Responses to Reviewers' Comments for Manuscript TMC-2024-88-8888

This is the title of the paper

Addressed Comments for Publication to

IEEE Transactions on Mobile Computing

by

aaa, bbb, CCC, DDD, EEE, FFF

Contents

Dear Editors, Associate Editor and Reviewers:

Thank you for your valuable and insightful feedback on our manuscript, "*This is the title of the paper*". We sincerely appreciate the time and effort you invested in reviewing our work and providing constructive suggestions, which have significantly enhanced the quality of our manuscript.

In response to the reviewers' comments and recommendations, we have carefully revised the manuscript and provided a detailed point-by-point response. Additionally, we have meticulously reviewed and refined the manuscript to ensure clarity, consistency, and accuracy. We hope that our revisions and responses meet your expectations.

We would like to take this opportunity to express our gratitude for your time and effort in handling our manuscript, and we look forward to your feedback.

Sincerely,
Authors

Note: To enhance the legibility of this response letter, all the editor's and reviewers' comments are typeset in boxes. **In the revised manuscript, the modified sections are highlighted using colored text to facilitate readability.**

Response to Associate Editor

Summary Comment

The paper presents an interesting and relevant survey, and it has received good reviews. However, I see important deficiencies in the presentation and clarity of the work, and also some missing experiments. All of them should considered when preparing a new revised version of the manuscript.

Response:

We would like to extend my sincere gratitude for your thorough review and valuable feedback on our manuscript. We appreciate the time and effort you have invested in evaluating our work and fully acknowledge the deficiencies you have identified in the presentation and clarity of our study, as well as the missing experiments.

We understand the importance of addressing these issues to enhance the quality and impact of our research. Below, we outline the steps to address each of your concerns.

Comment 1 of Associate Editor

- The authors should perform some experiments to provide better guidelines and insights to the readership.

Response:

Thank you very much for your valuable comments and suggestions. Our initial manuscript included no experiments because we followed other high-quality surveys [1]–[5] that did not include experiments. However, in light of your valuable feedback, we conducted some necessary experiments to provide better guidelines and insights to the readership. In the revised manuscript, we added a new section (Section VII on the 17th page of the revised manuscript) dedicated to comparative experiments, and we anonymously open-sourced the code implementing all experiments. For your convenience, we have restated the experimental part of the revised manuscript below.

References

[1] Z. Wu, S. Pan, F. Chen, G. Long, C. Zhang, and S. Y. Philip, "A comprehensive survey on graph neural networks," *IEEE transactions on neural networks and learning systems*, vol. 32, no. 1, pp. 4–24, 2020.

[2] S. Ji, S. Pan, E. Cambria, P. Marttinen, and S. Y. Philip, "A survey on knowledge graphs: Representation, acquisition, and applications," *IEEE transactions on neural networks and learning systems*, vol. 33, no. 2, pp. 494–514, 2021.

[3] Z. Li, F. Liu, W. Yang, S. Peng, and J. Zhou, "A survey of convolutional neural networks: Analysis, applications, and prospects," *IEEE transactions on neural networks and learning systems*, vol. 33, no. 12, pp. 6999–7019, 2021.

[4] X.-Y. Zhang, G.-S. Xie, X. Li, T. Mei, and C.-L. Liu, "A survey on learning to reject," *Proceedings of the IEEE*, vol. 111, no. 2, pp. 185–215, 2023.

[5] C. Li, C. Guo, L. Han, *et al.*, "Low-light image and video enhancement using deep learning: A survey," *IEEE transactions on pattern analysis and machine intelligence*, vol. 44, no. 12, pp. 9396–9416, 2021.

Response to Reviewer 1

Summary Comment

The paper offers an extensive overview of the latest confidence calibration techniques for deep imbalanced learning, presenting significant and relevant research. However, there are a few areas where improvement could be made.

Response:

We would like to express our sincere gratitude for your feedback and valuable suggestions on our manuscript. We have carefully considered each of your points and revised them carefully.

Comment 1.1

- A summary of the practical domains where these methods have been applied, or could be applied, is missing.

Response 1.1:

Thank you for the pertinent suggestions. We agree with your point of view. We added an application section (Section VIII) on the 18th page of the revised manuscript. For your convenience, we put the newly added application section below, and we hope it will satisfy you.

