Xiang Gu 5130309729 Tao Zhu 515020910243 Weihong Lin 515030910643 Chacha Chen 515021910302

Feature Dimensionality Reduction

0. Introduction

In this lab, we investigated several common techniques to do feature reduction. We used the Animals with Attributes (AwA2) dataset from https://cvml.ist.ac.at/AwA2/, which consists of 37322 images of 50 animal classes with pre-extracted features for each image. The goal of this lab is to apply different feature dimensionality reduction technique to these features and measure the 'quality' via training a linear SVM to do multi-class classification on the dataset.

Baseline -- Use Pre-extracted Features

In this section, we simply train a linear SVM with the (provided) pre-extracted features.

We first split the dataset into a training set (60%) and a test set (40%). Then we performed 5-fold cross-validation within the training set to determine the best choice for the hyperparameter C in sklearn.svm.SVC -- an existing SVM package that can be used directly. We conducted a grid-search for the optimal hyperparameter C in the range of

The result is shown as follows:

С	1e-5	1e-4	1e-3	1e-2	1e-1	1	1e1	1e2	1e3
Accura cy	0.6854 (+/- 0.0030)	0.9055 (+/- 0.0063)	0.9304 (+/- 0.0062)	(+/-	0.9262 (+/- 0.0077)	0.9262 (+/- 0.0076)	(+/-	0.9233 (+/- 0.0085)	0.9233 (+/- 0.0085)

We can see from the plot that C=1e-3 (0.001) gives the highest accuracy. We can now go ahead and test its performance on the test set:

Accuracy = 0.9338

2. Feature Reduction

With the baseline performance, we are now ready to explore the feasibility of applying feature reduction techniques learned in class. We report the results of three feature reduction methods here.

2.1. Feature Selection -- Evolutionary Algorithm

The first method is feature selection, meaning for each image, we select only a subset of the components in its original feature. It is helpful, conceptually, to think of the selection process as selecting a binary mask. The binary masks have the same dimensionality as the features but applying different masks to the original features gives different size-reduced features. Our goal is then to try to find one (or a set of) good mask so that applying those masks to original features gives features that are both smaller in size but also maintains a good classification accuracy when trained with an SVM.

We chose a evolutionary algorithm to search for better masks in the mask space. A population of 100 masks is generated randomly and used to generate 100 sets of features. For each set of features, we train a linear SVM and keep track of its performance. \footnote{We split the training set further into a training set (80%) and validation set (20%) to train and evaluate each set of features.} Next, we picked the masks with top 10% performance (i.e. masks with top 10 evaluation performance) and make small, random changes to them to enrich the mask population to 80. Namely, for each of the 10 masks, we randomly picked 3 (out of 2048) positions and generate 8 new masks by considering all permutation on these 3 positions. We also brought in 20 completely random masks to enlarge the whole mask population back to 100 again, and we iterate for 5 rounds.

The result is shown as follows:

Round	1st	2nd	3rd	4th	5th
Mean Accuracy of top 10 percent masks	0.93 (+/- 0.00)	0.92 (+/- 0.00)	0.92 (+/- 0.00)	0.92 (+/- 0.00)	0.92 (+/- 0.00)

The accuracies of all masks in all rounds are put in the Appendix.

The result might seem weird at first glance -- all masks in all iterations have almost exactly the same performance. We are supposed to see an increasing curve with an evolutionary algorithm! Yes, that is right but here is a coarse explanation why we see such a result.

1). within a search space whose cardinality is 2^2048, a population of 100 is obviously too few. The evolutionary algorithm works better with large population pool.

- 2). 5 iterations are too few as well. It typically requires more than thousands of iterations, if not more, for an evolutionary algorithm to find its way toward a good solution in the search space. 5 iterations are just ridiculously small.
- 3). Most importantly, almost all the masks have a length of around 1000. Well, this is reasonable since we generated each component (True or False) randomly and the length of the mask obeys a binomial distribution, so a mask's expected length is 1000. However, all masks of length ~1000 have roughly the same performance. We can still conclude something useful -- the individual components in the original feature does not play a big role but rather the size of the reduced feature. That is, as long as you keep 1000 components in the feature, you get approximately the same performance no matter which 1000 out of 2048 components you choose to keep. Probably a better way to generate the mask population is to generate masks of various length (length refers to the total number of True's) randomly so as to ensure length-wise exploration, rather than being limited to masks with similar length.

In hindsight, we should not use an evolutionary algorithm because of computation resource limitation but rather a forward selection/backward deletion method.

2.2. Feature Projection -- Principal Component Analysis (PCA)

Traditional feature selection keeps the features intact and chooses n best features among them, removing the redundant and co-linear features. However, PCA is a dimensionality reduction algorithm where new features are created which represents the original feature dimensions in a lower dimension with a little loss of the total information. It performs linear dimensionality reduction using Singular Value Decomposition of the data to project it to a lower dimensional space.

Scikit-learn library provides a *decomposition.PCA()* API that performs PCA conveniently. We let the argument n_components=0.95, which means scikit-learn will choose the minimum number of principal components such that 95% of the variance is retained. Finally, we get 830 principal components, which is a good amount of reduction from the original 2048 features.

We train and test these new data using SVM with c=0.001, get an accuracy of 93.25% on the test set. It's similar to the accuracy without PCA, but as we can see, the dimension of feature space is greatly reduced, which in turn reduces the complexity of the SVM model. As a result, we observed a decent decrease in the training time of SVM as well as the prediction time.

In this section, we also experiment with two common data preprocessing techniques: min-max normalization and z-score normalization. With min-max normalization, we add an additional step to normalize the original data to [0, 1] scale, then repeat PCA and SVM steps, get 1027 principal components and accuracy of only 75.17% on the testing set. Similarly, with z-score normalization, we normalize the original data to a distribution of mean=0 and standard deviation=1. The result is 1124 principal components and an accuracy of 93.05%. It turns out normalization doesn't further improve accuracy or help PCA get a smaller feature space. It can be explained that the original data are from the output of a

neural network, which is already normalized by Batch Normalization in the neural network. So performing normalization again is unnecessary.

2.3. Feature Learning -- Auto-Encoder

The last method is Auto-Encoder, one among many possible ways to do feature learning.

