

3.2 Proofs

Proofs require foundational techniques.

Ex. Theorem:

There are infinitely many primes

Proof by Contradiction

Proof. Suppose this were not the case. That is suppose there are only finitely many primes. Then there must be a last, largest prime, call it  $p$ . Consider the number:

$$N = p! + 1 = (p \cdot (p-1) \cdot \dots \cdot 3 \cdot 2 \cdot 1) + 1$$

Now  $N$  is certainly larger than  $p$ . Also,  $N$  is not divisible by any number less than or equal to  $p$ , since every number less than or equal to  $p$  divides  $p!$ . Thus the prime factorization of  $N$  contains prime numbers (possibly just  $N$  itself) all greater than  $p$ . So  $p$  is not the largest prime, a contradiction. Therefore there are infinitely many primes.

• Direct Proof

- useful when proving implications.

Assume  $P$ . Explain, explain, ..., explain. Therefore  $Q$ .

$\forall x (P(x) \rightarrow Q(x))$ : Assume  $P(x)$  is true and deduce  $Q(x)$   
Fix  $x$  to be an arbitrary element.

$\forall x \in \mathbb{Z} (P(x) \rightarrow Q(x))$       $P(x) = x \text{ is even}$       $Q(x) = x^2 \text{ is even}$

Assume  $x$  is even we can rewrite  $x$  as  $2y$ , where  $y$  is any integer.  $x^2 = x \cdot x = 2y \cdot 2y = 2(2y \cdot y)$ . Since any integer multiplied by two is even. We can conclude that if  $P(x)$ , then  $Q(x)$  is true for all cases.

$\forall x, y, z \in \mathbb{Z} (P(x, y, z) \rightarrow Q(x, z))$       $P(x) = x|y \wedge y|z$       $Q(x) = x|z$

Let  $x, y, z$  be integers. Assume  $x|y$  and  $y|z$



3.2 Proofs

## • Proof by Contrapositive

Since  $P \rightarrow Q \equiv \neg Q \rightarrow \neg P$  if we can prove the contrapositive we can prove the original implication.

Assume  $\neg Q$  ... therefore  $\neg P$

$$- \forall x \in \mathbb{Z} (P(x) \rightarrow Q(x)) \quad P(x) = x^2 \text{ is even} \quad Q(x) = x \text{ is even}$$

Prove  $\forall x \in \mathbb{Z} (\neg Q \rightarrow \neg P)$

Assume  $x$  is odd. We can rewrite  $x$  as  $2k+1$  where  $k$  is any integer in  $\mathbb{Z}$ . Squaring  $x$  gives us:

$$x^2 = (2k+1)^2 = (2k+1)(2k+1) = 4k^2 + 4k + 1$$

$$4k^2 + 4k + 1 = 2(2k^2 + 2k) + 1$$

Since  $k$  is an integer we know  $2k^2 + 2k$  is an integer. Since for all integers  $2(\text{integer}) + 1$  is odd. The statement  $P(x) \rightarrow Q(x)$  is true.

## • Proof by Contradiction

If you can prove the negation of a statement is false then you prove the statement as true.

Prove that  $\sqrt{2}$  is irrational

$P = \sqrt{2}$  is irrational  
 $\neg P = \sqrt{2}$  is rational

Suppose not. Then  $\sqrt{2}$  is rational so it equals some value  $\frac{a}{b}$ , assume  $\frac{a}{b}$  is in lowest terms.

$$2 = \left(\frac{a}{b}\right)^2 = \frac{a^2}{b^2} \rightarrow 2b^2 = a^2$$

Thus  $a^2$  is even. so  $a = 2k$  for some int  $k$  and  $a^2 = 4k^2$ .

$$2b^2 = 4k^2 \rightarrow b^2 = 2k^2$$

Thus  $b^2$  is even, and as such  $b$  is even. Since  $a$  is also even, we see that  $\frac{a}{b}$  is not in lowest terms, a contradiction. Thus  $\sqrt{2}$  is irrational.



3.2 Proofs

- Proof by (counter) example

It is almost never okay to prove a statement with just an example

YOU CANNOT PROVE A STATEMENT OF THE FORM  $\forall x P(x)$  WITH AN EXAMPLE

However existential statements can be!