Comment 1.2

- A summary of the practical domains where these methods have been applied, or could be applied, is missing.

Response 1.2:

Thank you for the pertinent suggestions. We agree with your point of view. We added an application section (Section VIII) on the 18th page of the revised manuscript. For your convenience, we put the newly added application section below, and we hope it will satisfy you.

Comment 1.3

- A summary of the practical domains where these methods have been applied, or could be applied, is missing.

Response 1.3:

Thank you for the pertinent suggestions. We agree with your point of view. We added an application section (Section VIII) on the 18th page of the revised manuscript. For your convenience, we put the newly added application section below, and we hope it will satisfy you [1]–[5].

Comment 1.4

- A summary of the practical domains where these methods have been applied, or could be applied, is missing.

Response 1.4:

Thank you for the pertinent suggestions. We agree with your point of view. We added an application section (Section VIII) on the 18th page of the revised manuscript. For your convenience, we put the newly added application section below, and we hope it will satisfy you.

Comment 1.5

- A summary of the practical domains where these methods have been applied, or could be applied, is missing.

Response 1.5:

Thank you for the pertinent suggestions. We agree with your point of view. We added an application section (Section VIII) on the 18th page of the revised manuscript. For your convenience, we put the newly added application section below, and we hope it will satisfy you [1]–[5].

(a) AAAAAA (b) BBBBBBBB

Figure R1: TRDDVFDDDDDDDDDDDDDDDDDDD

Table R1: List of Abbreviations and Definitions

Abbreviation	**Definition**
BS	Base Station
CR	Cooperation Role
CB	Cooperation Behavior
TV	Transmitting Vehicle
RV	Receiving Vehicle
DRL	Deep Reinforcement Learning
MARL	Multi-Agent Reinforcement Learning
HRL	Hierarchical Reinforcement Learning
CSI	Channel State Information
PSSCH	Physical Sidelink Shared Channel
PUCCH	Physical Uplink Control Channel
PDCCH	Physical Downlink Control Channel
UCI	Uplink Control Information
DCI	Downlink Control Information
V2V	Vehicle-to-Vehicle
V2X	Vehicle-to-Everything
V2I	Vehicle-to-Infrastructure
C-V2X	Cellular Vehicle-to-Everything
OFDM	Orthogonal Frequency Division Multiplexing
RB	Resource Block
PPO	Proximal Policy Optimization
MADDPG	Multi-Agent Deep Deterministic Policy Gradient
QoS	Quality of Service
MDP	Markov Decision Process
MSE	Mean Squared Error

References

[1] Z. Wu, S. Pan, F. Chen, G. Long, C. Zhang, and S. Y. Philip, "A comprehensive survey on graph neural networks," *IEEE transactions on neural networks and learning systems*, vol. 32, no. 1, pp. 4–24, 2020.

[2] S. Ji, S. Pan, E. Cambria, P. Marttinen, and S. Y. Philip, "A survey on knowledge graphs: Representation, acquisition, and applications," *IEEE transactions on neural networks and learning systems*, vol. 33, no. 2, pp. 494–514, 2021.

[3] Z. Li, F. Liu, W. Yang, S. Peng, and J. Zhou, "A survey of convolutional neural networks: Analysis, applications, and prospects," *IEEE transactions on neural networks and learning systems*, vol. 33, no. 12, pp. 6999–7019, 2021.

[4] X.-Y. Zhang, G.-S. Xie, X. Li, T. Mei, and C.-L. Liu, "A survey on learning to reject," *Proceedings of the IEEE*, vol. 111, no. 2, pp. 185–215, 2023.

[5] C. Li, C. Guo, L. Han, *et al.*, "Low-light image and video enhancement using deep learning: A survey," *IEEE transactions on pattern analysis and machine intelligence*, vol. 44, no. 12, pp. 9396–9416, 2021.

Response to Reviewer 2

Summary Comment

The paper offers an extensive overview of the latest confidence calibration techniques for deep imbalanced learning, presenting significant and relevant research. However, there are a few areas where improvement could be made.

Response:

We would like to express our sincere gratitude for your feedback and valuable suggestions on our manuscript. We have carefully considered each of your points and revised them carefully.

Comment 2.1

- A summary of the practical domains where these methods have been applied, or could be applied, is missing.