We designed a artificial neural network (ANN) with fully connected layers for this auto-encoder using Keras, summarized as follows:

Layer (type)	Output Shape	Param #	
input_1 (InputLayer)	(None, 2048)	0	========
dense_1 (Dense)	(None, 2000)	4098000	
dense_2 (Dense)	(None, 1750)	3501750	
dense_3 (Dense)	(None, 1500)	2626500	
dense_4 (Dense)	(None, 1250)	1876250	
dense_5 (Dense)	(None, 1000)	1251000	
dense_6 (Dense)	(None, 750)	750750	
dense_7 (Dense)	(None, 500)	375500	
dense_8 (Dense)	(None, 250)	125250	
dense_9 (Dense)	(None, 500)	125500	
dense_10 (Dense)	(None, 750)	375750	
dense_11 (Dense)	(None, 1000)	751000	
dense_12 (Dense)	(None, 1250)	1251250	
dense_13 (Dense)	(None, 1500)	1876500	
dense_14 (Dense)	(None, 1750)	2626750	
dense_15 (Dense)	(None, 2000)	3502000	
dense_16 (Dense)	(None, 2048)	4098048	

Total params: 29,211,798 Trainable params: 29,211,798

Non-trainable params: 0

Dense layers 1 through 8 consititutes the encoder part and dense layers 9 through 16 forms the decoder part.

We first trained this ANN with the original training set for 200 epochs in an ordinary supervised learning manner. \footnote{the labels of the training set are the training set itself!} Then we take the first half of the network (the 'encoder' part) and feed into our training set and test set. The output predictions are therefore the new size-reduced feature (250-dimensional in our example). What we did next is, again, train a linear SVM with those size-reduced features and test it on the test set. The final accuracy is

Accuracy: 0.803470

3. Conclusion

We explored three dimensionality reduction techniques for classification problem with the AwA2 dataset in this lab ---- evolutionary algorithm, PCA, and auto-encoder. We compared it with the baseline algorithm which directly uses the pre-extracted features. Our experiment validated the feasibility of feature reduction. Finally, we want to reserve our judgement on the question of which method is the best dimensional reduction method because we only did a few experiments which are still far away from being able to draw any assertive conclusions. More iterative experiments (e.g. tuning the structure of the auto-encoder network to find the best encoding dimension) are required to answer this question.

Appendix:

Detailed performance of each mask in the evolutionary algorithm 1st round:

mask population shape = (100, 2048)

Mask 1, # of active component = 1017 Mean Accuracy = 0.9281089528912704 Mask 2, # of active component = 1022 Mean Accuracy = 0.9307881223487385 Mask 3, # of active component = 1031 Mean Accuracy = 0.9278856887698147

Mask 4, # of active component = 1028

Mean Accuracy = 0.9236436704621568

Mask 5, # of active component = 1045

Mean Accuracy = 0.9296718017414601

Mask 6, # of active component = 1028 Mean Accuracy = 0.9301183299843715

Mask 7, # of active component = 1048

Mean Accuracy = 0.9249832551908909

Mask 8, # of active component = 1053

Mean Accuracy = 0.927662424648359 Mask 9, # of active component = 1030 Mean Accuracy = 0.9254297834338022 Mask 10, # of active component = 1063 Mean Accuracy = 0.9283322170127261 Mask 11, # of active component = 1082 Mean Accuracy = 0.9301183299843715Mask 12, # of active component = 1031 Mean Accuracy = 0.9278856887698147 Mask 13, # of active component = 1023 Mean Accuracy = 0.9267693681625363 Mask 14, # of active component = 1001 Mean Accuracy = 0.926992632283992Mask 15, # of active component = 997 Mean Accuracy = 0.9260995757981693Mask 16, # of active component = 1051 Mean Accuracy = 0.9263228399196249 Mask 17, # of active component = 1019 Mean Accuracy = 0.9278856887698147 Mask 18, # of active component = 1018 Mean Accuracy = 0.9283322170127261 Mask 19, # of active component = 1032 Mean Accuracy = 0.9298950658629158 Mask 20, # of active component = 1013 Mean Accuracy = 0.9267693681625363 Mask 21, # of active component = 1002 Mean Accuracy = 0.926992632283992Mask 22, # of active component = 1021 Mean Accuracy = 0.9310113864701942 Mask 23, # of active component = 1026 Mean Accuracy = 0.9260995757981693 Mask 24, # of active component = 1037 Mean Accuracy = 0.9321277070774726 Mask 25, # of active component = 1015 Mean Accuracy = 0.927662424648359Mask 26, # of active component = 1044 Mean Accuracy = 0.9298950658629158 Mask 27, # of active component = 1017 Mean Accuracy = 0.9310113864701942 Mask 28, # of active component = 1026 Mean Accuracy = 0.9272158964054477 Mask 29, # of active component = 1017 Mean Accuracy = 0.9247599910694352 Mask 30, # of active component = 957 Mean Accuracy = 0.9245367269479795 Mask 31, # of active component = 1026

Mean Accuracy = 0.9258763116767136 Mask 32, # of active component = 1062 Mean Accuracy = 0.9296718017414601 Mask 33, # of active component = 1010 Mean Accuracy = 0.926992632283992Mask 34, # of active component = 1035 Mean Accuracy = 0.9278856887698147 Mask 35, # of active component = 1080 Mean Accuracy = 0.9290020093770931 Mask 36, # of active component = 1086 Mean Accuracy = 0.9278856887698147 Mask 37, # of active component = 1021 Mean Accuracy = 0.9283322170127261 Mask 38, # of active component = 1008 Mean Accuracy = 0.9290020093770931 Mask 39, # of active component = 1010 Mean Accuracy = 0.9294485376200045 Mask 40, # of active component = 1008 Mean Accuracy = 0.9316811788345613 Mask 41, # of active component = 1016 Mean Accuracy = 0.9292252734985488 Mask 42, # of active component = 1038 Mean Accuracy = 0.9263228399196249 Mask 43, # of active component = 1029 Mean Accuracy = 0.9263228399196249 Mask 44, # of active component = 1046 Mean Accuracy = 0.9294485376200045 Mask 45, # of active component = 1029 Mean Accuracy = 0.9298950658629158 Mask 46, # of active component = 1014 Mean Accuracy = 0.9290020093770931 Mask 47, # of active component = 1026 Mean Accuracy = 0.9287787452556374 Mask 48, # of active component = 1027 Mean Accuracy = 0.9278856887698147 Mask 49, # of active component = 1045 Mean Accuracy = 0.9321277070774726 Mask 50, # of active component = 1063 Mean Accuracy = 0.9310113864701942 Mask 51, # of active component = 963 Mean Accuracy = 0.9298950658629158 Mask 52, # of active component = 991 Mean Accuracy = 0.9258763116767136 Mask 53, # of active component = 1010 Mean Accuracy = 0.9301183299843715 Mask 54, # of active component = 1033

