


From: Steven Bograd - NOAA Federal steven.bograd@noaa.gov 
Subject: Re: paper review
Date: January 13, 2023 at 3:18 PM
To: Natasha Hardy nahardy@ualberta.ca
Cc: Stephanie Green sgreen1@ualberta.ca



Yeah, sounds good. Thanks Tash!

Steven

On Jan 13, 2023, at 3:15 PM, Natasha Hardy <nahardy@ualberta.ca> wrote:

Sorry, I forgot to address that point. The documents Steven attached should be the final version, at present. I submitted the paper, sent Steven these documents. I have not addressed Joe's comments yet and will do so closer to receiving feedback from external reviewers. Thus [all submitted documents are housed in this folder](#), from where I downloaded and attached the same files you have + now Joe's edits and this is where I will likely create a subfolder for this submission and edits will be under a subfolder for a new submission. I hope that all makes sense?

Natasha Hardy (she / her)
Ph.D, Research Scientist & Postdoctoral Research Fellow
Department of Biological Sciences Department, University of Alberta,
Based in Canmore AB, Canada

I live work and play on Treaty 6 and Treaty 7 regions, the traditional territory of the diverse indigenous peoples and nations including the Blackfoot Confederacy, Tsuut'ina, Stoney Nakoda, Cree, Nakota Sioux, Iroquois, Dene, Ojibway / Salteaux / Anishinaabe, Inuit, Métis, and others whose histories, languages, and cultures continue to influence our vibrant community.

On Jan 13, 2023, at 12:59 PM, Stephanie Green <sgreen1@ualberta.ca> wrote:

Thanks Tash! Could you send Steven the final version as per request?

On 2023-01-12 12:33 p.m., Natasha Hardy wrote:

Hi Steven and Steph,

Happy New Year to you both! I'm just about settling into Vancouver life and work.

Again, thank you for facilitating this and I do appreciate Joe's helpful feedback. Of note, the two supplemental tables (S3 & S5) were in a [separate sheet](#), as are S4, S6 and S7 which he did not mention and I believe are cited but will double check. It could be worthwhile double checking that we provided him with this spreadsheet and hearing any further feedback he may have? The supplementary data are too large to be copied into a work document hence the text file and spreadsheet files for supplementary information.

Agreed with Steph, I will address and re-package when we receive external reviews for this piece.

Best,
Tash

On Wed, Jan 11, 2023 at 9:42 AM Steven Bograd - NOAA Federal <steven.bograd@noaa.gov> wrote:

Hi Steph and Tash,

Happy New Year! This plan makes sense.

Could you send me the latest draft?

Best,
Steven

On Jan 11, 2023, at 8:53 AM, Stephanie Green <sgreen1@ualberta.ca> wrote:

Hi Steven,

Happy New Year! Thanks for facilitating this and to Joe for his time! I think the best plan would be to save these to incorporate when we get reviews back from Fish & Fisheries.

Best,

Steph

Stephanie Green, PhD (she/her)

Assistant Professor
Canada Research Chair, Aquatic Global Change Ecology & Conservation
Department of Biological Sciences
University of Alberta
www.greenlab.ca

The University of Alberta is located on Treaty 6 territory, a traditional gathering place for diverse Indigenous peoples including the Cree, Blackfoot, Metis, Nakota Sioux, Iroquois, Dene, Ojibway/ Saulteaux/Anishinaabe, Inuit, and many others whose histories, languages, and cultures continue to influence our vibrant community.

On Wed, Dec 21, 2022 at 10:16 AM Steven Bograd - NOAA Federal <steven.bograd@noaa.gov> wrote:
Hi Tash and Steph,

Here is the NOAA internal review we got back from Joe Bizarro. I think we can make any edits we deem useful in the revised version of the manuscript.

Happy Holidays to you both!

Steven

Begin forwarded message:

From: Joe Bizarro - NOAA Affiliate <joe.bizarro@noaa.gov>
Subject: paper review
Date: December 21, 2022 at 9:08:47 AM PST
To: Steven Bograd - NOAA Federal <steven.bograd@noaa.gov>
Cc: Elliott Hazen - NOAA Federal <elliott.hazen@noaa.gov>

Hi, Steven:

I'm sorry that I'm late getting this to you. I had to pivot on Monday to finish a draft of one of my own papers as a co-author was getting ready to leave for a long break.

I enjoyed reviewing the paper. I think the data mining, data collection, and analysis aspects were very thorough and well reasoned. The results were interesting and informative in the context of albacore and certainly helped to push the trophic knowledge of that species forward, but I think the approach and outcomes of this paper are broadly applicable and provide a bit of a roadmap for similar work. I think you provided strong support for incorporating trait based characterization along with typical taxonomic identification in diet studies.

I would like to see some discussion that indicates the limitation of your results when describing and comparing diets because you had to use (relative) %FO instead of a more robust metric based on weight or number. I also thought that some of the interpretations of those results didn't match up with the data provided on the relevant figure (Fig. 4). Similarly, I thought the evaluation of sample size sufficiency needed a more objective assessment. A few of the cited supplemental tables (S3-S5) were missing from the material provided, and one supplemental figure (S4) wasn't cited in the text. I made lots of comments and edits throughout, as I always do. Use what you think will help the paper and discard the rest. I was just trying to do my part to move the paper forward.

Good luck with the submission and please let me know if you have any questions when you look it over.

Happy Holidays,

Joe

Joseph J. Bizarro, Ph.D.
Assistant Project Scientist IV
Institute of Marine Sciences
University of California, Santa Cruz &
Fisheries Ecology Division
Southwest Fisheries Science Center
National Marine Fisheries Service
Santa Cruz, CA
831-521-5844 (cell)
831-420-3993 (office)

Dr. Natasha Hardy
Postdoctoral Fellow, Biological Sciences
University of Alberta & Hopkins Marine Station, Stanford University
E: nahardy@ualberta.ca
Green Lab: <https://greenlab.ca/about/>
Crowder Lab: <https://crowderlab.stanford.edu/staff>



THE CHANGE LAB

The University of Alberta is located on Treaty 6 territory, a traditional gathering place for diverse Indigenous peoples including the Cree, Blackfoot, Metis, Nakota Sioux, Iroquois, Dene, Ojibway/ Saulteaux/Anishinaabe, Inuit, and many others whose histories, languages, and cultures continue to influence our vibrant community.

--

Stephanie Green, PhD (she/her)
Assistant Professor
Canada Research Chair, Aquatic Global Change Ecology & Conservation
Department of Biological Sciences
University of Alberta
www.greenlab.com

The University of Alberta is located on Treaty 6 territory, a traditional gathering place for diverse Indigenous peoples including the Cree, Blackfoot, Metis, Nakota Sioux, Iroquois, Dene, Ojibway/ Saulteaux/Anishinaabe, Inuit, and many others whose histories, languages, and cultures continue to influence our vibrant community.