Response 2.1:

Thank you for the pertinent suggestions. We agree with your point of view. We added an application section (Section VIII) on the 18th page of the revised manuscript. For your convenience, we put the newly added application section below, and we hope it will satisfy you.

Comment 2.2

- A summary of the practical domains where these methods have been applied, or could be applied, is missing.

Response 2.2:

Thank you for the pertinent suggestions. We agree with your point of view. We added an application section (Section VIII) on the 18th page of the revised manuscript. For your convenience, we put the newly added application section below, and we hope it will satisfy you.

Comment 2.3

- A summary of the practical domains where these methods have been applied, or could be applied, is missing.

Response 2.3:

Thank you for the pertinent suggestions. We agree with your point of view. We added an application section (Section VIII) on the 18th page of the revised manuscript. For your convenience, we put the newly added application section below, and we hope it will satisfy you [1]–[5].

References

[1] Z. Wu, S. Pan, F. Chen, G. Long, C. Zhang, and S. Y. Philip, "A comprehensive survey on graph neural networks," *IEEE transactions on neural networks and learning systems*, vol. 32, no. 1, pp. 4–24, 2020.

[2] S. Ji, S. Pan, E. Cambria, P. Marttinen, and S. Y. Philip, "A survey on knowledge graphs: Representation, acquisition, and applications," *IEEE transactions on neural networks and learning systems*, vol. 33, no. 2, pp. 494–514, 2021.

[3] Z. Li, F. Liu, W. Yang, S. Peng, and J. Zhou, "A survey of convolutional neural networks: Analysis, applications, and prospects," *IEEE transactions on neural networks and learning systems*, vol. 33, no. 12, pp. 6999–7019, 2021.

[4] X.-Y. Zhang, G.-S. Xie, X. Li, T. Mei, and C.-L. Liu, "A survey on learning to reject," *Proceedings of the IEEE*, vol. 111, no. 2, pp. 185–215, 2023.

[5] C. Li, C. Guo, L. Han, *et al.*, "Low-light image and video enhancement using deep learning: A survey," *IEEE transactions on pattern analysis and machine intelligence*, vol. 44, no. 12, pp. 9396–9416, 2021.

Response to Reviewer 3

Summary Comment

The paper offers an extensive overview of the latest confidence calibration techniques for deep imbalanced learning, presenting significant and relevant research. However, there are a few areas where improvement could be made.

Response:

We would like to express our sincere gratitude for your feedback and valuable suggestions on our manuscript. We have carefully considered each of your points and revised them carefully.

Comment 3.1

- A summary of the practical domains where these methods have been applied, or could be applied, is missing.

Response 3.1:

Thank you for the pertinent suggestions. We agree with your point of view. We added an application section (Section VIII) on the 18th page of the revised manuscript. For your convenience, we put the newly added application section below, and we hope it will satisfy you.

Comment 3.2

- A summary of the practical domains where these methods have been applied, or could be applied, is missing.

Response 3.2:

Thank you for the pertinent suggestions. We agree with your point of view. We added an application section (Section VIII) on the 18th page of the revised manuscript. For your convenience, we put the newly added application section below, and we hope it will satisfy you.

Comment 3.3

- A summary of the practical domains where these methods have been applied, or could be applied, is missing.

Response 3.3:

Thank you for the pertinent suggestions. We agree with your point of view. We added an application section (Section VIII) on the 18th page of the revised manuscript. For your convenience, we put the newly added application section below, and we hope it will satisfy you [1]–[5].

Lorem ipsum dolor sit amet, consectetuer adipiscing elit. Ut purus elit, vestibulum ut, placerat ac, adipiscing vitae, felis. Curabitur dictum gravida mauris. Nam arcu libero, nonummy eget, consectetuer id, vulputate a, magna. Donec vehicula augue eu neque. Pellentesque habitant morbi tristique senectus et netus et malesuada fames ac turpis egestas. Mauris ut leo. Cras viverra metus rhoncus sem. Nulla et lectus vestibulum urna fringilla ultrices. Phasellus eu tellus sit amet tortor gravida placerat. Integer sapien est, iaculis in, pretium quis, viverra ac, nunc. Praesent eget sem vel leo ultrices bibendum. Aenean faucibus. Morbi dolor nulla, malesuada eu, pulvinar at, mollis ac, nulla. Curabitur auctor semper nulla. Donec varius orci eget risus. Duis nibh mi, congue eu, accumsan eleifend, sagittis quis, diam. Duis eget orci sit amet orci dignissim rutrum.