Mean Accuracy = 0.9260995757981693 Mask 55, # of active component = 1037 Mean Accuracy = 0.9314579147131056 Mask 56, # of active component = 1017 Mean Accuracy = 0.9290020093770931 Mask 57, # of active component = 1012 Mean Accuracy = 0.9265461040410806Mask 58, # of active component = 1027 Mean Accuracy = 0.9285554811341817 Mask 59, # of active component = 987 Mean Accuracy = 0.9256530475552579 Mask 60, # of active component = 1026 Mean Accuracy = 0.9281089528912704 Mask 61, # of active component = 1006 Mean Accuracy = 0.9296718017414601 Mask 62, # of active component = 1027 Mean Accuracy = 0.9278856887698147 Mask 63, # of active component = 1010 Mean Accuracy = 0.9296718017414601 Mask 64, # of active component = 1053 Mean Accuracy = 0.9274391605269033 Mask 65, # of active component = 985 Mean Accuracy = 0.9292252734985488 Mask 66, # of active component = 991 Mean Accuracy = 0.9258763116767136 Mask 67, # of active component = 1069 Mean Accuracy = 0.9298950658629158 Mask 68, # of active component = 1046 Mean Accuracy = 0.9260995757981693Mask 69, # of active component = 1026 Mean Accuracy = 0.9281089528912704 Mask 70, # of active component = 994 Mean Accuracy = 0.9292252734985488 Mask 71, # of active component = 1040 Mean Accuracy = 0.9287787452556374 Mask 72, # of active component = 1019 Mean Accuracy = 0.9274391605269033 Mask 73, # of active component = 1008 Mean Accuracy = 0.9316811788345613 Mask 74, # of active component = 1024 Mean Accuracy = 0.9285554811341817Mask 75, # of active component = 1014 Mean Accuracy = 0.9298950658629158 Mask 76, # of active component = 1010 Mean Accuracy = 0.9285554811341817 Mask 77, # of active component = 1006

Mean Accuracy = 0.927662424648359 Mask 78, # of active component = 1024 Mean Accuracy = 0.9283322170127261 Mask 79, # of active component = 1027 Mean Accuracy = 0.9267693681625363 Mask 80, # of active component = 1010 Mean Accuracy = 0.9285554811341817Mask 81, # of active component = 1055 Mean Accuracy = 0.9298950658629158 Mask 82, # of active component = 1009 Mean Accuracy = 0.9296718017414601 Mask 83, # of active component = 1021 Mean Accuracy = 0.9294485376200045 Mask 84, # of active component = 1018 Mean Accuracy = 0.9312346505916499Mask 85, # of active component = 1010 Mean Accuracy = 0.9292252734985488 Mask 86, # of active component = 1002 Mean Accuracy = 0.9274391605269033 Mask 87, # of active component = 1018 Mean Accuracy = 0.9254297834338022 Mask 88, # of active component = 1020 Mean Accuracy = 0.9272158964054477 Mask 89, # of active component = 1008 Mean Accuracy = 0.9267693681625363 Mask 90, # of active component = 1044 Mean Accuracy = 0.927662424648359 Mask 91, # of active component = 1010 Mean Accuracy = 0.9312346505916499Mask 92, # of active component = 1025 Mean Accuracy = 0.9294485376200045 Mask 93, # of active component = 1020 Mean Accuracy = 0.9278856887698147 Mask 94, # of active component = 1040 Mean Accuracy = 0.926992632283992Mask 95, # of active component = 1069 Mean Accuracy = 0.9298950658629158 Mask 96, # of active component = 1002 Mean Accuracy = 0.9245367269479795 Mask 97, # of active component = 1007 Mean Accuracy = 0.9301183299843715 Mask 98, # of active component = 1016 Mean Accuracy = 0.9287787452556374 Mask 99, # of active component = 1028 Mean Accuracy = 0.9287787452556374 Mask 100, # of active component = 1019

Mean Accuracy = 0.9303415941058272

Mean performance of top 10 percent masks in this round: 0.93 (+/- 0.00)

2nd round:

mask population shape = (100, 2048)

Mask 1, # of active component = 1030 Mean Accuracy = 0.9240901987050681 Mask 2, # of active component = 1029 Mean Accuracy = 0.9240901987050681 Mask 3, # of active component = 1029 Mean Accuracy = 0.9238669345836125Mask 4, # of active component = 1028 Mean Accuracy = 0.9236436704621568 Mask 5, # of active component = 1029 Mean Accuracy = 0.9236436704621568 Mask 6, # of active component = 1028 Mean Accuracy = 0.923420406340701 Mask 7, # of active component = 1028 Mean Accuracy = 0.923420406340701 Mask 8, # of active component = 1027 Mean Accuracy = 0.9231971422192453Mask 9, # of active component = 958 Mean Accuracy = 0.9245367269479795 Mask 10, # of active component = 957 Mean Accuracy = 0.9245367269479795Mask 11, # of active component = 957 Mean Accuracy = 0.9240901987050681 Mask 12, # of active component = 956 Mean Accuracy = 0.9240901987050681 Mask 13, # of active component = 957 Mean Accuracy = 0.9256530475552579Mask 14, # of active component = 956 Mean Accuracy = 0.9252065193123465Mask 15, # of active component = 956 Mean Accuracy = 0.9247599910694352Mask 16, # of active component = 955 Mean Accuracy = 0.9247599910694352Mask 17, # of active component = 1002 Mean Accuracy = 0.9245367269479795 Mask 18, # of active component = 1001 Mean Accuracy = 0.9243134628265238 Mask 19, # of active component = 1001 Mean Accuracy = 0.9243134628265238 Mask 20, # of active component = 1000

