



PI/CO-PI Management -
[Proposal Functions](#) | [HOME](#) ▶

[NSF Home](#) | [News](#) | [Site Map](#) | [GPG](#) | [GPM](#) | [Contact Us](#) | [FastLane Help](#)
[Change Password](#) | [Logout](#)

Proposal Status | [MAIN](#) ▶

Organization: Pace University New York Campus

Panel Summary #2

Proposal Number: 0710790

Panel Summary:
Panel Summary

I. A brief statement of what the proposal is about.

Building on RS and Soar, this proposal requests funding for the extension of an existing cognitive architecture for robotics. The conceptual foundation of the architecture is language. Three milestones for the development are proposed; they culminate in the ability to perform learning and chunking on complex shepherding tasks.

II. Intellectual merit - the innovative / driving research (strengths and weaknesses)

The proposed cognitive architecture brings together interesting concepts from robotics and linguistics. The proposal could be strengthened by a detailed description of specific scientific objectives. A plan for comparative qualitative and quantitative evaluation should be provided as part of the work plan.

III. Broader impacts, including enhancing diversity and integration of research and education, if applicable (strengths and weaknesses)

The research will be conducted in collaboration with two other universities. The research involves undergraduates, including underrepresented minorities and women. No additional outreach activities are proposed. A collaboration with a museum provides an outreach opportunity and an interesting channel for dissemination of the research.

IV. Impact of prior NSF funded research, if applicable.

N/A

V. Panel recommendation and justification, including key strengths and critical weaknesses; also indicate if the project is considered transformative (high risk/high payoff) and why.

The panel recognizes the PI's extensive experience in the area of cognitive architectures, reflected in the broad and well-founded vision of the proposed cognitive architecture. The subject matter of the proposal fits well into the scope of Robust Intelligence.

The proposed activities are mainly concerned with system development. The panel feels that a detailed description of scientific objectives and contributions would strengthen the proposal. Based on the nature of these contributions, a detailed plan for quantitative and/or qualitative evaluation of the architecture should be included. A comparison with other cognitive architectures or at least relevant related work for parts of the architecture is necessary.

The panel is also concerned that the requested budget may not be sufficient to conduct the proposed activities. This could be alleviated by providing additional details about the collaborations with two other universities. The proposal should include a management or coordination plan for this collaboration. The two partner universities also did not provide a letter of support. Such letters should be included in a revised version of the proposal.

The project cannot be considered transformative. Parts of the proposed architecture have already been validated by the PI and other researchers. While the overall architecture can have significant impact on research in Robust Intelligence, the integration of the individual components of the architecture appears to occur in a straightforward manner.

The panel does not recommend this proposal for funding.

The summary was read by the panel, and the panel concurred that the summary accurately reflects the panel discussion.

Panel Recommendation: Not Recommended For Funding

 [Back to Proposal Status Detail](#)

Download [Adobe Acrobat Reader](#) for viewing PDF files

National Science Foundation
4201 Wilson Boulevard, Arlington, Virginia 22230, USA
Tel: 703-292-5111, FIRS: 800-877-8339 | TDD: 703-292-5090

[Privacy and
Security](#)