Nam dui ligula, fringilla a, euismod sodales, sollicitudin vel, wisi. Morbi auctor lorem non justo. Nam lacus libero, pretium at, lobortis vitae, ultricies et, tellus. Donec aliquet, tortor sed accumsan bibendum, erat ligula aliquet magna, vitae ornare odio metus a mi. Morbi ac orci et nisl hendrerit mollis. Suspendisse ut massa. Cras nec ante. Pellentesque a nulla. Cum sociis natoque penatibus et magnis dis parturient montes, nascetur ridiculus mus. Aliquam tincidunt urna. Nulla ullamcorper vestibulum turpis. Pellentesque cursus luctus mauris.

Nulla malesuada porttitor diam. Donec felis erat, congue non, volutpat at, tincidunt tristique, libero. Vivamus viverra fermentum felis. Donec nonummy pellentesque ante. Phasellus adipiscing semper elit. Proin fermentum massa ac quam. Sed diam turpis, molestie vitae, placerat a, molestie nec, leo. Maecenas lacinia. Nam ipsum ligula, eleifend at, accumsan nec, suscipit a, ipsum. Morbi blandit ligula feugiat magna. Nunc eleifend consequat lorem. Sed lacinia nulla vitae enim. Pellentesque tincidunt purus vel magna. Integer non enim. Praesent euismod nunc eu purus. Donec bibendum quam in tellus. Nullam cursus pulvinar lectus. Donec et mi. Nam vulputate metus eu enim. Vestibulum pellentesque felis eu massa.

Quisque ullamcorper placerat ipsum. Cras nibh. Morbi vel justo vitae lacus tincidunt ultrices. Lorem ipsum dolor sit amet, consectetuer adipiscing elit. In hac habitasse platea dictumst. Integer tempus convallis augue. Etiam facilisis. Nunc elementum fermentum wisi. Aenean placerat. Ut imperdiet, enim sed gravida sollicitudin, felis odio placerat quam, ac pulvinar elit purus eget enim. Nunc vitae tortor. Proin tempus nibh sit amet nisl. Vivamus quis tortor vitae risus porta vehicula.

Fusce mauris. Vestibulum luctus nibh at lectus. Sed bibendum, nulla a faucibus semper, leo velit ultricies tellus, ac venenatis arcu wisi vel nisl. Vestibulum diam. Aliquam pellentesque, augue quis sagittis posuere, turpis lacus congue quam, in hendrerit risus eros eget felis. Maecenas eget erat in sapien mattis porttitor. Vestibulum porttitor. Nulla facilisi. Sed a turpis eu lacus commodo facilisis. Morbi fringilla, wisi in dignissim interdum, justo lectus sagittis dui, et vehicula libero dui cursus dui. Mauris tempor ligula sed lacus. Duis cursus enim ut augue. Cras ac magna. Cras nulla. Nulla egestas. Curabitur a leo. Quisque egestas wisi eget nunc. Nam feugiat lacus vel est. Curabitur consectetuer.

Suspendisse vel felis. Ut lorem lorem, interdum eu, tincidunt sit amet, laoreet vitae, arcu. Aenean faucibus pede eu ante. Praesent enim elit, rutrum at, molestie non, nonummy vel, nisl. Ut lectus eros, malesuada sit amet, fermentum eu, sodales

cursus, magna. Donec eu purus. Quisque vehicula, urna sed ultricies auctor, pede lorem egestas dui, et convallis elit erat sed nulla. Donec luctus. Curabitur et nunc. Aliquam dolor odio, commodo pretium, ultricies non, pharetra in, velit. Integer arcu est, nonummy in, fermentum faucibus, egestas vel, odio.

Sed commodo posuere pede. Mauris ut est. Ut quis purus. Sed ac odio. Sed vehicula hendrerit sem. Duis non odio. Morbi ut dui. Sed accumsan risus eget odio. In hac habitasse platea dictumst. Pellentesque non elit. Fusce sed justo eu urna porta tincidunt. Mauris felis odio, sollicitudin sed, volutpat a, ornare ac, erat. Morbi quis dolor. Donec pellentesque, erat ac sagittis semper, nunc dui lobortis purus, quis congue purus metus ultricies tellus. Proin et quam. Class aptent taciti sociosqu ad litora torquent per conubia nostra, per inceptos hymenaeos. Praesent sapien turpis, fermentum vel, eleifend faucibus, vehicula eu, lacus.