Mean Accuracy = 0.9243134628265238 Mask 21, # of active component = 1001 Mean Accuracy = 0.9245367269479795 Mask 22, # of active component = 1000 Mean Accuracy = 0.9240901987050681 Mask 23, # of active component = 1000 Mean Accuracy = 0.9243134628265238 Mask 24, # of active component = 999 Mean Accuracy = 0.9243134628265238 Mask 25, # of active component = 1018 Mean Accuracy = 0.9245367269479795 Mask 26, # of active component = 1017 Mean Accuracy = 0.9245367269479795 Mask 27, # of active component = 1017 Mean Accuracy = 0.9247599910694352 Mask 28, # of active component = 1016 Mean Accuracy = 0.9247599910694352 Mask 29, # of active component = 1017 Mean Accuracy = 0.9247599910694352 Mask 30, # of active component = 1016 Mean Accuracy = 0.9247599910694352 Mask 31, # of active component = 1016 Mean Accuracy = 0.9249832551908909Mask 32, # of active component = 1015 Mean Accuracy = 0.9247599910694352 Mask 33, # of active component = 1049 Mean Accuracy = 0.9247599910694352 Mask 34, # of active component = 1048 Mean Accuracy = 0.9247599910694352 Mask 35, # of active component = 1048 Mean Accuracy = 0.9249832551908909 Mask 36, # of active component = 1047 Mean Accuracy = 0.9249832551908909Mask 37, # of active component = 1048 Mean Accuracy = 0.9247599910694352 Mask 38, # of active component = 1047 Mean Accuracy = 0.9247599910694352 Mask 39, # of active component = 1047 Mean Accuracy = 0.9249832551908909Mask 40, # of active component = 1046 Mean Accuracy = 0.9249832551908909Mask 41, # of active component = 1031 Mean Accuracy = 0.9258763116767136 Mask 42, # of active component = 1030 Mean Accuracy = 0.9258763116767136 Mask 43, # of active component = 1030

Mean Accuracy = 0.9258763116767136 Mask 44, # of active component = 1029 Mean Accuracy = 0.9260995757981693 Mask 45, # of active component = 1030 Mean Accuracy = 0.9254297834338022Mask 46, # of active component = 1029 Mean Accuracy = 0.9252065193123465Mask 47, # of active component = 1029 Mean Accuracy = 0.9256530475552579 Mask 48, # of active component = 1028 Mean Accuracy = 0.9254297834338022 Mask 49, # of active component = 1020 Mean Accuracy = 0.9254297834338022Mask 50, # of active component = 1019 Mean Accuracy = 0.9254297834338022 Mask 51, # of active component = 1019 Mean Accuracy = 0.9256530475552579Mask 52, # of active component = 1018 Mean Accuracy = 0.9254297834338022 Mask 53, # of active component = 1019 Mean Accuracy = 0.9260995757981693Mask 54, # of active component = 1018 Mean Accuracy = 0.9260995757981693Mask 55, # of active component = 1018 Mean Accuracy = 0.9260995757981693 Mask 56, # of active component = 1017 Mean Accuracy = 0.9260995757981693Mask 57, # of active component = 988 Mean Accuracy = 0.9256530475552579Mask 58, # of active component = 987 Mean Accuracy = 0.9258763116767136 Mask 59, # of active component = 987 Mean Accuracy = 0.9256530475552579Mask 60, # of active component = 986 Mean Accuracy = 0.9258763116767136 Mask 61, # of active component = 987 Mean Accuracy = 0.9260995757981693Mask 62, # of active component = 986 Mean Accuracy = 0.9265461040410806Mask 63, # of active component = 986 Mean Accuracy = 0.9260995757981693Mask 64, # of active component = 985 Mean Accuracy = 0.9265461040410806 Mask 65, # of active component = 1027 Mean Accuracy = 0.9260995757981693 Mask 66, # of active component = 1026

Mean Accuracy = 0.9260995757981693 Mask 67, # of active component = 1026 Mean Accuracy = 0.9258763116767136 Mask 68, # of active component = 1025 Mean Accuracy = 0.9258763116767136Mask 69, # of active component = 1026 Mean Accuracy = 0.9258763116767136Mask 70, # of active component = 1025 Mean Accuracy = 0.9258763116767136Mask 71, # of active component = 1025 Mean Accuracy = 0.9258763116767136 Mask 72, # of active component = 1024 Mean Accuracy = 0.9258763116767136 Mask 73, # of active component = 991 Mean Accuracy = 0.9258763116767136 Mask 74, # of active component = 990 Mean Accuracy = 0.9258763116767136 Mask 75, # of active component = 990 Mean Accuracy = 0.9254297834338022 Mask 76, # of active component = 989 Mean Accuracy = 0.9254297834338022Mask 77, # of active component = 990 Mean Accuracy = 0.9254297834338022Mask 78, # of active component = 989 Mean Accuracy = 0.9254297834338022 Mask 79, # of active component = 989 Mean Accuracy = 0.9252065193123465Mask 80, # of active component = 988 Mean Accuracy = 0.9252065193123465Mask 81, # of active component = 1028 Mean Accuracy = 0.9281089528912704 Mask 82, # of active component = 1021 Mean Accuracy = 0.9290020093770931 Mask 83, # of active component = 1029 Mean Accuracy = 0.927662424648359Mask 84, # of active component = 1003 Mean Accuracy = 0.9298950658629158Mask 85, # of active component = 1012 Mean Accuracy = 0.9272158964054477 Mask 86, # of active component = 1053 Mean Accuracy = 0.9278856887698147 Mask 87, # of active component = 1020 Mean Accuracy = 0.9278856887698147 Mask 88, # of active component = 1058 Mean Accuracy = 0.926992632283992 Mask 89, # of active component = 1000

Mean Accuracy = 0.926992632283992 Mask 90, # of active component = 1029 Mean Accuracy = 0.9298950658629158 Mask 91, # of active component = 1010 Mean Accuracy = 0.9283322170127261 Mask 92, # of active component = 1004 Mean Accuracy = 0.9265461040410806Mask 93, # of active component = 969 Mean Accuracy = 0.9249832551908909Mask 94, # of active component = 993 Mean Accuracy = 0.9310113864701942 Mask 95, # of active component = 1050 Mean Accuracy = 0.9283322170127261 Mask 96, # of active component = 1020 Mean Accuracy = 0.9281089528912704 Mask 97, # of active component = 1012 Mean Accuracy = 0.9263228399196249Mask 98, # of active component = 1024 Mean Accuracy = 0.9281089528912704 Mask 99, # of active component = 1040 Mean Accuracy = 0.9292252734985488 Mask 100, # of active component = 1036 Mean Accuracy = 0.9298950658629158

Mean performance of top 10 percent masks in this round: 0.92 (+/- 0.00)

