeling-Kane and requested comments from the Committee regarding an appropriate course of action to respond to the after-the-fact-Heritage Permit. The Committee provided several options which were noted by Ms. Kursikowski.

3.3 Mohammad Feroz, Shareholder, Sabrina Homes, Zeeshan Jafri,
Director, Golder Associates Ltd., and Henry Cary, Cultural Heritage
Specialist/Archaeologist, Golder Associates Ltd.
Re: 400 Mary Street East - Request for De-listing

Henry Cary, Cultural Heritage Specialist, Golder Associates Ltd., appeared before the committee on behalf of Mohammad Feroz, Shareholder, Sabrina Homes, and provided an overview of the Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment for 400 Mary Street East. Mr. Cary advised that the engine shed situated on 400 Mary Street East was part of the Lindsey/Port Perry Railway, also known as the 'Nip and Tuck' railway to many locals. The Cultural Heritage Impact Assessment determined that the property did have a cultural heritage interest under Ontario Regulation 9/06 but had a high degree of contamination. Mr. Cary provided further details such as:

- the engine shed was built in 1876 to replace the pre-existing wooden structure that was destroyed by fire;
- the engine shed architecture represented the Romanesque Revival Style;
- the outlines of the original train entrance arches were still visible

on the sides and rear of the building, but had been filled in with brick;

- the original peaked gable roof line had been changed;
- the architectural integrity of the building represented only 50% of the original context;
- there was a significant amount of soil contamination within and around the building to a depth of approximately 50 centimetres;
- tearing down the building would be necessary to remove the contaminated soil situated underneath the building; and
- an independent analysis by Biddle & Associates revealed significant structural issues that resulted in a prohibitive cost for reconstruction.

A discussion ensued between Committee Members and Mr. Cary regarding:

- incorporating the architecture of the current building style into the design of the future development on the lands;
- procuring documentation such as pictures, collection of newspaper articles, and cultural history of the site for the development of a single resource such as a book;
- the current zoning permits medium to higher density residential uses;
- the proposed development for the property and methods to incorporate a commemorative element into the design;
- the site met 3 of the 9 criteria for heritage value designation and therefore should not be de-listed; and
- developing historical documents for the property prior to approving a request for de-listing.

Recommendation:

Moved By Brian Winter

That the Heritage Whitby Advisory Committee is not in support of the de-listing application for the property municipally known as 400 Mary Street East and that the application for de-listing not be approved.

Carried

Recommendation:

Moved By Katherine Hull

That the Committee take a short recess.

Carried

The Committee recessed at 9:35 p.m. and reconvened at 9:40 p.m.

3.4 Austin Saldanha, Property Owner
Re: 42 Baldwin Street - Heritage Permit for Proposed Alterations to a
Part V Designated Building

Stacey Kursikowski provided a brief overview of the property located at 42 Baldwin Street and advised that the property was designated under Part V of the Ontario Heritage Act. She noted that the property owner had applied for a Heritage Permit to replace the existing front porch brick work for a railing and install a new ground sign on the front yard to replace the existing sign.

Austin Saldanha appeared before the Committee and provided an overview of the Heritage Permit application. Details of the application included:

- replacing the existing front porch brick work for a white picket railing to bring more light into the space;
- matching the proposed railing colour with the existing trim of the building; and
- adding an advertising sign that would resemble the design of the surrounding business' advertising signage.

A brief question and answer period ensued between Committee Members and Mr. Saldanha regarding:

- whether the proposed railing height would be in accordance to the Building Code standards;
- whether the proposed railing contradicted the building's architectural style and the current district's streetscape;
- whether the existing sign post could be lowered to open up the front facade; and
- the feasibility of relocating the sign to the north of the property to avoid blocking the entrance way to the front porch.

Recommendation:

Moved By Vincent Santamaura

That the Heritage Whitby Advisory Committee is in support of the Heritage Permit application for alterations to the property municipally known as 42 Baldwin Street with respect to the sign, and that the application for alterations to the porch be denied.