- Proof by case

Used when proving a statement by considering multiple cases

Break the problem into cases  $(P_1, P_2, \dots, P_n)$  Prove the statement for each case

For any integer  $n$ , the number  $(n^3 - n)$  is even

$$P(x) = (x^3 - x) \text{ is even}$$

$$\forall x \in \mathbb{Z} (P(x)) \rightarrow \text{There are two possible cases}$$

$$Q_1(x) = x \text{ is even}$$

$$Q_2(x) = x \text{ is odd}$$

$$\text{Case 1: } \forall x \in \mathbb{Z} (Q_1(x) \rightarrow P(x))$$

Assume  $Q_1(x)$  is true. Then  $x$  can be expressed as  $x = 2k$

$$x^3 - x = (2k)^3 - 2k = 2k \cdot 2k \cdot 2k - 2k$$

$$2k \cdot 2k \cdot 2k - 2k = 2(4k^3 - k)$$

Since  $k$  is any int and any int multiplied by 2 is even  $P(x)$  is true



3.2 Proofs

• Proof by cases cont.

Case 2:  $\forall x \in \mathbb{Z} (Q_2(x) \rightarrow P(x))$

Assume  $Q_2(x)$  is true.  $x$  can then be expressed as  $x = 2k + 1$ .

$$x^3 - x = (2k+1)^3 - (2k+1) = (2k+1)(2k+1)(2k+1) - 2k - 1$$

$$8k^3 + 16k^2 + 8k + 1 - 2k - 1 = 8k^3 + 16k^2 + 6k = 2(4k^3 + 8k^2 + 3k)$$

Any int multiplied by 2 is even, therefore case 2 is true.

Since both cases are always true then the statement  $\forall x \in \mathbb{Z} (P(x))$  is true.



- 5) Prove that for all integers  $n$ , it is the case that  $n$  is even if and only if  $3n$  is even. That is, prove both implications: if  $n$  is even, then  $3n$  is even, and if  $3n$  is even, then  $n$  is even.

Let:  $P(n) = "n \text{ is even}"$   $Q(n) = "3n \text{ is even}"$

Claim:  $\forall n \in \mathbb{Z} (P(n) \leftrightarrow Q(n))$   $\iff \forall n \in \mathbb{Z} (P(n) \rightarrow Q(n) \wedge Q(n) \rightarrow P(n))$

Proof: Case 1: Suppose  $n$  is even. Since  $n$  is even we know that  $n = 2a$  where  $a$  is any integer. Now consider  $3n$ :

$$3n = 3(2a) = 2(3a)$$

Since we know that  $a$  is an integer, we know that  $3a$  is an integer, so  $2(3a)$  is even. Therefore, if  $P(n)$ , then  $Q(n)$  is true.

Case 2: Consider the contrapositive of  $Q(n) \rightarrow P(n)$ , if  $n$  is odd, then  $3n$  is odd. Suppose  $n$  is odd. Since  $n$  is odd we know that  $n = 2k+1$  where  $k$  is any integer. Now consider  $3n$ :

$$3n = 3(2k+1) = 6k+3 = 2(3k+1)+1$$

Since we know that  $k$  is an integer, we know that  $3k+1$  is an integer, so  $2(3k+1)+1$  is odd. The contrapositive is true, therefore the original statement is true.

Since both cases are always true so is the complete claim.

//



7) Consider the statement: For all integers  $a$  and  $b$ , if  $a$  is even and  $b$  is a multiple of 3, then  $ab$  is a multiple of 6.

a. Prove the statement. What sort of proof are you using?

$a, b, n, m \in \mathbb{Z}$  Let:  $P: a = 2n$        $Q: 3 \mid b = m$        $R: 6 \mid ab = nm$

Claim:  $\forall a \forall b \in \mathbb{Z} (P \wedge Q \rightarrow R)$        $b = 3m$        $ab = 6(nm)$

Proof: Suppose  $P$  and  $Q$ .

$$ab = (2n)(3m) = 6(nm)$$

Since  $nm$  is an integer we can conclude that  $6 \mid ab = nm$   
Therefore the statement is true.

//

Direct Proof

SQ.2) "If  $k$  is any odd integer, and  $m$  is any even integer, then  $k^2 + m^2$  is odd"

Let:  $k, m \in \mathbb{Z}$        $P: "k \text{ is odd}"$        $Q: "m \text{ is even}"$

$R: "k^2 + m^2 \text{ is odd}"$

Claim:  $\forall k, m \in \mathbb{Z} (P \wedge Q \rightarrow R) \mid \forall k, m \in \mathbb{Z} (\neg R \rightarrow \neg P \vee \neg Q)$

Proof: Suppose  $P$  and  $Q$  are true.

Let:  $a, b \in \mathbb{Z}$        $k = 2a + 1$        $m = 2b$

$$k^2 + m^2 = (2a + 1)^2 + (2b)^2 = 4a^2 + 4a + 1 + 4b^2$$

$$4a^2 + 4b^2 + 4a + 1 = 2(2a^2 + 2b^2 + 2a) + 1$$

Since  $a$  and  $b$  are integers and they are closed under  $+$  and  $\times$ ,  $k^2 + m^2 = \text{odd}$ . Therefore the statement is true.

//