3rd round:

mask population shape = (100, 2048)

Mask 1, # of active component = 1027 Mean Accuracy = 0.9231971422192453 Mask 2, # of active component = 1026 Mean Accuracy = 0.9231971422192453Mask 3, # of active component = 1026 Mean Accuracy = 0.9236436704621568 Mask 4, # of active component = 1025 Mean Accuracy = 0.923420406340701 Mask 5, # of active component = 1026 Mean Accuracy = 0.9247599910694352Mask 6, # of active component = 1025 Mean Accuracy = 0.9247599910694352Mask 7, # of active component = 1025 Mean Accuracy = 0.9249832551908909Mask 8, # of active component = 1024 Mean Accuracy = 0.9249832551908909Mask 9, # of active component = 1031

Mean Accuracy = 0.9240901987050681 Mask 10, # of active component = 1030 Mean Accuracy = 0.9240901987050681 Mask 11, # of active component = 1030 Mean Accuracy = 0.9240901987050681 Mask 12, # of active component = 1029 Mean Accuracy = 0.9236436704621568 Mask 13, # of active component = 1030 Mean Accuracy = 0.9240901987050681 Mask 14, # of active component = 1029 Mean Accuracy = 0.9240901987050681 Mask 15, # of active component = 1029 Mean Accuracy = 0.9236436704621568 Mask 16, # of active component = 1028 Mean Accuracy = 0.923420406340701 Mask 17, # of active component = 1031 Mean Accuracy = 0.9236436704621568 Mask 18, # of active component = 1030 Mean Accuracy = 0.923420406340701 Mask 19, # of active component = 1030 Mean Accuracy = 0.9236436704621568 Mask 20, # of active component = 1029 Mean Accuracy = 0.923420406340701 Mask 21, # of active component = 1030 Mean Accuracy = 0.9236436704621568 Mask 22, # of active component = 1029 Mean Accuracy = 0.9236436704621568 Mask 23, # of active component = 1029 Mean Accuracy = 0.923420406340701 Mask 24, # of active component = 1028 Mean Accuracy = 0.923420406340701 Mask 25, # of active component = 1029 Mean Accuracy = 0.9240901987050681 Mask 26, # of active component = 1028 Mean Accuracy = 0.9243134628265238 Mask 27, # of active component = 1028 Mean Accuracy = 0.9236436704621568 Mask 28, # of active component = 1027 Mean Accuracy = 0.9240901987050681 Mask 29, # of active component = 1028 Mean Accuracy = 0.9238669345836125 Mask 30, # of active component = 1027 Mean Accuracy = 0.9240901987050681 Mask 31, # of active component = 1027 Mean Accuracy = 0.923420406340701 Mask 32, # of active component = 1026

Mean Accuracy = 0.9238669345836125 Mask 33, # of active component = 1031 Mean Accuracy = 0.923420406340701 Mask 34, # of active component = 1030 Mean Accuracy = 0.9236436704621568 Mask 35, # of active component = 1030 Mean Accuracy = 0.923420406340701Mask 36, # of active component = 1029 Mean Accuracy = 0.9236436704621568 Mask 37, # of active component = 1030 Mean Accuracy = 0.9236436704621568 Mask 38, # of active component = 1029 Mean Accuracy = 0.923420406340701 Mask 39, # of active component = 1029 Mean Accuracy = 0.923420406340701 Mask 40, # of active component = 1028 Mean Accuracy = 0.923420406340701 Mask 41, # of active component = 1030 Mean Accuracy = 0.923420406340701 Mask 42, # of active component = 1029 Mean Accuracy = 0.9231971422192453 Mask 43, # of active component = 1029 Mean Accuracy = 0.922750613976334 Mask 44, # of active component = 1028 Mean Accuracy = 0.9225273498548783 Mask 45, # of active component = 1029 Mean Accuracy = 0.9238669345836125 Mask 46, # of active component = 1028 Mean Accuracy = 0.923420406340701 Mask 47, # of active component = 1028 Mean Accuracy = 0.9229738780977896 Mask 48, # of active component = 1027 Mean Accuracy = 0.9229738780977896 Mask 49, # of active component = 1033 Mean Accuracy = 0.9231971422192453 Mask 50, # of active component = 1032 Mean Accuracy = 0.9238669345836125 Mask 51, # of active component = 1032 Mean Accuracy = 0.9231971422192453 Mask 52, # of active component = 1031 Mean Accuracy = 0.9238669345836125 Mask 53, # of active component = 1032 Mean Accuracy = 0.9236436704621568 Mask 54, # of active component = 1031 Mean Accuracy = 0.9238669345836125 Mask 55, # of active component = 1031

Mean Accuracy = 0.9236436704621568 Mask 56, # of active component = 1030 Mean Accuracy = 0.9240901987050681 Mask 57, # of active component = 1030 Mean Accuracy = 0.9240901987050681 Mask 58, # of active component = 1029 Mean Accuracy = 0.9245367269479795Mask 59, # of active component = 1029 Mean Accuracy = 0.9243134628265238 Mask 60, # of active component = 1028 Mean Accuracy = 0.9240901987050681 Mask 61, # of active component = 1029 Mean Accuracy = 0.9240901987050681 Mask 62, # of active component = 1028 Mean Accuracy = 0.9240901987050681 Mask 63, # of active component = 1028 Mean Accuracy = 0.9238669345836125Mask 64, # of active component = 1027 Mean Accuracy = 0.9240901987050681 Mask 65, # of active component = 958 Mean Accuracy = 0.9240901987050681 Mask 66, # of active component = 957 Mean Accuracy = 0.9240901987050681 Mask 67, # of active component = 957 Mean Accuracy = 0.9240901987050681 Mask 68, # of active component = 956 Mean Accuracy = 0.9240901987050681 Mask 69, # of active component = 957 Mean Accuracy = 0.9254297834338022Mask 70, # of active component = 956 Mean Accuracy = 0.9249832551908909 Mask 71, # of active component = 956 Mean Accuracy = 0.9254297834338022Mask 72, # of active component = 955 Mean Accuracy = 0.9249832551908909Mask 73, # of active component = 958 Mean Accuracy = 0.9240901987050681 Mask 74, # of active component = 957 Mean Accuracy = 0.9240901987050681 Mask 75, # of active component = 957 Mean Accuracy = 0.9240901987050681 Mask 76, # of active component = 956 Mean Accuracy = 0.9238669345836125 Mask 77, # of active component = 957 Mean Accuracy = 0.9243134628265238 Mask 78, # of active component = 956