References

[1] Z. Wu, S. Pan, F. Chen, G. Long, C. Zhang, and S. Y. Philip, "A comprehensive survey on graph neural networks," *IEEE transactions on neural networks and learning systems*, vol. 32, no. 1, pp. 4–24, 2020.

[2] S. Ji, S. Pan, E. Cambria, P. Marttinen, and S. Y. Philip, "A survey on knowledge graphs: Representation, acquisition, and applications," *IEEE transactions on neural networks and learning systems*, vol. 33, no. 2, pp. 494–514, 2021.

[3] Z. Li, F. Liu, W. Yang, S. Peng, and J. Zhou, "A survey of convolutional neural networks: Analysis, applications, and prospects," *IEEE transactions on neural networks and learning systems*, vol. 33, no. 12, pp. 6999–7019, 2021.

[4] X.-Y. Zhang, G.-S. Xie, X. Li, T. Mei, and C.-L. Liu, "A survey on learning to reject," *Proceedings of the IEEE*, vol. 111, no. 2, pp. 185–215, 2023.

[5] C. Li, C. Guo, L. Han, *et al.*, "Low-light image and video enhancement using deep learning: A survey," *IEEE transactions on pattern analysis and machine intelligence*, vol. 44, no. 12, pp. 9396–9416, 2021.

Response to Reviewer 4

Summary Comment

The paper offers an extensive overview of the latest confidence calibration techniques for deep imbalanced learning, presenting significant and relevant research. However, there are a few areas where improvement could be made.

Response:

We would like to express our sincere gratitude for your feedback and valuable suggestions on our manuscript. We have carefully considered each of your points and revised them carefully.

Comment 4.1

- A summary of the practical domains where these methods have been applied, or could be applied, is missing.

Response 4.1:

Thank you for the pertinent suggestions. We agree with your point of view. We added an application section (Section VIII) on the 18th page of the revised manuscript. For your convenience, we put the newly added application section below, and we hope it will satisfy you.

Comment 4.2

- A summary of the practical domains where these methods have been applied, or could be applied, is missing.

Response 4.2:

Thank you for the pertinent suggestions. We agree with your point of view. We added an application section (Section VIII) on the 18th page of the revised manuscript. For your convenience, we put the newly added application section below, and we hope it will satisfy you.

Comment 4.3

- A summary of the practical domains where these methods have been applied, or could be applied, is missing.

Response 4.3:

Thank you for the pertinent suggestions. We agree with your point of view. We added an application section (Section VIII) on the 18th page of the revised manuscript. For your convenience, we put the newly added application section below, and we hope it will satisfy you [1]–[5].

References

[1] Z. Wu, S. Pan, F. Chen, G. Long, C. Zhang, and S. Y. Philip, "A comprehensive survey on graph neural networks," *IEEE transactions on neural networks and learning systems*, vol. 32, no. 1, pp. 4–24, 2020.

[2] S. Ji, S. Pan, E. Cambria, P. Marttinen, and S. Y. Philip, "A survey on knowledge graphs: Representation, acquisition, and applications," *IEEE transactions on neural networks and learning systems*, vol. 33, no. 2, pp. 494–514, 2021.

[3] Z. Li, F. Liu, W. Yang, S. Peng, and J. Zhou, "A survey of convolutional neural networks: Analysis, applications, and prospects," *IEEE transactions on neural networks and learning systems*, vol. 33, no. 12, pp. 6999–7019, 2021.

[4] X.-Y. Zhang, G.-S. Xie, X. Li, T. Mei, and C.-L. Liu, "A survey on learning to reject," *Proceedings of the IEEE*, vol. 111, no. 2, pp. 185–215, 2023.

[5] C. Li, C. Guo, L. Han, *et al.*, "Low-light image and video enhancement using deep learning: A survey," *IEEE transactions on pattern analysis and machine intelligence*, vol. 44, no. 12, pp. 9396–9416, 2021.

The Revised version of Manuscript TMC-2024-88-8888

This is the title of the paper