Carried

3.5 Chris Uchiyama, Heritage Consultant, This Land Archaeology Inc., Sean McGaffey, Design Technician, Walker, Nott, Dragicevic Associates Limited

Re: 500 Dundas Street East - Request for De-listing

Chris Uchiyama, Heritage Consultant, This Land Archaeology Inc., and Sean McGaffey, Design Technician, Walker, Nott, Dragicevic Associates Limited appeared before the Committee and provided an overview of the property including a plan for a 6 storey residential building currently in the conceptual phase. Ms. Uchiyama advised that a Cultural Heritage Assessment and Archaeological Assessment had been conducted. Ms. Uchiyama provided further details regarding the heritage attributes including:

- the wood frame structure was built in 1878 for Jonathan Wolfinden;
- the later purchase and ownership of the house by Charles 'Ed' Bowman;
- the building reflects both Ontario Cottage and front-gable Edwardian era design;
- the front door case with decorative woodwork, 16-pane transom, and sidelights;
- the central gable peak on the west side facade with lancet arch window; and
- the remaining white marble fireplace lintel.

Sean McGaffey provided an overview of the proposed development and commemorative initiatives including:

- retaining the house would be impractical and would require extraordinary financial costs;
- the site was not broad enough to allow the building to be relocated;
- documenting and salvaging elements such as the arched window, door, brick work, and original stone hearth was the most feasible commemorative approach;
- the proposed development would incorporate the footprint of the existing building with salvaged brick as a landscape feature;
- the existing entrances to the building would be retained;
- the existing trees would be maintained;
- a commemorative memorial garden would be built on the footprint of the original building;
- commemorative signage and elements from the original building would be displayed in the lobby of the building; and

- the proposed development included 60 units.

Discussion ensued with respect to the property and proposed development, including:

- incorporating the existing herringbone pattern into the brick work of the proposed development;
- incorporating the archaeological elements into the lobby displays;
- the number of criteria met in the Cultural Heritage Assessment;
- the safety, accessibility, and likelihood of public use of the garden space and lobby;
- commemorating the original owners through the naming of the building such as "Ed Bowman" who ran uncontested as the Mayor of Whitby and received the Peter Perry award in 1962;
- the property is designated High Density Residential in the Official Plan;
- the Committee would be in support of staff's recommendation to not approve the de-listing as the property represented significant heritage value having met one point in each criteria; and
- the Committee's acknowledgement of the compelling presentation.

Recommendation:

Moved By Margaret Clayton

That the Heritage Whitby Advisory Committee does not approve of the application for de-listing for the property municipally known as 500 Dundas Street East.

Carried

4. General Business and Reports

4.1 Brooklin Harvest Festival - Event Discussion

Stacey Kursikowski provided an update regarding the Brooklin Harvest Festival on September 15, 2018 from 10:00 a.m. to 4:00 p.m. and advised that two shifts of volunteers would be needed for this event.

4.2 Heritage Matters Newsletter - Fall Edition Discussion

Stacey Kursikowski advised that several articles have been received for the Heritage Matters Fall Newsletter and thanked Members who had submitted articles.

5. Correspondence

5.1 CHOnews Summer Edition
Re: Community Heritage Ontario Newsletter

Stacey Kursikowski distributed copies of the CHOnews Summer Edition for Committee Members to review.

6. Council Update

6.1 Councillor Gleed advised that Council would be in a "lame duck" situation and therefore Council had given authority to the Planning Department for site plan approvals and red line development.

7. Other Business

7.1 Gallery Dental

Stacey Kursikowski advised that Gallery Dental located at 1200 Brock Street South would be submitting a request for a Heritage Permit to redo the front porch. She further advised that the owner would also be proposing to repair and repaint the exterior of the building in heritage colours later in 2018.

7.2 Advisory Boards and Committees Open House - November 15, 2018

Committee Members were advised that an Advisory Boards and Committees Open House was tentatively scheduled for November 15, 2018. Members were invited to attend the Open House in order to apply for the 2018-2022 recruitment term as well as provide experiential information to interested applicants.

8. Adjournment

8.1 Motion to Adjourn

Recommendation:

Moved by Rick McDonnell

That the meeting adjourn.

Carried

The meeting adjourned at 10:45 p.m.

H. Oerlemans, Council/Committee
Coordinator

J. Ecker, Committee Chair