Mean Accuracy = 0.9243134628265238 Mask 79, # of active component = 956 Mean Accuracy = 0.9240901987050681 Mask 80, # of active component = 955 Mean Accuracy = 0.9240901987050681 Mask 81, # of active component = 1031 Mean Accuracy = 0.9292252734985488 Mask 82, # of active component = 1038 Mean Accuracy = 0.9290020093770931 Mask 83, # of active component = 1007 Mean Accuracy = 0.927662424648359 Mask 84, # of active component = 1046 Mean Accuracy = 0.9296718017414601 Mask 85, # of active component = 1044 Mean Accuracy = 0.9323509711989283Mask 86, # of active component = 1020 Mean Accuracy = 0.9287787452556374 Mask 87, # of active component = 1000 Mean Accuracy = 0.9274391605269033 Mask 88, # of active component = 1020 Mean Accuracy = 0.9307881223487385 Mask 89, # of active component = 1044 Mean Accuracy = 0.9292252734985488 Mask 90, # of active component = 1029 Mean Accuracy = 0.9281089528912704 Mask 91, # of active component = 1002 Mean Accuracy = 0.9258763116767136 Mask 92, # of active component = 1050 Mean Accuracy = 0.9290020093770931 Mask 93, # of active component = 1027 Mean Accuracy = 0.9287787452556374 Mask 94, # of active component = 1023 Mean Accuracy = 0.9283322170127261 Mask 95, # of active component = 1079 Mean Accuracy = 0.926992632283992Mask 96, # of active component = 974 Mean Accuracy = 0.9281089528912704 Mask 97, # of active component = 1042 Mean Accuracy = 0.927662424648359 Mask 98, # of active component = 991 Mean Accuracy = 0.9281089528912704 Mask 99, # of active component = 1057 Mean Accuracy = 0.9281089528912704 Mask 100, # of active component = 1015 Mean Accuracy = 0.9310113864701942

Mean performance of top 10 percent masks in this round: 0.92 (+/- 0.00)

4th round:

mask population shape = (100, 2048)

Mask 1, # of active component = 1030 Mean Accuracy = 0.9243134628265238 Mask 2, # of active component = 1029 Mean Accuracy = 0.9240901987050681 Mask 3, # of active component = 1029 Mean Accuracy = 0.922750613976334 Mask 4, # of active component = 1028 Mean Accuracy = 0.9225273498548783Mask 5, # of active component = 1029 Mean Accuracy = 0.9249832551908909Mask 6, # of active component = 1028 Mean Accuracy = 0.9247599910694352Mask 7, # of active component = 1028 Mean Accuracy = 0.923420406340701 Mask 8, # of active component = 1027 Mean Accuracy = 0.9231971422192453Mask 9, # of active component = 1031 Mean Accuracy = 0.9229738780977896 Mask 10, # of active component = 1030 Mean Accuracy = 0.9231971422192453 Mask 11, # of active component = 1030 Mean Accuracy = 0.9236436704621568 Mask 12, # of active component = 1029 Mean Accuracy = 0.9238669345836125Mask 13, # of active component = 1030 Mean Accuracy = 0.9229738780977896 Mask 14, # of active component = 1029 Mean Accuracy = 0.922750613976334 Mask 15, # of active component = 1029 Mean Accuracy = 0.923420406340701 Mask 16, # of active component = 1028 Mean Accuracy = 0.923420406340701 Mask 17, # of active component = 1029 Mean Accuracy = 0.9229738780977896Mask 18, # of active component = 1028 Mean Accuracy = 0.9238669345836125 Mask 19, # of active component = 1028 Mean Accuracy = 0.9229738780977896 Mask 20, # of active component = 1027 Mean Accuracy = 0.9238669345836125 Mask 21, # of active component = 1028

Mean Accuracy = 0.9231971422192453 Mask 22, # of active component = 1027 Mean Accuracy = 0.9247599910694352 Mask 23, # of active component = 1027 Mean Accuracy = 0.9231971422192453 Mask 24, # of active component = 1026 Mean Accuracy = 0.9247599910694352Mask 25, # of active component = 1028 Mean Accuracy = 0.922750613976334 Mask 26, # of active component = 1027 Mean Accuracy = 0.9229738780977896 Mask 27, # of active component = 1027 Mean Accuracy = 0.9229738780977896 Mask 28, # of active component = 1026 Mean Accuracy = 0.9229738780977896 Mask 29, # of active component = 1027 Mean Accuracy = 0.9229738780977896 Mask 30, # of active component = 1026 Mean Accuracy = 0.9231971422192453 Mask 31, # of active component = 1026 Mean Accuracy = 0.923420406340701 Mask 32, # of active component = 1025 Mean Accuracy = 0.9231971422192453 Mask 33, # of active component = 1027 Mean Accuracy = 0.9231971422192453 Mask 34, # of active component = 1026 Mean Accuracy = 0.9238669345836125 Mask 35, # of active component = 1026 Mean Accuracy = 0.923420406340701 Mask 36, # of active component = 1025 Mean Accuracy = 0.9238669345836125 Mask 37, # of active component = 1026 Mean Accuracy = 0.9231971422192453 Mask 38, # of active component = 1025 Mean Accuracy = 0.9238669345836125 Mask 39, # of active component = 1025 Mean Accuracy = 0.9231971422192453 Mask 40, # of active component = 1024 Mean Accuracy = 0.9238669345836125 Mask 41, # of active component = 1027 Mean Accuracy = 0.923420406340701 Mask 42, # of active component = 1026 Mean Accuracy = 0.9236436704621568 Mask 43, # of active component = 1026 Mean Accuracy = 0.9231971422192453 Mask 44, # of active component = 1025

Mean Accuracy = 0.9231971422192453 Mask 45, # of active component = 1026 Mean Accuracy = 0.9231971422192453 Mask 46, # of active component = 1025 Mean Accuracy = 0.9238669345836125 Mask 47, # of active component = 1025 Mean Accuracy = 0.923420406340701Mask 48, # of active component = 1024 Mean Accuracy = 0.9240901987050681 Mask 49, # of active component = 1032 Mean Accuracy = 0.9238669345836125 Mask 50, # of active component = 1031 Mean Accuracy = 0.9240901987050681 Mask 51, # of active component = 1031 Mean Accuracy = 0.923420406340701 Mask 52, # of active component = 1030 Mean Accuracy = 0.9229738780977896 Mask 53, # of active component = 1031 Mean Accuracy = 0.9236436704621568 Mask 54, # of active component = 1030 Mean Accuracy = 0.9238669345836125 Mask 55, # of active component = 1030 Mean Accuracy = 0.9231971422192453 Mask 56, # of active component = 1029 Mean Accuracy = 0.9231971422192453 Mask 57, # of active component = 1034 Mean Accuracy = 0.9231971422192453 Mask 58, # of active component = 1033 Mean Accuracy = 0.923420406340701 Mask 59, # of active component = 1033 Mean Accuracy = 0.9231971422192453 Mask 60, # of active component = 1032 Mean Accuracy = 0.923420406340701 Mask 61, # of active component = 1033 Mean Accuracy = 0.9236436704621568 Mask 62, # of active component = 1032 Mean Accuracy = 0.9236436704621568 Mask 63, # of active component = 1032 Mean Accuracy = 0.9236436704621568 Mask 64, # of active component = 1031 Mean Accuracy = 0.9236436704621568 Mask 65, # of active component = 1033 Mean Accuracy = 0.9231971422192453 Mask 66, # of active component = 1032 Mean Accuracy = 0.9238669345836125 Mask 67, # of active component = 1032

Mean Accuracy = 0.9231971422192453 Mask 68, # of active component = 1031 Mean Accuracy = 0.9238669345836125 Mask 69, # of active component = 1032 Mean Accuracy = 0.9231971422192453 Mask 70, # of active component = 1031 Mean Accuracy = 0.9238669345836125 Mask 71, # of active component = 1031 Mean Accuracy = 0.9231971422192453 Mask 72, # of active component = 1030 Mean Accuracy = 0.9238669345836125 Mask 73, # of active component = 1028 Mean Accuracy = 0.9236436704621568 Mask 74, # of active component = 1027 Mean Accuracy = 0.9238669345836125 Mask 75, # of active component = 1027 Mean Accuracy = 0.9243134628265238 Mask 76, # of active component = 1026 Mean Accuracy = 0.9240901987050681 Mask 77, # of active component = 1027 Mean Accuracy = 0.9236436704621568 Mask 78, # of active component = 1026 Mean Accuracy = 0.9236436704621568 Mask 79, # of active component = 1026 Mean Accuracy = 0.9240901987050681 Mask 80, # of active component = 1025 Mean Accuracy = 0.923420406340701 Mask 81, # of active component = 1058 Mean Accuracy = 0.927662424648359Mask 82, # of active component = 1045 Mean Accuracy = 0.9263228399196249 Mask 83, # of active component = 1056 Mean Accuracy = 0.926992632283992Mask 84, # of active component = 1005 Mean Accuracy = 0.9256530475552579Mask 85, # of active component = 1028 Mean Accuracy = 0.9310113864701942 Mask 86, # of active component = 1058 Mean Accuracy = 0.9267693681625363 Mask 87, # of active component = 1043 Mean Accuracy = 0.9267693681625363 Mask 88, # of active component = 1043 Mean Accuracy = 0.9290020093770931 Mask 89, # of active component = 1030 Mean Accuracy = 0.9260995757981693 Mask 90, # of active component = 1002

Mean Accuracy = 0.9254297834338022 Mask 91, # of active component = 1021 Mean Accuracy = 0.926992632283992 Mask 92, # of active component = 1003 Mean Accuracy = 0.9298950658629158Mask 93, # of active component = 1051 Mean Accuracy = 0.9263228399196249Mask 94, # of active component = 1010 Mean Accuracy = 0.9290020093770931 Mask 95, # of active component = 1044 Mean Accuracy = 0.9287787452556374 Mask 96, # of active component = 994 Mean Accuracy = 0.9281089528912704 Mask 97, # of active component = 1050 Mean Accuracy = 0.9281089528912704 Mask 98, # of active component = 1045 Mean Accuracy = 0.9263228399196249Mask 99, # of active component = 1018 Mean Accuracy = 0.9283322170127261 Mask 100, # of active component = 1014 Mean Accuracy = 0.927662424648359

Mean performance of top 10 percent masks in this round: 0.92 (+/- 0.00)

5th round:

mask population shape = (100, 2048)

Mask 1, # of active component = 1028 Mean Accuracy = 0.9225273498548783Mask 2, # of active component = 1027 Mean Accuracy = 0.9231971422192453 Mask 3, # of active component = 1027 Mean Accuracy = 0.9229738780977896Mask 4, # of active component = 1026 Mean Accuracy = 0.923420406340701 Mask 5, # of active component = 1027 Mean Accuracy = 0.9231971422192453Mask 6, # of active component = 1026 Mean Accuracy = 0.923420406340701 Mask 7, # of active component = 1026 Mean Accuracy = 0.923420406340701Mask 8, # of active component = 1025 Mean Accuracy = 0.923420406340701 Mask 9, # of active component = 1030 Mean Accuracy = 0.9225273498548783 Mask 10, # of active component = 1029

Mean Accuracy = 0.9240901987050681 Mask 11, # of active component = 1029 Mean Accuracy = 0.9231971422192453 Mask 12, # of active component = 1028 Mean Accuracy = 0.923420406340701 Mask 13, # of active component = 1029 Mean Accuracy = 0.922750613976334Mask 14, # of active component = 1028 Mean Accuracy = 0.9236436704621568 Mask 15, # of active component = 1028 Mean Accuracy = 0.9229738780977896 Mask 16, # of active component = 1027 Mean Accuracy = 0.9231971422192453 Mask 17, # of active component = 1032 Mean Accuracy = 0.9225273498548783 Mask 18, # of active component = 1031 Mean Accuracy = 0.922750613976334 Mask 19, # of active component = 1031 Mean Accuracy = 0.9225273498548783 Mask 20, # of active component = 1030 Mean Accuracy = 0.9225273498548783 Mask 21, # of active component = 1031 Mean Accuracy = 0.9225273498548783 Mask 22, # of active component = 1030 Mean Accuracy = 0.922750613976334 Mask 23, # of active component = 1030 Mean Accuracy = 0.9225273498548783 Mask 24, # of active component = 1029 Mean Accuracy = 0.922750613976334 Mask 25, # of active component = 1030 Mean Accuracy = 0.9238669345836125 Mask 26, # of active component = 1029 Mean Accuracy = 0.9238669345836125 Mask 27, # of active component = 1029 Mean Accuracy = 0.9238669345836125 Mask 28, # of active component = 1028 Mean Accuracy = 0.9238669345836125 Mask 29, # of active component = 1029 Mean Accuracy = 0.922750613976334 Mask 30, # of active component = 1028 Mean Accuracy = 0.922750613976334Mask 31, # of active component = 1028 Mean Accuracy = 0.922750613976334 Mask 32, # of active component = 1027 Mean Accuracy = 0.922750613976334 Mask 33, # of active component = 1033

Mean Accuracy = 0.923420406340701 Mask 34, # of active component = 1032 Mean Accuracy = 0.9231971422192453 Mask 35, # of active component = 1032 Mean Accuracy = 0.9231971422192453 Mask 36, # of active component = 1031 Mean Accuracy = 0.9229738780977896Mask 37, # of active component = 1032 Mean Accuracy = 0.9236436704621568 Mask 38, # of active component = 1031 Mean Accuracy = 0.923420406340701 Mask 39, # of active component = 1031 Mean Accuracy = 0.923420406340701 Mask 40, # of active component = 1030 Mean Accuracy = 0.9231971422192453 Mask 41, # of active component = 1032 Mean Accuracy = 0.9229738780977896 Mask 42, # of active component = 1031 Mean Accuracy = 0.9231971422192453 Mask 43, # of active component = 1031 Mean Accuracy = 0.922750613976334 Mask 44, # of active component = 1030 Mean Accuracy = 0.9229738780977896 Mask 45, # of active component = 1031 Mean Accuracy = 0.9236436704621568 Mask 46, # of active component = 1030 Mean Accuracy = 0.9238669345836125 Mask 47, # of active component = 1030 Mean Accuracy = 0.9236436704621568 Mask 48, # of active component = 1029 Mean Accuracy = 0.9238669345836125 Mask 49, # of active component = 1031 Mean Accuracy = 0.9236436704621568 Mask 50, # of active component = 1030 Mean Accuracy = 0.922750613976334 Mask 51, # of active component = 1030 Mean Accuracy = 0.9238669345836125 Mask 52, # of active component = 1029 Mean Accuracy = 0.9229738780977896 Mask 53, # of active component = 1030 Mean Accuracy = 0.9236436704621568 Mask 54, # of active component = 1029 Mean Accuracy = 0.922750613976334 Mask 55, # of active component = 1029 Mean Accuracy = 0.9238669345836125 Mask 56, # of active component = 1028

Mean Accuracy = 0.9229738780977896 Mask 57, # of active component = 1030 Mean Accuracy = 0.9223040857334226 Mask 58, # of active component = 1029 Mean Accuracy = 0.9223040857334226 Mask 59, # of active component = 1029 Mean Accuracy = 0.9223040857334226Mask 60, # of active component = 1028 Mean Accuracy = 0.9223040857334226 Mask 61, # of active component = 1029 Mean Accuracy = 0.9231971422192453 Mask 62, # of active component = 1028 Mean Accuracy = 0.9229738780977896 Mask 63, # of active component = 1028 Mean Accuracy = 0.9229738780977896 Mask 64, # of active component = 1027 Mean Accuracy = 0.9229738780977896 Mask 65, # of active component = 1029 Mean Accuracy = 0.9229738780977896 Mask 66, # of active component = 1028 Mean Accuracy = 0.923420406340701 Mask 67, # of active component = 1028 Mean Accuracy = 0.9229738780977896 Mask 68, # of active component = 1027 Mean Accuracy = 0.923420406340701 Mask 69, # of active component = 1028 Mean Accuracy = 0.9229738780977896 Mask 70, # of active component = 1027 Mean Accuracy = 0.922750613976334 Mask 71, # of active component = 1027 Mean Accuracy = 0.9229738780977896 Mask 72, # of active component = 1026 Mean Accuracy = 0.922750613976334 Mask 73, # of active component = 1027 Mean Accuracy = 0.9229738780977896 Mask 74, # of active component = 1026 Mean Accuracy = 0.922750613976334 Mask 75, # of active component = 1026 Mean Accuracy = 0.9231971422192453 Mask 76, # of active component = 1025 Mean Accuracy = 0.922750613976334Mask 77, # of active component = 1026 Mean Accuracy = 0.9229738780977896 Mask 78, # of active component = 1025 Mean Accuracy = 0.9231971422192453 Mask 79, # of active component = 1025

Mean Accuracy = 0.9231971422192453 Mask 80, # of active component = 1024 Mean Accuracy = 0.923420406340701 Mask 81, # of active component = 1005 Mean Accuracy = 0.9287787452556374 Mask 82, # of active component = 1011 Mean Accuracy = 0.9274391605269033Mask 83, # of active component = 1036 Mean Accuracy = 0.9247599910694352Mask 84, # of active component = 1012 Mean Accuracy = 0.9245367269479795 Mask 85, # of active component = 1022 Mean Accuracy = 0.9307881223487385 Mask 86, # of active component = 1003 Mean Accuracy = 0.9305648582272829Mask 87, # of active component = 1003 Mean Accuracy = 0.9301183299843715 Mask 88, # of active component = 988 Mean Accuracy = 0.9301183299843715 Mask 89, # of active component = 1026 Mean Accuracy = 0.9281089528912704 Mask 90, # of active component = 992 Mean Accuracy = 0.9263228399196249 Mask 91, # of active component = 1019 Mean Accuracy = 0.9296718017414601 Mask 92, # of active component = 1003 Mean Accuracy = 0.9278856887698147 Mask 93, # of active component = 1051 Mean Accuracy = 0.927662424648359Mask 94, # of active component = 1022 Mean Accuracy = 0.9281089528912704 Mask 95, # of active component = 1034 Mean Accuracy = 0.9283322170127261 Mask 96, # of active component = 1050 Mean Accuracy = 0.9287787452556374 Mask 97, # of active component = 1051 Mean Accuracy = 0.9307881223487385 Mask 98, # of active component = 1042 Mean Accuracy = 0.9285554811341817 Mask 99, # of active component = 1031 Mean Accuracy = 0.9292252734985488 Mask 100, # of active component = 1015 Mean Accuracy = 0.9303415941058272

Mean performance of top 10 percent masks in this round: 0.92 (+/- 0.00)